

0 Question: Is it possible that wages went up from 1950 to 1960, but went down for both men and women? Assume that the proportion of men to women can change. (This is not a historical example.)

A1: Maybe, but it is unclear

A2: Yes

Arguments for A1

1 Question: Can the overall change in wages be expressed as an average of the change in wages for men and the change in wages for women?

A1: Yes

A2: Not always if the weights have to sum to 1 (which is not a standard weighted average)

3 Question: Are both the changes in wages for men and women negative?

A1: Yes

A2: Yes

4 Question: Is it possible for the average of two negative things to be positive?

A1: No

A2: No

Arguments for A2

2 Question: Can we write formulas for the variables in question?

A1: Potentially, although the exact formulas maybe be subject to dispute

A2: Yes

5 Question: If we write formulas for the variables in question, is there an example assignment of variables satisfying the original property?

A1: Possibly

A2: Yes

7 Question: Meta-debate: Given the questions and answers in this round, which is the better answer to the question?

A1: Maybe, but it is unclear

A2: Yes