

CTA's Addendum Regarding Recommendations on the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Chapter	Page	Line(s)	Recommendations
Preface	3	57-58	Change Native American and Indigenous to Native American
"	3	58	Change Asian American to Asian American and Pacific Islander
"	4	67	Add "and the teacher on record" after local education agencies and define how much flexibility is provided
"	4	69-71	Delete "and other forms of bigotry including anti-Semitism and Islamophobia" and put a period after "racism". Ethnic Studies centers on race.
"	4	73-75	Add a footnote citation on where the 4 sample themes came from and show their connection to the Ethnic Studies Guiding Principles
"	6-7	148-152	Instead of referencing the 9 <sup>th</sup> grade course of study for Ethnic Studies, add it into this document
One	2	17-47	Begin the introduction section entitled, Why Teach Ethnic Studies with elevating the voices of Students of Color who have advocated for Ethnic Studies. It should also draw upon the 52 years of Ethnic Studies expertise, methods, theories, and pedagogy. Teaching Ethnic Studies empowers our communities by teaching the truth and engaging them in social change.
"	3	51-66	Use the definition from the experts, not from the H/SS Framework. The definition we recommend is from the Liberated Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Coalition:  "Ethnic Studies is the interdisciplinary field that encompasses Africana/Black/African American Studies, American Indian/Alaskan Native/Native American Studies, Asian American/Pacific Islander Studies, Arab American Studies, and Chicanx/Latinx Studies. These disciplines contend with racism, white supremacy, and nation within nation relationships. By centering the stories, experiences, and perspectives of the aforementioned groups, intertribal, and mixed race people, Ethnic Studies uses community epistemologies, content, and pedagogy to educate students to be socially, politically, environmentally and economically conscious of their personal connections to local and (trans)national histories and herstories."

			<p>“Students in these courses study imperialism, coloniality, oppression, hegemony, privilege, and power--through the intersectional lenses of race, ethnicity, culture, gender, sexuality, ability, language, indigeneity, immigrant status, and class. We analyze systems of power through engagement with anti-racist, social justice activism as a means towards sovereignty, self-determination, and/or community actualization. Reflection, naming, dialogue, and community responsive action drive the learning, and support the belief that each person has important narratives, stories, and voices to share. Students will have the opportunity to cultivate intersectional solidarity with groups of people, locally and (trans)nationally, to foster active community responsiveness, social engagement, radical healing, critical hope and love, and a reimagined future.”</p>
“	8	174	Regarding the Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies, we recommend that the IQC give equal importance and complementary explanation to the Guiding Values as you did the Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies Teaching. The Eight Outcomes are the heart of multiculturalism. The Guiding Values are the heart of teaching Ethnic Studies and deserves extended elaboration.
“	9	174-329	Regarding the 8 Outcomes of Ethnic Studies Teaching, these are desirable outcome for a multicultural curriculum, not Ethnic Studies. Recommend that there be less emphasis on the 8 Outcomes or delete them and recommend that the emphasis be placed on the Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies for a more coherent strength based outcome for Ethnic Studies
“	9	199	Change “different” to “horrific or dehumanizing”
“	10	201	Change “nuance” to “intentionality”. Delete “drawing from multiple perspectives.”
“	10	205	Change “inclusivity” to “access”. Rationale: You could be included but not have access.
“	10	213	Change “being inclusive of” to “giving voice and agency to”
“	10	220	Add to title: “and Better Understanding of Others”
2	2	26	We recommend that this bullet provide an example of what Ethnic Studies meant to a district. “For

			example, in XYZ School District, they defined what Ethnic Studies defined Ethnic Studies as....”
2	2	30	We recommend that this bullet be more specific about defining community needs. What is the history of race relations in this community? How has demographic changes impacted the community, e.g. changing from a majority white community to majority minority? Is there a vibrant ethnic community, past or present?
“	3	42	In this bullet, we recommend that community organizations, city or county agencies, and universities be included as groups to consult for data and historical information about a community.
“	3	55	In this bullet, more specific sources of funding should be recommended. We recommend that districts look to funds from the LCFF/LCAP, Title I, Title II, or Title III funds. Additional federal entitlement funds could be targeted for an Ethnic Studies curriculum.
“	4	70	In this bullet, it is important to provide incentives to recruit Ethnic Studies educators. Options need to be provided for educators to take college or university ethnic studies courses for continuing education. Consideration should also be made for district to provide incentives for an advanced degree, additional certification, or credits to advance on the salary schedule.
“	4	86	Change the word “pipeline” to “cadre”.
“	4	87	In this bullet, we recommend including comments about professional development needs to be ongoing and recursive. It should not be a one shot and done type of PD. For Ethnic Studies to be successful, there needs to be ongoing reflection, practicum, and sharing.
“	7	175-181	We recommend a disclaimer with the suggestion that educators consult that H/SS and ELA frameworks for suggestions in developing an Ethnic Studies curriculum. These frameworks are written from a Eurocentric mindset and educators need to be able distinguish the differences in perspectives.
3	3	37	Instead of a guide, Chapter 3 reads more like an advice column on developing curriculum. We recommend that more specific content be added to build a coherent curriculum whether it is a stand alone or thematic. Teachers are not curriculum developers and rely on constructive guidance to help them in building and delivering a curriculum.

3	3	47	Add last sentence: "Most importantly, Ethnic Studies empowers students to love themselves and their community".
"	6	110	At the end of line 110, add a paragraph about identity within a local community where individuals made significant contribution to the community. An example is the remarkable history about the contributions of Stockton native, Dawn Bohulano Mabalon, who contributed so much to preserving the history of the Pilipinos in Stockton. Her writings can help build identity and pride in young people. Likewise, there are many of these types of community heroes.
"	14	317	Change "subject matter" to "Ethnic Studies" to clarify that the subject matter means Ethnic Studies
"	15	362-364	Nice reference to SFUSD's efforts
"	15	370	Add "Ethnic Studies theory, disciplinary thought," after "Engagement with"
"	16	375	While the guide suggests "strongly" that educators consult other experts for content, we find it amusing that other guides or frameworks didn't advise educators to consult these experts to integrate Ethnic Studies into their Eurocentric curriculum.
"	17-22		This section on the Stand Alone Course effectively reduced each of four ethnic groups that have traditionally been identified in an Ethnic Studies course from a chapter in the first draft to a section of approximately one page each is a "bleaching out" or "watering down" of the seriousness of the marginalization of each of these groups. The shorter sections with advice and considerations further marginalize each of the ethnic groups. We recommend that the IQC restore each ethnic group to a full chapter with meaningful histories, culture, struggles, themes, and contributions to society.
"	18	446	Add after "demographics", "poverty, geographic barriers such as redlining and urban blight".
"	18	450	Add a sentence at the end: "African American history and its importance is often overlooked or not mentioned in our history books, and it is important to trace and include the role of Black churches in the Civil Rights Movement, the Black Wall Street (Tulsa, OK), Reconstruction and Jim Crow. More importantly, those teaching Ethnic Studies should know about some of the voices who have lived through the movement."

“	18	455	Add after “race”, “religion”
“	19	466-509	This section on Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies lacks identification of historical figures who contributed to the movement. We recommend that relevant historical names and events be added to this section. We suggest less focus on terminology and more on content, such as, the violent colonization and oppression of Indigenous people and robbing and taking the land that belonged to the original Indigenous settlers of their land in the West and Southwest.
“	20-21	516-522	The study of Asian American history and contributions need not be singled out to a particular subgroup or subfields as the guide suggests. Asian American studies is interrelated. We recommend deleting lines 516-522 and replacing it with the following: “Asian American Studies has its ties to the civil rights movement of the 1960s. Asian American and Pacific Islanders are composed of many interconnected groups and cultures in the Pacific rim, South and West Asia. There is a rich history of social activism that involves many nationalities as they immigrated to the United States and were marginalized and discriminated against when they arrived in this country. APIs from all nationalities have been excluded, discounted, mis-represented, blamed, and demonize It is important to examine their lived experiences, their perspectives, and their struggles , and to feature the voices of Asian Americans within the communities where they live.”
“	21	537	Add after “Pacific Islanders”, “Koreans, the Japanese concentration camps,”
3	21	538	This section on Native American Studies need serious attention. We recommend gathering input for this section from Native American educators who could provide knowledge and insight on the cultural ways of knowing and doing, theory and pedagogical concepts, and authentic culturally sustainable and relevant practices. Visibly absent are citations of significant historical figures or events that provide context to the Native American experiences of genocide, political identity, sovereignty, isolation, and marginalization.

4	1	6	The Bibliography needs to be moved to the end of the guide. We also suggest that the citations contain updated content and authors.
Appendix A			We recommend that parts of Appendix A become a chapter in the main part of the guide. This chapter could contain an overview or summary of the courses approved by the UC by titles or topics. We also suggest titles and topics be added to the course focus in the appendix.
Appendix B			We recommend that Appendix B become a chapter in the main part of the guide to demonstrate what a complete lesson would look like using the template in Chapter 3.
Appendix C			Appendix C lacks organization. The process and techniques used to create Safe Spaces and Community Building are borrowed from traditional applications without suggesting how it might be used to create a safe place in an Ethnic Studies environment. Without explanation of how to use these techniques, a misapplication of its intent could quickly lead to unsafe outcomes. We suggest that a statement in the introduction advises an abundance of caution and sensitivity is when an educator thinks about using any of these strategies.