

Table 1: Evaluation metrics and performance comparison

| Dataset              | Methods       | OA          | Precision   | Recall      | F measure   | G mean      | Specificity | Sensitivity | ROC AUC     | Outcome Frequency     | Imbalanced ratio |
|----------------------|---------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-----------------------|------------------|
| Pima Indian Diabetes | Decision Tree | 0.71        | <b>0.61</b> | 0.54        | 0.57        | 0.66        | <b>0.80</b> | 0.54        | 0.67        | Maj: 500 Min:268      | 1.9              |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.67        | 0.55        | 0.54        | 0.54        | 0.63        | 0.75        | 0.54        | 0.64        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.68        | 0.56        | 0.58        | 0.57        | 0.66        | 0.74        | 0.58        | 0.66        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.66        | 0.52        | <b>0.86</b> | 0.64        | 0.68        | 0.54        | <b>0.86</b> | 0.70        |                       |                  |
|                      | Dev           | <b>0.73</b> | 0.60        | 0.78        | <b>0.68</b> | <b>0.74</b> | 0.71        | 0.78        | <b>0.74</b> |                       |                  |
| Abalone              | Decision Tree | 0.93        | 0.46        | <b>0.46</b> | <b>0.46</b> | <b>0.66</b> | 0.96        | <b>0.46</b> | <b>0.71</b> | Maj:689 Min:42        | 16.4             |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.88        | 0.24        | 0.38        | 0.29        | 0.59        | 0.92        | 0.38        | 0.65        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.88        | 0.24        | 0.42        | 0.31        | 0.62        | 0.91        | 0.42        | 0.66        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.84        | 0.19        | <b>0.46</b> | 0.27        | 0.63        | 0.87        | <b>0.46</b> | 0.66        |                       |                  |
| Vowel Recognition    | Dev           | <b>0.94</b> | 0.55        | 0.34        | 0.42        | 0.58        | <b>0.98</b> | 0.34        | 0.66        | Maj:900 Min:90        | 10.0             |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.97        | <b>0.90</b> | 0.79        | 0.84        | 0.88        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.79        | 0.89        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.96        | 0.85        | 0.74        | 0.80        | 0.86        | 0.99        | 0.74        | 0.87        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.97        | 0.88        | 0.79        | 0.83        | 0.88        | 0.99        | 0.79        | 0.89        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | <b>0.98</b> | 0.83        | 0.96        | 0.89        | 0.97        | 0.98        | 0.96        | 0.97        |                       |                  |
| Mammography          | Dev           | <b>0.98</b> | 0.87        | <b>0.98</b> | <b>0.93</b> | <b>0.98</b> | <b>0.99</b> | <b>0.98</b> | <b>0.98</b> | Maj: 10923 Min: 260   | 42               |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.98</b> | 0.62        | 0.64        | 0.63        | 0.79        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.64        | 0.81        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.97        | 0.44        | <b>0.78</b> | 0.54        | <b>0.87</b> | 0.99        | <b>0.78</b> | <b>0.88</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.97        | 0.38        | 0.72        | 0.50        | 0.84        | 0.97        | 0.72        | 0.84        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | <b>0.98</b> | 0.54        | 0.76        | 0.63        | 0.86        | 0.98        | 0.76        | 0.87        |                       |                  |
| Ionosphere           | Dev           | <b>0.98</b> | <b>0.66</b> | 0.67        | <b>0.67</b> | 0.82        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.67        | 0.83        | Maj: 225 Min: 126     | 1.8              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.86        | 0.83        | 0.73        | 0.77        | 0.82        | 0.92        | 0.73        | 0.83        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.85        | 0.75        | 0.81        | 0.78        | 0.84        | 0.86        | 0.81        | 0.84        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.88        | 0.84        | 0.80        | 0.82        | 0.86        | 0.92        | 0.80        | 0.86        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.91        | 0.80        | <b>0.85</b> | <b>0.87</b> | <b>0.90</b> | 0.95        | <b>0.85</b> | <b>0.90</b> |                       |                  |
| Vehicle              | Dev           | <b>0.91</b> | <b>0.92</b> | 0.79        | 0.85        | 0.87        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.79        | 0.88        | Maj: 647 Min:199      | 3.3              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.94        | <b>0.85</b> | 0.88        | 0.87        | 0.92        | <b>0.95</b> | 0.88        | 0.92        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.90        | 0.75        | 0.88        | 0.81        | 0.89        | 0.91        | 0.88        | 0.89        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.92        | 0.81        | 0.87        | 0.84        | 0.90        | 0.93        | 0.87        | 0.90        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | <b>0.95</b> | 0.84        | <b>0.97</b> | <b>0.90</b> | <b>0.96</b> | 0.94        | <b>0.97</b> | <b>0.96</b> |                       |                  |
| Phoneme              | Dev           | 0.89        | 0.70        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.81        | 0.92        | 0.87        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.92        | Maj: 3818 Min:1580    | 2.4              |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.86</b> | <b>0.75</b> | 0.74        | 0.75        | 0.82        | <b>0.90</b> | 0.74        | 0.82        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | <b>0.86</b> | 0.74        | 0.78        | <b>0.78</b> | <b>0.83</b> | 0.89        | 0.78        | <b>0.83</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.83        | 0.68        | 0.78        | 0.73        | 0.82        | 0.85        | 0.78        | 0.82        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.77        | 0.57        | 0.86        | 0.69        | 0.80        | 0.74        | 0.86        | 0.80        |                       |                  |
| Haberman             | Dev           | 0.52        | 0.38        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.54        | 0.57        | 0.34        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.66        | Maj: 225 Min:81       | 2.8              |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.67</b> | 0.38        | 0.25        | 0.30        | 0.46        | <b>0.83</b> | 0.25        | 0.54        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.65        | <b>0.40</b> | 0.39        | 0.39        | <b>0.64</b> | 0.76        | 0.39        | 0.57        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.60        | 0.37        | 0.52        | 0.43        | 0.58        | 0.63        | 0.52        | 0.58        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.48        | 0.34        | <b>0.84</b> | <b>0.48</b> | 0.53        | 0.34        | <b>0.84</b> | <b>0.50</b> |                       |                  |
| Wisconsin            | Dev           | 0.54        | 0.35        | 0.70        | 0.47        | 0.57        | 0.48        | 0.70        | <b>0.59</b> | Maj: 357 Min: 212     | 1.7              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.95        | 0.93        | 0.93        | 0.93        | 0.95        | 0.96        | 0.93        | 0.95        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.92        | 0.89        | 0.90        | 0.89        | 0.91        | 0.93        | 0.90        | 0.91        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.95        | 0.93        | 0.94        | 0.94        | 0.95        | 0.96        | 0.94        | 0.95        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | <b>0.98</b> | <b>0.99</b> | <b>0.95</b> | <b>0.97</b> | <b>0.97</b> | <b>0.99</b> | <b>0.95</b> | <b>0.97</b> |                       |                  |
| Blood Transfusion    | Dev           | 0.97        | 0.97        | <b>0.95</b> | 0.96        | 0.96        | 0.98        | <b>0.95</b> | 0.96        | Maj: 570 Min: 178     | 3.2              |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.72</b> | <b>0.39</b> | 0.28        | 0.32        | 0.40        | <b>0.86</b> | 0.28        | 0.57        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.71        | <b>0.39</b> | 0.39        | 0.39        | 0.56        | 0.81        | 0.39        | 0.60        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.70        | 0.38        | 0.42        | 0.40        | 0.57        | 0.78        | 0.42        | 0.60        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.44        | 0.29        | <b>0.93</b> | <b>0.45</b> | 0.52        | 0.29        | <b>0.93</b> | 0.61        |                       |                  |
| PCI                  | Dev           | 0.68        | 0.38        | 0.52        | 0.44        | <b>0.61</b> | 0.73        | 0.52        | <b>0.62</b> | Maj: 1032 Min: 77     | 13.4             |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.90        | 0.25        | 0.27        | 0.26        | 0.50        | 0.94        | 0.27        | 0.61        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.87        | 0.22        | 0.38        | 0.27        | 0.58        | 0.90        | 0.38        | 0.64        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.87        | 0.26        | <b>0.51</b> | 0.34        | <b>0.48</b> | 0.90        | <b>0.51</b> | <b>0.61</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.82        | 0.16        | 0.41        | 0.23        | 0.59        | 0.85        | 0.41        | 0.63        |                       |                  |
| Heart                | Dev           | <b>0.91</b> | <b>0.34</b> | 0.30        | 0.32        | 0.53        | <b>0.96</b> | 0.30        | 0.63        | Maj: 188 Min: 106     | 6.9              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.77        | <b>0.68</b> | 0.63        | 0.65        | 0.73        | 0.84        | 0.63        | 0.74        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.76        | 0.67        | 0.57        | 0.62        | 0.70        | <b>0.85</b> | 0.57        | 0.71        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | <b>0.79</b> | <b>0.68</b> | <b>0.75</b> | <b>0.71</b> | <b>0.78</b> | 0.81        | <b>0.75</b> | <b>0.78</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.70        | 0.55        | <b>0.75</b> | 0.63        | 0.71        | 0.68        | <b>0.75</b> | 0.71        |                       |                  |
| Segment              | Dev           | 0.74        | 0.60        | 0.74        | 0.66        | 0.74        | 0.75        | 0.74        | 0.74        | Maj: 1980 Min: 330    | 6.0              |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.96</b> | <b>0.88</b> | 0.88        | <b>0.88</b> | <b>0.93</b> | <b>0.98</b> | 0.88        | <b>0.93</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | <b>0.96</b> | 0.87        | 0.85        | 0.86        | 0.91        | <b>0.98</b> | 0.85        | 0.91        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | <b>0.96</b> | <b>0.88</b> | 0.87        | 0.87        | 0.92        | <b>0.98</b> | 0.87        | 0.92        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.95        | 0.80        | 0.87        | 0.83        | 0.92        | 0.96        | 0.87        | 0.92        |                       |                  |
| Yeast                | Dev           | 0.72        | 0.34        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.51        | 0.81        | 0.68        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.82        | Maj: 1240 Min: 244    | 5.1              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.83        | 0.46        | 0.59        | 0.51        | 0.72        | <b>0.87</b> | 0.59        | 0.73        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.81        | 0.41        | 0.60        | 0.49        | 0.71        | <b>0.85</b> | 0.60        | 0.72        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.82        | 0.43        | 0.66        | 0.52        | 0.75        | 0.84        | 0.66        | 0.75        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.70        | 0.32        | <b>0.82</b> | 0.46        | 0.75        | 0.68        | <b>0.82</b> | 0.75        |                       |                  |
| Oil                  | Dev           | <b>0.84</b> | <b>0.50</b> | 0.73        | <b>0.59</b> | <b>0.79</b> | <b>0.87</b> | 0.73        | <b>0.80</b> | Maj: 896 Min: 41      | 21.9             |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.93        | 0.35        | 0.48        | 0.41        | 0.68        | 0.96        | 0.48        | 0.72        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.91        | 0.26        | 0.48        | 0.33        | 0.67        | 0.93        | 0.48        | 0.70        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.89        | 0.22        | <b>0.52</b> | 0.31        | 0.69        | 0.91        | <b>0.52</b> | 0.71        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.94        | 0.41        | <b>0.52</b> | <b>0.46</b> | <b>0.71</b> | 0.96        | <b>0.52</b> | <b>0.74</b> |                       |                  |
| Adult                | Dev           | <b>0.95</b> | <b>0.47</b> | 0.28        | 0.35        | <b>0.52</b> | <b>0.98</b> | 0.28        | 0.63        | Maj: 37155 Min: 11687 | 3.2              |
|                      | Decision Tree | 0.75        | 0.48        | 0.47        | 0.48        | 0.63        | 0.84        | 0.47        | 0.66        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.70        | 0.41        | 0.56        | 0.48        | 0.65        | 0.75        | 0.56        | 0.65        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.71        | 0.42        | 0.57        | 0.48        | 0.65        | 0.75        | 0.57        | 0.66        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | <b>0.81</b> | <b>0.62</b> | 0.55        | <b>0.58</b> | 0.70        | <b>0.90</b> | 0.55        | <b>0.72</b> |                       |                  |
| Satimage             | Dev           | 0.75        | 0.48        | <b>0.67</b> | 0.56        | <b>0.72</b> | 0.77        | <b>0.67</b> | <b>0.72</b> | Maj: 5805 Min: 625    | 9.3              |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.91</b> | <b>0.53</b> | 0.51        | 0.52        | 0.70        | <b>0.95</b> | 0.51        | 0.73        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | 0.90        | 0.51        | 0.63        | 0.56        | 0.77        | 0.93        | 0.63        | 0.78        |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | 0.89        | 0.45        | 0.60        | 0.52        | 0.75        | 0.92        | 0.60        | 0.76        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.90        | 0.49        | 0.72        | <b>0.58</b> | 0.81        | 0.92        | 0.72        | <b>0.82</b> |                       |                  |
| Forest cover         | Dev           | 0.88        | 0.42        | <b>0.75</b> | 0.54        | <b>0.82</b> | 0.89        | <b>0.75</b> | <b>0.82</b> | Maj: 35754 Min: 2747  | 13.0             |
|                      | Decision Tree | <b>0.97</b> | <b>0.81</b> | 0.82        | <b>0.82</b> | 0.90        | <b>0.99</b> | 0.82        | 0.90        |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTE         | <b>0.97</b> | 0.78        | 0.85        | 0.81        | 0.91        | 0.98        | 0.85        | <b>0.92</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | ADASYN        | <b>0.97</b> | 0.79        | 0.86        | <b>0.82</b> | <b>0.92</b> | 0.98        | 0.86        | <b>0.92</b> |                       |                  |
|                      | SMOTEBoost    | 0.96        | 0.73        | 0.72        | 0.72        | 0.84        | 0.98        | 0.72        | 0.84        |                       |                  |
|                      | Dev           | 0.91        | 0.43        | <b>0.88</b> | 0.58        | 0.90        | 0.91        | <b>0.88</b> | 0.90        |                       |                  |