

1. Show that the set $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y} \leq 1 \text{ for all } \mathbf{y} \text{ with } \mathbf{y} \in \mathcal{C}\}$ is always convex, even if \mathcal{C} is not convex. Show that $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{x} \succeq 0, \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y} \leq 1 \text{ for all } \mathbf{y} \text{ with } \|\mathbf{y}\|_2 = 1\}$ is convex.

Solution: The set can be written as

$$\bigcap_{\mathbf{y} \in \mathcal{C}} \{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{x}^T \mathbf{y} \leq 1\} \quad (1)$$

which is an intersection of half-spaces and hence convex. The case where $\mathcal{C} = \{\mathbf{y} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \|\mathbf{y}\| = 1\}$ is a special case.

2. Consider the two-dimensional positive semidefinite cone \mathbb{S}_+^2 defined as

$$\{\mathbf{X} = \begin{bmatrix} x & y \\ y & z \end{bmatrix} | x, y, z \in \mathbb{R}, \mathbf{X} \succeq 0\}$$

Show that it can equivalently be expressed as $\{x, y, z \in \mathbb{R} | x \geq 0, z \geq 0, xz \geq y^2\}$.

Solution: The matrix \mathbf{X} is PSD if and only if $\mathbf{u}^T \mathbf{X} \mathbf{u} \geq 0$ for all \mathbf{u} , which means that

$$u_1^2 x + u_2^2 z + 2u_1 u_2 y \geq 0 \quad (2)$$

for all u_1, u_2 . Consider the following cases:

1. Case $\mathbf{u} = 0$: This case is trivial.
2. Case $u_1 = 0, u_2 \neq 0$: In this case, the inequality can be written as $z \geq 0$.
3. Case $u_1 \neq 0, u_2 = 0$: In this case, the inequality can be written as $x \geq 0$.
4. Case $u_1 \neq 0, u_2 \neq 0$: Dividing by $u_2^2 > 0$ and letting $u = u_1/u_2$, we have the quadratic equation:

$$u^2 x + 2uy + z \geq 0 \quad (3)$$

The minimum of this quadratic equation is at $u = -y/x$. There are two cases to consider. Suppose that $y = 0$, in which case, \mathbf{X} is a diagonal matrix and is PSD if $x \geq 0$ and $z \geq 0$. In the case that $-y/x \neq 0$, it is possible to have $\frac{u_1}{u_2} = -\frac{y}{x} \neq 0$. So the quadratic equation is greater than or equal to zero if and only if its minimum value is non-negative, i.e., $xz - y^2 \geq 0$.

Combining all the different cases, we have that $\mathbf{X} \succeq 0$ if and only if $x, z \geq 0, xz \geq y^2$. So the set $\mathbf{X} \succeq 0$ can be expressed as $\{x, y, z \in \mathbb{R} | x \geq 0, z \geq 0, xz \geq y^2\}$.

3. For $m < n$, let $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^m$ and $\mathbf{A} \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$ be full row rank. Show that any affine set $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}\}$ can be expressed in the form $\{\mathbf{C}\mathbf{u} + \mathbf{v} | \mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^{n-m}\}$. For example, the set $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^2 | x_1 + x_2 = 1\}$ can be expressed as $\{[u \ 1-u]^T | u \in \mathbb{R}\}$.

Solution: From the rank nullity theorem, we know $\text{rank}(A) + \text{nullity}(A) = n$, where $\text{nullity}(A)$ is the dimension of null space of the matrix A . Let $\mathcal{N}(A)$ represents null space of A . Let $\mathbf{c}_1, \mathbf{c}_2, \dots, \mathbf{c}_{n-m}$ be the basis of $\mathcal{N}(A)$, where each $\mathbf{c}_i \in \mathbb{R}^n$. Let \mathbf{v} be one of the solutions to $\mathbf{A}\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{b}$. Let $\mathbf{C} = [\mathbf{c}_1 \dots \mathbf{c}_{n-m}] \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n-m}$. Then for any $\mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^{n-m}$, $\mathbf{C}\mathbf{u} \in \mathcal{N}(A)$. Hence the affine set $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \mathbf{A}\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}\}$ can be expressed in the form $\{\mathbf{C}\mathbf{u} + \mathbf{v} | \mathbf{u} \in \mathbb{R}^{n-m}\}$.

4. Show that the set of all doubly stochastic matrices is convex polyhedral in $\mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$. A doubly stochastic matrix is a square matrix with nonnegative entries with the property that the sum of entries in every row and column is exactly 1.

Solution: Let all the columns of matrix are stalked into one big vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{n^2}$. Then the set of all doubly stochastic matrices can be written as,

$$\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^{n^2} | \sum_{i=1}^n x_{nj+i} = 1 \forall 0 \leq j \leq n-1, \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} x_{ni+j} = 1 \forall 1 \leq j \leq n\}.$$

5. Which of the following sets are convex (provide proof or counterexample)

- (a) $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \min_i x_i = 1\}$
 (b) $\{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n | \|\mathbf{x}\|_1 \leq \sqrt{n} \|\mathbf{x}\|_2\}$

Solution: This is not a convex set. For instance consider the case of $n = 2$, where we are $\min\{x_1, x_2\} = 1$, which is basically two lines that are perpendicular to each other, and hence not convex. The counter example is, vectors $\begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ belong to the set but not $\begin{bmatrix} 1.5 \\ 1.5 \end{bmatrix}$.

The second condition is always true, so the set that satisfies them is \mathbb{R}^n which is clearly convex. We can express $\|\mathbf{x}\|_1$ as $\mathbf{a}^T \mathbf{x}$ where $a_i = \text{sign}(x_i)$. From Cauchy-Schwarz inequality, for any $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$, we can write $\|\mathbf{x}\|_1 = \mathbf{a}^T \mathbf{x} \leq \|\mathbf{a}\|_2 \|\mathbf{x}\|_2 = \sqrt{n} \|\mathbf{x}\|_2$.