

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum May 2019 Draft

(Download and use to provide specific recommendations)

Include the chapter of the model curriculum, the page number, and line number(s) to ensure that the California Department of Education and Instructional Quality Commission can reference the content of the document when reviewing your comments. Please email this document as a Word document to [ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov](mailto:ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov). You may contact Kenneth McDonald, Education Programs Consultant, at [kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov](mailto:kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov) with any questions regarding this template or the public input process.

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
<i>[Enter the Chapter Number here, or just "General" for a comment that applies to the entire document.]</i>	<b>Dr. Shira Lubliner Professor Emeritus California State University East Bay Teacher Education Department</b>	<i>[Include the page and line number(s) here—Write your comment here]</i>
Chapter 1		The overview of the curriculum states that it will focus “on the experiences of African Americans, Asian Americans, Latinos, Native Americans, and Muslim and Arab Americans.” How were these groups selected? I can understand the inclusion of indigenous people (Native Americans), those who were brought over as slaves (African Americans), and those to whom the land of California once belonged (Latinos). But how is the inclusion of Muslims/Arabs justified when Jews are completely absent from this curriculum?

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 2 of 4

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 2		A redlining deed is used as a source document, demonstrating that properties could not be sold to non-Caucasians. Are the authors aware that such documents were used extensively in California to prevent the sale of houses to Jews. In fact, I have seen such deeds that were used in Orinda, California.
Chapter 2		<p>The curriculum emphasizes that critical thinking is a key part of the learning experience, yet the materials are entirely one-sided, particularly in relationship to Arab/Muslims.</p> <p>Arab/Muslim immigration is described as displacement due to the Nakba (catastrophe). This event refers to the establishment of the State of Israel. The fact that 6 million Jews had just been murdered by the Nazis, the surviving Jews displaced, and their properties and possessions stolen, is not mentioned. Also ignored is the vote of the United Nations to establish the State of Israel and the fact that five Arab nations invaded the tiny state within hours of its declaration of independence. Also ignored is the displacement of Jews from Arab countries in response to this event. Also not mentioned in this curriculum is the military cooperation between Arabs and the Nazis during WWII, numerous massacres of Jews, including many who had lived in this land for countless generations. There are clearly two distinct narratives regarding the establishment of Israel/Nakba. This would be a perfect opportunity for students to learn to use critical thinking skills, if the intent is to educate rather than indoctrinate.</p>
Chapter 2		The Privilege Walk is likely to make White students stand out in a negative way which may increase polarization between students of different races. It also touches on personal and possibly explosive topics that may cause serious blow back from parents.

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 3 of 4

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 4		<p>The following statement from Chapter 4 is extremely biased: BDS is a global social movement that currently aims to establish freedom for Palestinians living under apartheid conditions...</p> <p>Since Arab Israelis are citizens of the State of Israel, serve in the Knesset (Parliament), attend universities, and hold jobs of all kinds, it is puzzling to determine how they are living under apartheid conditions. It appears that the authors of this curriculum are unclear on the meaning of the term “apartheid” or simply wish to demonize Israel. The plight of Palestinians who live in the West Bank and Gaza is a serious concern but so is the issue of Palestinian terrorism. The entire topic of the establishment of Israel is extremely nuanced and requires a high level of expertise if it is to be taught properly. How exactly does this topic belong in a Ethnic Studies Curriculum for the State of California? How can the CDE ensure that teachers across the state will have the knowledge and skills to teach this topic objectively?</p>
Appendices		<p>Asian immigration is discussed including exclusionary practices and WWII Asian American Internment Camps. Yet, no mention is made of WWII German Concentration Camps.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 4 of 4

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Entire Document		<p>White Nationalists present a serious threat to our country, suggesting the need for people of good will to pull together to fight hate. Unfortunately, the coalition of the oppressed does not include Jews. This is true despite attacks on synagogues and Neo-Nazis chanting “The Jews will not replace us!” This curriculum goes even farther than the Neo Nazis. It does not merely replace the Jews with other groups, it erases Jews entirely from the American experience.</p> <p>Another serious flaw with the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum is that is more a program of indoctrination than a curriculum. As educators, we seek to inform students and challenge them to think for themselves. The ESMC appears to be designed to promote “group think” rather than critical thinking. I believe that the ESMC requires serious revisions if it is to be adopted by the California Department of Education.</p>