

TUTORIAL 6: THE WELCOME - WRITING A CRITICAL REFLECTION

ICONS TO HELP YOU NAVIGATE THE COURSE HANDOUTS



Whole class discussion



Team/Group discussion



Take/make notes



Impromptu talk topic (speak for 1 min)

Learning objectives:

- Give constructive feedback using the hamburger technique
- Mine for meaning
 - Beyond surface level vs reading too much into a text
- Write a critical reflection



1. GIVING CONSTRUCTIVE COMMENTS - HOT

HOT is an acronym to help you to structure peer feedback. It stands for:

H = holistic comment – start with something positive about the whole short talk or presentation, H = hamburger also

O = one constructive comments – remember Ennis says be respectful and sensitive about how we convey critical analysis to others.

T = tact – and here we just want to double underscore the importance of respect and sensitivity – so tact refers to tone and words used.

This is in part training for the workplace where you will need to give constructive yet critically thought out feedback.

Can speak for **just a minute** on the topic of “News or noose? How news reporting can string us along.”

2. STANDING FOR HUMAN RIGHTS BY SHARING?



Cross reference

<https://www.asiaone.com/singapore/mediacorp-creative-agency-apologise-brownface-e-pay-ad-then-seem-defend-it>

If you can make a connection with this piece of news, do so. It would be interesting to see what implications or further inferences you can draw from the notion of ‘sharing’.



3. “THE WELCOME” – REFLECTING CRITICALLY

- What is your critical reflection on the video in response to the challenge at the end of the video – would you share it to stand up for human rights? What guidelines do you use to decide what to share?
- Submit your response (300 words) to your tutor **within 48 hours** (work bin labelled Gp__ The Welcome), in order to get feedback in time for the critical reflection exercise for the project.

When you write up your thoughts on whether or not you would share “The Welcome”, you are in fact writing a critical reflection.

RUBRICS FOR FEEDBACK

1. Content knowledge – of the topic of human rights
2. Circumspection – awareness of the sort of stand one is being asked to take at the end of the video set against the context of the whole complexity of human rights
3. Vigorous analysis – engagement with the issue, not superficial
4. Persuasiveness – organisation of the response is logical, cohesive, transitions used to show cogency
5. Originality etc. – in this exercise we would be looking for reasonable confidence and perhaps imagination if alternative video scenarios or other cultural contexts were used



4. CONVERSING ACADEMICALLY ON YOUR GROUP PROJECT

What's the difference between a normal conversation between friends and an academic conversation?

An academic conversation is one where

The group project is a series of academic discussions in order to come up with three key deliverables:

- a critical reflection on Ennis showing your understanding of how a critical thinking taxonomy or framework can be used like an SOP to “process” i.e. evaluate information reliably and systematically,
- an easy to remember rubric to help you to internalise or turn the method into a habit, and to road test your rubric on a short article, on some aspect of technology e.g. disruptive technology, and lastly
- a live demonstration of your rubric and how it works on a given prompt

Let's start off the series of conversations, if you haven't already done this exercise from lecture 3, try it now.

BIG QUESTION


- How can you form a rubric from Ennis' Taxonomy and a memorable way of remembering it (Mnemonic)?

Fig 1. Big question

USING BARRETT'S TO UNDERSTAND ENNIS, 2011

Barrett's Taxonomy

LEARNING AID – FRAMEWORK FOR READING



Barrett's Taxonomy of Comprehension Skills

Appreciation	critique, appraise, comment, appreciate
Evaluation	analyse, appraise, evaluate, justify, reason, criticise, judge
Inferential Comprehension	predict, infer, guess
Reorganisation	classify, regroup, rearrange, assemble, collect, categorise
Literal Comprehension	label, list, name, relate, recall, repeat, state

Sample questions

- Level 5 – Can you form a rubric for your group's use based on Ennis' taxonomy for use with information from internet sources?
- Level 4 – What is/are the positive points about Ennis's taxonomy?
- Level 3 - How are the various taxa connected?
- Level 2 – Which taxa seem to be related closely to each other?
- Level 1-what is a taxonomy? What is the difference between a skill and a disposition?

Fig 2. Guiding questions help you to unpack.

Use the guiding questions from Fig. 2 to help your team to unpack the big umbrella question of Fig 1 for what you can get out of Ennis. Allow 20-25 minutes for this discussion. Take notes as these will help you with the subsequent short discussions or conversations as you build up toward your project deliverables.

Here is the next short discussion.

HOW CAN ENNIS' TAXONOMY BE USED AS AN SOP FOR PROCESSING INFORMATION? BRAINSTORM

- You need to have one person to record all your answers.
- You need to have another to ask for clarification of anything that is not clear.
- You need to have someone to keep the conversation going by asking useful questions.
- You could also have someone to encourage the others to talk.
- You could have one live wire who plays devil advocate.

Fig 3. Brainstorming systematically

Use Fig. 3 to guide your brainstorming. The point of your brainstorming is to think of a way to organise the key taxa you have decided are the most useful for processing information on technology.

Allow another 20-30 minutes to discuss this. You can change roles if you like so you get to experience different roles and understand the different demands each role brings.

Now to create your imaginative and memorable rubric you will need the notes from this discussion. Here is the final guiding slide:

HOW CAN WE BE IMAGINATIVE ABOUT THE MNEMONIC?

What is a Mnemonic?

- A mnemonic, also known as a memory aid, is a tool that helps you remember an idea or phrase with a pattern of letters, numbers, or relatable associations. Mnemonic devices include special rhymes and poems, acronyms, images, songs, outlines, and other tools. Mnemonic (pronounced ni-mon-ik) is derived from the Greek phrase *mimnēskesthai* meaning to "remember." <https://literaryterms.net/mnemonic/>

Examples

Acronym- A, B, C – Assume nothing, Believe no one, Check everything

Acrostic – Critical Cat

Fig. 4 Coming up with an imaginative rubric

Have another conversation or discussion using Fig. 4 as a guide, but this may take more time as it takes time for original ideas to brew.

There will be other conversations or discussions your group will need to have. However, now that you have made a start, you can plan the remaining conversations yourselves. See you at the project conference soon, please bring as much work as you and your team have done.

You should now be ready to write up your first draft of the group project critical reflection and to introduce your rubric/creative mnemonic.

5. HOMEWORK

- a) Complete and submit your critical reflection of “The Welcome” within 48 hours.
- b) Group Project:
 - Complete your brainstorming and discussions.
 - Collate your responses.
 - Draft your critical reflection, propose a rubric and create a mnemonic.
 - Pilot your mnemonic on a short text of your choice – it may be in any format.

COURSE NOTES



- Encouragement creates a safe space to make mistakes and to learn from them.
- Praise reinforces positive learning outcomes and reinforces the good points.
- Feedback should be constructive so that we can start improving other areas, e.g. in speaking or writing that can be worked on and so get better at something.
- Feedback to be constructive should be evidence based – base it on something you have observed or can point to, and should be tactfully conveyed.
- Critical thinking can be evidenced in how we ‘package’ or convey information. It is in the words we use, the organisation and the selection of points.
- A critical reflection is your considered opinion about something. It shows analysis. It is based on evidence. It may make use of prior knowledge. It may look at further implications or ramifications. It is not mere opinion and it should not be shallow.
- An academic conversation is different from a normal conversation.