

Vinaya Class Questions

Series 'A'

<https://vinaya-class.github.io>

LAST UPDATED ON

31st July 2023

CONTENTS

0.A. Introduction	1
1.A. Killing and Harming	5
2.A. Stealing	9
3.A. Sexual Conduct	11
4.A. Lustful Conduct	13
5.A. Women 1	17
6.A. Attainments	19
7.A. False Speech	21
8.A. Robes 1	23
9.A. Kiccavatta	25
10.A. Misc 1	27
11.A. Food 1	29
12.A. Food 2	33
13.A. Money	35
14.A. Arguments 1	37
15.A. Arguments 2	39
16.A. Arguments 3	41
17.A. Dwellings	43
18.A. Bowls	45
19.A. Women 2	47
20.A. Misc 2	49
21.A. Sekhiyas 1	51
22.A. Excuses	53
23.A. Sekhiyas 2	55
24.A. Robes 2	57
25.A. Misc 3	59

0.A. INTRODUCTION

Kim nāmo si:

1.

How can a bhikkhu determine if modern items (e.g. credit cards, sun glasses) are allowable or not?

- (a) Discuss with the community and create a new rule
- (b) Follow local cultural examples
- (c) ☒ Discuss and follow the Four Great Standards
- (d) One cannot know for sure what the Buddha's intentions were

Solution: Suitable protocol for a community to discuss how to apply the Four Great Standards and agree on the accepted standards.

2.

A bhikkhu is visiting a friend who asks if it's all right to eat a pizza with him in the evening. The bhikkhu says it's fine by him, and they eat the pizza. *Is this an offense?*

- (a) No, because they are not in the monastery
- (b) No, but there is a partial offense
- (c) Usually it is, but it can depend on the situation
- (c) ☒ Yes, it is a pācittiya offense

Discussion: How does one determine whether there is full offense of a rule? What happens when not all factors are fulfilled for an offense?

Solution: Consider which of the five factors are fulfilled in the situation. If not all factors are fulfilled, there may be either no offense, or a derived lesser offense.

3.

Match the type of offense with its description.

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| (a) <u> B </u> pārajika | A. grave offense |
| (b) <u> F </u> saṅghādisesa | B. defeat |
| (c) <u> A </u> thullaccaya | C. offense to be confessed |
| (d) <u> C </u> pācittiya | D. offense of wrong-doing |
| (e) <u> E </u> nissaggiya pācittiya | E. involving forfeiture |
| (f) <u> D </u> dukkaṭa | F. involving community meetings |

Discussion: Advice on restoring one's faith after breaking a rule or having done something regrettable.

Solution: Restoring one's faith: Doubt and anxiety will turn into self-vindication. Discuss the situation with the abbot. Remember the compassion of the Buddha for setting up the Vinaya. Remember dedication to the Triple Gem as a refuge.

4.

(a) Ignoring a *sekhiya* etiquette rule out of disrespect for the training is...

- (A) a wrong-doing (B) to be confessed (C) involves community meetings (D) negligible, *abbohārika*

(b) Probation is a procedure following a ... offense.

- (A) *pārājika* (B) *saṅghādisesa* (C) *pācittiya* (D) *dukkata*

Discussion: How is the term 'negligible' (*abbohārika*) used? What is a negligible rule?*Solution:* *Mānatta* is the penance, *parivāsa* is the probation procedure following a *saṅghādisesa* offense.

5.

True or False.(a) F There is never an offense when a bhikkhu doesn't remember a rule, or is not aware that he is currently breaking one.**Discussion:** Consider the case when he knows and remembers, but goes ahead because the job has to be finished today. What is the proper protocol for him to follow?*Solution:* He should confess the offense to another bhikkhu, describing the situation.(b) F One of the Four Great Standards is as follows: 'if it is not already allowed, but doesn't follow what is desirable, then it is allowable.'(c) F During his *upasampadā*, the candidate chants several lines of the ceremony incorrectly, therefore his ordination is invalid.**Discussion:** What is essential for a valid bhikkhu *upasampadā*?(d) F A young man (over 20) receives *upasampada*. He has concealed that he has to pay back his student loan, therefore his ordination is invalid.*Solution:* Only the *sanghakamma* has to be carried out properly to make it a valid *upasampada*, so only the chanting *acariya* has to chant correctly. The rest of the ceremony is choreography.Another example is when the parents didn't give permission for ordination. If the assembly knows, they commit a *dukkata* for ordaining him.(e) F A bhikkhu's *mentor* and *preceptor* cannot be the same person.(f) F A bhikkhu complains about the monastic life and says, 'Who am I kidding? Really, I want to disrobe.' After this statement he is no longer a bhikkhu.**Discussion:** What are the factors of the disrobing procedure?(g) F A bhikkhu can request a *baisuddhi* document when he moves from Europe to a monastery in Thailand.**Discussion:** What is a *baisuddhi*? Who issues it? What happens if you don't have one in Thailand?*Solution:* He should already have a *baisuddhi*. It is an ID certificate ('monks' passport') to show that you are not only posing as a bhikkhu.The *upajjhāyas* are issued a stack of numbered *baisuddhis* which they should automatically fill out and stamp for their monks after giving them *upasampada*. If you don't have one in Thailand, and the police asks for it, you could be arrested.(h) T The community may decide to give a bhikkhu a new robe from the stores without formal *sangha-kamma*.

Discussion: What are the steps of formal *sanghakamma*?

Solution: Four types of statements to conduct *sanghakamma* (Community transaction): **(a)** an announcement (*apalokana-kamma*), **(b)** a motion (*ñatti-kamma*), **(c)** a motion with one proclamation (*ñatti-dutiya-kamma*), **(d)** a motion with three proclamations (*ñatti-catuttha-kamma*).

6.

The abbot of a monastery tells the community that in this monastery, the standard is that the last person finishing the meal must always empty the water from the spittoons and put away the seats. One monk, being in a hurry, decides he will skip doing so and mosquitoes start breeding in the spittoon water. Are there offenses?

- (a) *pārājika* (b) *pācittiya* (c) *dukkāṭa* (d) no offenses

Solution: It may be *dukkāṭa* for disrespecting the local training. Not a *pācittiya* unless he throws away the water containing the mosquito larvae.

The situation is a reminder of the dispute at Kosambī, where the bhikkhus are quarrelling over their interpretation of a similarly ambiguous offense.

Discussion: What are some examples of local standards, or *korwat* rules? Cf. MN 48, Uda 4.5, Mv X on disputes at Kosambī. The Buddha then visits the park where Ven. Anuruddha, Nandiya and Kimbila were living in harmony, blending as ‘milk and water’ (MN 31).

7.

A bhikkhu lives alone in an accommodation on the property of his supporters. Some of his visitors consider him very accomplished and wish to join the monastic practice. What are the type of ordinations he can give them?

- (a) bhikkhu (b) *samanera* (c) *anagārika* (d) being alone, he can’t ordain them

Solution: Ordaining a *samanera* or *anagārika* is a local matter, it doesn’t require formal *sanghakamma*, and so one suitable bhikkhu may perform the ceremony. Five bhikkhus are required for performing a *bhikkhu upasampada*.

Discussion: Who can act as a preceptor *upajjhāya* to ordain bhikkhus?

Solution: The Ministry of Religious Affairs in Thailand appoints preceptors for a given region. By the Vinaya alone, a bhikkhu with 10 vassas may act as a preceptor, but the ordination may not be recognized by other communities.

1.A. KILLING AND HARMING

Kim nāmo si:

1.

- (a) A bhikkhu is camping in the forest. At night, something violently shakes his tent. He lashes out with a knife through the tent and kills it. When he gets out, he sees that it was a person. Is the bhikkhu pārājika?

☒ (A) Yes

(B) No

Solution: Factor of perception as ‘this is a living being’, with the intention of ‘aiming at death’.

If one doesn’t follow the Vibhanga’s definition of perception (Aj Brahmalī), then perception can be ‘this is a living *human* being’, in which case the bhikkhu is not parajika.

Discussion: Possible offenses in an animal attack.

Solution: Motive is irrelevant, if the intention is to kill them. Killing an animal out of self-defense: pacittiya. Hitting an animal with a stick to drive them off, with no intention of killing it: dukkata, even if it dies as a result (intention was not to kill).

- (b) A bhikkhu tells a layman that joining the armed forces and defending one’s country is a good thing to do. The layman joins the military and he is sent on a mission where he shoots people. Is the bhikkhu pārājika?

(A) Yes

☒ (B) No

Solution: Not parajika, if the man killed people following commands from his officers, not due to the recommendation of the bhikkhu.

Discussion: What if he sends a message to the bhikkhu that he did as he recommended?

Solution: The bhikkhu is parajika.

2.

Are there offenses?

- (a) Seeing a person suffering from fatal injuries, a bhikkhu asks the doctors to get it over quickly. The doctors inject a euthanasia agent. Nonetheless, the person miraculously recovers.

(A) pārājika

☒ (B) thullaccaya

(C) pācittiya

(D) dukkaṭa

(E) no offenses

Solution: Result is not fulfilled.

Discussion: the bhikkhu asks the doctors to anaesthetize the patient to relieve his pain. The person never wakes up.

Solution: Intention was not to cut off life.

- (b) A bhikkhu washes his bedding and accidentally kills some fleas or bed bugs.

(A) pārājika

(B) thullaccaya

(C) pācittiya

(D) dukkaṭa

☒ (E) no offenses

- (c) A bhikkhu removes a tick buried in his arm with a tweezer. The tick comes out in pieces.

(A) pārājika

(B) thullaccaya

☒ (C) pācittiya

(D) dukkaṭa

(E) no offenses

Solution: If the bhikkhu is sure that the method of removal doesn’t necessarily kill it, then there is no offense.

- (d) The beloved family dog of a lay supporter is very ill, and treatment will be expensive. He asks a bhikkhu whether they should ask the vet to euthanise the dog, or apply for treatment. The bhikkhu says 'He already lived a long life, prolonging his pain is cruel.' The supporter tells the doctors to euthanise the dog.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Suggesting to kill fulfils effort. Mercy-killing is not an exception.

Could be a dukkaṭa if he really didn't mean for the dog to die, but then he shouldn't have phrased it this way.

Discussion: Bhikkhus getting involved in medical issues.

- (e) A bhikkhu has worms in the gut and decides to take medicine.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: The medicine may act in different ways. If it kills the worms, the matter is straightforward.

If it 'flushes out' the worms, since the parasites cannot survive outside the body of the host, the case is similar to pouring water containing mosquito larvae, where pouring the water doesn't kill the larvae, but the larvae cannot survive without the water.

This is not to recommend that the bhikkhu shouldn't be treated, but that the offense should not be ignored.

- (f) A bhikkhu is attacked on the street. He pushes the attacker away and runs. The attacker falls on the pavement and cracks his head.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Solution: Pārājika requires intention to kill, and there is an exception for acting while not knowing that it could cause death. There was no intention to kill, and the effort was not aiming at death.

- (g) A bhikkhu is attacked on the street. He is enraged and starts punching the attacker until he goes limp and stops moving.

(A) pārājika (B) ☒ thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Thullaccaya if he is just unconscious. If he dies of his injuries, pārājika.

DISCUSSION

A woman asks a bhikkhu if she should get an abortion. What should the bhikkhu say?

Solution: Don't discuss the subject at all. Make it clear you are not available for these questions.

A bhikkhu hits an anagārika. What should the anagārika do?

Solution: Report the incident to the abbot, or a senior monk. The community may have a liaison appointed for this reason, which the juniors should be aware of.

Which rule includes damaging seeds while eating?

A bhikkhu is asked to clean the container which collects the rainwater, inside and outside. How can this be done so that there is no offense?

Is there an offense if there are living beings in the water which he cannot see?

Clearing up some rubble, a bhikkhu notices that the spade has dug into the ground. Is there any offense?

How does a bhikkhu decide if the ground is 'genuine soil' or not?

Is there any offense for pruning a plant? How can the work-monk organize the task?

2.A. STEALING

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

(a) A bhikkhu sneaks into the kitchen and eats an apple.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya for eating unoffered food, another pācittiya if eating in the wrong time. Stealing doesn't apply if the contents of the kitchen are considered Sangha property.

(b) The same bhikkhu sees a wallet left on the kitchen counter and picks it up, hoping to find money in it. He only finds ID cards, so he takes the wallet to the monk's office for safe-keeping.

(A) pārājika (B) ☒ thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Stealing is complete as soon as picking it up. Thullaccaya, because there are no valuables.

(c) A man gives a bhikkhu a new phone as a gift. He says he was able to get it very cheaply. The bhikkhu doesn't know that the phone comes from a batch stolen from the factory.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Solution: There is no offense assigned for receiving stolen goods, even knowingly.

(d) A bhikkhu is visiting a monastery. He is frustrated that he is not given the WiFi password. He uses a program on his laptop to break the WiFi encryption and steal the password anyway.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) ☒ dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Dukkaṭa for a broken promise. 'Stealing a password' is colloquial language for 'copying without permission'.

Discussion: What if this is in a hotel where they charge for WiFi access?

Solution: Dukkaṭa for a broken promise, pācittiya if deceit is involved. Using services without permission is not stealing.

(e) A bhikkhu is preparing to visit England. A visitor at the monastery asks him to carry an expensive audio recorder with him and give it to his friend in England. The bhikkhu decides to keep the recorder.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) ☒ dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Parajika if the recorder is seen as the friend's property. Dukkaṭa for a broken promise.

Make sure to clarify intentions, ask again for clear statements if necessary.

'I give this to you, please give it to X' – he is given ownership of the item, and *promises* to give it to X.

'This is my friend's recorder, please take it to him' – he is not given ownership, if he keeps it, the penalty is parajika.

(f) A bhikkhu receives a bag of expensive sweets on alms-round from a lady, who says, 'I bought these for the abbot'. The bhikkhu eats a bit from it before giving it to the abbot.

- (A) pārājika (B) ~~thullaccaya~~ (C) pācittiya (D) ~~dukkaṭa~~ (E) no offenses

Solution: Thullaccaya because he only eats a small bit, not the whole bag. Dukkaṭa for a broken promise. (Assuming that although the sweets may be 'expensive', but nonetheless not worth their weight in gold, and hence not a ground for pārājika.)

(g) A senior bhikkhu places a bowl under shared ownership (*vikappana*) with a samanera. He tells the bhikkhu that he may take it anytime when he needs it, and keeps the bowl in his kuti. A year later, the samanera is now a junior bhikkhu. The senior bhikkhu takes the bowl from the kuti when the junior bhikkhu is not there.

- (A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ~~no offenses~~

Solution: No offense for taking items on trust when there has been a previous arrangement. In this case, no offense for using a *vikappana* item: the *vikappana* is automatically rescinded when items are taken on trust.

(h) A bhikkhu is visiting a monastery and makes a long phone call. The call costs €100. The resident monks discover it on the bill and ask if anyone knows about this call. He remains silent.

- (A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ~~pācittiya~~ (D) ~~dukkaṭa~~ (E) no offenses

Solution: Dukkaṭa for the broken promise (using unauthorized services). Pācittiya for deceit.

DISCUSSION

How is it possible for a bhikkhu to steal from the Sangha?

A bhikkhu drives away with the monastery car and never comes back. What are the consequences?

3.A. SEXUAL CONDUCT

Kim nāmo si:

1.

A bhikkhu is staying at the apartment of a lay friend, where they organize a small gathering, and they start drinking alcohol. The bhikkhu gets drunk, and eventually he goes to bed in his room. He wakes up, and finds a woman's underwear in his bed, with a note saying 'love and kisses', plus a used condom.

Is the bhikkhu pārājika?

- (a) No, because he was drunk
- (b) No, if he was practising tantric freedom and compassion
- (c) Yes, since there is clear evidence of intercourse
- (d) Yes, even if he can't remember anything

Solution: Pārājika if there had been consenting intercourse, but the evidence as described is not sufficient and could be a deliberate plot for defaming Buddhist monks in general.

Discussion: What if he convinces himself that he is pārājika, but later finds out that they had played a prank on him?

What conditional cases must be considered?

Solution: Cases:

- (a) he had formally disrobed to be sure,
- (b) he didn't disrobe (assuming his bhikkhu status is nil) but committed pārājika since the incident,
- (c) he didn't disrobe and didn't commit pārājika since.

2.

Mark the factors which, under Sg 1, commit a *thullaccaya* offense.

- (a) object (b) perception (c) intention (d) effort (e) result

Solution: The factors are Intention, Effort and Result. Intention + Effort is *thullaccaya*. Intention / Effort + Result is not an offense.

3.

Are there offenses?

(a) A woman asks to speak with a bhikkhu. It is a hot day and she is dressed quite openly. For the rest of the day, he continues fantasising about her.

- (A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

Solution: Sensual thoughts are not an offense, but lead to dangerous situations, dissatisfaction, and no zeal and diligence for the training.

(b) Later, the bhikkhu recollects the meeting, starts rubbing himself, and causes an emission.

- (A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

Discussion: asking women to cover themselves when they come to a meeting in what is a normal dress for them.

4.A. LUSTFUL CONDUCT

Kim nāmo si:

1.

(a) Mark the factors which, under Sg 2, commit a *dukkāṭa* offense.

(A) object (☒) perception (C) intention (☒) effort (E) result

Solution: Result is not a factor. Including lustful intention would be *saṅghādisesa*. Intention + Effort could be a *dukkāṭa* if the Object is a man.

Discussion: describe such a situation.

2.

Are there offenses?

(a) A bhikkhu is walking behind a woman. She suddenly stops, and the bhikkhu walks into her. Annoyed and angered, he starts swearing about her butt.

(A) *saṅghādisesa* (B) *thullaccaya* (C) *pācittiya* (☒) *dukkāṭa* (E) no offenses

Solution: Insulting a lay person is *dukkāṭa*. Swearing out of anger is bad behaviour, but not a *saṅghādisesa*.

Discussion: What if he swears not in anger, but with a naughty smile? What if he swears in a language she doesn't understand, but asks other people about it later?

Solution: Lewd swearing is a *saṅghādisesa* when immediately understood.

If not understood immediately, *thullaccaya* if using direct expressions, *dukkāṭa* if using euphemisms.

(b) A bhikkhu meets a female visitor for a cup of tea, the two of them are alone. She later complains, saying that the bhikkhu made vulgar jokes, and she felt personally offended by them.

(A) *saṅghādisesa* (B) *thullaccaya* (C) *pācittiya* (D) *dukkāṭa* (☒) no offenses

Solution: Since she didn't specify what the jokes or their offending aspect has been, one should (1) ask her to describe the precise nature of the jokes, (2) ask the bhikkhu to do the same, in order to deal with the matter according to the facts.

There is no offense if we the jokes were using rough language, cynical or insensitive, with no lewd intention.

Joking for the sake of enjoying a sexually improper joke with a woman would be *saṅghādisesa*.

Jokes are not usually made out of an impulse of anger, which would be an exception from *saṅghādisesa*.

(c) A bhikkhu is carrying a table with a woman. He playfully pushes her with the table, sharing a good laugh.

(A) *saṅghādisesa* (☒) *thullaccaya* (C) *pācittiya* (D) *dukkāṭa* (E) no offenses

Solution: *Thullaccaya*, because of the indirect contact with 'objects connected to the body'. Minimum level for 'lustful intention' is even a momentary enjoyment of the contact.

- (d) A bhikkhu injures his arm with a deep cut. In the hospital, a female doctor stitches his wound. He can't feel his arm because of the anaesthetics. He remains completely still, but enjoys looking at the sweet female doctor.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: No offense as long as he is making no effort. If he makes a move with the desire for contact, saṅghādisesa. It is irrelevant whether his enjoyment is from the contact or not.

If he arranges to see the same female doctor again, that will count as effort.

- (e) A bhikkhu is trying on shoes in a shop. A female assistant helps to put on a shoe and she asks, 'Is that comfortable?' He looks into her eye and responds, 'Yes, very.'

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: No offense if only speaking about the shoe. Can be saṅghādisesa under Sg 3 for euphemistic references if the woman understands.

- (f) A girl-scouts club visits the monastery for an introduction to meditation. A bhikkhu leads a guided meditation for them, with no other male present.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: No offense if not aiming for privacy, and they probably asked questions. Nonetheless, best to have a male present.

- (g) A woman is chatting with a monk, when she starts praising the mind-expanding qualities of tantric sex. The bhikkhu says that it is a powerful way to spiritual advance, and they share a naughty smile.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Using euphemisms to enjoy lewd comments is a saṅghādisesa offense.

- (h) Travelling on the metro, a bhikkhu is pressed against a woman by the crowd. He tries to free himself, but there is no space.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (i) A bhikkhu shows the guests a wall which needs to be painted. He grabs the handle of a brush held by a woman, and guides her hand to show the correct brushing technique, trying get it over with quickly.

(A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

Solution: Avoid the situation, it looks bad even for those with faith. The bhikkhu is making indirect contact: it is thullaccaya if there even momentary enjoyment of the contact.

- (j) A bhikkhu picks up an advertisement leaflet with a woman's provocative image on it. Later, he fantasises while touching the picture.

(A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

(k) A bhikkhu accepts foot-massage from a woman, on the condition that she wears gloves.

(A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

Solution: Contact with clothed parts of the body is direct contact, not indirect.

(l) A bhikkhu is going to be interviewed in a television program. When he arrives to the studio, the cosmetic girls brush some colour on his face, so he doesn't look so worn-out. It's a quick and unpleasant procedure.

(A) pārājika (B) saṅghādisesa (C) thullaccaya (D) pācittiya (E) dukkaṭa (F) no offenses

Solution: Indirect contact, but presumably he is not desiring it.

5.A. WOMEN 1

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

(a) A woman is driving a minivan and stops to offer a lift for a bhikkhu. She is alone, but the bhikkhu sits at the back seat of the minivan.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(b) A bhikkhu needs regular car trips from the monastery to the town. He is accompanied by a male novice, but the bhikkhu arranges the same woman to drive every time.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(c) A bhikkhu is travelling by train, sitting in an enclosed compartment alone. At one of the stops a woman enters and takes a seat in the compartment.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Solution: No offenses if he is not aiming at privacy.

(d) A bhikkhu is travelling by bus to visit a friend. He arrives at the bus station, where the girlfriend of his friend is waiting with a car. She says, 'Hop in, we live a few minutes' drive from here'. He gets in and they drive to his friend.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(e) A bhikkhu is visiting his parents, and stays at their house for the weekend.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(f) A friend of a bhikkhu visits him at the monastery. He meets a girl there. Later, he asks the bhikkhu to pass on a message to the girl, that he will be at the monastery when her visit ends, and can give her a lift by car at a certain time. The bhikkhu gives her the information at the mealtime. In the end she leaves one day early by taxi.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) ☒ thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(g) A woman asks a bhikkhu for a meeting to learn about emptiness in Buddhism. They chat for hours, and she posts a happy selfie of them on Twitter. Her boyfriend arrives, angry at her for spending time with other men.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Discussion: She might be enjoying that she could make her boyfriend jealous.

(h) A bhikkhu receives an email from a woman, who recently visited the monastery and is asking for help in her meditation regarding *kāma-taṇhā*. The bhikkhu responds with *asubha* instructions. Their email exchange continues for several further messages.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(i) A bhikkhu is walking along the coast. He is tired, the beach seems empty, and he lies down in the sand. A woman walks up to him and lies down, but he doesn't hear it because of the sound of the waves.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(j) A married couple asks a bhikkhu for a discussion about how to repair their relationship. They talk for hours, and leave in a peaceful spirit. Later they divorce anyway, and the man blames the bhikkhu for talking about 'letting go'.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

(k) A bhikkhu is hanging his laundry in an enclosed drying room. A woman comes in with her laundry, and they chit-chat for hours.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: No offense because they are standing, but it would be better to just do one's business and get out of there.

(l) A bhikkhu is chatting with the guests about a local church. A woman suggests they could go there as a group by bus. The bhikkhu agrees and they go sight-seeing the next day.

(A) saṅghādisesa (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

6.A. ATTAINMENTS

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

- (a) A bhikkhu is conducting a Q&A session. Someone says that he doesn't look like other meditation teachers. The bhikkhu says he can even walk on water, but can't show it now because he would lose the ability.

(A) ☒ pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (b) A bhikkhu says that he has gotten much better at *metta-bhāvanā* but he has much to work on *upekkhā*.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

- (c) A lay supporter invites the bhikkhus for a meal: 'May the venerable arahants come to my house tomorrow for a meal offering.' Next day, a few of the bhikkhus go to his house to receive the offering.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Discussion: What if one of the bhikkhus gives the lay supporter a name-card with his website address, thearahant.wordpress.com?

- (d) A bhikkhu is seriously ill and a group of bhikkhus visit him. He says that he has no reason to fear death. Is there an offense?

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

- (e) A bhikkhu tells a friend about his samādhi practice in which he sees the beings in the heaven and hell realms.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (f) A bhikkhu is talking about astrological signs with the guests. One of them remembers a prediction the bhikkhu has given him, and how accurate it turned out to be. The bhikkhu says he has been developing his abilities for a long time.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Claims of 'animal knowledge' (*tiracchāna-vijjā*).

- (g) A bhikhu says, 'I never had anything to do with astrology. I still don't understand much, but I am surprised how much liberating insight and pure Dhamma there is in the Visuddhimagga.'

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Solution: Humble-bragging, although fraught with vanity, has not been assigned a penalty in the Vinaya.

- (h) The lay guests are talking about long periods of fasting. A bhikkhu comes along and tops all their stories.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) ☒ dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Truthful boasting only to impress is *dukkata*.

7.A. FALSE SPEECH

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

- (a) A bhikkhu is talking to the customer service on the phone. They ask him for his ID card number, but the dispatcher says it's just a formality, it can be a fake number if he doesn't want to give the real one. The bhikkhu says he is going to give him a fake number.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (b) A bhikkhu makes up extreme and outlandish stories about his tudong. They laugh at his stories but no one believes him.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya if he was not trying to joke. No offenses if it is understood that he is speaking jokingly. The factors of Pc 1 are Intention and Effort.

- (c) A bhikkhu forgets that a week ago he had eaten after midday, and doesn't confess the offense before the pāṭimokkha recitation. During the recitation he remembers it, but he is too embarrassed to speak up.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: It could be no offense if he did confess using the blanket confession formula. Nonetheless, one shouldn't rely on the blanket confession. The best practice is to mention specific offenses as best as one remembers them.

- (d) A bhikkhu promises to do his chore more often, but he has no intention to do so.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (e) A bhikkhu arranges the time for a phone call. On the day, he decides to go out for a walk and not show up for the phone call.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) ☒ dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (f) The bhikkhus are talking about the longest continuous sitting meditation they remember doing. One of them knowingly adds another hour to his "claim" in order to come out ahead.

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) ☒ pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

- (g) A bhikkhu tells a bhikkhu a story about the offense of another bhikkhu, 'It was pretty bad, I don't know the details exactly, but it could have been a saṅghādisesa.'

(A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) ☒ no offenses

Solution: Accusations are spoken in the presence of the other person. This is gossip, not an accusation.

Discussion: Vague gossip and divisive false tale-bearing.

(h) A bhikkhu tells a story about another bhikkhu, ‘... and you know what, he talks about Hindu gods in his Dhamma talks. That’s just *wrong*.’

- (A) pārājika (B) thullaccaya (C) pācittiya (D) dukkaṭa (E) no offenses

Solution: He is just complaining.

(i) A bhikkhu is talking with a visitor. He says he brought a few warm sweaters, and would like to offer them to the monastic community. The bhikkhu mentions that he actually needs one, and the man gives him one.

- (A) nissaggiya pācittiya (B) pācittiya (C) dukkaṭa (D) no offenses

Discussion: Can the community decide to forbid a bhikkhu from using a diverted item?

8.A. ROBES 1

Kim nāmo si:

What is the Pali name of a bhikkhu's upper, lower, and outer robe?

A bhikkhu discovers that the seams of his cotton jacket under the arm-pit where the cloth was joined, have come apart. What should he do?

Supporters wish to offer robe-cloth to the Community. They bring a piece of cloth as a sample, which is a white nylon material. Is there an offense in asking them to offer a better material?

After the Pavarana ceremony, the community holds a Kathina celebration. At the end, they relinquish the Kathina privileges. One of the bhikkhus, who didn't really want to relinquish the privileges, goes on tudong without taking his *saṅghāṭi* with him. Are there any offenses?

A bhikkhu wants to go tudong without his *saṅghāṭi*, and asks the community for permission to do so. Is this allowed?

Is a bhikkhu allowed to travel home without taking his *saṅghāṭi*? Can he stay one night at a hospital without it?

Solution: He must take his three robes with him when travelling.

In exceptional cases (short hospital stay), NP 2 allows the community to give him permission to be without his robes.

A bhikkhu receives a nice leather-belt from a friend. Is it allowable?

A bhikkhu embroiders the sign of the Eye of Horus on his meditation blanket. Is it allowable?

A bhikkhu keeps his three robes in his kuti where he spends the night. Waking up early while it is still dark, he goes for a walk outside the monastery to watch the Sun rise. Is there any offense?

A bhikkhu takes some cloth from the stores to his kuti to make a sitting cloth. He forgets about it for a few weeks. Is there an offense?

A monk is visiting home. His old friends invite him to the skate park. He puts on a pair of jeans and a black T-shirt to go and see if he can still do an ollie. Is there an offense?

A bhikkhu asks his mother to buy him a new robe made of silk when she is travelling in Thailand, even though his mother has asked him not to ask for any more new robes. Is there an offense?

A bhikkhu is chosen by the community to receive the Kathina-robe. What are the eight Kathina duties? What is procedure when receiving the Kathina robe? What are the Kathina privileges?

A bhikkhu is travelling by plane. He packs his *saṅghāṭi* in the hold luggage. After landing, his hold luggage is missing. He registers the missing luggage with the airport services, but has to leave without it. The airport delivers his luggage in a few days. What are his duties?

A bhikkhu wants to mark his robe. He has an ink bottle, and plucks a blade of grass to make a mark on the robe. Are there offenses?

A monk realises his robe is bigger than the standard measurement 2.25m x 1.5m – could he confess this to another monk in the monastery?

How should one treat one's robes? If they are torn, or lost or are laid aside, how should one deal with it?

9.A. KICCAVAṬṬA

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Match the dress code to the situation:

- | | |
|---|---|
| (a) <u> A </u> travelling between monasteries | A. both shoulders covered with the civara |
| (b) <u> B </u> entering the monastery | B. one shoulder covered with the civara |
| (c) <u> B </u> receiving a visiting teacher | C. angsa or cotton jacket |
| (d) <u> C </u> working outside on a hot day | D. removing clothes until bare chested |
| (e) <u> A </u> sitting in a car on a long journey | |
| (f) <u> A </u> sitting in a car for quick lift | |
| (g) <u> B </u> receiving the meal offering in the monastery | |
| (h) <u> A </u> receiving the meal offering at a supporter's house | |

2.

When you leave a monastery to travel, what are good times to take leave from the abbot?

- (a) No need, he already knows you are leaving
- (b) Send an email the day before
- (c) ☒ At the meal time the previous day
- (d) ☒ During the morning before departure

3.

Do or do Not?

- (a) D A samanera should find a new mentor when moving to a another monastery for upasampada and bhikkhu training.
- (b) N Feel free to choose travel dates to be on the Full- and New Moon, since the community can move the time of the *uposatha* out of the way.
- (c) D When you arrive at a monastery, wait to see the abbot until he tells you to see him.
- (d) D When a visiting bhikkhu arrives at the monastery, show them where their accomodation will be.
- (e) N When leaving a monastery, leave the lodgings monk to sort out the kuti or room you were using.
- (f) D Give a suitable *anumodana* chant when receiving the meal on your own.
- (g) N When washing your bowl, leave your bowl in the dish-dryer with the cups and plates and walk away. It will be dry by the time you come back.
- (h) N When washing the teacher's bowl, lean into the effort and scrub it hard to make sure it's clean.
- (i) N When arriving at a monastery, don't ask about chores and duties if you are senior to the chores monk.
- (j) D Ask for dependence (*nissaya*) from the teacher before the Vassa starts.
- (k) N When a visiting teacher arrives, it's better not to touch their bowl and travel bag.

4.

One of the following anumodanas is usually chanted for a death memorial.

(a) Āyu-do bala-do dhīro

(b) Adāsi me akāsi me

(c) Kāle dadanti sapaññā

(d) Sabba-buddhānubhāvena

DISCUSSION

A samanera is visiting a monastery. The community organizes a sauna night before the uposatha day. The samanera is the last one to leave the sauna, but doesn't tidy up and clean the sauna, since this is not his monastery. How should one leave the sauna room after use?

A junior bhikkhu wants to go on a two-months long hike in Australia with a lay friend. His mentor doesn't give him permission. The bhikkhu decides he is going to be independent from now on, and makes his travel arrangements to Australia.

What are the consequences?

10.A. MISC 1

Kim nāmo si:

A bhikkhu calls a samanera 'slow as a *megatherium*' (an extinct giant ground sloth). Are there offenses? What are proper actions for the samanera to take?

A bhikkhu wants to go for a walk in the afternoon, crossing a village. The other bhikkhus are back at their kutis. He leaves without informing them.

It is a warm day, but it will be cold at night. A bhikkhu lights a fire when the Sun sets, to keep warm during the night.

A bhikkhu wants to boil water on tudong. He collects some branches and lights a fire under a tree.

A bhikkhu lights a fire to burn a pile of old branches and leaves on the ground. Is this an offense for him? Can the pile be burned without offenses?

A bhikkhu sees a large, delicious cake left in the temple in a gift box. He considers it a valuable item and carries it to the kitchen, for safe keeping. Is this an offense?

A bhikkhu sees a nice looking rock on the beach. He picks it up and keeps it in his kuti. Is this an offense? What if it turns out to be a piece of opalized wood (expensive)?

A bhikkhu goes for a walk and finds a key ring. He recognizes the car keys of a friend of the monastery. What should he do?

DISCUSSION

The abbot in a monastery tells the community that in his monastery, it's OK to let the visitors cook fresh prawns. A bhikkhu eats from a dish of fresh *arroz com marisco* (rice, prawns and mussels) cooked in the monastery from live prawns. Are there offenses?

Solution: Pācittiya, since 'fresh prawns' in this context means cooked live.

'Know/heard/suspect': All the monks were made aware that visitors might cook live prawns, so they cannot excuse themselves thinking, 'visitors in the monastery never cook live prawns'.

The abbot tells the monks that in his monastery, they are not allowed to eat meat. A bhikkhu receives a few tins of sardines on alms-round, brings it back and eats from it at the meal. Are there offenses?

Solution: Dukkaṭa for going against kor-wat.

A bhikkhu opens a box of fruit-juice and drinks some of it, leaving the half-full box on the table. The next day, another bhikkhu sees the box of juice and drinks the remaining part. Any offense?

Solution: Pacittiya for consuming stored food.

A supporter would like to offer food to a monk. She is unable to bring the food directly to the monk in person. She orders food using the internet and requests that the food is delivered in the morning. She then tells the monk to expect a food delivery in the morning. The food vendor processes the order and sends an autonomous drone (e.g. a storage box rolling on wheels or flying) to deliver the food to the monk's address. The drone arrives on time in the morning and brings the food to the monk. The monk removes the food from the drone's storage compartment. Are there offenses?

What if the drone is remotely operated by a person? (E.g. a hovering tray)

Solution: Pc 40 on the act of giving: The donor must be within *hatthapāsa* of the monk and offer the food (a) with the body, (b) with something in contact with the body, or (c) by dropping, releasing, tossing it.

Robots delivering food in Milton Keynes:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z417CncwQsg>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D-WDaJROUBY>

What are staple and non-staple foods in the Vinaya? Would it be correct to consider current (culturally) staple foods such as bread, pasta, potatoes as staple foods?

Solution: Yes.

Staple foods: cooked grains (rice, wheat, barley, millet, beans, rye – Great Standards: any grain cooked as staple – corn and oats), fish and meat. Generally only these are considered staple.

What are the other categories for edible items?

Solution: Staple, Non-staple, juice drinks, the five tonics medicines and water.

You are out on tudong, your clock reads 1.30pm, however the Sun looks like it hasn't yet reached it's high point, would there be any offense in eating any remaining food? How about if you eat food at this point in the monastery?

Solution: Did he get up from his seat?

No offense if done outside the monastery, as midday has not yet occurred. In the monastery, eating after the formal community meal would generally be considered a breach of monastery house standards – kor wat.

You find some food stuck in your tooth in the afternoon and swallow it, any offense?

Solution: No, as it has already passed through the door of the mouth.

What is miso and why is it life-time?

Solution: Salted sour gruel are allowable in the Mahavagga.

Is rice- or almond milk allowable in the afternoon?

Solution: No, produced from staples not allowed in the afternoon.

What is a special feature regarding the instigator of Pc 38 (stored food)? What can we learn from this origin story?

Solution: The original instigator was an arahant (the former head of the 1000 asectics who awoke listening to the Fire Sermon). Even though he was practicing frugality, drying left over rice, and eating it at a later point, meaning he rarely had to go out for alms, the Buddha's rebuke suggests such behaviour would encourage bhikkhus to avoid going on alms round – it seems this is a culture the Buddha didn't want to encourage.

What benefits can we associate with a regular alms round practice?

Solution: An opportunity for bhikkhus to reflect on their dependency on others, the human condition in general, benefiting the laity through daily contact with bhikkhus and the chance to practice generosity of the most basic sort every day.

What are the finer staple foods?

Solution: Ghee, fresh butter, oil, honey, sugar/molasses, fish, meat, milk, curds.

What does ill and not ill mean?

Solution: Ill: fatigue, weakness or malnutrition that comes from specifically lacking these foods. Not ill means that one is able to fare comfortably without these foods.

While travelling you tell an anagārika to buy you some cheese and chocolate. What should be done with that cheese and chocolate if you receive it? Is there any exemption to this offense?

Solution: The cheese and chocolate should be given up and the *nissaggiya pācittiya* confessed.

Exception: if the anagārika has previously invited the bhikkhu to ask.

A lay supported lifts a corner of a table to offer all the dishes to a bhikkhu, is the food considered offered?

You are visiting family, they say, everything on this table is offered here today, would this be considered offered?

You are travelling 1st Class to Thailand, in the departure lounge there is a sign saying 'all this food is offered to those with a 1st class ticket' – is this considered offered?

Solution: Not offered, but it would not be stealing.

An anagarika accidentally knocks a tray of offered food at the meal time, does the tray need to be reoffered?

In the origin story to this rule how did Ven. Sagata show disrespect for the Buddha once drunk? How did the Buddha illustrate Ven. Sagata's drop in ability when drunk?

Solution: The monks placed Ven. Sagata with his head towards the Buddha, but Ven. Sagata turned around in his sleep and placed his feet towards the Buddha. The Buddha said that previously Sagata did battle with the Ambatittha naga – and asked could he do battle with even a salamander now?

How is the Great Standard used in this rule to include other intoxicants and narcotics?

Solution: The Canon criticizes alcohol on the grounds of it can destroy one's sense of shame, weakens one's discernment and can put one into a stupor – therefore this rule can be extended to other intoxicants, narcotics and hallucinogens – marijuana, cocaine, LSD etc.

A friend cooks a stew using red wine as an ingredient – any offense in knowingly eating it? How about if they serve a rum-truffle as dessert, but one eats it, not knowing it contains alcohol?

Solution: Cooking of the alcohol would cause it to evaporate – no offense. Eating the truffle with alcohol would incur an offense, as perception as to whether alcohol is contained is not a mitigating factor.

You are sick on tudong and approach a 'protected families' house to request some simple medicine and food. Is there an offense?

Solution: No offense as there is an exemption for illness.

Living in a risky forest dwelling, unannounced food is offered to a bhikkhu. On what condition is it allowable to receive it?

Solution: Pd 4 allows the bhikkhu to (a) receive the food inside the dwelling if he is ill and unable to go on alms-round, (b) or to receive it outside and eat it inside.

On alms in the village, a bhikkhu is informed that next week the villagers will bring food to his risky forest dwelling. Does this count as correctly announced?

Solution: The Vibhanga makes it clear the announcement is valid only if the informant makes it in the lodging or compound.

What two options does the Commentary recommend if unannounced gifts of food are offered?

Solution: (1) Have the donor take the food out of the lodging area, come and announce it, and then go out to bring the food back in and offer it.

(2) Have the donor take the food outside the lodging area, and have the food offered there.

DISCUSSION

What is the lifetime of the following items?

- | | |
|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|
| • Fruit juice in tetra-pack | • Cheese with red pepper spicing |
| • Unsweetened soya milk | • Cheese with onion pieces |
| • Margarine (from veg. oil) | • Coffee-mate powder |
| • Butter (dairy) | • Carrot juice |
| • Fried onions | • Chewing-gum |
| • Coca-Cola | • Jelly |

At the mealtime, a bhikkhu asks an anagarika to offer more spices and snacks. Are there offenses?

A monk on tudong receives some cheese on alms-round, which he keeps for later. The next day on alms-round, he receives some bread. He makes a sandwich, using the cheese from the day before and eats it. Is there an offense?

A bhikkhu receives a bottle of olive oil, and determines to use it externally. After a few weeks, he pours some in a cup, determines that as seven-day tonic, and drinks it.

A bhikkhu receives lemons, chili peppers and salt. He makes a habit of mixing a few spoonfuls in the evening and eating it.

What if he adds sunflower seeds as well?

During the months of daylight saving time, a bhikkhu wants an after-meal snack. While eating his meal, he puts an apple in his yarm to eat before 1pm.

A bhikkhu receives cookies on alms-round. After having finished eating the meal, he makes a cup of tea and dips the cookies in it.

13.A. MONEY

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Mark the items which are currency in terms of the Vinaya.

- (a) a piece of paper that says 'I owe you 10€'
- (b) a casino chip
- (c) a polished pearl bead
- ☒ (d) a USB pen-drive with bitcoin keys
- (e) a refund slip, accepted in any shop at the airport

Solution: Official currencies can't be refused as an exchange. Bitcoin is used in El Salvador as main currency. Pearls are not accepted as a general means of exchange.

2.

(a) Who does the money belong to, after being placed with the steward?

- ☒ (A) the donor (B) the steward (C) the bhikkhu

(b) When the bhikkhu indicates a need for requisites, who is responsible to find and conduct a fair deal?

- (A) the donor ☒ (B) the steward (C) the bhikkhu

Solution: The bhikkhu may get involved (advising the steward), but it remains the steward's responsibility to conduct the deal.

3.

A bhikkhu is walking on the street with a friend. A lay woman approaches them and holds out a few € bills toward the bhikkhu, 'Here, look after yourself.' The bhikkhu responds, 'Can you give it to my friend here? He usually takes care of it for me.'

Is this an offense?

- (a) No, if the bhikkhu doesn't see it as his money
- (b) No, if the bhikkhu has his own Vinaya interpretation
- (c) Yes, because he diverted the offering
- ☒ (d) Yes, because of instructing her what to do with her money
- ☒ (e) No offense

Solution: It is an offense if understood as an instruction, but not an offense if reading it as a suggestion.

4. A bhikkhu is travelling. He misses the bus which he had a ticket for, and he sits at the bus station, feeling helpless. He starts chatting with a man while sitting, who offers to give him money to buy a ticket when the next bus arrives. The bhikkhu accepts the money, buys a ticket, and takes the change back to the monastery.

(a) ☒ nissaggiya pācittiya

(b) dukkaṭa

(c) no offenses

Discussion: Correct procedure when he arrives at the monastery.

5.

Do the following situations incur an offense? Mark **Yes** or **No**.

- (a) Y A bhikkhu says, 'Mum, when you're going to the store, please buy a bag of chips for me.'
- (b) N A visitor puts some money in an envelope, saying, 'This is for the building project'. He places it next to the bhikkhu's seat, who consents with a nod.
- (c) Y A bhikkhu tells a lay supporter, 'Next time you come, please buy some cheese for the community.' He brings it as requested and the community members share it.
- (d) N A visitor leaves a handful of coins in their room with a note saying, 'for the monastery'. The guest monk scoops them up and places them in the donation box.
- (e) Y A bhikkhu is walking with an anagārika on the street. The bhikkhu sees a 10€ bill on the pavement and tells the anagārika to pick it up as an 'offering from karmic forces'.
- (f) Y On alms-round, a lay man places a few coins in the bhikkhu's shoulder bag, who looks at it and thinks 'I will carry it back and someone will take it from me'.
- (g) Y A bhikkhu asks an artist, 'Could you make a drawing for a new Dhamma book? I can't give you money for it, but I'm happy to send you some books.'

DISCUSSION

The Buddha made many efforts to end the quarrel at Kosambi which was heading to a schism but in the end concluded: “These foolish men are as though infatuated; it is not easy to persuade them,” rising up from his seat, departed. How did the issue get resolved?

Solution: The lay people, upset that the monks of Kosambi drove the Buddha away, stopped respecting the monks and offering them alms food, thinking it might help to resolve the issue. The monks of Kosambi, as a result, sort out the Buddha to resolve this vinaya question.

Why is Sg 11 related only to a monk with one, two or three bhikkhus supporting his case?

Solution: Four is already a split group.

If a bhikkhu difficult to admonished persist with his behaviour, and is then formally rebuked by the sangha in a sanghakamma of one motion and three announcements – can he be made to carry out the sanghadisesa penalty?

What additional procedure should the community to carry out?

Solution: A Community planning to impose any of these rules on one of its members should be prepared to recite the transaction statement for suspension against him as well, in the case that he is so stubborn that he will not see his fault or admit his sanghadisesa.

What are some examples of wrong modes of livelihood (for bhikkhus) which can lead to corruption of families?

Solution:

- running messages and errands - participating in political campaigns.
- scheming, talking, hinting, belittling others for the sake of material gain, pursuing gain with gain – giving hoping to receive more
- Practising worldly arts, e.g., medicine, fortune telling, astrology, exorcism, reciting charms, casting spells, performing ceremonies to counteract the influence of the stars, determining propitious sites, setting auspicious dates (for weddings, etc.), interpreting oracles, auguries, or dreams.

What is meant by serious offense in Pc 9?

There is a non-offense if one tells a lay person the action of an offense if one does not mention the class, or the class, if one does not mention the action – how can this be a problem?

Solution: Lay people generally know about the rules these days.

When might it be helpful to make use of this rule?

Solution: (a) A bhikkhu commits a serious offense and refuses to acknowledge it.

(b) Assuming to be a bhikkhu after doing a parajika or refusing to do rehabilitations after sanghadisesa – the sangha could then authorize a bhikkhu to inform the lay community – the bhikkhus supporters – to exert pressure on him to submit to the penalty.

(c) It could be used to help a weak-willed bhikkhu in mending his ways.

What is meant by evasive or uncooperative?

Solution: Evasive – one leads the talk aside.

Uncooperative – one remains silent.

What are the allowable reasons for remaining silent, asking questions, not speaking to the point?

Solution: Not understanding what is being said, too ill to speak, feeling that to speak will create conflict or dissension in the Community, feeling that the Community will carry out a transaction unfairly or not in accordance with the rule.

Would there be an offense to criticize and complain about to others, a bhikkhu who is not a community official?

Solution: Dukkata.

To criticize a biased community official to his face to hurt his feelings?

Solution: Pc 2 regardless of whether his behaviour has been biased or not.

A bhikkhu complains that the lodgings monk gives the best dwellings to his friends – any offense?

Solution: No offense if the official acts from the four causes of bias – desire, aversion, delusion, fear. Why is there no offense?

A qualifying factor for a community official is that he is unbiased.

15.A. ARGUMENTS 2

Kim nāmo si:

1.

A junior bhikkhu notices the loose robes of an older bhikkhu. He coughs and lets him know that he is dragging his robes on the floor.


Do the following responses incur an offense? Mark **Yes** or **No**.

- (a) Y He grabs the junior and grimaces.
- (b) Y He raises a finger and scowls.
- (c) Y He says, 'Now you think you know everything, do you?'
- (d) N He says, 'Thanks, I should keep an eye on that.'

Discussion: Ven. Sāriputta being told by a novice that his robe is loose. (Thag. 1001)

2.

A bhikkhu publishes YouTube videos about mindfully exploring desire as a way of practice. The wider bhikkhu community asks him by email to remove them, but he ignores their requests. Are there offenses?

- (a) pācittiya
- (b)  dukkaṭa
- (c) no offenses


Solution: The desires in the context of claiming that a hindrance is not really a hindrance are any desire related to *kāmacchanda*.

This includes sexual topics, but is not necessarily limited to such gross desires.

Discussion: Protocol leading up to suspension.

3.


A bhikkhu asks for support in travel and visas, but the community doesn't agree to it. He keeps arguing and quarrelling, until the community declares *persona non grata* against him, and he moves to another community. One of the bhikkhus still likes his jokes and visits him when travelling in the area. Is this an offense?

- (a) pācittiya
- (b) dukkaṭa
- (c)  no offenses

Discussion: The difference between a suspended bhikkhu, and one of *āgantuka* (visiting) status.

4.

A bhikkhu is walking on alms-round, when somebody grabs his arm and demands money from him. He kicks him in the foot and runs for safety. Is this an offense?

- (a) pācittiya
- (b) dukkaṭa
- (c)  no offenses

5.

Two bhikkhus are walking toward each other in a narrow corridor. When passing by, one of them pushes a hard shoulder into the other bhikkhu, who is surprised by not injured.

(a) pācittiya

(b) dukkaṭa

(c) no offenses

Discussion: Proper protocol in local conflicts.

16.A. ARGUMENTS 3

Kim nāmo si:

1.

A bhikkhu knows that another bhikkhu is prone to anxiety. He asks him, 'I saw you ate quite a lot today, isn't that like the fat bhikkhus in *pārājika* four?'

Are there offenses?

☒ (a) pācittiya

(b) dukkaṭa

(c) no offenses

2.

A bhikkhu uses one of the office computers. He opens the browser, and finds another bhikkhu's email account being open. He notices the name of the abbot, and reads the email thread, where he finds the bhikkhus complaining about the abbot.

Given the following actions, did reading the messages incur an offense? Mark **Yes** or **No**.

(a) N He tells the bhikkhu not to criticize the abbot.

(b) Y He tells the abbot how embarrassing it is, that those bhikkhus don't appreciate the abbot's work for them.

(c) N He notices his own name, and opens that email thread, worried about being criticized.

3.

(a) The Elder's Council decided on a policy that junior bhikkhus shouldn't engage in social media. A bhikkhu considers that this is not proper, and he was not asked when they decided that, and so he starts posting on Twitter. Are there offenses?

(A) pācittiya

☒ (B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Dukkaṭa for disobeying *kor-wat* out of disrespect.

(b) The bhikkhus explain to him that the decision was properly carried out, and ask him to stop. He still feels resentful, and starts posting polls about who thinks that junior bhikkhus should be allowed to use Twitter, since it is their basic human right to do so. Are there offenses?

(A) pācittiya

☒ (B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: It can't be pācittiya if the decision was not sanghakamma, so the offense is dukkaṭa for criticizing the *kor-wat* training.

Discussion: proper protocol to discuss an old issue.

4.

(a) After the *pāṭimokkha* recitation, the bhikkhus initiate an *apalokana-kamma* to decide on a work project. They get into an argument. One of them exclaims, 'That just makes *no sense!*', stands up and walks out. Are there offenses?

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

- (b) They make a decision without him. He feels offended for not being included in the decision, and insists that they should discuss it again. Are there offenses for the bhikkhu or the community?

(A) pācittiya

(~~B~~) dukkaṭa

(~~C~~) no offenses

Solution: Dukkaṭa for the community.

No offenses for the bhikkhu.

- (c) Later, he thinks, ‘They didn’t ask me, so I don’t need to ask *them*’, and starts repainting the kuti where he stays. Are there offenses?

(A) pācittiya

(~~B~~) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Dukkaṭa for not following the protocol for asking permission before modifying a dwelling.

DISCUSSION

A bhikkhu, by means of begging, is building a kuti for himself, without a sponsor. What are the two factors could then lead to a sanghadisesa offense? When is this offense incurred?

Solution: He does not get bhikkhus to approve the site and carry out a sanghakamma, the kuti is more than 3m long externally or 1.75m wide internally. The offense is incurred when the kuti is finished.

What are the differences here between Sg 6 and Sg 7?

Solution: In Sg 7 it is a large dwelling and no lower or upper limits to the size.

He has a sponsor for the project – it is not built through begging.

What is the distance at which it is considered you have departed from the furnishings?

Solution: One leḍḍupāta – 18 meters.

A bhikkhu sets out his mattress to air in the sun, then walks away, intending to return immediately. Does he incur an offense?

Solution: No - there is no offense if one departs having set furnishings belonging to the Community or another individual out in the sun with the purpose of drying them, and thinking, “I will put them away when I come back.”

Point from Vinaya-mukha: “This training rule was formulated to prevent negligence and to teach one to care for things. It should be taken as a general model.”

If there is to be an open-air meeting, who is responsible for the seats set out in the open?

Solution: The host bhikkhus are responsible for any seats set out in the open, until the visiting bhikkhus claim their places, from which point the visitors are responsible.

Consider kutis or Sangha buildings with a large veranda, which is open on the sides but has a roof. Would this count as ‘leaving out in the open’ under Pc 14 (leaving bed or bench)?

Solution: Unlikely, as it should be a fully open area.

Suggest some practical reasons for Pc 15 (spread bedding).

Solution: Origin story: the purpose of the rule is to prevent the bedding’s being left so long in an unoccupied dwelling that it attracts ants, termites, or other pests.

Vinaya-mukha: leaving bedding and other belongings scattered about in a dwelling might inconvenience the resident bhikkhus in that they could not easily allot the dwelling to another bhikkhu.

How is the bhikkhu who should not be forced to be moved defined in the Vibhanga?

Solution: Knowing the dwelling’s current occupant is a senior bhikkhu, a sick one, or one to whom the Community (or its official) has assigned the dwelling.

Suggest valid reasons for intruding on a bhikkhu’s dwelling.

Solution: Illness, suffering from cold or heat, dangers outside.

Does Pc 17 (causing a bhikkhu to be evicted) cover physically throwing someone out and verbal eviction (ordering someone to leave) in the same way?

Solution: Yes the offense is the same for both.

Suggest some valid reasons for evicting someone.

Solution: Insane, unconscientious in their behaviour, a maker of quarrels, strife, dissension in the community. A teacher may evict their student or his belongings from his dwelling if he is not properly observing his duties.

What is the purpose of Pc 18 (bed on an unplanked loft), as indicated in the origin story?

Solution: To guard against injury to a bhikkhu living under the loft: He might get hit on the head if any of the detachable legs fall down through the joists of the loft – therefore no offense of the space under the loft is not suitable as a dwelling or if there is no one underneath.

What can be understood as the reason for Pc 19 (supervising the building work)?

Solution: The non-offense clauses show clearly that the rule is aimed at preventing bhikkhus from abusing the generosity of the person sponsoring the building work.

Suggest the main purpose for Pc 87 (tall bed or bench).

Solution: The purpose of this rule is to prevent bhikkhus from making and using furnishings that are high and imposing.

Describe what the factors of effort and intention make under Pc 87.

Solution: Effort: One acquires it after making it or having it made. Intention: for one's own use.

What can be done if one receives from another an oversize bed or bench.

Solution: One can cut the legs down to regulation size before use.

You are visiting a lay friend, and they invite you to make use of a high bed, with long legs, is it suitable to use it, what would be a suitable course of action?

Solution: Cv.VI.8 allows that if furnishings of the sort unallowable for bhikkhus to own themselves are in a lay person's house (and belong to the lay person, says the Sub-commentary) bhikkhus may sit on them but not lie down on them.

What to do if not using the bed would seriously offend the lay supporter?

What is the purpose of Pc 88 (cotton stuffing)?

Solution: The purpose of all this is to keep bhikkhus from using furnishings that are extravagant and ostentatious.

What comments from the Vinaya-mukha give guidance on how to use Pc 88 – how can this apply in the monastery and when visiting a lay persons home?

Solution: Vinaya-mukha mentions, though, standards of what counts as extravagant and ostentatious vary from age to age and culture to culture (Some of the things allowed in the Canon and commentaries now seem exotic and luxurious; and other things forbidden by them, common and ordinary.)

Thus the wise policy, in a monastery, would be to use only those furnishings allowed by the rules and regarded as unostentatious at present. When visiting a lay person's home, to avoid sitting on furnishings that seem unusually grand.

DISCUSSION

You would like to make use of a smaller bowl for a tudong – is there a way of doing this without fully relinquishing your current bowl?

Solution: Make use of shared ownership.

A bhikkhu asks for a new bowl from a lay person, even though his current bowl is not broken. Following the protocol he relinquishes his new bowl to the sangha. In what way might he receive it back?

Solution: If none of the Bhikkhus exchange the new bowl for theirs, the offending monk will receive the bowl once the last monk is reached.

During the exchange-round, there is a dukkata for favouritism.

Swapping bowls is allowed, as long as it's not a trade.

Is there an offense in putting away a needle case that a monk has left laying around?

Solution: Putting away properly is no offense.

You hide your friend's robe, knowing he will find it funny too – is there an offense?

Solution: Friendly or malicious – offense all the same.

If one obtains a bone, ivory, or horn needle box made by another—not at one's instigation—offense?

Solution: Using it entails a dukkata.

A bhikkhu finds a large bone while walking and carves it into a needle box as a gift – any offense?

Solution: Dukkata when making it as gift, but no offense to receive it.

What if he carves a robe- or belt fastener instead?

Solution: No – these are allowable in the non-offense clause.

What is the general principle derived from Pc 86 (Needle box)?

Solution: The Buddha formulated this rule to put a stop of a 'bhikkhu fad' – where a certain requisite becomes fashionable to the point of putting pressures on a inconveniencing donors.

DISCUSSION

A bhikkhu is accused of a Sanghadisesa offense. Who decides? Does this principle hold for all offenses?

Solution: Ultimately the accused Bhikkhu decides and this holds for all rules.

What can a community do if a Bhikkhu is considered to have committed an offense but will not admit it?

Solution: A community may make a formal act of banishment to that Bhikkhu, so he may no longer live with that community.

You are travelling by car to a teaching engagement and a Siladhara comes along. Is there any offense?

Solution: Only if there was prior arrangement.

Who is a relation? In theory, and in practice?

Solution: In theory, going back through seven generations. Practically, are you aware of blood relations, and would they feel free to disagree with your requests.

What is the procedure that is encouraged for bhikkhus to follow at the monasteries of this tradition when corresponding with the siladhara?

Solution: Not to meet to talk in a private or secluded place, having another male around or sitting in an open, public place.

Male community members are advised not to talk about private topics with them.

A siladhara wishes to give a gift to a bhikkhu. What is the procedure she should follow?

Does this procedure also apply if you wish to give a gift to a siladhara?

Solution: It is better to exchange rather than give gifts. A gift should only be made in public, so it is not a special, secret act.

It is better to suggest that they offer the gift for the community of bhikkhus or/and siladharas, rather than for a specific person.

A siladhara offers to clean a bhikkhu's boots. How should the bhikkhu respond?

Solution: No, thank you.

1.

Are there offenses?

- (a) An old battleship, still in the harbour, is used as a museum. Lay friends invite the bhikkhu to visit it together, who agrees to go.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

Solution: Dukkata as a derived offense of Pc 48 (watching battle).

Dukkata as not a proper place for a bhikkhu to be, 'a wrong resort'.

Similar situation is walking past the residence of the president, which is guarded by the military.

A war memorial would be no offense, as it's not dedicated to war, but to those who lost (or gave) their lives in it.

- (b) A bhikkhu is visiting a prison inmate on his request for religious counselling. There are military vehicles parked in front of the prison building. The bhikkhu walks around them amused, taking photos.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

Solution: Dukkata as not a proper place for a bhikkhu to be, 'a wrong resort'.

- (c) A bhikkhu's cousin is an officer in the army. He is moved to a station nearby for a time, and invites the bhikkhu to a tour of the base. They walk around, looking at the soldiers performing their daily routine.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

Solution: Not an offense to go, but an offense to amuse oneself there.

- (d) A bhikkhu finds an abandoned surf-board on the beach. He takes off his upper robe and takes the surf-board for a ride in the water.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

- (e) Two bhikkhus were advised by their doctor to swim. They go down to a river for swimming. When they arrive, they start throwing water at each other for a laugh.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

- (f) Two bhikkhus are on tudong. After sunset, they start telling each other ghost stories. They get so spooked that they don't dare to sleep.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya if done for the excitement of scaring each other.

No offense if this is not the reason, and they just remember ghost stories.

- (g) A bhikkhu waits behind a corner, and suddenly steps forward when he hears a bhikkhu coming. He seems very amused with the startled expression on his face.

(A) pācittiya (B) dukkaṭa (C) no offenses

1. Do or do Not?

- (a) D Walking on the road to the town wearing a sun hat on hot day.
- (b) N Sitting in an angsa while travelling in a car.
- (c) D Visiting the town hall, wearing the upper-robcs on both shoulders.
- (d) N Walking along a crowded beach in an angsa.
- (e) N Sitting in an angsa in a public park.
- (f) N Using a corn-field as cover for defecating.
- (g) N Walking on the street, explaining a story and wildly gesticulating with the arms for emphasis.
- (h) D Walking along a river, stopping to urinate, away from the river.
- (i) N Being in a hurry before the *uposatha-kamma*, pulling up the upper robe and urinating.
- (j) N Wearing a hat inside a supermarket.
- (k) N Having parked and walked away from the car, yelling back to the driver to bring a water bottle.

22.A. EXCUSES

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

- (a) The abbot tells a bhikkhu to keep his robes within *hatthapāsa* at dawn, strapping them to his body if necessary. The bhikkhu responds that this is silly, and he prefers his previous teacher's interpretation of 'robe boundary'. He keeps his robes in the *dāna-sāla* instead.

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya since the motive is being irritated, not wanting to bother with a strict interpretation of the training rule.

- (b) A bhikkhu is eating in a very disciplined manner when the abbot is around, but as soon as the abbot walks out, his manner becomes unrestrained, and starts chatting with his mouth full. A one-Vassa bhikkhu comments on this, and he responds, 'Oh, you know everything now?'

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

- (c) A bhikkhu who is in charge of the monastery office, removes the list of Sangha regulations from the wall, hoping that the other bhikkhus will forget them. He spreads comments that the old *kor-wat* doesn't apply now.

(A) pācittiya

☒ (B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Dukkata as a derived offense, since *kor-wat* rules are not those laid down by the Buddha.

- (d) A sāmaṇera is in charge of preparing the community breakfast. He always makes sure to arrange his favourite jam on the sāmaṇeras' tray. After he receives *upasampadā*, during breakfast he sneaks the jam from the sāmaṇeras' tray to the bhikkhus'. When he is caught by a bhikkhu, he says that he is new, and nobody told him about that rule.

☒ (A) pācittiya

☒ (B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya for taking what is not given.

Dukkaṭa for pretending ignorance of the rule.

One may remember that *Pc 73* generously allows an excuse for not knowing the rules until the third time hearing the *pāṭimokkha*, but since in their training years the anagārikas and sāmaṇeras already study the rules and participate in Vinaya classes, it is hard to believe a bhikkhu claiming genuine ignorance of not having heard of a particular training rule.

1. Do or do Not?

- (a) D While eating, a bhikkhu asks for water. Someone hands over a water bottle, but he doesn't receive it until he washed his hands.
- (b) N Receiving alms-food, a bhikkhu asks a man to replace the tuna in tomato with tuna in oil.
- (c) N Two people are offering a bhikkhu alms at the same time. The first person gives many things and fills his bowl, while the second person is waiting. The bhikkhu starts exchanging items with the second person to fit more nutritious items into his bowl.
- (d) D While eating, splitting a large green pepper into two, instead of swallowing it whole.
- (e) N A lay person wraps up his leftover food from the previous day (dry bread, soggy potatoes, mixed up rice) and offers it to a bhikkhu. He declines the offer, hoping to get something better later.
- (f) D A bhikkhu has been standing in front of a shop for quite a while. He hasn't received much food, but he leaves nonetheless.
- (g) N A bhikkhu eats his alms-food in the public park. When he is finished, he has left-overs in his bowl but he can't see a bin, so he dumps it on the grass instead.
- (h) N Looking into a women's eyes while receiving alms-food.
- (i) D Counting the mouthfuls while eating.
Solution: Counting the mouthfuls is a practice which (1) allows one to practice not getting distracted while eating, (2) gauge how much food one needs, put exactly the necessary amount in the bowl and leave an empty bowl when finished.
- (j) N The abbot is standing up to leave, and quickly asks a question while the bhikkhu is chewing a mouthful. He makes sure to reply quickly before the abbot leaves.

24.A. ROBES 2

Kim nāmo si:

1.

Are there offenses?

(a) A monk takes a tea-towel from the kitchen to his kuti. He forgets to *bindu* (mark) and determine it.

(A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

☒ no offenses

(b) A monk takes a piece of left-over cloth from the sewing room and makes an *angsa*. He determines it as extra-cloth, but forgets to *bindu* it.

(A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

☒ no offenses

Solution: No need to bindu if the cloth he used was already bindued before.

(c) A bhikkhu wants to help another bhikkhu who has a difficult skin condition. He asks for a large amount of silk thread from his supporters, and arranges it to be woven into cloth, from which he makes a robe for the other bhikkhu.

(A) nissaggiya pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

☒ no offenses

(d) A bhikkhu is aware that a supporter is arranging a nice sitting-rug made of felt for his kuti. He finds the manufacturer's website, and emails them to make sure it's going to be all black.

☒ nissaggiya pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

(e) A bhikkhu's travel bag gets scratched on the side. He is bothered that the surface is no longer smooth and shiny, so he asks his supporters for a new one.

(A) nissaggiya pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

☒ no offenses

Solution: The offense would be for a santhata, but frugality should be practised.

(f) A bhikkhu is very particular about the colour of his robes. When he makes patches, he always cuts the patching piece from a new roll of cloth, instead of the older, faded off-cuts.

(A) nissaggiya pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

☒ no offenses

Solution: The offense would be for a santhata, but frugality should be practised.

1.

Are there offenses?

- (a) A bhikkhu is keen to improve the Pali pronunciation of the lay people, and keeps repeating the chanting lines with them until they get it just right.

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Could be no offense for correcting a short phrase, especially if the lay people have already memorized the text.

- (b) A bhikkhu is travelling and stays at different supporters' houses. In one case he spends a few nights in a small apartment with a friend, sleeping on the couch in the living room.

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Could be no offense if he gets up during the night, but the principle in the rule is being aware of the situation and appearance.

- (c) Two bhikkhus and an anagārika are going to the supermarket. When they arrive, one of the bhikkhus tells the others to go and find what they need, he is going to wait for them. When they are out of sight, he goes to the newspaper aisle to look at magazines about race cars.

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Pācittiya if he wants to hide his unsuitable behaviour, even when it's not about committing a particular offense.

No offense if he is just waiting, but still not a proper place for him to be seen.

- (d) A bhikkhu is visiting his friend and his wife. In the evening they watch an action movie together. His friend starts to make excited comments about the female characters in provocative clothing.

☒ (A) pācittiya

(B) dukkaṭa

(C) no offenses

Solution: Best to not even agree to watching it together.

DISCUSSION

A bhikkhu is upset with the abbot. When the abbot is away to teach a retreat, the bhikkhu starts complaining about his decisions, and convinces the other bhikkhus to change the way they organize the monastery's daily routine.

What would have been the correct protocol?