Gender gaps in healthy lifespans are often used to assess gender inequality in health. However, as these gaps mask important differences in health and mortality between women and men, we question whether these gaps are robust indicators to benchmark countries and guide gender equity policies. For this, we use the harmonized health data from the Gateway to Global Aging Data to estimate disability- and chronic-free life expectancy for individuals aged above 60 y and decompose the gender gap in health expectancy into its mortality and health components. We conduct a comparative analysis of the gender gap in health expectancy across multiple countries with different cultural backgrounds, gender norms, and health systems, including the U.S., England, South Korea, China, India, Mexico, and EU countries. Our findings indicate that using gender gaps in healthy lifespans as a metric for gender inequality is misleading. Countries with similar gender gaps do not necessarily have the same size of mortality and health contributions. In addition, when we group countries according to their total gender gap, countries that substantially differ in terms of development levels, health care system, and gender roles can be in the same category. The lack of a systematic pattern across countries signals that gaps do not necessarily capture inequality in health across women and men and should thus be interpreted with caution.