

Relational Programming in miniKanren

Relational Programming in miniKanren

William E. Byrd

© 2013 William E. Byrd

Typeset by the author in X_YL^AT_EX, using Tufte-Style Book from <http://www.LaTeXTemplates.com>.
July 2, 2013 version.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Unported License. (CC BY 3.0)

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/>

*For my H211 students: Indiana University, Fall 2010 & 2011,
and Team pw0ni3.*

Learning with always trumps learning from.

—Woodie Flowers

Contents

Preface ix

Introduction 1

Conclusion 3

Using core.logic instead of cKanren 5

Bibliography 7

Preface

This is a book about *relational programming*. Just as functional programs model mathematical functions, relational programs model mathematical relations. Relational programming is intimately related to both logic programming and relational algebra, the theory behind relational databases.

Relational programs generalize functional programs, in that they do not distinguish between the “input” arguments passed to a function and the “output” result returned by that function. For example, consider a two-argument variant of Scheme’s addition function, restricted to natural numbers: $(+ \ 3 \ 4) \Rightarrow 7$. A relational version of addition, $+^o$, takes three arguments: $(+^o \ 3 \ 4 \ z)$, where z is a *logic variable* representing the result of adding the first two arguments of $+^o$. In this case z is associated with 7. More interestingly, we can write $(+^o \ 3 \ y \ 7)$, which associates y with 4; our addition relation also performs subtraction. We can also write $(+^o \ x \ y \ 7)$, which associates x and y with all pairs of natural numbers that sum to 7; $+^o$ produces multiple answers, including $x = 3$ and $y = 4$, and $x = 0$ and $y = 7$. Finally, we can write $(+^o \ x \ y \ z)$, which enumerates all triples of natural numbers (x, y, z) such that $x + y = z$; $+^o$ produces infinitely many answers. Informally, we say that the call $(+^o \ 3 \ 4 \ z)$ runs the $+^o$ relation “forwards,” while the calls $(+^o \ 3 \ y \ 7)$, $(+^o \ x \ y \ 7)$, and $(+^o \ x \ y \ z)$ run “backwards.”

We will see that the remarkable flexibility of the $+^o$ relation is exhibited by more complex relations, such as interpreters, type inferencers, and finite-state machines. For example, we will write a relational interpreter for a subset of Scheme, $eval^o$. Running $eval^o$ forwards, the call $(eval^o \ '((\lambda (x) (+ \ x \ 2)) \ 4) \ val)$ associates val with 6. Running backwards is more interesting: $(eval^o \ exp \ '6)$ generates legal Scheme expressions that *evaluate* to 6, while $(eval^o \ exp \ exp)$ generates *quines*, which are Scheme expressions that evaluate to themselves.

This book will teach you how to write relations that produce interesting answers when running forwards and backwards. Running a relation in the forward direction is usually straight-forward. Running a relation backwards is where the fun begins. I hope you’ll enjoy the neverending fun of relational programming as much as I have.

If you know nothing about logic programming, relational algebra, or databases, *don’t panic!* This book only assumes that you can write simple recursive programs in a functional language, and have a reading knowledge of Scheme. See the *Audience* section below for details.

The *natural numbers* are the non-negative integers: 0, 1, ...

Here we are taking a notational liberty, as $+^o$ expects 3 and 4 to be represented as *binary, little-endian* lists: (1 1) and (0 0 1), respectively. Zero is uniquely represented as the empty list, (). To ensure a unique representation of each number, lists may not end with the digit 0. This numeric representation is extremely flexible, since the lists can contain logic variables—for example, the list '(1 . , x) represents any odd natural number, while '(0 . , x) represents any positive even natural.

We can also perform relational arithmetic on built-in Scheme numbers, using *Constraint Logic Programming over Finite Domains*, or CLP(FD); as we will see, CLP(FD) is faster, but less general, than $+^o$ and friends ($*^o$, $/^o$, etc.).

As might be expected, $eval^o$ will interpret the quoted list $(+ \ x \ 2)$ as the call $(+^o \ x \ 2 \ val)$, where the logic variable x is associated with 4.

All too often this fun never ends, as the relation diverges (loops forever)!

Audience

This book is written for intermediate-to-advanced programmers, computer science students, and researchers. For this book, *intermediate* means that you are comfortable writing simple recursive procedures in a functional programming language, such as Scheme, Racket, Clojure, Lisp, ML, or Haskell. I also assume you have a reading knowledge of Scheme. No knowledge of relational programming, logic programming, or programming language theory is required.

If you want to learn about relational programming, but are new to programming, Dan Friedman, Oleg Kiselyov, and I have written a book just for you, called *The Reasoned Schemer*¹. In that book we assume you are familiar with the material in *The Little Schemer*², which is a very gentle introduction to recursion and functional programming.

If you are an experienced programmer, but weak on recursion, you, too, might benefit from *The Little Schemer*. If you are comfortable with recursion, but not functional programming, good introductions include *Scheme and the Art of Programming*³ and the classic *Structure and Interpretation of Computer Programs*⁴.

If you are an experienced functional programmer, but do not know Scheme, the beginning of *Structure and Interpretation of Computer Programs* should get you up to speed, while *The Scheme Programming Language, 4th Edition*⁵ describes the language in detail.

The Language

The relations in this book are written in *miniKanren*, a language designed specifically for relational programming. *miniKanren* was first implemented in Scheme; over the past eight years *miniKanren* has been implemented in Racket, Clojure, Ruby, Python, and many other “host” languages. There are multiple *miniKanren* implementations in multiple host languages, and dozens of experimental *miniKanren* implementations in Scheme. Like Lisp and Scheme, *miniKanren* is really a *family* of related languages.

This diversity of implementations and host languages has its advantages. Interest in *miniKanren* has largely been driven by the popularity of David Nolen’s excellent `core.logic` Clojure library. Claire Alvis continues to add advanced constraint solving features to the `cKanren` (“constraint Kanren”) Racket library. Other researchers and hackers are experimenting with their own language extensions and optimizations, greatly accelerating the evolution of *miniKanren*. Unfortunately, this diversity poses a dilemma for both the author and readers of this book: which host language and implementation to use?

I have attempted to deliver [these lectures] in a spirit that should be recommended to all students embarking on the writing of their PhD theses: imagine that you are explaining your ideas to your former smart, but ignorant, self, at the beginning of your studies!

—Richard P. Feynman
The Feynman Lectures on Computation

¹ D. P. Friedman, W. E. Byrd, and O. Kiselyov. *The Reasoned Schemer*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2005

² D. P. Friedman and M. Felleisen. *The Little Schemer (4th ed.)*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1996

³ G. Springer and D. P. Friedman. *Scheme and the Art of Programming*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1989

⁴ H. Abelson and G. J. Sussman. *Structure and Interpretation of Computer Programs*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2nd edition, 1996

(full text at <http://mitpress.mit.edu/sicp/full-text/book/book.html>)

⁵ R. K. Dybvig. *The Scheme Programming Language, 4th Edition*. The MIT Press, 4th edition, 2009
(full text at <http://www.scheme.com/tspl4/>)

Links to these implementations, and many other *miniKanren* resources, can be found at the official *miniKanren* website: <http://minikanren.org/>

<https://github.com/clojure/core.logic>

<https://github.com/calvis/cKanren>

I have chosen Racket as the host language for this book, and cKanren as the default miniKanren implementation, for several important reasons. Racket’s cKanren library currently has the most advanced experimental extensions to miniKanren; we will need all of these features for the relations we are going to write. Racket is distributed under a Free Software license, which is in the open spirit of this book. Racket also has excellent documentation and debugging tools, and is simple to download, install, and run. The subset of Racket used in the book is essentially identical to R^5RS Scheme, the language used in previous academic work on miniKanren, including my dissertation. With the exception of a few Schemely features (such as *call/cc*) that I explain where they first appear, this subset of Racket should be easily readable to any functional programmer.

If you are a Clojurer, and prefer to follow along in `core.logic`, the first appendix describes the main differences between the cKanren and `core.logic` implementations of miniKanren. It should be straight-forward to translate most relational programs from cKanren to `core.logic`. Translating the implementations of miniKanren from Racket to Clojure is another story. I suggest you follow along with the Racket code, and then listen to one of David Nolen’s outstanding talks on the implementation of `core.logic`.

Goals

The two high-level goals for this book are to **make relational programming accessible** to a broader audience, and to **describe the state-of-the-art** in the design, implementation, and use of the miniKanren language. An important side-effect of these goals is to **provide the background** needed to understand academic work on miniKanren.

One sub-goal of this book is to **present a variety of non-trivial miniKanren relations**, written in what I consider to be **idiomatic style**, and to show **how these relations were derived**. Many of these examples draw from academic papers on miniKanren, and focus on programming language theory (interpreters, type inferencers, etc.). Other examples, such as finite state machines, should be immediately understandable by a wider audience of programmers. To make the book as accessible as possible, all of these concepts are explained either in the main text or in appendices. This book can therefore be used as an informal **introduction to programming language concepts**.

<http://racket-lang.org/>

<http://www.gnu.org/licenses/old-licenses/lgpl-2.1.html#SEC1>

<http://www.schemers.org/Documents/Standards/R5RS/>

To some extent, this book can be thought of as an updated, greatly expanded, and much more accessible version of my dissertation (full text at <http://gradworks.umi.com/3380156.pdf>):

W. E. Byrd. *Relational Programming in miniKanren: Techniques, Applications, and Implementations*. PhD thesis, Indiana University, 2009

In this sense the book emulates Benjamin Pierce’s outstanding *TAPL*, which is about types in programming languages, but also contains excellent introductions to other PL-related topics:

B. C. Pierce. *Types and Programming Languages*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2002

Margin Notes

This book is typeset in the style of Edward Tufte’s magnificent and beautiful *The Visual Display of Quantitative Information*⁶. I share Tufte’s love of margin notes, and use them in this book to help solve the problem of addressing readers with widely varying knowledge of computer science and programming. To make the book as accessible as possible, in the main text I assume the reader is the hypothetical *intermediate-level* programmer or student described in the *Audience* section above. In the margin notes, however, anything goes, and I reserve the right to geek out whenever necessary (or unnecessary).

Typographic Conventions

Acknowledgements

William E. Byrd
Salt Lake City, Utah
July 2013

This book is set using the “Tufte-Style Book” L^AT_EX style, freely available from <http://www.LaTeXTemplates.com>

⁶ E. R. Tufte. *The Visual Display of Quantitative Information*. Graphics Press, Cheshire, CT, 1986

Another great lover of marginalia was David Foster Wallace (1962–2008). The *Harry Ransom Center’s* DFW collection includes heavily annotated books from Wallace’s personal library: <http://www.hrc.utexas.edu/press/releases/2010/dfw/books/>. Wallace’s love of margin notes is best demonstrated by his essay, “Host,” in:

D. F. Wallace. *Consider the Lobster and Other Essays*. Little, Brown and Co., 2005

Introduction

gl hf!

—Greg “IdrA” Fields

Conclusion

G.G.

—Sean “Day[9]” Plott

Using `core.logic` instead of `cKanren`

Bibliography

H. Abelson and G. J. Sussman. *Structure and Interpretation of Computer Programs*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2nd edition, 1996.

W. E. Byrd. *Relational Programming in miniKanren: Techniques, Applications, and Implementations*. PhD thesis, Indiana University, 2009.

R. K. Dybvig. *The Scheme Programming Language, 4th Edition*. The MIT Press, 4th edition, 2009.

D. P. Friedman and M. Felleisen. *The Little Schemer (4th ed.)*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1996.

D. P. Friedman, W. E. Byrd, and O. Kiselyov. *The Reasoned Schemer*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2005.

B. C. Pierce. *Types and Programming Languages*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2002.

G. Springer and D. P. Friedman. *Scheme and the Art of Programming*. MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1989.

E. R. Tufte. *The Visual Display of Quantitative Information*. Graphics Press, Cheshire, CT, 1986.

D. F. Wallace. *Consider the Lobster and Other Essays*. Little, Brown and Co., 2005.