

Hello,

We thank you for submitting to the Beyond Fairness workshop and are releasing your reviews.

Beyond Fairness organizers

SUBMISSION: 21

TITLE: If saliency cropping is the answer, what is the question?

----- REVIEW 1 -----

SUBMISSION: 21

TITLE: If saliency cropping is the answer, what is the question?

AUTHORS: Vinay Prabhu and Abeba Birhane

----- Overall evaluation -----

SCORE: 2 (accept)

----- TEXT:

This is a very interesting study on an important problem online: image cropping. With Twitter getting in trouble recently because of the biases experienced using a saliency-based cropping mechanism. The authors first discuss the issues with how hazy the definition of saliency is in current CV literature and the contradictory expectations of such systems. Then they analyse the Twitter case specifically and find that perceived miscroppings were on account of either Separated saliency barycenters or saliency mismatch.

----- REVIEW 2 -----

SUBMISSION: 21

TITLE: If saliency cropping is the answer, what is the question?

AUTHORS: Vinay Prabhu and Abeba Birhane

----- Overall evaluation -----

SCORE: 3 (strong accept)

----- TEXT:

Summary:

This paper expands on recently noticed biases with the Twitter saliency cropping algorithm, showing ethnicity/race and gender biases, in addition pointing out the presence of the male gaze in saliency algorithms. It then complicates the notion of saliency, and provides an overview of different definitions and schools of development of saliency. The paper ends by challenging the necessity of saliency cropping in applications like Twitter.

Pros:

This paper is a thorough and contextual examination of biases of saliency algorithms, and poses thoughtful challenges to the notion of saliency itself.

-Includes extensive examples and code

-Detailed, multidisciplinary background and discussion

-Evaluation of Twitter saliency algorithm on hundreds of cropping tests

Cons:

Other:

Have the authors considered which images/videos are labelled as potentially sensitive content on Twitter? In my own experience I've noticed that media from or depicting Black people are disproportionately labelled as such.