

## Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum May 2019 Draft

(Download and use to provide specific recommendations)

Include the chapter of the model curriculum, the page number, and line number(s) to ensure that the California Department of Education and Instructional Quality Commission can reference the content of the document when reviewing your comments. Please email this document as a Word document to [ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov](mailto:ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov). You may contact Kenneth McDonald, Education Programs Consultant, at [kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov](mailto:kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov) with any questions regarding this template or the public input process.

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Glossary	Michael Rubenstein	<p>The ESMC Glossary for this course includes, under the letter B, an inaccurate description of BDS. But antisemitism is missing from the Glossary.</p> <p>B Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS)- is a global social movement that currently aims to establish freedom for Palestinians living under apartheid conditions. Inspired by tactics employed during the South African anti-apartheid movement, the Palestinian-led movement calls for the boycott, divestment, and sanctioning of the Israeli government until it complies with International law. BDS proponents and organizers have called for the global community to boycott or withdraw support from Israel and companies associated with it. The second component of BDS calls for governments, banks, universities, and other institutions to withdraw monetary support (divestment) from Israel and its companies. And finally, the third component—sanctions—asks international governments to hold Israel accountable for its actions through legislation, trade and military agreements, among other measures.</p>
Line 4955	Michael Rubenstein	<p>Within the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum ("ESMC"), line 4955 provides a list of recommended topics for students to investigate:</p> <p>Anti-Arab and Muslim Violence</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 2 of 5

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
		<p>Direct Action Front for Palestine and Black Lives Matter  Call to Boycott, Divest, and Sanction Israel  Comparative Border Studies: Palestine and Mexico</p> <p>The facts the ESMC omits are as follows:  The Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions movement against Israel is an antisemitic movement that has as its the goal eradicating the State of Israel. Its founders, including Omar Barghouti, have admitted as much.  Germany has recognized BDS as antisemitic.  The United States Congress has passed repeated resolutions condemning BDS. The most recent in July 2019 received overwhelming bipartisan support, and passed 398-17.  Numerous state legislatures have passed laws that prohibit state agencies from doing business with any firm that supports BDS.  California Assembly Bill 2844 was signed into law by Governor Jerry Brown on September 24, 2016. The law requires those who enter into contracts with state agencies to certify that they are not involved in activities that violate the Unruh Civil Rights Act, including support for the BDS movement and its programs.  Numerous state legislatures have passed laws that prohibit state agencies from doing business with any firm that supports BDS.  California Assembly Bill 2844 was signed into law by Governor Jerry Brown on September 24, 2016. The law requires those who enter into contracts with state agencies to certify that they are not involved in activities that violate the Unruh Civil Rights Act, including support for the BDS movement and its programs.</p>
Line 5157-5163	Michael Rubenstein	<p>The ESMC, at line 5157-5163, adopts the "Nakba" narrative:  The largest single group [of Arab immigrants to the US] was Palestinian, as hundreds of thousands of Palestinians had been displaced in the Nakba (Arabic for "Catastrophe," the term used to describe the dispossession and dispersal of</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 3 of 5

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
		<p>many Palestinian Arabs from the new state of Israel in the 1948 Palestine War). Most of the Arab immigrants to the US in this period, Palestinian and otherwise, were well-educated professionals because restrictive immigration laws kept out those without wealth or a trade.</p> <p>The Facts: This section introduces historical events without providing any factual substance. The following are facts students need to know in order to have a basic understanding of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the current Palestinian predicament: What happened in 1947-48 that led to the Palestinian Arab dispersal? 1) No state of Palestine existed. Two states were proposed – a Jewish one and an Arab one in UN Resolution 181. The resolution was accepted by the Jews and rejected by the Arabs. Arab armies invaded with the stated goal of eradicating the Jewish state. Resolution 242, passed after the 1967 war, forms the basis of a peaceful solution. 2) Most Palestinian Arabs who fled expected to return after the Jews had been defeated. Forcible removal of Arabs by Jewish armed groups was responsible for only a small portion of Palestinian Arab flight. For more, see Palestine Betrayed by Efraim Karsh and The Arab-Israeli Conflict: The Palestine War 1948 also by Efraim Karsh. 3) The Jews are indigenous people of the territory called Palestine. For much of its history it was known as Israel or Judea. The Jewish presence goes back several thousand years. The Arabs arrived as conquerors in the 7th century.</p>
Lines 5157-5163 cont.		4) The Palestine Mandate was a creation of the League of Nations and administered by Britain. It included what is now Jordan in 78% of the total land area.

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 4 of 5

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
		<p>5) The leading Palestinian political figure of the first half of the 20th century was Haj Amin Hussein. He incited violence against Jews and Arabs who sought a peaceful compromise and he collaborated with the Nazis. After World War II ended, he returned to the Middle East and organized a campaign of violence against Jews. See The Mufti of Jerusalem: Haj-Amin el-Husseini and National-Socialism by Jenny Lebel.</p> <p>6) Fatah (1959) and the PLO (1964) were created before Israel took control of the West Bank and Gaza (1967). Their goal was to erase Israel. The Fatah General Congress in 2010 reaffirmed its commitment to violence and dismantling the Jewish state.</p> <p>7) The chief obstacle to moving forward with a peaceful resolution is incitement and indoctrination to reject Israel and vilify Jews that is rampant in Palestinian media, schools, mosques and official messages to the public. Organizations like MEMRI and Palestinian Media Watch have documented on-going incitement to violence and hatred.</p>
Line 6008	Michael Rubenstein	<p>Line 6008 of the ESMC promotes the Council on American-Islamic Relations (CAIR) as a reliable source of information.</p> <p>The Facts:</p> <p>CAIR was an unindicted co-conspirator in the Holy Land terrorist financing trial. It has been labeled a terrorist group by the United Arab Emirates. CAIR has been ousted from the San Diego public schools for promoting Islam.</p>
Line 6010-6181	Michel Rubenstein	<p>The ESMC, at lines 6010-6181, extensively focuses on Islamophobia, yet does not discuss antisemitism.</p> <p>The Facts:</p>

**Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum**

Page 5 of 5

<b>Chapter of Model Curriculum</b>	<b>Your Name and Affiliation</b>	<b>Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)</b>
		<p>FBI figures show much greater prevalence of antisemitism and violence directed against Jews.</p> <p>There is no evidence of legal discrimination against Muslims in the United States.</p> <p>On college campuses, including in California, Jews, especially those who support Israel, are subject to the most extensive harassment.</p>
Lines 5792-5820	Michael Rubenstein	<p>ESMC Lines 5792 and 5820 include a lengthy rap song that calls for “Free Palestine.”</p> <p>The lyrics include the following statement: "The child (divine) Mary doesn't want your punishment, she is going to free the Palestinian soil."</p>