

From: Itamar Harari
Sent: Thursday, August 8, 2019 10:49 PM
To: CFIRD; Ethnic Studies
Cc: Brenda Harari
Subject: Curriculum Frameworks and Instructional Resources Division

To whom it may concern,

I would like to express my concern about a problematic section (Section B) in the Glossary chapter of the Draft 2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum that states erroneous information related to the Arab-Jewish conflict and the BDS movement. This section, in explaining the BDS movement, states the following (and I bolded the problematic word below):

*"Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS)- is a global social movement that currently aims to establish freedom for Palestinians living under **apartheid** conditions. Inspired by tactics employed during the South African anti-apartheid movement, the Palestinian-led movement calls for the boycott, divestment, and sanctioning of the Israeli government until it complies with International law. BDS proponents and organizers have called for the global community to boycott or withdraw support from Israel and companies associated with it. The second component of BDS calls for governments, banks, universities, and other institutions to withdraw monetary support (divestment) from Israel and its companies. And finally, the third component—sanctions—asks international governments to hold Israel accountable for its actions through legislation, trade and military agreements, among other measures."*

The word "apartheid" is a loaded political term that does not reflect the situation in the West Bank or in Gaza Strip. Just a brief history, Israel and the PLO signed the Oslo Accord in 1993 which empowered PLO to start its own regime in many parts of the West Bank and in Gaza. Israel completely withdrew from the Gaza Strip in 2005 allowing the Palestinian Authority to rule over all of Gaza Strip. Due to security problems ([480 attempted attacks coming from the West Bank against Israeli civilians were prevented by Israeli authorities in 2018](#)) Israeli authorities have been operating in the West Bank as part to also protect the Palestinian Authorities. In the Gaza Strip due to the acute security condition by which Israelis have been living under due to the Hamas regime ([1,119 rockets were launched from the Gaza Strip by Hamas and other terrorist groups and caused fatalities, injuries, and terror among the Israeli civilians who were under attack](#), again in 2018) the Israeli Defence Forces (IDF) responded by attacking Hamas and other terrorist groups in the Gaza strip.

In summary, the Arab - Jewish Conflict is highly complicated and by far not an apartheid-like condition. Using the word apartheid in this context would be considered in my mind as anti-Israel propaganda. If the CDE is interested in introducing to California High School students the BDS movement, it should not utilize words such as "apartheid" in explaining to students the situation on the ground. I ask that the word "apartheid" be replaced with words such as "difficult" or "frustrating" living conditions.

Please confirm receiving this email and feel free to contact me with any questions.

Respectfully,

Itamar

Itamar Harari, Ph. D.
HEART in Organizations