

A Study of Blockchain Consensus Mechanisms with Emphasis on Proof-of-Reputation

Yidi XING^{1*}

, Omar HASAN¹

, Sonia BEN MOKHTAR¹

, Tarek AWWAD¹

, Lionel BRUNIE¹

and Harald KOSCH²

Correspondence:
 xing@insa-lyon.fr
 LIRIS Laboratory, National
 Institute of Applied Sciences of
 Lyon, 20 avenue Albert Einstein,
 69100 Villeurbanne, FR
 Full list of author information is
 available at the end of the article

Abstract

- The emergence of blockchain technology enables people to build a distributed, decentralized and tamper-proof account book through a trust free P2P network. This technology has broad application prospects in the fields of digital assets, remittances, online payment and other financial services. Systems based on blockchain technologies combined the application of P2P network, public key cryptography, hash pointer and cryptographic hash function to ensure the decentralization, persistence, tamper resistance, forgery resistance and auditability of the system.

- What is block

- Users, as distrustful parties, can agree on the existence, value and transaction history of each other's accounts by maintaining consistency on the global blockchain network. This feature of blockchain network makes it possible to greatly save transaction costs, especially financial transaction costs, and improve transaction processing efficiency. It also allows financial services without the support of any banks or intermediaries.

- The feature

- In the area of blockchains, consensus algorithms are the key elements in each blockchain P2P network, because they are responsible for maintaining the integrity and security of these distributed systems and ensuring that the system can operate on a trust-free basis. Consensus algorithms can be defined as a mechanism to achieve agreement in blockchain networks. Blockchain systems have decentralized attributes and are constructed as distributed systems. Since they do not rely on a central authority, decentralized nodes need to agree on the validity of transactions, which is the function of consensus algorithms. Consensus algorithm ensures that all nodes comply with the rules defined by the system designer and that all transactions are conducted in a reliable manner. For example, in the field of cryptocurrency, each token coin used for trading can only be spent once.

- What is block

Abstract

- What the re

• While trying to balance security with functionality and scalability, each consensus protocol shows its own advantages and disadvantages. In this paper, we will focus on the analysis and comparison of different types of consensus protocols. In the second section, we first present the general design model of the hierarchical block chain system we envisage. We will further reveal the importance of the consensus layer by showing its importance, utility and potential interaction with other layers. Then in sections III and IV, we analyze and compare fourteen different consensus protocols. In the fifth, sixth and seventh sections, we will focus on an innovative concept of consensus protocols: proof-of-reputation protocols (PoR). PoR introduces the concept of reputation into the consensus process. We first introduce the general design model of PoR. Then we enumerate five existing por projects, compare and analyze their ideas, advantages and disadvantages, and try to provide possible trends for the future development of proof-of-reputation protocols.

Keywords: blockchain; consensus protocol; proof-of-reputation; decentralization

Declaration

Availability of data and materials

The blockchain systems data that support the findings of this study are available from “bitcointalk.org”, “www.coingecko.com/fr/pièces/”, “www.feixiaohao.com”, “coincheckup.com”, “blocktivity.info”, “bitinfocharts.com”, “www.reedit.com/r/Vechain/comments/97zmoy”.

Also, the next reported blockchain systems data were used to support this study and are available at “Practical Byzantine fault tolerance”, “Bitcoin: A peer-to-peer electronic cash system”, “https://blackcoin.co/blackcoin-pos-protocol-v2-whitepaper.pdf”, “DBFT: Efficient byzantine consensus with a weak coordinator and its application to consortium blockchains”, “The ripple protocol consensus algorithm”, “On security analysis of proof-of-elapsed-time (poet)”, “Slimcoin: A peer-to-peer crypto-currency with proof-of-burn”, “Proofs of space”, “Delegated proof-of-stake (dpos)”, “Komodo: An Advanced Blockchain Technology, Focused on Freedom”, “Komodo: An Advanced Blockchain Technology, Focused

on Freedom”, “Solana: A new architecture for a high performance blockchain
v0.8.13”, “Pbft vs proof-of-authority: applying the cap theorem to permis-
sioned blockchain”, “Algorand: Scaling byzantine agreements for cryptocurrencies”,
“gochain.io/assets/gochain-whitepaper-v2.1.2.pdf”, “Blockchain: The State of the
Art and Future Trends”. These prior studies (and datasets) are cited at relevant
places within the text as references [8-11, 13-23].

Competing interests statement

The authors declare that they have no competing financial interests.

Fundings

//TO DO

Authors’ contributions

Y has drafted the work. Y was the major contributor in writing the manuscript
and also substantively revised it. O and SB have made substantial contributions
to the conception and the design of the work. O and SB have also substantively
revised the manuscript. L and H have drafted the work, and have made important
contributions to the conception of the work. T have made important contributions
on the substantive amendments. All authors read and approved the final manuscript
thus the submitted version.

1 Introduction

Blockchain technology was first implemented by Nakamoto with Bitcoin applica-
tions in 2009[9]. It combines the application of encrypted hash functions, digital
signature, Merkle tree, consensus protocol and peer-to-peer (P2P) network, so as
to build a distributed and decentralized system based on trust-free P2P network.
It could be used not only for financial trading systems[1],[2], but also Scientific
research, resource management[3],[4], political domain[6],[7], etc. Using blockchain
technologies, we can build a distributed database system based on distributed P2P
network. The system could record a public account book, or called a “public ledger”
– this ledger sorts groups of transactions in chronological order and uses encrypted
hash function such as SHA256 to encryptedly link each group of transactions. Those
sets of transactions in the record are stored in a specific data structure, which we

- The composition of a b

50 call a data block. As new transactions continue to be completed, they are packaged
51 into data blocks, which are submitted to the end of the list of data blocks on the
52 public ledger. That's also why we call this technology blockchain.

53 The information contained in the ledger shows transaction history up to the cur-
54 rent time through block chains. These transaction records prove the existence and
55 value of each account. Therefore, in a decentralized block chain system, every up-
56 date of the ledger must be authenticated by each account holder in the network. Of
57 course, this means that there is a need for consensus among participants. In the real
58 world, we may not be able to find application examples with the same limitations.
59 For example, when an entity (bank or country) decides to issue legitimate digital
60 currency, it does not need to establish a public ledger that must be confirmed in
61 real time by each currency holder, because the entity, as the central agency, is re-
62 sponsible for the verification needed to use such digital currency for transactions
63 and ensures the security of transactions. In blockchain networks, this is not the
64 case: nodes operate independently. In order to reach consensus, it is essential and
65 necessary for nodes to communicate with each other through the network.

66 It can be imagined that in such a distributed system, there will be many kinds of
67 errors in the process of sending messages between nodes. We can generally divide
68 them into two types: the first is the error including node crash, data packet loss and
69 network failure. The characteristics of these errors are that the nodes themselves
70 are not malicious to the system. We call them "non-Byzantine errors". The second
71 type of errors refers to the arbitrary actions of the nodes and deliberate violations
72 of the rules of action formulated by the system designers. At this point, the wrong
73 node may itself be malicious. The behaviors include sending messages with different
74 contents at the same time to different nodes, delaying or rejecting messages in
75 networks, deliberate attempts to submit illegal transaction records, and so on. Such
76 errors are called "Byzantine errors". In serious cases, there may be collaboration
77 between malicious nodes, making Byzantine errors a serious problem.

78 The consensus protocol is designed to build a distributed blockchain system
79 a Byzantine fault-tolerant system. In the face of two mentioned types of errors,
80 the design of a qualified consensus protocol can keep the consistency and the live-
81 ness of system. Consistency means that honest and harmless system participants
82 agree on records in the public ledger. The liveness represents that the ledger can

- Features blo

- An introductio

- Introduction of the

83 be updated continuously, efficiently and effectively. There are a lot of practices of
 84 consensus protocols: Bitcoin which made successes on marketing, uses the Proof-of-
 85 Work protocol where users profit from computing proofs. They randomly find the
 86 node determining the next block[9]; or PoS protocol[10], which is used by Peercoin,
 87 where users profit there locked stake within the blockchain system prove that they
 88 are trustworthy, and to compete to win the right of generating subsequent blocks;
 89 or as PBFT protocols, all nodes identity should be known under this configuration.
 90 All nodes have equivalent voting rights, and they consumes numerous rounds of
 91 communications to reach consensus[8]. In this paper, we will focus on consensus
 92 protocols. First, we will give a general blockchain model which is widely used in
 93 practice. Next, we will introduce fourteen different consensus protocols that have
 94 been applied in practical projects, and analyze and compare them. Finally, we will
 95 mention a new and noteworthy consensus protocol concept, proof-of-reputation. We
 96 will focus on its introduction and analysis, and explain its unique advantages. The
 97 rest of this paper is organized as follows. Section II introduces the general design
 98 model for blockchain system. Section III shows the state-of-art of fourteen different
 99 consensus protocols. Section IV summarizes the precedent ones by giving tables
 100 and explanations showing the analysis results of those protocols, with a detailed
 101 explanation for these table and figures. Section V introduces the idea of proof-of-
 102 reputation, explains its idea, its operation principles, its general model, advantages
 103 and disadvantages. Section VI is an another state-of-art section where we list and
 104 present five different existing por blockchain projects. Section VII concludes.

105 II Background

106 In this section, we will introduce a general, layered and modular blockchain sys-
 107 tem model. It can be regarded as a template for blockchain projects that are now
 108 in operation. We will explain its composition, analyze which functional units the
 109 system consists of, which functions and operations the system supports, and which
 110 technologies the system uses to achieve them. The model in this section is inspired
 111 by the work of Yuan et al.[23]. Some changes have been made in the specific content,
 112 then in the layers and modules division. This basic model will consist of five layers:
 113 the data layer, the network layer, the consensus layer, the incentive schemes and
 114 the application layer.