

**Institute of Curriculum Services' (ICS) Review of the  
September 2020 Second Field Review Draft of the  
Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC)  
for the California Instructional Quality Commission  
September 30, 2020**

**Navigation Notes:**

Click this link and select Second Field Review to access the September 2020 Second Field Review Draft of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum  
<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/modelcurriculumprojects.asp>

**Review Legend:**

~~Strikethrough~~ = Recommended deletion

Underline = Recommended addition

**Comments** = Explanation and rationale provided to support recommendations

**General Comments:**

The CDE's revisions to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum are a commendable and significant improvement over the first draft on a number of levels; at the same time, the September draft requires further revision.

In this review, we focus on the revisions that will strengthen the curriculum. For example, we offer a concise keyword definition for antisemitism, which is missing while other related keywords, like racism, are rightfully defined. We also recommend the addition of key language from the Education Code that protects students and will ensure ethnic studies classrooms achieve the desired positive outcomes detailed in the draft. Given CDE's decision to expand the scope of the model curriculum, ICS will also submit a sample lesson on Jewish Americans.

The following are significant improvements CDE made to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum:

- Beyond removing denigrating content on Jews, Israelis, and Israel, the revised draft has resulted in stronger opportunities for districts and teachers to customize ethnic studies classrooms to reflect California's diverse ethnic communities per AB-2016.
- The September 2020 draft is better written, better organized, and easier to use. For example, the key terms are more appropriate for high school level instruction, and the language is easier to understand overall.
- The new draft follows the excellent ESMC Board of Education Guidelines and directly incorporates these guidelines in the Preface. The shift to the thematic organization of the curriculum based on key themes of (1) Identity, (2) History and Movement, (3) Systems of Power, and (4) Social Movements and Equity, allows for connections to be made among diverse ethnic groups in California and better aligns with the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines.
- There is added focus on helping districts implement ethnic studies (new Chapter 2), and along with this guidance, there is excellent direction regarding integrating

stakeholders and community in the process of developing ethnic studies classes in California.

- Antisemitism has been added and acknowledged as a form of hate. Given the pervasiveness of antisemitism in California, this is important and appreciated. Also laudable are Superintendent Thurmond's and CDE's commitment to ensuring that the model curriculum avoid content that is antisemitic or that may be perceived as antisemitic. It is a sad reflection of our times that this must be stated, but we are nevertheless appreciative of this firm commitment regarding the model curriculum.

As noted above, the September draft requires additional revisions. This review identifies places where there is internal inconsistency, lack of alignment, and critical omissions, and it focuses on offering specific and actionable solutions that support the overarching goals of the model curriculum. The review details specific places where the model curriculum can be strengthened by acknowledging Californian ethnic communities including communities of color that have been otherwise left out, while respecting the curriculum's emphasis on the four traditional groups.

Ethnic studies prizes nuance, multidimensionality, and the uplifting of marginalized and oppressed voices. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum should not pit ethnic communities and communities of color against one another or fall into zero-sum thinking. The ESMC emphasizes the four traditional groups. There is no reason it cannot create a small space for the intersecting, diverse, and significant ethnic communities in California not currently represented. This could be a lesson on Jewish Americans as a whole, or a lesson on Middle Eastern Americans within Asian American studies. We will submit a sample lesson plan on Jewish Americans, which may be added in Appendix B, or in a new Appendix with sample lessons on ethnic communities and communities of color who are not currently represented in the model curriculum and who have requested inclusion. This request falls squarely within the scope of ethnic studies for K-12 public education as defined by AB-2016 and the ESMC Guidelines.

Written in 1983, Audre Lorde's message in her short essay "There is No Hierarchy of Oppressions" resonates strongly today as we see systemic racism against African Americans and rising bigotry that targets many ethnic groups, including Jews of all skin colors.

*...I know I cannot afford the luxury of fighting one form of oppression only. I cannot afford to believe that freedom from intolerance is the right of only one particular group. And I cannot afford to choose between the fronts upon which I must battle these forces of discrimination, wherever they appear to destroy me. And when they appear to destroy me, it will not be long before they appear to destroy you.*

As California pursues ethnic studies education for K-12 students, Lorde's message serves as a call to unite against discrimination and oppression and to remember the words of Martin Luther King Jr., "Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere."

\*\*\*\*\*Preface\*\*\*\*\*

Preface, p. 3, line 41, race footnote 1, **Add:** “1 Race: the idea that the human species is divided into distinct groups on the basis of inherited physical and behavioral differences. Genetic studies in the late 20th century refuted the existence of biogenetically distinct races, and scholars now argue that “races” are cultural interventions [inventions] reflecting specific attitudes and beliefs that were imposed on different populations in the wake of western European conquests beginning in the 15th century. “Race, Human, Encyclopedia Britannica, Audrey Smedley, July 28, 2020  
<https://www.britannica.com/topic/race-human>, accessed 9/1/2020.”

**Comments:** The use of the term “intervention” here is unclear, and “cultural interventions” is not a term commonly used in high school. Adding a bracketed definition of “inventions” would aid students and teachers by making this definition clear and easy to understand, since in this context, race is acknowledged as a social construct, or cultural invention. The use of a hard to understand word as the key explanation of a central concept in ethnic studies hinders rather than helps understanding.

This is a direct quote and does not currently have a citation. This should be added to align with standards for academic citations.

Preface, p. 3, line 42, **Add:** “...bigotry, indigeneity, etc.,(3) The model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities; ~~(3)~~ (4) include course outlines that offer a thematic approach to ethnic studies with concepts that provide space for educators to build in examples and case studies from diverse backgrounds; . . . ”

**Comments:** The current two paragraphs about Assembly Bill 2016 titled “Legislation” summarizes most relevant sections of the law but completely omits a critical point intended by the Legislature, that the model curriculum should be modified by school districts to reflect their student population. Accordingly, this section should add a numbered point and quote from the language added by AB-216 to the *Education Code*, Section 51226.7, Section 2 (b) “The model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities.” For the complete text, see  
[https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill\\_id=201520160AB2016](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201520160AB2016)  
 accessed 9/1/2020.

Preface, p. 3, line 42, Ethnicity footnote 3, **Add:** “Ethnicity: an identity marker based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, religion, language, history, tradition, etc., that comprise a social group.”

**Comments:** Religion is discussed as a key part of ethnicity, ethnic groups, and ethnic studies in the following locations is the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum:

- Chapters 1 and 3 in the ESMC include the category of religion in their explanations of identity and intersectionality, and so “religion” should be added to this list of identity markers for ethnicity. (See chapter 1, p. 12, line 264; chapter 3, p. 9, line 207; and chapter 3, p. 31, line 794.)
- The UC Outlines in Appendix A include religion as a part of ethnicity in multiple course outlines and lessons covering African American, Latinx American, and

Native American Studies. In addition on p. 15 there is a unit assignment on Arabs/Muslim Americans.

Further supporting the appropriateness of this addition, the mission statement of the UC Berkeley Ethnic Studies Department specifically includes religion: “The Department of Ethnic Studies at UC Berkeley is committed to the comparative study of racialization and indigeneity within the Americas, as well as between the U.S. and other nations. We seek to understand race and racism as “moving targets” that undergo mutations or evolve, and to recognize the complexities of the intersections of race with gender, class, sexuality, religion, and other systems of difference and axes of power.” See <https://ethnicstudies.berkeley.edu/about/mission/> accessed 9/14/2020.

Many scholars of ethnic studies also include religion as an aspect of ethnicity. For example, R. Tolteka Cuauhtin includes the category of religion in (1) “Matrix of Social Identity and Power,” (2) his chart “Who Am I as an Intersectional Human Being,” and (3) in “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview.” (See p. 45, pp. 46-47, pp. 68-69 in R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview, p. 74 in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.)

Religious identity intersects with racial, ethnic, gender, cultural, and other social identities in ways that cannot be reduced to simple racial categories, but in fact contribute to the diversity found within one racial or ethnic group. For example, there are important and different histories of Muslim and Christian African Americans, and of Arab and Middle Eastern Americans who are Muslim, Christian, Jewish, or members of other religions. Religion is also a key part of ethnic identities for Indian Americans who are Hindu, Sikh, and Muslim.

Preface, p. 3, line 52, line 55, **Change:** “The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum will focus on the traditional, ethnic studies first established in higher education which has been characterized by four foundational disciplines: African American, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x, Native American and Indigenous, and Asian American and Pacific Islander studies.”

**Comments:** Unnecessary comma is a typo and should be deleted. Adding Pacific Islanders here makes the reference to the four groups consistent with references in Chapter 1 and in Appendix B.

Preface, p. 4, lines 66-69, **Add:** “This model curriculum includes an inclusive investigation of American history from the perspective of marginalized groups, Ethnic studies courses address race within the context of how white dominated culture impacts racism and other forms of bigotry including anti-Semitism<sup>5</sup> and Islamophobia.”

[Add footnote defining antisemitism: Footnote]

“5. Antisemitism is hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Jews based on stereotypes and myths that target their ethnicity, culture, religion, traditions, right to self-determination, or connection to the State of Israel.”

**Comments:** We commend the addition of these specific forms of hatred and bigotry in the model curriculum. The term antisemitism should be defined in a footnote so that teachers and students will have access to a clear, concise definition in order to understand discrimination against Jews and to see how it relates to other forms of

prejudice, discrimination, bigotry, and hatred. This concise definition aligns in length with other keyword definitions, e.g., for racism.

Scholars have shifted to writing antisemitism as one word because it is understood as a term with a distinct meaning, hatred of Jews, and there is no semitism to which one can be anti. Antisemitism is a term akin to Islamophobia, a proper noun, and we recommend following this convention in the writing of this keyword term. See <https://www.jweekly.com/2020/08/06/dropping-the-hyphen-why-this-publication-is-changing-its-spelling-of-antisemitism/> accessed 9/14/2020.

Preface, p. 4. lines 73-75, **Add:**

*“State Board of Education Guidelines*

In 2018, the SBE approved Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines based on AB 2016. The following guidelines are based on requirements in the authorizing statute (Assembly Bill 2016, Chapter 327 of the Statutes of 2016), feedback collected from the public at the Webinar held on January 9, 2018, and other public comment...The guidelines state that the curriculum shall:

### **1. Statutory Requirements**

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum must reflect the requirements in the authorizing statute as well as other legal requirements for curriculum in California. These include, but are not necessarily limited to, the following topics:

- The model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities.
- The model curriculum shall include examples of courses offered by local educational agencies that have been approved as meeting the A–G admissions requirements of the University of California and the California State University, including, to the extent possible, course outlines for those courses.
- The model curriculum must meet federal accessibility requirements pursuant to Section 508 of the United States Workforce Rehabilitation Act. Content that cannot be made accessible may not be included in the document.

**Comments:** The addition of the ESMC Guidelines to the Preface is very helpful for both Local Education Agency (LEA) administrators and for teachers. This addition can be enhanced by adding in the statutory requirements section which seem to have been omitted. The text of the ESMC should include the State Board of Education Guidelines as they were approved and add in the one section left out, the statutory requirements.

Preface, *State Board of Education Guidelines*, p. 4 line 76, p. 5 line 99, p. 5 line 112, and p. 6 line 119, **Add:**

### **2. General principles. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:**

- Include accurate information based on current and confirmed research;
- When appropriate, be consistent with the content and instructional shifts in the 2016 History–Social Science Framework, in particular the emphasis upon student-based inquiry in instruction;
- Promote the values of civic engagement and civic responsibility;
- Align to the Literacy Standards for History–Social Studies within the California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History–Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects, as appropriate;

- Promote self and collective empowerment;
- Be written in language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users, including teachers (single and multiple-subject), support staff, administrators, and the community;
- Encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together, highlighting core ethnic studies concepts such as equality, justice, race, ethnicity, indigeneity, etc.;
- Include information on the ethnic studies movement, specifically the Third World Liberation Front (TWLF), and its significance in the establishment of ethnic studies as a discipline and work in promoting diversity and inclusion within higher education;
- Promote critical thinking and rigorous analysis of history, systems of oppression, and the status quo in an effort to generate discussions on futurity, and imagine new possibilities.

### **3. Course Outlines. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:**

- Include course outlines that offer a thematic approach to ethnic studies with concepts that provide space for educators to build in examples and case studies from diverse backgrounds;
- Include course outlines that allow for ethnic studies to be taught as a stand-alone elective or integrated into an existing course (e.g., sociology, English language arts, and history);
- Include course outlines that allow for local, state-specific, national, and global inquiry into ethnic studies;
- Have the capability to engage multiple languages and genealogies;
- Engage a range of disciplines beyond traditional history and social sciences, including but not limited to: visual and performing arts, English language arts, economics, biology, gender & sexuality studies, etc.

### **4. Audience. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:**

- Be sensitive to the needs of all grade levels and incorporated disciplines, providing balance and guidance to the field;
- Engage pedagogies that allow for student and community responsiveness, validate students' lived experience, and address socioemotional development;
- Be inclusive, creating space for all students regardless of race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality, or citizenship, to learn different perspectives.

### **5. Administrative and Teacher Support. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:**

- Be easy to use both for teachers with educational backgrounds in ethnic studies, and those without such experience;
- Provide resources on professional development opportunities;
- Provide information for district and school administrators to support the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum and instruction;
- Provide examples of different methods of instruction and pedagogical approaches;

- Provide support for a collaborative teaching model that encourages teachers to work with colleagues across disciplines, further highlighting the interdisciplinarity of ethnic studies;
- Provide support for the use of technology and multimedia resources during instruction;
- Include access to resources for instruction (e.g., lesson plans, curricula, primary source documents, and other resources) that are currently being used by districts.”

**Comments:** Given that the Guidelines are almost quoted in their entirety, it would be more appropriate, following good citation practices, to cite them completely.

Furthermore, the subject of each bullet point of the Guidelines is rather far from the verbs and objects. Each of the 24 bullet points in the four sections complete the phrase on page 4: “The guidelines state that the curriculum shall:” The bullet points in each of the four subsections would be easier to read if they are cited the way they appear in the original State Board of Education Guidelines:

<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/ethnicguidelines.asp>.

#### \*\*\*\*\*Chapter 1\*\*\*\*\*

Chapter 1, p. 3, lines 53, and 59, close quotes from the CA HSS Framework missing,

**Add missing quotation marks:** “*Defining Ethnic Studies*

The History Social-Science Framework for California Public Schools: Kindergarten through Grade 12 defines ethnic studies in the following passages:

“Ethnic studies is an interdisciplinary field of study that encompasses many subject areas including history, literature, economics, sociology, anthropology, and political science. It emerged to both address content considered missing from traditional curriculum and to encourage critical engagement.”

“As a field, ethnic studies seeks to empower all students to engage socially and politically and to think critically about the world around them. It is important for ethnic studies courses to document the experiences of people of color in order for students to construct counter-narratives and develop a more complex understanding of the human experience. Through these studies, students should develop respect for cultural diversity and see the advantages of inclusion.”

**Comments:** The first two quotes of three paragraphs of quote from the History Social-Science Framework for California Public Schools Framework are missing closing quotation marks.

Chapter 1, p. 4, lines 66-70, **Add:** “At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States. People or person of color is a term used primarily in the United States and is meant to be inclusive among non-white groups, emphasizing common experiences of racism. The field also addresses the concept of intersectionality, which recognizes that people have different overlapping identities, for example, a transgender Latina or a Jewish African American. These intersecting identities shape individuals’ experiences of racism and bigotry.”



**Comments:** Because the concept of intersectionality is complicated and is referenced in the previous passage from the California History-Social Science Framework, adding some examples of intersectional identities can help students appreciate how these multifaceted identities shape individuals' experiences of racism and bigotry. The addition of the term bigotry is helpful here since the Framework reference to intersectionality includes non-racial identities (gender, sexuality, class, and others) that are also subject to prejudice and discrimination, and also because bigotry is specifically referenced in the Preface.

Chapter 1, p. 4. lines 75-82, **Change:** “Beyond providing an important history of groups underrepresented in traditional accounts and an analysis of oppression and power, ethnic studies offers a dynamic inquiry-based approach to the study of Native people and communities of color that encourages utilizing transnational and comparative thematic frameworks to compare ethnic groups in the local community. Thus, the fruitful themes and topics discussed within the field are boundless can range widely from migration to social movements, such as a study of Mexican American texts, the implications of war and imperialism on experiences of Southeast Asian refugees (Vietnamese, Laos, Cambodian, Hmong) in different waves of immigration to the U.S., of African American social movements, and modes of civic engagement, transformational change for the better, pursuit of justice and equity resistance, and Native American/Indigenous cultural retentions, to name a few.”

**Comments:** Chapter 1 defines the focus and emphasis of ethnic studies: “At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States.” (p. 4). In a course that has a lot of ground to cover as this course does, the model curriculum wisely lays out some disciplinary boundaries to prevent students and teachers from being overwhelmed by keeping the emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States. To expand the content to include “transnational and comparative” topics will make the course unmanageable from the outset. Adding language that suggests thematic frameworks and comparing ethnic groups from local demographics will add complexity without overwhelming teachers with breadth, and fulfills the intention of the legislation AB-2016 to customize the course for student demographics. The emphasis on themes is important and aligns with the ESMC Guidelines, section 3, first bullet.

Similarly including language about themes and topics being “boundless” fails to provide teachers with structured guidance, and seems at odds with the goal of this section which is to simply share some examples of potential fruitful topics to explore with students.

Civic engagement should be included here as it is key method of transformational change and a key value in:

- The California History Social Science Framework
- College, Career and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards (C3 Framework)
- The State Seal of Civic Engagement AB-24  
<https://www.cde.ca.gov/pd/ca/hs/hssstatesseal.asp>



The suggested addition of “transformational change for the better” is a direct quote that comes from R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview, p. 74 in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018. The full quote is: “As critically conscious holistic beings, how do we understand ourselves and our world in relation to the four macroscales and help to bring about transformational change for the better.” This phrase emphasizes the ultimate outcome, overcoming inequality and discrimination, rather than one means, resistance. The foundational values by Cuauhtin emphasize positive change and transformation, imagining a better society, not merely resistance for resistance sake, but towards positive goals. Including the methods (social movements, civic engagement, change) and the end goals (transformation, cultural continuity, the holistic well-being of all, pursuit of justice and equity, overcoming inequality) sets an important tone for teachers, less about violence than transformation. This revision around transformational change and the addition of “pursuit of justice and equity” is also in keeping with the first of the Carlos E. Cortés Guiding Principles and Outcomes (Pursuit of Justice and Equity) which states: “Ethnic studies should also examine individual and collective efforts to challenge and overcome inequality and discriminatory treatment.” (Chapter 1, p. 10).

If the detailed content of lessons is expanded to cover all push factors, this will no longer be a course studying racial and ethnic groups in the United States. There is a difference between a summary of push factors in migration, and a lesson on war and imperialism in world history. Teaching lessons on the experiences of Southeast Asian refugees (Vietnamese, Laos, Cambodian, Hmong) in the U.S. and the different waves of immigration before and after the Migration and Refugee Assistance Act of 1975 and the Refugee Act of 1980, will acknowledge push factors while honoring the emphasis of ethnic studies as defined in Chapter 1 (cited above), and respect the distinction between ethnic studies and world history as distinct disciplines.

Chapter 1, p. 6, line 134, **Add:** “At the state level, the California State Legislature has drafted and voted on several bills to help bolster support for ethnic studies implementation at the K–12 level, including Assembly Bill 2016 ([https://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill\\_id=201520160AB2016](https://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201520160AB2016)), which authorized the development of this document.”

**Comments:** Add link to the legislation and its language. Just as there are references to other key documents and resources, the legislation on which the model curriculum is based should also be referenced. This reference follows the model of parenthetical inserts used in the Preface for referring to the History-Social Science Framework. An alternative would be to add this as a footnote and adjust the footnotes on the page.

Chapter 1, p. 7, lines 155, 157, 159-160, 161-162, p. 8. Lines 167-168, 169-171, 172.

**Comments:** Most of the statements regarding the impact of ethnic studies include supporting footnote references, and additional references should be added to the remaining claims. This is important modeling for students to provide the evidence for assertions of impact.

Chapter 1, p. 8, new section before current line 173, **Add:** **“How Do You Teach Ethnic Studies in a K–12 Environment?”**

Ethnic studies highlights the importance of untold stories, and emphasizes the danger of a single story. In *The Danger of a Single Story*, Nigerian writer Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie argues that reducing people to a single story creates stereotypes and denies their humanity. Each ethnic community has its own unique history, struggles, and contributions, and these are to be taught, understood, and celebrated as ethnic studies focuses on U.S. culture and history from the perspective of marginalized groups. In addition, diversity and diverse perspectives within an ethnic group should also be taught to avoid reducing a group to a single story. In order to do this, teachers should trust students’ intellect and teach them to think critically, understand different and competing perspectives and narratives, and encourage them to form their own opinions. Care should be taken to ensure that (1) teachers present topics from multiple points of view and represent diverse stories and opinions within groups, (2) teaching resources represent a range of different perspectives, and (3) lessons are structured so students examine materials from multiple perspectives and come to their own conclusions.[new footnote]: Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, TED Talk, October 7, 2009: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D9lhs241zeg>.”

**Comments:** This addition highlights that a major goal of ethnic studies is to teach diverse stories and empower students to engage with and analyze complex information, construct their own understandings, and imagine new futures.

The first section of Chapter 1 focuses on the reasons to teach ethnic studies in a K-12 environment (the why) and includes subsections which cover definition, history, and benefits. The next section lacks an overarching organizational framework, but clearly answers the question of *how* to teach ethnic studies in a K-12 environment. Making this question explicit would help the reader. Chapter 2 goes into much more depth on implementation, but the content that is provided in Chapter 1 from pages 8 through 15 provides a high level overview that really explains *how* to teach ethnic studies in K-12. Accordingly, it would be helpful to add this as a section heading here and to the table of contents at the beginning of the chapter.

Before delving into the Values, Principles and Outcomes, some additional framing would be helpful, especially as many new teachers and districts will be looking for high level essential considerations before getting into the nitty gritty of implementation as laid out nicely in Chapter 2. In a powerful TED Talk, Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie expressed an idea central to ethnic studies, the danger of a single story, in which people are dehumanized. Ethnic studies centers humanity and emphasizes the multidimensionality of people. This addition highlights the multidimensionality of people, while challenging dominant narratives and stereotypes. R. Tolteka Cuauhtin speaks of the importance of “respecting students as intellectuals,” a concept reflected in this suggested addition (see R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview,” in *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*, eds. Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018, p. 68).

Chapter 1, p. 8, line 173, section title, **Change:** **“Guiding Foundational Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies”**

**Comments:** The sources for this list and the paragraph that introduces them speak of these seven items as “foundational values.” In revising the ESMC, the CDE recommended an edit detailed in Attachment 1: Staff Edits to the July 31, 2020 Draft: “Included ethnic studies principles from the May 2019 draft with slight revisions and included them as ethnic studies **values** to guide teaching and learning.” [Emphasis added.] However, this recommended revision to refer to values was not reflected in the September draft of the ESMC. The sources upon which the content that follows this heading are based refer to “values” or “foundational values,” so this section title is consistent with those sources, with the CDE’s recommended edit, and avoids confusion with the second CDE recommended edit to this chapter noted below. This revision and the next will make the model curriculum clearer and easier to understand for classroom teachers.

To ensure consistency and avoid confusion, conforming edits and references to *Foundational Values* should be made throughout the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

Chapter 1, pp. 8-9, lines 174-199, **Change:** “Given the range and complexity of the field, it is important to identify the key values and principles of Ethnic Studies as a means to offer guidance for the development of Ethnic Studies courses, teaching, and learning. The foundational values of Ethnic Studies are housed in the conceptual model of the “double helix” which interweaves *holistic humanization* and *critical consciousness*.<sup>13</sup> Humanization includes the values of love, respect, hope, and solidarity are based on celebration of community cultural wealth.<sup>14</sup> The values rooted in humanization and critical consciousness shapes the following guiding principles for Ethnic Studies teaching and learning. These are the guiding values and principles each Ethnic Studies lesson should include. Ethnic Studies courses, teaching, and learning will:

1. cultivate empathy, **community actualization**, cultural perpetuity<sup>15</sup>, self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being of all participants, especially Native People/s and people of color;
2. celebrate and honor Native People/s of the land and communities of color by providing a space to share their stories of struggle, success, community collaboration, and solidarity ~~resistance~~, along with their intellectual and cultural wealth;
3. center and place high value on the pre-colonial, ancestral knowledge<sup>16</sup>, narratives, and communal experiences of Native people/s and people of color and groups that is are typically marginalized in society;
4. critique empire-building in history and its relationship to white supremacy, racism<sup>17</sup> and other forms of power and oppression
5. challenge racist, bigoted, discriminatory, imperialist/colonial<sup>18</sup> beliefs and practices on multiple levels<sup>19</sup>
6. connect ourselves to past and contemporary ~~resistance~~ social movements that struggle for social justice and an equitable and democratic society ~~on the global and local levels to ensure a truer democracy~~; and
7. conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for ~~post-imperial life~~ a post-racist, post-systemic racism society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.<sup>20</sup>

**Comments:** In the introduction, there is a fair bit of redundancy so a few edits keep the emphasis while reducing repetition. The changes also align the text to the CDE Staff Edit recommendation noted above.

Item 1: The meaning of the term “community actualization” is likely to be unclear to many readers. We weren’t sure if it meant community empowerment, community re-imagination, equity, change, continuity and growth, or was a riff on self-actualization (another term students and teacher may not recognize). Since the term appears in Chapter 1 and is repeated in the context of alignment for each sample lesson, we recommend adding a definition for the term. The field of ethnic studies will be a new challenge for many teachers and a new subject to most students. Providing a clear definition will help ensure that this value is properly understood.

Item 2: Cuauhtin’s work that is the source for this list emphasizes positive outcomes, as well as struggles, and seeks to highlight stories of success as well as community collaboration, solidarity, allyship, protest, civic participation, struggle, along with intellectual and cultural wealth, and there is a focus on positive activism in addition to a focus on resistance as means of transformation.

Item 3: The way the sentence is written, there is a focus on ancestral knowledge, which is important. At the same time, narratives and communal experiences of people of color and other marginalized groups should be referenced too as they are often ignored by dominant narratives and ways of knowing. Some ethnic and racial communities have experienced a forced break with ancestral knowledge through enslavement (African Americans), prohibitions on cultural traditions (Native Americans), or prohibitions on language continuity (Latinx Americans). To address this, we suggest adding “narratives, and communal experiences” in addition to ancestral knowledge as a way to respect community, familial, and individual narratives, which are also important sources of knowledge. In addition there are other groups who have been traditionally marginalized who have narratives to share, for example, members of the LGBTQ community.

Item 5: Vague references to “imperialist/colonial beliefs” will not translate to students as racism, bigotry, discrimination and these should be spelled out specifically, either in addition to imperialist/colonial beliefs, or instead of those terms. The value being advocated for here is to challenge racism, bigotry, discrimination on individual, institutional, and systemic levels. Some of these situations can be described as colonial, such as when discussing Native Americans, but many other beliefs that ethnic studies is calling to challenge can more accurately be described as racist or bigoted or discriminatory.

Item 6: There are several things to address in item to bring it into alignment with other key concepts and language of the ESMC:

- The current emphasis on resistance movements ignores the broader context of social movements that work within and outside the system, as well as non-violent resistance movements, and other means of achieving social justice and strengthening democracy. The current sole emphasis on resistance suggests it is the only and best option, which is clearly not the position of CDE, nor consistent with other sections of the ESMC.
- The goal here should be clearly stated, the struggle for “an equitable and democratic society.” A “truer democracy” is vague, and echoes Marx’s call for an

overthrow of capitalism. The proposed revision above keeps the emphasis on the goal of an equitable and democratic society, while removing vague and potentially indoctrinating language that will be confusing to most teachers and students. Also unclear is what is being asked for on a global scale? A single political entity? A disruption of global capital? Resistance on the global level is asking a lot of a one semester high school course and is inconsistent with Chapter 1's definition of the focus of Ethnic Studies. A focus on the local, state, and national level is much clearer and more objective for a high school class and aligns with the focus and emphasis of Ethnic Studies laid out at the beginning of Chapter 1.

Item 7: The phrase a "post-imperial life" is a vague reference to the literature of a large and varied field of colonial and post-colonial studies at the university level and is unlikely to be immediately meaningful to 14 year old students. The point of this value is to conceptualize and build an improved society that seeks to end systemic racism and is post-racist. Stating this plainly will be much clearer to teachers and students.

Chapter 1, p. 9, footnote 17, "As well as patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, ~~capitalism~~ economic inequality, ableism, anthropocentrism"

**Comments:** Capitalism as a system is a rather complicated system to study, more suited for an economics course, and there would be insufficient time to adequately address this in an ethnic studies course. What is truly at the heart of ethnic studies is addressing economic inequality. Capitalism as a term and capitalism as a system have many, many competing definitions, old and new, and using "capitalism" here is an overly vague term. Specifically addressing the issue of economic inequality is more effective in a classroom than the study of capitalism in general. With limited instruction time, getting straight to the heart of the issue is more central than stopping to explain early and late Marxism and later centuries varied Marxist definitions of the term, and a deep dive into this will quickly lose students.

Chapter 1, p. 9, line 199, footnote 20 citing the origins of these values, **Change:** "Footnote 20: "Eunice Ho, UCLA Teacher Education Program Ethnic Studies Cohort, Class of 2019, summarizing the work of R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, "The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview, pp. 72-75, in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018."

**Delete:** ~~"Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales and Edward Curammeng, "Pedagogies of Resistance: Filipina/o Gestures of Rebellion Against the Inheritance of American Schooling," in Tracy Buenavista and Arshad Ali, eds., *Education At War: The Fight for Students of Color in America* (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 2018), 233–238."~~

**Comments:** This footnote is intended to support and explain value 7, but the relationship between the cited source and the values is not clear. Since this value originated with Cuauhtin and was summarized by Ho, the footnote should reference the above recommended work. The current footnote referring to *Education at War* should be replaced because 1) the article's focus on education in the Philippines is outside the defined focus of ethnic studies in Chapter 1 (p. 3), and 2) the content of the article in the

footnote is tangential to the value cited. The suggested alternative is a more appropriate footnote as it is the source for the language of the values listed in #7.

Chapter 1, p. 10, line 200, section title, **Add:** “Guiding Principles and Eight Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching”

**Comments:** In revising the ESMC, the CDE added the Carlos E. Cortés Guiding Principles and Outcomes to assist with K-12 implementation of Ethnic Studies. This addition to Chapter 1 was explained in Attachment 1: Staff Edits to the July 31, 2020 Draft ESMC: “Revised section, ‘Guiding Principles and Outcomes of Ethnic Studies Teaching for K–12,’ with language from the June 2019 draft and public comment.” The CDE staff edits’ suggested revision appropriately aligned the guiding principles with the outcomes desired. These revisions were crucial, since principles and outcomes of a curriculum should align. However, when the full ESMC draft was released, these revisions were not reflected in the title of these eight Guiding Principles and Outcomes. Modifying this section title is also more consistent with the title of Cortés’ original work (“High School Ethnic Studies Graduation Requirement, State of California, Suggested Basic Curriculum Principles”), which CDE adapted and incorporated into the model curriculum. This revision therefore aligns the model curriculum text with the CDE staff recommendation and more closely reflects the name of the original source.

Chapter 1, pp. 10-15, lines 200-336

**Comments:** This addition based on the work of the scholar Carlos E. Cortés provides clear language and practical help for implementing ethnic studies in high school classrooms and is clearly aligned with the ESMC Guidelines cited in the Preface.

\*\*\*\*\*Chapter 2: District Implementation Guidance\*\*\*\*\*

Chapter 2, p. 3, insert before line 66, **Add:** “Ensure that students receive appropriate and non-discriminatory instruction and materials. Ensure that district guidelines, professional development, syllabi, classroom instructional materials, and other contents of a locally developed ethnic studies course meet requirements for presenting potentially controversial issues in K-12 public school classrooms. While developing instruction and materials, school districts and local education agencies will follow the additions to the Education Code from AB-331 Pupil Instruction: High School Graduation Requirements: Ethnic Studies:

(G) (iv) Instruction and materials for a course described in clause (ii) shall meet all of the following requirements:

- (I) Be appropriate for use with pupils of all races, religions, genders, sexual orientations, and diverse ethnic and cultural backgrounds, pupils with disabilities, and English learners.
- (II) Not reflect or promote, directly or indirectly, any bias, bigotry, or discrimination against any person or group of persons on the basis of any category protected by Section 220.
- (III) Not teach or promote religious doctrine.



See

[https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billCompareClient.xhtml?bill\\_id=201920200AB331&showamends=false](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billCompareClient.xhtml?bill_id=201920200AB331&showamends=false) accessed 9/17/2020.”

**Comments:** The current draft of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum will be strengthened by including this key legislation, which was adapted from SB-48, the Fair, Accurate, Inclusive, and Respectful (FAIR) Education Act enacted in 2011. AB-331, approved by the California Assembly and Senate in 2020, includes concise and relevant guidelines from the FAIR Education Act. See [https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill\\_id=201120120SB48](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201120120SB48) accessed 9/22/2020.

District administrators, curriculum specialists, ethnic studies teachers, and those developing ethnic studies courses should ensure instruction and materials are appropriate for a wide range of learners and protect students from bias, bigotry, and discrimination. The value of adding this language to the model curriculum is that it will then be readily accessible to teachers and administrators.

If AB-331 is not enacted, this language from the FAIR Act should still be added as it has inherent value with its intent to protect all students from discrimination in school.

The reference information may be included as a footnote or as an in-text reference as determined by CDE staff.

Chapter 2, p. 3, insert after line 66, after the previous addition, **Add:** “Ensure fair and balanced pedagogy. Ensure that pedagogy ‘must support that, in the investigation, presentation and interpretation of facts and ideas within the prescribed course of study, teachers shall be free to examine, present and responsibly discuss various points of view in an atmosphere of open inquiry, provided that the instruction, material, or discussion: is appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students; is a fair and balanced academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship (adapted from the United Teachers – Los Angeles/Los Angeles Unified School District Contract 2014-2017, Article XXV Academic Freedom and responsibility, 1.0 Lesson Content).”<sup>5</sup>”

“Footnote 5 2017 the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team, “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum,” <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf> accessed 9/22/2020.”

**Comments:** In 2017 the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team developed guidelines for teachers to advise them on how to present sometimes challenging topics in K-12 public school ethnic studies classrooms. The team consisted of representatives from LAUSD’s Local District Central; the Division of Special Education; the Multilingual and Multicultural Education Department; Access, Equity and Acceleration Department; and Division of Instruction Content Coordinators to ensure multiple perspectives. See <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf> accessed 9/22/2020

We suggest adding this language because from the outset of developing ethnic

studies for a district, administrators and curriculum specialists should include these kinds of considerations in developing district guidelines, professional development instruction, syllabi, and classroom instructional materials. Both new and experienced teachers of ethnic studies should have these guidelines in mind as they create their courses. The intent of this addition is to guide teachers in the curation of materials on potentially controversial topics ensuring that they provide multiple perspectives, allowing students to come to their own conclusions as a matter of best educational practice.

Chapter 2, p. 10, *Selecting Existing Curricula and Instructional Materials*, insert after line 249, **Add:** “The curriculum frameworks adopted by the SBE also include criteria for the selection of instructional materials that can be used by LEAs as a model.”<sup>4</sup>

For example, the Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials in the California History-Social Science Framework states that: “Materials include the study of issues and historical and social science debates. Students are presented with different perspectives and come to understand the importance of reasoned debate and reliable evidence, recognizing that people in a democratic society have the right to disagree.”<sup>5</sup>

In addition, districts and LEAs should keep in mind Section 60044 of the California Education Code that schools may not use instructional materials that contain “any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or ethnicity, gender, religion, disability, nationality, or sexual orientation, occupation.” California Education Code, Section 60044.<sup>6</sup>

An example of guidelines written by a district on how to implement ethnic studies is “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017.”<sup>7</sup> When districts and LEAs create their own guidelines for teaching ethnic studies in their district, this may serve as a model guideline. LAUSD gathered many district stakeholder groups, found language to summarize how to address balanced pedagogy and instructional materials, and address student and teacher needs in support of teaching ethnic studies.

Footnote 5 See *History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools*, p.182, Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials, item 7. Accessed 9/22/2020.

Footnote 6 California Education Code 60044.

[http://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/codes\\_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&sectionNum=60044](http://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&sectionNum=60044) accessed 9/22/2020.

Footnote 7 See “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017. <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf>. Accessed 9/22/2020.”

**Comments:** This section on *Selecting Existing Curricula and Instructional Materials* begins by addressing the process, but does not provide enough guidance on creating guidelines and considerations for how to select balanced instructional materials to comply with the History-Social Science Framework and Education Codes. The existing reference to selecting K-8 materials, while a starting point, addresses non-controversial issues. Potentially controversial topics arise in ethnic studies, and if districts address how to approach these from the beginning, districts may be able to head off challenges. This addition to the draft can aid districts to learn how one large school district addressed the topic and illustrates how to create a balanced curriculum that ensures

multiple viewpoints are addressed on contentious issues is helpful to the many districts statewide who will create their own guidelines. The addition of a reference to this document could help districts with their own implementation. Alternatively, the draft could add all of this four-page document as a model.

\*\*\*\*\*Chapter 3: Instructional Guidance for K–12 Education\*\*\*\*\*

Chapter 3, p. 9, lines 210-211, **Add:** “This emphasis on citizenship within the pedagogy provides students with a keen sense of ethics, respect, and appreciation for all people, regardless of ethnicity, nationality, gender, sexual orientation, ability, religion, and beliefs. By democratizing the classroom, educators are allowing multiple entry points for students to discuss ethnic studies theories like, intersectionality—an analytic framework coined by Black feminist legal scholar, Kimberlé Crenshaw, that captures how multiple identities (race, class, religion, gender, sexuality, ability, etc.) overlap or intersect, creating unique experiences, especially for those navigating multiple marginalized or oppressed identities.<sup>8</sup> Intersectionality helps students better understand the nuances around identity, and provides them with skills to be able to engage and advocate for/with communities on the margins of the margins.”

Footnote 8: “See Kimberlé Crenshaw. “Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color.” *Stanford Law Review* 43, no. 6 (July 1991): 1241–99.”

**Comments:** Religion as a key component of identity for most ethnic groups, and the text should note that the term Intersectionality has grown to include a variety of components of identities, including religious identity, and so religion should be added to the list of multiple intersecting identities that captures other important identities. Sikhs may be oppressed or discriminated against on the basis of their outward religious appearance or on the basis of their racial identities as people of color. The same is true for Jews of color such as African American Jews, Latinx American Jews, Asian American Jews, or Middle Eastern and North African American Jews.

Chapter 3, p. 11, line 243, the novel *Things Fall Apart*, **Change vignette:**

**Comments:** This important novel by Nigerian writer Chinua Achebe is an excellent option for teaching World Literature or World History. With its sole focus on life and culture in Nigeria, its connection to the defined scope of ethnic studies as described in Chapter 1, the American experience of marginalized groups, is unclear. CDE may wish to identify a piece of literature with connections to the History-Social Science Framework and ELA/ELD Framework that also directly connects to the focus of ethnic studies as defined in the model curriculum, Chapter 1, p. 4, lines 66-67.

Chapter 3, p. 21, lines 531-537, *Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies*, **Add:** This course can explore a broad range of topics and events pertaining to the Asian American and Pacific Islander experiences, and examine their contributions to U.S. history. Topics may include: immigration, intergenerational conflict, the myth of the model minority, the internment of Japanese Americans, U.S. Supreme Court Case *Lau v. Nichols* regarding the right to an equal education, the unique experiences of Southwest Asians (Middle Easterners) such as Arabs, ~~and other Middle Easterners~~ Armenians, Assyrians,

Chaldeans, Iranians, Jews, Kurds, Yazidis, Filipina/o/x, South Asians such as Sikhs, Afghans, Bangladeshis, Indians, Pakistanis, and Sri Lankans, Southeast Asians, such as, Cambodians, Hmong, Laotians, Indonesians, Malaysians, Myanmarers, Thais and Vietnamese, East Asians, such as Chinese, Japanese, Koreans, Taiwanese, Filipina/o/x, Pacific Islanders, and U.S. colonialism and imperialism in the Pacific.”

**Comments:** This list illustrates the range of groups covered by Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies. Since this area covers a large geographical range, and what groups are included in both the westernmost and easternmost areas are not so obvious some examples of those regions should be detailed.

Especially included should be ethnic communities: 1) with significant populations in California,

(<https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?q=ACSDP1Y2019.DP05%20California&g=0400000US06&tid=ACSDP1Y2019.DP05&hidePreview=true>), and

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Asian\\_Americans\\_in\\_California](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Asian_Americans_in_California), and 2) ethnic groups from these regions not represented elsewhere in the model curriculum.

The geographic boundaries of the origins of the Latinx community (North, Central and South America, and the Iberian Peninsula) are easier to define, but the boundaries of the origins of Asian American and Pacific Islander communities are more challenging, so need to be delineated explicitly.

Southwest Asia (often but not completely synonymous with the Middle East) contains many non-Arab ethnic groups, many of whom have significant populations residing within California. Lumping these distinct ethnic communities in one group “other Middle Easterners” overlooks the unique experiences of these Southwest Asian American communities, and so Arabs, Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Iranians, Jews, Kurds, and Yazidis should be specifically included.

South Asia includes Afghanistan, Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and a few others, and includes the Sikhs, a separate group from the Hindu majority in India. There is a large Sikh diaspora community in California mainly from Punjab. Sikhs are omitted from ethnic studies despite experiences of explicit discrimination based on their religion and as a community of color.

Southeast Asia includes Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand and Vietnam. There is also a sizable Hmong community in California, and so they should also be listed.

East Asia includes China, Japan, Korea, and Taiwan, and there are significant populations of all four of these communities in California.

Chapter 3, p. 33, lines 858-869, *Sample Theme #2: History and Movement*, **Add:**

“Populations Displaced by War and Genocide – Students can conduct studies of how other populations affected by war or genocide have migrated to the United States. Historical examples include the population of Armenian Americans that settled in California in the aftermath of the Armenian Genocide. Another example is the effect that World War II and the Holocaust had upon the American Jewish population. A more contemporary study could be based on the migration of Iranians, Iraqis, Syrians, Afghans, and along with other refugees from the Middle East to California and the United States as a result of the recent wars in that region. Topics can include the experiences of the members of these groups and the political shifts and reactions that

each event prompted within the United States. The CDE's Model Curriculum for Human Rights and Genocide is a useful resource on these topics

(<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/im/documents/modelcurrichrgenoc.pdf>)."

**Comments:** California has a significant population of refugees from the Middle East and Afghanistan, the majority of whom have arrived since the 1970s up to recent years as a result of war. This includes Afghans, Iranians including Armenians and Jews, Iraqis including Assyrians and Chaldeans, and Syrians. Since Afghanistan is not part of the Middle East, the slight change in language above ensures the sentence's accuracy.

Chapter 3, p. 24, lines 620-628, **Change:** "As identity and the use of power are central to ethnic studies courses, instructors should demonstrate a willingness to reflect critically on their own perspective and personal histories as well as engage students as co-investigators in the inquiry process. A wide range of sources (e.g., literature, memoirs, art, music, oral histories) and ~~remnants~~ elements of popular culture can be utilized to better understand the experiences of historically disenfranchised groups—such as Native Americans, African Americans, Chicana/o and Latina/o, and Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders. At the same time, students should be aware of how the different media have changed over time and how that has shaped the depiction of the different groups."

**Comments:** Typo.

Chapter 3, p. 38, line 965, Table Sample Lesson Template, row 3, **Change:** "Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment."

**Comments:** To ensure consistency and avoid confusion, conforming edits and references to *Foundational Values* should be made throughout the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum, in chapters 1, 3, and Appendix B.

#### \*\*\*\*\*Chapter 4: Bibliography\*\*\*\*\*

Chapter 4, p. 4, lines 88-93, **Reorder alphabetically:**

~~"Paris, Django, and H. Samy Alim, eds. *Culturally Sustaining Pedagogies: Teaching and Learning for Justice in a Changing World*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press, 2017.~~

Ochoa O'Leary, Romero, Cabrera & Rascón, M. *Assault in Ethnic Studies in Arizona Firestorm: Global Immigration Realities, National Media, and Provincial Politics*. London, U.K.: Rowman & Littlefield Publishing, Co., 2012.

Paris, Django, and H. Samy Alim, eds. *Culturally Sustaining Pedagogies: Teaching and Learning for Justice in a Changing World*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press, 2017."

**Comments:** The Ochoa and Paris bibliography items are out of alphabetical order

Chapter 4, p. 4, line, 94, **Add:** "Omi, Michael, and Howard Winant. *Racial Formation in the United States*. 3rd Edition. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2014."

**Comments:** This book theorizes race as an ongoing process of formation rather than a fixed set of categories and structures, and shows the pervasiveness with which race permeates society, and the fluidity of racial meanings and identities. Christine Sleeter



recommends it as an important work that introduced the ideas of racial formation and racialization. This work is referenced in very many works on ethnic studies and explains key topics in theories of race. Originally published in 1986, this recent edition was updated in 2014.

Chapter 4, p.4, line 101, **Add:** "Schaefer, Richard T. *Racial and Ethnic Groups*, 15th Edition. Hoboken, N.J.: Pearson Higher Education, 2019."

**Comments:** This comprehensive ethnic studies textbook used by Los Angeles Unified School District starts with chapters about theories of race, ethnicity, prejudice, and discrimination, before addressing specifically many racial and ethnic minority groups in the United States. It includes first person accounts, primary sources, and covers race and ethnic relations in a sociohistorical context. The book and its online resources provide teachers with a digital collection of tools to aid in classroom instruction.

Chapter 4, p. 5, line 117, **Add both editions:**

"Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror: A History of Multicultural America*. Revised Edition. NY: Hachette Book Group, 2008."

Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror for Young People: A History of Multicultural America*. Adapted by Rebecca Stefoff. NY: Seven Stories Press, 2012."

**Comments:** Ronald Takaki's ethnic studies textbook *A Different Mirror* is cited in the ESMC Chapter 3, p. 16, lines 382-387, and so it should be cited in Chapter 4 in the bibliography. This ethnic studies textbook is the most widely-used textbook in California ethnic studies classrooms as of 2020, and is listed on the ethnic studies syllabi and guidelines of a wide variety of school districts in the state. There are two versions in use today, a shorter adapted text, and the longer, original text, long used in lower division ethnic studies classrooms. Both are appropriate reading levels for high school students, and both can be used to provide the history of the four core groups, African Americans, Asian Americans, Latinx Americans, and Native Americans, and so both should be added to this bibliography.

Christine Sleeter states of this text: "Written by arguably the leader of ethnic studies in the United States, this book is one of the best multicultural U.S. histories." (Christine Sleeter and Curtis Acosta, "Ethnic Studies in the United States," <https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199756810/obo-9780199756810-0104.xml> August 2020, accessed 9/14/2020. Takaki was a major founding scholar of the field of ethnic studies from UC Berkeley, and his seminal work, so often used as the foundational text in high school ethnic studies classrooms, should be included in the bibliography in both editions.

Chapter 4, p. 6, line 132, **Add:** "Wilkerson, Isabel. *Caste: The Origins of Our Discontents*. NY: Random House, 2020."

**Comments:** This investigation of the race-based ranking of human value is helpful for teachers and high school students to delve into the specific structures of racism, and how systemic racism lives on even after the civil rights era. Introducing the term "caste" into the analysis of race and systemic racism, the addition of this book to the bibliography will provide teachers with another tool in their toolkit for theorizing stratification and race in ethnic studies.



\*\*\*\*\*Appendix A: UC-Approved Course Outlines\*\*\*\*\*

## Appendix A: UC-Approved Course Outlines

Appendix A: p. 8, Unit 6: Irish and Jewish Americans: Redefining White and American,  
**Add footnote:**

We will examine the differences between the reception of Jewish and Irish immigrants to what it means to be Jewish and Irish now in the twenty first century. We will discuss parallels between language used to describe Irish and Jewish immigrants to those used in the early years of the United States to describe Native Americans. Students will investigate labor disputes and how they were ended and how that relates to the redefining of white. Posing questions on who gets to decide those that get to join the 'club' and why. Students will write a paper detailing certain events in American history that have led to Jewish and Irish Americans gaining racial privilege.<sup>1</sup> They will be asked to think critically about why and who is allowing this evolution in white identity and how this shift is affecting the identity of Irish and Jewish Americans.

"1. This unit provides an interesting comparative example, however, it is important to note that a significant portion of the Jewish community includes Jews of Color (African Americans, Asian Americans, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x-Americans, and Middle Eastern and North African-Americans). To accurately reflect the experiences of Jewish Americans, study of this topic should both recognize the diversity within the Jewish community and the ongoing reality of prejudice and discrimination, which may co-exist with privilege for some fair-skinned Jews."

**Comment:** While an approved course outline cannot be modified, we believe this particular unit would benefit greatly from the addition of a clarifying footnote. Given the reality of the diversity of the Jewish American community today, it is important for students to understand that Jews come in a variety of skin tones, and that even Jews with fair skin continue to experience antisemitism, while also benefiting from privilege. Presenting American Jews as all white or as coming from Europe erases the experiences of Jew of Color and is simply inaccurate. This complex reality should be recognized, and is very much in keeping with ethnic studies' emphasis on intersectionality. Jews of Color experience compounding prejudices, including systemic racism and antisemitism.

Appendix A, p. 72, lines 1992-1993, **Address:** "Arab & Arab American Feminisms: Gender, Violence, & Belonging Edited by Evelyn Alsultany, Nadine Christine Naber, and Rabab Abdulhadi;"

**Comments:** This comment focuses on concerns with a single reference and is not a critique of the sample course outline as a whole. This particular reference in the Introduction to Ethnic Studies course outline, from Salinas Union High School District, Unit 7: Women's Rights/Feminism is problematic and includes inflammatory and prejudiced rhetoric that violates Superintendent Thurmond's and CDE's commitment to keeping out of the ESMC language that is antisemitic or can be perceived as antisemitic. We understand that UC-approved course outlines cannot simply be edited like other chapters and appendices, and we appreciate that there is valuable content in

this course outline outside of this reference. We ask that CDE identify an appropriate solution that ensures this source is not held up as a model, when it unfortunately traffics in prejudiced notions equating Zionism (Jewish nationalism) with racism, conspiracy-type theories about Israel and the U.S., and anti-Jewish tropes. Specific examples connected to these points follow.

Zionism, the movement for Jewish self-determination in their historic homeland is labeled as racism, while Palestinian national aspirations are labeled as liberation struggles. Individuals are entitled to their views on nationalism. Denying self-determination to only one group of people in the world, Jews, is prejudiced. The relationship between the U.S. and Israel is depicted as a driver of anti-Arab and Islamophobic sentiment, especially after the terrorist attacks of 9/11. Descriptions of the impact of 9/11 seem to reinforce claims that Israel and/or Jews are to blame for masterminding the attacks. Portraying Israel as the source of all malignancy in the world or as desiring to control the world builds on centuries-old anti-Jewish ideas. Whatever the authors' personal intentions, without further clarification these analyses of 9/11 and the wars in the Middle East could easily reinforce anti-Jewish sentiment on school campuses, which has risen sharply since the book's publication in 2011.

The poem "Beyond Words" by Suheir Hammad with which the book opens conjures up several anti-Jewish tropes: "This type of behavior [rape, torture, humiliation] / Sanctioned violence in the name of a god / Who does not have enough love for us all / A god who chooses sides / A god who has favorites and chosen ones...." (p. 4) Mischaracterizations of "chosenness" have been, and are still, central to anti-Jewish prejudice. In another passage she writes, "I am not the child shot in the head by the Israeli Defense Forces / I am not the starving AIDS inflicted mother..." (p. 6) Associating Israel with the ravages of AIDS, particularly with such violent imagery, reinforces conspiracy theories that claim Jews and/or Israel are the source of AIDS, unleashing it on the world much in the way Jews were accused of poisoning wells during the Middle Ages.

In addition, the text relies upon a single story about Israel, by Ella Shohat, a scholar who has a particular animus against Israel. While every individual is entitled to her/his/their perspective on heated topics, ethnic studies emphasizes the importance of multidimensionality and diverse voices. Furthermore, as noted in Chapter 2, the Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials in the California History-Social Science Framework states that: "Materials include the study of issues and historical and social science debates. Students are presented with different perspectives and come to understand the importance of reasoned debate and reliable evidence, recognizing that people in a democratic society have the right to disagree." This is the only perspective presented in a resource in the ESMC with regards to Israel. There can be no debate when there is a lack of diverse voices and perspectives on a given subject. Accordingly, we ask that CDE identify a solution to ensure that all content in the ESMC upholds existing legislation and is in alignment with the History-Social Science Framework.

\*\*\*\*\***Appendix B: Sample Lessons and Topics**\*\*\*\*\*

Appendix B: Sample Lessons and Topics, p. 3, line 45, **Delete:** “The following sample lessons are aligned to the ~~to the~~ ethnic studies values, and to the guiding principles, and outcomes from Chapter 1 and the state-adopted content standards in history–social science, English language arts and literacy, and English language development.”

**Comments:** Delete the typo of the repeated words “to the to the” to correct this sentence. Also align language to Chapter 1, and match formatting conventions used elsewhere in the draft for consistency and polish, e.g., capitalization of the c in Chapter. CDE may wish to capitalize the specific standards referenced, as well as the values, guiding principles and outcomes as they represent proper names/titles in this context.

Appendix B, p. 3, 49-64, **carry over changes suggested in Chapter 1, p. 9, lines 184-199.**

**Comments:** See suggested changes to the seven ethnic studies foundational values for Chapter 1, p. 9, lines 184-199.

Appendix B, p. 7 line 136; p. 12 line 242; p. 19 line 382; p. 29 line 622; p. 34 line 736; p. 51 line 968; p. 58 line 1123; p. 67 line 1326; p.79 line 1529; p. 87 line 1715; p. 94 line 1889; p. 114 line 2262; p. 124 line 2468; p. 136 line 2759;

**Change:** “Ethnic Studies Foundational Values and Principles Alignment”

**Comments:** To ensure consistency and avoid confusion, conforming edits and references to *Foundational Values* should be made throughout the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

Appendix B, p. 20, lines 400-401, **Change:** “1. Draw connections between what they learned from the lesson overview, *A Raisin in the Sun*, and their own narratives, highlighting the overarching theme of housing inequality.”

**Comments:** The title *A Raisin in the Sun* should be italicized.

Appendix B, p. 20, lines 409-411, **Change:** “4. Analyze Lorraine Hansberry’s play, *A Raisin in the Sun*, identifying key themes as they relate to housing discrimination, and become familiar with the use of dramatic devices in written plays.”

**Comments:** The title *A Raisin in the Sun* should be italicized.

Appendix B, pp. 126-127, lines 2528-2533. **Delete:** “After splitting the class into two groups, have the first group read an excerpt from *An Indigenous People’s History of the United States*- (<http://www.beacon.org/An-Indigenous-Peoples-History-of-the-United-States-P1164.aspx>, click on “Excerpt”).”

**Comments:** Delete accidental hyphen between the citation and the link.

Appendix B, pp. 126-127, lines 2528-2533. **Delete or replace:**

“Meanwhile, have the second group read the introduction from *A Patriot’s History of the United States: From Columbus’s Great Discovery to the War on Terror* (excerpted below) Andrew Jackson’s “1830 Message to Congress on Indian Removal” (provided below)

Ask each group to have a discussion addressing the following prompts and questions after they have finished reading their assigned text:

1. What are the main arguments? What does the author assume? Do you agree or disagree?
2. In mixed pairs (one person from each group), compare and contrast the two authors' perspectives on how the nation was built and why this matters.
3. In those same pairs, discuss which perspective you would identify as the master narrative [provide a definition] and why? Which perspective might be the counter narrative [provide a definition]?"

**Comments:** In examining the *Sample Lesson 13: This is Indian Land: The Purpose, Politics and Practice of Land Acknowledgment*, the overall goal of this lesson is an important, impactful and a good selection for the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

However, one activity within the lesson falls short and fails to meet the lesson's overall objective. The overall goal of the lesson is to understand the purpose of land acknowledgement, an important topic for ethnic studies. Importantly, the excerpt from *An Indigenous People's History of the United States* is directly connected to the focus of the lesson. The goal of the activity is to compare a "master narrative" and a "counter narrative" about the history of the United States. To this end, students are asked to compare two excerpts. However, the lesson does not provide definitions of these key terms, making this a challenging activity for students to undertake. Defining key terms is an essential best practice in education, and **definitions of master narrative and counter narrative should be added to the lesson and provided where indicated above in square brackets.**

The excerpt selected to represent a master narrative seems less a master narrative than a polemic with a particular axe to grind. If the goal of the lesson is to teach students to discern underlying narratives, the lesson should define its terms and the activity should (1) represent sincere arguments and not a caricature of a position (master or otherwise), and (2) be on the same topic broadly speaking. The selection excerpted in the draft from *A Patriot's History* is a polemic against a multicultural vision of American history, and is not a sincere example of a master narrative. Moreover, it is not directly connected to the focus of the lesson (land acknowledgement), and does not support the goal of the activity to understand master and counter narratives, and so should be replaced.

Additionally, the excerpt from *A Patriot's History* contains an incorrect reference to "Lionel Cohen" as a founder of the Lionel Corporation. Joshua Lionel Cowen was the inventor and founder of Lionel trains. The way the stereotypical name Cohen is cited here is an antisemitic dog whistle, and is setting up Jews as a straw man in the phrase "immigrant Jew." The line is: "With secure property rights, anyone could become successful, from an immigrant Jew like Lionel Cohen and his famous Lionel toy trains..." This derogatory sentence along with this entire excerpt should be deleted from the ESMC.

To achieve the goal of having students compare a master narrative and a counter narrative, students could read a primary source that disregards Native American land rights. A brief, readily available primary source that presents a clear on-topic example of a master narrative is Andrew Jackson's "1830 Message to Congress on Indian Removal," *Register of Debates in Congress*, 2nd Session, 21st Congress,

Vol. VII, Washington: Gales and Seaton, 1831, pp. ix-x, 277-279. Copy of original document: <https://memory.loc.gov/cgi-bin/ampage?collId=llrd&fileName=010/llrd010.db&recNum=438> or see the easier to read transcript:

<https://www.ourdocuments.gov/doc.php?flash=false&doc=25&page=transcript>

Alternatively, two excerpts on the same topic from two perspectives could be added, such as two essays on Thanksgiving, on western expansion, or on manifest destiny illustrating a master narrative and a counter narrative.

Appendix B, p. 130, line 2629, Materials and Resources list, **Delete or replace:**

~~“A Patriot’s History of the United States (see excerpt below)~~

~~“Andrew Jackson’s 1830 Message to Congress on Indian Removal” (see transcript below).”~~

**Comments:** Delete or replace *A Patriot’s History* reference to a more suitable master narrative example such as that suggested above.

Appendix B: pp. 131- 135, lines 2634-2636, and 2721-2729, **Delete and Replace:**

~~“Excerpt from the Introduction of *A Patriot’s History of the United States: From Columbus’s Great Discovery to the War on Terror* by Larry Schweikart and Michael Allen (New York: Penguin Group, 2004). . . .~~

~~Yet virtue and character alone were not enough. It took competence, skill, and talent to build a nation. That’s where property came in: with secure property rights, people from all over the globe flocked to America’s shores. With secure property rights, anyone could become successful, from an immigrant Jew like Lionel Cohen and his famous Lionel toy trains to an Austrian bodybuilder turned millionaire actor and governor like Arnold Schwarzenegger. Carnegie arrived penniless; Ford’s company went broke; and Lee Iacocca had to eat crow on national TV for his company’s mistakes. Secure property rights not only made it possible for them all to succeed but, more important, established a climate of competition that rewarded skill, talent, and risk taking.”~~

“From Andrew Jackson’s 1830 Message to Congress on Indian Removal

It gives me pleasure to announce to Congress that the benevolent policy of the Government, steadily pursued for nearly thirty years, in relation to the removal of the Indians beyond the white settlements is approaching to a happy consummation. Two important tribes have accepted the provision made for their removal at the last session of Congress, and it is believed that their example will induce the remaining tribes also to seek the same obvious advantages.

The consequences of a speedy removal will be important to the United States, to individual States, and to the Indians themselves. The pecuniary advantages which it promises to the Government are the least of its recommendations. It puts an end to all possible danger of collision between the authorities of the General and State Governments on account of the Indians. It will place a dense and civilized population in large tracts of country now occupied by a few savage hunters. By opening the whole territory between Tennessee on the north and Louisiana on the south to the settlement

of the whites it will incalculably strengthen the southwestern frontier and render the adjacent States strong enough to repel future invasions without remote aid. It will relieve the whole State of Mississippi and the western part of Alabama of Indian occupancy, and enable those States to advance rapidly in population, wealth, and power. It will separate the Indians from immediate contact with settlements of whites; free them from the power of the States; enable them to pursue happiness in their own way and under their own rude institutions; will retard the progress of decay, which is lessening their numbers, and perhaps cause them gradually, under the protection of the Government and through the influence of good counsels, to cast off their savage habits and become an interesting, civilized, and Christian community.

What good man would prefer a country covered with forests and ranged by a few thousand savages to our extensive Republic, studded with cities, towns, and prosperous farms embellished with all the improvements which art can devise or industry execute, occupied by more than 12,000,000 happy people, and filled with all the blessings of liberty, civilization and religion?

The present policy of the Government is but a continuation of the same progressive change by a milder process. The tribes which occupied the countries now constituting the Eastern States were annihilated or have melted away to make room for the whites. The waves of population and civilization are rolling to the westward, and we now propose to acquire the countries occupied by the red men of the South and West by a fair exchange, and, at the expense of the United States, to send them to land where their existence may be prolonged and perhaps made perpetual. Doubtless it will be painful to leave the graves of their fathers; but what do they more than our ancestors did or than our children are now doing? To better their condition in an unknown land our forefathers left all that was dear in earthly objects. Our children by thousands yearly leave the land of their birth to seek new homes in distant regions. Does Humanity weep at these painful separations from everything, animate and inanimate, with which the young heart has become entwined? Far from it. It is rather a source of joy that our country affords scope where our young population may range unconstrained in body or in mind, developing the power and facilities of man in their highest perfection. These remove hundreds and almost thousands of miles at their own expense, purchase the lands they occupy, and support themselves at their new homes from the moment of their arrival. Can it be cruel in this Government when, by events which it can not control, the Indian is made discontented in his ancient home to purchase his lands, to give him a new and extensive territory, to pay the expense of his removal, and support him a year in his new abode? How many thousands of our own people would gladly embrace the opportunity of removing to the West on such conditions! If the offers made to the Indians were extended to them, they would be hailed with gratitude and joy.

And is it supposed that the wandering savage has a stronger attachment to his home than the settled, civilized Christian? Is it more afflicting to him to leave the graves of his fathers than it is to our brothers and children? Rightly considered, the policy of the General Government toward the red man is not only liberal, but generous. He is unwilling to submit to the laws of the States and mingle with their population. To save



him from this alternative, or perhaps utter annihilation, the General Government kindly offers him a new home, and proposes to pay the whole expense of his removal and settlement.”

**Comments:** Delete and replace the excerpt from *A Patriot’s History of the United States* per previous two recommendations. We have offered a topically relevant suggestion from Andrew Jackson’s “1830 Message to Congress on Indian Removal” as an option and illustration of a master narrative for this activity. CDE may wish to provide a different master narrative example. The choice should be connected to land acknowledgement like the excerpt from *An Indigenous People’s History of the United States*.