

**Reject:** if  $p$ -value is small,  $C_I$ : Collects all possible  $\mu_0$ 's that we can't reject in this way. Contains true  $\mu$   $(1-\alpha)/\epsilon$  of the time.

**P-Value:** How likely it would be to observe estimator  $\hat{\mu}$  as extreme than the one observed in the sample if null is true  $H_0: \mu = \mu_0$ .

**Estimator:** Function of data for the sample: What we actually see (random). **Estimand:** Function of distribution of observable data (fixed number)

$\int_{D_i}^1$ , treatment  $\sum_{i=1}^N Y_i$ ,  $Y_i(1) =$  outcome if treated,  $Y_i(0) =$  outcome if not.  $\therefore Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)$  individual i's treatment effect  $\Rightarrow Y_i = D_i Y_i(1) + (1-D_i) Y_i(0)$ . model  $(Y_i, D_i)$

**Target Parameter:**  $E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)]$ . Sample  $\{Y_i, D_i\}_N$ . Estimator:  $\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N Y_i - \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N Y_i$ . **Estimand:**  $E[Y_i(1)D_i] - E[Y_i(0)(1-D_i)]$  Compare to parameter  $E[Y_i(1)] - E[Y_i(0)]$

$CDF: F(x) = P(X \leq x)$ .  $X$  discrete:  $p(x) = P(X=x)$ ,  $\sum_{x \in X} p(x)=1$ , continuous:  $p(x) = \frac{d}{dx} F(x)$ ,  $F(x) \geq 0$ ,  $\int_x^\infty f(x) dx = 1$ , Bernoulli:  $X \in \{0, 1\}$ ,  $X \sim \text{Bernoulli}(\pi)$ ,  $p(x) = \pi^x (1-\pi)^{1-x}$

$X \in \mathbb{R}$ ,  $X \sim N(\mu, \sigma^2)$ :  $f(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} e^{-\frac{(x-\mu)^2}{2\sigma^2}}$  exp  $\left\{-\frac{1}{2} \frac{(x-\mu)^2}{\sigma^2}\right\}$   $\forall \alpha, \beta, (\alpha+X+\beta) \sim N$ .  $X \in (a, b)$ ,  $X \sim U(a, b)$ ,  $f(x) = \frac{1}{b-a}$ . Joint CDF:  $F(x, y) = P(X \leq x, Y \leq y)$ , pmf:  $f(x, y) = P(X=x, Y=y)$

pdf:  $f(x, y) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y} F(x, y)$ . Marginal D:  $p(x) = \sum_{y \in Y} f(x, y)$  Conditional:  $P(Y|X) = \frac{P(Y, X)}{P(X)} = \frac{P(X|Y)p(y)}{p(x)}$ . Bayes:  $p(Y|X) = \frac{p(X|Y)p(y)}{p(x)}$ . ( $X \perp\!\!\!\perp Y$ ) if  $p(Y|X) = p(Y) \forall Y, X$

**Conditional I.**  $Y \perp\!\!\!\perp X | W$  if  $p(Y|X, W) = p(Y, W) \forall Y, X, W$ . Multivariate Normal:  $X \in \mathbb{R}^k$ ,  $\mu \in \mathbb{R}^k$ , positive-definite  $\Sigma \in \mathbb{R}^{k \times k}$ ,  $(X, Y), X|Y, Y|X$

$\propto X + PY + c \sim N$ . Mean:  $E[X] = \sum_{x \in X} x p(x)$ ,  $E[C + bX] = a + bE[X]$ ,  $\text{Var}(X) = E[(X-E[X])^2] = E[X^2] - E[X]^2$ ,  $\text{Var}(a+bX) = b^2 \text{Var}(X)$ ,  $\text{Cov}(X, Y) = E[(X-E[X])(Y-E[Y])]$

$\text{Cov}(X, Y) = E(XY) - E(X)E(Y)$ ,  $\text{Corr}(X, Y) = \frac{\text{Cov}(X, Y)}{\sqrt{\text{Var}(X)\text{Var}(Y)}}$ ,  $X \perp\!\!\!\perp Y \Rightarrow \text{Cov}(X, Y) = 0$ ,  $\text{Var}(aX + bY + c) = a^2 \text{Var}(X) + 2ab \text{Cov}(X, Y) + b^2 \text{Var}(Y)$ ,  $\text{Cov}(aX + c, bY + d) = ab \text{Cov}(X, Y)$

$\text{Cov}(X + Z, Y) = \text{Cov}(X, Y) + \text{Cov}(Z, Y)$ . Conditional Exp:  $E[Y|X=x] = \sum_{y \in Y} y p(Y|X=x) = \int_y g(x, y) dy$ ,  $E(g(X)+g(Y)|X=x) = g(x) + g(Y|X=x)$   $\forall g(x, y)$   $\text{Law of I.E.}$

**CLIE:**  $E(Y) = E(E(Y|X))$ , Mean Ind:  $Y$  m.i. of  $X$ :  $E[Y|X=x] = E[Y] \forall x \in X \Rightarrow \text{Corr}(X, Y) = 0$ ,  $E\left[\begin{array}{c} X_1, \dots, X_n \\ E[X_1], \dots, E[X_n] \end{array}\right] = \left[\begin{array}{c} E[X_1], \dots, E[X_n] \\ E[X_1], \dots, E[X_n] \end{array}\right]$ ,  $\text{Var}\left[\begin{array}{c} X_1, \dots, X_n \\ E[X_1], \dots, E[X_n] \end{array}\right] = \left[\begin{array}{c} \text{Cov}(X_1, X_2) & \dots & \text{Cov}(X_1, X_n) \\ \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \text{Cov}(X_n, X_1) & \dots & \text{Cov}(X_n, X_n) \end{array}\right]$ . Average Treatment Effect:  $ATE = E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)] = (If D_i \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0))) = E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0]$

**Conditional Uncountedness**:  $D \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0)) | \vec{X}_i$ :  $E[Y_i|D_i=1, X_i=x] = E[Y_i(1)|X_i=x]$  and  $E[Y_i|D_i=0, X_i=x] = E[Y_i(0)|X_i=x] \Rightarrow ATE(x)$

$E[Y_i|D_i=1|X_i=x] - E[Y_i|D_i=0|X_i=x] = E[Y_i(1)-Y_i(0)|X_i=x]$  identified,  $E(E[Y_i(1)-Y_i(0)|X_i]) = E[Y_i(1)-Y_i(0)]$ . Population Mean:  $\{Y_i\}_{i=1}^n \stackrel{iid}{\sim} D$ ,  $\mu = E[Y_i]$

Natural estimator:  $\hat{\mu} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i$  (random variable),  $E[\hat{\mu}] = E\left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i\right] = \mu$ ,  $\text{Var}(\hat{\mu}) = \text{Var}\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i\right) = \frac{\sigma^2}{N}$ , Unbiased(i.e.)  $E[\hat{\mu}] = \mu$ .  $\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \text{Var}(\hat{\mu}) = 0$

**Null Hypothesis:**  $H_0: \mu = \mu_0$ . **P-value:** reject  $H_0$  if small (i.e.) unlikely to observe  $\hat{\mu}$  far from  $\mu_0$  if  $H_0$ .  $T \cdot \epsilon \cdot p\text{-value} = 2(1 - \Phi(\frac{|\hat{\mu} - \mu_0|}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}}))$

$\{Y_i\}_{i=1}^n \stackrel{iid}{\sim} N(\mu, \sigma^2) \Rightarrow \hat{\mu} \sim N(\mu, \frac{\sigma^2}{N})$ .  $\hat{\mu} = \frac{\bar{Y} - \mu_0}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}} \sim N(0, 1)$   $|H_0: \mu = \mu_0, P(|\hat{\mu}| > t) = 1 - P(-t \leq \hat{\mu} \leq t) = 1 - (\Phi(-t) - \Phi(t))$ ,  $p\text{-value} = 1 - (\Phi(\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}}) - \Phi(-\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}}))$

$\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}} = \frac{\bar{Y} - \mu_0}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}}$   $t = \frac{\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}} - \mu_0}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}} \approx 1.96$   $\therefore H_0$  if  $|\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}}| \leq 1.96 \Rightarrow \mu_0 \in [\hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}} - 1.96\sigma/\sqrt{N}, \hat{\mu}_{\text{obs}} + 1.96\sigma/\sqrt{N}] \triangleq CI: P(H_0 | CI) = 0.95$

**Significance (size):**  $P$  incorrectly rejecting  $H_0$  when  $T$ . (Type I error). Power:  $P$  correctly rejecting  $H_0$  when false (Type II error)

**LLN:**  $N \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $\bar{X} \xrightarrow{P} \mu$ ,  $\bar{X} \sim N(\mu, \frac{\sigma^2}{N})$ . **CML:**  $N \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $g(\hat{\mu})$  continuous  $\rightarrow g(\mu)$ . Fact:  $E[(X_N - \bar{X})^2] \xrightarrow{P} 0 \Rightarrow X_N \xrightarrow{P} \bar{X}$ , Chebyshov:  $P(|X_N - \bar{X}| > \epsilon) \leq \frac{E[(X_N - \bar{X})^2]}{\epsilon^2}$

$X_N$  converges in  $P$  to  $\bar{X}$ ,  $X_N \xrightarrow{P} \bar{X}$  if  $\forall \epsilon > 0$   $P(|X_N - \bar{X}| > \epsilon) \rightarrow 0$ ,  $X_N$  consistent if  $X_N \rightarrow \mu$ . Proof:  $E[(X_N - \bar{X})^2] = P(|X_N - \bar{X}| > \epsilon) E[(X_N - \bar{X})^2 | |X_N - \bar{X}| > \epsilon] + P(|X_N - \bar{X}| \leq \epsilon) E[(X_N - \bar{X})^2 | |X_N - \bar{X}| \leq \epsilon] \geq P(|X_N - \bar{X}| > \epsilon) \epsilon^2$

**LLN:**  $\{Y_i\}_{i=1}^n \stackrel{iid}{\sim} D$ ,  $\text{Var}(Y_i) = \sigma^2 \Rightarrow \bar{Y} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i Y_i \xrightarrow{P} \mu = E[Y_i]$ .  $P(|\bar{Y} - \mu| > \epsilon) \rightarrow 0$ ,  $P(|\bar{Y} - \mu| \leq \epsilon) \rightarrow 1$

Proof:  $E[\bar{Y}] = \mu$ ,  $\text{Var}[\bar{Y}] = \frac{\sigma^2}{n}$ .  $\text{Var}(\bar{Y}) = E[(\bar{Y} - \mu)^2] = \frac{\sigma^2}{n} \rightarrow 0 \Rightarrow \bar{Y} \xrightarrow{P} \mu$ .  $X_N$  converges in distribution to a continuously distributed variable  $X$ ,

i.e.  $X_N \xrightarrow{P} X$  if  $\forall \epsilon > 0$   $P(X_N \notin \epsilon) \rightarrow 0$ .  $P(X_N \in \epsilon) \rightarrow P(X \in \epsilon)$ . **CLO:**  $\{Y_i\}_{i=1}^n \stackrel{iid}{\sim} D$ ,  $E[Y_i] = \mu$ ,  $\text{Var}(Y_i) = \sigma^2 \Rightarrow \bar{Y} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i Y_i \xrightarrow{P} \mu$ ,  $X_N = \sqrt{n}(\bar{Y} - \mu) \xrightarrow{D} N(0, \sigma^2)$

$\Leftrightarrow \bar{Y} \xrightarrow{D} N(\mu, \frac{\sigma^2}{n})$ .  $\bar{X}_N \in \mathbb{R}^k$ ,  $\bar{X}_N \xrightarrow{D} \bar{X}$  if  $F_{\bar{X}_N}(\bar{x}) \rightarrow F_{\bar{X}}(\bar{x})$ ,  $F_{\bar{X}_N}(\bar{x}) = P(X_1 \leq x_1, \dots, X_N \leq x_N)$ ,  $x = \begin{pmatrix} x_1 \\ \vdots \\ x_N \end{pmatrix}$ , **CMT:**  $g(\cdot)$  continuous,  $\bar{X} \xrightarrow{D} X \Rightarrow g(\bar{X}_N) \xrightarrow{D} g(X)$ ,  $(\bar{X}_N) \xrightarrow{D} g(\bar{X})$ ,  $(\bar{X}_N) \xrightarrow{D} X \Rightarrow g(\bar{X}_N) \xrightarrow{D} g(X)$ . Let  $\hat{\sigma}^2 = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (Y_i - \bar{Y})^2$ . If  $\{Y_i\}_{i=1}^n \xrightarrow{D} \sigma^2$ .  $\text{Var}(Y_i) = \sigma^2 \Rightarrow \hat{\sigma}^2 = \text{Var}(Y_i)$ . Proof:  $\hat{\sigma}^2 = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (Y_i - \bar{Y})^2 = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (Y_i - \mu)^2 + \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (\bar{Y} - \mu)^2$ .  $Z_i = Y_i - \bar{Y} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (Y_i - \bar{Y})$ ,  $\bar{Y} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i Y_i \xrightarrow{P} \mu$ . Slutsky:  $X_N \xrightarrow{P} c \in \mathbb{R}$ ,  $Y_N \xrightarrow{D} Y \Rightarrow$

$X_N + Y_N \xrightarrow{D} c + Y$ ,  $X_N Y_N \xrightarrow{D} cY$ ,  $Y_N / X_N \xrightarrow{D} c$ . By Slutsky,  $\hat{\sigma} = \frac{\bar{Y} - \mu_0}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}} \xrightarrow{D} N(0, 1)$ :  $P(\mu \in [\hat{\mu} \pm 1.96\sigma/\sqrt{N}]) = 0.95$ . Hypothesis T. Exp:  $D \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0))$

$\tau = E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)] = E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0]$ .  $H_0: \tau = \tau_0$ .  $\bar{Y} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N Y_i$ ,  $\bar{Y}_0 = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i:D_i=1} Y_i$ ,  $\bar{Y}_1 = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i:D_i=0} Y_i$ :  $\left( \frac{\bar{Y}_1 - \bar{Y}_0}{\sigma/\sqrt{N}} \right) \xrightarrow{D} N(0, 1)$ ,  $\sum = \begin{pmatrix} \text{Var}(Y_{i=1}) & \dots & \text{Var}(Y_{i=N}) \\ \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \text{Var}(Y_{i=1}) & \dots & \text{Var}(Y_{i=N}) \end{pmatrix}$ ,  $N = N_1 + N_2$

$\frac{N_1}{N} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i D_i \xrightarrow{P} E[1-D_i]$ ,  $\frac{N_0}{N} \xrightarrow{P} E[D_i]$ .  $\therefore \sqrt{N}(\bar{Y}_1 - \bar{Y}_0 - E[Y_1 - Y_0]) \xrightarrow{D} N(0, \sigma^2)$ ,  $\sigma^2 = \frac{1}{E[C_D]} \text{Var}(Y_{i=1}) + \frac{1}{E[1-D_i]} \text{Var}(Y_{i=0})$ ,  $\hat{\sigma}^2 = \frac{N_1 \hat{\sigma}_1^2 + N_0 \hat{\sigma}_0^2}{N_1 + N_0}$

$D \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0)) | X_i \therefore \sqrt{N}(\bar{Y}_{i=1} - \bar{Y}_{i=0} - E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0) | X_i = x]) \xrightarrow{D} N(0, \sigma^2)$ ,  $N_k = |\{i: X_i = x\}|$ ,  $\sigma^2 = \frac{1}{E[C_{D_i=X_i}]} \text{Var}(Y_{i=X_i}) + \frac{1}{E[1-D_i=X_i]} \text{Var}(Y_{i=X_i})$

**Linear Regression:** Assume  $E[Y_i | X_i = x] = \alpha + \beta x$ ,  $(\alpha, \beta) = \arg \min E[(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))^2]$ ,  $\min E[(Y_i - u)^2] \Rightarrow E[-2(Y_i - u)] = 0 \therefore u = E[Y_i]$

$\min_u E[(Y_i - u)^2] = E[\min_u E[(Y_i - u)^2] | X_i] \therefore \forall x \in \mathbb{R} u(x) \Rightarrow \min_u E[(Y_i - u)^2 | X_i = x] \Rightarrow u(x) = E[Y_i | X_i = x] = \alpha + \beta x \therefore E[(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))^2] \leq E[(Y_i - u)^2] \forall u$

$\therefore E[(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))^2] = E[-2(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))] = 0$ ,  $\frac{\partial}{\partial \alpha} E[(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))^2] = E[-2x_i(Y_i - (\alpha + \beta x))] = 0$ ,  $\therefore \alpha = E[Y_i] - \beta E[x_i]$ ,  $\beta = \frac{E[(X_i - E[X_i])(Y_i - E[Y_i])]}{E[(X_i - E[X_i])^2]} = \frac{\text{cov}(X_i, Y_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)}$

$B = \frac{\text{cov}(X_i, Y_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)}$ ,  $\alpha = E[Y_i] - B E[X_i]$ ,  $\hat{\alpha} = \frac{\text{cov}(X_i, Y_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)}$ ,  $\hat{\alpha} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})(Y_i - \bar{Y})$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})^2$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = \bar{Y} - \hat{\alpha} \bar{X}$  OLS:  $\hat{\alpha} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (Y_i - (\alpha + \beta X_i))^2 = (\hat{\alpha}, \hat{\beta})$ , OLS consistency

$\hat{\beta} = \left( \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})^2 \right)^{-1} \left( \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})(Y_i - \bar{Y}) \right) \xrightarrow{P} (\alpha, \beta) = \alpha + \beta \bar{X}$ . Regression Residual:  $\varepsilon_i$

$\varepsilon_i = Y_i - (\alpha + \beta X_i)$ ,  $E[\varepsilon_i | X_i] = 0$ ,  $\varepsilon_i = \alpha + \beta X_i + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $E[\varepsilon_i | X_i] = 0$ ,  $\text{cov}(X_i, \varepsilon_i) = E[X_i \varepsilon_i] = 0$ ,  $\bar{Y} = \alpha + \beta \bar{X} + \bar{\varepsilon} \therefore (Y_i - \bar{Y}) = (X_i - \bar{X}) + \varepsilon_i$

$\therefore \hat{\beta} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})^2 \xrightarrow{P} \text{Var}(X_i)$ ,  $\hat{\alpha} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_i (X_i - \bar{X})(Y_i - \bar{Y}) \xrightarrow{P} E[(X_i - \bar{X})(Y_i - \bar{Y})]$

$\hat{\beta} = \bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_0 = \bar{\varepsilon}$ . Markov's:  $P(X \geq c) \leq \frac{E[X]}{c}$ , Chebyshov:  $P(|X - E[X]| > \epsilon) \leq \frac{Var(X)}{\epsilon^2}$ , Jensen's:  $E[g(x)] \geq g(E[x])$   $\Leftarrow$  convex

Randomization  $\Rightarrow D \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0)) \therefore E[Y_i | D_i=1] = E[Y_i | D_i=0] = E[Y_i(1)] = E[Y_i(0)]$ ,  $E[g(X)] = g(E[X])$

$\{Y_{i(0)}\}$ : Outcome that would be observed for an individual  $i$  if they do not receive the treatment ( $D_i=0$ )  
**Potential Outcomes**:  $\{Y_{i(t)}\} : \dots (D_i=t)$   $\xrightarrow{(k+1) \times 1} \vec{X}_i = (1, X_{i1}, \dots, X_{ik})^T \xrightarrow{\vec{\beta}} \begin{pmatrix} \alpha \\ \beta_1 \\ \vdots \\ \beta_k \end{pmatrix} \xrightarrow{\vec{X}_i \cdot \vec{\beta} = \alpha + \beta_1 X_{i1} + \dots + \beta_k X_{ik}}$  **Multivariate Regression**:  $E[Y_i | \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}]$ ,  $\vec{X}_i = (1, X_{i1}, \dots, X_{ik})^T \xrightarrow{\vec{\beta}} \begin{pmatrix} \alpha \\ \beta_1 \\ \vdots \\ \beta_k \end{pmatrix} \xrightarrow{\text{Univariate: } (\alpha, \beta) = a, b \text{ s.t. } E[(Y_i - (a+bX_i))^2]}$   
**Multivariate**:  $\vec{\beta} = \underset{b}{\arg\min} E[(Y_i - \vec{X}_i^T \vec{b})^2]$ . If CEF linear:  $E[Y_i | \vec{X}_i] = \vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta}$ , CEF  $\neq$  linear:  $\vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta}$  is MSE-minimizer approximator  
 $\vec{\beta} = [\vec{E}[\vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T]]^{-1} [\vec{E}[\vec{X}_i^T Y_i]]$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = (\vec{X}^T \vec{X})^{-1} \vec{X}^T Y$ ,  $\vec{X} \in \mathbb{R}^{N \times k}$ ,  $Y \in \mathbb{R}^{N \times 1}$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i \vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T\right)^{-1} \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i \vec{X}_i^T Y_i\right)$ ,  $\hat{\beta} \xrightarrow{P} \vec{\beta}$  (Consistency)  
**Asymptotic Normality**:  $\sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta} - \vec{\beta}) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \Sigma)$ ,  $\Sigma = E[\vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T]^{-1} \text{Var}(\vec{X}_i \varepsilon_i) E[\vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T]^{-1}$ ,  $\varepsilon_i = Y_i - \vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta}$ .  $\sum_i = \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i \vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T\right) \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i \vec{X}_i \vec{X}_i^T\right)^{-1}$ .  
 $\hat{\varepsilon}_i = \vec{X}_{iz} - \vec{X}_{iz}^T \hat{\beta}$ ,  $\hat{\varepsilon}_i = Y_i - \vec{X}_i^T \hat{\beta}$ .  $SE(\hat{\beta}_j) = \sqrt{\sum_{jj} / \sqrt{N}}$ . **Frisch-Waugh-Lovell**:  $Y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_{i1} + \beta_2 X_{i2} + \varepsilon_i$ . Obtain  $\hat{\beta}_2$ :  $\text{Reg } X_{i2} | X_{i1} : X_{i2} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_{i1} + u_{i2}$ ,  $X_{i2} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_{i1} + \hat{u}_{i2}$ .  
 $\hat{u}_{i2} = X_{iz} - \vec{X}_{iz}^T \hat{\beta}$ ,  $\hat{u}_{i2} = Y_i - \vec{X}_{iz}^T \hat{\beta} + \varepsilon_i$ .  $\hat{u}_{i2} = \alpha + (\vec{X}_{iz} - \vec{X}_{iz}^T \hat{\beta}) \hat{\beta}_2 + \varepsilon_i$ . **Measures-Model-Fit**:  $Y_i = \vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta} + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $R^2 = \frac{\text{Var}(\vec{X}_i \vec{\beta})}{\text{Var}(Y_i)}$ ,  $\text{Var}(Y_i) = \text{Var}(\vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta}) + \text{Var}(\varepsilon_i) \Rightarrow R^2 = 1 - \frac{\text{Var}(\varepsilon_i)}{\text{Var}(Y_i)}$   
 $\hat{R}^2 = \frac{\frac{1}{N} \sum_i (\vec{X}_i \vec{\beta} - \vec{X}_i \hat{\beta})^2}{\frac{1}{N} \sum_i (Y_i - \bar{Y})^2} = 1 - \frac{1}{N} \sum_i (Y_i - \bar{Y})^2$ .  $(Y_{i(1)}, Y_{i(0)}) \perp D | X \Rightarrow \text{CATE}(x) = E[Y_i | D_i=1, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}] - E[Y_i | D_i=0, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}] = E[(Y_{i(1)} - Y_{i(0)}) | \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}]$ ;  $E[Y_i | D_i=1, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}] \approx D_i \beta + \vec{x}^T \vec{\beta}$   
 $\Rightarrow \text{CATE}(x) \approx \beta$ ,  $\text{ATE} \approx \beta$   $\Rightarrow Y_i = D_i \beta + \vec{x}^T \vec{\beta} + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $\hat{\beta}$  estimated ATG. **Fixed-Variables**:  $\sum_{i=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \varepsilon_i \varepsilon_i^T$ . **Omitted-Variable-Bias**: Suppose  $Y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_D D_i + \beta_1 X_{i1} + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $Y_i = \tilde{\beta}_0 + \tilde{\beta}_D D_i + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $\tilde{\beta}_D = \frac{\text{Cov}(Y_i, D_i)}{\text{Var}(D_i)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(\beta_0 + \beta_1 D_i + \beta_2 X_{i1} + \varepsilon_i, D_i)}{\text{Var}(D_i)} = \beta_1 + \frac{\text{Cov}(X_{i1}, D_i)}{\text{Var}(D_i)} = \beta_1$ ,  $\text{Cov}(\varepsilon_i, D_i) = 0$   
 $E[\varepsilon_i] = 0$ ,  $E[D_i E[\varepsilon_i | D_i, X_{i1}]] = 0$ ,  $\tilde{\beta}_D = \frac{\text{Cov}(X_{i1}, D_i)}{\text{Var}(D_i)} \xrightarrow{\text{Omitted}} \tilde{\beta}$  bias  $\uparrow$  if  $X_{i1}$  highly correlated  $\Delta D_i$ ,  $\text{If } \beta_1 = 0 \vee \beta_D = 0 \Rightarrow \text{OVB}$ ,  $\tilde{\beta} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 \frac{\text{Var}(D_i)}{\text{Var}(X_{i1})}$ ,  $\tilde{Y}_i = \beta_0 + \beta_0 D_i + \beta_1 X_{i1} + \beta_2 X_{i2} + \varepsilon_i$   
 $X_{iz} : \tilde{\beta}_D = \beta_D + \beta_2 \vec{X}_{iz}$ ,  $X_{iz} = \beta_0 + \beta_D D_i + \beta_1 X_{i1} + u_i$ . **Heterogeneous I. Effects**:  $\text{CATE}(x) = E[Y_i | D_i=1, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}] - E[Y_i | D_i=0, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}]$ ,  $E[Y_i | D_i=1, \vec{X}_i = \vec{x}] \approx \beta_D + \beta_1 x_{i1} + \vec{x}^T \vec{\beta}$  for someone with  
 $\text{CATE}(x) \approx \beta_D + \beta_0 x_{i1} X_{iz} = x_{i1}$ . For heterogeneity by  $X_{i1}$ :  $Y_i = \beta_0 D_i + \beta_{0X} (D_i X_{i1}) + \vec{x}^T \vec{\beta} + \varepsilon_i$ . **Linear Combination**:  $\sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta} - \vec{\beta}) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \Sigma)$ ,  $g(\vec{\beta}) = \beta_1 + \beta_2 x_{i1}$  continuous  
 $\text{CMT: } \therefore \sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta}_1 + \hat{\beta}_2 x_{i1} - (\beta_1 + \beta_2 x_{i1})) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \sigma_x^2)$ ,  $\sigma_x^2 = \sum_{11} + x_{i1}^2 \sum_{22} + 2x_{i1} \sum_{12}$ . **C.I.**  $\beta_1 + \beta_2 x_{i1}$ :  $\hat{\beta}_1 + \hat{\beta}_2 x_{i1} \pm 1.96 \hat{\sigma}_x / \sqrt{N}$ ,  $\hat{\sigma}_x^2 = \sum_{11} + x_{i1}^2 \sum_{22} + 2x_{i1} \sum_{12}$ . **Multiple Hypothesis I.**: Just  $p\text{-val} = 5\%$   
 $\exists K$  groups.  $N_{\text{sig}} := \# \text{ results} \therefore P(N_{\text{sig}} \geq 1) = 1 - P(N_{\text{sig}} = 0) = 1 - \prod_{i=1}^K P(G_i \text{ sig}) = 1 - (0.95)^K$ . **Bonferroni**:  $T_{\text{test}} = \frac{1}{K} \sum_{i=1}^K T_{\text{test}, i}$ ,  $P(N_{\text{sig}} > 0) \leq \sum_{i=1}^K P(\text{ sig}) = K \left(\frac{0.05}{K}\right) = 0.05$   
**Difference-in-Differences**: Assume  $\exists$  periods  $t=1, 2$ . Treated units treated in period 2; Never treated unit  $i$ .  $Y_{it} = D_i Y_{it}(1) + (1 - D_i) Y_{it}(0)$  ( $Y_{it}$ : Observed outcome | period  $t$ ). **Assumptions**: No-anticipation:  $Y_{i(1)} = Y_{i(2)} \quad (Treatment|_{t=2} \text{ does not influence outcome}|_{t=1})$ , Parallel Trends:  $E[Y_{i(2)}(0) - Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=1] = E[Y_{i(2)}(0) - Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=0] \iff E[Y_{i(2)}(0) | D_i=1] - E[Y_{i(2)}(0) | D_i=0] = E[Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=1] - E[Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=0]$  i.e.  $\Delta$  in  $Y_{i(0)}$  for treated =  $\Delta$  in  $Y_{i(0)}$  for control  $\iff$  Selection Bias:  $|_{t=1} = Selection Bias|_{t=2} \quad (D_i = D) \cdot E[Y_{i(2)} - Y_{i(1)} | D_i=1] - E[Y_{i(2)} - Y_{i(1)} | D_i=0] = E[Y_{i(2)}(1) - Y_{i(1)}(1) | D_i=1] - E[Y_{i(2)}(0) - Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=0] = E[Y_{i(2)}(1) - Y_{i(2)}(0) | D_i=1] + E[Y_{i(2)}(0) - Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=1] - E[Y_{i(2)}(0) - Y_{i(1)}(0) | D_i=0] = E[Y_{i(2)}(1) - Y_{i(2)}(0) | D_i=1] = \tau_{ATT}$  (Average treatment effect on the treated).  $\therefore \tau_{ATT} = \bar{D}_{i=1} - \bar{D}_{i=0}$ . Estimate  $\hat{\tau}_{ATT} = \bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1} - \bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1}$  ( $\bar{y}_{dt}$ : sample mean for units  $D_i=d|_t$ ). **D-i-D-Regression**:  $Y_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 Post_{it} + \beta_2 D_i + \beta_3 Post_{it} \cdot Post_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}$  ( $Post_{it} = 1[t=2]$ ). **CEF**:  
 $E[Y_{it} | D_i=0, Post_{it}=0] = \beta_0$ ,  $E[Y_{it} | D_i=0, Post_{it}=1] = \beta_0 + \beta_1$ ,  $E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=0] = \beta_0 + \beta_2$ ,  $E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=1] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 + \beta_2$ ,  $E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=0] = \beta_0 + \beta_2 + \beta_3$ ,  $E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=1] = \beta_0 + \beta_1 + \beta_2 + \beta_3 = (E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=1] - E[Y_{it} | D_i=1, Post_{it}=0]) - (E[Y_{it} | D_i=0, Post_{it}=1] - E[Y_{it} | D_i=0, Post_{it}=0])$   
 $= \tau_{ATT} \Rightarrow \hat{\beta}_3 = (\bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1}) - (\bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1}) = \hat{\tau}_{ATT}$ . **Multiple Periods**:  $t=-T, \dots, \bar{T}$ , s.t. treatment  $|_{t=1}, \forall t=s \neq 0 : \hat{\beta}_s = (\bar{Y}_{is} - \bar{Y}_{i0}) - (\bar{Y}_{i0} - \bar{Y}_{i0}) = \Delta_{t=s} - \Delta_{t=0}$   
 $\tau_{ATT} = \hat{\beta}_3 = (\bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1}) - (\bar{Y}_{i2} - \bar{Y}_{i1}) = \hat{\tau}_{ATT}$ . **Parallel Trends**:  $\vec{Y}_{it} = \vec{\beta}_0 + \vec{D}_i \vec{\beta}_1 + \sum_{s \neq 0} D_i \times \vec{\beta}_s + \varepsilon_{it}$ . **S.E. for Panel Regressions**:  $\vec{Y}_i = \vec{X}_i^T \vec{\beta} + \varepsilon_i$  for  $(Y_i, \vec{X}_i)$ . Clustered S.E.: Allow  $(Y_{it}, \vec{X}_{it})$  to be correlated if in same cluster i.e.  $\{Y_{i1}, Y_{i2}, \dots\} \perp\!\!\!\perp \{Y_{j1}, Y_{j2}, \dots\}_{j \neq i}$ . **Instrumental Variables**: Let  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta X_i + \varepsilon_i$  We do not assume  $\text{Cov}(X_i, \varepsilon_i) = 0$   
Assume  $\exists Z_i$  that affects  $Y_i$  only through its effect on  $X_i$ . Randomization  $\Rightarrow \text{Cov}(Z_i, \varepsilon_i) = 0$ ,  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, Y_i) = \text{Cov}(Z_i, \alpha + \beta X_i + \varepsilon_i) = \beta \text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)$   
 $\therefore$  if  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i) \neq 0 \Rightarrow \beta = \text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)$  (identified).  $\therefore Z_i$  instrument  $\sim X_i$ ,  $\beta = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)}{\text{Var}(Z_i)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)}{\text{Var}(Z_i)} = \frac{\rho}{\pi}$ ,  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta Z_i + \varepsilon_i$  (Reduced Form Reg) and  $X_i = \mu + \pi Z_i + \eta_i$  (First Stage Reg)  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, \eta_i) = \text{Cov}(Z_i, \eta_i) = 0$ . If  $Z_i$  binary:  $\rho = \frac{\rho}{\pi} = \frac{E[Y_i | Z_i=1] - E[Y_i | Z_i=0]}{E[X_i | Z_i=1] - E[X_i | Z_i=0]}$  first-stage effect, Validity-Condition:  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, \varepsilon_i) = 0$   
(i) **As-good-as-random assignment**: Individuals with higher/lower potential outcome do not face systematically different values of  $Z_i$ . **Exclusion**: the "assignment" of  $Z_i$  only affects  $Y_i$  through  $X_i$ :  $Z_i \xrightarrow{\beta} X_i \xrightarrow{\varepsilon} Y_i$ . **Measurement-Error**:  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta X_i^* + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $\text{Cov}(X_i^*, \varepsilon_i) = 0$  but only observe  $X_i = X_i^* + \eta_i$ ; where  $\text{Cov}(X_i^*, \eta_i) = \text{Cov}(X_i^*, \varepsilon_i) = 0$ ,  $\frac{\text{Cov}(X_i^*, \eta_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(X_i^* + \eta_i, \alpha + \beta X_i^* + \varepsilon_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*)} = \beta \frac{\text{Var}(X_i^*)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*) + \text{Var}(\eta_i)} \xrightarrow{\text{Var}(X_i^*) \ll \text{Var}(\eta_i)}$  Attenuation-Bias:  $\frac{\text{Cov}(X_i^*, \eta_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(X_i^* + \eta_i, X_i^* + \eta_i + \varepsilon_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*)} = \frac{\beta \text{Var}(X_i^*)}{\text{Var}(X_i^*) + \text{Var}(\eta_i)} = \beta$ . For  $Z_i$  binary:  $\beta = \frac{\hat{\beta}}{\bar{X}_{i=1} - \bar{X}_{i=0}}$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{\rho}{\pi}$ ,  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, Y_i)}{\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)}$   
 $\hat{\beta} = \hat{\rho} + \hat{\rho} Z_i + \hat{\rho} \bar{Z}_i + \hat{\rho} \bar{Z}_i^2$ ,  $X_i = \mu + \pi Z_i + \eta_i$ ,  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, \varepsilon_i) \wedge \text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i) \neq 0$  identification:  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, Y_i)}{\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)} = \frac{\hat{\beta}}{\hat{\rho}}$ . For inference:  $\sqrt{N}(\hat{\beta} - \beta) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \sigma^2)$ . **I.V. Covariates**: Assume  $\text{Cov}(Z_i, W_i) = 0$   
 $\hat{\beta} = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, Y_i)}{\text{Cov}(Z_i, X_i)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(Z_i, Y_i)}{\text{Cov}(Z_i, Z_i) - \text{Cov}(Z_i, W_i)} = \frac{\hat{\beta}}{\hat{\rho} - \hat{\rho} \bar{W}_i}$ . For binary  $Z_i$ :  $E[X_i | Z_i=1, W_i] - E[X_i | Z_i=0, W_i] = \hat{\rho}$ .  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi} = \frac{Y_i = k + \rho Z_i + \bar{W}_i^T \bar{\beta} + \varepsilon_i, X_i = \mu + \pi Z_i + \bar{W}_i^T \bar{\beta} + \eta_i, \sqrt{N}((\frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}) - (\frac{\rho}{\pi})) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \sigma^2)}$   
**Delta-Methode**:  $g(\hat{\rho}, \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}) = \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}$ . For  $(\hat{\rho}, \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}) \approx (\rho, \pi)$  (Taylor):  $g(\hat{\rho}, \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}) \approx g(\rho, \pi) + \nabla g(\rho, \pi)(\hat{\rho} - \rho, \frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi} - \pi)^T \xrightarrow{\text{Cov}} \sqrt{N}(\frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi} - \frac{\rho}{\pi}) \approx \nabla g(\rho, \pi) \sqrt{N}((\frac{\hat{\rho}}{\pi}) - (\frac{\rho}{\pi})) \rightarrow N(0, \sigma^2)$   
 $= N(0, \nabla g(\rho, \pi) \sum_i \nabla g(\rho, \pi)^T)$ . **Multiple Instruments**:  $Z_{i1}, \dots, Z_{iL}$  (Multiple  $Z_{il}$  can test-validity). If  $Z_i$ : a-g-a-r-a prior to the realization of some treatment  $X_i$ , w/ outcome  $Y_i$ , then  $Z_i$  valid for estimating effect  $X_i$  on  $Y_i$ : False: We also need exclusion restriction. (2) If the pre-trends of a treat. n. control group are not statistically significantly diff. then a D-i-D identifies a causal effect: False: We also need trends stay parallel in post period. (3) If  $f(x) = E[Y_i | X_i=x]$  linear, then Reg  $Y_i | X_i$  identifies it: True. 4) Let  $D_i, Y_i, W_i$  (binary).  $(Y_{i(1)}, Y_{i(0)}) \perp\!\!\!\perp D_i | W_i$ . Let  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta D_i + \gamma W_i + \delta D_i W_i$ . Show: the coefficients capture the CEF  $E[Y_i | D_i=d | W_i=w]$ :  $E[Y_i | D_i=0, W_i=0] = \alpha$ ,  $E[Y_i | D_i=1, W_i=0] = \alpha + \beta$ ,  $E[Y_i | D_i=0, W_i=1] = \alpha + \gamma$ ,  $E[Y_i | D_i=1, W_i=1] = \alpha + \beta + \gamma + \delta$

$\beta = E[Y_i | D_i=1, W_i=0] - E[Y_i | D_i=0, W_i=0]$ , by  $D_i | W_i \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_{i(1)}, Y_{i(0)}) \Rightarrow \beta = E[Y_{i(1)} - Y_{i(0)} | W_i=0]$  (some CATE). (4) To estimate the effect of a state-level policy  $\Delta$  by  $D_i$ - $D$ , There must be a panel dataset where we observe the same people over time: False: we only need average outcomes by status and time. So a "repeated cross-section" dataset which samples diff. people over time is enough. (5) If you double rows in a dataset OLS coefficients & robust standard errors do not change: First: Coeff. don't change but SE  $\downarrow$  by  $\sqrt{2}$  unless you cluster by the original identifier.

(6) Suppose  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta X_i^2 + \varepsilon_i$ ,  $E[\varepsilon_i | X_i] = 0$ ,  $X_i \sim N(0, 1)$ . (If  $Z_i \sim N \Rightarrow E[(Z_i - E[Z_i])^3] = 0$ ) (a) Show that Reg. of  $Y_i$  on a constant,  $X_i, X_i^2$  identifies  $\alpha, \beta$ :  $E[Y_i | X_i, X_i^2] = E[\alpha + \beta X_i^2 + \varepsilon_i | X_i, X_i^2] = \alpha + \beta X_i^2 + E[\varepsilon_i | X_i] = \alpha + \beta X_i^2$  is linear  $\therefore$  a regression identifies the CEF parameters  $(\alpha, \beta)$ , (b) Derive slope coeff. in a bivariate regression of  $Y_i$  on a constant and  $X_i$ :  $\frac{\text{Cov}(Y_i, X_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)} = \frac{\text{Cov}(\alpha + \beta X_i^2 + \varepsilon_i, X_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)} = \beta \frac{\text{Cov}(X_i^2, X_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)}$ ,  $\text{Cov}(X_i^2, X_i) = E[(X_i^2 - E[X_i^2])(X_i - E[X_i])] = E[(X_i - E[X_i])^2]$

Show  $\alpha + \beta$  identified by the constant of the bivariate regression in (b):  $E[Y_i] - \frac{\text{Cov}(Y_i, X_i)}{\text{Var}(X_i)} E[X_i] = E[Y_i] = \alpha + \beta E[X_i^2] + E[\varepsilon_i] = \alpha + \beta$ , since  $E[X_i^2] = 1$ ,  $E[\varepsilon_i] = E[E[\varepsilon_i | X_i]] = 0$ .

(7) Consider  $Y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_1 X_{1i} + \beta_2 X_{2i} + \varepsilon_i$ ;  $X_{1i} = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 X_{2i} + \nu_i$ ,  $X_{2i} = \delta_0 + \delta_1 X_{1i} + w_i$ ,  $\beta$  coincides with slope parameter in the regression of  $Y_i$  onto  $(1, W_i)$ . (8) The OLS estimator for  $\vec{\beta} = (\beta_1, \beta_2)^T$  in (7) is asymptotically normal as the sample size  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $\sqrt{n}(\hat{\beta} - \vec{\beta}) \xrightarrow{d} N(0, \Sigma)$ ,  $\Sigma = \begin{pmatrix} \sigma_{11}^2 & \sigma_{12}^2 \\ \sigma_{21}^2 & \sigma_{22}^2 \end{pmatrix}$ , the asymptotic variance of  $\sqrt{n}[(\hat{\beta}_1 - \hat{\beta}_2) - (\beta_1 - \beta_2)]$  is:  $\sqrt{n}((\frac{\hat{\beta}_1}{\hat{\beta}_2}) - (\frac{\beta_1}{\beta_2})) \xrightarrow{d} Z_1$ ,  $\sqrt{n}[(\hat{\beta}_1 - \hat{\beta}_2) - (\beta_1 - \beta_2)] \xrightarrow{d} Z_1 - Z_2$ ,  $\text{Var}(Z_1 - Z_2) = \text{Var}(Z_1) - 2 \text{Cov}(Z_1, Z_2) + \text{Var}(Z_2) = \sigma_1^2 - 2\sigma_{12} + \sigma_2^2$

(9) (a)  $\exists$  Panel Data  $(Y_{it}, D_i)$ ,  $t = -4, \dots, 4$ , treatment  $|_{t=1}$ ,  $D_i$  binary. State assumption needed to identify ATT using  $D_i$ - $D$ : No anticipation: future treatment does not causally affect the current potential outcomes, Parallel Trends: The average time trend of the control outcomes are common between treated and control groups ( $E[Y_{it=0} - Y_{it-1=0} | D_i=1] = E[Y_{it=0} - Y_{it-1=0}] | D_i=0]$ )

(b) Why should we use the clustered SE in the construction of C.I.  $\forall t$ : Panel Data  $(Y_{it}, D_i)$  are not iid over time  $\therefore$  we should use CSE to take into account dependence across the observations. (c)  $\exists$  plot of treatment & control against time. i.e. log(monthly earnings) vs Months since programming class. Write a regression s.t. OLS estimates will yield the event-study coefficients:  $Y_{it} = \alpha + \sum_{s \neq 0} \beta_s \cdot 1\{t=s\} + \gamma D_i + \sum_{s \neq 0} \delta_s D_i \cdot 1\{t=s\} + \varepsilon_{it}$

(10) Let  $Y_i$ : i's earnings as an adult,  $D_i$ : indicator if grew up in a high-poverty neighborhood, Consider collecting a survey to ask earnings and if they grew up poor, We collect  $\bar{X}_i$  about family's background. What should  $\bar{X}_i$  include to make conditional unconfoundedness assumption somewhat plausible? (Wealth of parents, education of parents, race, etc). (b) Suppose you are given a dataset with  $(Y_i, D_i, \bar{X}_i)$  Write OLS specification that you might run to estimate the causal effect under cond. unconfoundedness, and a CATG:  $E[Y_{i(1)} - Y_{i(0)} | X_i=x]$  linear in  $x$ :  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta D_i + \bar{X}_i \gamma + D_i \cdot \bar{X}_i \delta + \varepsilon_i$ . CATE  $\approx \hat{\beta} + \bar{X}^T \hat{\delta}$

(c)  $Z_i$ : voucher to move to better neighborhood,  $Z_i=1$  if lost lottery,  $Z_i=1$  if won,  $D_i=1$  poor,  $D_i=0$  non-poor.

	$Z=1$	$Z=0$	
High-Poverty (mean)	0.5	0.4	Calculate an I.V. instrument for growing up in a poor neighborhood in income. First-Stage: $0.5 - 0.4$
Income mean	11,000 $\{\$0, 13\}$	11,300	Reduced-form: $11,000 - 11,300 = -300 \therefore$ I.V. estimator = $\frac{-300}{0.1} = -3000$ . First Stage

First Stage:  $D_i = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 Z_i + \nu_i$ , Reduced-form:  $Y_i = \rho_0 + \rho_1 Z_i + U_i$ , I.V. estimand is:  $\beta = \frac{\rho_1}{\gamma_1}$

(11)  $M_i$ : military service,  $Y_i$ : mental-health at 40's.  $Y_i = \alpha + \beta M_i + \vec{A}_i^T \vec{\gamma} + \varepsilon_i$ .  $A_i \in \mathbb{R}^J$ : characteristics relevant to mental health

**Estimand:** non-random, it is a function of the population distribution. When estimand and (target) parameter coincide  $\Rightarrow$  **identification**. Ex: 1)  $Y = a + X^3/b$ ,  $b > 0$ ,  $X \sim N(0, 1)$ ,  $F_{a,b}(y) = P(Y \leq y)$ ,  $Y \leq y \Leftrightarrow a + X^3/b \leq y \Leftrightarrow X \leq \sqrt[3]{b(y-a)}$   $\therefore P(Y \leq y) = \Phi(\sqrt[3]{b(y-a)})$ ,  $E[Y] = E(a + X^3/b) = a$  given  $E[X^3] = 0$  for  $X \sim N(0, 1)$   $\therefore \text{Cov}(Y, X) = E[XY]$   $\in [ax + X^4/b]$ ,  $E[X^4] = 3$  for  $X \sim N(0, 1)$   $\therefore \text{Cov}(X, Y) = abE[X] + \frac{3}{b} = \frac{3}{b}$ ;  $P(Y > 0) = 1 - \Phi(\sqrt[3]{b(0-a)}) = 1 - \Phi(0) = 0.5$

let  $W = a + X^3/b + Z$ ,  $Z$  mean-independent of  $X$ .  $\therefore E[W|X] = a + X^3/b + E[Z|W] = Y$

Need:

Ex 2:  $f(x; \rho) = \sum_{i=1-p, x=0}^p \{X_i\}^N$ :  $E[X_i] = \sum_{x=0}^N x f(x; \rho) = \rho$ . Natural estimator of  $E[X_i]$ :  $\hat{\rho} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i$ . Consistency:  $\text{Var}(\hat{\rho}) \xrightarrow{P} 0$   $\therefore$

$\text{Var}(\hat{\rho}) = \text{Var}\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i\right) = \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_i \text{Var}(X_i) = \frac{p(1-p)}{N} \xrightarrow{P} 0$ . Unbiased as  $E[\hat{\rho}] = \rho$ . Ex 3:  $\{X_i\}^N \sim \text{iid } \text{Exp}(\lambda) = \begin{cases} \lambda e^{-\lambda x}, & x \geq 0 \\ 0, & x < 0 \end{cases}$ ,  $E[X_i] = \frac{1}{\lambda}$   $\therefore \hat{\lambda} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i \therefore E[\hat{\lambda}] = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i E[X_i] = \frac{1}{\lambda}$ ,  $\text{Var}[X_i] = E[X_i^2] - E[X_i]^2 = \left(\int_0^\infty x^2 \lambda e^{-\lambda x} dx\right) - \left(\frac{1}{\lambda}\right)^2 = -x^2 e^{-\lambda x} \Big|_0^\infty + 2 \int x e^{-\lambda x} dx - \frac{1}{\lambda^2} = \frac{1}{\lambda^2}$

$\therefore \text{Var}(\hat{\lambda}) = \frac{1}{N^2} \sum_i \text{Var}(X_i) = \frac{1}{N\lambda^2}$ , By CLT:  $\sqrt{N}(\hat{\lambda} - \frac{1}{\lambda}) \xrightarrow{D} N(0, \frac{1}{\lambda^2})$ . Estimator for  $\frac{1}{\lambda^2} = \bar{X}_n^2$ ,  $\hat{\lambda} = \bar{X}_n$ , By LLN:  $\bar{X}_n \xrightarrow{P} E[X] = \frac{1}{\lambda}$

By CMT, since  $g(x) = x^2$  continuous  $\Rightarrow \frac{1}{\lambda^2} \xrightarrow{P} \frac{1}{\lambda^2}$  (consistent). Ex 4:  $\text{Cov}(aX, bY) = ab \text{Cov}(X, Y)$ ,  $\text{std}(aX) = a \text{std}(X)$

$\text{std}(bY) = b \text{std}(Y) \Rightarrow \text{Corr}(aX, bY) = \text{Corr}(X, Y)$ , Ex 5:  $Y \perp\!\!\!\perp X \Rightarrow E[Y^3|X] = E(Y^3)E(X)$ , by LIE

$E[Y^3|X] = E[E[Y^3|X]|X] = E[X E[Y^3|X]] = E[X E[Y^3]] = E[X] E[Y^3]$ . Ex 6:  $(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i)^2$  consistent for  $E[X_i]^2$ : By LLN:  $\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i \xrightarrow{P} E[X_i]$

$f(x) = x^2$  continuous  $\Rightarrow$  By CMT:  $f\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i\right) \xrightarrow{P} f(E[X_i])$ . Ex 7:  $D_i = \begin{cases} 1, & \text{outcomes } Y_i(1), Y_i(0) \\ 0, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$ , assume  $D_i \perp\!\!\!\perp (Y_i(1), Y_i(0))$

Prove that diff in  $Y_i$  identifies CATE:  $E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i(1)|D_i=1] - E[Y_i(0)|D_i=0] = E[Y_i(1)] - E[Y_i(0)] = E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)]$ ,  $Y_i = D_i Y_i(1) + (1-D_i) Y_i(0)$ , Suppose  $\tilde{Y}_i = Y_i + e_i$ ,  $e_i \perp\!\!\!\perp D_i : E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=1] - E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i + e_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i + e_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] + E[e_i|D_i=1] - E[e_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0]$

$E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)]$ . Therefore:  $E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=1] - E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=0] = E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=1] - E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] = E[Y_i(1) - Y_i(0)]$ . CATE Identified. Consider the sample means  $\tilde{Y}_i$  is this consistent estimate of CATE? Yes, by LLN each sample mean is consistent  $E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=1]$ . By CMT we have a consistent estimator for  $E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=1] - E[\tilde{Y}_i|D_i=0] = \beta$  under identifying assumptions. Assume we observe a difference in sample means of  $\tilde{Y}_i = 10,000$  with  $SE = 4500$ , what can you conclude about  $E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0]$ ? T-stat:  $\frac{10,000}{4,500} > 2 \therefore$  by our usual asymptotic approximation we can reject  $H_0$  with 95% confidence. Estimate is statistically significant at 5% level.

Ex 8: Suppose  $\{Y_i, X_i\}^N$ ,  $Y_i = \beta X_i + \varepsilon_i$  for some  $\beta$  parameter. Suppose  $E(\varepsilon_i|X_i) = 0$

$E(X_i) \neq 0$ , show  $\beta$  id. by  $E[Y_i]/E[X_i]$ :  $E[Y_i]/E[X_i] = E(\beta X_i + \varepsilon_i)/E(X_i) = \beta E(X_i)/E(X_i) + E(\varepsilon_i)/E(X_i) = \beta + E(\varepsilon_i)/E(X_i)$ . By LIE:  $E(E(\varepsilon_i|X_i)) = E(\varepsilon_i) = 0 \Rightarrow E(\varepsilon_i)/E(X_i) = \beta$  (identification). Show  $\hat{\beta} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i/X_i$  consistent for  $\beta$ .

By LLN:  $\frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i \xrightarrow{P} E(Y_i)$ ,  $\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i \xrightarrow{P} E(X_i)$ , By CMT:  $\frac{\frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i}{\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i} \xrightarrow{P} \frac{E(Y_i)}{E(X_i)} = \beta$ . Show  $\hat{\beta}$  unbiased estimate of  $\beta$

$E(\hat{\beta}) = E(E(\hat{\beta}|X_1, \dots, X_N)) = E\left(E\left[\frac{1}{N} \sum_i Y_i\right]|X_1, \dots, X_N\right) \left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i\right) = E\left(\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i E[Y_i|X_i]\right)\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i\right)\right) = E\left(\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i (\beta X_i + E[\varepsilon_i|X_i])\right)\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i\right)\right)$

$E[\beta(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i)/(\frac{1}{N} \sum_i X_i)] = \beta$ . Inference: Process of learning about observable features of the full population from a random sample. Identification: Process of learning about causal parameters from population estimands

A treatment  $D_i$  randomly assigned is independent of potential outcomes  $Y_i(1) \wedge Y_i(0)$ . But since  $Y_i = Y_i(1) + (Y_i(1) - Y_i(0))D_i$  it is not independent of  $Y_i$  unless there are no treatment effects" i.e.  $Y_i(1) - Y_i(0) = 0 \forall i$ .

Ex 9:  $D_i$ ,  $Y_i$  outcome of interest,  $W_i$ : another observed variable. Suppose CATE of  $D_i$  on  $Y_i$  constant  $\therefore Y_i(1) - Y_i(0) = \beta$ . Show  $Y_i = \beta D_i + \varepsilon_i$  for

some unobserved  $\varepsilon_i$ .  $Y_i = Y_i(0)(1-D_i) + Y_i(1)D_i = (Y_i(1) - Y_i(0))D_i + Y_i(0) = \beta D_i + \varepsilon_i \Rightarrow \varepsilon_i = Y_i(0)$ . Suppose we think  $D_i$  not randomly assigned. Show that:  $E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] = \beta + b$ , we have  $E[Y_i|D_i=1] - E[Y_i|D_i=0] = E(\beta D_i + \varepsilon_i|D_i=1) - E(\beta D_i + \varepsilon_i|D_i=0) = (\beta + E(\varepsilon_i|D_i=1)) - E(\varepsilon_i|D_i=0) = \beta + (E(\varepsilon_i|D_i=1) - E(\varepsilon_i|D_i=0)) = \beta + b$ ,  $b \neq 0$  whenever treated individuals have

different untreated potential outcomes, on average, than untreated individuals. Suppose  $\varepsilon_i = \mu + \lambda W_i$ , What does  $E[W_i|D_i=1] = E[W_i|D_i=0]$  mean for the id. of  $\beta$ :  $b = E[-\lambda W_i|D_i=1] - E[\mu + \lambda W_i|D_i=0] = \lambda(E[W_i|D_i=1] - E[W_i|D_i=0]) = 0$  (i.e.  $\beta$  is identified).

