

MR3145059 [03B40](#) [68N18](#) [68Q05](#) [68Q55](#)

Carraro, A. [[Carraro, Alberto](#)] (F-PARIS7-PPS);

Salibra, A. [[Salibra, Antonino](#)] (I-VE NE-AIS)

Ordered models of the lambda calculus. (English summary)

Log. Methods Comput. Sci. **9** (2013), no. 4, 4:21, 29 pp.

The introduction of this paper is a masterful overview of ordered lambda models and related problems. The technical contribution is also outstanding. Among other results, a question asked by Honsell and Plotkin in 2009 is answered.

The authors show their ability to solve deep problems and to tailor proof techniques to their needs at will.

Mariangiola Dezani-Ciancaglini

References

1. H.P. Barendregt, *The lambda calculus: Its syntax and semantics*, North-Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, 1984. [MR0774952](#)
2. O. Bastonero and X. Gouy, Strong stability and the incompleteness of stable models of λ -calculus. *Annals of Pure and Applied Logic*, 100:247–277, 1999. [MR1711984](#)
3. W. Bentz, Topological implications in varieties, *Algebra Universalis*, 42:9–16, 1999. [MR1736338](#)
4. A. Berarducci A., Infinite lambda-calculus and nonsensible models, Logic and Algebra, Lecture Notes in Pure and Applied Mathematics, Marcel Dekker Inc., 339–378, 1996. [MR1404948](#)
5. C. Berline. From computation to foundations via functions and application: The λ -calculus and its webbed models. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 249:81–161, 2000. [MR1791954](#)
6. C. Berline. Graph models of λ -calculus at work, and variations. *Math. Struct. in Comp. Science*, 16:185–221, 2006. [MR2228853](#)
7. C. Berline and A. Salibra. Easiness in graph models, *Theoretical Computer Science* 354:4–23, 2006. [MR2207939](#)
8. G. Berry. Stable models of typed lambda-calculi. In *Proc. 5th Int. Coll. on Automata, Languages and Programming*, LNCS 62, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1978. [MR0520840](#)
9. G. Birkhoff. On the structure of abstract algebras. *Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc.*, 31:433–454, 1935.
10. A. Bucciarelli and T. Ehrhard. Sequentiality and strong stability. *Sixth Annual IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science*, IEEE Computer Society Press, 138–145, 1991.
11. S. Burris and H.P. Sankappanavar, *A course in universal algebra*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1981. [MR0648287](#)
12. A. Church. A set of postulates for the foundation of logic. *Annals of Math.*, 2:346–366, 1933. [MR1503059](#)
13. A. Church. *The calculi of lambda conversion*. Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1941. [MR0005274](#)
14. J.P. Coleman, Separation in topological algebras, *Algebra Universalis*, 35:72–84, 1996. [MR1360532](#)
15. J.P. Coleman, Topological equivalents to n -permutability, *Algebra Universalis*, 38:200–209, 1997. [MR1609039](#)

16. H.B. Curry and R. Feys. *Combinatory logic*, Vol. I. North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1958. [MR0094298](#)
17. J. Duda J., On two schemes applied to Mal'cev type theorems, *Ann. Univ. Sci. Budapest*, Section Math. 26:39–45, 1983. [MR0719774](#)
18. J. Hagemann, Mal'cev conditions for algebraic relations and on regular and weakly regular congruences, Preprint Nr. 75, Darmstadt, 1973.
19. J. Hagemann and A. Mitschke, On n -permutable congruences, *Algebra Universalis*, 3:8–12, 1973. [MR0330010](#)
20. F. Honsell and G.D. Plotkin, On the completeness of order-theoretic models of the λ -calculus, *Information and Computation*, 207(5):583–594, 2009. [MR2514959](#)
21. F. Honsell and S. Ronchi della Rocca, An approximation theorem for topological λ -models and the topological incompleteness of λ -calculus, *Journal Computer and System Science*, 45:49–75, 1992. [MR1170917](#)
22. G. Jacopini, A condition for identifying two elements of whatever model of combinatory logic, in " *Lambda Calculus and Computer Science*" (C. Böhm, Ed.), Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 213–219, 1975. [MR0462922](#)
23. K. Kearnes and L. Sequeira, Hausdorff properties of topological algebras, *Algebra Universalis*, 47:343–366, 2002. [MR1923074](#)
24. R. Kerth. *Isomorphisme et équivalence équationnelle entre modèles du λ -calcul*. Thèse, Université de Paris 7, 1995.
25. R. Kerth. On the construction of stable models of λ -calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 269:23–46, 2001. [MR1862408](#)
26. J. Krivine, *Lambda-calcul types et modèles*, Masson, 1990. [MR1162977](#)
27. J. Kuper, On the Jacopini technique, *Information and Computation*, 138:101–123, 1997. [MR1479318](#)
28. S. Lusin and A. Salibra, The lattice of lambda theories, *Journal of Logic and Computation*, 14:373–394, 2004. [MR2068680](#)
29. G. Manzonetto and A. Salibra, Applying universal algebra to lambda calculus, *Journal of Logic and Computation*, 20(4):877–915, 2010. [MR2670239](#)
30. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: representation theorems. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 140:5–52, 1995. [MR1321662](#)
31. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: coordinatizing models of lambda calculus. *Fundam. Inf.*, 33(2):149–200, 1998. [MR1654292](#)
32. G.D. Plotkin. Set-theoretical and other elementary models of the λ -calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 121:351–409, 1993. [MR1249549](#)
33. G.D. Plotkin, On a question of H. Friedman, *Information and Computation*, 126:74–77, 1996. [MR1389375](#)
34. A. Salibra. On the algebraic models of lambda calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 249:197–240, 2000. [MR1791956](#)
35. A. Salibra, Topological incompleteness and order incompleteness of the lambda calculus, *ACM TOCL*, 4(3):379–401, 2003. [MR1995005](#)
36. M. Schönfinkel, Über die Bausteine der mathematischen Logik. *Math. Ann.*, 92:305–316, 1924. [MR1512218](#)
37. D.S. Scott. Models for the λ -calculus. Manuscript (unpublished), 53pp., 1969. In *Toposes, Algebraic geometry and Logic*. LNM 274, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1972. [MR0404073](#)
38. D.S. Scott. Continuous lattices. In *Toposes, Algebraic geometry and Logic*. LNM 274, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1972. [MR0404073](#)
39. D.S. Scott. Data types as lattices. *SIAM J. Comput.*, 5: 522–587, 1976. [MR0437330](#)
40. D.S. Scott, Lambda calculus: some models, some philosophy, *The Kleene Symposium*, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1980. [MR0591884](#)

- 41. P. Selinger, The lambda calculus is algebraic, *The Journal of Functional Programming*, 12(6):549–566, 2002. [MR1941293](#)
- 42. P. Selinger, Order-incompleteness and finite lambda reduction models, *Theoretical Computer Science*, 309:43–63, 2003. [MR2016524](#)
- 43. A. Ursini, On subtractive varieties, I, *Algebra Universalis*, 31(2):204–222, 1994. [MR1259350](#)
- 44. A. Visser, Numerations, λ -calculus and arithmetic. In: (J.R. Hindley and J.P. Seldin eds.) *To H.B. Curry: Essays on Combinatory Logic, Lambda-Calculus and Formalism*. Academic Press, New York, 259–284, 1980. [MR0592807](#)

*Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as
accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.*

MR873596 (88a:08014) [08B15](#) [03C05](#) [06B15](#)**Lampe, William A.****A property of the lattice of equational theories.***Algebra Universalis* **23** (1986), *no. 1*, 61–69.

Let $L(\Sigma)$ denote the lattice of all equational theories that extend an equational theory Σ . The main result states that the lattice L of all equational theories in a fixed similarity type has the property that for each $c, z \in L$ and any family a_i ($i \in I$) of elements in L , if $a_i \wedge c = z$ for each $i \in I$ and $\bigvee \{a_i : i \in I\} = 1$, then $c = z$. As a corollary it follows that no tight lattice is isomorphic to a lattice $L(\Sigma)$. In particular, the height 2 lattice M_n having n atoms is not isomorphic to an $L(\Sigma)$ for $n \geq 3$. *S. Comer*

MR1257643 (95c:08009) 08B10 08A30 08B05

Lipparini, Paolo

Commutator theory without join-distributivity. (English summary)

Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **346** (1994), no. 1, 177–202.

Commutator theory in varieties satisfying weaker properties than congruence modularity is investigated. The commutator $[\alpha, \beta]$ is defined as the smallest γ such that α centralizes β modulo γ , written as $C(\alpha, \beta; \gamma)$. In general, it is not true that $C(\alpha, \beta; \gamma) \wedge \gamma \leq \gamma' \Rightarrow C(\alpha, \beta; \gamma')$; rather it is shown that this assumption implies left distributivity, i.e. $[\alpha + \beta, \gamma] = [\alpha, \gamma] + [\beta, \gamma]$. Left semidistributivity of the commutator always holds, i.e., $[\alpha_i, \beta] = \delta \Rightarrow [\bigvee \alpha_i, \beta] = \delta$.

A major tool in modular varieties is a difference term $d(x, y, z)$ satisfying $x\alpha y \Rightarrow d(x, y, y) = x[\alpha, \alpha]d(y, y, x)$. Many nonmodular varieties, amongst them inverse semi-groups and all n -permutable varieties, are shown to possess a weak difference term satisfying only $x\alpha y \Rightarrow d(x, y, y)[\alpha, \alpha]x[\alpha, \alpha]d(y, y, x)$. Under the hypothesis of a weak difference term many of the reviewer's permutability results for modular varieties can be obtained, for instance $\alpha + \beta = (\alpha^{(n)} + \beta^{(n)}) \circ \alpha \circ \beta \circ (\alpha^{(n)} + \beta^{(n)})$, from which some useful commutator equations, such as $[\alpha + \gamma, \alpha + \gamma] = \alpha + [\gamma, \gamma]$, follow.

As in the classical case, certain sublattices of congruence lattices reveal clues about the commutator. As an example, if M_3 , the five-element modular nondistributive lattice, is a sublattice of $\text{Con}(A)$, then the commutator of its top element must be below its bottom. Finally, a list is provided of lattices that cannot be sublattices of $\text{Con}(A)$ if A has a weak difference term.

H. Peter Gumm

References

1. S. Burris and H. P. Sankappanavar, *A course in universal algebra*, Graduate Texts in Math., 78, Springer, New York, 1981. [MR0648287](#)
2. A. Day and R. Freese, *A characterization of identities implying congruence modularity*. I, *Canad. J. Math.* **32** (1980), 1149–1167. [MR0596102](#)
3. A. Day and H. P. Gumm, *Some characterizations of the commutator*, *Algebra Universalis* **29** (1992), 61–78. [MR1145556](#)
4. R. Freese, W. A. Lampe, and W. Taylor, *Congruence lattices of algebras of fixed similarity type*. I, *Pacific J. Math.* **82** (1979), 59–68. [MR0549832](#)
5. R. Freese and R. McKenzie, *Commutator theory for congruence modular varieties*, London Math. Soc. Lecture Notes No. 125, London Math. Soc., 1987. [MR0909290](#)
6. R. Freese and J. B. Nation, *Congruence lattices of semilattices*, *Pacific J. Math.* **49** (1973), 51–58. [MR0332590](#)
7. H. P. Gumm, *Geometrical methods in congruence modular algebras*, *Mem. Amer. Math. Soc.* No. 286 (1983). [MR0714648](#)
8. C. Herrmann, *Affine algebras in congruence modular varieties*, *Acta Sci. Math.* (Szeged) **41** (1979), 119–125. [MR0534504](#)
9. J. Hagemann and C. Herrmann, *A concrete ideal multiplication for algebraic systems and its relation to congruence distributivity*, *Arch. Math.* (Basel) **32** (1979), 234–245. [MR0541622](#)
10. D. Hobby and R. McKenzie, *The structure of finite algebras*, *Contemp. Math.*, vol. 76, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, R.I., 1988. [MR0958685](#)

11. B. Jonsson, *Congruence varieties*, Algebra Universalis **10** (1980), 355-394. [MR0564122](#)
12. K. A. Kearnes, *An order-theoretic property of the commutator*, preprint. [MR1250248](#)
13. K. A. Kearnes and R. McKenzie, *Commutator theory for relatively modular quasi-varieties*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **331** (1992), 465-502. [MR1062872](#)
14. E. W. Kiss, *Three remarks on the modular commutator*, Algebra Universalis **29** (1992), 455-476. [MR1201171](#)
15. E. W. Kiss and P. Pröhle, *Problems and results in tame congruence theory. A survey of the '88 Budapest Workshop*, Algebra Universalis **29** (1992), 151-171. [MR1157431](#)
16. P. Lipparini, *n-permutable varieties satisfy nontrivial congruence identities*, Algebra Universalis (to appear). [MR1318980](#)
17. P. Lipparini, *Varieties satisfying some form of the Herrmann Theorem* (in preparation).
18. R. McKenzie, *Some interactions between group theory and the general theory of algebras*, Groups, Canberra 1989 (L. G. Kovacs, ed.), Lecture Notes in Math., vol. 1456, Springer, New York, 1990. [MR1092221](#)
19. R. McKenzie, G. McNulty, and W. Taylor, *Algebras, lattices, varieties*, vol. I, Wadsworth & Brooks/Cole, Monterey, Calif., 1987. [MR0883644](#)
20. M. Petrich, *Inverse semigroups*, Wiley, 1984. [MR0752899](#)
21. R. Quackenbush, *Quasi-affine algebras*, Algebra Universalis **20** (1985), 318-327. [MR0811692](#)
22. J. D. H. Smith, *Mal'cev varieties*, Lecture Notes in Math., vol. 554, Springer, 1976. [MR0432511](#)
23. W. Taylor, *Some applications of the term condition*, Algebra Universalis **14** (1982), 11-24. [MR0634412](#)
24. W. Taylor, *Characterizing Mal'cev conditions*, Algebra Universalis **3** (1973), 351-397. [MR0349537](#)
25. R. Willard, *M_n as 0, 1-sublattice of $\text{Con}(\mathbf{A})$ does not force the term condition*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **104** (1988), 349-356. [MR0962797](#)

Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.

MR1637665 (2000a:08021) 08B05**Lipparini, Paolo (I-ROME2)****A characterization of varieties with a difference term. II. Neutral = meet semi-distributive. (English summary)***Canad. Math. Bull.* **41** (1998), *no. 3*, 318–327.

In congruence modular varieties there is basically only one commutator operation on congruences of algebras, and it has good behavior. There are several ways to extend this commutator beyond modularity, but many desirable properties are lost in the process. A “small” extension, called the TC-commutator, is still very useful in tame congruence theory, but the structure of algebras that are abelian with respect to the TC-commutator can be very complicated. Alternatively, one can use a “big” commutator, the so-called linear commutator, which is more difficult to work with, but which ensures that the algebras that are abelian with respect to this commutator are well-behaved (subalgebras of reducts of modules over a ring). There are various other commutator concepts lying in between these two. A celebrated result of K. A. Kearnes and Á. Szendrei [*Internat. J. Algebra Comput.* **8** (1998), no. 4, 497–531 [MR1663558](#)] states that in varieties satisfying any nontrivial idempotent Mal’tsev condition, the linear commutator coincides with a symmetric version of the TC-commutator (implying some reasonably good behavior).

One of the good properties of the modular commutator is the existence of a so-called difference term that is a generalization of Mal’tsev’s classical term characterizing congruence permutable varieties. In the present paper, the author proves that if a variety admits a weak version of the difference term with respect to the linear commutator, then this variety satisfies an idempotent Mal’tsev condition. From this, using the Kearnes-Szendrei theorem, and his earlier results, he obtains various characterizations of such varieties, in terms of Mal’tsev conditions and congruence identities. This property is also equivalent to the fact that the blocks of abelian congruences are affine.

A variety is called neutral with respect to a commutator if the commutator of any two congruences is their meet. This property implies the existence of a weak difference term, and therefore, by the results above, is independent of the choice of the commutator. Among several equivalent characterizations of neutrality, the author shows that this concept is equivalent to congruence meet-semidistributivity, and also to the property that M_3 does not occur as a sublattice in the congruence lattices of the algebras in the variety. His characterizations extend results of G. Czédli, R. McKenzie and D. Hobby.

{Part I has been reviewed [[MR1411074](#)].}*E. W. Kiss*

MR2068680 (2005g:03017) 03B40 03C05 68N18

Lusin, Stefania (I-VE NE-I); **Salibra, Antonino** (I-VE NE-I)

The lattice of lambda theories. (English summary)

J. Logic Comput. **14** (2004), no. 3, 373–394.

The complete lattice λT of lambda theories consists of sets of equations between (untyped) closed lambda terms, closed under deduction in lambda calculus with free variables, in particular under the rule $M = N \Rightarrow \lambda x.M = \lambda x.N$. The set is ordered by inclusion and the intersection of a set of theories forms their meet and the deductive closure of the union their join. This lattice λT has been studied in the signature $\langle L, +, \cdot, 0, 1 \rangle$, where $+$, \cdot , 0 , 1 stand for join, intersection, the least and largest element, respectively. The relation $\mathcal{S} \subseteq \mathcal{T}$ can be defined by $\mathcal{S} \cdot \mathcal{T} = \mathcal{S}$. Results have been obtained using proof-theory (there is an element \mathcal{H} , equating all unsolvables, with a unique maximal extension \mathcal{H}^* properly below the top 1), notions of reduction (there are 2^{\aleph_0} elements T with $\mathcal{H}^* \subseteq T \subseteq \mathcal{H}^*$), model-theory (\mathcal{H}^* was discovered as the theory of Scott's D_∞ models of untyped lambda calculus) and even recursion-theory (λT is a dense ordering); these results are due to various authors [see H. P. Barendregt, *The lambda calculus*, Revised edition, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1984; [MR0774952](#)]. The present paper studies λT using methods from universal algebra.

Lambda theories are not usual first-order equational algebraic theories. The reason is that there is an operator ' λx ' having a binding effect on the expression following it. For this reason one has studied lambda abstraction algebras [see A. Salibra, *Theoret. Comput. Sci.* **249** (2000), no. 1, 197–240; [MR1791956](#)], in which these ' λx ' belong to the algebraic signature and one axiomatizes the binding effect. This ensures that methods of universal algebra are applicable to λT .

The results of the paper are the following. 1. There are quasi-identities, i.e. statements of the form $E_1 \ \& \ \dots \ \& \ E_n \rightarrow E$, with the E_1, \dots, E_n, E all equations, that hold in λT , but not in arbitrary complete lattices. An example is $\mathcal{S} + \mathcal{T} = 1 \ \& \ \mathcal{S}\mathcal{G} = \mathcal{T}\mathcal{G} \rightarrow \mathcal{G} \subseteq \mathcal{S}$. 2. If an identity fails in some complete lattice, then it also fails in λT^+ , where one has added to the set of lambda terms a finite set of constants. 3. There exists a $\mathcal{J} \in \lambda T$ such that the sublattice $[\mathcal{J}] = \{\mathcal{T} \in \lambda T \mid \mathcal{J} \subseteq \mathcal{T}\}$ satisfies $\mathcal{S}\mathcal{T} = \mathcal{S}\mathcal{G} \rightarrow \mathcal{S}\mathcal{T} = \mathcal{S}(\mathcal{T} + \mathcal{G})$. This theory \mathcal{J} is axiomatized by (here $\Omega \equiv (\lambda a.aa)(\lambda a.aa)$ is the standard unsolvable term)

$$\Omega xx = x, \ \Omega xy = \Omega yx, \ \Omega x(\Omega yz) = \Omega(\Omega xy)z,$$

and is proved consistent by constructing a filter model using intersection types [see M. Coppo et al., in *Logic colloquium '82 (Florence, 1982)*, 241–262, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1984; [MR0762113](#)].

Henk Barendregt

References

1. S. Abramsky. Domain theory in logical form. *Annals of Pure and Applied Logic*, **51**, 1–77, 1991. [MR1100496](#)
2. F. Alessi, M. Dezani-Ciancaglini, and F. Honsell. *Filter Models and Easy Terms*, volume 2202 of *Lecture Notes in Mathematics*, pp. 17–37. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 2001. [MR1915405](#)
3. F. Barbanera, M. Dezani, and U. de' Liguoro. Intersection and union types: syntax and semantics. *Information and Computation*, **119**, 202–230, 1995. [MR1334464](#)

4. H. P. Barendregt. *The Lambda Calculus: Its Syntax and Semantics*, Revised edition, Studies in Logic and the Foundations of Mathematics **103**, North-Holland, Amsterdam 1985. [MR0774952](#)
5. H. P. Barendregt, M. Coppo, and M. Dezani-Ciancaglini. A filter lambda model and the completeness of type assignment. *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, **48**, 931–940, 1984. [MR0727784](#)
6. C. Berline. From computation to foundations via functions and application: The λ -calculus and its webbed models. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **249**, 81–161, 2000. [MR1791954](#)
7. M. Coppo, M. Dezani-Ciancaglini, F. Honsell, and G. Longo. Extended type structures and filter lambda models, Logic colloquium '82, Florence, 1982, pp. 241–262. North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1984. [MR0762113](#)
8. H. B. Curry and R. Feys. *Combinatory Logic*, Vol. I, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1958. [MR0094298](#)
9. R. Freese and R. McKenzie. *Commutator Theory for Congruence Modular Varieties*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1987. [MR0909290](#)
10. H. P. Gumm. Geometrical methods in congruence modular algebras. *Memoirs of the American Mathematical Society*, No. 286, **45**, 1983. [MR0714648](#)
11. J. Hagemann and C. Herrmann. A concrete ideal multiplication for algebraic systems and its relation to congruence distributivity. *Archiv der Mathematik*, **32**, 234–245, 1979. [MR0541622](#)
12. R. Hindley and G. Longo. Lambda-calculus models and extensionality. *Zeitschrift für Mathematische Logik und Grundlagen der Mathematik*, **26**, 289–310, 1980. [MR0582407](#)
13. K. Kearnes and A. Szendrei. The relationship between two commutators. *International Journal of Algebra and Computation*, **8**, 497–531, 1998. [MR1663558](#)
14. W. A. Lampe. Further properties of lattices of equational theories. *Algebra Universalis*, **28**, 459–486, 1991. [MR1128384](#)
15. P. Lipparini. Commutator theory without join-distributivity. *Transactions of the American Mathematical Society*, **346** 177–202, 1994. [MR1257643](#)
16. P. Lipparini. A characterization of varieties with a difference term, II: neutral = meet semidistributivity. *Canadian Mathematics Bulletin*, **41**, 318–327, 1998. [MR1637665](#)
17. R. N. McKenzie, G. F. McNulty and W. F. Taylor. *Algebras, Lattices, Varieties, Volume I*, Wadsworth Brooks, Monterey, CA, 1987. [MR0883644](#)
18. A. R. Meyer. What is a model of the lambda calculus? *Information and Control*, **52**, 87–122, 1982. [MR0693998](#)
19. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. An introduction to lambda abstraction algebras, IX Simposio Latinoamericano de Logica Matematica **38**, 1993, Notas de Logica Matematica Universidad Nacional del Sur, Bahia Blanca, Argentina, pp. 93–112. [MR1332525](#)
20. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: representation theorems. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **140**, 5–52, 1995. [MR1321662](#)
21. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: coordinatizing models of lambda calculus. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **33**, 149–200, 1998. [MR1654292](#)
22. A. F. Pixley. Local Malcev condition. *Canadian Mathematics Bulletin*, **15**, 559–568, 1972. [MR0309837](#)
23. A. Salibra. Nonmodularity results for lambda calculus. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **45**, 379–392, 2001. [MR2036324](#)
24. A. Salibra. On the algebraic models of lambda calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **249**, 197–240, 2000. [MR1791956](#)
25. A. Salibra and R. Goldblatt. A finite equational axiomatization of the functional algebras for the lambda calculus. *Information and Computation*, **148**, 71–130, 1999.

[MR1659467](#)

- 26. M. Schönfinkel. Über die bausteine der Mathematischen Logik. *Mathematischen Annalen*, **92**, 305–316, 1924. [English translation in J. van Heijenoort From Frege to Gödel, A Source Book in Mathematical Logic, 1879–1931, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 1967.](#)
- 27. J. D. H. Smith. *Mal'cev varieties*, volume 554 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1976. [MR0432511](#)
- 28. S. Vickers *Topology via logic*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1989. [MR1002193](#)
- 29. A. Visser. Numerations, λ -calculus and arithmetic. In *To H.B. Curry: Essays on Combinatory Logic, Lambda-Calculus and Formalism*, J. R. Hindley and J. P. Seldin, eds, pp. 259–284. Academic Press, New York, 1980. [MR0592807](#)

Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.

MR2670239 (2011k:03035) 03B40 06E25 08A70**Manzonetto, Giulio** (F-PARIS7-PPS); **Salibra, Antonino** (I-VE NE2-C)**Applying universal algebra to lambda calculus.** (English summary)*J. Logic Comput.* **20** (2010), no. 4, 877–915.

This important paper provides a detailed survey of recent work on λ calculus using universal algebra. Also, it shows that λ calculus and combinatory logic satisfy some unexpected algebraic properties. The Stone representation theorem is generalised to combinatory and λ abstraction algebras, showing that every such algebra can be decomposed as a weak product of indecomposable algebras. The semantics of λ calculus, in terms of directly indecomposable λ models, is shown to include all the main models, but is still incomplete. It follows from this that the continuous stable and strongly stable semantics are incomplete. Twenty-six open questions are discussed. *Martin W. Bunder*

References

1. J. Baeten and B. Boerboom. Omega can be anything it should not be. *Indagationes Mathematicae*, **41**, 111–120, 1979. [MR0535560](#)
2. H. P. Barendregt. *Some Extensional Term Models for Combinatory Logics and λ -Calculi*, Dissertation, University of Utrecht, Holland, 1971.
3. H. P. Barendregt. *The Lambda Calculus: Its Syntax and Semantics*. North-Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, 1984. [MR0774952](#)
4. H. P. Barendregt, M. Coppo and M. Dezani-Ciancaglini. A filter lambda model and the completeness of type assignment. *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, **48**, 931–940, 1984. [MR0727784](#)
5. O. Bastonero and X. Gouy. Strong stability and the incompleteness of stable models of λ -calculus. *Annals of Pure and Applied Logic*, **100**, 247–277, 1999. [MR1711984](#)
6. A. Berarducci. Infinite λ -calculus and non-sensible models. In *Logic and Algebra*, P. Agliano, A. Ursini, eds. Marcel-Dekker, New York, 1996. [MR1404948](#)
7. C. Berline. From computation to foundations via functions and application: The λ -calculus and its webbed models. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **249**, 81–161, 2000. [MR1791954](#)
8. C. Berline. Graph models of λ -calculus at work, and variations. *Mathematical Structures in Computer Science*, **16**, 185–221, 2006. [MR2228853](#)
9. C. Berline and A. Salibra. Easiness in graph models. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **354**, 4–23, 2006. [MR2207939](#)
10. C. Berline, G. Manzonetto and A. Salibra. Lambda theories of effective lambda models. In *Proceedings of 16th EACSL Annual Conference on Computer Science and Logic* (CSL'07), Vol. 4646 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 268–282. Springer-Verlag, 2007. [MR2540207](#)
11. G. Berry. Stable models of typed lambda-calculi. In *Proceedings 5th International Colloquium on Automata, Languages and Programming*, Vol. 62 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*. Springer, Berlin, 1978. [MR0520840](#)
12. D. Bigelow and S. Burris. Boolean algebras of factor congruences. *Acta Scientiarum Mathematicarum*, **54**, 11–20, 1990. [MR1073415](#)
13. G. Birkhoff. On the structure of abstract algebras. *Proceedings of Cambridge Philosophical Society*, **31**, 433–454, 1935.

14. C. Böhm. *Alcune proprietà delle forme $\beta - \eta$ -normali nel $\lambda - K$ -calcolo*. Pubblicazioni dell'Istituto per le Applicazioni del Calcolo n. 696, Roma, 1968.
15. A. Bucciarelli and T. Ehrhard. Sequentiality and strong stability. *Sixth Annual IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science*, pp. 138–145. *IEEE Computer Society Press*, 1991.
16. A. Bucciarelli and A. Salibra. The minimal graph model of lambda calculus. In *28th International Symposium on Mathematical Foundations of Computer Science*, Vol. 2747 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*. Springer, 2003. [MR2081580](#)
17. A. Bucciarelli and A. Salibra. The sensible graph theories of lambda calculus. In *19th Annual IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science (LICS 2004)*. IEEE Computer Society Press, 2004.
18. A. Bucciarelli and A. Salibra. Graph lambda theories. *Mathematical Structures in Computer Science*, **18**, 975–1004, 2008. [MR2457572](#)
19. A. Church. A set of postulates for the foundation of logic. *Annals of Mathematics*, **2**, 346–366, 1933. [MR1503059](#)
20. A. Church. *The Calculi of Lambda Conversion*. Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1941. [MR0005274](#)
21. S. Burris and H. P. Sankappanavar. *A Course in Universal Algebra*. Springer, Berlin, 1981. [MR0648287](#)
22. S. Burris and H. Werner. Sheaf constructions and their elementary properties. *Transactions of America Mathematical Society*, **248**, 269–309, 1979. [MR0522263](#)
23. S. Comer. Representations by algebras of sections over boolean spaces. *Pacific Journal of Mathematics*, **38**, 29–38, 1971. [MR0304277](#)
24. M. Coppo and M. Dezani. An extension of the basic functionality theory for the λ -calculus. *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic*, **21**, 685–693, 1980. [MR0592528](#)
25. M. Coppo, M. Dezani, F. Honsell and G. Longo. Extended type structures and filter lambda models. *Logic Colloquium'82*, Elsevier Science Publishers, pp. 241–262. 1984. [MR0762113](#)
26. H. B. Curry and R. Feys. *Combinatory Logic*, Vol. I. North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1958. [MR0094298](#)
27. M. Dezani-Ciancaglini, P. Severi and F. J. de Vries. Infinitary lambda calculus and discrimination of berarducci trees. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **298**, 275–302, 2003. [MR1974845](#)
28. P. Di Gianantonio, F. Honsell and G. D. Plotkin. Uncountable limits and the lambda calculus. *Nordic Journal of Computing*, **2**, 126–145, 1995. [MR1346058](#)
29. V. Diercks, M. Ern  and J. Reinhold. Complements in lattices of varieties and equational theories. *Algebra Universalis*, **31**, 506–515, 1994. [MR1274069](#)
30. E. Engeler. Algebras and combinators. *Algebra Universalis*, **13**, 389–392, 1981. [MR0631731](#)
31. R. Freese and R. McKenzie. *Commutator Theory for Congruence Modular Varieties*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1987. [MR0909290](#)
32. H. P. Gumm. *Geometrical Methods in Congruence Modular Algebras*, Memoirs of the American Mathematical Society, 1983. [MR0714648](#)
33. J. Hagemann and C. Herrmann. A concrete ideal multiplication for algebraic systems and its relation to congruence distributivity, *Archives of Mathematics*, **32**, 234–245, 1979. [MR0541622](#)
34. K. H. Hofmann and M. W. Mislove. All compact Hausdorff lambda models are degenerate. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **22**, 23–52, 1995. [MR1322584](#)
35. F. Honsell and S. Ronchi Della Rocca. An approximation theorem for topological lambda models and the topological incompleteness of lambda calculus. *Journal of Computer and System Sciences*, **45**, 49–75, 1992. [MR1170917](#)

36. P. T. Johnstone. *Stone Spaces*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1982. [MR0698074](#)
37. K. Kearnes and A. Szendrei. The relationship between two commutators. *International Journal of Algebra and Computation*, **8**, 497–531, 1998. [MR1663558](#)
38. J. R. Kennaway, J. W. Klop, M. R. Sleep and F. J. de Vries. Infinitary lambda calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **175**, 93–125, 1997. [MR1449433](#)
39. R. Kerth. *Isomorphisme Et Équivalence Équationnelle Entre Modèles du λ -calcul*. Thèse, Université de Paris 7, Paris, 1995.
40. R. Kerth. Isomorphism and equational equivalence of continuous lambda models. *Studia Logica*, **61**, 403–415, 1998. [MR1657121](#)
41. R. Kerth. On the construction of stable models of λ -calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **269**, 23–46, 2001. [MR1862408](#)
42. J. L. Krivine. *Lambda-calcul, types et modles*. tudes et Recherches en Informatique, Masson, pp. viii+176. Paris, 1990. [MR1162977](#)
43. W. A. Lampe. A property of the lattice of equational theories. *Algebra Universalis*, **23**, 61–69, 1986. [MR0873596](#)
44. P. Lipparini. Commutator theory without join-distributivity. *Transactions of the American Mathematical Society*, **346**, 177–202, 1994. [MR1257643](#)
45. P. Lipparini. A characterization of varieties with a difference term, II: neutral = meet semidistributivity. *Canadian Mathematics Bulletin*, **41**, 318–327, 1998. [MR1637665](#)
46. S. Lusin and A. Salibra. The lattice of lambda theories. *Journal of Logic and Computation*, **14**, 373–394, 2004. [MR2068680](#)
47. G. Manzonetto and A. Salibra. Boolean algebras for lambda calculus. In *21th Annual IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science (LICS 2006)*. IEEE Computer Society Press, 2006.
48. G. Manzonetto and A. Salibra. From lambda calculus to universal algebra and back. In *33rd International Symposium on Mathematical Foundations of Computer Science, Lecture Notes in Computer Science*. Springer, 2008. [MR2539394](#)
49. R. N. McKenzie, G. F. McNulty and W. F. Taylor. *Algebras, Lattices, Varieties, Volume I*. Wadsworth Brooks, Monterey, California, 1987. [MR0883644](#)
50. A. R. Meyer. What is a model of the lambda calculus? *Information and Control*, **52**, 87–122, 1982. [MR0693998](#)
51. M. W. Mislove. Topology, domain theory and theoretical computer science. *Topology and its Applications*, **89**, 3–59, 1998. [MR1641441](#)
52. R. S. Pierce. Modules over commutative regular rings. *Memoirs of the American Mathematical Society*, Vol. 70 American Mathematical Society, Providence, p. 112, R.I, 1967. [MR0217056](#)
53. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. An introduction to lambda abstraction algebras. IX Simposio Latinoamericano de Logica Matematica. *Notas de Logica Matematica*, vol. 38 Bahia Blanca, Argentina, 1993, pp. 93–111. [MR1332525](#)
54. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: representation theorems. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **140**, 5–52, 1995. [MR1321662](#)
55. D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Lambda abstraction algebras: coordinatizing models of lambda calculus. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **33**, 149–200, 1998. [MR1654292](#)
56. G. D. Plotkin. Set-theoretical and other elementary models of the λ -calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **121**, 351–409, 1993. [MR1249549](#)
57. A. Salibra and R. Goldblatt. A finite equational axiomatization of the functional algebras for the lambda calculus, *Information and Computation*, **148**, 71–130, 1999. [MR1659467](#)
58. A. Salibra. On the algebraic models of lambda calculus. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **249**, 197–240, 2000. [MR1791956](#)

59. A. Salibra. Nonmodularity results for lambda calculus. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **45**, 379–392, 2001. [MR2036324](#)
60. A. Salibra. A continuum of theories of lambda calculus without semantics. In *16th Annual IEEE Symposium on Logic in Computer Science (LICS 2001)*, pp. 334–343. IEEE Computer Society Press, 2001.
61. A. Salibra. Topological incompleteness and order incompleteness of the lambda calculus (LICS’01 Special Issue). *ACM Transactions on Computational Logic*, **4**, 379–401, 2003. [MR1995005](#)
62. D. S. Scott. Models for the λ -calculus. 53pp., 1969. In *Toposes, Algebraic Geometry and Logic*. Vol. 274 of *Lecture Notes in Mathematics*. Springer, Berlin, 1972. [MR0404073](#)
63. D. S. Scott. Continuous lattices. In *Toposes, Algebraic Geometry and Logic*. Vol. 274 of *Lecture Notes in Mathematics*. Springer, Berlin, 1972. [MR0404073](#)
64. D. S. Scott. Data types as lattices. *SIAM Journal of Computation*, **5**, 522–587, 1976. [MR0437330](#)
65. D. S. Scott. *Lambda calculus: some models, some philosophy*. The Kleene Symposium, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1980. [MR0591884](#)
66. P. Selinger. Order-incompleteness and finite lambda reduction models. *Theoretical Computer Science*, **309**, 43–63, 2003. [MR2016524](#)
67. M. Schönfinkel. Über die Bausteine der mathematischen Logik. *Mathematische Annalen*, **92**, 305–316, 1924. [MR1512218](#)
68. J. D. H. Smith. *Mal’cev varieties*, Vol. 554 of *Lecture Notes in Mathematics*. Springer, Berlin, 1976. [MR0432511](#)
69. R. Statman. Marginalia to a Theorem of Jacopini. *Fundamenta Informaticae*, **45**, 117–121, 2001. [MR1852530](#)
70. D. Vaggione. \mathcal{V} with factorable congruences and $\mathcal{V} = I\Gamma^a(\mathcal{V}_{DI})$ imply \mathcal{V} is a discriminator variety. *Acta Scientiarum Mathematicarum*, **62**, 359–368, 1996. [MR1430858](#)
71. D. Vaggione. Varieties in which the Pierce stalks are directly indecomposable. *Journal of Algebra*, **184**, 424–434, 1996. [MR1409222](#)
72. A. Visser. Numerations, λ -calculus and arithmetic. In *To H.B. Curry: Essays on Combinatory Logic, Lambda-Calculus and Formalism*, J. R. Hindley and J. P. Seldin eds, pp. 259–284. Academic Press, New York, 1980. [MR0592807](#)

Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as
accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.

MR1654292 (2000b:03050) [03B40](#) [03G25](#)**Pigozzi, Don** [[Pigozzi, Don L.](#)] ([1-IASU](#)); **Salibra, Antonino** ([I-VE NE-AM](#))**Lambda abstraction algebras: coordinatizing models of Lambda calculus.****(English summary)***Fund. Inform.* **33** (1998), *no. 2*, 149–200.

Lambda abstraction algebras algebraize the untyped lambda calculus just as combinatory algebras do combinatory logic. Both these classes of algebras form a variety in the sense of universal algebra. This paper derives connections between lambda abstraction algebras, subclasses of these that are “functional”, “locally finite” and “rich”, and combinatory algebras, lambda algebras and lambda models.

The main result of the paper is a stronger version of the functional representation theorem for locally finite lambda abstraction algebras, the algebraic analogue of the completeness theorem of lambda calculus.

Martin W. Bunder

MR1321662 (96b:68123) 68Q65 03B40 03G25**Pigozzi, Don** [[Pigozzi, Don L.](#)] (1-IASU); **Salibra, Antonino** (I-VE NE-AM)**Lambda abstraction algebras: representation theorems.** (English summary)

Selected papers of AMAST '93 (Enschede, 1993).

Theoret. Comput. Sci. **140** (1995), *no.* 1, 5–52.

Summary: “Lambda abstraction algebras (LAAs) are designed to algebraize the untyped lambda calculus in the same way cylindric and polyadic algebras algebraize the first-order predicate logic. Like combinatory algebras they can be defined by true identities and thus form a variety in the sense of universal algebra, but they differ from combinatory algebras in several important respects. The most natural LAAs are obtained by coordinatizing environment models of the lambda calculus. This gives rise to two classes of LAAs of functions of finite arity: functional LAAs (FLA) and point-relativized functional LAAs (RFA). It is shown that RFA is a variety and is the smallest variety including FLA.

“Dimension-complemented LAAs constitute the widest class of LAAs that can be represented as an algebra of functions and are known to have a natural intrinsic characterization. We prove that every dimension-complemented LAA is isomorphic to a member of RFA. This is the crucial step in showing that RFA is a variety.”

{For the collection containing this paper see [MR1321661](#)}

Martin W. Bunder

MR1659467 (2000b:03051) 03B40 68N18**Salibra, Antonino** (I-VE NE-I);**Goldblatt, Robert** [**Goldblatt, Robert Ian**] (NZ-VCTR-SMC)**A finite equational axiomatization of the functional algebras for the lambda calculus. (English summary)***Inform. and Comput.* **148** (1999), *no. 1*, 71–130.

The authors use techniques of universal algebra to make an interesting original contribution to the theory of the untyped $\lambda\beta$ -calculus. The main result is an explicit finite axiomatization of the valid equations between contexts. A context is a lambda term with some special variables called “holes”. An equation between contexts is valid if every instance of it obtained by substituting arbitrary lambda terms for the holes, without renaming of bound variables, is provable in the $\lambda\beta$ -calculus. So, for instance, denoting the hole by the Greek letter μ , we have that the equation $\lambda x.x\mu = \lambda y.y\mu$ is not valid, because on substituting the lambda term x for μ we obtain the unprovable equation $\lambda x.xx = \lambda y.yx$. An example of a valid equation, which is one of the proposed axioms, is $(\lambda xy.\xi)((\lambda y.\mu)z) = \lambda y.(\lambda x.\xi)((\lambda y.\mu)z)$, where μ, ξ are the holes, and the variable y is different from x and z . The proof takes place in the framework of the equational axiomatization LAA (lambda abstraction algebras) of the lambda calculus developed by D. Pigozzi and A. Salibra. Solving a problem raised by those authors, it is proved here that every model of LAA is a suitable expansion of a combinatory model of the lambda calculus. This was previously known only for the locally finite models. In the last part of the paper a completeness theorem for the infinite lambda calculus is given.

Alessandro Berarducci

MR2016524 (2004k:03032) 03B40 68N18

Selinger, Peter (3-OTTW-MS)

Order-incompleteness and finite lambda reduction models. (English summary)

Theoret. Comput. Sci. **309** (2003), no. 1-3, 43–63.

Summary: “Many familiar models of the untyped lambda calculus are constructed by order-theoretic methods. This paper provides some basic new facts about ordered models of the lambda calculus. We show that in any partially ordered model that is complete for the theory of β - or $\beta\eta$ -conversion, the partial order is trivial on term denotations. Equivalently, the open and closed term algebras of the untyped lambda calculus cannot be non-trivially partially ordered. Our second result is a syntactical characterization, in terms of so-called generalized Mal’cev operators, of those lambda theories which cannot be induced by any non-trivially partially ordered model. We also consider a notion of finite models for the untyped lambda calculus, or more precisely, finite models of reduction. We demonstrate how such models can be used as practical tools for giving finitary proofs of term inequalities.”

References

1. S. Abramsky, A. Jung, Domain theory, in: S. Abramsky, D.M. Gabbay, T.S.E. Maibaum (Eds.), *Handbook of Logic in Computer Science*, Vol. 3, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1994, pp. 1–168. [MR1365749](#)
2. H.P. Barendregt, *The Lambda Calculus, its Syntax and Semantics*, 2nd Edition, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1984. [MR0774952](#)
3. G. Berry, Stable models of typed λ -calculi, in: *Proc. 5th Internat. Colloq. on Automata, Languages and Programming*, Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Vol. 62, Springer, Berlin, 1978, pp. 72–89. [MR0520840](#)
4. S. Bulman-Fleming, W. Taylor, Union-indecomposable varieties, *Colloq. Math.* **35** (1976) 189–199. [MR0404100](#)
5. P. Di Gianantonio, F. Honsell, S. Liani, G.D. Plotkin, Countable non-determinism and uncountable limits, in: *Proc. CONCUR ’94*, Lecture Notes in Computer Science, Vol. 836, Springer, Berlin, 1994, pp. 130–145. See also: Uncountable limits and the Lambda Calculus, *Nordic J. Comput.* **2**, 1995, pp. 127–146. [MR1322969](#)
6. J.-Y. Girard, The system F of variable types, fifteen years later, *Theoret. Comput. Sci.* **45** (1986) 159–192. [MR0867281](#)
7. J. Hagemann, A. Mitschke, On n -permutable congruences, *Algebra Universalis* **3** (1973) 8–12. [MR0330010](#)
8. F. Honsell, S. Ronchi Della Rocca, An approximation theorem for topological lambda models and the topological incompleteness of lambda calculus, *J. Comput. System Sci.* **45** (1) (1992) 49–75. [MR1170917](#)
9. M. Hyland, A syntactic characterization of the equality in some models for the lambda calculus, *J. London Math. Soc.* **12** (1976) 361–370. [MR0396232](#)
10. B. Jacobs, I. Margaria, M. Zacchi, Filter models with polymorphic types, *Theoret. Comput. Sci.* **95** (1992) 143–158. [MR1157801](#)
11. A.I. Mal’cev, K obščei teorii algebraičeskikh sistem, *Mat. Sb. (N. S.)* **35** (77) (1954) 3–20. [MR0065533](#)
12. G.D. Plotkin, A semantics for static type inference, *Inform. Comput.* **109** (1994)

- 256–299. [MR1269377](#)
13. G.D. Plotkin, On a question of H. Friedman, Inform. Comput. 126 (1) (1996) 74–77. [MR1389375](#)
 14. P. Selinger, Functionality, polymorphism, and concurrency: a mathematical investigation of programming paradigms, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Pennsylvania, 1997. [MR2696204](#)
 15. W. Taylor, Structures incompatible with varieties, Abstract 74T-A224, Notices Amer. Math. Soc. 21 (1974) A-529.
 16. C.P. Wadsworth, The relation between computational and denotational properties for Scott's D_∞ -models of the lambda-calculus, SIAM J. Comput. 5 (1976) 488–521. [MR0505308](#)

Note: This list reflects references listed in the original paper as accurately as possible with no attempt to correct errors.