

## Kevin v Kevin Three bergs

[Judge View](#) [Tree View](#)

List of Debates

Hide notes

Side: None 

Phase: **Make Argument** Remaining: **10:00**

At root

Q

(H)

Three tubs are brimful with ice-cold water. Each has an iceberg floating in it. In tub A, the berg has a large air bubble. In tub W, the berg has some unfrozen water inside it. In tub M, the berg has a heavy metal rod inside it. What happens to the water level in each of the three tubs when the icebergs melt?

H

A & W stay the same, while the water level of M decreases

D

It's unclear, A/W might decrease depending on the weight of the air. M likely decreases

Notes

I'm wondering here how this works with the "lemma" structure of building up arguments. Is it more difficult to consider arguments when there are 3 individual things you have to prove? (E.g. if there were a 4-question limit as there was previously)

This is also to get me more familiar with the style of covering broader topics and then drilling down into others.

Q

What happens to A's water level?

H

It stays the same

D

Unclear, it might decrease

9

Payment: ☒ H ☐ D ☐ None

Notes

Wondering if it's a better strategy to start with 3 top-level questions to narrow down the disagreement here. I can envision two scenarios:

1. Honest recurses: Picks the one they are most confident defending.
2. Dishonest recurses: Picks the one they are most confident on, but in the process still has to simplify the question down to one berg.

I don't think drawing is a concern here, because H probably will want to pay to recurse.

I also wonder if here H & D would be willing to mutually coordinate to only ask these questions. It seems like D might want to pose other questions to either tempt H or make the debate confusing and lead to a draw?

I feel like on the whole, this round of explicitly breaking down the question is a little strange to me, since it contains no actual arguments.

Q

What happens to W's water level?

H

It stays the same

D

Unclear, it might decrease

10 Payment: 

H

D

None

Recurse

Notes

Q

What happens to M's water level?

H

It decreases

D

Probably decreases

11 Payment: 

H

D

None

Recurse

Notes