California schools are failing to teach their students how to read, write, and do arithmetic. When my wife taught at UCLA, she needed to teach her students not just the substantive material but how to construct a coherent paragraph. Not surprisingly, California bar passage rates just dropped to their lowest in more than 60 years. Rather than divide students to nurse ethnic-based grievances, schools would do better to meet their core functions first.

But if the state must create this curriculum, here are some specifc comments, by line.

30-32: "Develop an intersectional and global understanding of the impact of race and racism, ethnicity, and culture in the shaping of individuals and communities in the United States. They will learn about the interlocking systems of oppression and privilege that impact all people of color."

This seems to be less about teaching tolerance and mutual understanding than about creating an "us against them" perception that all whites seek to oppress all "people of color."

100: And dependent of the state of the state

- 119: **Course objective**: "Years after slavery, many African-Americans continue to live in poverty because of racist, discriminatory laws." A more balanced perspective would note there are many factors that have contributed to African-American poverty, inclduing family breakdown, which has worsened in recent years. In the 1960's Daniel Patrick Moynihan observed that one-quarter of African-American children were not born into marries households. More than 50 years later, after the demise of legal segregation, that rate has tripled. Students might conclude that "racist" laws are the primary cause of poverty, but that should be their own conclusion after considering multiples perspectives, not a "course objective." It is hard to see how such an objective will bring students together, rather than drive them apart.
- 157: **Expected household income**. America, and California in particular, has always represented an opportunity to find one's own path, and go in a different direction than expected. Is it really the best idea to tell people that if they come from a certain area they will have a limited income -- rather than teaching about people who overcame obstacles in achieving success?

- 180: Restrictive Deed. It seems counterproductive to show students a deed from **1943**to form understandings of their current world. If you must, you could also show how California Supreme Court Justice Stanley Mosk, then a Superior Court judge who had returned from fighting such hatred overseas, absorbed that lesson and invalidated such a deed in 1947, and the U.S. Supreme Court agreed with his position in *Shelley v. Kraemer* one year later. It would also show how California has insisted on more equal treatment sooner than the rest of the country has just as Jackie Robinson could play four sports for UCLA in the 1930's without anywhere near the controversy he would face a decade later.
- 479: "Today I learned." This can be a useful pedagogical tool, but it smacks of reciting a politically correct catechism. What if students don't embrace the course objective? Will anyone respect a diversity of thought?
- 509: Seriously? Every person who does not "pass as white" is comfortable, and everyone else struggles. 2019 California is not 1860 Alabama. Students should not think it is.
- 541: **Privilege walk**. Instead of bringing students together to see their common bonds, let's teach them that there is an unbridgeable gap between them, and then express surprise when there are race-based conflicts and fights in school. (See e.g. *Dariano v. Morgan Hill Unified School Dist.*, 767 F.3d 764, 774 (9th Cir. 2014).
- 999-1000: **Assata Shakur, Mumia Abu-Jamal**: African-American children must find their role models in convicted murderers?
- 1002: You should be embarrassed that there is so little knowledge of true African-American heroes that this misspells Frederick Douglass' last name.
- 1638: **Prison/Black Lives Matter**. If California truly seeks critical reasoning skills, shouldn't students understand the volume of violent crime, and not just occasional overreactions to it?
- 2496: "For example, instead of the statement, "Unauthorized immigrants take jobs away from U.S. workers" the small groups could develop an opposing statement like: "Unauthorized immigrants are frequently employed in low-wage jobs that are difficult to fill, and the wages they spend create more total jobs, which strengthens the economy."

- OK. There is no hiding the fact the goal is not to develop critical, independent thinking but to instill the party line. This is not worth taxpayer support.
- 2622: It is nice that this is trying to spark "debate." It would be more effective if there was at least one source supporting a more cautious approach to immigration.
- 2785: It is beyond disturbing that you expect students to find "immigrants take jobs from Americans" to be "fiction." It is an opinion, but hardly a completely fictional one. No immigrant has ever taken a single job from an American? THAT is fiction.
- 3528: Ask for three arguments refuting Peterson's article.. And what if they agree? Is that grounds for detention?
- 3750: expressing your viewpoint on how Chinese should be included in every celebration and commemoration of the of the transcontinental railroad, not in a simplistic, nominal, "Oh I forgot to mention…" manner, but in a deep, integral method that gives true tribute to the labor that has built this country.

You are not asking students to express *their* viewpoint but that of the curriculam designers. It would be most efficient if the state wrote the letter for the students, since it has already decided what they must say.

- 4092: "This caused a period of time called the Killing Fields in which 10% of the population was killed." Apparently, it wasn't Pol Pot who killed people; there was just a "time . . . in which millions were killed." Just sort of happened.
- 4105: Even better, it was all America's fault. Pol Pot had no agency at all. How could he have done anything wrong? He was a "person of color."
- 4168: "Why are these deportations unfair?" Leading question, no?
- 4187: "Write a letter to or call your congressperson to advocate and end to these deportations as well as to the deportations of undocumented immigrants from the Latino community." So the lesson plan is to conscript students into a particular political agenda? Are you at least paying them for their slave labor?

- 4537: "students will write an editorial letter advocating for California Indians' rights." Again, if you are telling them what to say, why not just write the letter for them,?
- 5056: "a troubled relationship between the US and the Arab world as a result of US imperialism." So all terrorism is America's fault. Did you get these talking points from Tehran or Damascus?
- 5067: **Terrorism Against Arabs**. The Arab experience with terrorism is only as victims? Never as perpetrators?
- 5079: Edward Said must be really important if he needs to be in both the Asian and Arab section. And you even spell his name right!
- 5107: **The Nakba**? So you are taking talking points directly from Hamas.
- 5169: Students write down three reasons why a person might leave his or her native country and immigrate to a new land. Maybe they were Jewish and the Arab country in which they were living expelled them. Would that count?
- 5726: Five Arab nations attack Israel and California calls it the "1948 Palestine War?"
- 5335: The Syrian peddler was a fixture in early twentieth-century American life. So was the Jewish peddler, but Jews apparent don't exist in California's history curriculum.
- 6133: Whatever the benefits of teaching the Arab-American experience, CAIR, a front group for the Muslim Brotherhood, should not be part of it. Perhaps you should expose students to some of Sayyid Qutb's writings.
- 6202: It is clear that Islamophobia is unfounded and based on the ignorance and dehumanization of Muslims. Will there be any evidence of how Muslim immigration is causing Jews to flee Europe and women to keep curfews to protect themselves from sexual assault?
- 6223: "Effects on Muslim Americans has been terrible." Maybe we should scrap ethnic studies and learn subject-verb agreement.

6244: "Omar Ilhan" is a horrible anti-Semite and embarrassment to her district but even she deserves to have her first name precede her last.

6363: *anti-Semitism*. This seems to be the first mention of anti-Semitism or Jews in 6000 lines.