

# Attention, Awareness, and Analysis: Video Clubs as Meaningful Venues for Teacher Noticing *and* Culturally-Sustaining Pedagogy

Melissa J. Luna, West Virginia University, melissa.luna@mail.wvu.edu  
Malayna B. Bernstein, West Virginia University, malayna.bernstein@mail.wvu.edu  
Janet D. K. Walkoe, University of Maryland, jwalkoe@umd.edu

**Abstract:** In this poster, we conceptualize how video clubs designed to promote teacher noticing can function as tools for social justice. We offer a conceptual model showing how the theoretical roots related to *Teacher Noticing/Responsive Teaching* are aligned with theories foundational to *Culturally-Sustaining Pedagogy*. We articulate design considerations for video clubs that can promote both *Teacher Noticing/Responsive Teaching* and *Culturally-Sustaining Pedagogy* as part of promoting rigorous disciplinary meaning-making.

**Keywords:** Teacher Noticing, Responsive Teaching, Culturally-Sustaining Pedagogy, Design of Video-Based Teacher Learning

## Major issue addressed

The teacher noticing community has extensively studied how to support teachers learning to attend to, make sense of, and respond to students' disciplinary meaning-making; however, our community is only beginning to consider how to support teachers' responsiveness to students' cultural ways of knowing. The body of theory undergirding noticing student thinking (as a vehicle for teacher learning) has a diversity of affordances, only some of which have been well-articulated by the literature. Just as many have leveraged the affordances of video-based professional development to support teacher noticing for ambitious mathematics and science teaching, these same affordances are available—and should be leveraged—for Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy (CSP) (Paris, 2012).

## Potential significance of work

By understanding how attention, awareness, and analysis are key ingredients for working towards equity, yet difficult for those who usually wield power in classrooms, the potential for video clubs as meaningful venues for *teacher noticing/responsive teaching* (N/RT) *and* CSP becomes clear. In this work, we begin the work of understanding how video clubs that are designed to promote teacher noticing can function as an instrument for social justice. We offer a conceptual model showing how the theoretical roots related to N/RT are closely aligned with theories foundational to CSP.

## Theoretical perspective

Early work on *teacher noticing*—a theoretical construct stemming from research that sought to understand mathematics teaching practice—described it as a dynamic cognitive process involving two main components: (1) attending to particular events in an instructional setting, and, (2) making sense of events in an instructional setting (Sherin, Jacobs, & Philipp, 2011). Other scholars have extended *teacher noticing* to include a third component (3) responding to events in an instructional setting (e.g. Jacobs et al., 2011). With some variation, researchers investigating N/RT hold these two or three components in common (e.g. Sherin & van Es, 2009; Windschitl, Thompson, & Braaten, 2011).

*Culturally-sustaining pedagogy* extends a legacy of research related to *resource pedagogies* (Paris, 2012), which builds on assumptions that run parallel to those articulated in the construction of N/RT. These include the idea that (1) students' prior knowledge can serve as a resource for learning disciplinary content (e.g. Moll et al., 1992), (2) learning is a cultural activity that takes place—and is shaped—within a complex ecology (e.g. Rogoff, 1990; Lee, 2007), and (3) learners' identity and epistemology are central to the learning experience (e.g. Nasir & Hand, 2008; Orellana, 1999).

An extensive body of research has shown how teacher video clubs effectively support teachers' noticing of students' disciplinary thinking. A video club involves a group of teachers watching and discussing video excerpts of classroom activity with a particular focus or framework in mind (Sherin & van Es, 2009). While video clubs can be designed with different teacher learning foci, few topics other than noticing student thinking have been considered. As a field, however, we have come to see how teacher noticing is a cultural activity intricately tied to issues of equity and access (e.g., Hand, 2012; McDuffie et al., 2014). Hand argues that even “well-intentioned” teachers “may be unaware of their relation to and perpetuation of dominant power hierarchies,”

(2012, p. 235). Much research has underscored the difficulty of teachers, particularly white teachers, seeing how oppression functions within schools and their own classrooms (e.g. Delpit, 2006). Paris (2017) charges, “What if the goal of teaching and learning with youth of color was...to explore, honor, extend, and, at times, problematize their cultural practices and investments?” (pp. 2-3). Thus, video clubs, which are well-established venues for promoting N/RT, should also be recognized as potentially powerful venues for promoting CSP.

Love (2000) contends that we begin to develop a “liberatory consciousness” through *awareness*, “to give attention to our daily lives, our language, our behaviors, and even our thoughts...noticing what happens in the world...” (p. 602), and *analysis*, “not only notice what is going on...but to think about it and theorize about it—that is, to get information and develop [an] explanation for what is happening, why it is happening, and what needs to be done about it...analysis will reveal a range of possible courses of action” (p. 603). By understanding how awareness and analysis are key ingredients for working towards equity, yet difficult for those who often wield power in classrooms, potential for video clubs as venues for N/RT and CSP becomes clear. Drawing on foundational literature of CSP and N/RT, we offer a framework showing commonalities in how three major constructs—knowledge, knowing/learning, and learners—are conceptualized across the two bodies of scholarship.

## Implications for design of video-based teacher learning contexts

Video-based PD encourages teachers to notice student thinking, make it the centerpiece of instruction in ways that recognize its complexity and honor its multiplicity, and then constructively build from it, rather than position it naïve or incorrect. We think these essential features also position teachers for CSP. As such, we believe our work towards a conceptual framework demonstrating some of the shared theoretical underpinnings of N/RT and CSP has potential to offer design considerations for future video clubs. In particular, we think that the theoretical underpinnings of *both* CSP and N/RT should drive the design process around using video to support teachers’ learning around seeing, understanding, and acting on students’ cultural ways of knowing—our proposed conceptual framework can help us do this.

## References

- Hand, V. (2012). Seeing culture and power in mathematical learning: Toward a model of equitable instruction. *Educational Studies in Mathematics*, 80, 233-247.
- Jacobs, V. R., Lamb, L. L., Philipp, R. A., & Schappelle, B. P. (2011). Deciding how to respond on the basis of children’s understandings. *Mathematics teacher noticing: Seeing through teachers’ eyes*, 97-116.
- Lee, C. (2007). *Culture, literacy, & learning: Taking bloom in the midst of the whirlwind*. Teachers College Press, NY.
- Love, B. J. (2000). Developing a liberatory consciousness. *Readings for diversity and social justice*, 2(470-474).
- McDuffie, A., Foote, M., Bolson, C., Turner, E., Aguirre, J., Bartell, T., Drake, C., & Land, T. (2014). Using video analysis to support prospective K8 teachers’ noticing of students’ multiple mathematical knowledge bases. *Journal of Mathematics Teacher Education*, 17, 245-270.
- Moll, L. C., Amanti, C., Neff, D., & Gonzalez, N. (1992). Funds of knowledge for teaching: Using a qualitative approach to connect homes and classrooms. *Theory into practice*, 31(2), 132-141.
- Nasir, N.I.S., & Hand, V. (2008). From the court to the classroom: Opportunities for engagement, learning, and identity in basketball and classroom mathematics. *The Journal of the Learning Sciences*, 17(2), 143-179.
- Orellana, M. F. (1999). Good guys and bad girls: Identity construction by Latina and Latino student writers. *Reinventing identities: The gendered self in discourse*, 64-82.
- Paris, D. (2012). Culturally sustaining pedagogy: A needed change in stance, terminology, and practice. *Educational researcher*, 41(3), 93-97.
- Rogoff, B. (1990). *Apprenticeship in thinking: Cognitive development in social context*. Oxford University Press.
- Sherin, M., Jacobs, V., & Philipp, R. (Eds.). (2011). *Mathematics teacher noticing: Seeing through teachers’ eyes*. New York: Routledge.
- Sherin, M. G. & van Es, E. A. (2009). Effects of video club participation on teachers’ professional vision. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 60(1), 2-37.
- Windschitl, M., Thompson, J., & Braaten, M. (2011). Fostering ambitious pedagogy in novice teachers: The new role of tool-supported analyses of student work. *Teachers College Record*, 113(7), 1311-1360.

## Acknowledgments

This paper is based upon work supported in part by the National Science Foundation under Grant Number DRL-1552428. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.