Consistent Metafunction Aliases

Document #: N3887 Date: 2013-12-26

Project: Programming Language C++

Library Evolution Group

Reply-to: Michael Park

<mcypark@gmail.com>

1 Introduction

This paper is inspired by N3655 [2], section 3 of which was adopted at WG21's 2013 Bristol meeting. That section provided (as did its predecessor N3546 [1]) template aliases for the result of *metafunctions* in <type_traits>. However, the broader question of analogous template aliases throughout the remainder of the standard library was not addressed.

This paper recommends a systematic guideline to steer future WG21 decisions in deciding when a metafunction-name_t template alias should accompany a standard library metafunction. After applying this recommended guideline to the entire C++14 standard library, we conclude that tuple_element_t is the only missing alias. We then propose wording (a) to remedy this lack and (b) to take advantage of the proposed remedy. Finally, we also present an alternative guideline and its implications, and provide justifications for favoring the recommended guideline.

2 Motivation and Scope

N3655 [2] provided the motivation for the existence of the _t template aliases. The goal of this paper is to introduce a guideline for WG21 to systematically decide when a *metafunction* in the standard library should be accompanied by a *metafunction-name*_t template alias. Specifically, we want to ensure that future standard library *metafunctions* stay consistent with those we currently have.

The proposed guideline is the following:

A class template should be accompanied by a *metafunction-name*_t template alias if it provides a public member type named type and no other accessible members.

An exhaustive search through the text of N3797 [3] reveals that the only class templates that meet the above guideline are the following:

- Transformation Traits from section 3 of N3655 [2].
- tuple_element

Since tuple_element_t is the only missing template alias, we propose to add it.

3 Impact on the Standard

template <size_t I, class ... Types>

This proposal is a pure library extension. It does not require any new language features, it is merely an extension of an existing practice adopted from N3655 [2].

4 Proposed Wording

```
Add to <tuple> synopsis of N3797 [3]:
// 20.4.2.5: tuple helper classes:
+template <size_t I, class T>
+using tuple_element_t = typename tuple_element <I, T>::type;
The definition of get functions in §20.3.4, and §20.4.2.6 of N3797 [3] can be simplified as follows<sup>1</sup>:
// 20.3.4: tuple-like access to pair:
template <size_t I, class T1, class T2>
- constexpr typename tuple_element<I, std::pair<T1, T2> >::type&
+ constexpr tuple_element_t<I, pair<T1, T2> >&
     get(std::pair<T1, T2>&) noexcept;
     get(pair<T1, T2>&) noexcept;
template <size_t I, class T1, class T2>
- constexpr typename tuple_element<I, std::pair<T1, T2> >::type&&
+ constexpr tuple_element_t<I, pair<T1, T2> >&&
     get(std::pair<T1, T2>&&) noexcept;
     get(pair<T1, T2>&&) noexcept;
template <size_t I, class T1, class T2>
- constexpr const typename tuple_element<I, std::pair<T1, T2> >::type&
+ constexpr const tuple_element_t<I, pair<T1, T2> >&
     get(const std::pair<T1, T2>&) noexcept;
     get(const pair<T1, T2>&) noexcept;
// 20.4.2.6, element access :
template <size_t I, class ... Types>
- constexpr typename tuple_element<I, tuple<Types...> >::type&
+ constexpr tuple_element_t<I, tuple<Types...> >&
    get(tuple<Types...>&) noexcept;
```

- constexpr typename tuple_element<I, tuple<Types...> >::type&&

+ constexpr tuple_element_t<I, tuple<Types...> >&&

¹Note the removal of explicit std:: namespace qualifiers and a standardized placement of const as a drive-by-fix.

```
get(tuple<Types...>&&) noexcept;

template <size_t I, class ... Types>
- constexpr typename tuple_element<I, tuple<Types...> >::type const&
+ constexpr const tuple_element_t<I, tuple<Types...> >&
    get(const tuple<Types...>&) noexcept;
```

5 Design Decisions

ratio_addratio_divideratio_multiplyratio_subtractreference_wrapper

We considered an alternative guideline:

A class template should be accompanied by a *metafunction-name*_t template alias if it provides a public member type named type and possibly other accessible members.

An exhaustive search through the text of N3797 [3] reveals that the class templates that meet this alternative guideline are the following:

```
    integral_constant

            Transformation Traits from section 4 of N3655 [2]
            is_bind_expression
            is_error_code_enum
            is_error_condition_enum
            is_placeholder
            ratio_equal
            ratio_greater
            ratio_greater_equal
            ratio_less
            ratio_less_equal
            ratio_not_equal
            tuple_size
            uses_allocator
```

This guideline is overly accepting, because we are rarely interested in the type member of these class templates. Consider integral_constant along with all of the class templates listed under it which inherit from integral_constant. The class member we are far more interested in for these class templates is the value member. For ratio, and ratio_operations, the type member is simply a type alias for itself, and reference_wrapper's type member is nothing but an identity type alias for T.

Also consider their intended use cases. All of is_property, ratio_compare, and uses_allocator

are intended for compile-time boolean tests. tuple_size is intended to acquire the size of a tuple. integral_constant is intended to capture a compile-time value and is sometimes used for tagged dispatch. ratio_operations are used for compile-time rational arithmetic. reference_wrapper is simply intended for containing references in our containers. The intended use cases make it clear that these are not metafunctions that yield a type as a result.

On the contrary, the proposed guideline captures the correct intended use of the class templates. If the only member provided for a class template is type, it is most likely a *metafunction* which yields a type as a result. This categorization holds true for all of *TransformationTraits* from section 3 of N3655 [2] and tuple_element. For example, add_const is a *metafunction* which yields a const-qualified version of the type as a result, and tuple_element is a *metafunction* which yields the type that lies at a specified index within a list of types as a result. Therefore providing a template alias for such class templates will be useful for convenient access to the type member.

6 Acknowledgements

Thanks to Walter E. Brown for encouraging me to write this paper.

References

- [1] Walter E. Brown. 2013. TransformationTraits Redux. N3546. Retrieved from http://www.openstd.org/jtc1/sc22/wg21/docs/papers/2013/n3546.pdf
- [2] Walter E. Brown. 2013. TransformationTraits Redux, v2. N3655. Retrieved from http://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg21/docs/papers/2013/n3655.pdf
- [3] Stefanus Du Toit. 2013. Working Draft, Standard for Programming Language C++. N3797. Retrieved from http://www.open-std.org/jtc1/sc22/wg21/docs/papers/2013/n3797.pdf