

Enhancing Consular Services for Indonesian Citizens Abroad: An AI-Driven Strategic Analysis

Executive Summary

(This section will be a concise overview of the entire report, summarizing key findings, the significance of AI in consular services, comparative insights, ethical imperatives, and the core recommendations for Indonesia. It will be drafted after the main body of the report is complete.)

I. Introduction: The Imperative for AI-Driven Consular Modernization

A. The Evolving Global Landscape of Consular Services

The global landscape of consular services is undergoing a significant transformation, driven by the escalating expectations of citizens for government services that are not only accessible and efficient but also digitally enabled, particularly for those residing or traveling abroad. This demand is compounded by the increasing complexity of consular work, which now encompasses a broader range of responsibilities, including sophisticated crisis management, catering to diverse and often urgent citizen needs, and handling an ever-growing volume of inquiries.¹ In this dynamic environment, technology, especially Artificial Intelligence (AI), is emerging as an indispensable tool for foreign ministries worldwide. AI offers the potential to streamline operations, enhance responsiveness, and personalize services, thereby enabling diplomatic missions to meet the multifaceted demands of modern consular affairs more effectively.² The global shift towards digital solutions in consular services is no longer merely a trend but a fundamental necessity for maintaining effective diplomatic presence and citizen support in the 21st century.⁴ Governments are increasingly recognizing that leveraging AI can lead to more proactive, predictive, and citizen-centric consular assistance.¹

B. Situating the Study: 'Fine-Tuning BERT for Indonesian Consular QA' as a Catalyst

This report takes as its starting point an illustrative research project focused on "Fine-Tuning BERT for Automated Consular Question Answering: A Case Study for Indonesian Citizens Abroad".⁵ This specific endeavor, while focused on a particular application of Bidirectional Encoder Representations from Transformers (BERT) for Indonesian consular queries, serves as a valuable catalyst for a broader investigation. The initial study represents a foundational step—the application of a powerful,

general-purpose AI model to address a specific linguistic and domain challenge within Indonesian public service.

However, the progression of AI, particularly in Natural Language Processing (NLP) for the Indonesian language, has advanced considerably. The development of more sophisticated, Indonesian-specific models such as IndoBERT ⁶ and the ambitious SahabatAI initiative ⁸ indicates that the national capacity is evolving beyond simply adapting generic global models. General-purpose models, while versatile, often encounter limitations when faced with the nuanced requirements of culturally specific contexts and the complexities of low-resource languages or dialects within a nation.⁶

Therefore, the "BERT for Indonesian Consular QA" project is perhaps best understood not as a definitive solution, but as an early and important indicator of Indonesia's journey toward developing more mature and tailored AI capabilities for public service. It underscores the inherent *need* that propels the creation of advanced, localized solutions. The successful and equitable implementation of AI in public services for a linguistically and culturally diverse nation like Indonesia necessitates a strategic commitment. This commitment involves not only adopting existing technologies but also actively developing, fine-tuning, and validating AI models that possess a deep understanding of local languages, dialects, cultural contexts, and specific citizen needs. This localized approach is a strategic imperative for ensuring both the inclusivity and the operational effectiveness of AI-driven public services. This report will expand upon the initial case study to explore these wider AI applications, draw comparisons with international approaches to consular service modernization, and formulate strategic considerations tailored to enhancing Indonesia's consular services for its citizens worldwide.

II. Advancing Automated Consular Assistance in Indonesia: NLP Technologies and Current Ecosystem

A. Technical Deep Dive: BERT and Fine-Tuning for Indonesian Consular Question Answering

The core of automating consular question answering lies in the ability of AI models to understand and process human language effectively. BERT stands out as a foundational technology in this domain.

1. Core Concepts: BERT, Transformers, and Fine-Tuning Methodologies

BERT, or Bidirectional Encoder Representations from Transformers, is a powerful pre-trained language model renowned for its capacity to grasp contextual nuances in text.⁵ Its architecture is based on the Transformer model, which uniquely employs an "attention

mechanism," allowing it to weigh the importance of different words in a sentence when processing information, thus capturing long-range dependencies and context more effectively than previous models.

Fine-tuning BERT for a specific task like consular question answering involves several key steps ⁵:

- **Data Preparation:** This is a critical initial phase. For the illustrative project, training data was handcrafted by scraping product descriptions, though for larger, real-world consular applications, this would involve collecting and curating extensive datasets of consular-related questions and their corresponding answers from official sources, FAQs, and historical query logs. Tools like Haystack Deepset or Doccano can be employed for annotation in larger projects.
- **Defining Questions and Answers:** Clear, concise question-answer pairs relevant to consular services must be defined, ensuring that the answers are explicitly found within the provided context or knowledge base.
- **Data Format Conversion:** The prepared training data must be converted into a specific format that the BERT model and the chosen training library (e.g., SimpleTransformers) can process.
- **Training:** The pre-trained BERT model (e.g., bert-large-uncased, a model with 340 million parameters) is then further trained on this custom dataset. This process, known as fine-tuning, adjusts the model's weights to specialize its knowledge for the consular domain. The training involves iterating through the data for a set number of epochs (e.g., 25 epochs as mentioned in the illustrative project ⁵).
- **Evaluation:** After training, the model's performance is assessed on a separate test dataset, which it has not seen during training, to measure its accuracy and effectiveness in answering new questions.

For question-answering (QA) tasks, BERT is typically provided with a question and a passage of text (context) that potentially contains the answer. The input is formatted by concatenating the question and the context, separated by a special `` token.

"Segment embeddings" are used to help the model differentiate between the question and the context.¹² BERT then predicts the "span" of text within the context that constitutes the answer by identifying the start and end tokens of that answer span.¹² While models pre-trained on large QA datasets like SQuAD (Stanford Question Answering Dataset) can provide reasonable out-of-the-box performance for general QA, fine-tuning on domain-specific data, such as consular information, is generally crucial for achieving higher accuracy and relevance.¹²

2. The Indonesian NLP Frontier: IndoBERT, SahabatAI, and other Language-Specific Models

While generic BERT models can be fine-tuned for Indonesian, the development of language-specific models marks a significant advancement for NLP in Indonesia.

- **IndoBERT and IndoBART:** IndoBERT is a BERT-based model pre-trained specifically on a large corpus of Indonesian text. This specialization allows it to achieve strong performance on the IndoNLU benchmark, which includes a variety of Indonesian Natural Language Understanding (NLU) tasks such as text classification, question answering, and named entity recognition.⁶ Similarly, IndoBART, based on the BART (Bidirectional and Auto-Regressive Transformer) architecture, is tailored for sequence-to-sequence tasks in Indonesian, such as machine translation and text summarization.⁶ These models represent a significant step towards more nuanced understanding and generation of the Indonesian language.
- **Addressing Linguistic Diversity: NusaBERT and Vocabulary Expansion:** Despite their strengths, even models like IndoBERT face challenges with phenomena such as code-switching (the practice of alternating between two or more languages or varieties of language in conversation) and catering to the numerous low-resource regional languages spoken across Indonesia.⁶ Initiatives like NusaBERT aim to extend capabilities to these under-resourced languages.⁷ Furthermore, to handle the informal language, slang, and evolving vocabulary prevalent in social media and everyday communication, techniques like vocabulary expansion are crucial. IndoBERTtweet, for example, augments IndoBERT's vocabulary with terms common in Indonesian Twitter data, improving its performance on informal text.⁶
- **SahabatAI: A Collaborative LLM Ecosystem for Indonesia:** A landmark development is the SahabatAI initiative, a collaborative effort by prominent Indonesian technology and telecommunication companies, GoTo Group and Indosat Ooredoo Hutchison.⁸ SahabatAI aims to create a suite of Large Language Models (LLMs) pre-trained and instruction-tuned specifically for Bahasa Indonesia and its diverse regional dialects, including Javanese and Sundanese, with future plans for Batak and Balinese.⁹ Built on advanced architectures like Llama3 8B CPT, SahabatAI models are trained with hundreds of thousands of Indonesian instruction-completion pairs, demonstrating a commitment to high-quality, localized AI.⁹ The potential applications of SahabatAI are directly relevant to public service enhancement, including simplifying government service interactions, demystifying taxation processes, streamlining administrative procedures related to life events (e.g., marriage, relocation), and even powering voice assistance for widely used local services like Gojek and GoPay.⁸ This initiative signifies a strategic investment in sovereign AI capabilities tailored to Indonesia's unique linguistic landscape.

3. Beyond Basic QA: Retrieval-Augmented Generation (RAG) and Knowledge Graphs for Enhanced Indonesian Contextual Understanding

To overcome limitations inherent in standard LLMs, such as generating outdated or factually incorrect information (hallucinations), more advanced techniques are being explored for Indonesian NLP.

- **Retrieval-Augmented Generation (RAG):** RAG enhances LLM performance by first retrieving relevant information from an external, up-to-date knowledge base before generating a response.¹⁵ This is particularly vital for Indonesian NLP, given the relative scarcity of high-quality, comprehensive digital training data for all specific domains and the critical need for factual accuracy in areas like consular services. RAG models can access and incorporate specific, current information, leading to more accurate and contextually appropriate answers. Research has demonstrated RAG's effectiveness when integrated with models like Mistral 7b for specialized Indonesian domains, such as medical herb question answering, outperforming other models by leveraging Indonesian-specific datasets.¹⁶ This approach is highly promising for consular AI, where queries often require precise and current regulatory or procedural information.
- **Knowledge Graphs (KGs):** Knowledge Graphs offer a structured way to represent information, capturing entities and the semantic relationships between them. Unlike vector-based similarity searches, KGs allow for exact matching and reasoning over these relationships during information retrieval.¹⁷ For complex consular queries that depend on interconnected pieces of information (e.g., visa eligibility based on multiple criteria, legal procedures involving several steps), KGs can provide a more robust foundation for QA systems. The development of Indonesian linguistic ontologies and ontology-based QA systems is an active area of research aimed at addressing challenges such as lexical gaps between user queries and ontology labels, semantic ambiguity, and the need for broad, multi-domain knowledge coverage.¹⁸ This is essential for building AI systems that can handle the multifaceted nature of consular inquiries.

The progression from fine-tuning generic BERT models to developing localized pre-trained language models like IndoBERT and the comprehensive SahabatAI ecosystem, coupled with the exploration of advanced architectures such as RAG and Knowledge Graphs for Indonesian, signals a maturing NLP landscape within the country. This trajectory is laying a robust technological foundation capable of supporting sophisticated, context-aware AI solutions for consular services. Such systems have the potential to move far beyond simple FAQ automation, offering capabilities for more complex reasoning, accessing up-to-date and specific knowledge bases, and interacting more naturally and effectively in Bahasa Indonesia

and its various regional languages. This evolution is critical for developing AI assistants that can genuinely enhance the quality, accessibility, and efficiency of consular support for Indonesian citizens globally.

A particularly noteworthy aspect of this development is the explicit focus on Indonesian dialects within the SahabatAI initiative ⁹ and the acknowledged challenges of handling code-switching in models like IndoBERT.⁶ This underscores a critical imperative for *hyper-localization* in the design and deployment of consular AI. While Bahasa Indonesia is the official language, many Indonesian citizens abroad may be more comfortable or primarily communicate in their regional languages or dialects. Consular services, by their very nature, must be accessible and effective for *all* citizens. If AI tools are predominantly optimized for standard Bahasa Indonesia, they risk inadvertently disadvantaging or excluding individuals who primarily use regional languages, thereby undermining the principle of equitable service access. This has profound implications for several stages of AI development. Data collection strategies for training consular AI must actively seek out, include, and appropriately label diverse linguistic data, encompassing various dialects and common patterns of code-switching. Subsequently, model fine-tuning processes must specifically address these linguistic variations to ensure accurate comprehension and the generation of appropriate responses. Achieving truly inclusive and effective AI-driven consular services for Indonesia therefore demands a deeper level of linguistic adaptation than might be necessary for more linguistically homogenous nations. This consideration directly impacts resource allocation for data acquisition, model development, rigorous testing across linguistic variations, and ongoing system maintenance. It also intersects directly with the ethical principles of fairness, non-discrimination, and accessibility in public service delivery.

B. Indonesia's Digital Consular Landscape: Progress and Challenges

Indonesia has made notable strides in digitalizing its consular services, aiming to provide more accessible and efficient support to its citizens abroad. Key platforms include the Portal Peduli WNI and the Safe Travel mobile application, recently augmented by the SARI AI chatbot.

1. Existing Platforms: Portal Peduli WNI and the Safe Travel Application – Functionality and User Reception

The Portal Peduli WNI (peduliwni.kemlu.go.id) serves as a central web-based platform for Indonesian citizens overseas. Its primary functionalities include Lapor Diri (Self-Reporting), which allows citizens to register their presence abroad online, eliminating the previous requirement for physical visits to embassies or consulates.¹⁹ It also offers Pelayanan Kekonsuleran (Consular Services) access and a mechanism for Pengaduan Kasus (Case

Reporting), enabling users to submit complaints or seek assistance regarding services or specific issues they face.²¹ The portal's data management is supported by ISO 27001:2013 certification for information security, and its service standards are subject to annual evaluation.²²

The **Safe Travel application**, developed by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Kemlu), is a mobile tool designed to provide practical information and assistance to Indonesians traveling or residing abroad. It includes features such as destination-specific information (security conditions, local laws, customs), immigration requirements, details on health services, locations of Indonesian Embassies/Consulates (KRI), and an emergency button for urgent help.²⁰ The app's privacy policy details its data handling practices.²⁵

User reception for these platforms has been mixed. While some users have found the Safe Travel app helpful and easy to use for travel purposes ²⁴, others have reported significant technical issues. These include persistent problems connecting to servers, particularly when trying to upload passport images for biodata submission, frequent app crashes, and occasional language display errors.²⁴ Such technical glitches can frustrate users and undermine confidence in the platform. A report from the Indonesian Consulate General (KJRI) in Shanghai highlighted another challenge: the low digital literacy of some service recipients can reduce the overall effectiveness of digital platforms like peduliwni.kemlu.go.id, even when consular staff and infrastructure are adaptive.²⁶

2. The SARI Chatbot Initiative: Features, Underlying Technology, and Targeted Impact for Indonesian Migrant Workers

Recognizing the specific needs of a significant and often vulnerable segment of its citizens abroad, the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Kemlu), in collaboration with UN Women, launched SARI (Sahabat Artifisial Migran Indonesia).²⁷ SARI is an AI-powered chatbot feature integrated within the Safe Travel mobile application.²⁰

The primary target group for SARI is Indonesian Migrant Workers (Pekerja Migran Indonesia - PMI), with a particular emphasis on women, who constitute a large proportion of PMIs and often face distinct challenges and vulnerabilities.²⁷ Key features of SARI are designed to address these specific needs:

- **Gender-Responsive and Empathetic Communication:** SARI is engineered to provide empathetic responses and avoid perpetuating stigma or prejudice, reportedly through the integration of gender-bias-free data in its training.²⁰
- **Information Provision:** It aims to summarize and deliver crucial information regarding security conditions, potential dangers, and crime threats relevant to the user's location.²⁰
- **Multilingual Capabilities:** SARI is intended to detect language and potentially

offer support in regional Indonesian languages such as Sundanese, Minahasa, and Melayu, enhancing accessibility for PMIs who may not be fluent in standard Bahasa Indonesia.²⁰

While the specific underlying LLM technology for SARI is not explicitly detailed beyond it being an "AI chatbot," its development aligns with the broader national push towards leveraging AI for public services, potentially drawing from or inspiring advancements within the SahabatAI ecosystem.⁸ The Ministry of Foreign Affairs views SARI as part of its commitment to digital transformation, aiming to improve access to reliable information, safety measures, and overall protection for PMIs, including helping to prevent issues like violence and human trafficking.²⁰ The chatbot was officially launched on April 21, 2025, coinciding with Kartini Day, a day celebrating Indonesian women's emancipation.²⁸

3. Identified Hurdles: Challenges in Indonesian Consular Service Delivery and Digital Service Adoption

Despite these digital advancements, the delivery of consular services to Indonesian citizens abroad faces several persistent challenges. Common services sought include passport renewals and replacements, legalization of documents, registration of vital events (births, marriages, deaths), emergency assistance, and general information provision.³⁴ The hurdles impacting both traditional and digital service delivery include:

- **Low Digital Literacy:** As previously mentioned, a significant portion of the user base, particularly certain groups of migrant workers, may have limited digital skills, hindering their ability to effectively utilize online portals and mobile applications.²⁶
- **Technical Instability of Platforms:** User-reported issues such as app crashes, server connection errors, and slow performance in existing digital tools like Safe Travel can lead to frustration and reduced adoption.²⁴
- **Data Privacy and Security:** The handling of sensitive personal data of citizens abroad necessitates robust data protection measures and adherence to privacy regulations, which requires ongoing vigilance and investment.²²
- **Accessibility and the Digital Divide:** Ensuring that digital services are accessible to all citizens, including those in remote locations or with limited or costly internet access, remains a challenge.²³
- **Complexity of Bureaucratic Processes:** Navigating the requirements for various consular services, including the array of necessary documents, can be complex and daunting for citizens.³⁶
- **Resource Constraints:** Limitations in funding, specialized technical skills, and personnel can affect the capacity of consular posts to manage a high volume of cases and respond effectively to emergencies.³⁸

- **Information Security in Diplomatic Technology:** Broader challenges in maintaining information security and internal controls within diplomatic technology units can pose risks, as highlighted in U.S. State Department assessments of their own missions in Indonesia, suggesting systemic complexities in such environments.³⁹
- **Volume and Diversity of Cases:** Consular staff often deal with a large number and wide variety of challenging cases, especially concerning migrant workers, such as lost contact with families, accidents, health emergencies, labor exploitation, human trafficking, legal problems, and deportations.³⁸
- **Combating Misinformation:** Protecting citizens, particularly PMIs, from misinformation and fraudulent schemes, such as deceptive job advertisements leading to exploitation, is an ongoing concern.³³

The concurrent development and deployment of general-impact digital platforms like Portal Peduli WNI and Safe Travel, alongside a specialized, AI-enhanced tool like the SARI chatbot for a particularly vulnerable demographic (Indonesian migrant workers), suggests a nuanced, tiered strategy in Indonesia's approach to digital consular services. This layered approach appears to acknowledge that a single, uniform digital solution may not adequately address the diverse spectrum of citizen needs and vulnerabilities. While broad platforms cater to general consular interactions and information access, the SARI initiative, with its AI-driven empathetic communication and focus on gender-responsiveness and regional language support²⁹, reflects a targeted effort to provide more tailored and accessible support to high-need, high-risk groups. This strategic segmentation—prioritizing advanced AI capabilities for demographics facing acute challenges while maintaining comprehensive platforms for general services—could offer a valuable model for other public service domains that grapple with similarly diverse user populations and varying levels of vulnerability.

However, despite these commendable advancements in creating digital consular platforms, the persistent challenges of low digital literacy among some end-users²⁶ and recurring technical glitches within the applications themselves²⁴ pose a significant risk. These issues could severely undermine the overall effectiveness and widespread adoption of even sophisticated AI solutions like SARI. This situation creates a critical dependency on traditional, non-digital support mechanisms and necessitates a robust, easily accessible user support infrastructure. If citizens struggle with basic digital navigation or if the platforms are unreliable, the advanced features of an AI chatbot—such as its capacity for empathy or multilingual interaction—may remain underutilized or fail to reach the very individuals who stand to benefit most. This points to a potential "last-mile problem," where sophisticated

backend technology does not translate into effective front-end service delivery due to user-side limitations or infrastructure-side deficiencies. Consequently, investments in AI and digital platforms must be strategically paralleled by equally robust investments in digital literacy programs for citizens abroad, dedicated multilingual technical support for these platforms, and potentially hybrid service models. Such hybrid models would combine the efficiencies of digital tools with readily available human assistance, especially for complex, sensitive, or urgent consular matters. Without this holistic approach, the return on investment in digital transformation initiatives may be constrained, and the goal of equitable and effective service delivery may not be fully realized.

Table 1: Overview of Indonesian Digital Consular Platforms

Platform Name	Primary Functionality	Target User Group(s)	Key Features	Underlying Technology (if known/inferred)	Reported Strengths	Reported Weaknesses/Challenges
Portal Peduli WNI	Self-reporting, consular service access, case reporting/complaints	Indonesian citizens residing abroad	Online Lapor Diri, access to consular service information, complaint submission	Web-based platform, database with ISO 27001:2013 security certification	Centralized online reporting, secure data storage, formal channel for complaints	Effectiveness can be reduced by low digital literacy of users ²⁶ ; relies on internet access.
Safe Travel Application	Practical travel information, emergency assistance	Indonesian citizens traveling or residing abroad	Destination info (security, laws, health), KRI locations, emergency button, host for	Mobile application (iOS, Android)	Provides useful travel information, emergency contact feature ²⁴	Technical issues: server connection problems, app crashes, language display

			SARI chatbot			errors ²⁴ ; data privacy considerations. ²⁵
SARI Chatbot	AI-powered information and assistance, empathetic support	Indonesia n Migrant Workers (PMIs), particularly women	Gender-responsive communication, empathetic responses, security/threat information, regional language translation (planned/reported)	AI chatbot, integrated into Safe Travel app; potentially leverages SahabatAI ecosystem	Targeted support for vulnerable group, aims for empathetic and non-judgmental interaction, multilingual capabilities ²⁰	Dependent on Safe Travel app's stability; effectiveness relies on user adoption and digital literacy; quality of AI responses and language support needs ongoing evaluation.

Data Sources: ¹⁹

III. AI Across Public Services: Global Innovations and Strategic Lessons

The application of Artificial Intelligence in public services extends far beyond consular affairs, with governments worldwide exploring its potential to enhance efficiency, improve citizen interactions, and address complex societal challenges.

A. International Case Studies: AI Transforming Citizen-Facing Government Services

Several nations have pioneered AI applications in public services, offering valuable insights:

- Singapore:** The GovTech agency has deployed AI-powered chatbots like "Ask Jamie" (utilized across over 70 government websites) and "HealthBuddy".⁴¹ These systems use Natural Language Processing (NLP) to provide instant, accurate

responses in multiple languages (English, Mandarin, Malay), reportedly leading to a 50% reduction in call center workload and 80% faster response times.⁴¹ The "Gov.sg" chatbot further integrates with Facebook Messenger, offering services from over 20 government agencies.⁴²

- **United States:** The U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS) utilizes "Emma," an advanced AI chatbot that assists immigrants with queries about visa status, green card eligibility, and citizenship exams in English and Spanish. Emma handles over a million inquiries monthly, achieving significant operational cost savings.⁴² USCIS also employs AI to refine asylum seeker application processing, and FEMA is testing generative AI for hazard mitigation planning.⁴³
- **Japan:** The Japan Meteorological Agency has implemented an AI-powered earthquake prediction system. This system uses deep learning to analyze seismic data in real-time, reportedly increasing earthquake detection accuracy by 70% and enabling faster evacuations.⁴¹
- **European Union:** A pilot program called "iBorderCtrl" explored AI-driven border security in Hungary, Greece, and Latvia. The system featured facial recognition, biometric scanning, and AI-based lie-detection tools to assess traveler risk, aiming to reduce border wait times while enhancing security screening.⁴¹
- **South Korea:** Seoul has implemented "Smart Bins" that use AI computer vision to identify waste types, automatically sort recyclables, and send real-time data to optimize waste collection routes. This has led to reduced waste overflow and increased recycling efficiency.⁴¹
- **Brazil:** In São Paulo, an AI-driven smart traffic management system uses sensors to adjust traffic signals in real-time and predict congestion patterns, resulting in reduced travel times and vehicle emissions in high-traffic zones.⁴¹
- **Australia:** The Australian Taxation Office (ATO) employs the "ATAX" chatbot to field common tax-related questions and guide users through tax processes, making tax filing more accessible.⁴²
- **Canada:** The "Alex" chatbot assists Canadian citizens with tax filing information and benefits inquiries.⁴²
- **Private Sector Innovation for Public Needs:** Nous Infosystems developed an AI-powered immigration chatbot for a NextGen Technology Platform, leveraging Azure OpenAI and Pinecone DB, which reportedly reduced support calls by 40% and compliance time by 30%.⁴⁵ While a private solution, it demonstrates the capabilities applicable to public immigration and consular services.
- **Conceptual AI Applications:** Research explores concepts like an "AI as Digital Consul Assistant," where AI uses descriptive and predictive analytics to help consular offices manage fluctuating demand for services such as emergency

passports and visa requests more effectively.¹

These examples illustrate the diverse ways AI is being harnessed globally to improve public service delivery, from citizen information and administrative processing to public safety and urban management.

B. Benefits, Limitations, and Risks of AI in the Public Sector: An Evidence-Based Review

The integration of AI into public administration offers a spectrum of potential benefits alongside significant challenges and risks that require careful management.

Benefits:

- **Efficiency and Cost Reduction:** AI can automate routine, repetitive, and administrative-heavy tasks such as form reviews, application tracking, and document handling, leading to enhanced operational efficiency and reduced costs.⁴⁶ This frees up human public servants to focus on more complex, sensitive, or strategic tasks.⁴⁶
- **Improved Data Utilization and Decision-Making:** AI excels at processing and analyzing vast amounts of data, helping to structure previously scattered information, identify relevant patterns, and support faster, more evidence-based decision-making by public officials.⁴³
- **Enhanced Citizen Services:** AI-powered tools like chatbots and virtual assistants can provide 24/7 support, reduce wait times for inquiries, and improve public access to information and services.⁴¹
- **Predictive Capabilities:** Predictive analytics driven by AI can help governments forecast trends in areas like public health, traffic flow, or demand for citizen services, enabling more effective resource allocation and proactive crisis management.⁴⁶
- **Fraud Detection:** AI algorithms can identify unusual patterns in transactions or claims that may indicate fraudulent activity, helping to safeguard public funds.⁴⁶
- **Transparency and Accountability:** When designed appropriately, AI systems can offer greater transparency in processes and traceability of decisions, potentially strengthening public trust and accountability mechanisms.⁴⁸

Limitations and Risks:

- **Algorithmic Bias and Fairness:** A primary concern is that AI systems can inherit and even amplify existing societal biases present in their training data. This can lead to unfair outcomes, discrimination against certain groups, and erosion of

public trust.⁵⁰

- **Lack of Transparency and Explainability:** Many advanced AI models, particularly deep learning systems, operate as "black boxes," making it difficult to understand their decision-making processes. This opacity hinders accountability and the ability to debug errors or biases.⁴⁷
- **Data Privacy and Security:** AI systems often require access to large volumes of data, including sensitive personal information. This raises significant concerns about data privacy, potential breaches, and cybersecurity vulnerabilities.⁴⁶
- **Workforce Adaptation and Skills Gap:** The integration of AI necessitates new skills and competencies within the public sector workforce, and adapting to these changes can be challenging.⁴³
- **Potential for Errors and Unjust Profiling:** Flaws in AI models or their underlying data can lead to errors in decision-making, potentially resulting in unjust profiling or denial of services.⁵⁰
- **Erosion of Individual Freedoms:** Unchecked AI-driven surveillance and predictive analytics could lead to infringements on fundamental freedoms, such as freedom of expression, association, and movement.⁴⁷
- **Implementation Challenges:** The deployment of AI in the public sector has often been fragmented or ad hoc, with pilot projects failing to scale effectively to achieve widespread impact.⁴⁷ The cost of developing, implementing, and maintaining AI systems can also be substantial.⁴⁸
- **Public Acceptance and Trust:** Gaining public acceptance and trust in AI-driven government services is crucial but can be difficult, especially if there are concerns about fairness, privacy, or lack of human oversight.⁴⁸
- **Accountability Deficits:** The complexity of AI systems and the distributed nature of decision-making in AI-augmented processes can create accountability gaps, making it unclear who is responsible when errors or harms occur.⁵⁶

C. Integrating AI Solutions with Legacy Government Systems: Technical and Operational Pathways

A significant hurdle for AI adoption in the public sector is the prevalence of legacy IT systems. Effective AI integration strategies must account for this reality, aiming to enhance existing capabilities rather than requiring complete overhauls where unnecessary.

Most public sector bodies operate with established, often aging, IT infrastructure. Therefore, AI solutions must be designed with the capability to "plug into" these existing platforms—such as case management tools, financial software, or records databases—without causing major disruptions or demanding extensive redevelopment.⁴⁶ A fundamental prerequisite for any successful AI integration is the availability of high-quality, accessible, and well-managed data. Without a solid data foundation, the potential of AI cannot be fully realized.⁴³

Several technical and operational pathways can facilitate this integration:

- **Application Programming Interfaces (APIs):** APIs are crucial for enabling smooth and secure data flow between new AI systems and existing government databases. They act as bridges, allowing different software components to communicate and exchange information in a standardized manner.⁵² Conversational AI APIs, offered by providers like Google (Dialogflow), OpenAI, Microsoft (Azure Cognitive Services), Amazon (Lex), and IBM (watsonx Assistant), allow developers to integrate sophisticated chat and natural language understanding capabilities into existing websites, applications, or service platforms.⁵⁹
- **AI-as-a-Service (AlaaS) Models:** Cloud providers and specialized vendors offer AlaaS, which provides access to pre-built AI tools, models (e.g., for machine learning or NLP), and infrastructure on a subscription or pay-as-you-go basis.⁴³ This can accelerate adoption and reduce upfront investment, allowing agencies to deploy AI capabilities more rapidly without needing extensive in-house expertise. However, agencies must carefully evaluate potential vendor lock-in and ensure that these services comply with government security and data sovereignty requirements.⁴³
- **Cloud Platforms:** Cloud computing environments (e.g., AWS, Azure, Google Cloud) offer the scalability, flexibility, and computational resources necessary for developing, training, and deploying AI models and workloads of varying complexity.⁴³
- **Phased and Iterative Approach:** A staged methodology is generally recommended. This begins with clearly defined objectives for the AI project.⁴⁶ It is followed by pilot projects to test feasibility and gather insights before committing to full-scale rollouts.⁴³ Continuous testing, user feedback, and iteration are key to refining the solution.
- **Data Synchronization and Quality:** Mechanisms must be in place to ensure that data exchanged between AI systems and legacy databases is accurate, consistent, and updated in (or near) real-time to maintain the reliability of AI-driven insights and actions.⁵² Robust data governance and preparation processes are essential.⁴⁶
- **DevSecOps Integration:** Incorporating AI and machine learning components into the DevSecOps (Development, Security, and Operations) pipeline can help streamline development, ensure security is built-in, and manage the lifecycle of AI applications more effectively within the government's IT environment.⁴³

The successful global case studies of AI in public services, such as Singapore's GovTech chatbots⁴¹ and the USCIS's Emma chatbot⁴², often reveal a strategic

combination of advanced AI capabilities, like NLP and machine learning, with disciplined data management practices and a clear, citizen-centric focus on solving specific, high-impact problems. These examples demonstrate that AI is typically applied not merely for its novelty but as a strategic tool to address tangible operational challenges—such as managing high volumes of citizen inquiries or streamlining complex administrative processes—where data can be effectively leveraged to improve outcomes. This implies that for Indonesia, or any nation looking to implement AI in consular or other public services, a problem-driven and data-informed approach is paramount. Identifying specific pain points within consular operations (e.g., repetitive, high-volume questions; complex document navigation; lengthy processing times) and ensuring the availability of structured, relevant, and high-quality data pertinent to those areas should be foundational activities that precede or accompany the development and deployment of AI tools. Technology alone is insufficient; its successful application hinges on a clear understanding of the problem it aims to solve and the data that will fuel its intelligence.

While AI presents transformative potential for public services, the consistent and widespread emphasis across research and policy discussions on risks such as algorithmic bias, lack of transparency, and privacy violations⁵⁰ indicates that the socio-technical challenges of AI adoption are at least as significant, if not more so, than the purely technical ones. Technical hurdles, like integrating AI with legacy systems⁴⁶, are often solvable with engineering effort. However, issues such as ensuring fairness, building public trust⁵², fostering workforce adaptation⁵¹, and establishing clear accountability⁵⁶ require a broader, multi-faceted approach that extends beyond technology. Effective governance frameworks, transparent operational protocols, and sustained public trust are critical non-technical enablers for the successful and ethical deployment of AI in the public sphere. This suggests that resources must be allocated not only to research, development, and technical deployment but also, crucially, to establishing robust ethical guidelines, comprehensive governance structures, mechanisms for public consultation and engagement, and extensive training programs. These efforts are essential to build and maintain public confidence and to ensure that AI is utilized responsibly, equitably, and in a manner that upholds democratic values and citizen rights. For consular services, which inherently deal with sensitive personal data, diverse populations, and decisions that can profoundly impact individuals' lives, addressing these socio-technical dimensions is of paramount importance. Failure to do so can lead to project failure, public backlash, erosion of trust, or even tangible harm to citizens.

IV. Comparative Global Perspectives: Innovation in Consular Service Delivery

A comparative analysis of how different nations are modernizing their consular services, particularly through digital transformation and AI adoption, offers valuable lessons and benchmarks for Indonesia.

A. Modernizing Consular Operations: A Cross-Country Analysis

Countries around the world are at various stages of leveraging technology to enhance their consular operations:

- **United States:** The U.S. Department of State's Bureau of Consular Affairs (CA) is tasked with protecting U.S. citizens abroad, supporting border security, and facilitating legitimate travel.⁶⁰ Technology initiatives are overseen by the Bureau of Diplomatic Technology.⁶¹ The CA has adopted Leadership and Management Tenets and a "Balanced, SMART, and Lean" Management Framework to drive efficiencies, which includes fostering innovation through forums and metrics projects.⁶² A prime example of AI use is the "Emma" chatbot for U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services (USCIS), assisting with immigration queries.⁴² The U.S. Digital Service (USDS) has also been involved in improving visa application status check tools, emphasizing user-centric design with plain language and thorough user testing.⁶³ Challenges include dealing with legacy systems and the need for standardized software development processes.⁶³ The Government Accountability Office (GAO) has made recommendations concerning the mitigation of IT vulnerabilities and department-wide risk profiling for the State Department.⁶⁴
- **United Kingdom:** The Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) manages consular services, prioritizing emergency situations and support for vulnerable British citizens abroad. They offer online applications for emergency travel documents.⁶⁵ A significant technological shift is the upcoming implementation of an Electronic Travel Authorization (ETA) system, similar to the U.S. ESTA, as part of a broader move towards a digital border system.⁶⁶
- **Canada:** Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada (IRCC) provides a Client Support Centre that offers multiple channels for inquiries, including web forms (with specific forms for crisis situations), an automated telephone service, and access to live agents for those within Canada.⁶⁷ Separately, the Canada Revenue Agency (CRA) is piloting an online chat service with live agents within its secure "My Account" portal, allowing taxpayers to discuss account-specific issues related to personal income tax and benefits.⁶⁸
- **Australia:** The Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) operates the Smartraveller website, a comprehensive resource providing travel advice, advisories for over 170 destinations, and a subscription service for email updates.⁶⁹ A Consular Services Charter clearly outlines the scope of assistance

provided, and a 24/7 Consular Emergency Centre is available.⁶⁹ Australia encourages citizens to first seek assistance from other sources (family, airlines, insurance) before contacting missions for non-emergency matters.⁷⁰

- **Singapore:** Beyond its well-regarded Gov.sg chatbot ⁴¹, Singapore's Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) actively encourages citizens traveling to potentially volatile regions to e-register. This allows the MFA to provide timely updates and assistance. Contact details for High Commissions and Consulates, including 24-hour duty mobile phone numbers, are readily available for emergency support.⁷¹
- **South Korea:** The Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MOFA) delivers consular and visa services through its global network of embassies and consulates.⁷³ Key digital initiatives include an E-Visa Center dedicated to online processing of civil affairs and visa issuances, particularly beneficial for international talent and group tourists. South Korea also utilizes an Automated Immigration Clearance Service (SES) and maintains an Immigration Contact Center (reachable via the 1345 hotline).⁷⁴
- **Germany:** Germany has made significant strides with the launch of a new Consular Services Portal. This portal allows foreign nationals to apply online for 28 different national visa categories (including for employment, studies, and family reunification) across all 167 of Germany's visa sections worldwide.⁷⁵ The system aims to drastically reduce the need for in-person visits to consular offices, eliminate postal deliveries of applications, and shorten long waits for appointments. Further digitalization and expansion of the portal's functionality are planned.⁷⁵ Additionally, a project to build a German Embassy chatbot using BERT and other LLMs is underway, designed to handle visa, passport, and immigration-related questions in multiple languages (German and English), drawing on data from embassy FAQs, government websites, and support logs, and fine-tuned for domain-specific accuracy.⁷⁶
- **Thailand:** Thailand's Department of Consular Affairs is actively expanding its e-Consular services.⁷⁷ This includes the issuance of e-Passports incorporating advanced security features like iris scan technology. A notable innovation is their stickerless e-Visa system, accessible via the thaievisa.go.th website. This system allows applicants to complete the entire visa application process virtually – from document submission and online verification to approval and payment – eliminating the need for physical document submission or visits to Thai Embassies or Consulates-General. This e-Visa system is operational at 38 missions in 23 countries, with plans for global expansion. Thailand has also implemented e-Legalisation services using electronic signatures and QR codes for document authentication and has established a Rapid Response Centre (RRC) to coordinate

responses to overseas emergencies affecting Thai nationals.⁷⁷

The global trend in consular service modernization clearly points towards not merely digitizing isolated existing processes but fundamentally reimagining the entirety of service delivery. This involves creating integrated digital platforms, fostering proactive citizen engagement, and increasingly leveraging AI for personalized assistance and operational efficiency. Countries like Germany, with its comprehensive online Consular Services Portal ⁷⁵, and Thailand, with its end-to-end stickerless e-Visa system ⁷⁷, are setting new benchmarks for what comprehensive digital transformation in consular affairs can achieve. This maturation signifies a move beyond simple online information repositories towards truly interactive, efficient, and holistic digital consular ecosystems. For Indonesia, this implies that its own digital transformation journey in consular services should aspire to similar levels of integration and comprehensiveness, drawing lessons from these advanced international models to architect a seamless and citizen-centric experience for its nationals abroad.

Table 2: Comparative Overview of Consular AI/Digital Services in Select Countries

Country	Key Digital/AI Consular Service(s)	Primary Functionalities	Noteworthy Technologies Used	Multilingual Support	Reported Impact/Benefits
USA	"Emma" (USCIS Chatbot), Visa Status Check Tool, CA Innovation Forum	Immigration queries, visa status, leadership & efficiency in consular ops	AI, NLP, User-centric design principles, Metrics projects	Yes (Emma: Eng, Spa)	Emma: >1M inquiries/month, >\$12M annual savings ⁴² ; Improved visa status info ⁶³ ; Enhanced ops efficiency ⁶²
UK	Online Emergency Travel Document, ETA System	Passport replacement in emergencies , pre-travel	Digital application platform, ETA (digital border	Primarily English	Faster emergency document processing

	(upcoming)	clearance	system)		⁶⁵ ; Streamlined travel authorization ⁶⁶
Canada	IRCC Client Support Centre (Web forms, Phone), CRA Chat Pilot	Immigration/ citizenship inquiries, crisis support, tax/benefits queries	Web forms, Automated phone, Live agent chat (CRA)	Yes (Eng, Fre)	Multiple channels for support ⁶⁷ ; Direct chat for tax issues ⁶⁸
Australia	Smarttraveller website & app, Consular Emergency Centre	Travel advice, emergency assistance, service charter	Online portal, Subscription updates, 24/7 emergency line	Primarily English	Informed travelers, coordinated emergency response ⁶⁹
Singapore	Gov.sg Chatbot, MFA e-registration	Multi-agency info, important announcements, proactive alerts for travelers	AI, NLP, Facebook Messenger integration, e-registration system	Yes (Eng, Man, Mal)	Gov.sg: >3M inquiries handled ⁴² ; Enhanced safety for citizens in volatile regions ⁷¹
S. Korea	E-Visa Center, Automated Immigration Clearance (SES), 1345 Hotline	Online visa issuance, expedited immigration, general immigration info	Online visa platform, Biometric systems (likely for SES)	Korean, English (for some services)	Streamlined visa for talent/tourists, faster immigration clearance ⁷⁴
Germany	Consular Services Portal, German Embassy	Online visa applications (28 categories), general	Comprehensive online portal, BERT/LLM	Yes (German, Eng for chatbot)	Reduced in-person visits, faster visa processing

	Chatbot (planned)	consular queries	for chatbot		(portal goal) ⁷⁵ ; Efficient query handling (chatbot goal) ⁷⁶
Thailand	e-Visa System, e-Passport, e-Legalisation, RRC	Stickerless online visa application, secure passports, digital document legalization, emergency response coordination	Online visa platform, Iris scan (passport), E-signatures, QR codes	Thai, English (e-Visa likely)	Contactless visa process, enhanced document security, rapid emergency response ⁷⁷

Data Sources: ⁴¹

B. Emerging Best Practices in Digital Consular Services and AI Deployment

From the varied approaches of these nations, several best practices in the digitalization and AI-enhancement of consular services emerge:

- **User-Centric Design:** Prioritizing the user experience by employing plain language, conducting thorough user testing, and developing intuitive interfaces is fundamental. The U.S. Digital Service's approach to redesigning visa status tools exemplifies this.⁶³
- **24/7 Accessibility:** AI-powered chatbots and comprehensive online portals offer continuous support and information access, unconstrained by traditional office hours.⁴¹
- **Multilingual Support:** Given the global nature of consular services and the linguistic diversity of many nations' diasporas, providing services in multiple languages is essential for inclusivity and effectiveness.⁴¹
- **Integrated Service Platforms:** Moving towards single, integrated portals or interconnected systems that provide access to a wide range of consular services (e.g., Singapore's Gov.sg, Germany's Consular Services Portal) enhances user convenience and streamlines administrative processes.⁴²
- **Proactive Information Dissemination:** Utilizing tools like e-registration systems for targeted alerts (as done by Singapore's MFA ⁷¹) and offering subscription

services for travel advisories (like Australia's Smartraveller ⁷⁰) allows for proactive communication with citizens, especially in times of crisis or changing circumstances.

- **Focus on Vulnerable Groups:** Tailoring services and prioritizing assistance for vulnerable populations, such as citizens in distress or specific demographic groups with unique needs (e.g., the UK FCDO's prioritization ⁶⁵; Indonesia's SARI chatbot for migrant workers ²⁷), is a key aspect of responsible consular care.
- **Data-Driven Improvement:** Systematically collecting and analyzing service metrics and user feedback to identify areas for improvement and to enhance service delivery is crucial (e.g., the U.S. Bureau of Consular Affairs' Metrics Project ⁶²).
- **Phased Rollout and Piloting:** Testing new AI solutions and digital services through pilot programs before full-scale deployment allows for refinement, risk mitigation, and better alignment with user needs (e.g., the EU's iBorderCtrl pilot ⁴¹; Canada Revenue Agency's chat pilot ⁶⁸).
- **Digitalization of Core Consular Processes:** Transitioning core functions such as visa applications, passport renewals, and emergency travel document issuance to fully online processes significantly improves efficiency and accessibility (e.g., Germany, UK, Thailand ⁶⁵).
- **International Collaboration and Information Sharing:** Engaging in forums and initiatives like the Global Consular Forum to share best practices, challenges, and solutions can foster collective improvement in consular services worldwide.⁷⁸
- **Clear Service Charters and Expectation Management:** Publishing clear service charters that outline what assistance consular services can and cannot provide (e.g., Australia's Consular Services Charter ⁶⁹) helps manage citizen expectations and clarifies the scope of government responsibility.

While many countries showcase advanced AI and comprehensive digital platforms, a persistent and crucial best practice is the concurrent emphasis on clear communication regarding the limitations of these services (as seen with Australia's Consular Services Charter ⁶⁹) and the maintenance of robust, human-centric emergency support systems, especially for vulnerable citizens (demonstrated by the UK FCDO's approach ⁶⁵). Even with sophisticated digital tools, 24/7 human-operated emergency hotlines remain a non-negotiable staple of effective consular operations across leading nations.⁶⁹ This observation strongly suggests that technology is intended to complement and augment human capabilities, rather than entirely replace the fundamental human element and the inherent duty of care in consular services. As Indonesia continues to develop and deploy its AI-driven consular tools, it will be vital to simultaneously reinforce its human-centric support systems, particularly for

emergency response and assistance to vulnerable individuals in critical situations. Achieving a judicious balance between technological efficiency and human empathy and intervention is key to maintaining public trust and fulfilling the core protective mandate of consular affairs.

C. The Critical Role of Multilingual NLP for Inclusive Global Consular Access

Consular services, by definition, must be accessible and comprehensible to all citizens of a nation, irrespective of their primary language or dialect. For a linguistically diverse country like Indonesia, with numerous regional languages spoken by its diaspora, multilingual Natural Language Processing (NLP) is not just a desirable feature but a fundamental requirement for inclusive and equitable global consular access.

The development and deployment of multilingual NLP systems, however, present several significant challenges ⁷⁹:

- **Linguistic Diversity:** Languages vary immensely in vocabulary, grammar, syntax, and idiomatic expressions. Handling this diversity within a single AI system is complex.
- **Data Scarcity:** Many languages and, even more so, specific dialects, are "low-resource," meaning there is a limited amount of digital text and speech data available for training AI models. This is a major impediment to building high-performing NLP tools for these languages.
- **Code-Switching:** In multilingual communities, it is common for speakers to mix languages or dialects within a single conversation or even a single sentence. Traditional NLP models, often trained on monolingual text, struggle to process and understand code-switched input effectively.⁷⁹
- **Fairness and Bias:** AI models can inadvertently learn and perpetuate biases present in their training data. If training data for certain languages or dialects is less representative or contains societal biases, the resulting NLP system may perform poorly or unfairly for speakers of those languages.⁷⁹
- **Cultural Nuances and Context:** Language is deeply intertwined with culture. A direct translation or a context-unaware response can lead to misunderstandings, offense, or ineffective communication. AI systems need to be culturally adaptable, understanding appropriate tones, levels of formality, and culturally specific references.⁸⁰

Despite these challenges, various solutions and strategic approaches are being pursued to advance multilingual NLP ⁷⁹:

- **Multilingual Pre-trained Models:** Large-scale models like multilingual BERT

(mBERT) and XLM-RoBERTa (XLM-R) are pre-trained on text from many languages simultaneously.⁷⁶ These models learn cross-lingual representations and can often perform tasks in multiple languages, sometimes even with a degree of proficiency in handling code-switching.

- **Cross-Lingual Transfer Learning:** This technique leverages knowledge learned from training on high-resource languages (which have abundant data) to improve performance in low-resource languages. A model pre-trained on diverse languages can often be fine-tuned for a specific task in a new, low-resource language with relatively limited data.⁷⁹
- **User Language Selection:** A straightforward approach in chatbot design is to allow users to select their preferred language at the beginning of an interaction. This ensures the conversation proceeds in a language the user understands, though it doesn't inherently solve the AI's underlying comprehension challenges for all possible inputs.⁸⁰
- **Machine Translation (MT) Integration:** MT can be used as a component to translate user input into a language the AI understands well, and then translate the AI's response back into the user's language. However, reliance on MT must be cautious, as translation errors, especially with slang, idioms, and culturally specific expressions, can occur and degrade the user experience or lead to miscommunication.⁷⁹ Human vetting or oversight for sensitive or nuanced content translated by machines remains crucial.
- **Cultural Adaptation Training:** Beyond linguistic accuracy, efforts are needed to train AI systems to be culturally sensitive, projecting appropriate tones and adhering to cultural norms of formality and interaction style for different user groups.⁸⁰
- **Centralized Content Management:** For multilingual systems that rely on predefined responses or knowledge bases, robust content management systems are essential to ensure that information is consistently and accurately translated and updated across all supported languages.⁸⁰

The implications of effective multilingual NLP for consular services are profound. It directly impacts accessibility, ensuring that citizens who are not proficient in the dominant or official language can still access vital information and assistance.⁷⁹ It promotes inclusivity, making digital resources and government services available to a broader and more diverse audience, thereby ensuring that no citizen is left behind due to language limitations.⁷⁹ For Indonesia, with its rich tapestry of languages and dialects spoken by its citizens at home and abroad, a strategic focus on advancing and implementing robust multilingual NLP capabilities is indispensable for realizing

the full potential of AI-driven consular modernization in an equitable manner.

Table 3: Key Challenges and Strategic Solutions in Multilingual NLP for Public Services

Challenge	Description of Challenge	Strategic Solutions/Approaches
Linguistic Diversity	Languages vary greatly in vocabulary, grammar, syntax, script, and semantic nuances, making it hard for a single model to master all. ⁷⁹	Utilize multilingual pre-trained models (e.g., mBERT, XLM-R) ⁷⁹ ; Develop language-specific or dialect-specific model components where feasible; Continuous research into underrepresented linguistic structures.
Data Scarcity (Low-Resource Languages/Dialects)	Many languages and dialects lack sufficient digital text and speech data for effective AI model training. ⁶	Employ cross-lingual transfer learning ⁷⁹ ; Zero-shot and few-shot learning techniques; Data augmentation strategies; Crowdsourcing for data collection; Focus on models like SahabatAI that explicitly include regional dialects. ⁹
Code-Switching	Users frequently mix languages or dialects within a single conversation or sentence, confusing models trained on monolingual text. ⁶	Leverage advanced multilingual models (e.g., multilingual BERT, GPT variants) that show better contextual understanding of mixed-language input ⁷⁹ ; Specific research and model fine-tuning on code-switched datasets.
Bias and Fairness	AI models can learn and amplify biases present in training data, leading to discriminatory or unfair outcomes for certain linguistic groups. ⁷⁹	Curate diverse and representative training datasets; Develop methods for bias detection and mitigation in models; Fine-tune models for

		sensitivity to discrimination; Implement fair evaluation metrics across languages.
Cultural Nuances & Context	Direct translations can miss cultural subtleties, politeness norms, or specific connotations, leading to miscommunication or offense. ⁸⁰	Incorporate cultural sensitivity training into model development; Design chatbots with adaptable formality levels and tones; Employ human review for culturally sensitive content; Localize user interfaces and interaction flows.
Machine Translation Errors	While MT is a component, it can fail with idioms, slang, or complex culturally loaded expressions, leading to absurd or incorrect translations. ⁸⁰	Use MT judiciously, especially for critical information; Implement quality checks and human post-editing for sensitive translations; Inform users about potential MT limitations; Prioritize native language generation where possible for key interactions.
Maintenance & Content Management	Supporting multiple languages means managing multiple versions of content, FAQs, and responses, which can be complex and prone to inconsistencies. ⁸⁰	Implement centralized content management systems with version control and translation workflows; Automated synchronization of updates across language versions; Regular audits for consistency and accuracy.

Data Sources: ⁶

V. Ethical Governance and Trustworthy AI in Consular Affairs

The deployment of AI in consular services, while promising significant benefits, also introduces complex ethical considerations that must be proactively addressed to ensure these technologies are used responsibly, equitably, and in a manner that upholds public trust and fundamental human rights.

A. Navigating the Ethical Terrain: Transparency, Accountability, Bias, Fairness, Privacy, and Human Rights in AI for Public Services

Several core ethical principles are paramount when integrating AI into public services, particularly in the sensitive domain of consular affairs:

- **Transparency and Explainability:** Governments have an obligation to be transparent about their use of AI systems. This includes clarity regarding the data sources used for training and operation, the general nature of the algorithms employed, and the processes by which AI systems contribute to decisions that affect citizens.⁴⁴ The "black box" nature of some AI models, where decision-making pathways are opaque even to developers, poses a significant challenge to transparency and can erode public trust if not adequately addressed.⁵⁰ Achieving algorithmic transparency involves not just technical disclosure but also ensuring that explanations are understandable to the public and relevant to the context of use.⁵⁴
- **Accountability:** Clear mechanisms must be established to hold government agencies and officials accountable for the development, deployment, and outcomes of AI systems used in public services.⁴⁴ This includes establishing independent oversight bodies, implementing regular public reporting on AI use, and clearly defining roles and responsibilities within agencies for AI governance and incident response.⁴⁴ A key challenge is that the introduction of AI can alter the traditional roles and responsibilities of public employees, potentially leading to ambiguity regarding who or what should be held accountable when AI systems err or cause harm.⁵⁶
- **Bias and Fairness:** AI systems must be designed, trained, and deployed with a strong commitment to fairness and non-discrimination.⁴⁴ A major risk is that AI models can learn and perpetuate existing societal biases present in their training data, leading to discriminatory outcomes, particularly against marginalized or underrepresented groups.⁵⁰ Ensuring fairness requires diligent efforts to curate diverse and representative training data, develop techniques for bias detection and mitigation, and continuously monitor and evaluate AI system outputs against established fairness metrics and non-discrimination standards.⁴⁴
- **Privacy:** The protection of individual privacy is a fundamental ethical imperative, especially as AI systems often process vast amounts of personal and sensitive data.⁴⁴ Agencies must ensure that the collection, use, storage, and sharing of data by AI systems strictly adhere to established privacy norms, data protection regulations (such as GDPR where applicable), and principles of data minimization.
- **Human Rights:** The deployment of AI in consular and other public services must be aligned with the protection and promotion of human rights and fundamental dignity.⁵⁰ There is a tangible risk that unchecked AI applications, particularly in areas like surveillance, profiling, or decision-making about entitlements, could

infringe upon fundamental rights such as privacy, due process, freedom of expression, and freedom of movement.⁵⁰

- **Human Oversight and Determination:** While AI can automate and augment decision-making, it should not displace ultimate human responsibility and accountability, particularly for critical decisions with significant impact on individuals' lives.⁴⁴ Human experts should remain in the loop, with the ability to review, understand, and, where necessary, override AI-generated recommendations or decisions, ensuring that ethical considerations are upheld and that automated systems do not perpetuate unintended biases or unfairness.⁴⁴

B. Global AI Governance Frameworks (e.g., UNESCO RAM AI, EU AI Act) and Their Relevance to Consular AI

The international community is increasingly recognizing the need for robust governance frameworks to guide the ethical development and deployment of AI. Several key initiatives provide valuable principles and guidance relevant to the use of AI in consular services:

- **UNESCO Recommendation on the Ethics of Artificial Intelligence (RAM AI):** This landmark framework, adopted by UNESCO member states, provides a comprehensive global standard for the ethical governance of AI. It emphasizes core values such as respect for human rights and dignity, living in peaceful and just societies, ensuring diversity and inclusiveness, and environmental flourishing.⁵⁰ RAM AI outlines ten core principles: Proportionality and Do No Harm; Safety and Security; Fairness and Non-Discrimination; Sustainability; Right to Privacy, and Data Protection; Human Oversight and Determination; Transparency and Explainability; Responsibility and Accountability; Awareness and Literacy; and Multi-stakeholder and Adaptive Governance and Collaboration.⁸⁴ These principles are directly applicable to ensuring that AI systems in consular affairs are developed and used in a trustworthy manner.
- **European Union AI Act:** The EU AI Act is a pioneering legislative effort to regulate AI based on a risk-based approach. It aims to ensure that AI systems placed on the EU market and used within the Union are safe and respect fundamental rights and EU values.⁵³ For high-risk AI systems, which could include certain applications in law enforcement, border control, or administration of justice relevant to consular functions, the Act imposes stringent requirements regarding data governance, transparency, human oversight, accuracy, and cybersecurity.⁵⁰
- **United States Executive Order 14110 on "Safe, Secure, and Trustworthy Development and Use of Artificial Intelligence":** This executive order directs

U.S. federal agencies to develop guidelines, standards, and best practices for AI safety and security. It outlines policy goals such as promoting competition in the AI industry, preventing AI-enabled threats to civil liberties, and ensuring responsible AI innovation.⁵³

- **United Nations Initiatives:** Various UN bodies are actively engaged in discussions on AI governance. For instance, a UN advisory body has recommended the establishment of inclusive international institutions to regulate AI, emphasizing principles rooted in international law and human rights law.⁵³

These global frameworks underscore a growing consensus on the need for proactive and comprehensive AI governance. For consular AI applications, which inherently involve processing sensitive personal data, making decisions that can affect individuals' rights and international mobility, and operating in a cross-border context, these international principles provide essential benchmarks for developing national policies and operational guidelines.

C. Foundational Principles for Building and Maintaining Trustworthy AI Systems in Citizen Services

Building and maintaining public trust in AI-driven citizen services, including consular assistance, requires adherence to several foundational principles:

- **Human Rights-Based Approach:** AI systems should be designed, developed, and deployed in a manner that explicitly respects, protects, and promotes human rights and fundamental freedoms.⁵⁴
- **Multi-stakeholder Collaboration:** Effective AI governance benefits from the engagement of diverse stakeholders, including government agencies, industry developers, academic researchers, civil society organizations, and the public. This inclusive approach helps ensure that AI frameworks are comprehensive, ethically sound, and aligned with societal values and expectations.⁴⁴
- **Rigorous Testing, Validation, and Continuous Audits:** AI systems must undergo thorough testing and validation before deployment to ensure their safety, accuracy, reliability, and robustness. Continuous monitoring and periodic audits are necessary to detect and mitigate biases, ensure ongoing performance, and adapt to evolving risks or societal norms.⁴⁴
- **Comprehensive Data Governance:** Robust data governance frameworks are essential. These should cover the entire data lifecycle, including ethical data collection, secure storage, appropriate processing and use, responsible data sharing, and adherence to all relevant data protection regulations.⁴⁴
- **Transparency and Explainability in Practice:** Beyond policy statements,

agencies should adopt tools and techniques that can provide meaningful explanations for AI-driven decisions in terms that are understandable to users and oversight bodies. This enhances transparency and allows for scrutiny.⁴⁴

- **Public Engagement and Awareness:** Actively engaging the public in discussions about the use of AI in government services can help build trust, gather diverse perspectives, and ensure that AI systems are developed and deployed in ways that align with societal values and meet genuine citizen needs.⁵³ Promoting AI literacy is also important.
- **Independent Oversight and Redress Mechanisms:** Establishing independent bodies to oversee the use of AI in the public sector and providing clear, accessible mechanisms for citizens to seek redress in cases of AI-related errors, discrimination, or harm are crucial for accountability and trust.⁴⁴

The global momentum towards establishing comprehensive AI governance frameworks, as evidenced by initiatives like UNESCO's RAM AI, the EU AI Act, and the US Executive Order on AI⁵⁰, reflects a widespread recognition that the transformative power of AI, especially when applied in public services, demands proactive ethical safeguards rather than merely reactive responses to problems after they arise. For consular services, which operate at the sensitive intersection of national sovereignty, international law, and individual human rights, this global trend implies an urgent need to embed ethical considerations deeply within the entire lifecycle of AI systems. This means integrating ethics from the initial design and data collection phases, through model development and training, and into deployment, ongoing monitoring, and periodic review. It is not sufficient to treat ethics as a compliance checklist to be addressed post-development; rather, it must be a core, guiding principle shaping how AI is envisioned, built, and used to serve citizens abroad.

The challenge of ensuring "accountability" for AI-driven public services⁵⁶ becomes particularly acute within the context of consular affairs. This is due to several compounding factors: the inherently distributed nature of diplomatic missions operating across diverse international jurisdictions; the involvement of multiple human and automated actors in service delivery (including local staff, central ministry officials, and the AI systems themselves); and the significant cross-border legal and human implications that can arise from decisions informed or made by AI. If an AI-powered consular chatbot provides incorrect advice leading to a citizen facing hardship in a foreign country, or if an AI-driven risk assessment for a visa application is found to be flawed and discriminatory, determining who bears responsibility is a complex undertaking. Is it the AI developers, the local consular officer who relied on the AI's output, the central ministry that mandated the system's deployment, or the AI

system itself (a problematic notion)? The inherent "opaqueness" or "black box" nature of some sophisticated AI models⁵⁴ further complicates the process of tracing errors and assigning responsibility. This complex scenario necessitates that the establishment of clear accountability frameworks for AI in consular services must involve a meticulous examination of the entire service delivery chain. It requires defining precise roles, responsibilities, oversight mechanisms, and escalation pathways at each stage where AI interacts with or informs consular processes. This extends beyond the AI's technical performance to encompass the broader governance structure surrounding its use in a high-stakes, international, and often legally intricate environment. Such frameworks may require the development of new operational protocols and comprehensive training for consular staff on how to critically interact with AI-generated information, understand its limitations, and exercise human judgment, including when to override AI recommendations if deemed necessary to uphold ethical principles or ensure a just outcome.

VI. Strategic Roadmap: Architecting AI-Enhanced Consular Services for Indonesia

Developing a strategic roadmap for integrating AI into Indonesia's consular services requires careful prioritization, a user-centric approach, phased implementation, and robust governance.

A. Prioritization Framework: Identifying Key Consular Functions for AI Automation

The first step in leveraging AI is to identify consular functions where automation can yield the most significant benefits in terms of efficiency, service quality, and citizen satisfaction. Analysis of common consular services provided by Indonesian missions abroad³⁴ and successful AI use cases in government globally⁴¹ points to several promising areas:

- **Automated FAQ Answering:** This is a direct application of the BERT-based QA concept and can address a high volume of repetitive inquiries regarding passports (renewal, loss), visa requirements, document legalization procedures, and processes like *Lapor Diri* (Self-Reporting). This aligns with the capabilities of models like IndoBERT and SahabatAI.
- **Application Status Checks:** Providing automated updates on the status of visa or passport applications, similar to the improvements made by the USDS for U.S. visa applicants⁶³, can significantly reduce direct inquiries to consular staff.
- **Guidance on Documentary Requirements:** AI tools can guide citizens through the often complex process of identifying and preparing the necessary documents

for various consular services, such as marriage registration, birth certificates for children born abroad, or shipping personal effects.³⁶

- **Appointment Scheduling:** Automating the booking of appointments for in-person services at embassies or consulates can improve efficiency and user convenience.
- **Initial Triage of Cases and Complaints:** AI can perform an initial assessment of incoming citizen inquiries or complaints, directing users to the correct information resources, relevant forms, or, for complex issues, escalating them to human consular officers.
- **Information Dissemination:** Proactively distributing travel advisories, updates on consular policies, and emergency notifications, a function that the SARI chatbot aims to support.²⁰

A prudent approach would be to begin with "low-hanging fruit"—services that are highly structured, involve routinized operations, and are based on clear, stable procedures.¹ These often include informational queries and simple transactional services. A risk-based approach should also inform prioritization, carefully considering the potential impact of AI errors in different functions.⁶⁴ Ultimately, priority should be given to AI applications that can substantially reduce the workload of consular staff from repetitive tasks, thereby freeing them to concentrate on complex cases, direct citizen interaction requiring empathy and nuanced judgment, and crisis management.

B. User-Centric AI: Leveraging User Segmentation and Personalization for Consular Tools

To be truly effective, AI-driven consular tools must be designed with a deep understanding of the diverse needs and characteristics of Indonesian citizens abroad. This user base is not monolithic; it includes tourists, students, various categories of migrant workers (who may have differing levels of digital literacy, as noted in the KJRI Shanghai report ²⁶), business travelers, and families, each with unique requirements and interaction preferences.

AI itself offers powerful techniques for customer segmentation, which can be adapted for citizen services. By processing and analyzing large datasets (e.g., from Lapor Diri, service requests, website interactions), AI can help uncover deeper insights into user behavior, create dynamic citizen segments, and enable the delivery of hyper-personalized information and services.⁸⁹ Potential segmentation approaches include:

- **Clustering Models (e.g., K-Means, DBSCAN):** These algorithms can group

citizens based on shared characteristics (e.g., location, visa type, frequency of service use) or behaviors (e.g., types of information sought, preferred communication channels).

- **Classification Models:** These can assign citizens to predefined segments based on specific criteria (e.g., "frequent traveler," "long-term resident," "student," "high-need migrant worker").
- **Predictive Models:** AI can forecast future behaviors or needs, such as the likelihood of a citizen requiring specific types of assistance based on their profile or recent events in their region of residence.⁸⁹
- **Intent-Based Segmentation:** Understanding the user's "intent" or where they are in their "consular journey" (e.g., planning travel, currently abroad and needing routine service, facing an emergency) can allow AI tools to provide more relevant and timely support.⁸⁹ The SARI chatbot's specific focus on PMIs is an existing example of segmentation in Indonesian consular services.²⁷

Personalization based on these segments could involve tailoring the information presented by a chatbot, proactively sending relevant reminders (e.g., for passport renewal), or offering customized guidance for specific consular processes. However, the use of AI for segmentation must be approached ethically, ensuring that it does not lead to discriminatory practices or unfair treatment of any citizen group. Robust measures to address and mitigate potential biases in the AI models used for segmentation are essential.⁹⁰

C. Implementation Pathways: Phased Development, Deployment Strategies, and Effective Scope Management for Consular AI Projects

A structured and methodical approach to implementation is crucial for the success of consular AI projects.

- **Phased Approach:** Drawing from established project management principles, a phased approach is recommended ⁴³:
 1. **Phase 1: Ideation & Discovery:** Clearly define the objectives and desired outcomes of the AI initiative. What specific consular problem will it solve? What value will it deliver to citizens and the Ministry?⁴⁶
 2. **Phase 2: Feasibility Assessment:** Conduct a thorough assessment of technical feasibility (availability of data, appropriate AI models, integration capabilities), financial viability (development, deployment, and maintenance costs), and operational readiness (staff skills, existing infrastructure).
 3. **Phase 3: Strategic Prioritization:** Based on the potential impact, feasibility, and alignment with overall strategic goals, prioritize specific AI projects or

features for development.

4. **Phase 4: Pilot Implementation:** Develop and deploy the AI solution on a smaller scale, or as a pilot program, to test its effectiveness, gather user feedback, identify unforeseen challenges, and make necessary refinements before a full-scale rollout.⁴³

- **Deployment Strategies:**

- **Integration with Existing Platforms:** Where feasible and appropriate, new AI functionalities should be integrated into Indonesia's existing digital consular platforms, such as the Portal Peduli WNI and the Safe Travel mobile application, to provide a more unified user experience and leverage existing user bases.⁴⁶
- **Cloud-Based Deployment:** Utilizing cloud computing platforms can offer scalability, flexibility, and potentially cost-effectiveness for hosting AI models and applications, especially for services requiring dynamic resource allocation.⁴³
- **AI-as-a-Service (AlaaS):** For certain functionalities, exploring AlaaS offerings from reputable vendors could accelerate deployment, providing access to pre-built tools or specialized NLP capabilities without requiring extensive in-house development from scratch.⁴³
- **Multi-Channel Access:** Plan for AI-driven services to be accessible across various channels that citizens use, including web portals, mobile applications, and potentially secure messaging platforms, as envisioned in the German Embassy chatbot project.⁷⁶

- **Effective Scope Management:**

- **Clear Definition of Scope:** It is critical to clearly and precisely define the scope of each AI project from the outset to prevent "scope drift"—the uncontrolled expansion of project requirements—which can lead to delays, cost overruns, and failure to meet original objectives.⁹¹ Unclear or ambiguous requirements are a primary cause of scope drift.
- **NLP for Requirements Clarity:** Interestingly, NLP techniques themselves can be employed to improve the clarity and precision of project documentation and requirements specifications. An NLP-Enhanced Documentation Framework (NEDF) has been proposed to analyze, refine, and monitor requirements throughout the project lifecycle, thereby strengthening scope control.⁹¹
- **Narrowing Scope for Initial Projects:** For initial forays into new AI applications, it is often advisable to narrow the scope to specific, well-defined use cases. Lessons from public health NLP projects in Africa indicate that industry-led projects with a narrower, more focused scope tend to be more

successful in deployment compared to broader academic research endeavors.⁹²

- **Continuous Monitoring and Improvement:** Post-deployment, AI systems require ongoing monitoring of their performance, user feedback analysis, and periodic updates or retraining to maintain accuracy, adapt to new information, and address any emerging issues.⁴⁶

D. Data Governance, Cybersecurity, and Privacy-Preserving Techniques for Consular AI

The data underpinning AI consular services is often sensitive and personal, necessitating stringent data governance, robust cybersecurity measures, and the application of privacy-preserving techniques.

- **Robust Data Governance Frameworks:** The Ministry of Foreign Affairs should establish and enforce comprehensive data governance frameworks that cover the entire lifecycle of data used in consular AI systems. This includes ethical guidelines for data collection, secure protocols for data storage and access, clear rules for data processing and sharing (both internally and with any third-party service providers), and strict adherence to Indonesian data protection laws and relevant international regulations.⁴⁴ High-quality, well-managed data is the bedrock of effective and trustworthy AI.⁴³
- **Data Quality and Consistency:** AI models perform optimally with clean, accurate, consistent, and well-structured data. Processes for data validation, cleaning, and preparation are essential to enhance the reliability of AI outputs.⁹⁰
- **Strong Cybersecurity Measures:** Consular AI systems and the data they handle must be protected by robust security features. This includes end-to-end encryption for data in transit and at rest, strong access controls and authentication mechanisms, regular security audits and vulnerability assessments, and compliance with all applicable data protection and cybersecurity regulations.⁴⁶ The potential for cybersecurity risks associated with AI systems must be proactively addressed.⁵¹
- **Privacy-Preserving Techniques:** Beyond basic security, specific privacy-enhancing technologies and techniques should be considered. These may include data minimization (collecting only the data strictly necessary for the AI's function), anonymization or pseudonymization of data where feasible (especially for training or analytics purposes), and ensuring secure data storage environments. The ISO 27001 certification for the Portal Peduli WNI database is a positive step in this direction.²²
- **Transparency in Data Usage:** Citizens should be clearly informed about how

their data is being collected, used, and protected by consular AI systems. This transparency is crucial for building and maintaining trust. The privacy policy for the Safe Travel app is an example of such disclosure.²⁵

The successful architecture of AI-enhanced consular services for Indonesia will necessitate a careful calibration between leveraging advanced, potentially centralized AI capabilities (such as those offered by the national SahabatAI initiative⁸) and ensuring the delivery of these services through decentralized, context-aware, and user-friendly front-end applications. These applications must cater to the diverse needs of Indonesian citizens abroad, accommodating varying levels of digital literacy²⁶ and linguistic preferences. A purely centralized, one-size-fits-all AI solution might struggle to adapt to local nuances or gain widespread user adoption across all citizen segments. An effective implementation strategy will likely involve utilizing powerful central AI engines for core processing tasks—such as sophisticated language understanding, knowledge retrieval from verified sources, and complex reasoning—but deploying these capabilities through flexible and user-centric interfaces. Examples include specialized chatbots like SARI, which is tailored for migrant workers, or enhanced AI-driven features embedded within existing platforms like Portal Peduli WNI. This suggests a modular architectural approach, where core AI services can be consumed by various front-end applications, allowing for both standardization in terms of AI quality and reliability, and customization in terms of user experience and specific functional requirements.

The challenge of "low digital literacy" among some Indonesian citizens abroad, as highlighted in the KJRI Shanghai report²⁶, is more than just a barrier to adoption; it is a critical design constraint that must fundamentally shape the development of AI consular tools. This reality calls for a "digital inclusion by design" philosophy, where AI solutions are not only technologically advanced but are also co-designed with input from less digitally savvy users to ensure they are intuitive, accessible, and empowering. Such an approach would involve extensive user research across diverse citizen groups, including those with limited digital experience. It might lead to the development of simpler, step-by-step guided interactions within AI tools, or the prioritization of voice-enabled interfaces, particularly in local languages and dialects (the potential of SahabatAI to power voice assistance⁸ is highly relevant here). Furthermore, AI tools could be designed to intelligently detect signs of user confusion or difficulty and proactively offer more basic explanations, alternative pathways, or clear directions to non-digital contact options for human assistance. The broader implication is that Indonesia's strategy for AI in consular services must be deeply interwoven with a national strategy for digital literacy and inclusion. Paradoxically, AI

itself could become part of the solution by making digital interactions simpler and more navigable for individuals who are less familiar with technology, thereby bridging the digital divide rather than exacerbating it.

VII. Conclusion and Actionable Recommendations for Indonesia

A. Synthesis of Key Findings and Strategic Imperatives

This report has examined the multifaceted potential of Artificial Intelligence, particularly advanced Natural Language Processing models tailored for the Indonesian language (such as IndoBERT and the SahabatAI ecosystem) and innovative techniques like Retrieval-Augmented Generation (RAG) and Knowledge Graphs, to significantly transform consular question answering and overall service delivery for Indonesian citizens abroad. The analysis indicates that these technologies offer substantial opportunities to enhance efficiency, accessibility, and personalization of consular support.

Indonesia has already made commendable progress in establishing a digital consular presence through platforms like the Portal Peduli WNI, the Safe Travel mobile application, and the targeted SARI AI chatbot. The SARI initiative, with its specific focus on the needs of Indonesian Migrant Workers (PMIs) and its emphasis on empathetic, gender-responsive communication, is a noteworthy example of leveraging AI for vulnerable groups.

Comparative analysis with international counterparts reveals global trends towards integrated digital consular platforms, a strong emphasis on user-centric design, robust multilingual support, and proactive citizen engagement strategies. Leading nations are not just digitizing existing processes but are reimagining service delivery through comprehensive digital ecosystems.

However, the successful and ethical deployment of AI in this sensitive domain is contingent upon addressing several critical imperatives. Robust ethical governance, stringent data privacy and security measures, and concerted efforts to build and maintain public trust are foundational. Key challenges identified include bridging the digital literacy gap among some user segments, ensuring the technical stability and reliability of digital platforms, guaranteeing inclusivity for Indonesia's diverse linguistic groups, and navigating the inherent complexities of AI system implementation and management. The journey from generic AI models to localized solutions like SahabatAI, and the exploration of advanced architectures like RAG, signify a maturing Indonesian NLP ecosystem. Yet, the effectiveness of these technologies hinges on

addressing user-side and infrastructure-related hurdles.

B. Tailored Recommendations for the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Stakeholders

To harness the full potential of AI for enhancing consular services, the following actionable recommendations are proposed for the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Kemlu) and relevant stakeholders:

1. Technology and Infrastructure Development:

- **Recommendation 1: Champion and Invest in Localized NLP Capabilities.**
 - Actively support and expand collaboration with national initiatives like SahabatAI ⁸ to ensure the development of robust AI models with deep understanding of Bahasa Indonesia and its diverse regional dialects.
 - Prioritize the fine-tuning of these models specifically for consular tasks, using comprehensive, high-quality, and diverse datasets derived from actual Indonesian consular interactions and official knowledge bases.
 - Explore and invest in advanced NLP techniques like Retrieval-Augmented Generation (RAG) ¹⁵ and Knowledge Graphs (KGs) ¹⁷ to enhance factual accuracy, contextual understanding, and the ability to handle complex queries.
- **Recommendation 2: Adopt a Modular, Integrated Digital Consular Platform Strategy.**
 - Strategically evolve towards a more unified and integrated digital consular ecosystem, allowing for seamless data flow between different services and providing a consistent user experience.
 - While aiming for integration, maintain the flexibility to deploy specialized AI tools (like SARI for PMIs ²⁷) that cater to the unique needs of specific citizen segments. This involves a modular architecture where core AI services can power various user-facing applications.
 - Improve the technical stability and performance of existing platforms like the Safe Travel app ²⁴ to ensure they provide a reliable foundation for integrated AI features.

2. Policy, Governance, and Ethical Oversight:

- **Recommendation 3: Establish a Comprehensive AI Ethics Framework for Consular Services.**
 - Develop and implement a clear AI ethics framework specifically tailored to the context of consular services, aligned with global best practices such as the

UNESCO Recommendation on the Ethics of AI (RAM AI) ⁵⁰ and relevant national regulations.

- This framework must explicitly address issues of bias detection and mitigation, transparency in AI decision-making, accountability mechanisms, data privacy, non-discrimination, and human oversight.
- Consider establishing an independent AI Ethics Advisory Board, comprising technical experts, legal scholars, ethicists, civil society representatives, and consular practitioners, to guide the ethical development and deployment of AI in consular affairs.⁴⁴

- **Recommendation 4: Strengthen Data Governance, Cybersecurity, and Privacy Protections.**

- Implement and rigorously enforce comprehensive data governance policies for all data collected and processed by consular AI systems, covering data quality, security, access control, retention, and disposal.⁴⁴
- Conduct regular cybersecurity audits and vulnerability assessments for all digital consular platforms and AI systems to protect against breaches and ensure data integrity.
- Ensure full compliance with Indonesian data protection laws and international privacy standards (e.g., GDPR principles if applicable to data from certain regions), employing privacy-enhancing technologies where appropriate.

3. Human Capacity and User Engagement:

- **Recommendation 5: Enhance Digital Literacy and Provide Robust User Support.**

- Launch targeted digital literacy programs for Indonesian citizens abroad, with a special focus on groups identified as having lower digital proficiency, such as some segments of migrant workers.²⁶
- Provide accessible, multilingual, and multi-channel technical support for all digital consular tools to assist users and address issues promptly.
- Develop user-friendly guides and tutorials in various languages and formats (text, video) to facilitate the adoption of AI-powered services.

- **Recommendation 6: Prioritize User-Centric Design and Continuous Feedback Mechanisms.**

- Embed user-centric design principles in the entire lifecycle of AI consular tools, from ideation to deployment and iteration.
- Conduct extensive user research and usability testing with diverse citizen groups, including those with low digital literacy and speakers of various regional languages, to ensure inclusivity and ease of use.⁶³
- Establish clear and accessible channels for users to provide feedback on AI

tools and consular services. Systematically analyze this feedback to drive continuous improvement and adaptation of the systems.

- **Recommendation 7: Invest in Training and Capacity Building for Consular Staff.**

- Provide comprehensive training to consular staff on how to effectively use new AI tools, understand their capabilities and limitations, interpret AI-generated outputs critically, and manage AI-related ethical considerations.
- Equip staff with the skills to assist citizens who may face difficulties interacting with AI-driven services.

4. Implementation Strategy and Collaboration:

- **Recommendation 8: Implement a Phased, Pilot-Driven Approach for New AI Solutions.**

- For new AI applications, adopt a phased implementation strategy, starting with pilot projects for high-impact, lower-risk consular functions.⁴³
- Use insights and lessons learned from these pilots to refine solutions, assess scalability, and mitigate risks before wider deployment.

- **Recommendation 9: Foster Inter-Agency and Public-Private-Academic Partnerships.**

- Strengthen collaboration with other relevant Indonesian government agencies (e.g., BP2MI, Ministry of Communication and Informatics, Ministry of Law and Human Rights) to ensure a coordinated approach to digital transformation and citizen protection.
- Continue and expand partnerships with the private sector (e.g., technology providers like GoTo and Indosat involved in SahabatAI) and academic institutions to leverage external expertise, foster innovation, and share best practices in AI development and deployment.⁹

C. Future Outlook and Continued Innovation in AI for Consular Excellence

The journey of integrating AI into consular services is an ongoing process of innovation and adaptation. Looking ahead, further advancements in AI could unlock even more sophisticated capabilities for Indonesian consular affairs. These might include highly advanced conversational AI systems capable of more natural and nuanced interactions, proactive consular assistance that anticipates citizen needs based on data patterns, and AI-powered tools for enhanced crisis management, early warning systems for citizens in affected areas, and more efficient coordination of emergency responses.

To realize this future, a commitment to sustained research, development, and agile

adaptation will be essential. The technological landscape of AI is evolving at an unprecedented pace, and citizen expectations will continue to rise. The Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs must foster a culture of continuous learning and innovation within its consular operations to keep pace with these changes.

By strategically investing in localized AI capabilities, prioritizing ethical governance and user-centricity, building human capacity, and fostering collaboration, Indonesia has the potential not only to significantly enhance its consular services for its own citizens but also to emerge as a leader in AI-driven, citizen-centric public service innovation. Indonesia's unique demographic profile, with a large and diverse diaspora including a significant migrant worker population, its rich linguistic tapestry, and its burgeoning local AI development scene (exemplified by initiatives like SahabatAI⁸ and the SARI chatbot²⁷), positions it to pioneer culturally attuned, ethically grounded, and inclusive AI solutions for consular services. Successfully navigating the technical, ethical, and adoption challenges in this domain could provide valuable lessons and adaptable models for other developing nations facing similar demographic, linguistic, and technological landscapes, thereby contributing to a global discourse on responsible and effective AI in public service, particularly for the unique needs of the Global South. This presents an opportunity for Indonesia to not only serve its citizens better but also to showcase its leadership in harnessing technology for the public good on an international stage.

Works cited

1. Diplomacy in the Age of Artificial Intelligence, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://uscpublicdiplomacy.org/printpdf/89581>
2. VFS Global powers digital cross-border mobility with SAP software | Frontier Enterprise, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.frontier-enterprise.com/vfs-global-powers-digital-cross-border-mobility-with-sap-software/>
3. AI Embassies: A New Frontier in Cyber Domain - Journal of Cyberspace Studies, accessed May 8, 2025, https://jcss.ut.ac.ir/article_100581_e88fa4dcea93291e80233e66497e581e.pdf
4. Applications of artificial intelligence in global diplomacy: A review of research and practical models - ResearchGate, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/390329776_Applications_of_artificial_intelligence_in_global_diplomacy_A_review_of_research_and_practical_models
5. the-ogre/finetuning_bert_for_qa: This project focuses on fine-tuning a BERT model for question answering using a limited dataset for illustration purposes. - GitHub, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://github.com/the-ogre/LLM-FinetuningBERTforQuestionAnswering>
6. arXiv:2403.01817v1 [cs.CL] 4 Mar 2024, accessed May 8, 2025,

- <https://arxiv.org/pdf/2403.01817>
7. NusaBERT: Teaching IndoBERT to be Multilingual and Multicultural - arXiv, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://arxiv.org/html/2403.01817v1>
 8. Sahabat AI: The Friend Indonesia Needs for a Digital Future - Twimbit, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://twimbit.com/about/blogs/sahabat-ai-the-friend-indonesia-needs-for-a-digital-future>
 9. GoToCompany/llama3-8b-cpt-sahabatai-v1-instruct - Hugging Face, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://huggingface.co/GoToCompany/llama3-8b-cpt-sahabatai-v1-instruct>
 10. Fine-Tuning Small Language Models for Indonesian Languages, Trivan Menezes, UG '25 (19115) - Princeton Media Central, accessed May 8, 2025, https://mediacentral.princeton.edu/media/Fine-Tuning+Small+Language+Models+for+Indonesian+Languages%2C+Trivan+Menezes%2C+UG+25+%2819115%29/1_nil56g8g
 11. What Is Extractive Question Answering? - Ontotext, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.ontotext.com/knowledgehub/fundamentals/what-is-extractive-question-answering/>
 12. Question Answering with a Fine-Tuned BERT - Chris McCormick, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://mccormickml.com/2020/03/10/question-answering-with-a-fine-tuned-BERT/>
 13. BERT Question Answering System - Grid Dynamics, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.griddynamics.com/blog/question-answering-system-using-bert>
 14. Sahabat-AI, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://sahabat-ai.com/>
 15. UTILIZING RETRIEVAL-AUGMENTED GENERATION IN LARGE LANGUAGE MODELS TO ENHANCE INDONESIAN LANGUAGE NLP - EJournal Universitas Nusa Mandiri, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://ejournal.nusamandiri.ac.id/index.php/jitk/article/download/5916/1292>
 16. Integrating Retrieval-Augmented Generation with Large Language Model Mistral 7b for Indonesian Medical Herb - ResearchGate, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/384328184_Integrating_Retrieval-Augmented_Generation_with_Large_Language_Model_Mistral_7b_for_Indonesian_Medical_Herb
 17. Building, Improving, and Deploying Knowledge Graph RAG Systems on Databricks, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.databricks.com/blog/building-improving-and-deploying-knowledge-graph-rag-systems-databricks>
 18. Indonesian Linguistic Ontology for Enhancing Ontology-Based Indonesian Question-Answering Systems | Request PDF - ResearchGate, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/388694434_Indonesian_Linguistic_Ontology_for_Enhancing_Ontology-Based_Indonesian_Question-Answering_Systems
 19. Lapor Diri - Smart Consulate Office (SCO) KJRI New York, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://kjrinewyork.org/self-report>

20. Foreign Ministry to Utilize AI-Based Services for Indonesian Citizens ..., accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://en.tempo.co/read/1975389/foreign-ministry-to-utilize-ai-based-services-for-indonesian-citizens-abroad>
21. Peduli WNI - Kemenlu, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://peduliwni.kemlu.go.id/>
22. Standar Pelayanan - Peduli WNI, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://peduliwni.kemlu.go.id/server-file/download/referensi/standarpelayanan.pdf.html>
23. Diplomasi Digital dan Implementasi Aplikasi Safe Travel di Kementerian Luar Negeri Republik Indonesia, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://pesirah.ejournal.unsri.ac.id/index.php/jap/article/download/1/28/230>
24. Safe Travel - Apps on Google Play, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://play.google.com/store/apps/details?id=id.go.kemlu.safetravel>
25. Privacy Policy - Safe Travel, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://bo-safetravel.kemlu.go.id/privacy-policy>
26. KONSULAT JENDERAL REPUBLIK INDONESIA SHANGHAI - Portal Kemlu, accessed May 8, 2025,
https://kemlu.go.id/files/repositori/80020/1729842623671b4dbfb9b24_LKj_2022_KJRI_Shanghai.pdf
27. Migration MPTF Final Report, accessed May 8, 2025,
https://mptf.undp.org/sites/default/files/documents/2025-02/final_report_2024_migration_mptf_indonesia.pdf
28. Bantu Pekerja Migran, Wamen Christina Apresiasi ... - BP2MI, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.bp2mi.go.id/berita-detail/bantu-pekerja-migran-wamen-christina-apresiasi-peluncuran-fitur-chatbot-sari-dari-kemlu>
29. Kemlu RI dan UN Women Luncurkan Chatbot SARI, Inovasi AI untuk Pelindungan Perempuan Pekerja Migran - Global Liputan6.com, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.liputan6.com/global/read/6001356/kemlu-ri-dan-un-women-luncurkan-chatbot-sari-inovasi-ai-untuk-pelindungan-perempuan-pekerja-migran>
30. Kemlu RI-UN Women meluncurkan SARI, asisten virtual untuk lindungi PMI - Fokus Taiwan, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://indonesia.focustaiwan.tw/society/202504215001>
31. Kemlu RI dan UN Women Perkuat Pelindungan Perempuan Pekerja Migran melalui Inovasi Chatbot AI SARI - NOA.co.id, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.noa.co.id/kemlu-ri-dan-un-women-perkuat-pelindungan-perempuan-pekerja-migran-melalui-inovasi-chatbot-ai-sari/>
32. Kemlu Sebut Aplikasi SARI Lengkapi Informasi bagi Pekerja Migran - RRI, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.rri.co.id/pusat-pemberitaan/nasional/1464772/kemlu-sebut-aplikasi-sari-lengkapi-informasi-bagi-pekerja-migran>
33. Wamen P2MI Apresiasi Peluncuran SARI, Chatbot untuk Lindungi Pekerja Migran Indonesia, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://planet.merdeka.com/hot-news/wamen-p2mi-apresiasi-peluncuran-sari-chatbot-untuk-lindungi-pekerja-migran-indonesia-381696-mvk.html>

34. WNI yang memerlukan pelayanan kekonsuleran dan keimigrasian dipersilahkan datang langsung ke Loker Konsuler KBRI Washington, DC dengan melengkapi dan menyerahkan seluruh persyaratan yang ditentukan., accessed May 8, 2025, <https://consular.embassyofindonesia.org/page/informasiumum.html>
35. FAQ - Kedutaan Besar Republik Indonesia Den Haag, Belanda, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://indonesia.nl/faq/>
36. Syarat Pelaporan Peristiwa Penting WNI di Luar Negeri, Cek Infonya! - detikNews, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-7746189/syarat-pelaporan-peristiwa-penting-wni-di-luar-negeri-cek-infonya>
37. Perlukah Dokumen Asing Dilegalisasi di KBRI? | Klinik Hukumonline, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.hukumonline.com/klinik/a/perlukah-dokumen-asing-dilegalisasi-di-kbri--lt60053590761ab/>
38. Indonesian Ministerial Regulation to Protect Indonesian Citizens Abroad (No. 4/2008) - Migrants in Countries in Crisis (MICIC), accessed May 8, 2025, <https://micicinitiative.iom.int/indonesian-ministerial-regulation-protect-indonesian-citizens-abroad-no-4/2008-0>
39. Inspection of Embassy Jakarta and Constituent Post, Indonesia; ISP-I-25-01 - Department of State OIG, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.stateoig.gov/uploads/report/report_pdf_file/inspection-embassy-jakarta-and-constituent-posts-indonesia-isp-i-25-01.pdf
40. Kementerian Luar Negeri RI Luncurkan SARI - RRI, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.rri.co.id/ipitek/1465548/kementerian-luar-negeri-ri-luncurkan-sari>
41. How Governments are Using AI: 8 Real-World Case Studies, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://blog.govnet.co.uk/technology/ai-in-government-case-studies>
42. Chatbots in the Public Sector: How AI-Driven Chatbots are ..., accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.fxmweb.com/insights/chatbots-in-the-public-sector-how-ai-driven-chatbots-are-reshaping-government-services.html>
43. AI in Government: A Strategic Framework for Digital Transformation - REI Systems, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.reisystems.com/ai-in-government-a-strategic-framework-for-digital-transformation/>
44. Ethical and Responsible AI Adoption in Government - REI Systems, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.reisystems.com/roadmap-to-transformation-the-next-generation-of-government-operations-with-ethical-and-responsible-ai-adoption/>
45. AI-Powered Immigration Support - Nous Infosystems, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.nousinfosystems.com/insights/case-study/enhancing-operational-efficiency-ai-powered-immigration-assistant>
46. AI Solutions for Government: Transforming Public Sector Services - Zealous System, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.zealousys.com/blog/ai-solutions-for-government/>
47. Economic and Social Council - United Nations Digital Library System, accessed

May 8, 2025,

https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/4079896/files/E_C.16_2025_4-EN.pdf

48. Navigating Governmental Choices: A Comprehensive Review of Artificial Intelligence's Impact on Decision-Making - MDPI, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.mdpi.com/2227-9709/11/3/64>
49. Government Chatbots | AI-Powered Citizen Support & Services - Conversation Design Institute, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.conversationdesigninstitute.com/use-cases/government>
50. AI Governance and Ethics: Lessons from the U.S. Visa Revocation Policy, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://moderndiplomacy.eu/2025/03/11/ai-governance-and-ethics-lessons-from-the-u-s-visa-revocation-policy/>
51. www.mdpi.com, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.mdpi.com/2076-3387/15/4/149#:~:text=Addressing%20challenges%20such%20as%20algorithmic,values%20and%20the%20public's%20trust.>
52. Challenges in Chatbot Development - SmythOS, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://smythos.com/ai-agents/chatbots/challenges-in-chatbot-development/>
53. Exploring Public Policy and AI Ethics in Modern Society - Number Analytics, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.numberanalytics.com/blog/public-policy-ai-ethics-modern-society>
54. Toward Meaningful Transparency and Accountability of AI Algorithms in Public Service Delivery - DAI, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.dai.com/uploads/ai-in-public-service.pdf>
55. Global Trends in AI Governance - World Bank Documents and Reports, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099120224205026271/pdf/P1786161ad76ca0ae1ba3b1558ca4ff88ba.pdf>
56. Full article: Holding AI-Based Systems Accountable in the Public Sector: A Systematic Review - Taylor & Francis Online, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/15309576.2025.2469784?src=exp-la>
57. Artificial Intelligence in Diplomacy: Transforming Global Relations and Negotiations, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://trendsresearch.org/insight/artificial-intelligence-in-diplomacy-transforming-global-relations-and-negotiations/>
58. Integrating Artificial Intelligence into Public Administration - MDPI, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.mdpi.com/2076-3387/15/4/149>
59. Conversational AI API | Find the Top API Solutions - aiOla, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://aiola.ai/blog/conversational-ai-apis/>
60. Bureau of Consular Affairs - United States Department of State, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.state.gov/bureaus-offices/under-secretary-for-management/bureau-of-consular-affairs/>
61. Bureau of Diplomatic Technology - United States Department of State, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.state.gov/bureaus-offices/under-secretary-for-management/bureau>

[-of-diplomatic-technology/](#)

62. Inspection of the Bureau of Consular Affairs, Office of 1CA: Leadership, Management, and Innovation - Department of State OIG, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.stateoig.gov/uploads/report/report_pdf_file/isp-i-21-28_1.pdf
63. Improving the Visa Processing System at Department of State | United States Digital Service, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.usds.gov/report-to-congress/2016/visa-processing/>
64. GAO-25-108069, Priority Open Recommendations: Department of State, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.gao.gov/assets/gao-25-108069.pdf>
65. British Consulate General New York - GOV.UK, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.gov.uk/world/organisations/british-consulate-general-new-york>
66. Travel Alert – New Entry Requirements for UK (January 8, 2025), accessed May 8, 2025, <https://de.usembassy.gov/new-entry-requirements-for-uk/>
67. Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada Client Support Centre services - Canada.ca, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/corporate/contact-ircc/client-support-centre.html>
68. CRA Online chat - Canada.ca, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.canada.ca/en/revenue-agency/corporate/contact-information/online-chat.html>
69. Smartraveller: Homepage, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.smartraveller.gov.au/>
70. Consular services - Australia in the USA, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://usa.embassy.gov.au/consular-services>
71. Singapore urges citizens to avoid non-essential travel to Jammu and Kashmir, Pakistan in fresh advisory | World News - Hindustan Times, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.hindustantimes.com/world-news/singapore-urges-citizens-to-avoid-non-essential-travel-to-india-jammu-and-kashmir-pakistan-in-fresh-advisory-101746669532513.html>
72. Singapore urges citizens to avoid non-essential travel to Jammu & Kashmir and Pakistan amid regional conflict - Connected to India, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.connectedtoindia.com/singapore-urges-citizens-to-avoid-non-essential-travel-to-jammu-kashmir-and-pakistan-amid-regional-conflict/>
73. Office Hours and Location Embassy of the Republic of Korea in the USA, accessed May 8, 2025, https://overseas.mofa.go.kr/us-en/wpge/m_4501/contents.do
74. Information>Our Policies>E-Visa Center, accessed May 8, 2025, https://www.immigration.go.kr/immigration_eng/2098/subview.do
75. Germany | Consular Services Portal launched | BAL Immigration News, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://www.bal.com/perspectives/bal-news/germany-consular-services-portal-launched/>
76. Lucky-akash321/Building-Chatbot-using-BERT-LLM-for ... - GitHub, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://github.com/Lucky-akash321/Building-Chatbot-using-BERT-LLM-for-German-Embassy>

77. The E-Consular department at your service - Paving the way for innovative consular services, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://mumbai.thaiembassy.org/en/content/the-e-consular-department-at-your-service-paving-t?cate=5d74ff3715e39c0a7c000fdc>
78. Politicization and Securitization of Consular Affairs in International Relations - Journal of Asian Governance, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://jag.scholasticahq.com/article/127931-politicization-and-securitization-of-consular-affairs-in-international-relations/attachment/260064.pdf>
79. Multilingual NLP Made Simple [Challenges, Solutions & The Future], accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://spotintelligence.com/2023/09/19/multilingual-nlp-made-simple-challenges-solutions-the-future/>
80. Multilingual Chatbot: Benefits, Challenges & How to Build | WotNot, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://wotnot.io/blog/multilingual-chatbot>
81. Multilingual Propaganda Detection: Exploring Transformer-Based Models mBERT, XLM-RoBERTa, and mT5 - ACL Anthology, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://aclanthology.org/2025.nakbanlp-1.9.pdf>
82. FacebookAI/xlm-roberta-large - Hugging Face, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://huggingface.co/FacebookAI/xlm-roberta-large>
83. Which Type of Language Service Provider Should I Choose? - Terra Translations, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://terratranslations.com/2019/07/24/type-of-language-service-provider-should-i-choose/>
84. Ethics of Artificial Intelligence | UNESCO, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.unesco.org/en/artificial-intelligence/recommendation-ethics>
85. AI Ethics in Public Policy: Case Studies & Challenges | ISPP, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.ispp.org.in/ethics-of-ai-in-public-policy-in-the-indian-context/>
86. AI in government: Top use cases - IBM, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://www.ibm.com/think/topics/ai-in-government>
87. Kementerian Luar Negeri RI - Portal Kemlu, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://fe-non-production.apps.opppd2-dev.layanan.go.id/kontak>
88. Kekonsuleran - Portal Kemlu, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://fe-non-production.apps.opppd2-dev.layanan.go.id/layanan/layanan-konsuler-fasilitas-diplomatik-dan-pelindungan-wni/kekonsuleran>
89. How to Use AI for Customer Segmentation? 5 Easy Steps & Insights - CleverTap, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://clevertap.com/blog/ai-customer-segmentation/>
90. Unlock the Power of AI Customer Segmentation with AWS Marketplace - Amazon.com, accessed May 8, 2025,
<https://aws.amazon.com/marketplace/solutions/generative-ai/what-is/ai-customer-segmentation/>
91. NLP for Project Documentation: Ensuring Clear Requirements to Avoid Scope Drift, accessed May 8, 2025,
https://www.researchgate.net/publication/390303105_NLP_for_Project_Documentation_Ensuring_Clear_Requirements_to_Avoid_Scope_Drift
92. Natural Language Processing Technologies for Public Health in Africa: Scoping

Review, accessed May 8, 2025, <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/40053738/>