

**Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum
May 2019 Draft**

—Inaccurate—

By law, teachers must “impress upon the minds of the pupils the principles of ... truth [and] avoid ... falsehood.” CA Ed Code Section 233.5(a). “All instructional materials ... shall be...accurate, objective...” CA Ed Code Section 60045(a). “...only instructional materials which...accurately portray the cultural and racial diversity of our society...” are to be used. CA Ed Code Section 60040. CDE’s “History and Social Science Framework for California Public Schools” requires that instructional materials “present accurate, detailed content” including primary sources which must convey “an accurate and thorough sense of the period” and narratives which present “an accurate and vivid picture of the times.”

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham, parent & CA taxpayer	<p><u>This part is inaccurate and so needs to be corrected:</u> “...a region of the Ottoman Empire then called Syria (which includes the modern states of Syria, Lebanon, and Palestine/Israel)” is inaccurate and should be corrected.</p> <p>Israel-Palestine is not a single entity and shouldn’t be hyphenated. Israel is the name of a country. Palestine is the name of a separate territory.</p> <p><u>Suggested correction:</u> “...a region of the Ottoman Empire then called Syria (which includes the modern states of Syria, Lebanon, and Israel, as well as the Palestinian Territories.”</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 241 ...line(s): 5137-5138</p>
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is inaccurate and so needs to be corrected:</u> “If time permits, students highlight Lebanon, Syria, Israel-Palestine, and Iraq, and for each country teacher explains...”</p> <p>Israel-Palestine is not a single entity and shouldn’t be hyphenated. Israel is a country. Full stop. Also, there is no country called Israel-Palestine, and it is inaccurate to say “for each country” and refer to a non-existing Israel-Palestine entity as one of the supposed “countries” in the list. Palestine is a separate geographical area including Gaza and the West Bank. Palestine is predominantly Arab territory. In Israel, a minority of about 20% are Arabs (with full citizenship, voting rights, health care coverage, etc.). Jews living in Palestine and most Arab countries are not granted similar rights. Arab-Americans have come to the US from both Palestine and Israel, although the majority of Arab Americans have come from other parts of the world.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> Correct the various inaccuracies explained above, especially avoiding all use of the term “Israel-Palestine,” which is not a country or a state.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 237 ...line(s): 5029 - 5030</p>

Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 2 of 13

—Biased, Lacks Balance—

SBE’s “Guidelines for Ethnic Studies Curriculum” and CDE’s “History and Social Science Framework for California Public Schools” require that all students be taught a “balanced” curriculum.” The Guidelines also call for materials that give a “cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together.”

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is biased, not balanced and so needs to be revised:</u> In this section describing Arab immigration, the teacher “explains what time periods saw significant immigration from each of” four specified Arab “countries” including “Lebanon, Syria, Israel-Palestine, and Iraq.”</p> <p>The current text specifies regions that do not represent the largest portions of Arab immigrants to the US, but rather cherry picks 4 areas either at random or with an agenda, but <i>without regard to size</i> in the American Arab community that came from that region. The four largest Arab-American populations come from: Lebanon (25%), Egypt (12%), Syria (8%), and Somalia (7%). Per https://drive.google.com/file/d/1O2S7T_hA2Ew2TJDteBsNTuMbGQ3CSb31/view</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> “If time permits, students highlight Lebanon, Egypt, Syria, and Somalia, and for each country teacher explains what time periods saw significant immigration from each of those countries to the US.”</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 237 ...line(s): 5030</p>
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is biased, not balanced and so needs to be revised:</u> “This first wave of Arab immigration ended with the passage of the Immigration Act of 1924 (the Johnson-Reed Act), which sharply restricted the number of immigrants through a quota system. Only one hundred Arabs were allowed to immigrate each year.”</p> <p>This statement, especially given the current political environment, can easily be misconstrued to suggest that the Johnson-Reed Act was a ban on Arab immigrants. Which it was NOT. Quotas for specific countries were set at 2% of the U.S. population from each country as recorded in 1890.^[2] Yes, Arabs were affected as stated, but ALL populations poorly represented in 1890 were prevented from immigrating in proportionate numbers—the Act especially affected Italians, Jews, Greeks, Poles and other Slavs.^{[1][3][4]}</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> The section should be re-written to correct this misunderstanding, and to include <i>all</i> the groups affected by the Johnson-Reed Act, along with the effect on the Arab community.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 242 ...line(s): 5150 - 5153</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 3 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is biased, not balanced and so needs to be revised:</u> “The largest single group was Palestinian, as hundreds of thousands of Palestinians had been displaced in the Nakba (Arabic for “Catastrophe,” the term used to describe the dispossession and dispersal of many Palestinian Arabs from the new state of Israel in the 1948 Palestine War).” Nakba is a very biased, offensive term, and the description accompanying it is also.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> The US State Department’s description of this was is fact-based, historically accurate and descriptive, without being offensive: “The Arab-Israeli War of 1948 broke out when five Arab nations invaded territory in the former Palestinian mandate immediately following the announcement of the independence of the state of Israel on May 14, 1948.” https://history.state.gov/milestones/1945-1952/arab-israeli-war</p> <p>The text could continue with a statement that the war, and events surrounding it, led to many Palestinians emigrating at that time, along with Mizrahi and Sephardic Jews expelled from predominantly Arab countries throughout the Middle East.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 236, 242 ...line(s): 4992, 5157 - 5161</p>
Chapter 2 & 4	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not balanced and so needs to be revised</u> Antisemitism has been omitted, as has any reference to the Jewish American experience, despite the large and growing antisemitic hate crime statistics.</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 4 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is biased, not balanced and so needs to be revised:</u> While the list of “Potential Significant Figures to Cover” in the African American section is not claiming to be “exhaustive,” it SHOULD attempt to represent a balance of approaches, and not focus primarily on violence or aggression as it currently does, nor should it include those advocating hatred of others.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> Many successful African American history agents of change (and role models) were NOT violent or militant (the curriculum's current list includes 3 Black Panthers - Bobby Seele, Angela Davis, and Fred Hampton, but leaves out Martin Luther King, Maxine Watters, Barbara Jordan, Thurgood Marshall, Bryan Stevenson and Barak Obama). Many African Americans worked passionately for improvement by building coalitions, joining peaceful movements, or entering politics or law to accomplish significant things. They worked with or within the system to improve it, rather than threatening to blow it up. This perspective should be better reflected in the suggested “significant political figures” by including some of the people suggested above.</p> <p>Clara Muhammad should not be included in this list of significant figures to cover. She is known as the First Lady of the Nation of Islam – a group known for advocating antisemitic beliefs and that The Southern Poverty Law Center tracks as a hate group. Clara is really known for creating the first religious homeschooling, the exact opposite of the public school model our democracy tries to foster (and the place for which this curriculum is being designed).</p> <p>Assata Shakur, and Mumia Abu-Jamal should not be included in this list – each have been convicted as first degree murderers of a police officer.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • • "Nation of Islam". Southern Poverty Law Center.. • <i>Tatum, Sophie (March 1, 2018). "Nation of Islam leader Farrakhan delivers anti-Semitic speech". CNN. Retrieved March 2, 2018.</i> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s):49-50 ...line(s): 982 - 1006</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 5 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is biased, not balanced and so needs to be revised:</u> In the African American section, the curriculum asks an excellent and important question “How have people historically, and in the present, resisted forms of oppression in the United States?” (lines 1467-68) but the only answer the curriculum provides (lines 1473 – 1635) is one of violence and rioting (Attica Prison riots).</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> Rioting is certainly one approach, but the curriculum should ALSO point out that there are other valid approaches such as using the court room and legal system. Great African American examples include Bryan Stevenson of the Equal Justice Initiative fighting for criminal justice reform, and Thurgood Marshall's work culminating in the Brown v. Board of Education decision banning segregation in schools.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 69-76 ...line(s): 1467 - 1635</p>

Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 6 of 13

—Needs to Be Based on Sound Research—

SBE's "Guidelines for Ethnic Studies Curriculum" require that these materials be "based on current and confirmed research" and provide students a "rigorous analysis of history, systems of oppression, and the status quo." CDE's "History and Social Science Framework for California Public Schools" requires that narratives, when used, present an "accurate" picture of the times.

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> "Label the map with as many, or all of the Arab countries. There are 22"</p> <p>Palestine is listed as "one of 22 Arab-speaking countries in the world" but Palestine is not a country. It is not recognized by the United States as a country, and has no official borders. It should not be considered a country in a California text book or lesson plan.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> The question for students (line 5926-27) could be reframed to "Identify places that Arab Americans have come from – there are 21 countries and 1 territory that predominantly speak Arabic. If you cannot label all of them, but know some or all of them, please list them."</p> <p>The student answer key (lines 5929-5932) could be revised to either say: "There are 21 Arabic-speaking counties and 1 territory that predominantly speak Arabic" and that way Palestine can be included or say: "There are 21 Arabic-speaking counties in the world" (in this case, Palestine should not be labeled as a separate country). Also correct the answer key so the language is Arabic.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s):275, 276 ...line(s): 5926-5927, 5929-5932 https://docs.google.com/document/d/1sDiAm0fb9gfHGM97CynAVI5tziYiXYrkRM2a4OBNqys/edit#heading=h.gjdqxs https://docs.google.com/document/d/10nJPqQA40245YZWG1bEx2DkGkZX608Kw8Yr9j42RDn8/edit</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 7 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> "...includes 22 Arab countries as diverse as Egypt, Lebanon, Morocco, Yemen, Tunisia and Palestine."</p> <p>There are actually 21 Arab countries. Palestine is not a country. It is not recognized by the United States as a country, and has no official borders. It should not be considered a country in a California text book or lesson plan.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> Delete reference link to "Quick Facts about Arab Americans" or ask the Arab American Institute Foundation to correct the reference page section on "Origin" so Palestine isn't described as a country or create a separate reference page with the correct list of 21 countries speaking Arabic.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 276 ...line(s): 5945-5946 https://drive.google.com/file/d/11V6oXvkN6lgcTulOglkTt7mAQ-MS9uDm/view</p>
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">The location of Lebanon is incorrectly labeled on the map.</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">The location of Palestine is incorrectly labeled on the map.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Lebanon should be labeled as the country on the southwest corner of Syria (just north of Israel)</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Palestine, if it is included as a territory, should point to the West Bank and Gaza. Israel's boundaries should be recognizable with clear borders.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 276 ...line(s): 5931-5932</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 8 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> “Americans who know anything about the farm workers movement know it was started by César Chávez. In reality, Arab, Chicano/a, Mexican, Filipino/a, black, and white farm workers founded it too.”</p> <p>This is not factually correct nor does it reflect current research.</p> <p>Facts show that the farm workers movement (United Farm Workers) was founded by César Chávez & Dolores Huerta (both started the National Farm Workers Association), and Larry Itliong (leader of Agricultural Workers Organizing Committee). So it is correct to say that the farm workers movement was founded by farm workers whose ancestors were Mexican, Chicano/a, and Filipino/a.</p> <p>While there were black and white workers as well as Arab and Jewish participants in the farm workers union, they were <i>not</i> the founders and shouldn't share the same prominence as those who actually did establish and lead the movement. They should (and Arabs do) get credit elsewhere for their leadership positions or for sacrificing their lives for the movement, however statements of credit should not confuse or mislabel the origins of the movement's founding leaders.</p> <p>How strange that in a course that should be about inclusion, the section on the Farm Workers Movement completely omits the female role of Dolores Huerta, who created the Agricultural Workers Association in 1960, then co-founded (with Chavez and Itliong) in 1962 what later became United Farm Workers. Instead it only mentions César Chávez and Naji Daifullah, two men.</p> <p>Also, if this part of the curriculum is about minorities and labor unions, it would be reasonable to reference Samuel Gompers, a Jewish immigrant who founded the American Federation of Labor.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> “The farm workers movement was started by César Chávez, Dolores Huerta and and Larry Itliong, men and women farm workers with Mexican, Chicano/a, and Filipino ancestry. Within the union there were leaders from many other backgrounds, including Arab, ... ”</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 240 ...line(s): 5112 - 5114</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 9 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> “Another possibility would be to present the material they learned to the history department, encouraging them to teach about the diverse group that unionized farm workers. Americans who know anything about the farm workers movement know it was started by César Chávez. In reality, Arab, Chicano/a, Mexican, Filipino/a, black, and white farm workers founded it too.”</p> <p>This is not factually correct nor does it reflect current research.</p> <p>Facts show that the farm workers movement (United Farm Workers) was founded by César Chávez & Dolores Huerta (both started the National Farm Workers Association), and Larry Itliong (leader of Agricultural Workers Organizing Committee). So it is correct to say that the farm workers movement was founded by farm workers whose ancestors were Mexican, Chicano/a, and Filipino/a.</p> <p>While there were black and white workers as well as Arab and Jewish participants in the farm workers union, they were <i>not</i> the founders and shouldn't share the same prominence as those who actually did lead the movement. They should, (and Arabs do), get credit elsewhere for their leadership positions or their deaths for the movement, without diminishing the founding leaders' actual origins.</p> <p>How strange that in a course that should be about inclusion, completely overlooks the female role of Dolores Huerta, who created the Agricultural Workers Association in 1960, then co-founded (with Chavez and Itliong) in 1962 what later became United Farm Workers.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> Delete this optional activity of presenting the material to the History department, but leave the other suggested activities to “analyze immigration policy” or “contact a local politician or ACLU”</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 240 ...line(s): 5111 – 5114v</p>

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 10 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> “Through our consumer economy and family, we are taught gender norms even before we can talk.”</p> <p>This reference to blaming “our consumer economy” as a primary influencer of gender norms is inconsistent with research from anthropologists (on the process of socialization) and from psychologists (on conformity to social norms). Economic systems of one kind or another are not one of the major factors in teaching gender norms.</p> <p>One might also ask why an Ethnic Studies program is discussing gender issues.</p> <p><u>Suggested revision:</u> “Through our family, culture and social influences, we are taught gender norms ...”</p> <p>Perhaps an additional statement should be made that American society is far less likely to marginalize women and girls than virtually any of the immigrant cultures being studied. Students should understand that some behaviors that are acceptable in the country from which their family immigrated are not acceptable in the US.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s):273 ...line(s): 5860-5861</p>
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is not based on sound research and so needs to be revised:</u> “We can stop ascribing gender identity to infants and we can resist the aggressive marketing targeted at parents and families”</p> <p>This inaccurately blames hegemony and gender identity on “aggressive marketing” from the previously villainized “consumer economy.” In fact, gender identity is actually a result of family and societal norms, social pressures, and socialization experiences.</p> <p><u>Suggested correction:</u> “We can stop ascribing gender identity to infants.” [DELETE: “and we can resist the aggressive marketing targeted at parents and families”]</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 273 ...line(s): 5870-5871</p>

Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 12 of 13

—Other, Inappropriate—

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<u>This part is inappropriate, and should be removed and revised:</u> No assignment should require a student to publicly advocate for some issue that the teacher or curriculum assigns. It's fine to ask a student to write a mock "letter to your congressman" about an issue (done well line 2560, and 3632. However, it's completely out of bounds to require the student to send it or call the congressperson, to join an organization to work on an issue or to post an announcement on facebook or Instagram! Specific examples of this are: lines 3640 – 3644, 4064 – 4072, 5109 – 5111 . Requiring such public-facing steps goes over the line. It makes it ok to turn students into a megaphone for whatever issue the teacher chooses, and <i>requires them</i> to go public or their grade will suffer. That is not appropriate or desired.
Chapter 2	Barbara Windham	<u>This part is inappropriate, and should be removed and revised:</u> This song, Letra de "Somos Sur" ft. Shadia Mansour, is offensive in many ways, and should be removed from the curriculum. It includes negative & divisive us-against-them themes, anti-Jewish stereotypical hate tropes of controlling the media, cloaked references to eradicate Israel, etc. Page and line numbers: ... page(s): 266-268, 273 ... line(s): 5722 – 5735, 5795 - 5829 (these are part of song that runs from 5692 - 5830

Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 13 of 13

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment
Chapter 2 & 4	Barbara Windham	<p><u>This part is inappropriate, and should be removed and revised:</u> “Call to Boycott, Divest and Sanction against Israel” should not be a recommended sample topic to the Arab American course outline. “Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions Movement for Palestine” should not be listed in this curriculum as a suggested social movement to study. The B.D.S. is divisive, anti-Israel, and anti-Semitic. Asad AbuKalil, Professor of Political Science and BDS leader at the University of California has said, “The real aim of BDS is to bring down the State of Israel.” Wikipedia includes the following references about the BDS movement being antisemitic^{[10][11]} in the form its opposition to Zionism takes, ^{[12][13]} drawing analogies to the Nazi boycott of Jewish businesses^{[14][15][16]} and accusing it of promoting the delegitimization of Israel.^{[17][18]}</p> <p>The German Parliament passed a resolution in May 2019 designating the Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions movement against Israel as anti-Semitic and stating that “The pattern of argument and methods of the B.D.S. movement are anti-Semitic.” According to the AP “The campaign’s calls to boycott Israeli artists, along with stickers on Israeli goods that are meant to dissuade people from buying them....The BDS movement’s ‘Don’t Buy’ stickers on Israeli products inevitably awake associations with the Nazi slogan ‘Don’t Buy from Jews!’ and similar scrawls on facades and shop window.” The Bundestag vowed not to fund organizations that question Israel’s right to exist, that call for a boycott of Israel, or that actively support B.D.S.</p> <p>The US House of Representatives in an overwhelming bipartisan vote (398 – 17) passed a resolution condemning the B.D.S. movement against Israel as one that “promotes principles of collective guilt, mass punishment and group isolation, which are destructive of prospects for progress towards peace.”</p> <p>According to various sources (Wikipedia is cited here), a number of current or former members of designated terrorist organizations, Hamas and the Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP), were financially and organizationally involved in the BDS movement.^{[48][49]} Between 2017 and 2019, 30 financial accounts linked to BDS have been shut down in the United States and Europe after it was discovered that they had ties with terror groups.^[51]</p> <p>There are plenty of non-hateful, non antisemitic, non terror-funded groups that one could reference in this curriculum, and so many that there is not room to mention them all. The B.D.S. should not be included in the ESMC, taking space and prominence that could be used for another organization that is less condemned both in the US and internationally, that is less divisive and less hateful.</p> <p>Page and line numbers: ...page(s): 35, 234 in Chapter 2; page 2 in Chapter 4 ...line(s): 684, 4957 in Chapter 2; lines 30-40 in Chapter 4</p>