Changing the "cut rule" to "remove after loosing the k-th son"

Problem 1. Let us redefine the rule used by the Fibonacci heap algorithm for disconnecting a node from it's tree. We disconnect a node from it's tree when for the first time it looses it's k-th son. Prove that if k is a fixed number then every tree in the Fibonacci heap has degree bounded by $O(\log(n))$, where n is the size of the tree.

Answer: We will prove that the size of the tree is exponentially large in the degree of the root. Let S_l denote the minimum size of a tree whose root's degree is l, when applying the new rule (notice that this S_l is different for different values of k). We are looking for a number c > 1 for which we can prove $S_l \ge c^l$ (for k = 2 it is proven in the book that c can be chosen to be ϕ). First we generalize the lemma used in the book.

Lemma 1. Let $y_1, y_2, ..., y_l$ be the sons of some root tree, then the degree of y_i which we denote by d_i is at least i - k.

Proof. similar to the book (strait forward).

We will leave the value of c to be fixed later, for now we rely on the fact that c will be a fixed constant greater than 1 (of course we will have to verify that it when we will fix c). Using the lemma we derive:

$$S_l \ge 1 + k + \sum_{i=k+1}^{l} S_i = 1 + k + \sum_{i=1}^{l-k} S_i$$

We will prove that $S_l \geq c^l$ by induction on l. We will now use the induction step:

$$S_l \ge 1 + k + \sum_{i=1}^{l-k} S_i \ge 1 + k + \sum_{i=1}^{l-k} c^i \ge 1 + k + \frac{c^{l-k+1} - c}{c-1}$$

The last inequality uses the formula for the sum of a geometric finite sequence. To prove the induction step we have to show that:

$$1 + k + \frac{c^{l-k+1} - c}{c-1} \ge c^l$$

(for every $l \ge 1$), but this depends on the value of c. Now we have to choose c in a clever way so that the inequality holds. It is enough to fix c so the following two inequalities holds (summing them will give the above inequality):

1.
$$1 + k - \frac{c}{c-1} \ge 0$$

2.
$$\frac{c^{l-k+1}}{c-1} \geq c^l$$
 (or equivalently $\frac{c^{-k+1}}{c-1} \geq 1)$

We choose c = 1 + 1/k so the first inequality holds as equality. Now we have to verify that the second equality is satisfied by our choice. After substituting c = 1 + 1/k the second inequality becomes $c^{k-1} < k$.

$$c^{k-1} < c^k = (1+1/k)^k < e < 3 \le k$$

(we assume $k \geq 3$ as the case k = 2 is handled in the book)

Remarks: notice that c > 1 as required. We need also to check the base of the induction l = 1, in this case $S_1 \ge 2 > c$.