

**From:** Marcy Winograd

**Sent:** Wednesday, November 11, 2020 2:37 PM

**To:** Ethnic Studies <EthnicStudies@cde.ca.gov>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] My comments on the Ethnic Studies Curriculum--Leave in Palestine, Arab section--  
Do not conflate anti-semitism w/criticism of Zionism or State of Israel.

Dear CDE & Supt. Thurmond:

As a retired LAUSD public high school teacher, I am disappointed (understatement) to learn that political pressure has led to the censorship of the ethnic studies curriculum and urge you to reverse key changes to the curriculum that treat Arab American studies as a second class citizen and omit mention of Palestine. Please do not adopt or allow reference to anti-semitism as criticism of Israel or Zionist. I am a non-Zionist Jew who embraces equal rights for all in Israel/Palestine, not a state defined by racial or ethnic identity where those born of certain mothers are awarded privileged status. Should you opt to go forward with such conflation, I imagine there will be tremendous push back from supporters of the First Amendment and those who do not wish to be complicit in the erasure of Palestinians and their homeland.

See more details below. Thank you for considering my requests. Sincerely, Marcy Winograd, Retired LAUSD English teacher; member, Jewish Voice for Peace, JVP-Action

**Key Changes to Reverse, Please:**

1. Arab American studies has been moved from the main body to the appendix of the CA Model Ethnic Studies Curriculum (ESMC). . This is a complete reversal from Thurmond's commitment—at the August 2020 meeting of the Instructional Quality Commission—to include Arab American studies as part of Asian American studies curriculum. **The press release from the Coalition to Save Arab American Studies is attached.**
2. Any mention of Palestine has been removed from the ESMC, including from the one Arab-American lesson plan included in the appendix. The appendix now includes two lesson plans on Jewish Americans but only one on Arab-Americans. There are also lesson plans on Sikhs and Armenians. The lesson plans on Jewish Americans are written from a Zionist point of view.
3. The appendix includes a sample lesson plan on "Antisemitism and Jewish Middle Eastern Americans" submitted by JIMENA. This lesson teaches about antisemitism using the ADL and IHRA definitions in a handout but does not make any reference to the controversy around these definitions or offer alternate definitions.
4. In addition, a proposed comment has been forwarded by the CDE to the IQC for discussion and possible adoption at its Nov 18th-19th meeting. This comment, if adopted, would add this footnote definition of antisemitism to the preface of the entire Model Studies Ethnic Curriculum: **Add a footnote to the term "antisemitism," which reads: "Antisemitism is hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Jews based on stereotypes and myths that target their ethnicity, culture, religion, traditions, right to self-determination, or connection to the State of Israel."**