

# TITLE

Ilia Kohanovski<sup>a</sup>, Uri Obolski<sup>b,c</sup>, and Yoav Ram<sup>a,\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup>School of Computer Science, Interdisciplinary Center Herzliya, Herzliya 4610101, Israel

<sup>b</sup>School of Public Health, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 6997801, Israel

<sup>c</sup>Porter School of the Environment and Earth Sciences, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 6997801, Israel

\*Corresponding author: yoav@yoavram.com

April 22, 2020

## Abstract

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetur id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

## 18 Introduction

19 Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo.  
20 Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan  
21 bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit  
22 mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus  
23 et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper  
24 vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

25 Nulla malesuada porttitor diam. Donec felis erat, congue non, volutpat at, tincidunt tristique,  
26 libero. Vivamus viverra fermentum felis. Donec nonummy pellentesque ante. Phasellus adipiscing  
27 semper elit. Proin fermentum massa ac quam. Sed diam turpis, molestie vitae, placerat a, molestie nec,  
28 leo. Maecenas lacinia. Nam ipsum ligula, eleifend at, accumsan nec, suscipit a, ipsum. Morbi blandit  
29 ligula feugiat magna. Nunc eleifend consequat lorem. Sed lacinia nulla vitae enim. Pellentesque  
30 tincidunt purus vel magna. Integer non enim. Praesent euismod nunc eu purus. Donec bibendum quam  
31 in tellus. Nullam cursus pulvinar lectus. Donec et mi. Nam vulputate metus eu enim. Vestibulum  
32 pellentesque felis eu massa.

33 Quisque ullamcorper placerat ipsum. Cras nibh. Morbi vel justo vitae lacus tincidunt ultrices.  
34 Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Integer  
35 tempus convallis augue. Etiam facilisis. Nunc elementum fermentum wisi. Aenean placerat. Ut  
36 imperdiet, enim sed gravida sollicitudin, felis odio placerat quam, ac pulvinar elit purus eget enim.  
37 Nunc vitae tortor. Proin tempus nibh sit amet nisl. Vivamus quis tortor vitae risus porta vehicula.

## 38 Models and Methods

39 **Data.** We use daily confirmed case data  $\mathbf{X} = (X_1, \dots, X_T)$  from several different countries. These  
 40 incidence data summarize the number of individuals  $X_t$  tested positive for SARS-CoV-2 RNA (using  
 41 RT-qPCR) at each day  $t$ . Data was retrieved from **REFS** for the following regions: Wuhan, China;  
 42 Austria; ...

43 **SEIR model.** We model SARS-CoV-2 infection dynamics by following the number of susceptible  
 44  $S$ , exposed  $E$ , reported infected  $I_r$ , and unreported infected  $I_u$  individuals in a population of size  $N$ .  
 45 This model distinguishes between reported and unreported infected individuals: the reported infected  
 46 are those that have enough symptoms to eventually be tested and thus appear in daily case reports, to  
 47 which we fit the model.

48 Susceptible ( $S$ ) individuals become exposed due to contact with reported or unreported infected  
 49 individuals ( $I_r$  or  $I_u$ ) at a rate  $\beta_t$  or  $\mu\beta_t$ . The parameter  $0 < \mu < 1$  represents the decreased transmission  
 50 rate from unreported infected individuals, who are often subclinical or even asymptomatic. The  
 51 transmission rate  $\beta_t \geq 0$  may change over time  $t$  due to behavioral changes of both susceptible and  
 52 infected individuals. Exposed individuals, after an average incubation period of  $Z$  days, become  
 53 reported infected with probability  $\alpha_t$  or unreported infected with probability  $(1 - \alpha_t)$ . The reporting  
 54 rate  $0 < \alpha_t < 1$  may also change over time due to changes in human behavior. Infected individuals  
 55 remain infectious for an average period of  $D$  days, after which they either recover, or becomes ill  
 56 enough to be quarantined. They therefore no longer infect other individuals, and therefore the model  
 57 does not track their frequency. The model is described by the following equations:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \frac{dS}{dt} &= -\beta_t S \frac{I_p}{N} - \mu\beta_t S \frac{I_u}{N} \\
 \frac{dE}{dt} &= \beta_t S \frac{I_p}{N} + \mu\beta_t S \frac{I_u}{N} - \frac{E}{Z} \\
 \frac{dI_r}{dt} &= \alpha_t \frac{E}{Z} - \frac{I_r}{D} \\
 \frac{dI_u}{dt} &= (1 - \alpha_t) \frac{E}{Z} - \frac{I_u}{D}.
 \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

59 This model is inspired by Li et al. (2020) and Pei & Shaman (2020), who used a similar model  
 60 with multiple regions and constant transmission  $\beta$  and reporting rate  $\alpha$  to infer COVID-19 dynamics  
 61 in China and the continental US, respectively.

**Likelihood function.** The *expected* number of new reported infected individuals on day  $t$  is

$$Y_t = \alpha_t E(t)/Z.$$

We define  $\tilde{Y}_t$  to be the cumulative expected number of reported infected individuals up to day  $t$ ,

$$\tilde{Y}_t = \sum_{i=1}^t Y_i$$

As mentioned above,  $X_t$  is the number of confirmed cases in day  $t$ . Then,

$$\tilde{X}_t = \sum_{i=1}^t X_i$$

is the cumulative number of confirmed cases until day  $t$  (with  $X_0 = 0$ ). We assume that reported infected individuals yet to be confirmed, i.e. individuals in  $\tilde{Y}_t$ , are confirmed and therefore appear in

the daily case report of day  $t$  with probability  $p_t$ , which may change over time (note that  $t$  is a specific date, and not the elapsed time since infection). Therefore, we assume that the number of confirmed cases in day  $t$  is binomially distributed,

$$X_t \sim \text{Bin}(n_t, p_t),$$

where  $n_t$  is the *realized* number of reported infected individuals yet to appear in daily reports by day  $t$ . Given  $\tilde{X}_{t-1}$ , we assume  $n_t$  is Poisson distributed,

$$(n_t | \tilde{X}_{t-1}) \sim \text{Poi}(\tilde{Y}_t - \tilde{X}_{t-1}), \quad n_1 \sim \text{Poi}(Y_1).$$

62 Therefore,  $(X_t | \tilde{X}_{t-1})$  is a binomial conditioned on a Poisson, which reduces to a Poisson with

$$63 \quad (X_t | \tilde{X}_{t-1}) \sim \text{Poi}((\tilde{Y}_t - \tilde{X}_{t-1})p_t), \quad X_1 \sim \text{Poi}(Y_1 p_1). \quad (2)$$

Therefore, for given vector  $\theta$  of model parameters

$$\theta = (Z, D, \mu, \{\beta_t\}, \{\alpha_t\}, \{p_t\}, S(0), E(0), I_r(0), I_u(0)),$$

64 which also includes the initial conditions (state at  $t = 0$ ), it is possible to compute the expected number  
 65 of exposed  $\{E(t)\}_{t=1}^T$  and number of new infections  $\{Y_t\}_{t=1}^T$  for each day. Then, since  $\tilde{X}_{t-1}$  is a function  
 66 of  $X_1, \dots, X_{t-1}$ , we can use Eq. (2) to write the probability of the confirmed case data  $\mathbf{X} = (X_1, \dots, X_T)$   
 67 as

$$68 \quad \mathbb{L}(\theta | \mathbf{X}) = P(\mathbf{X} | \theta) = P(X_1 | \theta)P(X_2 | X_1, \theta) \cdots P(X_T | X_1, \dots, X_{T-1}, \theta). \quad (3)$$

69 This defines our *likelihood function* for the parameter vector  $\theta$  given the data  $\mathbf{X}$ .

**NPI model.** To model non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs), we set the start of the NPIs to day  $\tau$  and define

$$\beta_t = \begin{cases} \beta, & t < \tau \\ \beta\lambda, & t \geq \tau \end{cases}, \quad \alpha_t = \begin{cases} \alpha_1, & t < \tau \\ \alpha_2, & t \geq \tau \end{cases}, \quad p_t = \begin{cases} 1/9, & t < \tau \\ 1/6, & t \geq \tau \end{cases},$$

70 where  $0 < \lambda < 1$ . The values for  $p_t$  follow Li et al. (2020), who estimated the average time between  
 71 infection and reporting in Wuhan, China, at 9 days before the start of NPIs (Jan 23, 2020) and 6 days  
 72 after start of NPIs. The parameter  $\tau$  is then part of the parameter vector  $\theta$ .

73 **Model fitting.** To fit our model (Eq. (1)) to the data  $\mathbf{X}$  and estimate the model parameters  $\theta$ , we apply  
 74 a Bayesian inference approach. We define the following flat priors on the model parameters  $P(\theta)$ :

$$\begin{aligned} Z &\sim \text{Uniform}(2, 5) \\ D &\sim \text{Uniform}(2, 5) \\ \mu &\sim \text{Uniform}(0.2, 1) \\ \beta &\sim \text{Uniform}(0.8, 1.5) \\ 75 \quad \lambda &\sim \text{Uniform}(0, 1) \\ \alpha_1, \alpha_2 &\sim \text{Uniform}(0.02, 1) \\ E(0) &\sim \text{Uniform}(0, 3000) \\ I_u(0) &\sim \text{Uniform}(0, 3000) \\ \tau &\sim \text{Uniform}(1, T - 1), \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

76 where  $T$  is the number of days in the data  $\mathbf{X}$ . Most priors follow Li et al. (2020), except  $\lambda$ , which  
 77 is used to enforce that the transmission rates are lower after the start of the NPIs ( $\beta_{t \geq \tau} < \beta_{t < \tau}$ ).  
 78 The posterior distribution on the model parameters  $P(\theta | \mathbf{X})$  is then estimated using an affine-  
 79 invariant ensemble sampler for Markov chain Monte Carlo (MCMC) implemented in the emcee  
 80 Python package (Foreman-Mackey et al. 2013).



## 82 Discussion

83 Quisque ullamcorper placerat ipsum. Cras nibh. Morbi vel justo vitae lacus tincidunt ultrices. Lorem  
84 ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Integer tempus  
85 convallis augue. Etiam facilisis. Nunc elementum fermentum wisi. Aenean placerat. Ut imperdiet,  
86 enim sed gravida sollicitudin, felis odio placerat quam, ac pulvinar elit purus eget enim. Nunc vitae  
87 tortor. Proin tempus nibh sit amet nisl. Vivamus quis tortor vitae risus porta vehicula.

88 Fusce mauris. Vestibulum luctus nibh at lectus. Sed bibendum, nulla a faucibus semper, leo velit  
89 ultricies tellus, ac venenatis arcu wisi vel nisl. Vestibulum diam. Aliquam pellentesque, augue quis  
90 sagittis posuere, turpis lacus congue quam, in hendrerit risus eros eget felis. Maecenas eget erat in  
91 sapien mattis porttitor. Vestibulum porttitor. Nulla facilisi. Sed a turpis eu lacus commodo facilisis.  
92 Morbi fringilla, wisi in dignissim interdum, justo lectus sagittis dui, et vehicula libero dui cursus dui.  
93 Mauris tempor ligula sed lacus. Duis cursus enim ut augue. Cras ac magna. Cras nulla. Nulla egestas.  
94 Curabitur a leo. Quisque egestas wisi eget nunc. Nam feugiat lacus vel est. Curabitur consectetur.

95 Suspendisse vel felis. Ut lorem lorem, interdum eu, tincidunt sit amet, laoreet vitae, arcu. Aenean  
96 faucibus pede eu ante. Praesent enim elit, rutrum at, molestie non, nonummy vel, nisl. Ut lectus eros,  
97 malesuada sit amet, fermentum eu, sodales cursus, magna. Donec eu purus. Quisque vehicula, urna  
98 sed ultricies auctor, pede lorem egestas dui, et convallis elit erat sed nulla. Donec luctus. Curabitur  
99 et nunc. Aliquam dolor odio, commodo pretium, ultricies non, pharetra in, velit. Integer arcu est,  
100 nonummy in, fermentum faucibus, egestas vel, odio.

## 101 **Acknowledgements**

102 This work was supported in part by the Israel Science Foundation 552/19 (YR) and XXX/XX (Alon Rosen)

## 103 References

- Foreman-Mackey, D., Hogg, D. W., Lang, D. & Goodman, J. (2013), ‘emcee : The MCMC Hammer ’, *Publ. Astron. Soc. Pacific* **125**(925), 306–312.
- Li, R., Pei, S., Chen, B., Song, Y., Zhang, T., Yang, W. & Shaman, J. (2020), ‘Substantial undocumented infection facilitates the rapid dissemination of novel coronavirus (SARS-CoV2)’, *Science* (80-. ). p. eabb3221.  
**URL:** <https://www.sciencemag.org/lookup/doi/10.1126/science.abb3221>.
- Pei, S. & Shaman, J. (2020), ‘Initial Simulation of SARS-CoV2 Spread and Intervention Effects in the Continental US’, *medRxiv* p. 2020.03.21.20040303.  
**URL:** <http://medrxiv.org/content/early/2020/03/23/2020.03.21.20040303>.