Chris:H Mihnea:D Sledge 2

List of Debates   Hide notes   Side: None ⌄   Phase: **Make Argument**   Remaining: **0:23**

At root

0	Q (H)	Someone lies on the floor with an anvil on their chest. Someone else hits the anvil with a sledgehammer. The anvil shields the first person from most of the sledgehammer's: a) momentum b) kinetic energy c) both d) neither

H We should interpret "shields from most of X" to mean, "prevents the transmission of the sledgehammer's quantity of X, or less, into the person", and the answer is then B, kinetic energy.

D We should interpret "shields from" to mean "prevents damage from" and the answer is then a) momentum

Notes _____

Q Is momentum communicated to the person through the anvil?

H Yes (97%)

D Yes, but it does no damage because the anvil is there (95%)

2 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ Recurse

Notes _____

Q Is kinetic energy communicated to the person through the anvil?

H No (93%)

D No (99%)

3 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ Recurse

Notes _____

Q Is the important aspect of this scenario that the person doesn't get hurt, as a result of having this anvil on them?

H Yes, or at least it seems like this is the intention of the question, although it's not clear that the person would be damaged even if kinetic energy was communicated, since what matters for "damage" is really pressure (force divided by area) (92%)

D Yes, probability 90%

1 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ Recurse

Notes _____

Q If the important aspect of this scenario is that the person doesn't get hurt, does this suggest we should interpret "shields from" to mean "prevents damage from"?

Q Does "the anvil shields the person from most of X" mean "the X (kinetic energy or momentum) never makes it to the human from the anvil"?

H Yes (85%) **D** No (80%)

4 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ [Recurse]

Notes [   ] ⁄⁄

H It would be better to interpret it as the communication of each quantity into the person, since none of these would necessarily cause damage in any case. (83%)

D Yes, probability 95%

5 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ [Recurse]

Notes [   ] ⁄⁄

Q Would the momentum of the sledgehammer hurt the person if there was no anvil, but it does not hurt them given the anvil is there?

H [   ] **D** Yes (95%)

6 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ [Recurse]

Notes [   ] ⁄⁄

Q Would the kinetic energy of the sledgehammer hurt the person if there was no anvil?

H [   ] **D** No, the body can absorb a lot of energy via an increase in its heat (85%)

7 Payment: H ○ D ○ None ◉ [Recurse]

Notes [   ] ⁄⁄

Q Meta-debate: Given the questions and answers in this round, which is the better answer to the question?

H We should interpret "shields from most of X" to mean, "prevents the transmission of the sledgehammer's quantity of X, or less, into the person", and the answer is then B, kinetic energy.

D We should interpret "shields from" to mean "prevents damage from" and the answer is then a) momentum

8 Payment: H ◯ D ◯ None ◉ [Recurse]

Notes [   ]