**Peer review sheet**

MAFS6010Z, 2021 fall

Your name and sid: Liu Shifei 20734530

Group that you review: Group 5

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Confidence on your assessment (1-3) | Clarity and quality of writing (1-5) | Technical quality  (1-5) | Overall rating  (1-5) |
| Score | 2 | 5 | 4 | 4 |

Summary:

The report follows the same method in the paper with only slight changes about CNN. Details are discussed in Architecture section in the report. The same cross entropy loss is applied. Moreover, data are divided into train, validation and test, following instructions in the paper. It only reproduces the result of 20-day return, which is OK. The paper gets 53.3% accuracy while the report gets 55.95%. The report demonstrates that changes in learning rate or weight decay do not affect accuracy performance significantly.

Strengths:

There are some ablation studies on the learning rate and weight decay. This is not included in the original paper, which makes the work novel. The report also contains a visualization section. Although the analysis is preliminary, it demonstrates that the author is capable of programming using Grad-CAM method.

Weaknesses:

In addition to sensitivities with respect to learning rate and weight decay, there can be sensitivities concerning alternate choices in model architecture, such as varying the number of layers or trying different CNN models. These may require larger modifications in the code and may take more time to experiment.

Clarity and writing:

The report clearly states the method applied, with appropriate details. For ablation studies, it contains discussions/conclusions on the results. All results are shown as pictures or diagrams. It also has references in the appendix.

Technical quality:

Overall, the technical quality is good. The author finishes the same process as discussed in the paper. The code is complete and runnable. The ablation and visualization studies show that the author is able to add some extensions on top of the original CNN model.