0 Question: A bag contains one counter, known to be either white or black with probability 1/2. A white counter is put in, the bag shaken, and a counter drawn out, which proves to be white. What is now the chance of drawing a white counter?

A1: It is unclear | A2: 2/3

Arguments for A1

1 Question: If you put a white counter in and take a white counter out, is the bag unchanged?

A1: Yes | A2: Yes

3 Question: Is the probability of drawing out a white counter at the beginning 1/2?

A1: Yes | A2: Yes

4 Question: Thus does it seem likely that the probability of drawing a white counter at the end is also 1/2?

A1: Yes | A2: It might seem like that to some people, but it is incorrect

6 Question: Should we be uncertain when dealing with probabilities that are complicated?

A1: Yes | A2: Not when we can calculate the answer, as in this problem

Arguments for A2

2 Question: What is the probability that a white counter is drawn the first time?

A1: 3/4 | A2: 3/4

7 Question: What is the probability that a white counter is drawn the first time and the second time?

A1: 1/2 | A2: 1/2

8 Question: Given:
probability that a white counter is drawn the first time = 3/4
probability that a white counter is drawn the first time and the second time = 1/2
What is the probability that a white counter is drawn the second time, given that it is drawn the first time?

A1: It is unclear | A2: 2/3

9 Question: Meta-debate: Given the questions and answers in this round, which is the better answer to the question?

A1: It is unclear | A2: 2/3