

Comparison ran on March 27th, 2020.

Solver setups

| Name | Solver | Flags | Input |
|----------------|----------------|--|--|
| VAMPIRE | Vampire | <code>-ind struct</code> | SMT-LIB |
| VAMPIRE* | Vampire | <code>-ind struct -indgen on</code> | SMT-LIB |
| VAMPIRE** | Vampire | <code>-ind struct -indgen on -indoct on</code> | SMT-LIB |
| CVC4 | CVC4 | <code>--quant-ind</code> | SMT-LIB |
| CVC4-GEN | CVC4 | <code>--quant-ind --conjecture-gen</code> | SMT-LIB |
| ZENO | Zeno | default mode | functional program encoding |
| ZIPPERPOSITION | Zipperposition | default mode | <code>.zf</code> (native input format) |
| ZIPREWRITE | Zipperposition | default mode | <code>.zf</code> with definitions as rewrite rules |
| IMANDRA | Imandra | default mode | functional program encoding |
| ACL2 | ACL2 | default mode | functional program encoding |

Benchmarks

| | VAMPIRE | VAMPIRE* | VAMPIRE** | CVC4 | CVC4-GEN | ZENO | ZIPPERPOSITION | ZIPREWRITE | IMANDRA | ACL2 |
|---|---------|----------|-----------|------|-----------|----------|----------------|------------|---------|------|
| $\forall x.\forall y.(x + y) = (y + x)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | — |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.(x + (y + z)) = ((x + y) + z)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| $\forall x.(x + (x + x)) = ((x + x) + x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | — | — |
| $\forall x.(s(x) + x) = s(x + x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | — | — | ✓ | — | — |
| $\forall x.\forall y.(x \leq (x + y))$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| $\forall x.(x \leq (x + x))$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.(x ++ (y ++ z)) = ((x ++ y) ++ z)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| $\forall x.(x ++ (x ++ x)) = ((x ++ x) ++ x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | — |
| $\forall x.\forall y.pref(x, x ++ y)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| $\forall x.pref(x, x ++ x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — |
| $x + x + \dots$ 3 | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | — | ? |
| $x + x + \dots$ 4 | — | 90% (9) | 100% (10) | — | 100% (10) | 20% (2) | — | 100% (10) | — | ? |
| $x + x + \dots$ 5 | — | 30% (15) | 50% (25) | — | 100% (50) | 12% (6) | — | 100% (50) | — | ? |
| $x + x + \dots$ 6 | — | 8% (4) | 18% (9) | — | 100% (50) | 22% (11) | — | 100% (50) | — | ? |
| $x + x + \dots$ 7 | — | — | 10% (5) | — | 100% (50) | 2% (1) | — | 100% (50) | — | ? |
| $x + x + \dots$ 8 | — | — | 2% (1) | — | 100% (50) | 4% (2) | — | 100% (50) | — | ? |

| | VAMPIRE | VAMPIRE* | VAMPIRE** | CVC4 | CVC4-GEN | ZENO | ZIPPERPOSITION | ZIPREWRITE | IMANDRA | ACL2 |
|----------------------|---------|-----------|-----------|------|-----------|----------|----------------|------------|---------|------|
| $x + x + \dots 9$ | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 100% (50) | 8% (4) | – | 84% (42) | – | ? |
| $x + x + \dots 10$ | – | – | – | – | 100% (50) | 8% (4) | – | 90% (45) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 3$ | – | ✓ | ✓ | – | – | – | – | ✓ | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 4$ | – | 70% (7) | 90% (9) | – | – | – | – | 100% (10) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 5$ | – | 46% (23) | 48% (24) | – | – | – | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 6$ | – | 6% (3) | 26% (13) | – | – | 6% (3) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 7$ | – | 2% (1) | 6% (3) | – | – | – | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 8$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 90% (45) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 9$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 88% (44) | – | ? |
| $x ++ x ++ \dots 10$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 68% (34) | – | ? |
| $\leq (3, 3)$ | – | 100% (2) | 100% (2) | – | 100% (2) | 100% (2) | – | 100% (2) | – | ? |
| $\leq (4, 4)$ | – | – | 15% (3) | – | 100% (20) | 20% (4) | – | 100% (20) | – | ? |
| $\leq (5, 5)$ | – | – | 4% (2) | – | 100% (50) | 12% (6) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (1, 2)$ | – | ✓ | ✓ | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| $\leq (2, 3)$ | – | 50% (1) | 50% (1) | – | – | 100% (2) | – | – | – | ? |
| $\leq (3, 4)$ | – | – | 30% (3) | – | – | 40% (4) | – | – | – | ? |
| $\leq (4, 5)$ | – | – | 8% (4) | – | – | 16% (8) | – | – | – | ? |
| $\leq (5, 6)$ | – | – | 6% (3) | – | – | 10% (5) | – | – | – | ? |
| $\leq (1, 3)$ | – | 100% (2) | 100% (2) | – | – | 100% (2) | – | 100% (2) | – | ? |
| $\leq (2, 4)$ | – | – | 40% (2) | – | – | 40% (2) | – | 100% (5) | – | ? |
| $\leq (3, 5)$ | – | – | 14% (4) | – | – | 28% (8) | – | 100% (28) | – | ? |
| $\leq (4, 6)$ | – | – | 10% (5) | – | – | 18% (9) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (5, 7)$ | – | – | 4% (2) | – | – | 18% (9) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (1, 4)$ | – | 100% (5) | 100% (5) | – | – | 80% (4) | – | 100% (5) | – | ? |
| $\leq (2, 5)$ | – | – | 35% (5) | – | – | 42% (6) | – | 100% (14) | – | ? |
| $\leq (3, 6)$ | – | – | 18% (9) | – | – | 38% (19) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (4, 7)$ | – | – | 6% (3) | – | – | 16% (8) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (5, 8)$ | – | – | – | – | – | 6% (3) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (1, 5)$ | – | 100% (14) | 100% (14) | – | – | 85% (12) | – | 100% (14) | – | ? |
| $\leq (2, 6)$ | – | – | 33% (14) | – | – | 26% (11) | – | 100% (42) | – | ? |
| $\leq (3, 7)$ | – | – | 14% (7) | – | – | 32% (16) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (4, 8)$ | – | – | 4% (2) | – | – | 18% (9) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $\leq (5, 9)$ | – | – | – | – | – | 14% (7) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(3, 3) | – | 100% (2) | 50% (1) | – | – | – | – | 100% (2) | – | ? |
| pref(4, 4) | – | – | 25% (5) | – | – | – | – | 100% (20) | – | ? |
| pref(5, 5) | – | – | 2% (1) | – | – | 4% (2) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(1, 2) | – | ✓ | ✓ | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| pref(2, 3) | – | – | 50% (1) | – | – | 50% (1) | – | – | – | ? |
| pref(3, 4) | – | – | 20% (2) | – | – | 20% (2) | – | – | – | ? |
| pref(4, 5) | – | – | 8% (4) | – | – | 8% (4) | – | – | – | ? |

| | VAMPIRE | VAMPIRE* | VAMPIRE** | CVC4 | CVC4-GEN | ZENO | ZIPPERPOSITION | ZIPREWRITE | IMANDRA | ACL2 |
|-----------------------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|-----------|----------|----------------|------------|-----------|------|
| pref(5,6) | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| pref(1,3) | – | 100% (2) | 100% (2) | – | – | 50% (1) | – | 100% (2) | – | ? |
| pref(2,4) | – | 20% (1) | 40% (2) | – | – | 20% (1) | – | 100% (5) | – | ? |
| pref(3,5) | – | – | 14% (4) | – | – | 14% (4) | – | 100% (28) | – | ? |
| pref(4,6) | – | – | 6% (3) | – | – | 8% (4) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(5,7) | – | – | 2% (1) | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(1,4) | – | 100% (5) | 100% (5) | – | – | 40% (2) | – | 100% (5) | – | ? |
| pref(2,5) | – | – | 35% (5) | – | – | 21% (3) | – | 100% (14) | – | ? |
| pref(3,6) | – | – | 14% (7) | – | – | 12% (6) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(4,7) | – | – | 4% (2) | – | – | 4% (2) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(5,8) | – | – | – | – | – | 4% (2) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(1,5) | – | 100% (14) | 100% (14) | – | – | 42% (6) | – | 100% (14) | – | ? |
| pref(2,6) | – | – | 33% (14) | – | – | 21% (9) | – | 100% (42) | – | ? |
| pref(3,7) | – | – | 16% (8) | – | – | 16% (8) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(4,8) | – | – | 10% (5) | – | – | 12% (6) | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| pref(5,9) | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 100% (50) | – | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 3$ | 94% (32) | 100% (34) | 100% (34) | 94% (32) | 100% (34) | 85% (29) | 94% (32) | 100% (34) | 85% (29) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 6$ | 60% (30) | 76% (38) | 68% (34) | 68% (34) | 74% (37) | 52% (26) | 62% (31) | 96% (48) | 74% (37) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 9$ | 36% (18) | 24% (12) | 20% (10) | 36% (18) | 42% (21) | 24% (12) | 34% (17) | 54% (27) | 50% (25) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 12$ | 4% (2) | 2% (1) | 2% (1) | 10% (5) | 12% (6) | 10% (5) | 8% (4) | 16% (8) | 24% (12) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 15$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 18$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | 2% (1) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 21$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 24$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 27$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| $x + s(y) + s(0 + x) \dots 30$ | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | – | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_2 + \dots 3$ | 6% (2) | 70% (21) | 63% (19) | 6% (2) | 16% (5) | 40% (12) | 10% (3) | 100% (30) | 33% (10) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_3 + \dots 3$ | 57% (29) | 57% (29) | 60% (30) | 68% (34) | 68% (34) | 66% (33) | 78% (39) | 100% (50) | 100% (50) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_2 + \dots 4$ | – | 20% (10) | 32% (16) | – | 8% (4) | 28% (14) | 10% (5) | 74% (37) | 6% (3) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_3 + \dots 4$ | 4% (2) | 20% (10) | 18% (9) | 4% (2) | 4% (2) | 20% (10) | 20% (10) | 57% (29) | 14% (7) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_4 + \dots 4$ | 8% (4) | 6% (3) | 14% (7) | 22% (11) | 26% (13) | 44% (22) | 24% (12) | 34% (17) | 34% (17) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_2 + \dots 5$ | – | 4% (2) | 10% (5) | – | 4% (2) | 6% (3) | 2% (1) | 24% (12) | – | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_3 + \dots 5$ | – | 2% (1) | – | – | 6% (3) | 12% (6) | 6% (3) | 26% (13) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_4 + \dots 5$ | – | 2% (1) | 4% (2) | – | 2% (1) | 6% (3) | 2% (1) | 20% (10) | 16% (8) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_5 + \dots 5$ | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 2% (1) | 20% (10) | 10% (5) | 14% (7) | 10% (5) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_2 + \dots 6$ | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 4% (2) | 4% (2) | 2% (1) | 4% (2) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_3 + \dots 6$ | – | – | 4% (2) | – | 2% (1) | 10% (5) | 8% (4) | 10% (5) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_4 + \dots 6$ | – | – | – | – | – | 4% (2) | 2% (1) | 4% (2) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_5 + \dots 6$ | – | – | – | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 6% (3) | 2% (1) | ? |
| $x_0 + x_1 \dots + x_2 + \dots 7$ | – | – | 2% (1) | – | – | 2% (1) | – | 4% (2) | – | ? |

| | VAMPIRE | VAMPIRE* | VAMPIRE** | CVC4 | CVC4-GEN | ZENO | ZIPPERPOSITION | ZIPREWRITE | IMANDRA | ACL2 |
|---|---------|----------|-----------|------|----------|--------|----------------|------------|---------|------|
| $\mathbf{x_0 + x_1... + x_3 + ...7}$ | — | — | — | — | 2% (1) | 4% (2) | — | — | — | ? |
| $\mathbf{x_0 + x_1... + x_4 + ...7}$ | — | — | — | — | — | 4% (2) | — | — | — | ? |
| $\mathbf{x_0 + x_1... + x_5 + ...7}$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.(x \times y) = (y \times x)$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.(x \times (y \times z)) = ((x \times y) \times z)$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.(x \times (y + z)) = ((x \times y) + (x \times z))$ | — | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.((x + y) \times z) = ((x \times z) + (y \times z))$ | — | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.((x + y) \times z) = ((z \times x) + (y \times z))$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.(id(x) + y) = (y + x)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.equal(x, x)$ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.\forall y.\forall z.(equal(x, y, z) \leftrightarrow (x = y \wedge y = z))$ | — | — | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.equal(x + (x + x), (x + x) + x, (x + x) + x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | ✓ | — | — | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.equal(x + ((x + x) + x), x + (x + (x + x)), (x + x) + (x + x))$ | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | — | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.rev(rev(x)) = x$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |
| $\forall x.(x \mathbin{++} (rev(x) \mathbin{++} x)) = ((x \mathbin{++} rev(x)) \mathbin{++} x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.rev(x \mathbin{++} (x \mathbin{++} x)) = rev((x \mathbin{++} x) \mathbin{++} x)$ | — | ✓ | ✓ | — | — | — | — | ✓ | — | ? |
| $\forall x.revAcc(x) = rev(x)$ | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | — | ? |