Chapter 3 Solution

May 20, 2023

Problem 3.6

Take the model

$$C = N_C$$
$$E = \alpha C + N_E$$

What is the distribution of P(C|E=2)

Solution

Using bayes rule we have that

$$\begin{split} P(C|E=2) &= \frac{P(E=2|C)P(C)}{P(E=2)} \\ &\propto P(E=2|C)P(C) \\ &\propto \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}(2-\alpha C)^2\right) \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}C^2\right) \\ &\propto \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}(4-4\alpha C+(\alpha^2+1)C^2)\right) \\ &\propto \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2}(-4\alpha C+(\alpha^2+1)C^2)\right) \\ &\propto \exp\left(-\frac{\alpha^2+1}{2}(-4\frac{\alpha}{\alpha^2+1}C+C^2)\right) \\ &\propto \exp\left(-\frac{\alpha^2+1}{2}\left(C-\frac{2\alpha}{\alpha^2+1}\right)^2\right) \end{split}$$

Clearly, minus the normalizing constant, this is the pdf of a normal distribution with mean $\mu = \frac{2\alpha}{\alpha^2 + 1}$ and variance $\sigma^2 = \frac{1}{\alpha^2 + 1}$. Therefore, the distribution must be a normal with these

parameters. And plugging back in $\alpha = 4$ we get the result in the book. Namely

$$P(C|E=2) = \mathcal{N}(\mu = 8/17, \sigma^2 = 1/17)$$

Problem 3.7

See the book

Solution

We can intervene on X with the distribution P(X) = Bernoulli(0.5) and then we can check the distribution of Y. If it is normal then we know that the model $Y \to X$ is correct. If it is not normal then we know that the model $X \to Y$ is correct.

Problem 3.8

See the book

Solution

a) We need to find $\alpha, \beta, \gamma, \delta$ such that for every n_x, n_y the equation holds. Plugging in $X = \alpha n_x + \beta n_y$ and $Y = \gamma n_x + \delta n_y$ we get that our solution must satisfy

$$\alpha n_x + \beta n_y = 2\gamma n_x + 2\delta n_y + n_x$$
$$\gamma n_x + \delta n_y = 2\alpha n_x + 2\beta n_y + n_y$$

As this needs to hold for all n_x then we get the following system of equations

$$\alpha = 2\gamma + 1$$
$$\beta = 2\delta$$
$$\gamma = 2\alpha$$
$$\delta = 2\beta + 1$$

Which we can solve as follows. Plugging in 3 into 1 we get

$$\alpha = 4\alpha + 1 \Rightarrow \alpha = -1/3$$

Plugging 2 in 4 we get

$$\delta = 4\delta + 1 \Rightarrow \delta = -1/3$$

and then using these two results in 2 and 3 we get

$$\beta = 2\delta = -2/3$$

$$\gamma=2\alpha=-2/3$$

So to summarize we have that

$$\alpha = -1/3
\beta = -2/3
\gamma = -2/3
\delta = -1/3$$
(1)
(2)
(3)
(4)

$$\beta = -2/3 \tag{2}$$

$$\gamma = -2/3 \tag{3}$$

$$\delta = -1/3 \tag{4}$$