Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Preface

Third Field Review Draft

Contents

Acknowledgements

The California Department of Education (CDE) acknowledges the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Advisory Committee for developing the draft on which this document is built.

Committee members Elizabeth Arzate, Dawniell Black, Guadalupe Cardona, Tolteka Cuauhtin, Angie Fa, John Gonzalez, Roselinn Lee, Stephen Leeper, Theresa Montano, Melissa Moreno, Jorge Pacheco, Jr., Jenna Phillips, Aimee Riechel, Samia Shoman, Alphonso Thompson, Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales, and Vicky Xiong-Lor dedicated their time and passion to this groundbreaking project—the first of its kind among the 50 states—and their expertise as educators and scholars is greatly appreciated.

The CDE further acknowledges the contributions of curriculum writers Jeanelle Hope, ArtNelson Concordia, and Guillermo Antonio Gomez, who worked to coalesce ideas and shape the original draft.

Finally, the Department recognizes the more than 21,000 individuals—educators, parents, students and others—whose questions, comments, and suggestions spurred discussions vital to the revision process. Helping students become active, engaged citizens is a fundamental goal of public education, and we thank you for raising your voices.

The Model Curriculum

Legislation

Assembly Bill 2016, Chapter 327 of the Statutes of 2016, added Section 51226.7 to the *Education Code,* which directs the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) to develop, and the State Board of Education (SBE) to adopt, a model curriculum in ethnic studies.

Consistent with the legislation this document will: (1) offer support for the inclusion of ethnic studies as either a stand-alone elective, or to be integrated into existing history–social science and English language arts courses; (2) be written in language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users, including teachers (single and multiple-subject), support staff, administrators, and the community, and encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together, highlighting core ethnic studies concepts such as equality and equity, justice, race[1] and racism[2], ethnicity[3] and bigotry, indigeneity, etc., (3) the model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities, (4) include course outlines that offer a thematic approach to ethnic studies with concepts that provide space for educators to build in examples and case studies from diverse backgrounds; (5) include course outlines that have been approved by the University of California and California State University as having met the “A–G”

requirements for college readiness, in addition to sample lesson plans, curricula, primary source documents, pedagogical and professional development resources and tools, current research on the field, among other materials; and (6) be developed with the guidance of classroom teachers, college/university ethnic studies faculty and experts, representatives from local educational agencies, and representation from the ethnic populations referenced directly, where possible.

Focus on Four Foundational Disciplines

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum will focus on the traditional ethnic studies first established in higher education which has been characterized by four foundational disciplines: African American, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x, Native American, and Asian American and Pacific Islander studies.[4] The focus on the experiences of these four disciplines provides an opportunity for students to learn of the histories, cultures, struggles, and contributions to American society of these historically marginalized peoples which are often untold in U.S. history courses. Given California's diversity, the California Department of Education understands and knows that each community has its own ethnic make-up and each demographic group has its own unique history, struggles, and contributions to our state. Therefore, under the direction of State Superintendent of Public Instruction Tony Thurmond, this model curriculum has been written to include information on the foundational disciplines in ethnic studies, and affords local educational agencies the flexibility to adapt the curriculum to address the demographics and diversity of the classroom. The adaptations should center on deepening or augmenting, rather than scaling down any of the four disciplines.

This model curriculum is a step to rectifying omission of the experiences, contributions, and cultures of communities within California. Ethnic studies courses address institutionalized systems of advantage, and address the causes of racism and other forms of bigotry including antisemitism and Islamophobia within our culture and governmental policies. Educators can create and utilize lessons rooted in the four foundational disciplines alongside the sample key themes of (1) Identity, (2) History and Movement, (3) Systems of Power, and (4) Social Movements and Equity to make connections to the experiences of all students.

School curricula must not only provide content knowledge, but must also provide ~~equip~~ students with the tools to ~~promote~~ student understand~~ing~~ ~~as~~ and practice being contributing community members and/or civic participants in a changing democratic society.

When schools help students acquire a “social consciousness”, they are better equipped to contribute to the public good and help strengthen democratic institutions.

Among other roles, ~~The role of~~ our public schools should ~~to~~ promote mutual respect. Accordingly, understanding and appreciation of its diverse population must be an essential part of the curriculum offered to every student.

Ethnic studies instruction should be a fundamental component of California public education in the twenty-first century. The proposed Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum helps build the capacity for every young Californian to develop knowledge and a social consciousness ~~and knowledge~~ that will contribute to the public good and, as a result, strengthen democracy.

Commented [1]: knowledge and a social consciousness

State Board of Education Guidelines

In 2018, the SBE approved Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines based on AB 2016. The following guidelines are based on requirements in the authorizing statute (Assembly Bill 2016, Chapter 327 of the Statutes of 2016), feedback collected from the public at the webinar held on January 9, 2018, and other public comment.

1. Statutory Requirements

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum must reflect the requirements in the authorizing statute as well as other legal requirements for curriculum in California. These include, but are not necessarily limited to, the following topics:

- The model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities.

- The model curriculum shall include examples of courses offered by local educational agencies that have been approved as meeting the A–G admissions requirements of the University of California and the California State University, including, to the extent possible, course outlines for those courses.

- The model curriculum must meet federal accessibility requirements pursuant to Section 508 of the United States Workforce Rehabilitation Act. Content that cannot be made accessible may not be included in the document.”

2. General Principles. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:

· Include accurate information based on current and confirmed research;

· When appropriate, be consistent with the content and instructional shifts in the 2016 *History–Social Science Framework*, in particular the emphasis upon student-based inquiry in instruction;

· Promote the values of civic engagement and civic responsibility;

· Align to the Literacy Standards for History/Social Studies within the California *Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects*, as appropriate;

· Promote self and collective empowerment;

· Be written in language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users, including teachers (single and multiple-subject), support staff, administrators, and the community;

· Encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together, highlighting core ethnic studies concepts such as equality, justice, race, ethnicity, indigeneity, etc.;

· Include information on the ethnic studies movement, specifically the Third World Liberation Front (TWLF), and its significance in the establishment of ethnic studies as a discipline and work in promoting diversity and inclusion within higher education;

· Promote critical thinking and rigorous analysis of history, systems of oppression, and the status quo in an effort to generate discussions on futurity, and imagine new possibilities.

3. Course Outlines. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:

· Include course outlines that offer a thematic approach to ethnic studies with concepts that provide space for educators to build in examples and case studies from diverse backgrounds;

· Include course outlines that allow for ethnic studies to be taught as a stand-alone elective or integrated into an existing course (e.g., sociology, English language arts, and history);

· Include course outlines that allow for local, state-specific, national, and global inquiry into ethnic studies;

· Have the capability to engage multiple languages and genealogies;

· Engage a range of disciplines beyond traditional history and social sciences, including but not limited to: visual and performing arts, English language arts, economics, biology, gender and sexuality studies, etc.

4. Audience. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:

· Be sensitive to the needs of all grade levels and incorporated disciplines, providing balance and guidance to the field;

· Engage pedagogies that allow for student and community responsiveness, validate students' lived experience, and address social-emotional development;

· Be inclusive, creating space for all students regardless of race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality, or citizenship, to learn different perspectives.

5. Administrative and Teacher Support. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shall:

· Be easy to use both for teachers with educational backgrounds in ethnic studies, and those without such experience;

· Provide resources on professional development opportunities;

· Provide information for district and school administrators to support the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum and instruction;

· Provide examples of different methods of instruction and pedagogical approaches;

· Provide support for a collaborative teaching model that encourages teachers to work with colleagues across disciplines, further highlighting the interdisciplinarity of ethnic studies;

· Provide support for the use of technology and multimedia resources during instruction;

· Include access to resources for instruction (e.g., lesson plans, curricula, primary source documents, and other resources) that are currently being used by districts.

This model curriculum should not be seen as exhaustive, but rather a guidance document to pair with existing SBE-adopted content standards and curriculum frameworks, including the *History–Social Science Content Standards* (https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/) and the *History–Social Science Framework* (https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/cf/hssframework.asp), the *California Common Core State Standards in English Language Arts and Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects* (https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/), the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework* (https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/rl/cf/elaeldfrmwrksbeadopted.asp), and the *California English Language Development Standards* (https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/). The *History–Social Science Framework* in particular provides support for the implementation of ethnic studies, including a brief outline of a ninth-grade elective course in the field, and the document overall emphasizes key principles of ethnic studies teaching and learning, such as diversity, inclusion, challenging systems of inequality, and support for student civic engagement.

California Department of Education, December 2020

---

[1] Race: There are multiple definitions of race. One is that race is the idea that the human species is divided into distinct groups on the basis of inherited physical and behavioral differences. Genetic studies in the late 20th century refuted the existence of biogenetically distinct races, and scholars now argue that “races” are cultural interventions [inventions] reflecting specific attitudes and beliefs that were imposed on different populations in the wake of western European conquests beginning in the 15th century. Race, Human, *Encyclopedia Britannica*, Audrey Smedley, July 28, 2020 https://www.britannica.com/topic/race-human, accessed 9/1/2020.

Within the field of ethnic studies, 'race' is defined as "a (neo)colonial social construction. It is viewed as a “master category” based upon a Eurocentric biological fallacy that is central to inequitable power relations in society. As a social and historical construct, the idea of race is primarily filtered through physical traits (phenotype), including pigmentation (skin color) and other physical features; where people's ancestral origins are from (precolonial geographic ancestry); cultural traits; and sometimes economic

Commented [2]: Really appreciate calling out the definition and the purpose of its construction. Race as a construct should not be limited to a footnote and should be foregrounded as part of the core model curriculum.

Commented [3]: Race as a construct, and further explained as it is in the second definition here, should not be limited to a footnote and should be foregrounded as part of the core model curriculum; this is a good Ethnic Studies definition of race, whereas the first is more a general anthropological approach to the definition -- it is good to see it included, and we must respect the discipline of Ethnic Studies here; thank you.

class. Since race produces material impacts, it also produces racial consciousness and facilitates the process of racialization and racial projects, including both the oppositional projects of racism/colorism/anti-Blackness/anti-Indigeneity and anti-racism/racial justice. The People of Color Power movements that emerged in the 1960s ("Black Power, Red Power, Brown Power, Yellow Power") are key examples of how race has also been embraced and leveraged in the resistance against racism; they are the movements that Ethnic Studies rose from. In the United States today, races very broadly break down as people of color (POC) and white people." Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M., Sleeter, C., & Au, W. (Eds.). (2018). *Rethinking Ethnic Studies* (1st edition). Milwaukee, OR: Rethinking Schools.

[2] Racism: a belief that race is the primary determinant of human traits and capacities and that racial differences produce an inherent superiority or inferiority of a particular race compared to other ones.

[3] Ethnicity: an identity marker based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, religion, language, history, tradition, etc., that comprise a social group.

[4] For notes on disciplinary naming, please see chapter 3.

Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview

Third Field Review Draft

Contents

Why Teach Ethnic Studies in a K–12 Environment?

Ethnic studies is a class for all students. The model curriculum focuses on the four ethnic groups that are at the core of the ethnic studies field. At the same time, this course, through its overarching study of the process and impact of the marginalization resulting from systems of power, is relevant and important for students of all backgrounds. Over 70% of California students are students of color. By affirming the identities and contributions of marginalized groups in our society, ethnic studies helps all students to see and hear all people, including our students of color ~~themselves and each other,~~ as part of the narrative of the United States. Importantly, this helps students see themselves as ~~active~~ agents of change in the interethnic bridge-building process we call American life and take an active role to prevent and counter social marginalization.

Ethnic studies helps bring students and communities together. This does not mean glossing over differences, avoiding difficult issues, or resorting to clichés about how we are all basically alike. It should do so by simultaneously doing three things: (1) addressing racialized experiences and ethnic differences as real and unique and should be valued; (2) building

greater understanding and communication across ethnic differences; ~~and~~ (3) revealing underlying commonalities that can bind by bringing individuals and groups together; and embracing the fact that diversity and differences has been the engine that propelled our nation to prosperity. Ethnic studies is designed to benefit all students. Christine Sleeter, Critical Education scholar, posits, “rather than being divisive, ethnic studies helps students to bridge differences that already exist in experiences and perspectives,” highlighting that division is *antithetical* to ethnic studies. Her study of the research on ethnic studies outcomes found that instruction that includes diversity experiences and a specific focus on racism and other forms of bigotry has a positive impact in terms of “democracy outcomes” and higher-level thinking.[1]

Commented [4]: I wonder if it might be worthwhile to add research on the value of student sense of belonging and its impact on student motivation and achievement as well. https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10964-005-5752-7

Sleeter’s research shows that culturally meaningful and relevant curriculum such as an ethnic studies course, which helps students develop the skillsets to engage in critical conversations about race, can have a positive impact on students. Research also shows that curricula that teach directly about racism have a stronger impact than curricula that portray diverse groups but ignore racism. Students that become more engaged in school through courses like ethnic studies are more likely to graduate and feel more personally empowered. By asking students to examine and reflect on the history, struggles, and contributions of diverse groups within the context of racism and bigotry, ethnic studies can foster the importance ~~causes~~ of equity and justice.

Ethnic studies requires a commitment among its teachers to personal and professional development, deep content knowledge, social-emotional learning, safe and healthy classroom management practices, and instructional strategies that develop higher-order thinking skills in children. It requires a commitment from the school community—parents, administrators, elected officials, and nonprofit partners—to support an ethnic studies program even when it challenges conventional ideals or prompts difficult or uncomfortable conversations. It may be helpful to acknowledge upfront that some people may get triggered by differences in perspectives and that these triggers are opportunities for exponential growth and learning about ourselves and our expectations.

This model curriculum, therefore, is provided as only a small piece of a much larger set of resources necessary for a successful ethnic studies program.

Defining Ethnic Studies

The *History Social–Science Framework for California Public Schools: Kindergarten through Grade Twelve* defines ethnic studies in the following passages:

> "Ethnic studies is an interdisciplinary field of study that encompasses many subject areas including history, literature, economics, sociology, anthropology, and political science. It emerged to both address content considered missing from traditional curriculum and to encourage critical engagement."
>
> "As a field, ethnic studies seeks to empower all students to engage socially and politically and to think critically about the world around them. It is important for ethnic studies courses to document the experiences of people of color in order for students to construct counter-narratives and develop a more complex understanding of the human experience. Through these studies, students should develop respect for cultural diversity and see the advantages of inclusion."
>
> "Because of the interdisciplinary nature of this field, ethnic studies courses may take several forms. However, central to any ethnic studies course is the historic struggle of communities of color, taking into account the intersectionality of identity (gender, class, sexuality, among others), to challenge racism, discrimination, and oppression and interrogate the systems that continue to perpetuate inequality."

At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States. People or person of color is a term used primarily in the United States and is meant to be inclusive among non-white groups, emphasizing common experiences of racism. The field also addresses the concept of intersectionality, which recognizes that people have different overlapping identities, for example, a transgender Latina or a Jewish African American. These intersecting identities shape individuals' experiences of racism and bigotry. The field critically grapples with the various power structures and forms of oppression that continue to have social, emotional, cultural, economic, and political impacts. It also deals with the often-overlooked contributions to many areas of government, politics, the arts, medicine, economics, etc., made by people of color and provides examples of how collective social action can lead to a more equitable and just society in positive ways.

Beyond providing an important history of groups underrepresented in traditional accounts and an analysis of oppression and power, ethnic studies offers a dynamic inquiry-based approach to

the study of Native people and communities of color that encourages utilizing transnational and comparative frameworks. Thus, the themes and topics discussed within the field are boundless, such as a study of Mexican American texts, the implications of war and imperialism on Southeast Asian refugees, African American social movements and modes of resistance, and Native American/Indigenous cultural retentions, to name a few.

Furthermore, considering that European American culture is already robustly taught in the school curriculum, ethnic studies presents an opportunity for different cultures to be highlighted and studied in a manner that is meaningful and can be transformative for all students. It allows for students to understand, and have learning examples, that all Americans, not just European Americans, should be seen, heard, valued, and represented in our democractic society. Ethnic studies provides students with crucial interpersonal communication strategies, cultural competency, and equity driven skills (such as how to effectively listen to others, give people in need a voice, use shared power, be able to empathize, select relevant/effective change strategies, get feedback from those they are trying to help, know how to deliberate, know how to organize and build coalitions) and positive ways of expressing collective and collaborative power that are integral to effective and responsive civic engagement and collegiality, especially in a society that is rapidly diversifying.

The History of Ethnic Studies

The history and genealogy of ethnic studies can be traced back to the activism and intellectual thought of pioneers such as W.E.B. DuBois, Mary McLeod Bethune, Grace Lee Boggs, Rodolfo Acuña, Carter G. Woodson, Carlos Bulosan, Vine Deloria Jr., and Gloria Anzaldúa. These scholars argued that the histories, perspectives, and contributions of those on the social, political, and economic margins—African Americans, Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, Chicanx/Latinx, and Native Americans—be included in mainstream history (as well as other traditional disciplines) to be able to better understand the past, envision new possibilities, and celebrate the nation's wealth of diversity.

By 1968, this call was crystallized as Black Student Union members at San Francisco State College (now San Francisco State University) began organizing around the issue. Soon after, they were joined by other students, culminating with a student strike. Inspired by youth activism and organizing in the Civil Rights, Black Liberation, American Indian, Chicano, Asian American, labor, and anti-Vietnam war movements, students at San Francisco State College embarked on

a strike (November 6, 1968–March 20, 1969) demanding: (1) equal access to public education, (2) an increase in faculty of color, and (3) “a new curriculum that would embrace the history of all people, including ethnic minorities.”[2] Led by the Third World Liberation Front (TWLF)—a coalition of students from the campus’ Black Student Union, Latin American Student Organization (LASO), the Intercollegiate Chinese for Social Action (ICSA), the Mexican American Student Confederation, the Philippine American Collegiate Endeavor (PACE), La Raza, the Native American Students Organization, and Asian American Political Alliance (AAPA)—students refused to attend classes for five months until administrators met their demands.

At University of California (UC) Berkeley in the spring of 1968, the Afro-American Students Union (AASU) proposed a Black Studies program.[3] The administration consistently stalled negotiations and kept deleting elements of AASU’s proposal—particularly the crucial community component. AASU was joined by the Mexican-American Student Confederation (MASC), the Asian American Political Alliance (AAPA) and the Native American Student Union (NASU) to form the Third World Liberation Front at Berkeley. They expanded the Black Studies program to an autonomous Third World College to be comprised of Departments of Asian Studies, Black Studies, Chicano Studies, Native American Studies, and “any other Third World studies programs as they are developed and presented.” Demands also included widespread recruitment of Third World[4] students and hiring of Third World people in positions of power in every department and discipline, from Admissions to Finances. Third World control--self-determination involving students and communities—was to oversee all aspects of the Third World College and programs.

When UC rejected the TWLF demands, the Third World Strike began the longest and bloodiest strike in UC history—from January to March 1969. The Administration and State of California violently opposed the TWLF to the point where Governor Ronald Reagan declared “a state of extreme emergency” at Berkeley, with unprecedented constant sweeps and teargassing by combined forces of not only the campus police but six East Bay police forces, the Alameda County Sheriff’s deputies, the Highway Patrol, and even the National Guard. Despite being forbidden from having any sound system or holding mass rallies and the threat of “immediate suspension” for protesting, TWLF strikers showed up in force every day and organized growing multinational support both within the campus and around the country.

The first ethnic studies entity in the US was won at Berkeley on March 7, 1969, when UC approved an Ethnic Studies Department that would evolve into a College. Thus it was also the first African American Studies (originally Black Studies), Chicana/o and Latina/o Studies (originally called Chicano Studies), Native American Studies, and Asian American Studies (originally called Asian Studies) in the country. After AAPA had formed in May 1968—originating the term and concept of Asian American—SFSU's TWLF later broadened their original demand for separate Filipino Studies and Chinese American Studies to Asian American Studies.

On March 20, 1969, the first college of ethnic studies was established at San Francisco State University. Students were now able to take courses devoted to foregrounding the perspectives, histories, and cultures of African Americans, Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, Chicana/o/x/, Latina/o/x, and Native Americans. In early 1969, students at the University of California, Berkeley successfully launched a strike that resulted in the creation of the first ethnic studies department in the country. Meanwhile, at the other end of the state, as early as 1968 students at California State University, Los Angeles and California State University, Northridge were establishing Chicano studies and Black studies departments. Soon, college students across the nation began calling for the establishment of ethnic studies courses, departments, and degree programs. Over 50 years after the strikes at San Francisco State College and UC Berkeley, ethnic studies is now a vibrant discipline with multiple academic journals, associations, national and international conferences, undergraduate and graduate degree programs, and thousands of scholars and educators contributing to the field's complexity and vitality.

Since the student movements of the 1960s, ethnic studies proponents have fought for the inclusion of ethnic studies across public schools at the K–12 level and higher education. Over the last 10 years this movement has gained substantial traction at the local level as numerous California public school districts have either passed their own ethnic studies graduation requirements or are implementing ethnic studies courses.

At the state level, the California State Legislature has drafted and voted on several bills to help bolster support for ethnic studies implementation at the K–12 level, including Assembly Bill 2016 (https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=201520160AB2016), which authorized the development of this document.

The Benefits of Ethnic Studies

In a 2011 report for the National Education Association entitled *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies*, Christine Sleeter stated that:

> There is considerable research evidence that well-designed and well-taught ethnic studies curricula have positive academic and social outcomes for students. Curricula are designed and taught somewhat differently depending on the ethnic composition of the class or school and the subsequent experiences students bring, but both students of color and white students have been found to benefit from ethnic studies.[5]

As the demographics continue to shift in California to an increasingly diverse population—for example, with Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x students comprising a majority in our public schools and students of two or more races comprising the fastest growing demographic group—there is a legitimate need to address the academic and social needs of such a population. All students should be better equipped with the knowledge and skills to successfully navigate our increasingly diverse society.[6] Ethnic studies provides the space for all students and teachers to begin having these conversations. Furthermore, ethnic studies scholars and classroom teachers established through research that courses in the field have:

- Helped students develop a strong sense of identity[7]
- Contributed to students' sense of agency and academic motivation[8]
- Helped students discover their historical and ancestral origins
- Reduced stereotype threat[9]
- Aided in the social-emotional wellness of students
- Increased youth civic engagement and community responsiveness[10]
- Provided students with skills and language to critically analyze, respond, and speak out on social issues

- Increased critical thinking, problem solving, collaboration, and interpersonal communication skills
- Led to an increase in attendance[11]
- Led to an increase in standardized test scores[12]
- Led to an increase in GPA, especially in math and science[13]
- Led to an increase in graduation and college enrollment rates[14]
- Introduced students to college level academic frameworks, theories, terms, and research methods
- Helped foster a classroom environment of trust between students and teachers, enabling them to discuss contentious issues and topics, as well as current events
- Strengthened social and cultural awareness

How Do You Teach Ethnic Studies in a K–12 Environment?

Ethnic studies highlights the importance of untold stories, and emphasizes the danger of a single story. In *The Danger of a Single Story*, Nigerian writer Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie argues that reducing people to a single story creates stereotypes and denies their humanity. Each ethnic community has its own unique history, struggles, and contributions, and these are to be taught, understood, and celebrated as ethnic studies focuses on U.S. culture and history from the perspective of marginalized groups. In addition, diversity and diverse perspectives within an ethnic group should also be taught to avoid reducing a group to a single story. In order to do this, teachers should trust students' intellect and teach them to think critically, understand different and competing perspectives and narratives, and encourage them to form their own opinions. Care should be taken to ensure that (1) teachers present topics from multiple points of view and represent diverse stories and opinions within groups (staying within the realm of

inclusion and humanizing discourse), (2) teaching resources represent a range of different perspectives, and (3) lessons are structured so students examine materials from multiple perspectives and come to their own conclusions.[15]

Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies

Given the range and complexity of the field, it is important to identify the key values of ethnic studies as a means to offer guidance for the development of ethnic studies courses, teaching, and learning. The foundational values of ethnic studies are housed in the conceptual model of the "double helix" which interweaves *holistic humanization* and *critical consciousness*.[16] Humanization includes the values of love, respect, hope, and solidarity are based on celebration of community cultural wealth.[17] The values rooted in humanization and critical consciousness are the guiding values each ethnic studies lesson should include. Ethnic studies courses, teaching, and learning will:

1. ~~cultivate~~ CULTIVATE empathy, community actualization, cultural perpetuity[18], self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being of all participants, especially ~~Native People/s and~~ Black, Indigenous, People of Color (BIPOC), for educational and racial justice~~;~~
2. ~~celebrate~~ CELEBRATE and honor the Native People/s of the land and intersectional communities of Black, Indigenous, People of Color by providing a space to share our ~~their~~ stories of ~~success~~ struggle and resistance, and our stories of success, community collaboration, and solidarity, along with ~~their~~ our intellectual and cultural wealth;
3. ~~center~~ CENTER and place high value on ~~the~~ pre-colonial, ancestral, indigenous, diasporic, familial, and marginalized knowledge~~[19], narratives, and communal experiences of Native people/s and people of color and groups that are typically marginalized in society~~;
4. ~~critique~~ CRITIQUE empire, ~~-building in history and its relationship to~~ white supremacy, anti-Blackness, anti-Indigeneity, racism, xenophobia, patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, transphobia, capitalism, ableism, Islamophobia, anti-Semitism, ageism, anthropocentrism, and other forms of power and oppression at the intersections of our society ~~[20]~~

5. ~~challenge~~ CHALLENGE ~~racist, bigoted, discriminatory,~~ imperialist/colonial, racist, bigoted and discriminatory, hegemonic ~~[21~~] beliefs and practices on ideological, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized levels; multiple levels[22]
6. ~~connect~~ CONNECT ourselves to past and contemporary ~~social~~ resistance movements that struggle for social justice on global and local levels to ensure a truer, more just and ~~an~~ equitable and democracytic ~~society~~; ~~and conceptualize~~,
7. CONCEPTUALIZE imagine, and build new possibilities for a post-imperial/post-racist~~,~~ ~~post-systemic racism~~ society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, ~~and~~ radical healing~~.~~[~~23~~]and activism for racial and social justice -- including by changing systemic policies, as we realize these possibilities for past, present, and future generations

~~6.~~

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.5", Space After: 0 pt, Line spacing: Multiple 1.15 li, No bullets or numbering, No widow/orphan control

Eight Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching[24]

The following eight essential outcomes for ethnic studies teaching and learning are offered to assist with K–12 implementation of ethnic studies:

(1) Pursuit of truth, justice and equity—Ethnic studies did not arise in a vacuum. It arose with the intent of giving voice to stories long silenced, including stories of injustice, marginalization, and discrimination, as well as stories of those who became part of our nation in different ways, such as through slavery, conquest, colonization, and immigration. Ethnic studies should truthfully address those experiences, including systemic racism[25], with both honesty and nuance, drawing upon multiple perspectives. Ethnic studies should also examine individual and collective efforts to challenge and overcome inequality and discriminatory treatment.

The exploration of injustice, ~~and~~ inequality, and how partial truths are distorted as whole truths should not merely unearth the past. It should also create a better understanding of dissimilar and unequal ethnic trajectories in order to strive for a future of greater equity and inclusivity. In the pursuit of truth, justice, and equality, ethnic studies should help students comprehend the various manifestations of racism and other forms of ethnic bigotry, discrimination, and

marginalization. It should also help students understand the role that they can play individually and collectively in challenging these inequity-producing forces, such as systemic racism.

(2) Working toward greater inclusivity—The ethnic studies movement arose because of historical exclusion and pursued greater inclusion. California ethnic studies should emphasize educational equity by being inclusive of all students, regardless of their backgrounds. This means incorporating the experiences of a broad range of ethnic groups, while particularly clarifying the role of race and ethnicity in California and the United States. Yet, due to curricular time constraints, difficult choices will have to be made at the district and classroom level. While ethnic studies should address ethnicity in the broadest sense, it should devote special emphasis to the foundational disciplines while making connections to the varying experiences of all students.

(3) Furthering self-understanding—Through ethnic studies, students will gain a deeper understanding of their own identities, ancestral roots, and knowledge of self. Ethnic studies will help students better exercise their agency and become stronger self-advocates.

Not every student has a strong sense of ethnic identity. However, all students have an ethnic heritage (or heritages) rooted in the histories of their ancestors. Building from the concept of student-based inquiry, ethnic studies should provide an opportunity for all students to examine their own ethnic heritages. Increasing numbers of students have multiple ethnic heritages.

For example, this search can involve the exploration of students' own family histories. Through oral histories of family members and, where available, the use of family records, students can develop a better understanding of their place and the place of their ancestors in the ethnic trajectory of California and the United States. For students with non-English-speaking family members, this would also provide an opportunity to develop research skills in multiple languages. However, educators should be sensitive to student and family privacy, while also recognizing that factors like adoption, divorce, and lack of access to family information may complicate this assignment for some students.

(4) Developing a better understanding of others—The essential and complementary flip-side of self-understanding is the understanding of others. Ethnic studies should not only help students explore their own backgrounds. It should also help build bridges of intergroup understanding.

This interethnic bridge-building can be furthered in various ways. Obviously, it can be enhanced by exposing students to a wide variety of voices, stories, experiences, and perspectives through materials featuring people of myriad ethnic backgrounds. But bridge-building can also occur through the classroom sharing of students' personal stories and family histories. In this way students can simultaneously learn to understand ethnic differences while also identifying underlying commonalities and personal challenges.

With mutual respect and dignity being emphasized, students will develop an appreciation for the complexity of diversity and how it continues to shape the American experience. Additionally, students will learn how to transform their appreciation of diversity into action that aims to build community and solidarity.

(5) Recognizing intersectionality—Ethnic studies focuses on the role of race and ethnicity. However, these are not the sole forces affecting personal identity, group identification, and the course of human experience. People, including students, are not only members of racial and ethnic groups. They also belong to many other types of social groups. These groups may be based on such factors as sex, religion, class, ability/disability, age, sexual orientation, gender identity, citizenship status, socioeconomic status, and language use.

For each individual, these multiple social categories converge in a unique way. That confluence of groups is sometimes called intersectionality. Those myriad categories influence, but do not necessarily determine, one's life trajectory. They also may influence how a person is perceived and treated by others, including both by individuals and by institutions. The inequitable institutional treatment of certain racial and ethnic groups is sometimes referred to as systemic racism.

To some degree, each person's individuality and identity are the result of intersectionality. The lens of intersectionality helps both to explore the richness of human experience and to highlight the variations that exist within ethnic diversity. By highlighting intragroup variations, intersectionality can also help challenge group stereotyping and polarization.

(6) Promoting self-empowerment for civic engagement—Ethnic studies should help students become more engaged locally and develop into effective civic participants and stronger social justice advocates, better able to contribute to constructive social change. It can also help students connect current resistance movements to those of the past, and to imagine new possibilities for a more just society. The promotion of empowerment through ethnic studies can

occur in various ways. It can help students become more astute in critically analyzing documents, historical events, and multiple perspectives. It can help students learn to discuss difficult or controversial issues, particularly when race and ethnicity are important factors. It can help students learn to present their ideas in strong, compelling, clear and precise academic language. It can help students assess various strategies for bringing about change. It can provide students with opportunities to experiment with different change strategies, while evaluating the strengths and limitations of each approach. In short, through ethnic studies, students can develop civic participation skills, a greater sense of self-empowerment, and a deeper commitment to life-long civic engagement.

(7) Supporting a community focus—Ethnic studies in all California districts should address the basic contours of national and statewide ethnic experiences. This includes major events and phenomena that have shaped our diverse ethnic trajectories. However, individual school districts may also choose to enrich their approach to ethnic studies by also devoting special attention to ethnic groups that have been significantly present in their own communities.

By shaping ethnic studies to include a focus on local ethnic groups, districts can enhance learning opportunities through student-based inquiry into the local community. Such research can draw on multiple sources, such as local records, census material, survey results, memoirs, and media coverage. It can also involve oral history, providing voice for members of different ethnic communities and allowing students to engage multiple ethnic perspectives. This local focus can also create additional opportunities for civic engagement, such as working with city government or presenting to school boards.

(8) Developing interpersonal communication—Achieving the preceding principles will require one additional capability: effective communication. Particularly considering California's extensive diversity, ethnic studies should help build effective communication across ethnic differences. This includes the ability to meet, discuss, and analyze sometimes controversial topics and issues that garner multiple diverse points of view. In other words, students should learn to participate in difficult dialogues. Further, students participating in ethnic studies will be equipped to analyze and critique contemporary issues and systems of power that impact their lived experiences and respective communities. They will engage in meaningful activities and assignments that encourage them to challenge the status quo and reimagine their futures.

Ethnic studies should help students learn to value and appreciate differences and each other's lived experiences as valuable assets in our diverse society in order to communicate more effectively and constructively with students of different backgrounds. It should help them communicate and interact with empathy, appreciation, empowerment, and clarity, to interact with curiosity, to listen empathically without judgment, and to critically consider new ideas and perspectives. It should also encourage students to modify their positions in the light of new evidence and compelling insights. Students should not seek to dominate in conversations, but rather practice a model of engagement which places a greater priority on listening, seeking to understand before seeking to persuade.

Even the concepts of "race" and "ethnicity" present challenges. What do they mean? How do they relate to each other? How were concepts of race, like "whiteness" and "blackness" constructed? How has our understanding of race and ethnicity changed over time? How are race and ethnicity as group identities reflected in public documents, such as the U.S. Census and most formal applications? How do these group identifiers impact social connection and division? Ethnic studies should help students address these and other fundamental issues that complicate intergroup communication and understanding.

By operating on the basis of these eight principles, statewide ethnic studies can become a venue for developing a deeper understanding of the opportunities and challenges that come with ethnic diversity. It should advance the cause of equity and inclusivity, challenge systemic racism, foster self-understanding, build intergroup and intragroup bridges, enhance civic engagement, and further a sense of human commonality. In this way, ethnic studies can help build stronger communities, a more equitably inclusive state, and a more truthful and just nation.

- In K–12 education it is imperative that students are exposed to multiple perspectives, taught to think critically, and form their own opinions.

- Curriculum, resources, and materials should include a balance of topics, authors, and concepts, including primary and secondary sources that represent multiple, and sometimes opposing, points of view or perspectives.

- Students will actively seek to understand, analyze and articulate multiple points of view, perspectives and cultures.

- The instruction, material, or discussion must be appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students, and be a fair, balanced, and humanizing academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship.

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum for K–12 Education

Ethnic studies incorporates purposeful academic language and terminology, including intentional respellings[26], to challenge various forms of oppression and marginalization. These language conventions are not foregrounded in this model curriculum for those just beginning familiarity with ethnic studies; however, educators should note that such conventions continue to grow and are common within ethnic studies classes, communities and scholarship.

The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum serves as a guide to school districts that would like to either develop and implement stand-alone courses or integrate the concepts and principles of ethnic studies into current social science or English language arts courses. It is divided into chapters and appendices:

· Chapter 2 provides guidance to district and site administrators on teacher, student, and community involvement in the development of these courses.

· Chapter 3 provides instructional guidance for veteran and new teachers of ethnic studies content.

· Chapter 4 of the document is a bibliography to assist the local school district and committees to further inform their discussion on ethnic studies.

· Appendix A provides a collection of guiding questions, sample lessons and topics for ethnic studies courses.

· Appendix B provides links to instructional resources to assist educators in facilitating conversations about race, racism, bigotry, and the experiences of diverse Americans.

· Appendix C provides examples of courses approved by the University of California Office of the President as meeting A–G requirements.

---

[1] Christine Sleeter, *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies A Research Review* (Washington, D.C.: National Education Association, 2011), 16–19, http://www.nea.org/assets/docs/NBI-2010-3-value-of-ethnic-studies.pdf (accessed July 27, 2020)

[2] Denize Springer, "Campus Commemorates 1968 Student-Led Strike," SF State News, last modified September 22, 2008, http://www.sfsu.edu/news/2008/fall/8.html (accessed July 23, 2020).

[3] The language in the next four paragraphs was provided by eight members of the public who identified themselves as members of the TWLF and submitted identical suggested edits as public comment.

[4] This term was used by contemporaries in the movement to refer to people of color.

[5] Christine Sleeter, *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies,* p. viii.

[6] California Department of Education, *2018–2019 Enrollment by Ethnicity and Grade* (Sacramento, CA: California Department of Education, n.d.), https://dq.cde.ca.gov/dataquest/dqcensus/EnrEthGrd.aspx?cds=00&agglevel=state&year=2018-19 (accessed July 23, 2020).

[7] Sleeter, C. and Zavala, M., *Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools* (New York: Teachers College Press, 2020).

[8] Christine Sleeter, *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies*, 9.

[9] See: Claude Steele and Joshua Aronson, "Stereotype threat and the test performance of academically successful African Americans," in *The Black-White Test Score Gap*, ed. Christopher Jencks and Meredith Phillips (Washington, DC, US: Brookings Institution Press, 1998).

[10] Christine Sleeter, *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies,* 14.

[11] Julio Cammarota, "A Social Justice Approach to Achievement: Guiding Latina/o Students Toward Educational Attainment With a Challenging, Socially Relevant Curriculum," *Equity & Excellence in Education* 40, no. 1 (February 7, 2017).

[12] Ibid.

[13] Thomas S. Dee and Emily K. Penner, "The Causal Effects of Cultural Relevance," *American Educational Research Journal*, vol 54(1) (February 1, 2017) https://www.nber.org/papers/w21865 (accessed December 31, 2019).

[14] Ibid.

[15] Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, TED Talk, October 7, 2009: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D9Ihs241zeg.

[16] Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.

[17] Tara Yosso, 2005. “Whose Culture Has Capital? A Critical Race Theory Discussion of Community Cultural Wealth”, in Race, Ethnicity and Education, 8(1), 69–91.

[18] An understanding that a culture’s important teachings will live on.

[19] ~~] As well as indigenous, diasporic, and familial~~

~~[20] Such as, but not limited to, patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, exploitative economic systems, ableism, ageism, anthropocentrism, xenophobia, misogyny, antisemitism, anti-blackness, anti-indigeneity, Islamophobia, and transphobia~~

~~[21] and hegemonic~~

~~[22] Ideological, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized~~

[23] ~~Eunice Ho, UCLA Teacher Education Program Ethnic Studies Cohort, Class of 2019, summarizing the work of~~ Based on R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview,” 72-75, in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2019~~8~~.” Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales and Edward Curammeng, “Pedagogies of Resistance: Filipina/o Gestures of Rebellion Against the Inheritance of American Schooling,” in Tracy Buenavista and Arshad Ali, eds., Education At War: The Fight for Students of Color in America (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 2018), 233–238., and Tara Yosso, 2005. “Whose Culture Has Capital? A Critical Race Theory Discussion of Community Cultural Wealth”, in Race, Ethnicity and Education, 8(1), 69–91.

Commented [5]: These do not need to be footnotes, they should ideally be included within the text itself as we recommended. Thank you.

Commented [6]: Eunice Ho worked on the graphic design that has often been used, however, the summarizing was done by the ESMC Advisory Committee based on the works noted.

[24] This section was adapted from Carlos E. Cortés, “High School Ethnic Studies Graduation Requirement, State of California, Suggested Basic Curriculum Principles,” essay dated June 26, 2020.

[25] Systemic racism: the systemic normalization or legalization of racism and discrimination. This often emerges via the unequal and inequitable distribution of resources, power, and opportunity. Systemic racism is also referred to as institutional and/or structural racism.

[26] Such as ‘herstory’ or ‘hxrstory’.

Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Chapter 2: District Implementation Guidance

Third Field Review Draft

Contents

Key Considerations for District and Site Administrators

While effective teaching of ethnic studies is paramount, a supportive district and site leadership is just as important to the efficacy of the work. District and site administrators should also work to develop their understandings of ethnic studies instruction and pedagogies. Below are ways districts can work to best support the development and implementation of a kindergarten through grade twelve (K–12) ethnic studies program, whether it utilizes a stand-alone, integrated or a thematic approach:

- *Ensure that district and site administration support the development of the program, and that the local governing board is fully briefed on the project.* District support is critical to the successful implementation of any new instructional program.
- *Develop a definition of what ethnic studies means to your district.* The purpose statement in the "Developing an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy for K–12 Education" section in chapter 3 notes the importance of connecting the local district and community needs to the historical field of study.

· *Ensure alignment of the district course(s) to state and local policy, district resources, and community needs.* Determine the type of program that is being implemented. Is this a semester or year-long course? Will the course be a standalone ethnic studies course, or will an existing course be modified to incorporate ethnic studies content, skills, and principles? Which department or departments will house ethnic studies? Will a separate ethnic studies professional learning community be formed to include teachers from multiple disciplines and academic backgrounds? As you make these determinations, you may also consider how many courses are going to be offered, existing courses that offer opportunities to teach ethnic studies content and lessons, the expectations for student enrollment, how the program will be accommodated within local facilities, and how many teachers will be needed.

· *Consider the local history, demographics, and particular needs of your district/site's students and their respective communities, including recognition of the Indigenous Peoples wherever a course is being taught.* Administrators should consider conducting research on the cultural values, traditions, indigeneity, and histories of the diverse populations represented in schools. Evaluate the demographic makeup of the district. What is the ethnic breakdown of the student population? Does the district have large numbers of English learners? Students who live in poverty? How can this program serve those students? How can the value of and empathy for other marginalized groups be fostered when student populations are homogenous and/or haven't been explicitly or formally exposed to concepts of race and ethnicity? This research can be done by delving into reported student data, consulting student families and community stakeholders about pressing issues and concerns facing these communities, or even inviting scholars specialized in the history of the communities represented in the district.

· *Develop a clear funding model that includes the resources available for the program and how those resources will be allocated* (e.g., teacher training, classrooms, administrative support, purchase of instructional materials).

- *Be grounded and well-versed in the purpose and impact of ethnic studies.* Similar to ethnic studies educators, administrators should also familiarize themselves with research on the efficacy of K–12 ethnic studies—from developing strong cultural and academic identity, building academic skills within elementary, middle, and high school teachers to facilitating civic engagement with a service and problem-solving orientation. Again, the bibliography included in this document can be used as a starting point. Furthermore, administrators should work to weave the purpose, benefits, principles, and impact of ethnic studies into the fabric of the school, and as a means to educate parents and the broader community. Administrators should familiarize themselves with the ethnic studies guiding values and outcomes outlined in chapter 1, and keep them in mind as they implement an ethnic studies program.
- *Ensure that students receive appropriate and non-discriminatory instruction and materials.* Ensure that district guidelines, professional development, syllabi, classroom instructional materials, and other contents of a locally developed ethnic studies course meet requirements for presenting potentially controversial issues in K–12 public school classrooms. While developing instruction and materials, school districts and local education agencies should ensure that instruction and materials are appropriate for use with pupils of all races, religions, genders, sexual orientations, and diverse ethnic and

cultural backgrounds, pupils with disabilities, and English learners; do not reflect or promote, directly or indirectly, any bias, bigotry, or discrimination against any person or group of persons on the basis of any category protected by Section 220 of the *Education Code;* and do not teach or promote religious doctrine.

- *Ensure fair, balanced, and humanizing pedagogy*. Ensure that pedagogy must support that, in the investigation, presentation and interpretation of facts and ideas within the prescribed course of study, teachers shall be free to examine, present and responsibly discuss various points of view in an atmosphere of open inquiry, provided that the instruction, material, or discussion is appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students; is a fair, balanced, and humanizing academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship (adapted from the United Teachers – Los Angeles/Los Angeles Unified School District Contract 2014-2017, Article XXV Academic Freedom and responsibility, 1.0 Lesson Content).[1]
- *Identify teachers who are willing and committed to invest in developing an ethnic studies curriculum and pedagogy.* Administrators should work within the district and site departments to identify teachers with backgrounds in ethnic studies or strong interest in teaching in the area, who will be involved in the development and implementation of the program. It is especially important to establish connections between the new program and existing offerings in history–social science and English/language arts. Additionally, ethnic studies can be integrated into existing courses in addition to, or instead of, creating a standalone ethnic studies course. Teachers and departments should be provided time to incorporate ethnic studies content and principles into existing curricula and be provided with access to professional development as appropriate. Conducting inner-district outreach campaigns, and exploring the possibility of developing ethnic studies teachers from the ranks of paraprofessionals and other support staff, are just two ways administrators can work to recruit and develop ethnic studies teachers. Additionally, administrators can work with local teacher education programs and university ethnic studies departments to actively recruit and develop a pipeline for individuals interested in teaching ethnic studies.
- *Develop, implement, monitor, and evaluate instructional support.* In order for teachers to provide a robust ethnic studies learning experience they should be engaged in continual professional development and supported by their site and district administrators who are working in tandem with students and community. Administrators should consider

creating a department or distinct lane of work specifically dedicated to developing, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating ethnic studies instructional materials and professional development (preferably differentiated professional development trainings specifically based on varying levels of ethnic studies content knowledge). Administrators can develop their own models of ethnic studies professional development and/or instructional materials by consulting other districts with well-established ethnic studies departments and teachers. It is imperative to consider the number of teachers who currently have experience in this subject area and those who will need additional support and professional development prior to implementation. Furthermore, administrators can draw upon the expertise of scholars to help create this tailored training.

·Tribal Consultation: Conduct Tribal consultation with California Native American Tribes and Tribal organizations in the development of and prior to the implementation of their local Ethnic Studies programs, and should include consultation with Native American and Indigenous organizations in their district as well as Native American scholars and educators.

Consult with other districts, higher education institutions, and relevant community organizations and resources that have implemented ethnic studies programs to see if there are other models and resources that can be adapted to the local program. Appendix C contains a selection of course descriptions from various districts across the state; listings of other courses can be found at the University of California's A–G Course Management Portal at https://hs-articulation.ucop.edu/.

· *Consult with the local county office of education*. Your local county office of education may provide consultation, resources, and/or professional development activities to support the development and implementation of the ethnic studies program.

· *Develop a comprehensive strategic plan for implementation*, including an initial pilot that will enable the district to gather data about what works and doesn't work about the new program. One option is to pilot the course as a semester course and then expand it to a full-year course as capacity is developed within the district. Utilize a subcommittee, preferably including the teachers who will be teaching the course(s), to select instructional materials for the pilot. Alternatively, the course could be piloted by modifying an existing course so that it is taught using an ethnic studies lens. Conduct the pilot, providing frequent opportunities for participating teachers to collaborate and provide feedback both to each other and to district and site

administration. Finally, provide opportunities for students to provide feedback and use assessment tools to quantify the areas that need improvement. The district may utilize the pilot as an opportunity to develop new lessons, resources, activities, and assessments that can be used in the program moving forward.

· Use longitudinal student data to determine student outcomes and assess the effectiveness of the new program over time, and continue teacher professional development to strengthen content knowledge and ensure a smooth transition of new teachers into the program.

Guide to Developing a Local Curriculum with Ethnic Studies Principles

When developing a local curriculum, the first step is to assemble a team to do the work. These team members should have appropriate professional training on curriculum development. Teachers with an ethnic studies background who will be implementing the curriculum should take the lead on this process, but it should also include teachers from other content areas. Ethnic studies is by its very nature interdisciplinary, and ethnic studies teachers can collaborate with history–social science teachers, teachers in language arts, visual and performing arts, and other subjects as well. This collaboration will help to ensure that the curriculum is aligned to the skill expectations in the state's history–social science and language arts content standards, but beyond that it can help to ensure that the concepts and principles of ethnic studies are present throughout the curriculum and are not just limited to the ethnic studies classroom. For example, the pursuit of justice and equity is not only something that students practice in the classroom, but a skill that they develop for use in later life as citizens and proponents for social change. Schools and administrators should also develop a process for evaluation of courses developed and supported through high-quality ethnic studies professional learning.

Administrative support is also essential to the successful implementation of a new curriculum, as teacher training and other opportunities for professional learning should be incorporated into the curriculum plan. This will help ensure that future teachers will be equipped with the necessary skills, content knowledge, and critical mindsets and be able to refine the curriculum long after its initial development. It should also be acknowledged that there will be districts that may be undertaking this process for the first time without experienced teachers who are trained in ethnic studies content and pedagogy. In those cases, it will be particularly important for administrators to support their teachers in order to ensure that they are sufficiently prepared to

implement a successful ethnic studies program. Further, following the development and adoption process in the school district, having a process in place to include opportunities for the continual development and refinement of the curriculum after its initial development is beneficial.

It is also important to engage students and the community in the curriculum development process. Student participation during the curriculum development process is integral to the effectiveness of ethnic studies curriculum. That participation should begin at the school level.

In order to develop a curriculum that is culturally and community relevant and responsive, teachers and administrators need to be familiar with both their student population and their communities. Chapter 1 of this model curriculum stresses the importance of these connections in order to accomplish the goals of ethnic studies in the classroom. The team developing the curriculum must not consider their work complete because they have developed a curriculum that addresses the races/ethnicities on a demographic report. They must seek to understand how the lived experiences of their student population affect the knowledge and attitudes that they bring to the classroom and that students have just as much to bring to the table for mutual learning. With that knowledge in hand, it will be easier to develop a curriculum that engages students as peer learners and with mutual understanding and appreciation.

The curriculum frameworks adopted by the State Board of Education (SBE) contain information that can guide teachers and administrators in the development of a local curriculum. In particular, the *History–Social Science Framework* and the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework* contain useful guidance for current or potential teachers of ethnic studies. Both frameworks contain chapters on assessment that include specific direction on how to use formative and summative assessments to plan and implement an instructional program. They also include chapters on access and equity that emphasize the importance of designing curriculum to support all students, including those who have special needs. One approach for how to differentiate instruction to address those needs is Universal Design for Learning (UDL), a set of strategies for planning instruction and presenting content that enables students to access and use disciplinary knowledge in a variety of ways that address their needs, assets, and strengths.[2] Finally, the frameworks include chapters on instructional strategies and professional learning that provide guidance for both teachers and administrators in planning, implementing, and supporting an inquiry-based instructional program that supports student engagement with the curriculum.

The *History–Social Science Framework* is of particular importance and should be considered an essential companion document to this model curriculum for current and prospective ethnic studies teachers. The framework was organized around four key instructional shifts: inquiry, literacy, content, and citizenship. These shifts are strongly aligned with the core principles of ethnic studies as a discipline. The framework contains a suggested elective course in ethnic studies designed to be used as a history–social science elective in grade nine.[3] This model curriculum obviously goes into much more detail, but the framework relies upon a similar instructional approach, presenting essential questions to direct student inquiry, classroom examples, and suggestions for ways that students can participate in service learning or activism in their school or local community.

Integrating Stakeholders and Community

With the field of ethnic studies being born out of a grassroots community movement, community partnership and accountability are central to its identity. By design, ethnic studies seeks to be community accountable and responsive. Districts and sites considering offering ethnic studies should include students, families, and other public/community institutions (museums, community art spaces, local non-profits relevant to the field, grassroots/community advocacy organizations, etc.) in those plans and discussions to ensure that the particular histories, aspirations, struggles, and achievement of the communities present in classrooms are reflected in the course. One option would be to create a steering committee that could include district teachers and administrators, students, parents, and members of community and advocacy organizations that are active in the district area. Provide multiple opportunities for the public to provide comment on the proposed program during the development process. Student participation in service-learning activities may serve as a way of confirming community support and addressing concerns during the implementation of the program.

Selecting Existing Curricula and Instructional Materials

Local educational agencies (LEAs) have a great deal of flexibility when it comes to the selection of instructional materials for use in their schools. *Education Code* Section 60000(c) states that it is the responsibility of an LEA's governing board to establish courses of study and to select the appropriate instructional materials for those courses. While there is a state-level process by which the SBE adopts instructional materials, that process only applies to kindergarten through

grade eight materials and LEAs are not required to purchase from the state list. High school materials, including materials for elective courses such as ethnic studies, are adopted at the local level by the LEA governing board (*Education Code* Section 60400).

Commented [7]: I would like to add "and LEAs are not required to purchase from the state list"

LEAs are required to adopt materials that meet certain requirements in code, such as the requirement that instructional materials "accurately portray the cultural and racial diversity of our society" (*Education Code* Section 60040). However, the process by which materials are selected at the local level varies significantly. Most LEAs have policies that govern this process. Typically, the process begins when a local selection committee is chosen. *Education Code* Section 60002 states that, "Each district board shall provide for substantial teacher involvement in the selection of instructional materials and shall promote the involvement of parents and other members of the community in the selection of instructional materials." But how exactly that involvement is carried out depends on the LEA. Another way to honor the principles of ethnic studies is to have students be involved in this process as well, either through direct involvement in district policy development or through community outreach to engage others in the selection process.

Governing boards should make these decisions through an open and public process that provides for public input and teacher leadership throughout the process. It is important that all steps related to the development of a local curriculum, including the selection of materials, are transparent and involve all stakeholders in the community. This process can be time-consuming and difficult, but it is the best way to ensure that the materials used are high quality and support effective instruction and student learning.

The SBE has adopted a policy document that provides a set of guidelines for piloting textbooks and instructional materials.[4] While focused on kindergarten through grade eight, much of the guidance in the document applies to the selection of materials for the secondary grades as well. These guidelines include tasks such as the creation of a representative selection committee, the definition and prioritization of evaluation criteria, and establishing a pilot process to determine which available materials best meet local needs. The curriculum frameworks adopted by the SBE also include criteria for the selection of instructional materials that can be used by LEAs as a model.[5]

For example, the Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials in the California *History–Social Science Framework* states that, "Materials include the study of issues and historical and social

science debates. Students are presented with different perspectives and come to understand the importance of reasoned debate and reliable evidence, recognizing that people in a democratic society have the right to disagree."[6]

In addition, districts and LEAs should keep in mind Section 60044 of the California *Education Code* that schools may not use instructional materials that contain "any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or ethnicity, gender, religion, disability, nationality, or sexual orientation, occupation."[7]

An example of guidelines written by a district on how to implement ethnic studies is "Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017.[8] When districts and LEAs create their own guidelines for teaching ethnic studies in their district, this may serve as a model guideline. LAUSD gathered many district stakeholder groups, found language to summarize how to address balanced pedagogy and instructional materials, and address student and teacher needs in support of teaching ethnic studies.

California Department of Education, December 2020

---

[1] 2017 the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team, "Elements of a Balanced Curriculum," https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf accessed 9/22/2020.

[2] UDL is discussed on pages 540–543 of the *History–Social Science Framework* and pages 910–913 of the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework*. UDL is just one of a number of universal access strategies present in both frameworks.

[3] *History–Social Science Framework,* Chapter 14, pp. 310–314.

[4] "Guidelines for Piloting Textbooks and Instructional Materials," State Board of Education Policy 01-15 (January 2015),

https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/documents/impilotingguidelines.doc (Accessed July 23, 2020).

[5] See chapter 23 of the *History–Social Science Framework for California Public School,* and chapter 12 of the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework for California Public Schools.*

[6] See *History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools*, p.182, Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials, item 7. Accessed 9/22/2020.

[7] California Education Code 60044. http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&sectionNum=60044 accessed 9/22/2020.

[8] See "Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017. https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf. Accessed 9/22/2020.

Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Chapter 3: Instructional Guidance for K–12 Education

Third Field Review Draft

Contents

Developing an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy for K–12 Education

Ethnic studies teaching is grounded in the belief that education can be a tool for transformation, social, economic, and political change, and liberation.[1] Central to an ethnic studies pedagogy is the goal to develop students to be able to effectively and powerfully read, write, speak, and think critically and engage in school in meaningful ways. To achieve these goals, ethnic studies educators should consider the following five elements as part of their pedagogical practice: purpose, identity, content and skills, context, and methods. Teaching ethnic studies necessitates that educators consider the purpose of ethnic studies, the context in which the course is being taught, and even a reflection on how the educator's identity and potential biases impact their understanding of and outlook on the world.

Purpose

It is essential that ethnic studies educators first reflect upon the purpose of the field, and the specific course at hand, before arriving at their pedagogical approach. Historically, the educational and academic purpose of ethnic studies has centered on three core concepts: *access, relevance, and community*.[2]

- Access- Ethnic studies provides all students the opportunity to engage with ethnic studies materials and content within their classrooms. They will be exposed to a diverse curriculum and rich teaching that is both meaningful and supportive.
- Relevance- Ethnic studies provides students with an education that is both culturally and community relevant, and draws extensively from the lived experiences and material realities of each individual student.
- Community- Ethnic studies teaching and learning is meant to serve as a bridge between educational spaces/institutions and community. Thus, encouraging students to apply their knowledge to practice being agents of change, social justice organizers and advocates, and engaged citizens at the local, state, national, and global levels.

Reflecting on these concepts at the onset will ensure that ethnic studies educators are creating content and a pedagogical praxis that is grounded in both the field's purpose and aforementioned values and outcomes. Dawn Mabalon provides the following essential questions that guide the purpose of ethnic studies: (1) Who am I? (2) Who is my family and community? (3) What can I do to bring positive change to my community and world?

Identity

Before embarking on lesson planning for an ethnic studies course, it is important that ethnic studies educators are aware of how their own identities, implicit biases, and cultural awareness may impact ethnic studies teaching and learning. With much of the field focusing on issues related to race and identity, teachers, especially those with limited ethnic studies knowledge, should engage in activities that allow them to unpack their own identities, privilege, marginalization, lived experiences, and understanding and experience of race, culture, and social justice. For teachers who may feel especially concerned with teaching ethnic studies, leading ethnic studies scholars highly recommend that they work through assignments like critical autobiography, critical storytelling, critical life history, or keeping a subjectivity journal, to begin the process of "constructively situating oneself in relationship to Ethnic Studies".[3]

Additionally, unlike traditional fields, ethnic studies often requires both students and educators to be vulnerable with each other given the range of topics discussed throughout the course. Thus, educators should work to build community within their classrooms, be comfortable with sharing pieces of their own identities and lived experience, and be equipped to holistically

navigate and respond to students' concerns, discussions, and emotions. Educators should view student-lived experiences as assets, that they themselves may not always have the answers, and therefore should seek opportunities to learn from their students and create room for teachable moments.

This is also true when incorporating literature in an ethnic studies course. Students need to see themselves represented as empowered individuals and experience a diverse range of complex stories to help them understand themselves, as individuals and as members of group identity, and the lived experiences of others different from them. Studies have shown that large majorities of books published for children and young adults feature white characters.[4] When characters of color or other marginalized groups, such as LGBTQ+[5], do appear, they are often portrayed as stereotypes or exist at the fringes of the story. Scholar and author Ebony Elizabeth Thomas warns that this exclusion is creating an "imagination gap" where children are growing up without experiencing what Dr. Rudine Sims Bishop described as the "windows, mirrors, and doors" of literature: "Literature transforms human experience and reflects it back to us, and in that reflection, we can see our own lives and experiences as part of the larger human experience. Reading, then, becomes a means of self-affirmation, and readers often seek their mirrors in books. Literature transforms human experience and reflects it back to us, and in that reflection, we can see our own lives and experiences as part of the larger human experience. Reading, then, becomes a means of self-affirmation, and readers often seek their mirrors in books."[6] By centering the voices that have been traditionally marginalized or excluded from the curriculum and applying a critical lens to texts, teachers provide opportunities to develop students' critical literacy skills, while also allowing them to see themselves in the literature they read and expand the range of stories that they have about others in the world.

Content and Skills

With ethnic studies drawing on a range of academic disciplines from history and performing arts to sociology and literature, students should be introduced to an array of academically rigorous content and skills that are simultaneously grounded in the contributions, lived experiences, and histories of people of color. Students should be exposed to a variety of primary and secondary sources, learn how to process multiple and often competing sources of information, form and defend their own evidence-based analyses, and understand how to appropriately contextualize and evaluate sources of information by bringing them into conversation with other texts, significant events, people, theories, and ideas.

For additional support on identifying a multitude of sources that can be used in the classroom, ethnic studies educators should consult the University of California ethnic studies course outlines that are included in Appendix C of this document, collaborate with other teachers at their sites, and engage materials that can be found at local and community archives and libraries, especially those housed by the University of California, California State University, and local community colleges.

Context

Beyond content, it is important that ethnic studies educators are knowledgeable of the context in which the course is being taught. Here are some dynamics an ethnic studies educator might consider:

- Is the course being taught in a district where parents or community members are unfamiliar with the field?
- Is the course being taught in a school with a widening opportunity gap?
- How comfortable and/or experienced are students with explicitly discussing race and ethnicity?
- Is the course being taught during a moment where racial tensions at the local and national level are beginning to impact students?

These are just a few of the contextual factors that ethnic studies educators must consider as they develop their pedagogical practice.

While being aware of these dynamics is important, working to address them within the course is also key. For example, an ethnic studies educator might create a lesson around education inequality and the opportunity gap that gets students to reflect upon the many factors that have contributed to disparate student success across racial and class lines. Students could analyze “student success,” “college readiness,” and standardized test data from their district or others across the state, read case studies that identify some of the key factors that contribute to student success, and reflect upon their own experiences, drawing connections to collected data or scholarly analyses, if any. A critical part of the context of ethnic studies is being aware of and anticipating for when negative emotions and/or traumas arise from students in dealing with

potentially difficult content or materials—having training with this and resources of further support (including school site counselors when needed), is key.

Methods

There are various methods or pedagogical approaches that ethnic studies educators should consider, from culturally/community relevant and responsive pedagogy to the important instructional shifts described in the California *History–Social Science Framework* and the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework*.

Inquiry

An inquiry-based approach to ethnic studies invites students to become active participants in the learning process. Students are encouraged to pose questions, investigate and explore academic content, and research and theorize solutions to problems that have and continue to generate inequities and racial tensions. This approach is inherently student-centered and helps democratize the classroom by allowing students to help shape their education. Thus, the role of a teacher in an inquiry-based classroom is more of a facilitator that helps students formulate questions, conduct research, and come to their own conclusions/solutions. Researchers found that this approach has yielded student achievement gains/narrowed the opportunity gap (especially amongst historically marginalized students), increased proficiency amongst English language learners, and provides a framework for teachers that might not share the same identities of their students to best engage underrepresented students.[7] This approach of ensuring that students critically investigate and interrogate content is paramount to the ethnic studies course.

In practice, a teacher employing an inquiry-based approach to ethnic studies might frame the course description around a question like—how have race and ethnicity been constructed in the United States, and how have they changed over time? While broad, this question allows for students to be able to enter the course from various points. This approach encourages the use of lessons grounded in research and academic content. Getting students to engage primary sources, develop youth-participatory action research (Youth-led Participatory Action Research [YPAR]) projects, or create service-learning projects are just a few examples of how an inquiry-based approach encourages students to become actors within the learning process.

Democratizing the Classroom and Citizenship

Ethnic studies educators democratize their classrooms by creating a learning environment where ~~both~~ students, ~~and~~ teachers, and community partners are equal active participants in co-constructing knowledge. This enables students to be recognized and valued as knowledge producers alongside their educators, while simultaneously placing an emphasis on the development of democratic values and collegiality.

This approach to ethnic studies teaching is also echoed in the California *History–Social Science Framework's* underscoring one of the four important instructional shifts—citizenship, which is needed to prepare all members of American society, regardless of citizenship status, to become civically engaged in our democratic society. Having students research a challenge facing their community; engagement with local elected officials, advocates, and community members; structured debate; simulations of government; or service learning are all citizenship-oriented skills that are best developed in a classroom where students are able to exercise their agency. Furthermore, these types of activities are appropriate for an ethnic studies course as they provide a lens for students to identify institutional/structural inequities, advocate for change at the local, state, national, or international level, and to engage in healthy debate and dialogue with their peers.

It will often be appropriate for ethnic studies courses to include a community-based ~~engagement~~ project that allows for students to engage with some form of local government to apply ~~use~~ their knowledge and voice to affect social transformation in their community. Teachers can utilize programs that assist students in collecting data, identifying issues, root causes and implementing a plan to better their environment (e.g., YPAR, Mikva Challenge, Action Civics). For example, if students decide they want to advocate for increasing the number of polling places within historically underrepresented communities in their city, they can develop arguments in favor and then plan a meeting with their county registrar of voters. To be convincing, they would ~~must~~ do in-depth research on how other counties have achieved this change, demographic data, leading counterarguments, past voting data, etc. and then plan their persuasive speeches backed by evidence. This experience can be powerful and transformational in that it instills a sense of civic efficacy and empowerment in youth that they will carry on throughout their lives.

Commented [8]: I wonder about the role of community partners in the creation of the learning and how we could incorporate the voice of community experts in the co-constructing of knowledge

Commented [9]: wondering about changing "engagement" to community-based project (given the verb is "engage")

Commented [10]: Should we elaborate or refine on this?

This emphasis on citizenship within the pedagogy provides students with a keen sense of ethics, respect, and appreciation for all people, regardless of ethnicity, nationality, gender, sexual orientation, ability, religion, and beliefs. By democratizing the classroom, educators are allowing multiple entry points for students to discuss ethnic studies theories like, intersectionality—an analytic framework coined by Black feminist legal scholar, Kimberlé Crenshaw, that captures how multiple identities (race, class, religion, gender, sexuality, ability, etc.) overlap or intersect, creating unique experiences, especially for those navigating multiple marginalized or oppressed identities.[8] Intersectionality helps students better understand the nuances around identity, and provides them with skills to be able to engage and advocate for/with communities on the margins of the margins. Further, it helps those with privilege at different intersections recognize their societal advantages in these areas, and lend/cede voice to and build solidarity with oppressed groups.

Reinforcing Literacy

Ethnic studies, like all areas within the social sciences, is a literate discipline. Students should learn the skills necessary to access informational, scholarly, and literary texts. Moreover, they should be able to think critically and analytically, and express themselves through strong verbal and written communication. These skills are integral to students' ability to grasp and master content, engage in inquiry, and be active and well-informed participants in society. The specific grade-level skills that students should develop in their high school careers are described in the *History–Social Science Content Standards,* specifically the Historical and Social Sciences Analysis Skills, and in the *California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy,* including the writing and reading standards for history/social studies.

To further develop students' literacy skills, ethnic studies educators should consider including literature or other language arts-based texts into their courses, which also speak to some of the principles of ethnic studies. Examples include poems, plays, or literature, like the writings of Langston Hughes and Zora Neale Hurston, or dramas produced by El Teatro Campesino. These texts allow for teachers to discuss the literary, poetic, and theatrical devices of these works, while simultaneously highlighting the history of the Harlem Renaissance, and the dramas and cultural production of the Chicano and United Farm Workers movements. The infusion of more ethnic studies-based texts also allows for students of color to see themselves reflected in the curriculum, and for all students to develop a mindset based on their exposure to multiple

ethnicities in their curriculum, that all people are valued, not just European Americans, and that all people should be represented~~imagine a better world~~ in other contexts too.

Making Connections to the *History–Social Science Framework* and the *English Language Arts/English Language Development (ELA/ELD) Framework*:

These two curriculum frameworks contain an extensive lesson example that shows how teachers can work with colleagues across disciplines to address a common topic. In this case, the example is how a language arts teacher and history–social science teacher collaborate to teach the novel *Things Fall Apart,* addressing both language arts and history–social science standards in their instruction (the example begins on page 338 in the *History–Social Science Framework*, and page 744 of the *ELA/ELD Framework*).

Ethnic studies educators should also consider how they can collaborate with their peers to integrate ethnic studies instruction with content in other areas. Depending on which grade level the ethnic studies course is being offered, the ethnic studies educator can include a literary selection that connects to the content students are studying in their history–social science classroom, or work with the language arts teacher on lessons that address grade-level standards in reading or writing.

Culturally/Community Relevant and Responsive- Ethnic studies educators should be sure that their pedagogy is both community and culturally relevant. Beyond teaching content that is diverse, having an understanding of the various cultural backgrounds of students, being aware of pertinent cultural norms and nuances, and acknowledging and valuing student lived experiences as important assets and resources to collective learning, are also important to ethnic studies teaching and learning.[9] While much of being able to develop a culturally-responsive pedagogy is about the relationships teachers build with their students, operating from a holistic and motivational space, tailoring lessons and assignments to speak to the needs and cultural experiences of students and staying abreast of research, trends, and issues that speak to the various cultures of students is also key.[10] Furthermore, ethnic studies educators should stay abreast of challenges impacting their students' communities, and leverage ethnic studies courses to implement and spur discussions, assignments, and community-engaged projects around those issues and/or topics.[11]

In-Class Community Building

Given the unique and often sensitive material and discussions that may unfold in an ethnic studies course, being able to establish trust and building community within the classroom are essential. Engaging topics on race, class, gender, oppression, etc. may evoke feelings of vulnerability, uneasiness, sadness, guilt, helplessness, or discomfort, for students not previously exposed to explicit conversations about these topics. Thus, it is imperative for ethnic studies educators to develop a pedagogy and classroom that (1) sees the humanity and value in each individual student; (2) recognizes that each student has their own wealth of experiences and knowledge that will shape their worldviews and values, and diverse viewpoints are respected; (3) is grounded in academic rigor, but also tends to the socioemotional development of students; (4) encourages students to engage each other with respect, trust, love, and accountability; and (5) is a space where learning is democratized and students are centered through an inquiry-based process that nurtures the student voice and honors different styles of learning.

Ethnic studies educators are encouraged to establish community agreements or classroom norms in collaboration with their students where empathetic listening is prioritized and conflicting views are valued as opportunities for deeper learning, incorporate community building activities into lessons, and create time for regular reflection and debrief. Incorporating these recommendations can assist in building a welcoming environment where students are able to rigorously and intimately engage ethnic studies and build upon existing interpersonal communication and collaboration skills.

Educators today have a tremendous responsibility to students: teaching content, cultivating their social–emotional skills, and preparing them to be informed and active global citizens. “In reflective classrooms, students’ knowledge is constructed rather than passively absorbed. Students are prompted to join with teachers in posing problems to foster ‘critical consciousness’ (Freire, 1994). In reflective classrooms, teaching and learning are conceived as social endeavors in which a healthy exchange of ideas is welcome. Students are encouraged to engage in dialogue within a community of learners, to look deeply, to question underlying assumptions, and to discern underlying values being presented. Students are encouraged to voice their own opinions and to actively listen to others, to treat different students and different perspectives with patience and respect, and to recognize that there are always more perspectives and more to learn. Learning in these contexts nurtures students’ humility as well as

confidence - humility because they come to see that they have no 'corner' on the truth, and confidence because they know their opinion will still be taken seriously."[12]

Building "safe," "brave," "democratic," "empowering" classrooms is both art and science. Skilled teachers use a variety of techniques to create a sense of trust and openness; to encourage students to speak and listen to each other; to make space and time for silent reflection; to offer multiple avenues for participation and demonstrating learning; and to help students appreciate the points of view, talents, and contributions of less vocal members.

Commented [11]: do we add: demonstrating their learning?

Facilitating thoughtful, respectful, and generative discussions of controversial issues can be especially challenging in classrooms where students bring a diversity of social, personal, cultural, and academic backgrounds, mindsets, and experiences to the conversation. Yet the richness of these discussions and their importance for future citizenship drives many teachers whose classes are relatively homogeneous to seek out opportunities for their students to engage with counterparts of different backgrounds.

It is equally challenging to consistently facilitate honest or insightful dialogue in classrooms where there is a greater degree of social, personal, economic, and/or political homogeneity. By prioritizing student-centered approaches and utilizing a wide variety of discussion protocols, teachers can provide opportunities for students to engage critically in the gray areas of controversial topics with peers who may share similar viewpoints.

What do teachers need in order to effectively engage students in productive conversations and learning activities around difficult and important issues? Simply put:

- Sufficient understanding of the subject matter to provide basic context and select a set of authentic and varied readings, coupled with genuine curiosity and an awareness of the limitations of their knowledge
- Knowledge of their students' backgrounds and the ability to elicit students' questions and perspectives; monitor their understanding; push them to think critically; and help them appreciate the insights, wisdom, and moral courage of themselves and others
- A map of anticipated challenges—and a set of strategies, supports, and mentors that they can turn to when students' confusion, lack of engagement, misconceptions, prejudices, or hurtful comments and behavior prove challenging

- Awareness and active monitoring of their own thinking and learning and access to other adults who can join them in the inquiry, help them to articulate their questions and insights, and further stimulate their thinking
- Careful attention to their own political viewpoints and potential biases, to ensure students are empowered to form their own opinions rather than simply adopting the views of the teacher or particular educational materials

To become effective educators, teachers first need the time and opportunity to reflect together with colleagues. Providing professional development seminars and workshops which specifically create time for teachers to be learners allows them to explore core concepts and to deepen their understanding of the history they intend to teach while simultaneously exploring their own identity, the way their identity has affected and been affected by their experiences, and how their identity influences their perspective and the way they are seen by others, including their students. In community with other educators, teachers gain insight from others' experiences and perspectives and build relationships for ongoing exploration which may be useful as they then create reflective communities for their students. There is a wide range of existing activities that teachers can use to support community building in their classrooms. Please see Appendix B for lessons resources including community building activity examples.

Approaches to Ethnic Studies

The *History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools: Kindergarten through Grade Twelve* offers the following guidance for schools and educators on the teaching of ethnic studies focusing on two essential questions:

· How have race and ethnicity been constructed in the United States, and how have they changed over time?

· How do race and ethnicity continue to shape the United States and contemporary issues?

When the discipline was first founded, "ethnic studies" was (and still is) deployed as an umbrella term/field that was designed to be inclusive of four core fields—African American Studies, Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies, and Native American Studies. While each core field addresses the specific histories, and social, cultural, economic, and political experiences of people from said group, they often overlap in their

approach, the types of methods and theories that are engaged, and through discussion of shared/collective struggles. The approaches found in these examples can also be applied to the study of other diverse groups based on race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, religion, beliefs, and other identifiers that help to affirm a student's sense of self.

With such disciplinary diversity, ethnic studies has been approached utilizing various instructional formats at the K–12 level. The most common are stand-alone core field courses, thematic/comparative race and ethnic studies courses, and the integration of ethnic studies content into existing content.

Like all successful instruction, teaching ethnic studies requires effective preparation, depth of knowledge, belief in students as capable learners, as well as strong institutional support. Drawing on lessons from San Francisco Unified School District's effort to build its ethnic studies program, districts are encouraged to support their teachers' development in three key areas:

Useful Theory, Pedagogy, and Research

Teachers and administrators should begin with a careful, deliberate analysis of their own personal identities, backgrounds, knowledge base, and biases. They should familiarize themselves with current scholarly research around ethnic studies instruction, critical and culturally/community relevant and responsive pedagogies, critical race theory, and intersectionality, which are key theoretical frameworks and pedagogies that can be used in ethnic studies research and instruction. Engagement with theory and scholarly research can help strengthen educators' ability to distinguish between root causes and symptoms, dispel myth from fact, and address the importance of discussing and addressing lasting issues caused by systemic inequities. Attention should also be given to trauma-informed and healing informed educational practices. The bibliography included in this document can be used as a springboard. However, it is strongly encouraged that both educators and administrators consult ethnic studies coordinators at the district level and county level, professional development offered by ethnic studies classroom teachers, county offices of education, faculty at institutions of higher education, relevant community resources, and other support providers. These sources, contacts, and institutions can help educators and administrators stay abreast of useful theory, research, and content knowledge that can be leveraged in the classroom and/or professional development.

Ethnic Studies Content

In Ronald Takaki's seminal text, *A Different Mirror: A History of Multicultural America,* he articulates the need for a new "looking glass" from which our society must gaze. He argues that within our national narrative all communities must be able to see themselves. Thus, it is vital for teachers to engage a multitude of stories, narratives, sources, and contributions of everyone in America so that all students can see themselves as part and parcel of the grand American narrative.

Teachers should engage various texts and perspectives when teaching ethnic studies; be open to learning from their students; consider allowing students to offer suggested texts or sources that may speak to the specificities of their individual identities; and in addition to consulting other teachers, ethnic studies coordinators, and higher education faculty, draw on other instructional materials approved by the State Board of Education (SBE), as well as resources provided by other public institutions like local museums, archives, and libraries.

Academic Skill Development

Any meaningful education must equip students with the necessary tools to engage and invest in their own learning. Reading, writing, speaking, listening, and collaboration are all critical to student success and foundational to the principles of ethnic studies. During lesson planning, ethnic studies educators should reflect upon different ways (exercises, homework assignments, service-learning projects, etc.) to get students to engage in ethnic studies content while rigorously developing academic skills. With fewer K–12 instructional materials available for implementing ethnic studies, as compared to traditional fields, it is imperative that teachers collaborate with each other to develop new units, lessons, and other instructional materials. School administrators can support this collaboration by allotting time within professional development days or during department meetings.

Teacher development in these key areas can help ensure that students in ethnic studies courses will develop a firm grasp of the field, as well as critical social and academic literacies that equip them to meaningfully participate as confident and engaged citizens.

Stand-Alone Courses

This section includes an overview of sample courses that districts can use as guidance for creating their own ethnic studies courses with engaging lessons that connect with the demographics in their communities. Stand-alone courses provide students the opportunity to

delve into content relevant to specific core fields and allow teachers to develop robust and focused curriculum. Overall, this approach to ethnic studies provides some of the most concentrated and comprehensive spaces for learning about a particular area within an ethnic studies core field.

The sample course overviews below address the original ethnic studies disciplines. When stand-alone ethnic studies courses were initially developed at the college level, they represented four core people of color groups: Black/African American Studies, Latina/o/x Chicano/a/x Studies, Native American Studies, and Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies. The use of these four groups as an umbrella for a myriad of ethnically and culturally diverse representations was replicated when courses in ethnic studies were developed at the high school level. It is important to note that there are groups that are sometimes addressed under the broadly defined umbrella of those core groups. For example, Arab Americans have sometimes been covered within the study of Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies. There is a range of sample UC, A–G-approved course outlines in Appendix C which cover a variety of communities that represent the rich diversity of California. A list of suggested significant events and individuals that can be included, as well as, sample lessons that are aligned to the ethnic studies principles from chapter 1 and the state-adopted content standards in history–social science, English language arts, and English language development, are available in Appendix A.

African American Studies

The study of people of African descent has taken on various academic field names, including Afro-American Studies, African American Studies, Africana Diaspora Studies, Pan African Studies, Black Studies, and Africana Studies, to name a few. While they all cover the contributions, histories, cultures, politics, and socialization of people of African descent, naming often differs as a way denote an emphasis on particular political background or ideological approach; to express that this iteration of the field will be African-centered or focus on people of African descent in the Americas; and some names are no longer used simply due to the evolution of the field and shifting identity markers. For example, Afro-American Studies dates back to the late 1960s and is mostly no longer used. The name was largely replaced with Black Studies in response to the Black Power movement. While the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum does not endorse any particular iteration over another, Ethnic Studies educators and administrators are encouraged to consider student demographics, needs, interests, and current

events when crafting a course or lesson, as this may help determine what iteration of the field will be most useful for the class. For example, if you are teaching a class with a large number of first generation African students, perhaps an Africana or African Diaspora Studies approach would be most beneficial.

An African American Studies course can be designed to be an introduction to the study of people of African descent in the United States, while drawing connections to Africa and the African diaspora. Students explore the history, cultures, struggles, and politics of African Americans as part of the African diaspora across time. This course contends with how race, gender, and class shape life in the United States for people of African descent, while simultaneously introducing students to new frameworks like Afrofuturism. Ultimately, this course considers the development of Black identity in the United States and explores the importance African Americans played in the formation of the United States, the oppression they faced, the exploitation of black labor, and the continued fight for liberation.

This course can explore the African American and African Diaspora experience, from the precolonial ancestral roots in Africa to the trans-Atlantic slave trade and enslaved people's uprisings in the antebellum South to the elements of Hip Hop and African cultural retentions. This class is designed to engage various themes, time periods, genres and cultures along the spectrum of Blackness.

Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies

The study of people of Latinx descent has taken on various academic field names, including: Raza Studies, Chicano Studies, Chicana/o Studies, Latina/o Studies, Central American Studies, Chican@/Latin@ Studies, Chicanx/Latinx Studies, and Xicanx/Latinx Studies, to name a few. While they all cover the contributions, histories, cultures, politics, and socialization of people from Mesoamerica, South America, the Caribbean, and the United States Southwest, naming often differs as a way to denote an emphasis on a particular experience and language evolution. For example, Chicano derived fields focused on the experiences of Mexican Americans and grew out of student activism that called for the creation of a field that addressed the history, contributions, injustices, and historical oppression of primarily Mexican Americans. Today, Chicano as an identity and the field of Chicano/a/x/ Studies has been broadened to include a range of Latinx backgrounds and experiences. Embracing the term Chicano is embracing the inherent activism and social justice leanings. As another example, the use of "@" was

popularized during the early 2000s as a way to include both genders and as a nod to the burgeoning digital age. The recent use of “x” is done for two purposes. The first “x” in Xicanx replaces the “ch” because the sound produced by “x” is much more in line with the Náhuatl language and indigenous etymologies. The second “x” renders the term gender-neutral and more inclusive of all identities.

A Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x course can explore the complexities of the indigenous, mestizo, and Afro-mestizo populations from Latin America (the Americas and Caribbean) that have been grouped in the United States under the demographic label of Latino/a, and more recently, Latinx. Latinx populations come from different countries with varying languages and dialects, customs, and cultural practices. The common experiences that unite these diverse populations are their indigenous and African roots/identities, the experience and ancestral memories of European colonization, cultural practices, U.S. imperialism, migration, resistance, and colonial languages (i.e., Spanish and Portuguese).

Furthermore, this course can offer an introductory study of Chicana/o/x in the contemporary United States, focusing primarily on history, roots, migration, education, politics, and art as they relate to the Chicana/o/x experience. More specifically, this course also introduces the concept and terminology of Chicano/a, Xicanx, or Latinx as an evolving political and social identity. Lastly, students cover the birth of the 1960s Chicano Movement as well as more contemporary social movements that have sought to highlight the experiences of Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x people.

This course can delve into a wealth of topics that have defined the Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x experience ranging from indigeneity, the European invasion of the Americas, colonial independence movements, migration to the United States, identity formation, culture, social movements, and resistance to exploitative labor practices. Through interactive lectures, readings, class activities, writing prompts, collaborative group projects, presentations, and discussions, students in this course examine the following: The cultural formation and transformation of Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x communities, the role of women in shaping Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x culture, Chicana/o/x muralism, Mexican immigrants in American culture, and much more.

Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies

The study of people of Asian descent has taken on various academic field names, including Asian American Studies and Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies. Additionally, various subfields have emerged out of Asian American Studies as a means of including groups that have been historically marginalized and understudied within the field. Arab American Studies, Southeast Asian Studies, Filipina/o/x Studies, and Pacific Islander Studies are just a few. While the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum does not endorse any particular field or subfield over another, ethnic studies educators and administrators are encouraged to consider student demographics, needs, interests, and current events when crafting a course or lesson as this may help determine what iteration of the field will be most useful for the class.

An Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies course can be designed to be an introduction to the socio-political construction of Asian American and Pacific Islander identity in the United States. Students can explore the history, cultures, struggles, and politics of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders as part of the larger Asian diaspora. This course contends with how race, gender, and class shape life in the United States for people of Asian descent, while simultaneously introducing students to concepts like Pan-Asianism and transnationalism. Ultimately, this course considers how different Asian ethnicities are inducted into the ~~re/~~formation of an Asian racial identity, culture, and politics within the United States.

This course can explore a broad range of topics and events pertaining to the Asian American and Pacific Islander experiences, and examine their contributions to the state and U.S. throughout history. Topics may include: immigration, intergenerational conflict, the myth of the model minority, the incarceration of Japanese Americans during World War II, U.S. Supreme Court Case *Lau v. Nichols* regarding the right to an equal education, the unique experiences of Southwest Asians (Middle Eastern populations) such as Arabs, Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Coptic-Christians, Iranians, Mizrahi Jews, Kurds, and Yazidis; South Asians such as Sikhs, Hindus, Afghans, Bangladeshis, Indians, Pakistanis, and Sri Lankans; Southeast Asians such as Cambodians, Hmong, Laotians, Indonesians, Malaysians, Myanmarese, Thais, and Vietnamese; East Asians such as Chinese, Japanese, Koreans, and Taiwanese; Filipina/o/x; Pacific Islanders, and U.S. colonialism and imperialism in the Pacific.

Native American Studies

The study of Native and indigenous people has taken on various academic field names, including, American Indian Studies, Native American Studies, and Indigenous Studies. While

they all cover the histories, contributions, politics, and cultures of indigenous people, the specific academic field names are often used to denote specific groups. While American Indian and Native American Studies refer to the study of indigenous people in the Americas, Indigenous Studies takes a more global approach and is used to discuss indigenous and aboriginal people beyond the U.S. While Mexican Americans and Latina/o/x Americans have native ancestry, their indigenous histories are addressed in the Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x course outline.

This course can explore the complexity and diversity of Native American experiences from the pre-contact era to the present, highlighting key concepts like indigeneity, settler colonialism, environmental justice, cultural retention, cultural hegemony, imperialism, genocide, language groups, self-determination, land acknowledgement, and tribal sovereignty. The course can provide students with a comprehensive understanding of how the role of imperialism, settler colonialism, and genocide, both cultural and physical, of North American Native Americans contributed to the formation of the United States. Students are exposed to the history and major political, social, and cultural achievements of various Native American tribes. Overall, students have an opportunity to critically engage readings, materials, and sources from indigenous perspectives.

The course can have key goals such as: (1) foreground the rich history of sovereign and autonomous Native American tribes; (2) delve into the implications of genocide and forced land removal on Native American populations; (3) grapple with the cultural and ideological similarities and differences amongst various tribes in and outside of the California region. Students identify salient values, traditions, and customs relevant to California-based Native American populations; and (4) highlight major periods of resistance and social activism, like the American Indian Movement (AIM), and recent movements around the Emeryville Shellmounds and the Dakota Access Pipeline.

Integrating Ethnic Studies into Existing Courses

While an increasing number of districts across the state have worked to develop and implement ethnic studies courses, there are still many districts that have not offered the course for a multitude of reasons (e.g., budgetary and other infrastructural constraints, lack of instructional resources and curriculum support) Consequently, many educators have worked diligently to include ethnic studies concepts, terms, and topics into existing courses. It is not uncommon to see ethnic studies integrated into history–social science courses, including U.S. history, world

history, economics, psychology, social studies, and geography. There are also cases of ethnic studies being included in visual and performing arts, mathematics, science, English language arts, and other subject areas.

For example, a geography teacher might develop a unit or lesson around urban geography, where students can delve into key concepts like environmental racism and ecological justice, and focus on the experiences of people of color in those spaces. Students could draw on local news stories, primary sources like housing and city planning maps, archived oral history interviews from current and past residents of the area, and literary texts that speak to the experiences of people of color in urban spaces like Sandra Cisneros' *House on Mango Street,* Lorraine Hansberry's *A Raisin in the Sun,* and the poetry of Janice Mirikitani.

This approach ensures that the intersectional lens that ethnic studies provides is salient and manifests within various subject areas. Moreover, this approach further enriches traditional subject areas by including a range of perspectives that can further elucidate the overall course content.

The Cultural Proficiency Continuum for History–Social Science, based on the work of Geneva Gay, Randall Lindsey, Stephanie Graham and others, provides an example of how ethnic studies can be integrated into history–social science courses. It asks important questions about the content and curriculum materials we use in classrooms. The selection of curriculum content and resources may be intentional or unintentional but are worthy of analysis if we are intent on providing a culturally proficient curriculum for students. In the teaching of history, as described in the *History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools*, as a story well told, we need to ask ourselves, whose story are we telling? Which perspectives are shared? What message or agenda is delivered? The Continuum can be found at https://www.lacoe.edu/Portals/0/Curriculum-Instruction/HSS/HSS%20Cultural%20Proficiency%20Continuum%20FINAL.pdf?ver=2020-09-08-142513-047.

Grade Level

Ethnic studies has primarily been taught at the college/university and high school (ninth through twelfth grade) levels. However, some districts have offered the course for grades six through eight, and at the K–5 level ethnic studies may be included as a stand-alone unit. Understanding how race and ethnicity impacts society should be an essential core component of every

students' K–12 education experience. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum has been developed for educators teaching grades nine through twelve, and in alignment with the University of California and California State University System "A–G" subject requirements. Adjusting assignments, modes of assessment and readings, as well as pedagogical approach, are most important to consider when modifying the model curriculum to be developmentally appropriate and fit a specific grade level.

From a history–social science perspective, students may study the history and culture of a single, historically racialized group in the United States. Examples may include a course on African American, Asian American and Pacific Islander, Native American, or Chicana/o and Latina/o history.

The course could also focus on an in-depth comparative study of the history, politics, culture, contributions, challenges, and current status of two or more racial or ethnic groups in the United States. This course could, for example, concentrate on how these groups experienced the process of racial and ethnic formation in a variety of contexts and how these categories changed over time. The relationship between global events and an ethnic or racial group's experience could be another area of study. In this vein, students could study how World War II drew African Americans from the South to California cities like Oakland and Los Angeles, how the Iranian Revolution and its aftermath affected Iranian immigrants in the United States, or how Armenian Americans mobilized to urge the U.S. government to formally acknowledge the Armenian Genocide. Many peoples came to the United States fleeing oppression, war, or genocide, including those listed above and others such as Assyrians and Jews. Alternatively, a course could focus in on the local community and examine the interactions and coalition-building among a number of ethnic and/or racial groups. In an ethnic studies course, students will become aware of the constant themes of social justice and responsibility, while recognizing these are defined differently over time.

As identity and the use of power are central to ethnic studies courses, instructors should reflect critically on their own perspective and personal histories as well as engage students as co-investigators in the inquiry process. A wide range of sources (e.g., literature, court cases, government files, memoirs, art, music, oral histories) and elements of popular culture can be utilized to better understand the experiences of historically disenfranchised groups—such as Native Americans, African Americans, Chicana/o and Latina/o, and Asian Americans and Pacific

Islanders. At the same time, students should be aware of how the different media have changed over time and how that has shaped the depiction of the different groups.

Models of instruction should be student centered. For example, students could develop research questions based on their lived experiences in order to critically study their communities. Reading and studying multiple perspectives, participating in community partnerships, collecting oral histories, completing service-learning projects, or engaging in Youth Participatory Action Research can all serve as effective instructional approaches for this course.

Teachers can organize their instruction around a variety of themes, such as the movement to create ethnic studies courses in high schools and universities; personal explorations of students' racial, ethnic, cultural, and national identities; the history of racial construction, both domestically and internationally; and the influence of the media on the framing and formation of identity. Students can investigate the history of the experience of various ethnic groups in the United States, as well as the diversity of these experiences based on race, gender, and sexuality, among other identities.

To study these themes, students can consider a variety of investigative questions, including large, overarching questions about the definitions of ethnic studies as a field of inquiry, economic and social class in American society, social justice, social responsibility, civic rights and responsibilities, and social change. They can ask how race has been constructed in the United States and other parts of the world. They can investigate the relationship between race, gender, sexuality, social class, and economic and political power. They can explore the nature of citizenship by asking how various groups have become American and examining cross-racial and inter-ethnic interactions among immigrants, migrants, people of color, and working people. They can investigate the legacies of social movements and historic struggles against injustice in California, the Southwest, and the United States as a whole and study how different social movements for people of color, women, and LGBTQ+ communities have mutually informed each other.

Students can also personalize their study by considering how their personal and/or family stories connect to the larger historical narratives and how and why some narratives have been privileged over others. Lastly, students may consider how to improve their own community, what constructive actions can be taken, and how they can provide a model for change for those in other parts of the state, country, and world.

Thematic/Comparative Race and Ethnic Studies Approach

Increasingly, ethnic studies curricula combine comparative and thematic approaches. The combination of these approaches offer valuable opportunities for students to learn about the similarities as well as differences experienced by two or more groups. In addition, a comparative, thematic course or lesson plan gives teachers the option to include a variety of group experiences over time. Teachers will often identify key themes and concepts within the field that can be used to investigate the histories, contributions, and struggles of multiple groups, both individually and collectively. Identity, colonialism, systems of power, and social justice are just a few of the many concepts and themes that can be engaged within an ethnic studies course employing this approach. In doing so, teachers are able to provide a space for multiple perspectives and narratives to be included in units and lessons simultaneously. This approach also encourages students to make links across racial and ethnic lines, and foregrounds the development of allies—who will act on the behalf of the harmed group in order to make change—and solidarity building. Additionally, students are able to engage readings and materials from multiple fields, thus exposing them to new ideas and perspectives that they may not have encountered in a stand-alone ethnic studies course. As noted previously, teachers and administrators should consider their local student and community demographics when building the content of their courses.

Another way to engage this approach is by using themes to delve into several core ethnic studies areas independently. For example, during a 16-week semester, educators can divide the course up evenly, with approximately four weeks dedicated to the study of different core fields, and a salient focus on particular themes across all the core fields. Overall, the thematic and comparative approaches often stress the importance of identifying shared struggles, building unity, and developing intercultural communication and competence.

Introduction to Ethnic Studies

This section contains a sample course outline for a general Introduction to Ethnic Studies course utilizing a thematic approach. Districts can use this outline as guidance for creating their own ethnic studies courses that reflect the student demographics in their communities.

The thematic course draws from the four core disciplines that were the original basis of ethnic studies and provides opportunities for educators to utilize the themes to make connections to

their classroom demographics. These disciplines have continued to evolve and change over time. African American Studies has had various academic names but focuses on the experiences of people of African descent in the United States, while drawing connections to Africa and the African diaspora. Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies covers the contributions, histories, cultures, politics, and socialization of people from Mesoamerica, South America, the Caribbean, and the United States Southwest. Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies has grown to incorporate various subfields as a means of including groups that have been historically marginalized and under studied within the field, such as Arab American Studies. Finally, Native American Studies covers the histories, contributions, politics, and cultures of indigenous people in the Americas. While the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum does not endorse any particular field or subfield over another, ethnic studies educators and administrators are encouraged to consider student demographics, needs, interests, and current events when crafting a course or lesson, as this may help determine what iteration of the field will be most useful for the class.

Introduction to Ethnic Studies Course Outline

Course Overview: This course is designed to help students develop an intersectional and global understanding of the impact of race and racism, ethnicity, and culture in the shaping of individuals and communities in the United States. They will learn about the interlocking systems of oppression and privilege that impact all people. Students will be exposed to a multitude of histories, perspectives, and cultures with the goal of students being able to build critical analytical and intercultural communication skills; developing an understanding of geo-historical and cultural knowledge and contributions; fostering of humanism and collaboration across lines of difference; learning the value and strength in diversity; and developing a rigorous historical understanding of the development of racial and ethnic identities in the United States; and engaging in civic action, community service, and/or community education to bring positive change that helps build a future society free of racism and other forms of bigotry associated with white supremacy, white nationalism, and institutional racism[13].

Course Content: Given the interdisciplinary nature of ethnic studies, students will be exposed to many subject areas, including, but not limited to, history, geography, literature, sociology, anthropology, and visual arts.

The use of a thematic approach to teaching ethnic studies is incredibly generative as students are able to consider an array of inquiry-based questions—from more overarching questions around racial formation and their own ancestral legacies, to more focused inquiries that may address issues in their communities, like a public health inequity that is being exacerbated because of the racial and/or class makeup. Themes also allow students to delve into various perspectives simultaneously, where they are able to draw connections across racial and ethnic groups.

Throughout the course, each unit and lesson plan should be founded on the guiding values and principles of ethnic studies as described in chapter 1:

1. Cultivate empathy, community actualization, cultural perpetuity, self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being of all participants, especially Native People/s and black indigenous people of color (BIPOC)
2. Celebrate and honor Native People/s of the land and communities of black indigenous people of color by providing a space to share their stories of success, community collaboration, and solidarity, along with their intellectual and cultural wealth
3. Center and place high value on the pre-colonial, ancestral knowledge, narratives, and communal experiences of Native people/s and people of color and groups that are typically marginalized in society
4. Critique empire-building in history and its relationship to white supremacy, racism and other forms of power and oppression
5. Challenge racist, bigoted, discriminatory, imperialist/colonial beliefs and practices on multiple levels
6. Connect ourselves to past and contemporary social movements that struggle for social justice and an equitable and democratic society; and conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for a post-racist, post-systemic racism society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing

Further, they should support and develop the key outcomes of:

1. Pursuit of justice and equity
2. Working toward greater inclusivity
3. Furthering self-understanding

4. Developing a better understanding of others
5. Recognizing intersectionality
6. Promoting self-empowerment for civic engagement
7. Supporting a community focus
8. Developing interpersonal communication

Some ethnic studies teachers begin lessons by acknowledging that they are on native land, and honor the specific indigenous peoples who have had a close relationship to that land in the past and present. Each sample theme below includes sample lessons located in Appendix A. They are designed to show how a teacher might cover a particular portion of a theme. Please note that these lessons are meant to serve as exemplars for how teachers can organize a course around these central themes. They are not exhaustive, nor do they constitute a scope and sequence or full curriculum. Teachers and administrators are encouraged to address themes and specific content that are reflective of the demographics of their communities. Many of the sample lessons provided in Appendix A can be adapted to tell the stories of other groups. Further, many of the lessons could be used to support an alternate theme. For example, the Redlining Lesson located in the Systems of Power theme, also fits within the theme of History and Movement.

Sample Theme #1: Identity

1. What factors shape our identities? What parts of our identities do we choose for ourselves? What parts are determined for us by others, by society, or by chance?
2. What dilemmas arise when others view us differently than we view ourselves?
3. How do our identities influence our choices and the choices available to us?
4. What factors influence our identity, and in turn, the choices we make?
5. How is identity shaped and reshaped by our ~~my~~ specific circumstances?

"Adolescence is, by definition, a time of transition, when young people begin to take their places as responsible and participating members of their communities. As young people weigh their future choices, they wrestle with issues of loyalty and belief. The adolescent's central developmental questions are 'Who am I?' 'Do I matter?' and 'How can I make a difference?' They seek people and paths that are worthy of their loyalty and commitment, challenge

hypocrisy, and bring passion and new perspectives to enterprises that capture their imaginations and engage their involvement."[14]

Adolescence brings with it new abilities to think abstractly and meta-cognitively, so this exploration of identity is developmentally responsive. The high-engagement reflection on ourselves, who we are, who we relate to, how we relate to others, how we are perceived by others, and how our identity influences our perspective, choices, and impact, builds schema for a more sophisticated understanding of agency, belonging, and community and for deep ethical reflection. It also provides an initial basis for delving into the tension between the universal and particular—understanding and drawing out universal lessons on human behavior while respecting the integrity of particular moments and experiences.

Our society—through its particular culture, customs, institutions, and more—provides us with the labels we use to categorize the people we encounter. These labels are based on beliefs about race, ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation, economic class, and more. Sometimes our beliefs about these categories are so strong that they prevent us from seeing the unique identities of others. Sometimes these beliefs also make us feel suspicion, fear, or hatred toward some members of our society. Other times, especially when we are able to get to know a person, we are able to see past labels and, perhaps, find common ground and value and appreciate differences. Some examples of topics that could be used to explore questions of identity are the "model minority" myth and its historic and contemporary implications for Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, the experiences of Arab Americans and the rise of Islamophobia and discrimination against Sikhs in the aftermath of 9/11 and the War on Terror, the recent rise in anti-Semitic violence, hatred, and rhetoric, and the way that Native Americans have challenged the use of native iconography and dress for mascots on college campuses and professional sports leagues.

Sample Theme #2: History and Movement

1. What does it mean to live on this land? Who may become an American? What happens when multiple narratives are layered on top of each other?
2. How should societies integrate newcomers? How do newcomers develop a sense of belonging to the places where they have arrived?
3. How does migration affect the identities of individuals, communities and nations?
4. How do ideas or narratives about who may belong in a nation affect immigration policy, the lives of immigrants, and host communities?

5. What role have immigrants played in defining notions of democracy?

Another theme that this course could focus on is an in-depth study of the migration of various people of color to California. Within this theme of history and movement, teachers will develop and facilitate instructional opportunities for students to explore intense migration periods like:

· The Second Great Migration (1940–1970) – The mass exodus of African Americans from the rural South to urban cities across the Northeast, Midwest, and West. Students could focus on the World War II era, in particular port cities like Los Angeles, Oakland, San Francisco, and Richmond, whose African American populations skyrocketed with the increase of job opportunities to support the maritime, munitions, and other military industries. Teachers can discuss how this period of migration reshaped urban cities in California; grapple with how the influx of African American migrants impacted racial politics and dynamics in the state; and highlight the major contributions African Americans made to the political, socioeconomic, and cultural life of the state.

· Southeast Asian Refugee Crisis – Students can discuss the implications of the Vietnam War on Vietnamese, Cambodian, Hmong, Iu-Mien, and Laotian populations into the 1970s and 1980s. Beyond learning about the war, the fall of Saigon, the era of the Khmer Rouge, and other significant events of this period, students can also delve into the experiences of Southeast Asian immigrants, the racial enclaves they created in California (Sacramento, Long Beach, and Fresno are just a few cities with vibrant Southeast Asian refugee communities), their contributions, and ongoing struggles.

· Native American Removal – Students will be able to discuss early settlers and the U.S. government's often fraught engagement with Native American tribes dating back to the eighteenth century. Sample topics and events include: the Indian Removal Act of 1830, forced migration, the creation of Reservations, broken treaties, and the enacting of genocide against Native American people. Overall, these topics will provide students with a better understanding of the struggles many Native American tribes endured, while also connecting those struggles to western expansion, manifest destiny, and the establishment of the contiguous U.S.

· Migrants and Refugees from Latin America – Students can discuss the growing number of refugees from Central America, beginning with refugees from El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, and Nicaragua in the late 1970s. Beyond learning about U.S. intervention in

the region, students can explore the experience of recent refugees in California, for example the mass exodus of Salvadorans fleeing the war-torn country during the 1980s, later settling in California in large numbers. These latest refugees can be considered with the indigenous Latinx community in the United States, which has faced historic loss of lands and rights. Related topics include the 1910 Great Mexican Migration, the Great Depression, Mexican repatriation, the Bracero Program, and Operation Wetback. Additionally, students should delve into the migration of Central American, Latin American, and Caribbean populations. This history can help students better contextualize current controversial discussions on immigration. Further, students can learn how California and the Southwest were part of Mexico from 1810–1848 (see map of Disturnell).

· Populations Displaced by War and Genocide – Students can conduct studies of how other populations affected by war or genocide have migrated to the United States. Historical examples include the population of Armenian Americans that settled in California in the aftermath of the Armenian Genocide, the effect that World War II and the Holocaust had upon the American Jewish population, and the Southeast Asian Refugee Crisis. A more contemporary study could be based on the migration of Iranians, Iraqis, Syrians, Afghans, along with other refugees from the Middle East to California and the United States as a result of the recent wars in that region. Topics can include the experiences of the members of these groups and the political shifts and reactions that each event prompted within the United States. The CDE's *Model Curriculum for Human Rights and Genocide* is a useful resource on these topics (https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/im/documents/modelcurrichrgenoc.pdf).

· South Asian Immigration – Students can explore South Asian immigration to California. The challenges and opportunities faced by South Asian immigrants to California will allow students to learn about socio-economic issues, identity, religion, culture, racism, immigration reform and legislation, and political contributions to anti-imperial and anti-colonial movements. For example, the 1800s progressing to the early twentieth century saw waves of workers on the Western Pacific Railroad in 1910 and former soldiers who had served in the British colonial army in East Asia. Legislation such as *United States vs. Bhagat Singh Thind* (1923) and the US Immigration and Nationality Act (1965) affected South Asian immigration significantly, but also lent insight on how the "white" race is defined institutionally to preserve white privilege and power. The contributions of Dalip Singh Saund to politics opened doors for minority communities to rise above prejudice and racism when he became the first-ever Asian, the first Indian, and the first Sikh to be elected to the United States Congress (1957–1963). The

founding of Stockton Gurdwara, the first-ever Sikh place of worship in the United States in 1912, served as a focal point for immigrants across communities and was linked to the founding of the Gadar Party, which opposed British rule in India.

In addition to learning more about the history of migration from these various perspectives, teachers can help facilitate discussions on xenophobia and anti-immigrant sentiment, while emphasizing the nation's history of being a home for immigrants, the merit-based promises offered by a capitalist economy, and the value of having a diverse citizenry.

Making Connections to the *History–Social Science Framework*

Chapter 14 of the framework includes an outline of an elective ethnic studies course. This course outline includes a classroom example (page 313) where students engage in an oral history project about their community. This example includes discussion of redlining and other policies that resulted in "white flight" and the concentration of communities of color into certain neighborhoods, as demonstrated by this video, Segregated by Design (https://vimeo.com/328684375).

Teachers can expand upon the classroom example, and connect it to the themes described in this model curriculum.

Sample Theme #3: Systems of Power

1. What is the relationship between the individual and society?
2. How does society divide people into groups?
3. What is the relationship between individual power and collective power?
4. How do social systems influence the choices we make?
5. What are the implications for a society when it categorizes people into a social hierarchy?

Another theme that can be covered in this type of ethnic studies course is systems of power. Teachers can introduce the theme by defining and providing examples of systems of power, which can include exploitative economic systems, ~~and~~ social systems like patriarchy, and the roles, structures, and processes of governmental institutions and policies concocted by these institutions advance particular group interests over others. These are structures that have the

Commented [12]: This is an opportunity to discuss voting rights and how they have evolved over.

capacity to control circumstances within economic, political, and/or social–cultural contexts. These systems are often controlled by those in power and go on to determine how society is organized and functions.

In introducing this theme, teachers should consider taking one system of power, like sexism and patriarchy, and offering perspectives across the various ethnic groups. Discussions of systems of power should include both the struggles that come with being entangled and impacted by these systems, but also resistance to them. Systems of power can be analyzed using the four "I"s of oppression (ideology, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized), so students can identify the root causes/sources of oppression to develop and partake in solutions to undo the damage.

Building on the theme of sexism and patriarchy, teachers can concentrate on the various ways in which women and femmes of color have been oppressed and resisted. Alternatively, this section can include a discussion on how women of color resisted and elevated women's rights issues (e.g., adequate reproductive health care and equal pay) via social movements (e.g., the second wave feminist and #Metoo movements), the creation of their own organizations, through writings (literature, poems, and scholarly works), and other mediums. In addressing this theme, teachers may plan a lesson that addresses U.S. housing inequality, including issues of redlining and racial housing covenants.

Making Connections to the *English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework*:

Chapter 7 of the framework includes a snapshot activity entitled, "Investigating Language, Culture, and Society: Linguistic Autobiographies" (page 726). This lesson example has students reflect on their own histories of using language in different contexts, and reflects a number of the ethnic studies themes described in this model curriculum. This could be a useful lesson to explore the ways that language is utilized as a system of power.

Sample Theme #4: Social Movements and Equity

1. What debates and dilemmas from past historical moments remain unresolved? Why?
2. What does equity entail? What is the difference between equality and equity? Why does this matter?
3. How can one make a difference in the community?
4. What skills and tools are needed to create change in society?

Another theme that this course could explore is the multitude of effective social movements communities have initiated and sustained in response to oppression and systems of power. Teachers will develop and facilitate instructional opportunities for students to explore major social movements like:

- The Civil Rights Movement
- The Farm Workers Movement
- Japanese American Redress and Reparations
- Black Lives Matter
- Mni Wiconi[15] Water is Life: No Dakota Access Pipeline at Standing Rock

In addition to learning more about the history of social movements and the gains achieved through solidarity, activism, civil disobedience, and participation in the democratic process, teachers can help facilitate discussions on resistance to oppression, the broad support these movements mobilized, and their lasting impacts of the change. The teacher can also introduce situations where young people engaged in protest against injustice, such as the lunch counter sit-ins during the Civil Rights Movement or the 1968 East Los Angeles student walkouts to advocate for improved educational opportunities and protest racial discrimination.

Making Connections to the *History–Social Science Framework*:

Chapter 16 of the framework discusses a number of civil rights movements that were created in response to political, economic, and social discrimination. Teachers can build upon the example of the struggle to preserve the San Francisco Bay Area shellmound sites of the Ohlone people and have students compare that to some of the other movements referenced in the framework, such as the 1969–1971 occupation of Alcatraz or the American Indian Movement's 1972–73 standoff at Wounded Knee in South Dakota. This lesson can also be connected to the Social Movements and Student Civic Engagement lesson in Appendix A.

Sample Lesson and Unit Plan Templates

Two sample templates for developing an ethnic studies curriculum are provided below. The first contains both general concepts that are common to other content areas and some specific

areas that are specific to ethnic studies. A discussion of the specific components of this template follows.

The second is a unit plan template that allows teachers to curate a more dynamic, responsive, and relevant learning experience. This tool is meant to serve as the bridge between a larger course overview, which maps out the overall year's (or semester's) scope and sequence, and the day-to-day lesson plans, which provide detailed teacher moves and preparation specific to a lesson.

Other frameworks for developing ethnic studies lessons exist online. For example, Christine Sleeter has produced a Teaching Works article that describes a curriculum planning framework focused on ethnic studies content that is culturally responsive to the lived experience of students, and a book that elaborates on the framework and offers examples.[16]

Table: Sample Lesson Template

Lesson Title and Grade Level(s): Add title of the lesson and grade level.

Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment: Each lesson should draw from and be informed by the ethnic studies values and principles described in chapter 1.

Standards Alignment: Lessons should be aligned to the academic content standards adopted by the SBE. In the *History–Social Science Content Standards for California Public Schools*, grade nine is reserved as an elective year. Therefore, most ethnic studies courses that are offered as electives will not align to specific grade-level history–social science content standards. However, teachers may want to show alignment to standards in the grade eleven United States History and Geography course or the grade twelve Principles of American Democracy course as a way of demonstrating how ethnic studies content connect to other history–social science disciplines. However, the history–social science standards also include a set of Historical and Social Sciences Analysis skills for grades nine through twelve. These skills, organized under the headers of Chronological and Spatial Thinking, Historical Research, Evidence, and Point of View, and Historical Interpretation, do connect directly with the objectives of a rigorous ethnic studies course.

Other standards that should be addressed are the *California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects (CCSS for ELA/Literacy)* and the *California English Language Development Standards (CA ELD Standards).* The *CCSS for ELA/Literacy* include grade-level expectations for student skill development in reading, writing, speaking and listening, and language, with an expectation on the skills needed to prepare students for college and careers. In particular, the writing and reading expectations for students in ethnic studies courses should align strongly with the expectations in the *CCSS for ELA/Literacy.* The *CA ELD Standards* provide progressions across the grade levels for students at the emerging, expanding, and bridging levels of English language acquisition.

Lesson Purpose and Overview: Each lesson should have a brief narrative overview of the lesson and its purpose. This narrative should describe how the lesson is connected to the broader unit, describe the specific concept(s) and/or topic(s) that students will engage, and begin to highlight some of the texts (i.e., primary and scholarly sources) that students will delve into. The purpose of this section is to provide a clear description on how the lesson topic connects to skill development, and to provide a glimpse into the overall lesson.

Key Terms and Concepts: The lesson outline should also have a list of the critical academic vocabulary specific to ethnic studies that students will learn over the course of instruction. These terms and concepts should connect directly to the lesson topic.

Lesson Objectives: The lesson objectives identify what the desired takeaways are from the lesson. In other words, when the lesson is concluded, a student should have gained an understanding of the lesson content and be able to demonstrate that knowledge using specific skills. It is essential that lesson objectives to be written with active verbs based on cognitive demand (example: students will be able to infer the imperialist motives of Columbus using his journals).

Essential Questions: The use of essential or guiding questions is an approach that was used within the *History–Social Science Framework* to support student inquiry. Framing instruction around questions of significance allows students to have choice and agency to develop and engage with their content knowledge in greater depth. This approach transforms students into active learners, as they are able to conduct research and evaluate sources in an effort to develop a claim about the question.

Lesson Steps/Activities: The steps in the lesson should be clear and discrete. In addition to more conventional lesson activities, teachers should consider including a cultural energizer and/or community building activity at the start of each lesson. They can include traditional icebreakers that involve movement, music, and games, and community-unity chants. The class can also begin with silent reflection on a question related to the lesson, followed by small group sharing, and culminating with a larger class wide discussion. Energizers or community builders should typically take no more than 10–15 minutes, depending on the activity. If done well, the energizer/community builder will pique student interest in the lesson; generate energy and enthusiasm for learning; and facilitate connection between students, the teacher, and the larger community.

Another activity to consider at the end of the lesson is a community reflection. This activity concludes the lesson with a meaningful reflection of student experience as it pertains to the objectives of the day. Teachers can facilitate this portion in various ways. For example, teachers can ask students to complete a silent, pen-to-paper response to a prompt. Teachers should create prompts that encourage students to reflect upon learnings and challenges, outstanding questions, connections to prior learning, and so on. The key to this portion of the lesson is that it be used to meaningfully review key takeaways, clarify misunderstandings, answer questions, generate questions, and connect to the larger purpose of the course.

Assessment, Application, Action, and Reflection: Instruction cannot be effective if the teacher is unable to determine if the students have mastered the content. Furthermore, students should be able to apply skills and knowledge learned to solve problems. Therefore, it is important to include both formative and summative assessment within the lesson plan. Formative assessment takes place during instruction and allows the teacher to modify that instruction to assist learning. Summative assessments measure student achievement or progress toward mastery of the content, may take place at the end of a lesson, unit, or term, and may take the form of a performative task.

Materials and Resources: The selection of materials and resources can be difficult. At the very least, there needs to be sufficient resources for students to conduct the lesson activities, address the essential questions, and achieve the lesson objectives. However, it should be noted that students can be self-directed to share their lived experiences and conduct research to identify more resources for inclusion and further investigation. There is

certainly a range of primary and secondary sources that can accomplish these goals. But teachers need to be aware of some concerns when selecting resources. Online resources are plentiful, but have to be approached with caution. Links often expire, and while the content is usually available somewhere else, it can at times be difficult to find the new location. A web page that hosts a resource may also have content or links that can take students to sites that are inappropriate or offensive.

That particular issue is less present in print materials, but those materials also need to be reviewed carefully. The *Education Code* has requirements for social content that prohibit districts from adopting instructional materials that include advertising or contain content that demeans, stereotypes, or patronizes various specified groups.[17] There are also potential copyright issues when using sources that are not within the public domain. For these reasons, local educational agencies (LEAs) may wish to focus on resources that are not commercial in nature, or websites that are from *.gov, *.edu, or, in some cases, *.org domains. When commercial products, such as a textbook or DVD, are used, LEAs should make sure that those materials are properly vetted through the local selection process for instructional materials (see below).

Ethnic Studies Outcomes: Each lesson should address one or more of the outcomes described in chapter 1.

Table: Sample Unit Plan Template

Summative Assessments/Performance Tasks:

Identify when the summative assessment(s) will be given and indicate where it will be administered in the appropriate week. What will students know and be able to do at the end of the unit? Plan backwards from your summative assessment(s), keeping in mind what students will need to be successful.

Unit Overview: A general summary of what students will study, and why, during the unit, including concepts, content, and skills. Places the unit within the context of a yearly (or semester long) course of study.

Unit Enduring Understandings: An Enduring Understanding is a statement that summarizes important ideas and core processes that are central to a discipline and have lasting value beyond the classroom.

Essential Questions: An Essential Question is an overarching question that provides focus and engages students. Framing instruction around questions of significance allows students to develop their content knowledge in greater depth.

Unit Planning/Description of Week: Provide a brief overview of what students will be engaging for the week.

Standards Alignment: Units should be aligned to the academic content standards adopted by the SBE.

Learning Experiences and Instructional Sequence: Identify and sequence the daily and/or weekly instructional experiences and best practices that will allow students to meet the student learning outcomes independently. Allows instructor to consider and plan an engaging learning experience for students, including appropriate activities, differentiation and best practices, for all students.

Student Learning Outcomes and Formative Assessments: Describes how students will demonstrate what they know and are able to do related to the unit outcomes. Formative assessments are ongoing and allow teachers to monitor learning and build student capacity towards the unit's summative assessment.

Engagement and Activity Tracker: This tool allows teachers to keep the diverse learning community in mind while planning. In ethnic studies, it is paramount that energizers, engaging multimodal activities, and a multiplicity of student tasks are utilized throughout the learning experience. Teachers can use this section to rate both their lessons and instructional sequence for the unit and ensure that moments tending toward the static and less active, are followed by periods of dynamic activity, and that moments of intensive, individual, silent and sustained reading or writing are followed by collective discussion and multimodal exercise.

Summative Assessments/Performance Tasks: These should be administered at the end of each unit. They assess understanding, knowledge and skills. Summative assessments can be in the form of a culminating writing assignment, a class publication, the delivery of an

oral presentation, etc. They should also address the essential questions. And finally, they should provide students opportunity to demonstrate agency in a real-world context.

California Department of Education, December 2020

---

[1] Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (New York, NY: Bloomsbury, 2000), 71.

[2]Allyson Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy: Implications for K–12 Schools from the Research," *The Urban Review* 47, no. 1 (March 12, 2015).

[3] Tintiangco-Cubales et al., "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy," pp. 118–120.

[4] Data on books by and about people of color and from First/Native Nations published for children and teens compiled by the Cooperative Children's Book Center, School of Education, University of Wisconsin-Madison. https://ccbc.education.wisc.edu/books/pcstats.asp (Accessed March 30, 2020).

[5] The usage of LGBTQ+ throughout this document is intended to represent an inclusive and ever-changing spectrum and understanding of identities. Historically, the acronym included lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender but has continued to expand to include queer, questioning, intersex, asexual, allies, and alternative identities (LGBTQQIAA), as well as expanding concepts that may fall under this umbrella term in the future.

[6] Sims Bishop, R. (1990). "Mirrors, windows, and sliding glass doors." *Perspectives*, 1(3), ix–xi.

[7] Center for Inspired Teaching, *Inspired Issue Brief: Inquiry-Based Teaching* (Washington, D.C.: Center for Inspired Teaching, 2008), https://inspiredteaching.org/wp-content/uploads/impact-research-briefs-inquiry-based-teaching.pdf (accessed July 23, 2020).

[8] Kimberlé Crenshaw, "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics," *University of Chicago Legal Forum*: Vol. 1989: Issue 1, Article 8.

[9] While often conflated, it should be noted that an ethnic studies pedagogy is not the same as culturally/community relevant and responsive pedagogy. The latter is but a facet of ethnic studies pedagogy.

[10] Ibid.

[11] For More on Community/Culturally Relevant and Responsive Pedagogies see: Gloria Ladson-Billings, "Toward a Theory of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy." *American Educational Research Journal* 32, no. 3 (Autumn 1995): 465–91; R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies* (Williston, VT: Rethinking Schools, 2019); Bell hooks. *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1994).

[12] Betty Bardige and Dennis Barr, "Case Study: Facing History and Ourselves," in *Handbook of Prosocial Education*, vol. 2., edited by Philip M. Brown, Michael W. Corrigan, and Ann Higgins-D'Alessandro (Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2012), p. 672.

[13] Institutional racism: the systemic normalization or legalization of racism and discrimination. This often emerges via the unequal and inequitable distribution of resources, power, and opportunity. Institutional racism is also referred to as systemic and/or structural racism.

[14] Bardige and Barr, p. 666.

[15] Mni Wiconi originates from the Sioux tribe located in the Midwestern states of North Dakota, South Dakota, Wisconsin, and Minnesota. The term is believed to be of the Lakota dialect.

[16] Christine Sleeter, *Designing Lessons and Lesson Sequences with a Focus on Ethnic Studies or Culturally Responsive Curriculum* (University of Michigan: Teaching Works, 2017), http://www.teachingworks.org/images/files/TeachingWorks_Sleeter.pdf (accessed June 1, 2020), and Christine Sleeter and Judith Flores Carmona, *Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom* (New York: Teachers College Press, 2017).

[17] More information about these requirements can be found in the State Board of Education's *Standards for Evaluating Instructional Materials for Social Content, 2013 Edition*. Available at https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/lc.asp (Accessed July 23, 2020).

Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Chapter 4: Bibliography

Third Field Review Draft

Aldridge, Derrick. "The Limits of Master Narratives in History Textbooks: An Analysis of Representations of Martin Luther King, Jr." *Teachers College Record* 108 (April 4, 2006): 662–86.

Astin, Alexander. “Diversity and Multiculturalism on the Campus: How Are Students Affected?” *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning* 25, no. 2 (1993): 44–49.

Banks, James. *Teaching Strategies for Ethnic Studies (8th Edition).* Boston: Pearson Education/Allyn & Bacon, 2009.

Barnes, Charline. "Preparing Preservice Teachers to Teach in a Culturally Responsive Way." *The Negro Educational Review* 57, nos. 1–2 (Spring/Summer 2006): 85–100.

Bell hooks. *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1994.

Berta-Avila, Margarita Ines. “Critical Xicana/Xicano Educators: Is it Enough to Be a Person of Color?” *High School Journal* 87, no. 4 (April/May 2004): 66–80.

Bigler, Rebecca. “The Use of Multicultural Curricula and Materials to Counter Racism in Children.” *Social Issues* 55, no. 4 (Winter 1999): 687–705.

Brown, Keffrelyn, and Anthony Brown. “Silenced Memories: An Examination of the Sociocultural Knowledge on Race and Racial Violence in Official School Curriculum.” *Equity & Excellence in Education* 43, no. 2 (May 2010): 139–54.

Brown, Ruth Nicole, and Chamara Jewel Kwakye, eds. *Wish to Live: The Hip-Hop Feminism Pedagogy Reader*. New York, NY: Peter Lang, 2012.

Bode, Patty. *Affirming Diversity: The Sociopolitical Context of Multicultural Education*. Boston, MA: Pearson Education, 2012.

Cammarota, Julio. "A Social Justice Approach to Achievement: Guiding Latina/o Student Attainment with a Challenging, Socially Relevant Curriculum." *Equity & Excellence in Education* 40, no. 1 (January 2007): 87–96.

Cammarota, Julio, and Augustine Romero. "Participatory Action Research for High School Students: Transforming Policy, Practice, and the Personal with Social Justice Education." *Educational Policy* 35, no. 3 (2011): 488–506.

Crenshaw, Kimberle. "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color." *Stanford Law Review* 43, no. 6 (July 1991): 1241–99.

Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018.

Dee, Thomas, and Emily Penner. "The Casual Effects of Cultural Relevance: Evidence from an Ethnic Studies Curriculum." Working paper, National Bureau of Economic Research, January 2016.

Donald, Brooke. "Stanford study suggests academic benefits to Ethnic Studies courses." *Stanford News* (Stanford, CA), January 12, 2016. Accessed March 8, 2019. https://news.stanford.edu/2016/01/12/ethnic-studies-benefits-011216/.

Duncan-Andrade, Jeffrey. "Note to Educators: Hope Required When Growing Roses in Concrete." *Harvard Educational Review* 79, no. 2 (Summer 2009): 181–94.

Duncan-Andrade, Jeffrey, and Ernest Morrell. *The Art of Critical Pedagogy: Possibilities for Moving from Theory to Practice in Urban Schools*. New York, NY: Peter Lang Publishers, 2008.

Evans-Winters, Venus. *Teaching Black Girls: Resiliency in Urban Classrooms*. New York, NY: Peter Lang, 2011.

Ford, Donna Y., and J. John Harris III. "A Framework for Infusing Multicultural Curriculum into Gifted Education." *Roeper Review* 23, no. 1 (March 1999): 4–10.

Franquiz, Maria E., and Maria Del Carmen Salazar. "The Transformative Potential of Humanizing Pedagogy: Addressing the Diverse Needs of Chicano/Mexicano Students." *The High School Journal* 87, no. 4 (April/May 2004): 36–53.

Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York, NY: Penguin Books, 1996.

Gallager-Geurtsen, T. “San Diego’s Struggle for Ethnic Studies: The Value for All of Democratizing Education.” *Xchange Publications and Resources for Transforming Public Schools. UCLA School of Education.*

Gay, Geneva. *Culturally Responsive Teaching: Theory, Research, and Practice*. Edited by James Banks. 2nd ed. Multicultural Education Series. New York, NY: Teachers College Press, 2010.

Halagao, Patricia Espiritu. "Liberating Filipino Americans through Decolonizing Curriculum." *Race, Ethnicity and Education* 13, no. 4 (December 2010): 495–512.

Hefflin, Bena. "Learning to Develop Culturally Relevant Pedagogy: A Lesson about Cornrowed Lives." *Urban Review* 34, no. 3 (September 2002): 231–50.

Hughes, Julia Milligan, and Rebecca Bigler. "Addressing Race and Racism in the Classroom." In *Lessons in Integration: Realizing the Promise of Racial Diversity in American Schools*, edited by Erica Frankenberg and Gary Orfield, 190–206. Charlottesville, VA: The University of Virginia Press, 2007.

Jocson, Korina. "Kuwento as a Multicultural Pedagogy in High School Ethnic Studies." *Pedagogies: An International Journal* 3, no. 4 (November 5, 2008): 241–53.

Ladson-Billings, Gloria. "Toward a Theory of Culturally Relevant Pedagogy." *American Educational Research Journal* 32, no. 3 (Autumn 1995): 465–91.

Lee, Carol. "A Culturally Based Cognitive Apprenticeship: Teaching African American High School Students Skills in Literary Interpretation." *Reading Research Quarterly* 30, no. 4 (November/December 1995): 608–30.

Lipka, Jerry. "Toward a Culturally Based Pedagogy: A Case Study of One Yup'ik Eskimo Teacher." *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* 22, no. 3 (September 1991): 22–3.

Matthews, Catherine, and Walter Smith. "Native American Related Materials in Elementary Science Instruction." *Journal of Research in Science Teaching* 31, no. 4 (April 1994): 363–80.

Ochoa O'Leary, Romero, Cabrera & Rascón, M. *Assault in Ethnic Studies* in *Arizona Firestorm: Global Immigration Realities, National Media, and Provincial Politics.* London, U.K.: Rowman & Littlefield Publishing, Co., 2012.

Omi, Michael, and Howard Winant. *Racial Formation in the United States.* 3rd Edition. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 2014.

Paris, Django, and H. Samy Alim, eds. *Culturally Sustaining Pedagogies: Teaching and Learning for Justice in a Changing World*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press, 2017.

Precious Knowledge. Directed by Ari Palos and Eren Isabel McGinnis. 2011.

Reyhner, Jon, ed. *Teaching Indigenous Students: Honoring Place, Community, and Culture*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 2015.

Romero, Augustine, Sean Arce, and Julio Cammarota. "A Barrio Pedagogy: Identity, Intellectualism, Activism, and Academic Achievement through the Evolution of Critically Compassionate Intellectualism." *Race, Ethnicity and Education* 12, no. 2 (June 2009): 217–33.

Sleeter, Christine. "State Curriculum Standards and Student Consciousness." *Social Justice* 29, no. 4 (2002): 8–25.

Sleeter, Christine. *The Academic and Social Value of Ethnic Studies: A Research Review*. Washington, DC: National Education Association, 2011. Accessed October 7, 2018. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED521869.pdf.

Sleeter, Christine. *Designing Lessons and Lesson Sequences with a Focus on Ethnic Studies or Culturally Responsive Curriculum*. Teaching Works Repository, University of Michigan, 2017. Accessed June 1, 2020. http://www.teachingworks.org/images/files/TeachingWorks_Sleeter.pdf

Sleeter, Christine, and Judith Flores Carmona. *Unstandardizing Curriculum: Multicultural teaching in the standards-based classroom.* New York: Teachers College Press, 2017.

Sleeter, Christine, and Miguel Zavala, *Transformative Ethnic Studies in Schools.* New York: Teachers College Press, 2020.

Steele, Claude, and Joshua Aronson. "Stereotype threat and the test performance of academically successful African Americans." In *The Black-White Test Score Gap*, edited by Christopher Jencks and Meredith Phillips, 401–27. Washington, DC, US: Brookings Institution Press, 1998.

Solorzano, Daniel, and Dolores Delgado Bernal. "Examining Transformational Resistance Through a Critical Race and Latcrit Theory Framework: Chicana and Chicano Students in an Urban Context." *Urban Education* 36, no. 3 (2001): 308–42.

Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror: A History of Multicultural America*. Revised Edition. NY: Hachette Book Group, 2008.

Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror for Young People: A History of Multicultural America*. Adapted by Rebecca Stefoff. NY: Seven Stories Press, 2012.

Tanaka, Michele. *Learning and Teaching Together: Weaving Indigenous Ways of Knowing into Education*. Vancouver, BC: University of British Columbia Press, 2017.

Tintiangco-Cubales, Allyson, Peter Nien-chu Kiankg, and Samuel Museus. "Praxis and Power in the Intersections of Education." *AAPI Nexus* 8, no. 1 (Spring 2010): v–xvii.

Tintiangco-Cubales, Allyson, Rita Kohli, Jocyl Sacramento, Nick Henning, Ruchi Agarwal-Rangnath, and Christine Sleeter. "Toward an Ethnic Studies Pedagogy: Implications for K-12 Schools from the Research." *The Urban Review* 47, no. 1 (March 2015): 104–25.

Ullucci, Kerri. "Learning to See: The Development of Race and Class Consciousness in White Teachers." *Race Ethnicity and Education* 14, no. 4 (2011): 561–77.

Valencia, Richard, ed. *Chicano School Failure and Success: Past, Present, and Future*. 3rd ed. New York, NY: Routledge, 2010.

Vasquez, Jessica. "Ethnic Identity and Chicano Literature: How Ethnicity Affects Reading and Reading Affects Ethnic Consciousness." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 28, no. 5 (2005): 903–24.

Yang, Kou. "Commentary: Mis-Education in K-12 Teaching About Hmong Culture, Identity, History and Religion." *Hmong Studies Journal* 13, no. 1 (January 2012).

Yang, Philip. *Ethnic Studies: Issues and Approaches*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2000.Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum