Institute for Curriculum Services (ICS) Review of the
2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum
June 14, 2019 Draft
for the California Instructional Quality Commission (IQC)
July 2019

Overview

This document has two parts: an Executive Summary and a detailed review covering the five chapters of the June 14, 2019 draft of the 2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC) found here: https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/esmcpubliccomment.asp. This draft was approved by the Instructional Quality Commission (IQC) for public review on May 16, 2019 and opened for public comment on June 14, 2019. Thank you for your consideration of these recommendations and for your efforts to ensure that this model curriculum is accurate and aligned with the ESMC Guidelines. We appreciate the opportunity to submit our review to you to help you in your efforts to ensure a pedagogically fruitful learning experience for the students and teachers of our diverse and multicultural state. There are problems in the draft that are pedagogically unsound and ill-aligned with the ESMC Guidelines and California's Education Code, and it contains significant omissions.

The Executive Summary addresses overarching concerns with the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum draft, with five content-related concerns and three pedagogic/alignment concerns. This review is not exhaustive and we strongly recommend the IQC conduct a closer review of the rigor and pedagogy of the Model Curriculum as a whole. The majority of this review focuses on content related to our areas of expertise: Judaism, Jewish history, best practices around teaching about religion in public school classrooms, and relevant education code and state standards. The Executive Summary is followed by a review with specific recommended changes.

Part I: Executive Summary

<u>Content Concerns</u>

1. While much of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum contains positive coverage of diverse groups, Jews are barely mentioned and are not treated as an ethnic group. There is a passing reference in one Sample Course Model to a Jewish immigrant, and then three other one-word references to Jewish immigrants in the Stockton Unified School District Ethnic Studies Course in Appendix A. It is important for the ESMC to reflect that Jews are a distinct ethnic group who share a common culture, history, ancestry, language, and religion. In his textbook, *Racial and Ethnic Groups*, Richard T. Schaefer categorizes Jews as a distinct ethnic group that shares "cultural traits...from a long history of being segregated and prohibited from becoming a part of a host society," and that once living in the United States, ethnic groups such as Jews "may maintain distinctive cultural practices through associations, clubs, and

worship...to perpetuate cultural distinctiveness."[1] **The California Jewish community's most significant concern with the ESMC is that Jews are not acknowledged as an ethnic group within the model curriculum and therefore will not be represented in the ethnic studies classroom and curriculum.** American Jews share a culture that transcends religion or religiosity. As an ethnic group, Jews in the U.S. share a very different past when compared to other groups in American history. Because Jews are both an ethnic group and a religion, the ESMC should accurately reflect that ethnicity is a central component of Jewish identity.

2. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum should include the **category of religion** as part of ethnic identity because religion is often a central component of ethnic identity, and also because it is important in ensuring proper representation of the diversity of California. Religious identity intersects with racial, ethnic, gender, cultural, and other social identities in ways that cannot be reduced to simple racial categories, but in fact contribute to the intra-ethnic diversity found in California's diverse demographics. For example, there are important and different histories of African Americans and Arab Americans who are Muslim or Christian. Membership in a religious group is often an important part of ethnic identity among American immigrant communities, and a central component of understanding their persecution and immigration to the United States, as is clearly demonstrated by the Yazidis from Syria and Iraq and the Maronite Christians from Lebanon. Catholicism is also an important part of Latinx culture, the church is a central part of African American culture and social activism, and the legal fight to recognize Native American freedom of religion is central to Native American Studies.

   Illustrating its centrality to ethnic studies, specific examples of religion as a component of ethnicity is detailed in Chapter 2, the Sample Course Models for African American Studies, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies, Native American Studies, and Arab American Studies and in Chapter 5, in a number of the UC-Approved Course Outlines. For instance, one UC-approved course includes an entire unit on Muslim American Studies. The definition of ethnicity in the model curriculum should add religion as a component to bring it into alignment with the content of specific lessons and courses in the Model Curriculum. **By not including religion, the ESMC leaves out some Californian ethnic groups, has an incomplete definition of ethnicity that is not consistent with standard definitions, and is internally inconsistent given the inclusion of religion for some ethnic groups in Chapters 2 and 5.**

   Early scholars such as Max Weber and Emile Durkheim recognized the centrality of religion to ethnic and cultural identities, and, in turn, current ethnic studies pedagogy recognizes religion as a facet of ethnicity. Carolyn Chen, a professor of religion, race, ethnicity, and immigration in the UC Berkeley Ethnic Studies Department, who focuses on religion in minority communities, writes about "the nuanced and diverse ways that religion intertwines with race and ethnicity" (p. 41) and states "the lines

[1] See Richard T. Schaefer, *Racial and Ethnic Group*s, (New York: Pearson, 14th ed., 2015), p. 7.

between religion, ethnicity, and family are closely blurred."[2] (p.17) The UC Berkeley Department's mission statement also includes religion:

> The Department of Ethnic Studies at UC Berkeley is committed to the comparative study of racialization and indigeneity within the Americas, as well as between the U.S. and other nations. We seek to understand race and racism as "moving targets" that undergo mutations or evolve, and to recognize the complexities of the intersections of race with gender, class, sexuality, **religion** and other systems of difference and axes of power. [emphasis ours] [3]

The American Jewish experience should be included along with other diverse population groups in California in the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum, especially since the ESMC stresses that content should be representative of the local population. There are over 1.18 million Jews in California (3 percent of the population of CA), yet there are almost no references to Jews. California has the second largest Jewish population in the U.S. California also has a large population of Israeli Jewish Americans in both Los Angeles and Silicon Valley, with estimates ranging from 100,000-200,000. Furthermore, in the context of American cultural diversity, Jews come in every color, and this diversity should be reflected in the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. Nationwide, 11.2 percent of the country's 7.16 million Jews are people of color. In the San Francisco Bay Area, 25 percent of local Jewish households include a person of color.[4] The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum should represent all of California's diverse ethnic populations, and Jews and the diversity within the American Jewish community should be included. Ultimately, learning about ethnoreligious groups in California and their histories will enhance student understanding of religious freedom and deepen their understanding of history.

3. **When Jews do come up is in Sample Course Models in Chapter 2 and Chapter 4, the ESMC contains language that denigrates Jews and Israelis.** The California Education Code 60044 states schools may not use instructional materials that contain "any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or **ethnicity**, gender, religion, disability, nationality, or sexual orientation, occupation." [emphasis ours][5] Furthermore, the Education Code 51500 states that a: "teacher shall not give instruction and a school district shall not sponsor any activity that promotes a

---

[2] Carolyn Chen, *Sustaining Faith Traditions: Race, Ethnicity and Religion among the Latino and Asian American Second Generation* (New York: NYU 2012).

[3] See "UC Berkeley Ethnic Studies mission statement," http://ethnicstudies.berkeley.edu/about/mission, accessed 5/24/2019.

[4] Rob Gloster, "Jews of color stake their claim to mainstream leadership roles," (1/25/2019), https://www.jweekly.com/2019/01/25/rising-up-jews-of-color-ascend-to-mainstream-leadership-roles/ accessed 5/29/2019. See also Ari Y. Kelman et al "Counting Inconsistencies: An Analysis of American Jewish Population Studies, with a Focus on Jews of Color," Jews of Color Field Building Initiative.

[5] California Education Code 60044, http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&sectionNum=60044, accessed 5/29/2019.

discriminatory bias on the basis of race or ethnicity, gender, religion, disability, nationality, or sexual orientation, or because of a characteristic listed in Section 220."[6] While the ESMC is supposed to "enable students to develop a deep appreciation for cultural diversity and inclusion" (ESMC, Chap. 1, lines 19-20), as currently written, it will, in fact, sow a hostile environment toward Jewish American students and Jewish Israeli American students through the content that perpetuates negative stereotypes of both. Because the biased negative portrayals detailed in the review violate California's Education Code and the ESMC Guidelines, they should be removed.

4. One goal of the field of ethnic studies is to reduce prejudice and discrimination. The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines dictate that the Model Curriculum shall "Be inclusive, creating space for all students..." Jews face prejudice and are subject to hate crimes as a religious and ethnic minority. The ESMC references white supremacists and hate crimes a number of times, but does not include Jews as a common target of such hate groups, nor includes antisemitism in the Glossary.

   Discussions of hate crimes, bias, prejudice, discrimination, and stereotyping should explicitly include antisemitism along with Islamophobia and other prejudices. Lack of representation hurts Jewish students in California. White supremacists and others brandishing dangerous extremist ideologies have had a devastating impact. With hate crimes against ethnic and religious minorities on the rise, Jews have been increasingly targeted with antisemitic attacks in the U.S. and beyond. Between 2016 and 2019, there were 1,875 anti-Jewish incidents in the U.S., as well as two shootings in synagogues, and the number of assaults against Jews more than doubled in 2018.[7] California has seen the largest percentage increase in antisemitic incidents. In 2018, there were 341 antisemitic incidents.[8] **Antisemitism should also be included in the Introduction and in the Glossary** along with Islamophobia, and Jews should be included in discussions of hate crime targets so that California public schools can be free of discrimination and prejudice.

5. The inclusion of Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions (BDS) in the ESMC is problematic. The BDS movement is an international strategy to delegitimize and isolate Israel with boycotts and sanctions. The movement's stated goals do not include advocating for a just and peaceful solution that respects the need for

---

[6] California Education Code 51500, http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&division=4.&title=2.&part=28.&chapter=4.&article=1, accessed 6/3/2019.

[7] See "Assaults Against Jews More Than Doubled," Anti-Defamation League, https://www.adl.org/news/press-releases/anti-semitic-incidents-remained-at-near-historic-levels-in-2018assaults, accessed 5/26/2019; see also See "Special Report on Anti-Jewish Violence in the U.S> After Two Deadly Synagogue Attacks Within Months," CNN, https://www.cnn.com/videos/politics/2019/05/13/anti-semitism-us-sara-sidner-pkg-tsrvpx.cnn accessed 5/28/2019; see also "Anti-Semitic Incidents Remained at Near-Historic Levels in 2018" https://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/anti-semitic-assaults-u-s-more-doubled-2018-adl-reports-n1000246 accessed 5/28/2019.

[8] For the latest statistics on hate crimes, see "ADL H.E.A.T Map," American Defamation League, https://www.adl.org/education-and-resources/resource-knowledge-base/adl-heat-map, accessed 6/3/2019.

sovereignty and self-determination of both parties; to the contrary, the movement is extremist and focused on advancing one party's interests at the expense of the other. **To fully comply with ESMC Guidelines and the Education Code, all references to BDS should be removed from the curriculum.** There are several important reasons why BDS should be removed from the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum:

- First, BDS is outside the disciplinary boundaries of American ethnic studies, which focuses on the experiences of ethnic groups within the United States. The Model Curriculum itself defines the field of ethnic studies: "at its core, the field of Ethnic Studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity with an emphasis on experiences of people of color in the United States." (See ESMC Chapter 1, lines 24-25.) An ethnic studies survey course has a lot of content to cover, even when it sticks to historical and cultural issues within the United States. Unlike the Black Lives Matter, Dreamers, or Occupy movements, BDS is not concerned with the experiences of people in the United States, but is an internationally coordinated movement focused specifically on governments 10,000 miles away. And when BDS actions do target people and organizations in the United States, these negatively impact their First Amendment rights, as noted below.

- Second, the addition of BDS is not inclusive and violates the mandate of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines, which states that the Model Curriculum shall:
  i. "Promote the values of civic engagement and civic responsibility"
  ii. "Be written in language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users"
  iii. "Encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together, highlighting core ethnic studies concepts such as consciousness raising and knowledge building, identity development and self-determination, justice and social change, and love, respect, and hope"
  iv. "Be inclusive by creating space for all students regardless of race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality, or citizenship to learn different perspectives"

  Inclusion of BDS presents a single viewpoint on a complex international issue, which is hostile to others involved in the matter, and violates the mission of inclusion which is paramount to the field of American ethnic studies. The field of ethnic studies aims to bring diverse groups together where all groups are represented in a respectful way with the intention of compelling intergroup dialogue. In significant contrast, BDS is, at its core, about division, which will ultimately put students in vulnerable positions with teachers explicitly violating California Education Code 51500.

- Third, the BDS movement explicitly calls for actions that violate international academic freedom and the First Amendment. Other activist and social movement groups referenced in the ESMC do not work to shut down academic freedom when addressing speech that disputes their political perspectives. The BDS movement agitates for academic boycotts and has been successful in shutting down the speech of invited speakers and scholars worldwide. It pressures universities to end study-abroad programs and scholarly exchanges. It targets Jews who do not share its political positions, creating a hostile environment for Jewish students, professors, administrators, and scholars. It calls for cultural boycotts in an attempt to pressure figures in the entertainment, sports, and art industries against performing or playing in Israel while simultaneously pressuring sponsors to boycott Israeli artists and musicians from performing in the U.S. The BDS movement seeks to censor the academic freedom and free speech of Israelis and those who support Israel's right to exist, while insisting that BDS advocates' free speech, which incites hate, be protected. The inclusion of BDS in the ESMC will put a segment of California students and teachers in an untenable position of feeling discriminated against. California should not adopt a curriculum that violates the State's own goal of creating interconnectedness, respect across ethnic lines, free speech, and unfettered access to public education.

- Finally, where the ESMC draft references other international conflicts, the curriculum is without bias and never denigrates one party within a conflict while championing a political tactic used by the other. References to conflicts over land and sovereignty that led to emigration are noted briefly and without bias, and when other religions or ethnicities are alluded to, it is done without derogatory depictions of one party to the conflict. For example, the ESMC notes in neutral terms that a civil war prompted a surge of migration from El Salvador, and that the Vietnam War created migrants among the Vietnamese, Cambodian, Hmong, and Laotian populations. In sharp contrast, the inclusion of BDS, a political one-sided and discriminatory strategy meant to delegitimize Israel, ensures that the ESMC draft is taking a hostile position and side in this international dispute. In this Model Curriculum draft, only Israel is held up for critique, with no historical context or rebuttal of factually incorrect assertions. This is not balanced scholarship, but one-sided, biased politicized speech that prevents students from hearing all sides and points of view on a complex topic. This kind of content does not belong in public school classrooms or a Model Curriculum, especially one dealing with ethnic studies.

Pedagogic and Alignment Concerns

6. Pedagogically, the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum lacks sufficiently strong definitions of race and ethnicity. The course fails to adequately introduce ethnicity in the Introduction (Chapter 1) or in the template for Introduction to Ethnic Studies in Chapter 3, and only attempts to provide a definition in Chapter 4 in the Glossary (which omits religion, a key facet). Given that the course is called Ethnic Studies, this is methodologically flawed, demonstrates a lack of rigor, and prevents teachers from understanding and conveying a defining concept of the ESMC, ethnicity.

   Rather than teaching about ethnic communities as one would expect in a course called Ethnic Studies, the ESMC focuses on certain individual identities. The ESMC lists ethnicity only as a category of identity and leaves out religion altogether as noted above. While asserting that teachers provide historical context, the ESMC does not cover, explain, or even list topics to show how understandings of race and its definitions have changed throughout American history. What is more, throughout the ESMC, the language stresses only the inclusion of content on "native people and people of color." Because of this, **the ESMC equates ethnicity, the presumptive subject of ethnic studies, with race, and uses the shorthand of race for ethnicity. Moreover, ethnicity is often reduced to a study of four races, a glaring misunderstanding given that ethnicity is conceptually distinct from race.** This also results in the exclusion of some ethnic groups who fail to meet clear racial categorization, such as Dominicans and Afro-Brazilians, and those that do not fall into a clear racial category such as Jews, who have various racial backgrounds. More needs to be done within the Model Curriculum to fully flesh out these key concepts.

7. A key issue that was raised but not resolved at the IQC meeting was the fact that **many of the sample lessons do not follow the official Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines (ESMCG) and include alignments to the English Language Development (ELD) standards**, and English Language Arts (ELA) and Literacy standards. Only half of the sample lessons have complete alignments in Chapter 2. It was proposed at the May meeting of the IQC that they could either delete the ELD and ELA alignments from half the lessons where they were missing, or alternatively, add them to half the lessons. The suggestion to delete the alignments is not appropriate because the Guidelines require the alignments be included. The Guidelines specifically state that the lessons in the ESMC have to "align to the Literacy Standards for History–Social Studies within the California Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy in History–Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects." (See https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/cc/cd/esmcguidelines.asp)

8. While research is an important pedagogical skill to develop, **students need guidance to learn how to judge the credibility and reliability of sources**. Internet searches on contentious, divisive, or controversial topics can lead to the

consumption and dissemination of racist, hate-inciting, and extremist websites, so the reliance on unvetted internet research in activities and lessons throughout the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum is concerning because there does not seem to be appropriate guidance on how to evaluate the reliability of websites. This not only poses the risk of misinformation, but as the ESMC notes in Chapter 3 lines 268-272, "A web page that hosts a resource may also have content or links that can take students to sites that are inappropriate, hateful, or offensive." A prime example of this is the infamous "Institute for Historical Review," which sounds scholarly but is a Holocaust denial site. A seemingly reasonable search term, like "immigration studies" can bring up hate sites like the Center for Immigration Studies.[9] The ESMC should include suggestions for vetted websites and instruction on evaluating the reliability of internet content.

Part II: Review

The Executive Summary above provides an overview of the major concerns. This review goes into detail on the 575-page Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum draft and includes specific recommendations. Each paragraph cites the relevant portion of the ESMC draft, indicates suggested additions with underline and deletions with strikethrough, and follows up with comments that explain the rationale behind the recommended edits.

Navigation Notes: Click on this website for links to the chapters of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/esmcpubliccomment.asp

Review Legend:

~~Strikethrough~~ = Recommended deletion
Underline = Recommended addition
Comments = Explanation and rationale provided to support recommendations

Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview, Why Teach Ethnic Studies?

Chapter 1, page 2, lines 27-31, Defining Ethnic Studies, **Change**: "The field critically grapples with the various power structures and forms of oppression, including, but not limited to, white supremacy, race and racism, sexism, classism, homophobia, islamophobia, antisemitism, transphobia, and xenophobia, that continue to impact the social, emotional, cultural, economic, and political experiences of Native Peoples, ethnic minorities, and people of color."
Comments: Given the focus of this paragraph on hate speech in the context of ethnic studies, antisemitism should be added to this list. It is a persistent and pernicious form of hate targeting an ethnic minority group. It also intersects with some of the other forms of hate listed, e.g., white

[9] See Southern Poverty Law Center, "Fighting Late, Center for Immigration Studies, https://www.splcenter.org/fighting-hate/extremist-files/group/center-immigration-studies accessed 7/20/2019.

supremacy. This suggested addition aligns with the recommendation for the Glossary to also include a definition of antisemitism. See the specific suggestion below.

As the course is Ethnic Studies, ethnic minorities should be included in this list.

Chapter 1, page 2, lines 31 -32, Introduction and Overview, Why Teach Ethnic Studies, Defining Ethnic Studies, **Add**: "The topic of ethnic studies is ethnicity, which refers to a social group to which a person belongs and which may be an important marker of individual identity. Ethnicity can be defined as a group of people who identify with each other based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, language, history, religion, tradition, etc."
Comments: The Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum lacks a clear definition of ethnicity in the opening section of Chapter 1 called "Defining Ethnic Studies." Above, we have incorporated the definition from the Glossary (page 6, lines 140-141), added religion, and noted that ethnicity is a social group as well as an individual marker of identity.

Chapter 1, pages 18-19, lines 441-443, 456-463, Introduction and Overview, Why Teach Ethnic Studies, Methods, **Change**: "All Ethnic Studies courses should include a community engagement/action project that allows for students to use their knowledge and voice to affect social transformation in their community. . . . This emphasis on citizenship within the pedagogy provides students with a keen sense of ethics, respect, and appreciation for all people, regardless of ethnicity, nationality, religion, gender, sexual orientation ability, and beliefs. Furthermore, citizenship is a key entry point for students to discuss Ethnic Studies theories like~~,~~ intersectionality—an analytic framework coined by Black feminist legal scholar, Kimberl~~é~~é~~e~~ Crenshaw, who derived the term in 1989 as a way to explain the oppression of African-American women. Current use of the term should capture~~s~~ how multiple identities (race, class, religion, gender, sexuality, ability, etc.) overlap or intersect, creating unique experiences, especially for those navigating multiple marginalized or oppressed identities."
Comments: Religion should be added to the list of respected aspects of identity. The CA History-Social Science Framework calls for an increased teaching of citizenship, and the ESMC tries to align with this goal in three ways: 1) calling for a community engagement project, 2) teaching respect for all and respecting minority rights, and 3) recognizing the unique experiences of those with multiple identities. This cited paragraph of the ESMC shows how lessons on citizenship are a key part of ethnic studies. Content pertaining to citizenship should respect the dignity of every person and stress that respect for minority groups is enshrined in our laws, including the freedoms of religion and speech. A close look at the whole draft Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum shows that religion is a key component of identity for most ethnic groups. For instance, Catholicism is an important part of Latinx culture, the church is a central part of African American culture and social activism, the legal fight to recognize Native American freedom of religion is central to Native American Studies, and the treatment of Muslims is important to Arab American Studies. Even this cursory glance at the intersections of multiple identities shows how religion is one vital component of ethnicity and should be included in this list. (For specific examples in the ESMC, see a more detailed list in the comments on the definition of ethnicity below.) Therefore, religious minorities should also be included in this list of respected aspects of identity by adding the term "religion."

There is no need for a comma between "like" and "intersectionality".

Please correct the spelling of the scholar's name. The correct spelling is Kimberlé Crenshaw.

The text should note when the term was coined and how it has grown to include a variety of identities, including religious identity. Including the suggested language will ensure that students better understand how the term is used today. It is noteworthy that Crenshaw considers religion as an aspect of identity in this paper. (See Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color," p. 8 https://www.racialequitytools.org/resourcefiles/mapping-margins.pdf, accessed 6/3/2019.)

Chapter 2: Sample Course Models

Chapter 2, page 28-30, lines 531-588, Activity - Race to The Finish line: Examining the Impact of Privilege, Option 1: Power, Privilege and Five People I Know, Privilege Walk, Handout B, Gender, **Delete**: activity or make modifications
Comments: A privilege walk can be a powerful tool to teach students about privilege, but having students do this activity with questions that can publicly expose private trauma defeats the purpose of helping the less privileged. While the goal of the exercise is recognizing privilege, pedagogically it would be better for students to confront their own privilege in a safe space with proper adult supervision. Moreover, it would be impossible to answer some of the prompts for the arbitrary biographies attached to the activity because many of them are not surface level characteristics and qualities. For greater pedagogical precision and neutrality, the activity should be modified and contain safeguards.

Chapter 2, page 39, lines 576-577, Activity - Race to The Finish line: Examining the Impact of Privilege, Option 1: Power, Privilege and Five People I Know, Privilege Walk, Handout B, Gender, **Delete**: "~~If any women in your family have been sexually harassed or abused, one step backward.~~"
Comments: If the activity is retained, the statement on sexual harassment should be deleted from the activity. Sexual harassment and abuse are extremely sensitive subjects that should not be addressed in a game-type exercise in a course on ethnic studies. Such an activity might trigger students who have personally, or in their family, experienced sexual trauma without the adequate space or qualified professional support. If the activity is retained, this line should be deleted.

Chapter 2, page 35, line 684, African American Studies Course Outline, Sample Theme # 2: Social Movements, List of Potential Social Movements, **Delete**: "~~Boycott, Divestment, and Sanctions Movement for Palestine~~"
Comments: In a sample lesson on the origins of ethnic studies and contemporary social movements, BDS is listed as a search topic in a research project on current American social movements. The topic of BDS is inappropriate for a focus on social movements in American ethnic studies. All other suggested topics focus on social problems within the United States, such as criminal justice reform and #MeToo. As stated in the Executive Summary, the BDS movement is a concerted international strategy to delegitimize and isolate Israel. It focuses on the Middle East, so characterizing it as an American social movement is inaccurate. Furthermore, while students are directed to vetted primary and secondary sources in an activity exploring the Third World Liberation Front, in contrast, the research assignment on social movements, including BDS, provides no teacher-directed sources. The vague assignment directs students to the internet without providing ways of evaluating problematic and unreliable sources, which will

likely generate inaccurate information and biased conclusions. See also the Executive Summary on BDS.

Chapter 2, page 105, lines 2346-2348, Central American Sample Unit, Salvadoran American Migration and Collective Resistance, Prerequisite Skills and Knowledge, **Add**: "Students should also be exposed to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which was created in response to the events of the Holocaust after many Jews and other groups seeking refuge from the Nazi regime were denied entry to the United States and other countries. Students should be taught that this was a result of the tight immigration quotas in the United States Immigration Act of 1924 and have basic understanding of articles which grant asylum in the United States to war refugees."
Comments: We appreciate the diversity within this lesson, as well as its focus on refugees, but the lesson content needs to be put into better historical context. While the lesson chronology started to focus on immigration history post-1965, when U.S. immigration policy focused on reuniting immigrant families, students should understand how and why this more progressive immigration policy came to be. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948, a pivotal document for understanding human rights and is a key document to study when looking at the history of U.S. immigration policy. Providing more historical context will allow students to have a better understanding of the document's significance. It is important to understand that the document was created following the Holocaust, where the Nazi regime systematically murdered six million Jews and five million other minorities and political enemies based on flawed and dangerous racial theories. Many countries refused to take in Jewish and other minority refugees. To fully appreciate why U.S. immigration policy shifted from strict policies under the 1924 law to the more progressive Immigration and Nationality Act of 1965, students need to be taught that the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and international understandings of human rights developed from the world's reaction to the Holocaust. Many Jews living in Germany or German-occupied Europe that were denied entry to the U.S. and other Western countries because of the Immigration Act of 1924 were subsequently murdered. These laws reflected public attitudes at the time. For instance, in 1939, a public opinion poll found that 61 percent of Americans did not want to take in German-Jewish refugee children fleeing Nazi Germany. (See Ishaan Tharoor, "What Americans thought of Jewish refugees on the eve of World War II," (11/17/2015) *The Washington Post*, https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2015/11/17/what-americansthought-of-jewish-refugees-on-the-eve-of-world-warii/?noredirect=on&utm_term=.c2352aba3190 accessed 4/5/2019.) The Wagner-Rogers Bill, which would have allowed 20,000 German-Jewish children to enter the United States, was defeated in 1939. (See U.S. Policy During WWII: The Wagner-Rogers Bill," Jewish Virtual Library https://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/wagner-rogers-bill accessed 5/26/2019.) For a fuller understanding of refugees in America and beyond, the connection between the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Immigration Act of 1924, and the 1965 Nationality Act should be explicitly addressed in a lesson about refugees. Including this historical context will help students see the unfortunate echoes between attitudes towards Jews in the 1930s and 40s and attitudes towards refugees coming to America from Syria and other places today.

Chapter 2, page 108, lines 2408-2414, Central American Sample Unit, Salvadoran American Migration and Collective Resistance, Lesson 2, Youth Scholars Teach U.S. Immigration Policy Shifts to the People, Instructions for students steps 1 and 2, **Change**: "Distribute the Push and

Pull Factors ~~Rating Preferences~~ Activity handout to students. Instruct students to work independently first to rank the factors in terms of which have historically been the three most significant push and pull factors prompting immigration to the United States. They must then select the top three most significant current push and pull factors and explain why they choose those factors ~~they believe should be most important to least important in determining whether an immigrant should be able to gain legal status in the United States~~. Once students have determined their rankings, group them in fours and instruct them to compare their rankings, and ~~to~~ try to come to a consensus on the top three factors for each as a group. Instruct each group to share their top ~~four~~ factors for each with the class, and then facilitate a short discussion, noting similarities and differences between each group's answers while asking probing questions to get students to support their arguments with evidence ~~justify responses~~."

Comments: It is important to introduce the concepts of push and pull factors of immigration. Push factors are the factors that drive people to leave a place and pull factors are those that draw people to come to a new place. These are key concepts for studying immigration and should be added to the lesson.

The purpose of this powerful and important lesson is to understand how U.S. immigration policies evolved in response to historical events, a very timely discussion for any student taking an ethnic studies course, and especially those living in a diverse state like California. However, as originally designed, the Immigrant Rating Preference activity is extremely problematic and does not seem to serve a productive pedagogical purpose. It should be modified to be objective and neutral in order to prevent the introduction of misinformation or stereotypes during the student discussion. For greater balance and neutrality, students should be prompted to think about the top three historical push and pull factors impacting immigration first before being asked their opinions on current immigration policy. Using this approach will make students aware of the differences between someone who comes voluntarily by "pull" factors such as proximity of country of origin to the U.S. or wealth of the immigrant from someone who is a refugee or asylum seeker facing several of the serious "push" challenges listed. These include religious or racial persecution, civil war, or violence in their country of origin. The suggested edits help to place this content into better historical context, and reinforce key concepts of push and pull factors which will help further student understanding about immigration to the United States.

Students should be asked to provide evidence to support their claims, so the suggested language should be included.

Chapter 2, page 108, lines 2421-2426, Central American Sample Unit, Salvadoran American Migration and Collective Resistance, Lesson 2, Youth Scholars Teach U.S. Immigration Policy Shifts to the People, Instructions for students, step 3, **Change**: "Distribute the Presentation Assignment Sheet and explain the expectations to students. (For more background on the racist origins of the Immigration Act of 1924 ~~you can read with~~ instruct students to read David Kaiser's article, "Immigration Debates Have Always Been Tied to America's Moments of Crisis," in *Time*, http://time.com/5108772/immigration-history-crisis/."~~DACA, The 1924 Immigration Act, and American Exclusion" in the Huffington Post, https://www.huffpost.com/entry/dacathe-1924-immigration-act-and-american-exclusion_b_59b1650ee4b0bef3378cde32.)~~"

Comments: To fully understand what specific values and principles guided the history of United States' immigration policy and how to resolve disagreements surrounding immigration policy

today, students should read about the Immigration Act of 1924. This is vital for understanding how and why immigration policy evolved and what this means moving forward. Students need more information to understand this particular history, and the recommended article provides it. As referenced above in the earlier comments on this lesson, many Jewish refugees fleeing Nazi Germany were denied entry into the United States and other Western countries, prompting the creation of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other human rights protections. (See Peter J. Duignan, "Making and Remaking America: Immigration into the United States," Hoover Institution Archives, https://www.hoover.org/research/making-and-remaking-america-immigration-united-states (Sept. 15, 2003), accessed 6/2/2019. For additional details, see comments and edits for Chapter 2, page 102, lines 2293-2296, Central American Sample Unit, Prerequisite Skills and Knowledge.)

The original article should be replaced with one that is more academic, especially since Sessions' nativist language is spared the proper historical context. Students might come to assume his approach is sound immigration policy for 2019, almost a full 100 years after the 1924 Immigration Act was passed. The *Time* article we recommend addresses the issue in a more scholarly and nuanced way, which is important for adolescents trying to understand such an important and sophisticated topic.

Chapter 2, pages 120-121, lines 2628 - 2645, Lesson 2, Central American Sample Unit, Salvadoran American Migration and Collective Resistance, Immigrant Rating Preferences Activity, **Change**: "What is a push factor? What were the three most historically significant push factors and what are the three most significant ones now? What is a pull factor? What were the three most historically significant push factors and what are the three most significant ones now? Be prepared to explain your answers. ~~Who should be allowed to immigrate and why? What factors should be most important in determining who should be allowed to immigrate permanently to the United States?~~"

Comments: Asking students "Who should be allowed to immigrate and why?" and "What factors should be most important in determining who should be allowed to immigrate permanently to the United States?" before providing a full historical context or other information is pedagogically unsound, setting up a scenario where misinformation, stereotypes, or even harassment may occur. By focusing on the key concepts of push and pull factors for immigration rather than student opinion, the suggested edits to the activity will better prepare students for a deeper understanding of the pedagogical goals of the lesson. It also further reinforces the difference between immigrants who voluntarily come to the United States and refugees and asylum seekers that are pushed to do so.

Chapter 2, pages 233-234, lines 4943-4958, Arab American Studies Course Outline, Sample Topics, **Change**: "Sample Topics:
The Arab World vs. The Middle East,
Defining Arab and Muslim, Islamophobia,
Arab Immigration to the United States,
Dow v. United States (1915),
Race and the Arab-American Experience,
The history of Anti-Arab Immigration Policies,
The Muslim Ban Executive Order 13769,
Terrorism Against Arabs: Arab American and Civil Liberties post-9/11,

Orientalism and Arab Representations in the Media,
Arab and Muslim Women in the United States,
Anti-Arab and Muslim Violence,
~~Direct Action Front for Palestine and Black Lives Matter,~~
~~Call to Boycott, Divest, and~~ ~~Sanction Israel,~~
~~Comparative Border Studies: Palestine and Mexico~~"

Comment: This course covers the experiences of Arab-Americans and provides a list of topics to cover. All but three of the topics in this list are clear and focused on concepts directly related to the Arab American experience. Three of the topics should be removed because they are biased and provide a one-sided and extreme perspective on the Arab-Israeli conflict and are outside the content of the course.

The ESMC Model Curriculum Guidelines dictate that the content must be "written in language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users," and written to "Encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together, highlighting core ethnic studies concepts such as consciousness raising and knowledge building, identity development and self-determination, justice and social change, and love, respect, and hope." Because of this directive, it is imperative that the groups represented be as inclusive as possible. Linking the two topics together in the phrase "Direct Action Front for Palestine and Black Lives Matter" is problematic for the following reasons. First, in an attempt to draw false parallels, the phrase pairs two groups together that are dealing with separate and dissimilar issues. Second, the grouping is meant to inspire one-sided and biased political activism on a controversial and divisive issue and is not directly related to ethnicity. Third, students will be unable to find clear information about "Direct Action Front for Palestine" as a legitimately established group because a simple internet or social media search does not locate a webpage for this group. Fourth, the Black Lives Matter movement is appropriately addressed in multiple other places in Chapter 2, including a whole sample lesson "#BlackLivesMatter and Social Change" (p. 57). Linking the Black Lives Matter movement to a fringe international strategy to boycott and isolate Israel is inappropriate and misrepresents the main message of the Black Lives Matter movement.

Boycott, Divestment, and Sanction (BDS) proponents frequently denigrate Israelis, Israeli Americans, and their vitriol often extends to Jews who do not share their contempt for Israel. The BDS movement's most prominent leaders broadly support a one-state solution, which means the dissolution of the Jewish State of Israel. While they support self-determination for Palestinians, they deny that same right to Jews. In fact, they do not believe Israel has a right to exist at all. For example, Omar Barghouti, a cofounder of the BDS Movement and the Palestinian Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel, stated: "I clearly do not buy into the Two-State Solution."[10] Additionally, he said, "Definitely, most definitely we oppose a Jewish state in any part of Palestine. No Palestinian, rational Palestinian, not a sell-out Palestinian, will ever accept a Jewish state in Palestine."[11] The extreme rhetoric that dominates the BDS movement, as well as tactics that attempt to shut down civil discourse, create a negative and divisive atmosphere that is antithetical to California values of inclusion and respect for the rights of all people. BDS crosses the line into antisemitism when it rejects the Jewish people's right to self-determination and uses tropes that vilify Jews. Ultimately, promotion of BDS in public schools is inappropriate and

[10] See "Boycott Divestment Sanction Israel," You Tube, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tnpilMYsR0I&feature=youtu.be&t=4m6s accessed 5/3/2019.
[11] Omar Barghouti, "Strategies for Change," Vimeo, https://vimeo.com/75201955 accessed 5/3/2019.

would likely be incompatible with California Education Code, section 60044: "No instructional materials shall be adopted by any governing board for use in the schools which, in its determination, contains: (a) Any matter reflecting adversely upon persons because of their race, color, creed, national origin, ancestry, sex, handicap, or occupation."

While the last topic, "Palestine and Mexico", could be a potential topic of study in a world history course that covers contemporary issues and takes a comparative approach, it is outside the disciplinary bounds of American ethnic studies. It is also unsuitable because the term Palestine is geographically ambiguous, so its inclusion here is not pedagogically sound.

Chapter 2, pages 235, line 4947, Arab American Studies Course Outline, Potential Significant Figures to Cover, **Delete**: ~~Helen Thomas~~
Comments: Helen Thomas should be deleted from the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. By listing individuals as significant figures, they may be perceived as role models. However, individuals who traffic in hate targeting particular groups should not be lauded. Helen Thomas should not be included because of her blatantly antisemitic comments. When Rabbi David Nesenoff asked her about Israel she said that they [the Jews] should "get the hell out of Palestine" and "go home" to Poland and Germany. This comment was insensitive, prejudiced, and wrong on many levels - at that time, 38 percent of Jewish Israelis were born in Israel.[12] However, the comments to the Rabbi were not a one-off. Thomas doubled down with classic antisemitic tropes (while denying she was anti-Jewish) about Jewish power and control of the financial markets in a Playboy interview (she spoke of "total control", said that Jews "own the White House", and agreed that there's a "Jewish conspiracy at work in this country.") Her interchangeable use of Jewish and Zionist underscored her prejudice.[13] Therefore, she should not be highlighted as a significant figure.

Chapter 2, page 237, lines 5027-5032, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 1, Arab Immigration to the US (Modified Lesson Plan from the Arab Cultural), Grade 11, Lesson Steps/Activities, Lesson Step 2, **Change**: "To wrap up the exercise, students should identify the ways that one might identify a country as "Arab," (e.g. predominantly Arabic-speaking, member of the Arab League). If time permits, have students highlight Lebanon, Syria, Israel, ~~-~~ Palestin~~e~~ian territories (Gaza and the West Bank), and Iraq, and ~~for each~~ ~~country~~ teacher explains what time periods saw significant immigration from each of those ~~countries~~ areas to the US. (10 min)"
Comments: Please insert the suggested language for greater clarity. "Palestinian territories" is often used as international shorthand for Gaza and the West Bank as a reference to land with a majority Palestinian population. "Palestinian territories" is an improvement over the unclear reference to Palestine. The terms "West Bank" and "Gaza Strip" are more neutral and clear and are unlikely to be disputed or change as the political situation unfolds, and they help clarify the areas in question. Since there are effectively two Palestinian governments, Hamas in Gaza and

[12] Israel Central Bureau of Statistics, Statistical Abstract of Israel 2010, https://www.cbs.gov.il/he/publications/doclib/2010/2.%20shnatonpopulation/st02_24x.pdf, accessed June 13, 2019.
[13] See https://www.scribd.com/document/50980781/Interview-Helen-Thomas?ad_group=35871X943606Xc20ec858c3f916a7369ef36eb12f47e7&campaign=SkimbitLtd&keyword=660149026&medium=affiliate&source=hp_affiliate, accessed June 13, 2019.

the Palestinian Authority in the West Bank, these terms also make it easier to distinguish between them.

The text should reflect current reality rather than future aspirations or political goals. In September 2011, Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas submitted an application to the United Nations for Palestine to become a United Nations Member State. This application for full member status was rejected by the UN Security Council. On November 29, 2012, the United Nations General Assembly voted to upgrade the status of the Palestinians to that of a "non-member observer state." The United States, Israel, Switzerland, Canada, Japan, South Korea, Mexico, Australia, New Zealand, and most of the European Union, among others, do not recognize a state of Palestine. They believe that Palestinian statehood can only be achieved through direct negotiations with Israel. Because there is not international consensus on this issue, use of the name "Palestine" here reflects a political perspective and may be confusing to students as far as how the term maps on to current geographic regions.

Chapter 2, page 241, lines 5136-5139, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 1, Arab Immigration to the US (Modified Lesson Plan from the Arab Cultural), Grade 11, History of Arab Immigration to the United States, paragraph 1, **Change original text (see below for options)**: "Beginning around 1870, there were three major waves of Arab immigration. The first wave came mostly from a region of the Ottoman Empire then called Syria (which includes the modern states of Syria, Lebanon, and Palestine/Israel), in particular the region of Mount Lebanon."

Comments: The above text as written is problematic. This paragraph contains inaccurate information that should be corrected. What was then often referred to as Ottoman Syria included the vilayets of Syria and Beirut as well as parts of what is present-day Jordan. Much of the coastal region being described was part of the vilayet of Beirut, not the vilayet of Syria. The use of the term "Palestine/Israel" is particularly inaccurate because of the following reasons: 1) there is no state called "Palestine/Israel," 2) there is a state of Israel (a UN member state since 1949), 3) using the slash between the two names asserts that there is no separate entity called the State of Israel, which erases and delegitimizes its existence, 4) the term's use unnecessarily politicizes a brief explanation of the source of Arab immigration to the U.S., and 5) at the present date, Palestine has not been conferred UN member state status with clear boundaries; rather, it was given non-member observer state status in 2012, which has not been recognized by the United States, Canada, and the EU, among others. The inaccuracies in the current text can be resolved in one of the following ways and still include the key content of the lesson as intended.

Option 1:

Change: "Beginning around 1870, there were three major waves of Arab immigration. The first wave came mostly from a region of the Ottoman Empire ~~then~~ often called Ottoman Syria (which ~~includes the modern states of Syria, Lebanon, and Palestine/Israel),~~ included the regions between the Mediterranean Sea and the Euphrates River, and between the Taurus Mountains and Arabian Desert). Within these regions, large numbers of immigrants came from ~~in particular~~ the region of Mount Lebanon."

Comments: The clearest and most accurate way to explain the geography of a region that has had many names and borders throughout time is to use geographic landmarks. The inclusion of modern place names in an account of immigration from the 1870s onward is historically out of place. This option provides the geographic boundaries of the region being described, which has

the advantage of orienting students to geography, thus avoiding confusion around old and modern place names while building their map skills.

Option 2: Change: "Beginning around 1870, there were three major waves of Arab immigration. The first wave came mostly from a region of the Ottoman Empire ~~then~~ often called Syria (which includes present-day ~~the modern states of~~ Syria, Lebanon, Jordan, Israel, and Palestine~~ian territories/Israel)~~ (Gaza and the West Bank). Large numbers of immigrants came from ~~in particular~~ the region of Mount Lebanon specifically."
Comments: The term "present-day" makes clear that the content is talking about current locations. "Palestinian territories" is often used as international shorthand for Gaza and the West Bank as a reference to land with a majority Palestinian population. Because this part of the lesson is trying to orient students to the present-day geographic location of the Syrian region of the Ottoman Empire, it should use clear, accurate terms. It is not clear to what "Palestine/ Israel" refers. Using a slash between the two names asserts that there is no separate entity called the State of Israel which erases and delegitimizes its existence. Use of the neutral geographic terms "Gaza" and "West Bank" to locate the Palestinian territories is clear and inclusive by covering the areas under discussion and will not confuse teachers and students about past or future states, as well as current situations where terminology is disputed.

The territory of part of present-day Jordan was part of the Ottoman Syria so "Jordan" should also be added.

Option 3:
Change: "The first wave came mostly from a region of the Ottoman Empire ~~then~~ often called Syria (which includes present-day ~~the modern states of~~ Syria, Lebanon, Jordan, Israel, and Palestine ~~/ Israel)~~ (Gaza and the West Bank). Large numbers of immigrants came from ~~in particular~~ the region of Mount Lebanon."
Comments: This part of the lesson is trying to orient students to the present-day geographic location of Ottoman Syria. It is not clear to what "Palestine/Israel" refers. Using a slash between the two names asserts that there is no separate entity called the State of Israel, which erases and delegitimizes its existence. At a minimum, separate terms should be used and the slash deleted. If this option is selected, the addition of the neutral geographic terms "Gaza" and "West Bank" will clarify what areas are being referenced specifically, which will help student understanding.

The territory of part of present-day Jordan was part of the Ottoman Syria, so "Jordan" should also be added.

Chapter 2, page 241, lines 5139-5144, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 1, Arab Immigration to the US (Modified Lesson Plan from the Arab Cultural), Grade 11, History of Arab Immigration to the United States, **Change**: Many of these immigrants, about 95,000 during this wave, ~~200,000 in all~~, were young men pursuing economic opportunity in the United States and by 1924, about 200,000 were living in the U.S. First wave immigrants were generally ~~called~~ Syrians or Turks, and in fact many did not necessarily think of themselves primarily as Arab. They often identified as members of a particular religious group or geographic area: Christians, Muslims, or Jews from the Middle East and North Africa ~~Lebanon, Aleppo, or Jerusalem~~."
Comments: The number 200,000 is inaccurate. During this time, 95,000 Arab immigrants came, and by 1924 there were already 200,000 Arab Americans living in the United States. (See Arab American National Museum with Randa Kayyali, *Arab Americans: History, Culture &*

Contributions, Chapter 4, "Histories of Arab American Immigration," p. 34, (Dearborn, Mich. 2019), http://arabamericanmuseum.org/umages/Arab-Americans.pdf accessed 5/27/2019.)

The term "called" is not necessary when referring to Syrians and Turks, so it should be deleted.

The original language does not cover the full range of places where Christians, Muslims, or Jews came from at that time. They also came from Iraq, Syria, Algeria, Tunisia, and Morocco, as well as Lebanon and the other places referenced in the original text. For greater accuracy, this recommended language should be added.

Chapter 2, page 242, lines 5154-5163, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 1, Arab Immigration to the US (Modified Lesson Plan from the Arab Cultural), Grade 11, The History of Arab American Immigration in the United States, paragraph 3, **Change**: "The second wave of immigrants, in the middle of the twentieth century, arrived more slowly because of these restrictions in immigration law after the Immigration Act of 1924 was passed. This wave was small~~er~~ (less than 100,000) and much less homogeneous than the first. ~~Immigrants, both~~ Jewish, Christian, and Muslim immigrants~~,~~ arrived from all over the Arab world, not just Syria. This wave of immigration featured two major groups, Yemenis and Palestinians. Yemenis generally came as laborers to Michigan, New York, California, as well as Illinois and Virginia, where they worked in car factories, shipyards, mining, and as migrant farmers. About 3,000 Palestinian families immigrated to the U.S. during this period. ~~The largest single group was Palestinian, as hundreds of thousands of Palestinians had been displaced in the Nakba (Arabic for "Catastrophe," the term used to describe the dispossession and dispersal of many Palestinian Arabs from the new state of Israel in the 1948 Palestine War). Most~~ Many of the Arab immigrants to the US in this period~~, Palestinian and otherwise~~ were well-educated professionals. ~~because restrictive immigration laws kept out those without wealth or a trade~~."

Comments: The current language might be confusing to students because they may get the impression that immigration restrictions were exclusive to Arabs in general or Palestinian Arabs in particular. The language does not specify why immigration was restricted or the many reasons for immigration during this time. Students should be informed why immigration was restricted during this time and that the immigration restrictions were not exclusive to one ethnic group. The many reasons for immigration are not accurately listed as well, and the original language politicizes a brief explanation of the source of Arab immigration to the U.S., which might lead to misinformation or student confusion.

For greater accuracy, it should include Jews to fully reflect how and why immigration from this region occurred. The National Origins Act of 1924 drastically restricted immigration by setting up quotas that reflected the percentages of various national groups within the population in 1890, which severely restricted immigration to the U.S. during this time period, so the suggested edit should be included for greater historical context.

The information about the second wave of Arab immigration is inaccurate. According to the Arab American National Museum, Yemenis and Palestinians together constituted the largest groups of Arab American migrants in this period. All sources agree that there was a reduction in Arab immigration from 1925 to 1964. The suggested changes are more accurate.

The text as written misleads teachers and students into thinking that hundreds of thousands of Palestinians immigrated to the U.S. during this period. Immigration data should be well-researched and vetted by scholar experts. The accurate number of Palestinian families that came to the U.S. in this period is 2,985. (See Arab American National Museum with Randa

Kayyali, *Arab Americans: History, Culture & Contributions*, Chapter 4, "Histories of Arab American Immigration," pp. 38-40, (2019: Dearborn, Mich.), http://arabamericanmuseum.org/umages/Arab-Americans.pdf accessed 5/27/2019.)

Chapter 2, page 245, lines 5241-5242, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 1, Arab Immigration to the US (Modified Lesson Plan from the Arab Cultural), Grade 11, The History of Arab American Immigration in the United States, Student handout, Arab-American Immigration and Labor, paragraph 6, **Delete**: "~~The increased militarization of the US-Mexico border also reflects the connection between the issues of the two communities. Large defense companies like Raytheon, Lockheed Martin, and Northrup Grumman are scrambling to secure contracts to provide weaponry, including drones, for the border to make up for the drawdown of US forces in Iraq and Afghanistan~~."
Comments: A final paragraph should focus on content related to the course topic. This section introduces an unrelated complex topic with insufficient explanation to be helpful to students. Furthermore, the politicized tone is inappropriate and unscholarly. A more logical and timely conclusion could include the recent political developments that impact Muslim Arab immigration to the U.S.

Chapter 2, pages 253-274, lines 5404-5887, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, **Delete:** Sample Lesson 2.
Comments: While the analysis of hip-hop music and rap lyrics can be a valuable teaching tool, in this case, its execution in this lesson is of insufficient pedagogical value, and the content is neither appropriate nor helpful in advancing the goal of inclusivity, as required in the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines. While the activity's stated goal is to dispel stereotypes, the content strongly reinforces them by including language about Palestinians that "try to 'destroy Israel' and 'drive the Jews into the sea.'" This language is extremely problematic, and the veiled sarcasm makes the author's intent unclear. The language and lack of context seems to be shorthand for calling for genocide against Jews and the destruction of the State of Israel. This type of language is blatantly antisemitic. Denying one people the right to a national homeland (Jews), while supporting that right for other peoples reflects a troubling double standard that does not belong in California public schools. For further details, see the Executive Summary.

We support the idea of including the topic of hip-hop music and rap in the ESMC, but the two hip-hop songs currently included are not contextualized enough for students to properly understand their nuanced takeaways, and they contain harmful stereotypes and sarcasm that detract from the goal of the lesson. Problematic language can be found in the lyrics and voice-over of one of the hip-hop songs, which some adolescents may not be able to decipher as sarcasm, including phrases such as "this song is so racist right now." Additionally, students could also easily come across a far more prejudiced video remake in their search; the remake utilizes classic antisemitic tropes. (See "Zionist Money," You Tube, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lTcfDcuWfYQ, accessed 5/26/2019.)

The African American Studies Course asserts that the following key concepts must be taught: "This course will explore the African American and African Diaspora experience, from the precolonial ancestral roots in Africa to the trans-Atlantic slave trade and enslaved people's uprisings in the antebellum South, to the elements of Hip Hop and African cultural retentions." However, no content or pedagogy surrounding hip hop is provided in either the course outline or

in the lessons on African American Studies. Given this glaring omission, it seems strange to flesh out the concept elsewhere in an Arab American Studies course without properly putting the hip-hop movement into proper historical context. The lesson does not provide students with a full background and instead presents a skewed portrait of hip-hop culture.

See the specific edits below explaining why each element is problematic. Because of these problems, the entire lesson needs to be pulled from the ESMC or completely rewritten.

Chapter 2, page 259, lines 5554-5560, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, Arab Stereotypes, **Delete:** "~~**General Epithets:** Arabs, camel jockeys, towel-heads, sand-niggers "All Arabs are Muslims" or "All Muslims are Arabs" "Moslems" or "Mohammedans" (rather than Muslims) "Sheik," harem, desert, camels, oasis, nomads, Bedouin, warriors, tribal; Arab world as an exotic arena where Western heroes have romantic adventures. Arabian Nights, genie, magic carpet, princess, evil vizier~~" ~~**Muslims**: fundamentalists, extremists, militants, fanatics, terrorists, cut off hands, oppress women, jihad as "holy war~~"
Comments: While undoubtedly well-meaning, the list of Arab and Muslim stereotypes should be deleted and the lesson replaced with one that uses more neutral language. Exploring stereotypes in the manner suggested by the exercise can have serious unintended consequences, serving to introduce or reinforce negative stereotypes and isolate Arab American students. An alternative approach using more generalized, neutral language and including a wider range of character adjective vocabulary, both positive and negative, should be used such as the lesson plan for English language learners available here (https://www.thoughtco.com/national-sterotypes-1210269). Using this alternative meets the pedagogical goals of the lesson without potentially reinforcing negative views of Arab and Muslim Americans. The use of a self-affirming lesson that builds intergroup relations also has the benefit of negating the same "stereotype threats' that cause performance gaps. (See Ken Beare, "ESL Lesson Plan to Teach Students About National Stereotypes,"*ThoughCo.com* (January 30, 2019), https://www.thoughtco.com/national-sterotypes-1210269 accessed 5/272019; see also Claude M. Steele and Joshua Aronson, "Stereotype Threat and the Intellectual Test Performance of African Americans," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 69 (5): 797-811.)

Chapter 2, page 259, lines 5561-5562, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, Arab Stereotypes, **Delete**: "~~Palestinians: terrorists, blow up airlines, try to "destroy Israel" and "drive the Jews into the sea~~"
Comments: The term "terrorist" and the phrases "blow up airlines", "try to destroy Israel", and "driving Jews into the sea" have the potential to link Palestinian and Arab Americans to extremist, political views. This language is derogatory toward both Arab and Jewish Americans, and is not appropriate in a public school classroom to use with adolescent students. The phrase "drive the Jews into the sea" suggests genocide and must be removed. As the lesson quite rightly intends to demonstrate, these are extreme views that do not reflect the views of all Palestinians or Arab Americans. Presenting them here without sufficient context or direction could lead to essentializing Palestinians as extremists and teaching students negative stereotypes about Jews and Israelis.

Chapter 2, page 259, lines 5563-5574, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, Arab Stereotypes, **Delete:** "~~Good Arabs: minor characters, passive, culturally Western, dramatically insignificant, subordinate to Western heroes, rarely the main character or action hero~~ ~~**Arab Men:**~~

~~Oil Sheiks, fabulously wealthy, lavish and wasteful spending, "buying up America" Greasy merchants, swarthy, dirty, greedy, unshaven, uneducated, dishonest, manipulative, incompetent Mad dictators, ruthless, violent, treacherous, barbaric, hate Jews and America, secret plots to destroy America Cruel, deceitful, hot-tempered, irrational Abduction of blond western women **Arab Women**: Oppressed by Arab men/Islam Luxurious harem, scantily clad belly dancers; sensuous, beautiful woman in love with Western hero who rescues her from evil Arab man. Confined to home, veils, head coverings, long robes; passive, uneducated, voiceless, faceless, characterless. Older women: hysterical, artificial grief in mourning rituals~~"

Comments: The list of Arab stereotypes is highly problematic and should be deleted. Exploring stereotypes in the manner suggested by the exercise can have serious unintended consequences, serving to introduce or reinforce negative stereotypes and isolate Arab American students. The use of a self-affirming lesson that builds intergroup relations has the benefit of negating the same "stereotype threats' that cause performance gaps. See suggestion above for an alternative approach that meets the pedagogical goals of the lesson without potentially reinforcing negative views of Arab Americans.

Chapter 2, page 261-264, lines 5611-5690, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, "The Real Arab Money," **Delete**: primary source of rap lyrics.

Comments: The background narrative in the draft informs students that these lyrics are troubling and problematic, and as a result of the critique by Narcicyst, Busta Rhymes apologized, and these songs have been pulled. Given the acknowledgement of all parties of the troubling stereotypes depicted, it is not clear why this song is being used for adolescents to analyze in a public school classroom. Even more problematic language can be found in the lyrics and voice-over of one of the hip-hop songs, which some adolescents may not be able to decipher as sarcasm, including phrases such as "this song is so racist right now." Students could also easily come across a far more prejudiced video remake in their search; the remake utilizes classic antisemitic tropes. (See "Zionist Money," You Tube, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lTcfDcuWfYQ, accessed 5/26/2019.)

The hip-hop song includes misleading information about Israel and Israelis by repeating a blanket statement in one lyric, which says "In Palestine, kids can't shop at these malls." This will lead to harmful and negative stereotypes about one party to the Arab-Israeli conflict and could lead to exclusion or harassment of Jewish or Israeli students. See also the Executive Summary.

Chapter 2, pages 264-270, lines 5692- 5830, and 5881-5882, Arab American Studies Course, Sample Lesson 2, Hip-hop as Resistance, Ana Tijoux, Letra de "Somos Sur" feat. Shadia Mansour, from the album *Vengo*, printed in Arabic, Spanish, and English, **Delete**: primary source of rap lyrics and the link to the video on page 270.

Comments: This hip-hop song with rap lyrics should be deleted because it contains lyrics with decontextualized problematic language with inaccurate information about the Middle East. Phrases such as "For every free political prisoner, an Israeli colony is expanded. For each greeting, a thousand houses were demolished. They use the press so they can manufacture, but when my sentence is judged, reality presents itself," are not only inaccurate, but they conjure up stereotypes about Jews and Israelis, specifically an offensive and harmful trope about media control and a biased perspective on Israel. This stereotypical language is inaccurate and extremely problematic, and the veiled sarcasm makes unclear the author's intent. As such, this

song reflects adversely on Jews and Jewish Israelis, and it may lead to discrimination against Jewish American students who feel an attachment to Israel. Therefore, it should not be used. Other minorities are not singled out in this way in the Model Curriculum and doing so here is wrong and may violate Education Code 60044 and 51500. See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 2, page 280, lines 6040 - 6044, Hip-hop as Resistance, 9-12, Lesson Steps/Activities, Lesson Step/Activity 1, **Change**: "Review the video from the Pew Research Center and select an excerpt to show the class as a whole. Then, ask the class to describe the diversity of experiences within the Muslim American community and compare those experiences with those of other religious minorities. ~~Ask the question – Is anyone here Muslim or feels they are often labeled Muslim when you are not? (If anyone raises their hand, ask them to feel free to add and comment to any content that is being presented as this lesson on Islamophobia – the experiences of Arab Americans in dealing with it will be discussed. But to not feel any pressure to represent their whole community.)~~"

Comments: This activity is pedagogically inappropriate because it has the potential to single out students who might already feel marginalized. Singling out students for their ethnicity or religion without their consent might prompt discrimination, attacks, or even hate. This is inconsistent with the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines. Activities that tokenize students and make them feel pressured to represent their entire faith community are inappropriate in a public school classroom. Religious minority groups are diverse and one or two students should not be asked to serve as spokespeople for their faith. It is one thing for students to volunteer to share experiences, but the teacher should not single out any student and put them on the spot. In addition to the possibility of putting Muslim students in an uncomfortable position, the activity will not work if no Muslim students are in the classroom. To better understand and fully appreciate the diversity of the Muslim American experience, the activity should be modified, and students should watch an excerpt from a clip of a video on being Muslim American. (For a good example of a resource, see "Being Muslim in the U.S." Pew Research Center, https://www.pewforum.org/2018/04/17/video-being-muslim-in-the-u-s/ accessed 7/5/2019.)

Chapter 3: UC-Approved Course Outlines Overview

Chapter 3, page 16, lines 328-338, template for Introduction to Ethnic Studies, **Change**:
"Sample Course Outline: Introduction to Ethnic Studies
Course Purpose

Ethnic studies is designed to give students an introduction to the experiences of ethnic communities that are generally underrepresented or misrepresented in textbooks and other widely used teaching resources. This course will equip students with a powerful way to understand ethnic groups and their various dimensions such as race, ~~ethnicity,~~ nationality, religion, and culture in the United States in order to build a truer democracy. Furthermore, students will explore the critical connections between themselves, their communities, the larger world and the systemic institutional structures used to organize society.

Throughout the course, students will learn about the problems various communities have faced and the social movements they initiated to address those problems. Students will explore how people throughout this country's history have fought for freedom, inclusion, justice, and democracy."

Comments: Since ethnic groups and ethnicity are the main subjects of an ethnic studies course, other categories of identity should be listed as components or dimensions of ethnicity. The focus should be on ethnic groups as communities as well as ethnic identity and its various facets. Failing to do so detracts from the main content that an ethnic studies course should cover. As stated in the Executive Summary, not defining ethnicity and ethnic groups in Chapter 1 is methodologically flawed, demonstrates a lack of rigor, and prevents teachers from understanding and conveying a defining concept of the ESMC, ethnicity, thereby impeding the understanding of the intersectionality of identities. The ESMC should include content that teaches about ethnic groups who have at one point, or even continuously, faced extreme prejudice and discrimination in this country rather than exclusively focusing on the "interlocking systems of oppression and privilege that impact all people of color."

This is the generic template provided for LEAs and teachers to develop their own Introduction to Ethnic Studies Courses. It will be used as the starting point to customize a course for their school district. Since it is the only template provided for an Introduction to Ethnic Studies course, it should be as general as possible, so that it can cover topics and groups in which religion is an important part of ethnic identity. Therefore, "religion" should be included in this template of Introduction to Ethnic Studies Course Purpose.

Chapter 3, page 16, lines 348-351, Sample Course Outline: Introduction to Ethnic Studies,
Change: "Course Goals
Through active engagement in the learning experience, students will be able to:

1. explore a diverse set of narratives and primary sources across <u>ethnic</u> <u>communities that contain diverse marginalized groups</u> ~~race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality, nationality, and culture~~;"

Comments: While these are important facets of an individual's identity, they do not necessarily make up an individual's ethnic identity. However, since the subject of the course is ethnic studies, it should be assumed that the focus of the course will be on ethnic communities. See comments for Chapter 3, page 16, lines 330-342, template for Introduction to Ethnic Studies. If the original list is retained, at a minimum religion should be added to it.

Chapter 3, page 17, lines 371-374, Sample Course Outline: Introduction to Ethnic Studies,
Change: "Unit 4 (4–8 weeks): *Transformational Change,* **Key Concepts and Definitions,** *Community* A group of people that share particular characteristics (i.e., race, class, gender, neighborhood, nationality, <u>religion,</u> culture, and interests) and/or maintain a sense of fellowship with others due to common interests, goals, and attitudes."
Comments: Religion is a key part of identity in many ethnic and racial communities, so it should be part of the definition of "Community" in ethnic studies. Whether used as a general term for the wider ethnic group, i.e. the African American community, or a more local community, i.e. a specific church community, religion should be part of the definition. Religion is also a key part of community as a whole so it should be included here. See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 3, page 20, lines 428-430, Sample Course Outline: Introduction to Ethnic Studies,
Change: "Key Terms - *Race, Ethnicity, Nationality, <u>Religion,</u> Culture, Gender, Sexuality, Community, Intersectionality, Point of View, Eurocentrism, Narrative, Counternarrative, Master narrative, Nature vs. nurture"*

Comments: Because religion is so often a key or even defining part of ethnic identity (such as for Sikhs, Yazidis, Catholics, Muslims, and Jews), "religion" should be listed as a key term here. See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 3, page 22, lines 483-484, Sample Course Outline: Introduction to Ethnic Studies, Unit 4 (4–8 weeks): Transformational Change, Essential Questions, **Change**: "Is allyship across race, class, religion, gender, sexuality possible? If so, how? If not, what barriers and obstacles persist?"
Comments: The content ignores interfaith allyship, which should be a key concept in any ethnic studies course. This is all the more true in light of recent violent attacks on religious communities. See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 4 - Glossary and Bibliography

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 1, line 24, **Add: "*Antisemitism* - hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Jews and the overall religion of Judaism. Antisemitism has a long history in the United States, ranging from Jews being a target of the white supremacist group, the Ku Klux Klan and its neo-Nazi descendants, to restrictions on immigration and refugees. In recent years, Jews have become increasingly targeted by white supremacists and others with extremist ideologies through criminal attacks on individuals and Jewish institutions, ranging from vandalism to shootings and bombings in California and nationally."**
Comments: As stated in the Executive Summary, the definition of antisemitism in this glossary should parallel the definition of Islamophobia. Antisemitism has a long history in the United States. Often a target of the KKK, Jews have experienced prejudice and have been singled out as an ethnic "other." Anti-Jewish discrimination reached its height in the years between WWI and WWII, with restrictions on immigration targeting Jews in the Immigration Act of 1924, explicit attacks by Henry Ford and Father Coughlin, quotas on college admissions, overt restrictions on Jews entering white collar professions, and a refusal to allow the immigration of Jewish refugees from Nazi Germany in the 1930s and 40s. In the 1950s and 60s, Jewish institutions were firebombed. Attacks on Jews from white supremacists, white nationalists, and other extremists have grown in frequency more recently. White supremacists and others brandishing dangerous extremist ideologies have had a devastating impact across the country. Discussions of hate crimes, bias, prejudice, discrimination, and stereotyping should explicitly include anti-Jewish prejudice along with anti-Muslim and other prejudices. Adding this term will help students to further flesh out the notion that key concepts in ethnic studies apply to religious and ethnic-based discrimination, as well as race-based prejudice. See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 2, lines 30-40, **Delete**: ***"~~Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS)~~*** ~~- is a global social movement that currently aims to establish freedom for Palestinians living under apartheid conditions. Inspired by tactics employed during the South African anti-apartheid movement, the Palestinian-led movement calls for the boycott, divestment, and sanctioning of the Israeli government until it complies with International law. BDS proponents and organizers have called for the global community to boycott or withdraw support from Israel and companies associated with it. The second component of BDS calls for governments, banks, universities, and other institutions to withdraw monetary support (divestment) from Israel and its companies. And~~

~~finally, the third component – sanctions – asks international governments to hold~~ ~~Israel accountable for its actions through legislation, trade and military agreements,~~ ~~among other measures.~~"

Comments: Boycott, Divestment, and Sanction (BDS) proponents frequently denigrate Israelis, Israeli Americans, and their vitriol often extends to Jews who do not share their contempt for Israel. The BDS movement's most prominent leaders broadly support a one-state solution, which means the dissolution of the Jewish State of Israel. While they support self-determination for Palestinians, they deny that same right to Jews. They do not believe Israel has a right to exist at all. For example, Omar Barghouti, a cofounder of the BDS Movement and the Palestinian Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel, stated: "I clearly do not buy into the Two-State Solution."[14] Additionally, he said, "Definitely, most definitely we oppose a Jewish state in any part of Palestine. No Palestinian, rational Palestinian, not a sell-out Palestinian, will ever accept a Jewish state in Palestine."[15] The extreme rhetoric that dominates the BDS movement, as well as tactics that attempt to shut down civil discourse, create a negative and divisive atmosphere that is antithetical to California values of inclusion and respect for the rights of all people. BDS crosses the line into antisemitism when it rejects the Jewish people's right to self-determination and uses tropes that vilify Jews. Ultimately, promotion of BDS in public schools is inappropriate, divisive, and would likely be incompatible with California Education Code, section 60044: "No instructional materials shall be adopted by any governing board for use in the schools which, in its determination, contains: (a) Any matter reflecting adversely upon persons because of their race, color, creed, national origin, ancestry, sex, handicap, or occupation." See the Executive Summary.

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 6, lines 140-141, **Change**: "***Ethnicity*** - an identity marker based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, language, history, <u>religion,</u> tradition, etc., that comprise a social group."

Comments: "Religion" should be added to the glossary definition of ethnicity because religion is often a central part of ethnic identity. As mentioned previously, religious identity intersects with racial, ethnic, gender, cultural, and other social identities that cannot be reduced to simple racial categories.

Religion is covered as a part of ethnicity in the course models for African American Studies, Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies, Native American Studies, and Arab American Studies in Chapter 2. In Chapter 5, Appendix A UC-Approved Course Outlines for Ethnic Studies, there is considerable content on the religious aspect of ethnic identity.

Here is a sampling of ways in which these UC-approved courses include religion as an important component of ethnic studies:

- Students are asked to address religion, including "escape from religious persecution", as a push factor in immigration to the U.S. in an activity on refugees (Chapter 2, page 177, lines 2575-2594), and in a unit on immigration (Chapter 5, page 8, line 261).
- Religion is covered as a protected right in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Chapter 2, page 102, line 2295) and in multiple instances in Chapter 5.

---

[14] See "Boycott Divestment Sanction Israel," You Tube, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tnpilMYsR0I&feature=youtu.be&t=4m6s accessed 5/3/2019.

[15] Omar Barghouti, "Strategies for Change," Vimeo, https://vimeo.com/75201955 accessed 5/3/2019.

- The Chicana/o/x and Latina/o/x Studies course also includes religion by covering "the impact of the social, political and religious institutions that were introduced in the Americas" (Chapter 5, page 170, lines 6932-6933) and "students will discuss the role of religion, gender and race relations in order to understand how Mexican-American culture was shaped in different parts of the United States" (page 170).
- In a course on Native American Studies, religious practices, legal rulings, and the suppression of religious freedom are highlighted as important themes. Students are specifically asked about "the primary difference between the Civilization Regulations of 1880 and the American Indian Religious Freedom Act (AIRFA) of 1978" (Chapter 5, page 182, lines 7412-7414). They also have to explain the difference between animism, monotheism, and polytheism on page 182, lines 7414-7417. In the second part of the lesson activity, "students have to write a paragraph consisting of seven to nine sentences, explaining the differences between traditional Native American spiritual beliefs and Western practices." This course demonstrates the centrality of religion to Native American Studies.
- The African American Studies course also covers religion, for example in this theme:
    - "Dimensions of African-American Religion - Students will explore traditional African religions and the conversion to Christianity as a group once arriving in the Americas. Students will study the fusion of these religions through Santeria and Camdomble." (Chapter 5, page 67, lines 2686-2691)
- One outlined course includes a unit titled "Muslim American Studies", which begins:
    - "Students address the historical and current experiences of Arab and Muslim Americans in the United States by exploring the racial, ethnic, religious and cultural aspects of Islam and Muslim communities. In addition, students will discern between the secular and religious dynamics in how Islam and Muslim communities are being defined in American society. Students begin the unit by exploring the beliefs of Islam such as the five pillars of faith and the importance of the beliefs to the Muslim community" (Chapter 5, page 42, lines 1717-1722).

Clearly, in ethnic studies, there is a longstanding practice of recognizing that for many communities, religion is an important component of ethnicity. Thus, religion should be added to the list in this introductory survey course and throughout the model curriculum.

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 7, lines 167-169, **Change**: "***Genocide*** - the intentional systematic destruction of an entire national, ethnic, racial or religious community. ~~Moreover, the~~ The United Nations' 1948 Genocide Convention defines genocide as intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, as such: (a) Killing members of the group; (b) Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group; (c) Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part; (d) Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group; (e) Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group. Raphael Lemkin, a Jewish refugee from Nazi-occupied Poland who lost 49 relatives in the Holocaust, coined the term and initiated the Genocide Convention.
~~offers a much more expansive definition of this term that encompasses the various ways in which genocide manifests.[1]"~~

~~[1] The United Nations defines genocide as, "any of the following acts committed with the intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, such as: killing members of the group; causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group; deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part; imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group; [and] forcibly transferring children of the group to another group."~~
Comments: Glossary entries do not usually have footnotes, and having the legal definition in a footnote is awkward and hard to use. Students should understand that the origins of the general term "genocide" grew out of the Holocaust. We suggest incorporating the definition of genocide adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in Resolution 2060 directly into the definition, and adding a brief summary of the person who coined the term "genocide." (For the original primary source, see "Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, General Assembly Resolution 260, December 9, 1948," http://avalon.law.yale.edu/20th_century/genocide.asp accessed 5/29/2019. For the origins of the word genocide, see "What is Genocide," United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, https://www.ushmm.org/confront-genocide/defining-genocide accessed 5/29/2019.)

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 8, line 190, **Add:** "***Holocaust*** - The Holocaust was the state-sponsored systematic persecution and annihilation of European Jews by Nazi Germany and its collaborators between 1933 and 1945. Six million Jews, or two-thirds of European Jews, were murdered. The Nazis also killed five million other people during World War II. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948 and international understandings of human rights developed out of world reaction to the Holocaust." **Comments**: Since the ESMC requires learning about the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which was an outgrowth of the Holocaust, this term should be added to the Glossary. This definition comes from the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. American understanding of the dangers of racism and prejudice is greatly informed by education about the Holocaust, so the definition should be reinforced here as well. (For the definition, see "Holocaust," Holocaust Encyclopedia, United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, https://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007315, accessed 5/29/2019, and "What was the Holocaust?", Yad Vashem, https://www.yadvashem.org/holocaust/about.html accessed 6/26/2018.)

Chapter 4, Glossary, page 10, lines 239-240, **Change**: "***Islamophobia*** **-** hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Muslims and the overall religion of Islam. Hate crimes against Muslims greatly increased following 9/11, including arson attacks on mosques, violence by white supremacists, and many other attacks on individuals and Muslim institutions, ranging from vandalism to shootings and bombings in California and nationally."
Comments: In addition to the accurate but sparse definition on Islamophobia, more recent information should be added to demonstrate how Islamophobia has increased since 9/11, due in large part to the growth of white supremacy and religious bigotry. Reference should be made to attacks on Muslims and Muslim places of worship, including arson attacks on mosques, such as the Dar-ul-Arqam mosque in Escondido. (See comments for Chapter 2, page 102, lines 2293-2296, Central American Sample Unit, Prerequisite Skills and Knowledge.)

Chapter 4, page 16, line 386, **Add**: "***Zionism*** - the belief in the right to self-determination for the Jewish people and an expression of Jewish nationalism. Founded in the late 19th century as a response to rising antisemitism, Zionists sought to create a nation in their historic homeland where Jews could be the majority, rather than a minority. Since 1948, it generally refers to support for or attachment to the modern State of Israel."

Comments: We do not recommend the inclusion of BDS, which is outside the bounds of American ethnic studies, because it is unnecessarily divisive and oversimplifies a complex international situation. **If, however, BDS is retained in the Glossary, Zionism should be added** for fairness and accuracy. It should be presented as it is understood by those who identify with the term, just as other beliefs are presented as they are understood by adherents (and not detractors).

Zionism is an expression of Jewish nationalism: namely, the belief in the right to self-determination for the Jewish people. Founded in the late 19th century, it was largely a response by Ashkenazi Jews to rising antisemitism in Europe, exemplified by the Dreyfus affair in France and the anti-Jewish pogroms in the Russian Empire. The primary goals of Zionism were the return of the Jewish people to their historic homeland, known as "Eretz Yisrael" in Hebrew, and the reestablishment of a Jewish national home there. Jews have always maintained a continuous presence in the region and there were group migrations of Jews to the land of Israel prior to the modern period. Zionists sought to create a nation where Jews could be the majority, rather than a vulnerable minority, as they were around the world. Since the creation of Israel in 1948, Zionism has become synonymous with support for or attachment to modern Israel.

Chapter 5 - Appendices, Appendix A: UC-Approved Course Outlines, Appendix B: Community Builders

Appendix A – The included documents appear to have already been approved so we have not recommended changes. Before finalizing the Model Curriculum, the Instructional Quality Commission may wish to assess the appendices to ensure alignment with the ESMC Guidelines and California's Education Code.

Appendix B – The IQC may wish to examine the activities more closely. In particular, "The Privilege Walk" appears pedagogically questionable and potentially humiliating to students.