

Table 2 Examples of CTL^{*} formulas and respective counterexamples

| | Sub-logic | Formula | Intuition | Counterexample |
|----|-----------------------------------|--|---|---|
| 1 | CTL, LTL | $\mathbf{AG}p$ | p is an invariant | finite path leading to $\neg p$ |
| 2 | CTL, LTL | $\mathbf{AF}p$ | p must eventually hold | infinite path (lasso-shaped) without p |
| 3 | CTL, (negated) LTL | $\mathbf{EF}\neg p$ | $\neg p$ is reachable | substructure with all reachable states, all containing p |
| 4 | CTL, LTL | $\mathbf{AG}(p \vee \mathbf{X}p) = \mathbf{AG}(p \vee \mathbf{AX}p)$ | p holds at least every other state | finite path leading to $\neg p$ twice in a row |
| 5 | CTL, LTL | $\mathbf{AGF}p = \mathbf{AGAF}p$ | p holds infinitely often | infinite path (lasso) on which p occurs only finitely often |
| 6 | CTL, LTL | $\mathbf{AG}(p \rightarrow \mathbf{F}q) = \mathbf{AG}(p \rightarrow \mathbf{AF}q)$ | every p is eventually followed by q | finite path leading to p , but no q now nor on the infinite path (lasso) afterwards |
| 7 | CTL, (boolean combination of) LTL | $(\mathbf{AGF}p) \wedge \mathbf{EF}\neg p$ | both 3 and 5 hold | either counterexample for $\mathbf{AGF}p$ or for $\mathbf{EF}\neg p$ |
| 8 | CTL only | $\mathbf{AGEX}p$ | reachability of p in one step is an invariant | finite path leading to a state whose successors all have $\neg p$ |
| 9 | CTL only | $\mathbf{AG}(p \vee \mathbf{AXAG}q \vee \mathbf{AXAG}\neg q)$ | once p does not hold, either q or $\neg q$ become invariant in one step | finite path leading to $\neg p$ from which two finite extensions reach q and $\neg q$ |
| 10 | LTL only | $\mathbf{AFG}p$ | p must eventually become an invariant | infinite path (lasso) on which $\neg p$ occurs infinitely often |
| 11 | LTL only | $\mathbf{A}(\mathbf{GF}p \rightarrow \mathbf{GF}q)$ | if p holds infinitely often, so does q | infinite path (lasso) on which p occurs infinitely often, but q does not |