# Set Theory2

#### Yao

## 2022年3月10日

## 目录

1	集合	的宇宙	9	
	1.1	数理逻辑	1	
	1.2	层垒的谱系	4	
	1.3	相对化 relativization	9	
	1.4	Exercise	10	
1	L 集合的宇宙			

## 1.1 数理逻辑

在 ZFC 下证明 ZFC  $\vdash$  CH,希望将 "ZFC  $\vdash$  CH" 表述为一阶句子 一般而言,给定一个  $\mathcal{L}$ -理论 T 和一个  $\mathcal{L}$ -句子  $\delta$ ," $T \vdash \sigma$ " 不能用一个

 $\mathcal{L}$ -句子表示,只能用元语言表述

我们需要在 ZFC 中编码"元语言"

在 ZFC 中可以定义  $\mathcal{N} = (\mathbb{N}, +, \times, 0, 1)$ 

即存在集合论语言  $\mathcal{L}=\{\in\}$  中的 **公式**,在 **ZFC** 的任意模型中可以定义  $\mathbb{N},+,\times,0,1$ ,以上公式与模型无关

用「0<sup>¬</sup>,「1<sup>¬</sup>,「2<sup>¬</sup>...表示 ZFC 中的"自然数",以区别元语言中的自然数

Theorem 1.1. 如果  $R \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  是一个递归关系。 $T \subseteq \operatorname{Th}(\mathcal{N})$  是包含数论的适当丰富的理论,则存在公式  $\varphi(x_1, ..., x_n)$  使得对任意自然数  $m_1, ..., m_n$  有

如果
$$(m_1,\ldots,m_n)\in R$$
则 $T\vdash \varphi(\lceil m_1\rceil,\ldots,\lceil m_n\rceil)$ 如果 $(m_1,\ldots,m_n)\notin R$ 则 $T\vdash \neg \varphi(\lceil m_1\rceil,\ldots,\lceil m_n\rceil)$ 

*Remark.* 1.  $T \subseteq \text{Th}(\mathcal{N}) \subseteq \text{ZFC}$ 

- 2.  $\varphi$  是语言  $\{+, \times, 0, 1\}$  上的公式
- 3.  $\varphi$  可以还原为一个 {∈} 上的公式
- 4.  $\varphi(\lceil m_1 \rceil, \dots, \lceil m_n \rceil)$  是一个闭语句

#### 编码

编码函数  $f: X \to \mathbb{N}$ 

存在解码函数 g,h,对  $a=a_0,\ldots,a_n\in X$ , h(f(a))=n+1,  $g(f(a),k)=a_k$  (分量)

性质: 以上三种函数 f,g,h 均是递归函数  $\Rightarrow$  都是可表示的

性质: "公式集"的编码集是递归的

性质: 如果  $T \subseteq ZFC$  是可公理化的,则 T 的证明集的编码集是递归的

#### Corollary 1.2. 存在一个公式 $\psi$ 和 $\theta$ 使得

$$\begin{tabular}{ll} ZFC \vdash \psi(n) \Leftrightarrow n \ is \ a \ formula \\ ZFC \vdash \neg \psi(n) \Leftrightarrow n \ is \ not \ a \ formula \\ ZFC \vdash \theta(n) \Leftrightarrow n \ is \ a \ proof \ in \ ZFC \\ ZFC \vdash \neg \theta(n) \Leftrightarrow n \ is \ not \ a \ proof \ in \ ZFC \\ \end{tabular}$$

 $\mathsf{FORM} = \{\lceil \varphi \rceil \mid \varphi \; \mathsf{formula}\} \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ 

如果  $T \subseteq \mathsf{ZFC}$  是可公理化的,则"T 是一致的"是一个一阶表述式"不存在一个有穷的证明序列  $D = (\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n)$  使得  $\varphi_n$  形如  $\varphi \land \neg \varphi$  ,记作  $\mathsf{Con}(T)$ 

Theorem 1.3 (第二不完全). 如果T是包含ZFC的一个递归公理集,且T一致,则

$$T \not\vdash Con(T)$$

特别地, ZFC ⊁ Con(ZFC)

**Theorem 1.4.** 对任意可公理化的理论 T, $ZFC \vdash Con(T)$  当且仅当存在  $M \vDash T$ 

即不能在 ZFC 里证明 ZFC 有一个模型

需要可公理化来写出 Con(T),因此因为 ZFC 
ot = Con(T),我们只能假设这么一个模型

集合论的模型跟集合论没什么关系,就是一个集合带一个二元关系,是 关于集合论语言的结构

**Definition 1.5.** 设 (M, E) 是集合论模型

1. 对任意公式  $\varphi(\bar{x},y)$ , 定义  $M^n$  上的函数

$$h_{\omega}:M^n\to M$$

满足条件

$$M \vDash \exists y \varphi(\bar{a},y) \Rightarrow M \vDash \varphi(\bar{a},h_{\varphi}(\bar{a}))$$

称  $h_{\varphi}$  为  $\varphi$  的 Skolem 函数(依赖于选择公理,不同的变量选择有不同的函数)

2. 令  $\mathcal{H}=\{h_{\varphi}\mid \varphi \text{ formula}\}$  为 Skolem 函数集合,设 S 是 M 的任意子集,则  $\mathcal{H}(S)$  表示包含 S 且对  $\mathcal{H}$  封闭的最小集合,称之为 S 的 Skolem 壳

**Lemma 1.6.** 令 N 是集合论模型,  $S \subseteq N$ , 如果  $M = \mathcal{H}(S)$ , 则  $M \prec N$ 

证明. Induction

对任意  $\bar{a} \in M^n$ ,有  $M \models \varphi(\bar{a}) \Leftrightarrow N \models \varphi(\bar{a})$ 

1. 不含量词,显然成立

2.  $\varphi$  形如  $\exists y \psi(\bar{x},y)$ ,  $N \vDash \exists y \psi(\bar{a},y) \Rightarrow N \vDash \psi(\bar{a},h_{\psi}(\bar{a}))$ , by IH,  $M \vDash \psi(\bar{a},h_{\psi}(\bar{a})) \Rightarrow M \vDash \exists y \psi(\bar{a},y)$ 

Theorem 1.7 (Löwenheim-Skolem Theorem).

### 1.2 层垒的谱系

工作于  $\mathbf{ZF}^-$ :  $\mathbf{ZF} -$ 基础公理  $\alpha \mapsto V_{\alpha}$  是 On 到 WF 的 1-1 映射,而 On 是真类

**Lemma 1.8.** For any ordinal  $\alpha$ 

- 1.  $V_{\alpha}$  is transitive
- 2.  $\xi \leq \alpha \Rightarrow V_{\xi} \subseteq V_{\alpha}$
- 3. if  $\kappa$  is inaccessible, then  $|V_{\kappa}| = \kappa$

**Definition 1.9.** For any  $x \in WF$ , rank of x is

$$\mathrm{rank}(x) = \min\{\beta \mid x \in V_{\beta+1}\}$$

$$\operatorname{rank}(x) = \alpha \Rightarrow x \in V_{\alpha+1} \land x \not\in V_\alpha$$

- $x \in V_{\alpha+1} \Leftrightarrow \operatorname{rank}(x) \le \alpha$
- $\bullet \ \ x \subseteq V_\alpha \Leftrightarrow \mathrm{rank}(x) \leq \alpha$

 $\textbf{Lemma 1.10.} \qquad 1. \ \ V_{\alpha} = \{x \in \mathrm{WF} \mid \mathit{rank}(x) < \alpha\}$ 

- 2. WF is transitive
- 3.  $\forall x, y \in WF$ ,  $x \in y \Rightarrow rank(x) < rank(y)$
- 4.  $\forall y \in WF$ ,  $rank(y) = \sup\{rank(x) + 1 \mid x \in y\}$

- 证明. 1. by definition,  $x\in V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)+1}\setminus V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)}$ ,  $\mathrm{rank}(x)<\alpha\Rightarrow x\in V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)+1}\subseteq V_{\alpha}$   $\mathrm{rank}(x)\geq\alpha\Rightarrow x\notin V_{\alpha}$ 
  - 2. WF is the "union" of transitive sets
  - $3. \ y \in V_{\mathsf{rank}(y)+1} \smallsetminus V_{\mathsf{rank}(y)}, \ y \subseteq V_{\mathsf{rank}(y)}, \ x \in y \Rightarrow x \in V_{\mathsf{rank}(y)} \Rightarrow \mathsf{rank}(x) < \mathsf{rank}(y)$
  - 4. by 3,  $\sup\{\operatorname{rank}(x)+1\mid x\in y\}\leq \operatorname{rank}(y)$ . induction on  $\operatorname{rank}(y)\leq \sup\{\operatorname{rank}(x)+1\mid x\in y\}$ 
    - $\operatorname{rank}(y) = 0$
    - $$\begin{split} \bullet \ \, \mathrm{rank}(y) &= \beta + 1, y \in V_{\beta + 2} \smallsetminus V_{\beta + 1} \\ y &\in V_{\beta + 2} \Rightarrow y \subseteq V_{\beta + 1}. \ \, y \notin V_{\beta + 1} \Rightarrow y \not\subseteq V_{\beta} \Rightarrow y \smallsetminus V_{\beta} \text{ nonempty.} \\ \mathrm{Let} \, \, x \in y \smallsetminus V_{\beta}, \mathrm{rank}(x) \geq \beta, \sup \{ \mathrm{rank}(x) + 1 \mid x \in y \} \geq \beta + 1 = \mathrm{rank}(y) \end{split}$$
    - $$\begin{split} \bullet \ \, & \operatorname{rank}(y) = \gamma \operatorname{for some limit, then} \, y \subseteq V_{\gamma} \operatorname{and for any} \, \xi < \gamma, y \not\subseteq V_{\xi}, \\ & \operatorname{let} \, X_{\xi} \in y \smallsetminus V_{\xi}, \operatorname{then} \, \operatorname{rank}(X_{\xi}) \geq \xi, \sup \{ \operatorname{rank}(x) + 1 \mid x \in y \} \geq \\ & \sup \{ \xi + 1 \mid \xi < \operatorname{rank}(y) \} \geq \operatorname{rank}(y) \end{split}$$

- WF 中的集合按照秩分层
- 在 WF 中基础公理是成立的:  $\forall y(y \neq \emptyset \rightarrow \exists x \in y(x \cap y = \emptyset))$ ,因为任何序数集都有最小元,挑一个有最小 rank 的就好了
- WF 类的构造没有用到选择公理
- On  $\subseteq$  WF

**Lemma 1.11.** *for any ordinal*  $\alpha$ 

1.  $\alpha \in WF$  and  $rank(\alpha) = \alpha$ 

- 2.  $V_{\alpha} \cap On = \alpha$
- 证明. 1.  $0 \in V_1 \setminus V_0 \subset WF$ , rank(0) = 0

If  $\alpha \in \operatorname{WF}$  and  $\operatorname{rank}(\alpha) = \alpha$ .  $\alpha \in V_{\alpha+1} \setminus V_{\alpha}$ ,  $\alpha \subseteq V_{\alpha+1}$ .  $\alpha+1 = \alpha \cup \{\alpha\} \subseteq V_{\alpha+1}$ ,  $\alpha+1 \in V_{\alpha+2} \subset \operatorname{WF}$ . If  $\alpha+1 \in V_{\alpha+1}$ , then  $\operatorname{rank}(\alpha+1) \leq \alpha$ , but  $\alpha \in \alpha+1 \Rightarrow \operatorname{rank}(\alpha) = \alpha < \operatorname{rank}(\alpha+1)$ . A contradiction

suppose  $\gamma$  is a limit ordinal and for any  $\alpha < \gamma$ ,  $\alpha \in V_{\alpha+1} \setminus V_{\alpha}$ .  $\gamma = \bigcup_{\alpha < \gamma} \alpha \subseteq \bigcup_{\alpha < \gamma} V_{\alpha} = V_{\gamma}$ . Thus  $\gamma \in V_{\gamma+1}$ ,  $\mathrm{rank}(\gamma) \le \gamma$  and  $\mathrm{rank}(\gamma) \not< \gamma$ .

2. suppose  $\beta \in V_{\alpha} \cap \text{On}$ , then  $\beta = \text{rank}(\beta) < \alpha$ . If  $\beta \in \alpha$  and  $\text{rank}(\beta) < \alpha$ ,  $\beta \in V_{\alpha} \cap \text{On}$ 

**Lemma 1.12.** 1. If  $x \in WF$ , then  $\bigcup x, \mathcal{P}(x), \{x\} \in WF$ , and their rank  $< rank(x) + \omega$ 

- 2. If  $x,y \in WF$ , then  $x \times y, x \cup y, x \cap y, \{x,y\}, (x,y), x^y \in WF$ , and their  $rank < rank(x) + rank(y) + \omega$
- 3.  $\mathbb{Z}, \mathbb{Q}, \mathbb{R} \in V_{\omega + \omega}$
- *4. for any set* x,  $x \in WF \Leftrightarrow x \subset WF$
- 证明. 1. suppose  $\operatorname{rank}(x) = \alpha. \ x \in V_{\alpha+1} \setminus V_{\alpha} \ \operatorname{and} \ x \subseteq V_{\alpha}.$  by transitivity,  $\bigcup x \subseteq V_{\alpha} \Rightarrow \bigcup x \in V_{\alpha+1} \subset \operatorname{WF. rank}(\bigcup x) \leq \alpha$  suppose  $y \in \mathcal{P}(x), \ y \subseteq x \Rightarrow y \subseteq V_{\alpha} \Rightarrow y \in V_{\alpha+1}. \ \mathcal{P}(x) \subseteq V_{\alpha+1},$   $\mathcal{P}(x) \in V_{\alpha+2}, \operatorname{rank}(\mathcal{P}(x)) \leq \alpha+1.$   $\{x\} \in \mathcal{P}(x) \in V_{\alpha+2}.$ 
  - 2. Suppose  $\operatorname{rank}(x) = \alpha, \operatorname{rank}(y) = \beta, x \subset V_{\alpha}, y \subset V_{\beta}$   $x \cup y \subset V_{\alpha} \cup V_{\beta} = V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)}, \operatorname{rank}(x \cup y) \leq \max(\alpha,\beta)$   $x \cap y \subset V_{\min(\alpha,\beta)}$

$$\begin{split} \{x,y\} &\subseteq V_{\alpha+1} \cup V_{\beta+1} = V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)+1}, \operatorname{rank}(\{x,y\}) = \max(\alpha,\beta) + 1 \\ (x,y) &= \{\{x\}, \{x,y\}\} \subset V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)+2}. \ \operatorname{rank}((x,y)) = \max(\alpha,\beta) + 2 \\ x \times y &= \{(a,b) \mid a \in x, b \in y\}. \ a \in x \Rightarrow \operatorname{rank}(a) < \alpha, b \in y \Rightarrow \\ \operatorname{rank}(b) &< \beta, \operatorname{rank}(a,b) < \max(\alpha,\beta) + 2, (a,b) \in V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)+2}. \ x \times y \subseteq V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)+2}, \operatorname{rank}(x \times y) \leq \max(\alpha,\beta) + 2. \\ x^y &\subseteq \mathcal{P}(x \times y) \subseteq V_{\max(\alpha,\beta)+3}. \end{split}$$

3.  $\mathbb{N} = \omega \in V_{\omega+1}$ 

 $\mathbb{Z}$ : let  $\sim$  be an equivalence relation on  $\omega \times \omega$ ,  $(a,b) \sim (c,d) \Leftrightarrow a+d=b+c$ , then  $\mathbb{Z}=(\omega \times \omega)/\sim$ . Hence  $\mathbb{Z}$  is a partition of  $\omega \times \omega$  and hence  $\mathbb{Z}\subseteq \mathcal{P}(\omega \times \omega)$ .  $\mathbb{Z}\in V_{\omega+3}$ 

 $\mathbb{Q}$ : let  $\sim$  be an equivalence on  $\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z}^+$ ,  $(a,b) \sim (c,d) \Leftrightarrow ad = bc$ .  $\mathbb{Q} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z}^+)$ ,  $\mathbb{Q} \in V_{\omega+6}$ 

 $\mathbb{R}\text{: set of dedekind cut on }\mathbb{Q}\text{, }\mathbb{R}\subset\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{Q})\text{, }\mathbb{R}\in V_{\omega+8}$ 

4.  $\Rightarrow$ : WF is transitive

 $\Leftarrow: x \text{ is a set and } x \subset \bigcup_{\alpha \in \mathsf{On}} V_{\alpha}.$ 

**Claim**: there is an ordinal  $\alpha$  s.t.  $x \subset V_{\alpha}$ 

Otherwise, let  $f:\operatorname{On} o \mathcal{P}(x)$  s.t.  $f(\alpha)=x \smallsetminus V_{\alpha}$ . Then for any  $y \in \mathcal{P}(x)$ ,  $f^{-1}(y)$  is a set.  $\operatorname{On} = \bigcup_{y \in x} f^{-1}(y)$  and is thus a set, a contradiction

AC => Any set has cardinality

#### **Lemma 1.13.** *Assume AC* ( $V \models ZFC$ )

- 1. for any group G, there is a group G' in WF s.t.  $G \cong G'$
- 2. for any topological space T, there is a topological space T' in WF s.t.  $T \cong T'$  (homeomorphic)

证明. 1. suppose  $(G,*_G)$  is a group,  $G,*_G \in V$ . By AC, there is a cardinal  $\alpha$  s.t.  $|G|=\alpha$ , that is, there is a bijection  $f:\alpha \to G$ . Define \*: for any  $x,y,z\in \alpha$ ,  $x*y=z\Leftrightarrow f(x)*_G f(y)=f(z)$ . Then  $(\alpha,*)\cong (G,*_G)$ ,  $*\subseteq \alpha \times \alpha$ 

V 中的任何结构都可以在 WF 中找到同构象(同构是在 V 里看到的)

**Definition 1.14.** 任意集合 A 上的二元关系 < 是 **良基**的,当且仅当对 A 的 任意非空子集 X,X 有 < 下的极小元

**Theorem 1.15.** *If*  $A \in WF$ , then  $\in$  is a well-founded relation on A

证明. suppose  $X \subseteq A$ ,  $X \neq \emptyset$ ,  $X \subseteq WF$ , then elements of X has ranks and  $x \in y \Rightarrow \operatorname{rank}(x) < \operatorname{rank}(y)$ . Let x having least rank in X, then x is the  $\in$ -minimal element in X

**Lemma 1.16.** If A is a transitive set and  $\in$  is a well-founded relation on A, then  $A \in WF$ 

证明. Just need to prove  $A \subset WF$ . If  $A \not\subset WF$ ,  $X = A \setminus WF \neq \emptyset$ . Then X has a  $\in$ -minimal element x. Then  $x \neq \emptyset \in WF$ . For any  $y \in x$ ,  $y \in A$ . By the minimality of x,  $y \in WF$ . Then  $x \subset WF$ ,  $x \in WF$ , a contradiction

**Lemma 1.17.** *For any set* x*, there is a minimal transitive set* trcl(x) s.t.  $x \subseteq trcl(x)$ 

证明. For any  $n \in \omega$  define  $x_n$ 

$$x_0 = x$$
 
$$x_{n+1} = \bigcup x_n$$

let  $\operatorname{trcl}(x) = \bigcup_{n \in \omega} x_n$ .

1. trcl(x) is transitive

$$a \in \operatorname{trcl}(x) \Rightarrow a \in x_n \Rightarrow a \subseteq x_{n+1} \subseteq \operatorname{trcl}(x)$$

2. trcl(x) is minimal

If  $y\supseteq x$  is transitive, recursively prove for any  $n<\omega$ ,  $x_n\subseteq y$ .

trcl(x) is the **transitive closure** of x.

**Lemma 1.18.** We can prove the following without axiom of power set

- 1. *if* x *is transitive,* trcl(x) = x
- 2.  $y \in x \Rightarrow trcl(y) \subseteq trcl(x)$
- 3.  $trcl(x) = x \cup \bigcup \{trcl(y) \mid y \in x\}$
- 证明. 2.  $y \in x \subset \operatorname{trcl}(x)$ .  $y \in \operatorname{trcl}(x)$ .  $\operatorname{trcl}(y) \subseteq \operatorname{trcl}(x)$ .
  - 3.  $x \cup \bigcup \{ \operatorname{trcl}(y) \mid y \in x \} \subseteq \operatorname{trcl}(x)$  by (2)  $\bigcup \{ \operatorname{trcl}(y) \mid y \in x \} \text{ is transitive. For } y \in x, \, y \subseteq \operatorname{trcl}(y). \text{ Thus rhs is }$

**Theorem 1.19** (In  $ZF^-$ ). For any set X, TFAE

- 1.  $X \in WF$
- 2.  $trcl(X) \in WF$

transitive

3.  $\in$  is a well-founded relation on trcl(X)

证明.  $1 \rightarrow 2$ : WF is closed under union

**Theorem 1.20.** *If*  $V \models ZF^-$ , TFAE

- 1. axiom of foundation  $(V \vDash)$  axiom of foundation
- 2. for any set X,  $\in$  is a well-founded relation on X
- 3. V = WF

 $V \models ZF \Rightarrow V = WF(WF \models ZF)$ Goal:  $V \models ZF^- \Rightarrow WF \models ZF^-$  但是 WF 是一个类,我们并没有定义 我们可以用相对化编码 WF  $\models ZF^-$ 

### 1.3 相对化 relativization

工作在 ZF-

**Definition 1.21.** M class,  $\varphi$  formula,  $\varphi$  对 M 的 相对化  $\varphi^{M}$ 

- 1.  $(x = y)^{\mathbf{M}} := x = y$
- 2.  $(x \in y)^{\mathbf{M}} := x \in y$
- 3.  $(\varphi \to \psi)^{\mathbf{M}} := \varphi^{\mathbf{M}} \to \psi^{\mathbf{M}}$
- 4.  $(\neg \varphi)^{\mathbf{M}} := \neg \varphi^{\mathbf{M}}$
- 5.  $(\forall x \varphi)^{\mathbf{M}} := (\forall x \in \mathbf{M}) \varphi^{\mathbf{M}}$

#### 1.4 Exercise

 $\textit{Exercise 1.4.1.} \qquad 1. \ \ V_{\alpha} = \{x \in \mathsf{WF} \mid \mathsf{rank}(x) < \alpha\}$ 

- 2. WF is transitive
- 3.  $\forall x, y \in WF, x \in y \Rightarrow rank(x) < rank(y)$
- 4.  $\forall y \in WF$ ,  $rank(y) = sup\{rank(x) + 1 \mid x \in y\}$
- 证明. 1. by definition,  $x\in V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)+1}\setminus V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)}$ ,  $\mathrm{rank}(x)<\alpha\Rightarrow x\in V_{\mathrm{rank}(x)+1}\subseteq V_{\alpha}$   $\mathrm{rank}(x)\geq\alpha\Rightarrow x\notin V_{\alpha}$ 
  - 2. WF is the "union" of transitive sets
  - $3. \ \ y \in V_{\operatorname{rank}(y)+1} \smallsetminus V_{\operatorname{rank}(y)}\text{, } y \subseteq V_{\operatorname{rank}(y)}\text{, } x \in y \Rightarrow x \in V_{\operatorname{rank}(y)} \Rightarrow \operatorname{rank}(x) < \operatorname{rank}(y)$

- 4. by 3,  $\sup\{\operatorname{rank}(x)+1\mid x\in y\}\leq \operatorname{rank}(y).$  induction on  $\operatorname{rank}(y)\leq \sup\{\operatorname{rank}(x)+1\mid x\in y\}$ 
  - $\operatorname{rank}(y) = 0$
  - $\begin{array}{l} \bullet \ \ {\rm rank}(y) = \beta + 1, y \in V_{\beta + 2} \smallsetminus V_{\beta + 1} \\ \\ y \in V_{\beta + 2} \Rightarrow y \subseteq V_{\beta + 1}. \ \ y \notin V_{\beta + 1} \Rightarrow y \not\subseteq V_{\beta} \Rightarrow y \smallsetminus V_{\beta} \ \ {\rm nonempty}. \\ \\ {\rm Let} \ x \in y \smallsetminus V_{\beta}, {\rm rank}(x) \geq \beta, {\rm sup}\{{\rm rank}(x) + 1 \mid x \in y\} \geq \beta + 1 = {\rm rank}(y) \\ \end{array}$
  - $\begin{array}{l} \bullet \ \, \mathrm{rank}(y) = \gamma \, \mathrm{for \, some \, limit, \, then} \, y \subseteq V_{\gamma} \, \mathrm{and \, for \, any} \, \xi < \gamma, y \not\subseteq V_{\xi}, \\ \mathrm{let} \, X_{\xi} \in y \smallsetminus V_{\xi}, \, \mathrm{then \, rank}(X_{\xi}) \geq \xi, \, \mathrm{sup}\{\mathrm{rank}(x) + 1 \mid x \in y\} \geq \\ \mathrm{sup}\{\xi + 1 \mid \xi < \mathrm{rank}(y)\} \geq \mathrm{rank}(y) \\ \end{array}$