

# Acid rain mitigation experiment shifts a forested watershed from a net sink to a net source of nitrogen

Emma J. Rosi-Marshall<sup>a,1,2</sup>, Emily S. Bernhardt<sup>b,1</sup>, Donald C. Buso<sup>a</sup>, Charles T. Driscoll<sup>c</sup>, and Gene E. Likens<sup>a,d,2</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies, Millbrook, NY 12545; <sup>b</sup>Department of Biology, Duke University, Durham, NC 27708; <sup>c</sup>Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY 13244; and <sup>d</sup>Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Connecticut, Storrs, CT 06268

Contributed by Gene E. Likens, May 13, 2016 (sent for review October 18, 2015; reviewed by Kevin Bishop, Ryan Sponseller, and Peter M. Vitousek)

Decades of acid rain have acidified forest soils and freshwaters throughout montane forests of the northeastern United States; the resulting loss of soil base cations is hypothesized to be responsible for limiting rates of forest growth throughout the region. In 1999, an experiment was conducted that reversed the long-term trend of soil base cation depletion and tested the hypothesis that calcium limits forest growth in acidified soils. Researchers added 1,189 kg Ca<sup>2+</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup> as the pelletized mineral wollastonite (CaSiO<sub>3</sub>) to a 12-ha forested watershed within the Hubbard Brook Experimental Forest in the White Mountains of New Hampshire. Significant increases in the pH and acid-neutralizing capacity of soils and streamwater resulted, and the predicted increase in forest growth occurred. An unanticipated consequence of this acidification mitigation experiment began to emerge a decade later, with marked increases in dissolved inorganic nitrogen (DIN) exports in streamwater from the treated watershed. By 2013, 30-times greater DIN was exported from this base-treated watershed than from adjacent reference watersheds, and DIN exports resulting from this experiment match or exceed earlier reports of inorganic N losses after severe ice-storm damage within the study watershed. The discovery that CaSiO<sub>3</sub> enrichment can convert a watershed from a sink to a source of N suggests that numerous potential mechanisms drive watershed N dynamics and provides new insights into the influence of acid deposition mitigation strategies for both carbon cycling and watershed N export.

calcium | acid deposition | nitrate

Decades of acid deposition throughout North America and Europe have resulted in acidified soils and freshwaters in regions with inherently low rates of base cation supply. Acidification of soils and freshwaters impairs the health of sensitive trees and aquatic species, leading to declines in aquatic biodiversity and forest growth (e.g., refs. 1–3). Although clean air regulations have reduced levels of acid deposition below their historic highs, the marked depletion of base cations of affected ecosystems remains a legacy of acid deposition (4–6). In 1999, researchers at the Hubbard Brook Experimental Forest (HBEF) attempted to reverse this trend by adding 1,189 kg Ca<sup>2+</sup> ha<sup>-1</sup> as the pulverized mineral wollastonite (CaSiO<sub>3</sub>) to an entire watershed ecosystem (“Watershed 1” or W1) (7). The goal of this whole-ecosystem experiment was to replace soil calcium that had been lost as a result of elevated leaching since the onset of acid deposition. Researchers predicted that this experiment (adding CaSiO<sub>3</sub>) would increase the soil base saturation, pH, and acid neutralizing capacity (ANC) of soil solution and streamwater, resulting in a sustained increase in forest growth. The experiment also offered the opportunity to test the specific prediction that the addition of soil calcium would lead to enhanced growth of *Acer saccharum* (sugar maple), a canopy dominant with a high calcium requirement that has been declining in relative abundance throughout northeastern forests (1, 8).

Thus far, the experimental results have confirmed all of these initial predictions. The wollastonite addition led to changes in the soils of W1, including increased concentrations of Ca<sup>2+</sup> and H<sub>4</sub>SiO<sub>4</sub> and significant declines in H<sup>+</sup> and dissolved inorganic Al concentrations (9). Soil solution and streamwater pH and ANC increased

significantly after the treatment and have remained above reference conditions (9, 10). Mass balances indicate that soils have been a net sink for the Ca and Si added to the watershed (9, 11), and that only 5% of the added wollastonite was lost via stream export within the first 12 y after treatment (12). Tree biomass, leaf area index, and total evapotranspiration increased after the whole-watershed CaSiO<sub>3</sub> enrichment (13–15). The total leaf area index, foliar Ca, and seed production of existing sugar maple trees responded particularly strongly to the addition of CaSiO<sub>3</sub> (15, 16).

Observations of enhanced forest growth in the CaSiO<sub>3</sub>-treated watershed led to predictions of a “tightening N cycle” (in the sense of ref. 17), whereby trees accumulate N in biomass and prevent its export from the watershed. This prediction arises from three classic tenets of watershed science: Ecosystems with higher primary production tend to retain more limiting nutrients (18, 19); forest biomass should accumulate N when N enrichment increases, until plant demand is saturated (20–22); and undisturbed and unpolluted ecosystems strongly retain inorganic nitrogen (23, 24).

These assumptions have been developed through comparative studies that contrast N dynamics across forests at various successional stages (19, 23, 24) or through vegetation removal experiments (e.g., ref. 25). Experimental manipulations that lead to increased plant growth (as in this CaSiO<sub>3</sub> enrichment experiment) are typically too small in extent to allow watershed-scale nutrient retention studies (e.g., free air CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment experiments) (26). We used watershed mass balance comparisons between the experimental watershed and from adjacent, unmanipulated reference watersheds. We wanted to assess whether CaSiO<sub>3</sub> fertilization has

## Significance

Acid rain has stripped forests of soil calcium, with consequences for forest health and downstream ecosystems. In 1999, researchers initiated a whole-watershed experiment, with the goal of replacing all the calcium lost. This experiment increased the pH and acid-neutralizing capacity of soils and streamwater, and forest growth increased. In 2010, nitrogen export from the treated watershed began to increase, and by 2013, annual inorganic N losses from the experimental watershed were 30-times higher than from the adjacent reference watershed, a proportional increase only seen in whole-watershed clear-cutting experiments. The discovery that calcium enrichment can convert a watershed from a sink to a source of N suggests unforeseen consequences of acid rain mitigation and provides new insights into watershed dynamics.

Author contributions: D.C.B., C.T.D., and G.E.L. designed research; D.C.B., C.T.D., and G.E.L. performed research; E.J.R.-M., E.S.B., D.C.B., and G.E.L. analyzed data; and E.J.R.-M., E.S.B., and G.E.L. wrote the paper.

Reviewers: K.B., Uppsalla Universitet; R.S., Umea University; and P.M.V., Stanford University.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

<sup>1</sup>E.J.R.-M. and E.S.B. contributed equally to this work.

<sup>2</sup>To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: rosimarshall@caryinstitute.org or likensg@caryinstitute.org.

This article contains supporting information online at [www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1607287113/-DCSupplemental](http://www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1607287113/-DCSupplemental).







If enhanced SOM mineralization is the source of excess N, there are sufficient supplies to sustain enhanced watershed N export for more than a century. Ecosystem theory, drawn largely from vegetation removal experiments, provides little guidance to predict the shape, magnitude, and duration of this long-term N loss pathway. The conceptual framework built from vegetation removal experiments must be expanded to adequately explain how a vegetation growth-enhancing experiment can create a persistent source of excess N export with the potential to exceed the losses associated with prior forest clear-cutting experiments. Significant advances in the use of element ratios and isotopic tracers allow modern watershed studies to expand beyond mass balance approaches and provide new opportunities for unraveling these complex biogeochemical dynamics. Ultimately, these approaches will be necessary to build new conceptual and empirical models that can explain how soil acidity and alkalinity affect the sequestration and mineralization of SOM. These findings also illustrate the importance of long-term research, as the unanticipated, high-magnitude effects of an experimental manipulation on ecosystem element cycling took ~10 y to emerge (43).

## Materials and Methods

The watersheds examined are located in the HBEF in the White Mountain National Forest, New Hampshire. Several south-facing watersheds have been gaged, and the export of solutes has been studied since 1963. The forests of

the watersheds are dominated by the hardwood species sugar maple (*Acer saccharum*), American beech (*Fagus grandifolia*), and yellow birch (*Betula alleghaniensis*). In addition, red spruce (*Picea rubens*), balsam fir (*Abies balsamea*), and white birch (*Betula papyrifera*) are common on the ridges of these watersheds. For additional details on these ecosystems, see ref. 5. The procedures used to collect, store, and analyze rain and streamwater samples have been detailed by Buso et al. (44). Here we describe the procedures briefly. Since 1963, streamwater samples have been collected at least weekly from all six south-facing watersheds at HBEF (Table S1). Samples are collected ~10 m upstream of the stream gauges in acid-washed plastic bottles. Historically, samples were not filtered because of the extremely low particulate content of streamwater and the limited effects of storage on solute concentrations (see ref. 39). In 1999, researchers at the HBEF added 1,189 kg/ha<sup>-1</sup> Ca<sup>2+</sup> as the finely ground mineral wollastonite (CaSiO<sub>3</sub>) to an 11.8-ha watershed 1 (W1) in an attempt to restore the soil Ca<sup>2+</sup> depleted by acid deposition. Procedures for determining annual N deposition and N flux have followed the same approach over the long-term record. A detailed description of these methods and the data handling and processing approaches has been published previously (5, 39).

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank the original designers and implementers of the W1 whole-watershed CaSiO<sub>3</sub> addition, Peter Groffman, Gary Lovett, Chris Johnson, John Battles, Lindsey Rustad, Melany Fisk, Tim Fahey, and others whose work contributed to our ability to conduct this analysis; and Peter Groffman and Melany Fisk for providing useful comments on an earlier version of this manuscript. Funding was provided by the National Science Foundation through the Long-Term Research in Environmental Biology and Long-Term Ecological Research programs.

- Tomlinson GH (2003) Acidic deposition, nutrient leaching and forest regrowth. *Biogeochemistry* 65(1):51–81.
- Schindler DW (1988) Effects of acid rain on freshwater ecosystems. *Science* 239(4836):149–157.
- Likens GE, Buso DC (2010) Long-term changes in streamwater chemistry following disturbance in the Hubbard Brook Experimental Forest, USA. *Verh Internat Verein Limnol* 30:1577–1581.
- Likens GE, et al. (1998) The biogeochemistry of calcium at Hubbard Brook. *Biogeochemistry* 41(2):89–173.
- Likens GE (2013) *Biogeochemistry of a Forested Ecosystem* (Springer, New York), 3rd Ed.
- Warby RAF, Johnson CE, Driscoll CT (2009) Continuing acidification of organic soils across the northeastern USA: 1984–2001. *Soil Sci Soc Am J* 73(1):274–284.
- Peters SC, Blum JD, Driscoll CT, Likens GE (2004) Dissolution of wollastonite during the experimental manipulation of Hubbard Brook Watershed 1. *Biogeochemistry* 67(3):309–329.
- Horsley SB, Long RP, Bailey SW, Hallett RA, Hall TJ (2000) Factors associated with the decline disease of sugar maple on the Allegheny Plateau. *Can J For Res* 30(9):1365–1378.
- Cho Y, Driscoll CT, Johnson CE, Blum JD, Fahey TJ (2012) Watershed-level responses to calcium silicate treatment in a northern hardwood forest. *Ecosystems* (N Y) 15(3):416–434.
- Cho Y, Driscoll CT, Blum JD (2009) The effects of a whole-watershed calcium addition on the chemistry of stream storm events at the Hubbard Brook Experimental Forest in NH, USA. *Sci Total Environ* 407(20):5392–5401.
- Johnson CE, Driscoll CT, Blum JD, Fahey TJ, Battles JJ (2014) Soil chemical dynamics after calcium silicate addition to a northern hardwood forest. *Soil Sci Soc Am J* 78(4):1458–1468.
- Shao S, et al. (2016) Long-term responses in soil solution and streamwater chemistry at Hubbard Brook after experimental addition of wollastonite. *Environ Chem* 13(3):528–540.
- Huggett BA, Schaberg PG, Hawley GJ, Eagar C (2007) Long-term calcium addition increases growth release, wound closure, and health of sugar maple (*Acer saccharum*) trees at the Hubbard Brook Experimental Forest. *Can J For Res* 37(9):1692–1700.
- Green MB, et al. (2013) Decreased water flowing from a forest amended with calcium silicate. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 110(15):5999–6003.
- Battles JJ, Fahey TJ, Driscoll CT, Blum JD, Johnson CE (2014) Restoring soil calcium reverses forest decline. *Environ Sci Technol Lett* 1(1):15–19.
- Juice SM, et al. (2006) Response of sugar maple to calcium addition to northern hardwood forest. *Ecology* 87(5):1267–1280.
- Groffman PM, Fisk MC (2011a) Calcium constrains plant control over forest ecosystem nitrogen cycling. *Ecology* 92(11):2035–2042.
- Odum EP (1969) The strategy of ecosystem development. *Science* 164(3877):262–270.
- Vitousek PM, Reiners WA (1975) Ecosystem succession and nutrient retention: A hypothesis. *Bioscience* 25(6):376–381.
- Aber JD, Nadelhoffer KJ, Steudler P, Melillo JP (1989) Nitrogen saturation in northern forest ecosystems. *Bioscience* 39(6):378–386.
- LeBauer DS, Treseder KK (2008) Nitrogen limitation of net primary productivity in terrestrial ecosystems is globally distributed. *Ecology* 89(2):371–379.
- Magnani F, et al. (2007) The human footprint in the carbon cycle of temperate and boreal forest ecosystems. *Nature* 447:849–851.
- Hedin LO, Armesto JJ, Johnson AH (1995) Patterns of nutrient loss from unpolluted, old-growth temperate forests: Soil organic matter and evaluation of biogeochemical theory. *Ecology* 76(2):493–509.
- Perakis SS, Hedin LO (2002) Nitrogen loss from unpolluted South American forests mainly via dissolved organic compounds. *Nature* 415(6870):416–419.
- Bormann FH, Likens GE (1979) Catastrophic disturbance and the steady state in northern hardwood forests. *Am Sci* 67(6):660–669.
- Norby RJ, Zak DR (2011) Ecological lessons from Free-Air CO<sub>2</sub> Enrichment (FACE) experiments. *Annu Rev Ecol Syst* 42:181–203.
- Huntington TG, Ryan DF (1990) Whole-tree-harvesting effects on soil nitrogen and carbon. *For Ecol Manage* 31(4):193–204.
- Yanai RD, et al. (2013) From missing source to missing sink: Long-term changes in the nitrogen budget of a northern hardwood forest. *Environ Sci Technol* 47(20):11440–11448.
- Bernhardt E, et al. (2005) Can't see the forest for the stream? – In-stream processing and terrestrial nitrogen exports. *Bioscience* 55(3):219–230.
- Lehmann CMB, Bowersox VC, Larson SM (2005) Spatial and temporal trends of precipitation chemistry in the United States, 1985–2002. *Environ Pollut* 135(3):347–361.
- Kothawala DN, et al. (2011) Stream nitrate responds rapidly to decreasing nitrate deposition. *Ecosystems* (N Y) 14(2):274–286.
- Lovett GM, Weathers KC, Arthur MA (2002) Control of N loss from forested watersheds by soil carbon:nitrogen ratio and tree species composition. *Ecosystems* (N Y) 5:712–718.
- Lovett GM, Weathers KC, Arthur MA, Schultz JC (2004) Nitrogen cycling in a northern hardwood forest: Do species matter? *Biogeochemistry* 67(3):289–308.
- Jost G, Dinbock T, Grabner MT, Mirtl M (2011) Nitrogen leaching of two forest ecosystems in a karst watershed. *Water Air Soil Pollut* 218(1):633–649.
- Groffman PM, Fisk MC (2011b) Phosphate additions have no effect on microbial biomass and activity in a northern hardwood forest. *Soil Biol Biochem* 43(12):2441–2449.
- Phillips RP, Finzi AC, Bernhardt ES (2011) Enhanced root exudation induces microbial feedbacks to N cycling in a pine forest under long-term CO<sub>2</sub> fumigation. *Ecol Lett* 14(2):187–194.
- Liang Y, Sun W, Zhu YG, Christie P (2007) Mechanisms of silicon-mediated alleviation of abiotic stresses in higher plants: A review. *Environ Pollut* 147(2):422–428.
- Morse JL, Durán J, Groffman PM (2015) Soil denitrification fluxes in a northern hardwood forest: The importance of snowmelt and implications for ecosystem N budgets. *Ecosystems* (N Y) 18(3):520–532.
- Bernal S, Hedin LO, Likens GE, Gerber S, Buso DC (2012) Complex response of the forest nitrogen cycle to climate change. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 109(9):3406–3411.
- Simek M, Cooper JE (2002) The influence of soil pH on denitrification: Progress towards the understanding of this interaction over the last 50 years. *Eur J Soil Sci* 53(3):345–354.
- Likens GE, Buso DC (2012) Dilution and the elusive baseline. *Environ Sci Technol* 46(8):4382–4387.
- Lovett GM, Arthur MA, Crowley KF (2016) Effects of calcium on the rate and extent of litter decomposition in a Northern Hardwood Forest. *Ecosystems* (N Y) 19(1):87–97.
- Lindenmayer DB, Likens GE (2010) Improving ecological monitoring. *Trends Ecol Evol* 25(4):200–201.
- Buso DC, Likens GE, Eaton JS (2000) *Chemistry of Precipitation, Stream Water and Lake Water from the Hubbard Brook Ecosystem Study: A Record of Sampling Protocols and Analytical Procedures*. General Technical Report NE-275. (USDA Forest Service, Newtown Square, PA).