

**Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum**  
**May 2019 Draft**

(Download and use to provide specific recommendations)

Include the chapter of the model curriculum, the page number, and line number(s) to ensure that the California Department of Education and Instructional Quality Commission can reference the content of the document when reviewing your comments. Please email this document as a Word document to [ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov](mailto:ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov). You may contact Kenneth McDonald, Education Programs Consultant, at [kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov](mailto:kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov) with any questions regarding this template or the public input process.

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
GENERAL	California School Boards Association (CSBA)	<p>According to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines adopted by the State Board of Education, the model curriculum is to be in a language that is inclusive and supportive of multiple users, including teachers (single and multiple-subject), support staff, administrators and the community. It also must also address several issues regarding administrative and teacher support, including being easy to use both for teachers with educational backgrounds in ethnic studies and those without such experience.</p> <p>As currently written, the model curriculum is not accessible for multiple users, especially those that have no experience in ethnic studies. The language used and many of the sample course models are very specific to those with an ethnic studies background.</p> <p>The model curriculum should include course outlines that allow for ethnic studies to be taught as a stand-alone course <u>or</u> integrated into an existing course (e.g. sociology, English language arts, and history).</p> <p>There are few examples of how the curriculum can be integrated into current courses, and even less information on how to incorporate ethnic study lessons.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 2 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Race and ethnicity have played a critical role in the development of American life and history and should be incorporated in the broad context of the educational curriculum as the important, influential factor that it is. This model curriculum does not sufficiently place race and ethnicity in a context to be properly taught, much less understood, by California students. As currently written, the model curriculum provides little real context for understanding “why” people are treated differently, why they had separate “American Experiences.” Additionally, there is little focus on institutional influences and regional histories that helped to shape group experiences that have come to shape American life. The model curriculum provides little ability to analyze and place into context the interplay between culture, public policy, media, law enforcement and the courts. It appears to pluck from the air people and events to communicate complex historical circumstances and misses opportunities to teach broader, more meaningful lessons.</p> <p>People of Color are more than the sum of negative interactions with American institutions and society. The story that ethnic studies should be sharing is how those negative experiences originated, how people overcame the circumstances, and the lessons that can be learned from history.</p>
<b>CHAPTER ONE</b>  <b>Introduction and Overview</b>	CSBA	<p>The Introduction is laden with jargon that make the document unwieldy and unusable as a resource for those with limited or no background in Ethnic Studies. The guidelines approved by the State Board of Education state that the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum "shall be easy to use both for teachers with educational backgrounds in Ethnic Studies, and those without such experience," but the introduction fails to meet such a standard. Terms such as "hxrstory," "cisheteropatriarchy," and "hegemony" are not accessible for audiences seeking to understand the most fundamental aspects of Ethnic Studies.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 3 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>To assist educators and local policy makers who are unfamiliar with Ethnic Studies, the <i>Benefits of Ethnic Studies</i> (Pages 6-8, Lines 134-171) and <i>Approaches to Ethnic Studies</i> (Pages 8-11, Lines 172-252) should be moved immediately after <i>Defining Ethnic Studies</i> (Pages 1-3, Lines 19-79) to provide readers with a better understanding of the nature of Ethnic Studies.</p> <p>This foundational understanding should be established before describing the history and background that begins on Page 3 of the current draft.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 11, Line 245</p> <p>This line “Ethnic Studies should be an essential core component of every students K-12 education experience” is too overarching. It would be more appropriate to say something along the lines of: “Learning about different cultural backgrounds and the contributions of diverse people should be a core component of every students K-12 education experience, which can be accomplished through Ethnic Studies.”</p> <p>This is a model curriculum, and while it provides a basis to establish programs in grades 9-12, it does not address all the needs for a K-12 curriculum and is outside the State Board of Education Guidelines and the authorizing legislation.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 4 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Pages 12 and 13</p> <p>Every district that implements Ethnic Studies can do so by having conversations with teachers, administrators, community leaders and other stakeholders in order to lay out principles and standards for the ethnic studies lessons that they will offer, how they will be approved and whether they can meet A-G or other requirements (when appropriate). The principles in this section can be used as a starting point for laying out the principles for the lessons in each LEA.</p> <p>El Rancho USD provides an excellent example of Ethnic Studies implementation which was driven by their teachers and other local stakeholders. LEAs should develop ethnic studies program(s) with careful attention to local context, co-constructing it in consultation with stakeholders. The information provided through the curriculum should allow local communities to have important conversations that can lead to buy-in from the diverse stakeholders required to make this sustainable.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 16, Line 387</p> <p>This section needs to be expanded, adding a new paragraph to stress the importance of the need for ongoing Anti-Bias/Sensitivity Training and Trauma Informed Practices from a cross-cultural lens for Ethnic Studies Educators.</p> <p>It is critical that educators of these courses are skilled at facilitation of diverse groups, understand how to incorporate all aspects of culture in the curriculum and are reflective about teaching from multiple perspectives.</p>

## Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 5 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Page 21, Line 518</p> <p>As an Ethnic Studies teacher, it is important that the educator also do the self-reflection assignments that they ask their students to do. It will allow them to share their experiences and perspectives. This will help strengthen the relationship with the students and the teacher through building trust and empathy.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 22, Line 544</p> <p>There needs to be a balanced focus on content and process. It is critical to pay attention to “how” we are learning through relationship building and sharing of stories and perspectives.</p> <p>Learning “how to learn” and be open to different perspectives is a critical component for building upon deeper concepts. The concepts should include the “whole” story from the beginning and not “secondly” with history that began in the United States.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 6 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Page 22, Line 546</p> <p>The use of debriefing activities is important to assist students in learning from the shared experiences of their peers.</p> <p>Questions should be scaffolded for learners and include opportunities to process learning and emotions. Students should be given different ways to debrief and express their feelings in a safe manner.</p> <p>This should include journaling as a process and strategy for students to document learning while improving their writing skills.</p> <p>Questions can include: What did you learn about yourself? About others? What questions do you still have? What emotions were provoked?</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 22, Line 550</p> <p>This section can include multiple activities in the book, Cultural Proficiency: Manual for School Leaders by Dr. Randell B. Lindsey (i.e. What's in a Name, Cultural Perceptions, etc.).</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 7 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p><u>Key Considerations for District and Site Administrators, pp. 24-26</u></p> <p>This section does not sufficiently provide the "information for district and school administrators to support the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum and Instruction" set out as a guideline for the Model Curriculum (SBE, 2018).</p> <p>Recommend that the draft be revised to incorporate a separate section/appendix that provides more concrete resources for administrators interested in developing and implementing Ethnic Studies.</p> <p>For a recent example, consider the draft of the Computer Science Standards (Appendix: Guide for Leadership), which addresses communication, building capacity, and sustainability. It would also be helpful to provide a figure which visually presents possible types of implementation (electives with themes, electives distinguished by the four core areas, integration, etc.).</p>
<p><b>CHAPTER TWO</b></p> <p><b>Sample Course Models</b></p>	CSBA	<p>Page 4, Line 95 -- "Femmes" needs to be defined for the reader.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 5, Line 104</p> <p>Sample Lesson 1 should be switched with Page 14, Line 259 Sample Lesson 2, to create a smoother flow. It is critical to start by building community first through reflection and sharing.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 8 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Page 15, Line 267</p> <p>Needs to include the establishment of community guidelines in the first day/week of class lesson plan. Also, confidentiality is key when students share personal experiences, thus it is necessary to build a high level of trust in the classroom starting on day one.</p>
	CSBA	Page 62, Line 1300 -- Change spelling to “Willie”
	CSBA	Page 71, Line 5 -- Consider student self-assessment, group assessment as well.
	CSBA	<p>Page 74, Line 1587 -- All presented activities need a note to include:</p> <p><u>Debrief</u>: What did you learn about yourself and others? What were the similarities? What stood out for you? Share your own thoughts and feelings.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 94, Line 2059</p> <p>Needs to include a debrief section - <u>Debrief</u>: What did it feel like to ask for rights/ What did it feel like to sit and listen to the demands? What did you learn from this activity? How might this relate to your current life experiences/community?</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 95, Line 2083</p> <p>Sample Lesson 3 -- While this was the most creative lesson and well thought-out, it did not go deep enough to the roles of the experience of Native students who continue to face discrimination on so many levels. It referred to food and fun but was very different from the other lessons.</p>



## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 9 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Page 98, Line 2146</p> <p>The talking pieces is a Native tradition. It is critical that this is not the place to replace it with “once mic, one voice.”</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 148, Line 2998</p> <p>Provide student guidelines for Oral Presentations and ensure that safe space has been established for students to share in front of peers.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 232, Line 4919</p> <p>This represents a good lesson but needs to link to some of the current issues faced by Native Americans around discrimination. It can address the lack of understanding of important symbols, different styles of communication, and impact of cultural destruction, trauma and poverty.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 300, Line 6458</p> <p>Every lesson plan should include as part of closure, “How has taking this class changed my perspective of the group studied? How do I see my role as a citizen in contributing to change in the future?”</p>
<b>General Comment</b>	CSBA	<p>Lessons should be enhanced by the voices of ethnic people represented in the course. This can include videos, documentaries, books and real and virtual fieldtrips, as well as real voices of community elders.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 10 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>  <b>UC Approved Course Outlines/Overviews</b>	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 3, Line 82  As part of the Curriculum Review Team, consider including the following: Ethnic Studies Educators from college/university, researchers, historians, elders of respective ethnic groups, etc.
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 4, Line 102  Consider conducting a focus group with stakeholders, students, teachers, parents, administrators and other members of the school/ethnic communities.
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 11, Line 236  Include stronger and more explicit language than “consider” Community Reflection. This should be emphasized as a significant part of the process of learning and integrating new information, and should be a regular part of every class experience.

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 11 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
General Comment	CSBA	<p>When rolling out ethnic studies courses, it is important for school boards and school leaders to be strategic with a plan to address resistance or conflict that may arise. This could include political, religious, racial or familial conflict. For example, student projects may include community or family engagement that can strike emotional harm stemming from past trauma. Students may also engage in conflict with each other and need conflict resolution strategies to manage the dynamics of differences in a constructive manner. Thus, safe space and norms must be established. A community plan is necessary to strategically message purpose and impact as well as outreach to parents and the community.</p> <p>Forming advisory committees within districts will help to ensure feedback, buy-in and ownership.</p>
General Comment	CSBA	<p>There is a great deal of flexibility in adopting materials. It is important to get reliable input during the adoption process and should include input from experts in the field, members of the respective ethnic communities, college/university professors and researchers. When adopting curriculum, it is critical to have a process for selection, evaluation and adjustment of courses/curriculum. This should include monitoring the impact of graduation, attendance, achievement and school climate.</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 12 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>  <b>Glossary and Bibliographies</b>  <b>General Comment</b>	<b>CSBA</b>	<p>As Ethnic Studies expands beyond the four original core fields of African American Studies, Asian American Studies, Chicano/a/x and Latina/o/x Studies, and Native American Studies, the role of anti-Semitism in both individual and collective histories warrants inclusion. According to the model curriculum guidelines, the curriculum "shall be inclusive, creating space for all students regardless of race, ethnicity, class, gender, sexuality, or citizenship, to learn different perspectives." Yet while Islamophobia is defined, as is BDS (Boycott, Divest, and Sanction), anti-Semitism is left undefined within the glossary draft. For students who identify as ethnically or culturally Jewish, this omission might send the message that Ethnic Studies is lacking balance or inclusivity.</p> <p>The glossary section should be expanded to include more vocabulary (i.e. colorism, Cultural Proficiency, etc.). The bibliography section should include the work of Dr. Randell Lindsey, focused on the Cultural Proficiency Framework.</p>
	<b>CSBA</b>	<p>Page 1, Line 14</p> <p>Recommend replacing the word "attacking" with "challenging" or "confronting," as the term "attacking" connotes violence.</p>
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 1, Line 16 -- Remove and define “allyship” separately.
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 1, Line 19 -- It should be “Inuit” – remove the “s”
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 2, Line 29 -- Include definitions for bigotry and bias.

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 13 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	<p>Page 4, Line 89</p> <p>Recommend adding a contrasting definition for "cultural appreciation" to address potential confusion. Possible language: "This is in contrast to cultural appreciation, in which elements of a culture are adopted or referenced with a respect and understanding of the original culture."</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 5, Line 109 – Include the definition for discrimination.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 7, Line 159 – This may need to be referenced as “First Nations.”</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 7, Lines 161-166</p> <p>While the entry for "gender" discusses a broader concept of gender as a spectrum, it does not first begin with a definition that acknowledges gender as a social construct. According to the American Psychological Association, gender "refers to the attitudes, feelings and behaviors that a given culture associates with a person's biological sex. Behavior that is compatible with cultural expectations is referred to as gender-normative; behaviors that are viewed as incompatible with these expectations constitute gender non- conformity" (2012). From this definition, or one similar, the remainder of the glossary entry (challenging the binary model) could be incorporated.</p>
	CSBA	<p>Page 8, Line 196</p> <p>It would be useful to have the United Nations definition included in the footnotes, the same as was done for genocide.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 14 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 9, Line 204 – Include definitions for “inter-cultural communication,” “implicit bias” and “inclusion.”
	<b>CSBA</b>	<p>Page 10, Lines 230-231</p> <p>The definition of intersectionality should credit Kimberlé Crenshaw (as others are credited in similar entries...e.g., Gloria Anzaldua for <i>Nepantlas</i>, p. 11). It would also help readers unfamiliar with the term to provide examples of marginalized identity types (race, sex and gender, class, etc.).</p>
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 10, Line 236 – It may be necessary to remove the “s”, the way the definition is written.
	<b>CSBA</b>	Page 12, Line 290 – Define “prejudice” in this this section.
	<b>CSBA</b>	<p>Page 13, Line 308 – Perhaps consider the following definition:</p> <p>Privilege – a special advantage or benefit not enjoyed by everyone often unearned and invisible, conferred upon people solely based on their membership in a particular group.</p>
	<b>CSBA</b>	<p>Page 13, Lines 314-316</p> <p>The definition of racism should either incorporate a description of "structural racism" or a separate definition should be added to the glossary, as it is helpful for students to see the manifestation of racism as a system in which laws, policies, institutions and other norms that reinforce racial inequality.</p>

## Public Input Template—2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 15 of 15

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
	CSBA	Page 13, Line 323 – in this section, define “stereotype.”

CSBA Comments – August 14, 2019

California Department of Education, June 2019