

## Won Do Lee

---

**From:** Tim Schwanen  
**Sent:** 08 August 2023 02:56  
**To:** Won Do Lee  
**Subject:** COVID paper  
**Attachments:** Temporal\_cluster\_v6.1\_TS.docx

Hi Won Do,

I've now managed to finalise new versions of the results and discussion section – see attached.

If you think the new discussion section makes sense and you are happy with it, then I would suggest that we:

1. Substantially reposition and rewrite the introduction and literature review sections. I think we can probably limit ourselves to one section instead of two and that is broadly structured as follows:
  - a. Paragraph 1: there is now a very large literature on the effect of the pandemic on everyday mobility, showing among others a) the uneven degree to which different population groups adapt, and were able to adapt their mobility (e.g. our own paper, Kim & Kwan, many others can be added), b) the rebounding/recovery of mobility levels before lockdown policies were watered down or diminished (e.g. Kim & Kwan and many others), c) substantial recovery/resilience (e.g. shown by quite a few studies of public bike sharing: ) though less so for public transport and for vulnerable groups like the elderly (e.g. [Wang et al. 2022](#)). More generally, studies have paid more and more attention to trends and changes over time in mobility over the course of the pandemic. Some studies have considered mobility waves (e.g. [Duenas et al 2021](#)), but a focus on the first wave continues to dominate the literature.
  - b. Paragraph 2: less attention has been paid to spatio-temporal developments in mobility over the course of the pandemic – this is potentially important because adaptability and resilience (for elaborations of these terms, see the studies I have referenced in the discussion section) is likely to differ geographically. Apart from theoretical arguments, there is also the issue of MAUP: trends in mobility may well look differently when the spatial scale at which they are assessed is varied. There are, therefore, both theoretical and methodological reasons why paying detailed attention to spatiotemporal trends in mobility is warranted
  - c. Objective of our study: examine that spatiotemporal variation – using CDR data for England in Jan-Jun 2020 and with appropriate methods [a brief summary will be useful here].
  - d. We then need to explain which sets of variables we expect to be related to place-specific trends in mobility levels – here I would suggest a simplification compared to earlier versions, and suggest three sets of variables: an area's sociodemographic profile, its accessibility levels, and local COVID-19 risk in the earliest stages of the pandemic (which were very influential in shaping national policy and public debate whilst also exhibiting distinct geographical differences)
  - e. We finish with a paragraph on summarising the policy context – the relative lateness of national lock-down policies compared to many other European countries, the nature of the measures that were put in place, when they got relaxed, etc.
2. We would have to write a new conclusion section, which can be a summary of key findings and points in the discussion section
3. We would also have to adapt the abstract
4. I've led multiple requests for references in the discussion section – perhaps you can have a look for appropriate material (which may well have to come from UK government websites)
5. We may want to consider whether we should include a table with all independent variables you have considered in Section 3, with average values and standard deviations. I don't think it would take much time to make such a table as you already prepared a very similar one to describe the four clusters and in which

you added a column for the national average. I think it would be a good idea to add that table, but leave the decision as to whether we do so or not to you

6. We may need to re-consider journal choice – I am okay with International Journal of Urban Sciences, but believe we could also try Journal of Transport Geography or Applied Geography. You should make the choice, on the basis of what is now best for your further career

Would you be able to give 1-4 a go, and consider 5-6?

I'd be happy to do another round of editing of the introduction and conclusion section if that's helpful.

I hope this is going in a direction you are happy with the direction the paper has taken – I think it is shaping up to be quite an original contribution.

Take care,  
Tim

**Tim Schwanen** (he/him)

Professor of Transport Geography and Director of the Transport Studies Unit

tim.schwanen@ouce.ox.ac.uk | +44 (0)1865 285503

Transport Studies Unit, University of Oxford | [www.tsu.ox.ac.uk](http://www.tsu.ox.ac.uk)

Fellow, Academy of Social Sciences

Editor, Environment and Planning F

The 2022 Annual Report for the Transport Studies Unit is now available