

### **This public comment refers to the research findings cited in the CA ESMC Draft 3.**

State Board of Education (SBE) requirements:

CA Education Code Section 60045: "All instructional materials ...shall be...accurate, objective, and current and suited to the needs and comprehension of pupils."

The SBE's approved Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines: "include accurate information based on current and confirmed research."

### **Add: Additional research findings for the ESMC**

The following table includes requests for research findings to be added to the ESMC:

Chapter 1, add between lines 189 and 190	<p>"The expansion and implementation of Ethnic Studies programs is often highly contentious." --Thomas S. Dee and Emily K. Penner, "The Causal Effects of Cultural Relevance," <i>American Educational Research Journal</i>, vol 54(1) (February 1, 2017), page 6."</p> <p>"Use of evidence to inform teaching and learning in a process of continuous improvement" is common in out-performing school districts. -- Linda Darling-Hammond, Learning Policy Institute's "positive outliers" study. <a href="https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/positive-outliers-closing-opportunity-gap-report">https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/positive-outliers-closing-opportunity-gap-report</a> and <a href="https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/product-files/Positive_Outliers_Quantitative_REPORT.pdf">https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/sites/default/files/product-files/Positive_Outliers_Quantitative_REPORT.pdf</a></p> <p>"Color-blind and multicultural interventions sometimes reduce racial bias among children" -- Julie Milligan Hughes and Rebecca Bigler "Addressing race and racism in the classroom" (2007), page 198</p> <p>"Lessons about racism have the potential to trigger negative emotional reactions [that] may block attitudinal change and thus they should be carefully studied before being adopted" -- Julie Milligan Hughes and Rebecca Bigler "Addressing race and racism in the classroom" (2007), page 198</p> <p>"Children benefit from learning about racism in the context of lessons that discuss the positive achievement of European American and African American individuals" -- Julie Milligan Hughes and Rebecca Bigler "Addressing race and racism in the classroom" (2007), page 203</p>
--	---

### **Revise: Add language to clarify research findings**

The following table includes requests for revisions to the language regarding research findings to be added to the ESMC:

Chapter 1, revise line 220 as follows	<p>Regarding this study: Thomas S. Dee and Emily K. Penner, "The Causal Effects of Cultural Relevance," American Educational Research Journal, vol 54(1) (February 1, 2017) <a href="https://www.nber.org/papers/w21865">https://www.nber.org/papers/w21865</a> (accessed December 31, 2019).</p> <p>Delete: "Led to an increase in GPA, especially in math and science "</p> <p>Insert: "A well-designed Ethnic Studies elective can have positive outcomes (GPA, attendance) for academically-weak Hispanics, males, and, to a lesser extent, Asians if successfully replicated and scaled up."</p>
---------------------------------------	---

### **Remove: No authority cited to support claims**

The following table includes requests for deletions, as no authority is cited to support the claims in the language regarding research findings to be added to the ESMC:

Chapter 1, delete lines 40-46	"Research also shows that curricula that teach directly about racism have a stronger impact than curricula that portray diverse groups but ignore racism. Students that become more engaged in school through courses like ethnic studies are more likely to graduate and feel more personally empowered."
Chapter 1, delete line 210	"Helped students discover their historical and ancestral origins"
Chapter 1, delete line 212	"Aided in the social-emotional wellness of students"

Chapter 1, delete lines 214-217	<p>“Provided students with skills and language to critically analyze, respond, and speak out on social issues</p> <p>Increased critical thinking, problem solving, collaboration, and interpersonal communication skills”</p>
Chapter 1, delete lines 222-227	<p>“Introduced students to college level academic frameworks, theories, terms, and research methods</p> <p>Helped foster a classroom environment of trust between students and teachers, enabling them to discuss contentious issues and topics, as well as current events</p> <p>Strengthened social and cultural awareness”</p>
Chapter 2, delete lines 60-63	<p>“—from developing strong cultural and academic identity, building academic skills within elementary, middle, and high school teachers to facilitating civic engagement with a service and problem-solving orientation”</p>

### **Remove: Not sound research**

Christine Sleeter’s paper citing some ethnic studies surveys, etc, was issued in 2011.

Its soundness was rejected by Stanford researcher Thomas Dee and Emily Penner, authors of the 2016 study cited in the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. They stated that their 2016 study “is the first study to examine the effect of any type of culturally relevant pedagogy (CRP) in a quantitative study that supports credible causal inferences.” (page 24)

[https://www.nber.org/system/files/working\\_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf](https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf)

Chapter 1, delete lines 33-42	<p>“Ethnic studies is designed to benefit all students. Christine Sleeter, Critical Education scholar, posits, “rather than being divisive, ethnic studies helps students to bridge differences that already exist in experiences and perspectives,” highlighting that division is <i>antithetical</i> to ethnic studies. Her study of the research on ethnic studies outcomes found that instruction that includes diversity experiences and a specific focus on racism and other forms of bigotry has a positive impact in terms of “democracy outcomes” and higher-level thinking.”— Christine Sleeter, <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies A Research Review</i></p> <p>“Sleeter’s research shows that culturally meaningful and relevant curriculum such as an ethnic studies course, which helps students develop the skillsets to engage in critical conversations about race, can have a positive impact on students.”</p>
Chapter 1, delete lines 191-198	<p>“In a 2011 report for the National Education Association entitled <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies</i>, Christine Sleeter stated that: ‘There is considerable research evidence that well-designed and well-taught ethnic studies curricula have positive academic and social outcomes for students. Curricula are designed and taught somewhat differently depending on the ethnic composition of the class or school and the subsequent experiences students bring, but both students of color and white students have been found to benefit from ethnic studies.’” -- Christine Sleeter, <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies</i>, p. viii”</p>
Chapter 1, delete line 209	<p>“Contributed to students’ sense of agency and academic motivation -- Christine Sleeter, <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies</i>. “</p>
Chapter 1, delete line 213	<p>“Increased youth civic engagement and community responsiveness— Christine Sleeter, <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies</i>. “</p>

Chapter 4, delete lines 107-109	"Sleeter, Christine. <i>The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies: A Research Review</i> . Washington, DC: National Education Association, 2011. Accessed October 7, 2018. <a href="https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED521869.pdf">https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED521869.pdf</a> ."
---------------------------------------	---

Stanford's Dee and Penner found that "the evidence that is available relies on research designs that cannot necessarily support credible causal inference" such as in Cammarota study: "For example, a small-scale study stated that Cammarota (2007) focused on the 'Social Justice Education Project' (SJEP), a 'sub-curriculum' fielded among 17 at-risk Latina/o students in a Tucson high school over four semesters between 2003 and 2005." ([https://www.nber.org/system/files/working\\_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf](https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w21865/w21865.pdf) at pages 7-8)

Chapter 1, delete lines 218-219	<p>"Led to an increase in attendance—Julio Cammarota, "A Social Justice Approach to Achievement: Guiding Latina/o Students Toward Educational Attainment With a Challenging, Socially Relevant Curriculum," <i>Equity &amp; Excellence in Education</i> 40, no. 1 (2007)</p> <p>Led to an increase in standardized test scores— Julio Cammarota, "A Social Justice Approach to Achievement: Guiding Latina/o Students Toward Educational Attainment With a Challenging, Socially Relevant Curriculum," <i>Equity &amp; Excellence in Education</i> 40, no. 1 (2007)"</p>
Chapter 4, delete lines 33-35	"Cammarota, Julio. "A Social Justice Approach to Achievement: Guiding Latina/o Student Attainment with a Challenging, Socially Relevant Curriculum." <i>Equity &amp; Excellence in Education</i> 40, no. 1 (January 2007): 87–96."

In November 2019, the Oakland Unified School Board rejected the charter renewal application of San Francisco State Professors Duncan-Andrade and Tintiangco-Cubales' Ethnic Studies K-8 lab school "Roses in Concrete" due to high attrition rates and its students underperforming schools with similar demographics: 92% of its students were below standard in math and 79% were below standard in Language Arts.

This failing school -- Roses in Concrete --is the subject of the article below and so it should be removed. <https://oaklandnorth.net/2019/11/22/school-board-considers-renewal-of-three-charter-schools>.

Chapter 4, delete lines 50-51	"Duncan-Andrade, Jeffrey. "Note to Educators: Hope Required When Growing Roses in Concrete." <i>Harvard Educational Review</i> 79, no. 2 (Summer 2009): 181–94."
-------------------------------	--

**Remove: Claim does not match the study's findings**

Steele's study is about testing, not Ethnic Studies.

Chapter 1, delete line 211	"Reduced stereotype threat -- <i>Claude Steele and Joshua Aronson, "Stereotype threat and the test performance of academically successful African Americans," in The Black-White Test Score Gap, ed. Christopher Jencks and Meredith Phillips (Washington, DC, US: Brookings Institution Press, 1998</i>
----------------------------	--

Stanford's Dee and Penner's research does not address graduation and college enrollment

Chapter 1, delete line 221	"Led to an increase in graduation and college enrollment rates – <i>Thomas S. Dee and Emily K. Penner, "The Causal Effects of Cultural Relevance," American Educational Research Journal, vol 54(1) (February 1, 2017) <a href="https://www.nber.org/papers/w21865">https://www.nber.org/papers/w21865</a> (accessed December 31, 2019).</i>
----------------------------	--