



Educators for Excellence in Ethnic Studies

October 30, 2020

VIA EMAIL

Members of the Instructional Quality Commission
Governor Gavin Newsom
State Board of Education President Linda Darling-Hammond
The Honorable Tony Thurmond
Dr. Stephanie Gregson
Shanine Coats

Dear California Officials,

As educators, we support ethnic studies courses that confront racism, develop civic responsibility, and help to develop the 21st century skills that our students need to succeed in school, work, and life.

However, the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC) exacerbates polarization, inculcates a militant anti-capitalist agenda, and opens the door to antisemitism and other hatred. Its Guiding Values and Principles -- with which the sample lessons are aligned -- include "critique empire building" including "patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism," "connect...to resistance movements," and challenge "imperial/colonialist beliefs." Best practices in pedagogy dictate that lessons should be aligned with outcomes, not values. And when those Guiding Values and Principles are unbalanced and politically dogmatic, these lessons become indoctrination.

California educators simply cannot teach this ESMC and expect to accomplish the History-Social Science Framework's goal for ethnic studies, which is to encourage students "to think critically about the world around them [so they] develop a more complex understanding of the human experience [and] respect for cultural diversity and see the advantages of inclusion."

Changes **must be made** in order for us to have a pedagogically-sound curriculum that we are proud - not ashamed - to teach to our students. Please see the attached "Educators' Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests 10/2020" for specific information, including chapter, page and line numbers, clarifying the numerous pedagogical issues with the ESMC.

We urge you to remove the political agenda from the ESMC and its lessons by:

1. Aligning all lessons only to the impartial "Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies," and identifying those Outcomes as "Guiding Principles and Outcomes."
2. Removing the political agenda from the ESMC, including the "Guiding Values and Principles."
3. Providing course outlines that are balanced and unbiased, and that develop 21st century critical thinking skills.
4. Ensuring that the model and sample lessons are developmentally and social-emotionally appropriate for K-12 students.
5. Providing clear guidance about the role of educators in student civic engagement projects.

Thank you for your attention to these crucial problems in the ESMC.

Sincerely,
Lori Meyers
California Educator
For Educators for Excellence in Ethnic Studies

Boris Law
California Educator

CC: Brooks Allen, Jamie Callahan, Joey Freeman, Jennifer Johnson, Dr. Kenneth McDonald, Ann O'Leary, Emily Swide

Request for Changes in the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Draft 2
Submitted by Educators for Excellence in Ethnic Studies
October 30, 2020

This document details our recommendations regarding specific problems with the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum and includes chapter, page, and line numbers from the September 2020 draft.

Align model and sample lessons with the “Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies,” not with the “Guiding Values and Principles.”

Best practices in teaching dictate that lessons are developed with educational outcomes in mind. Understanding the outcome - or end goal - helps teachers to design lessons and assessments that result in students achieving the academic goals of a course. Lessons and courses that are developed to target specific goals and standards ensure that students learn what they are expected to learn.

However, the ESMC specifies that lessons should be aligned with the ESMC Guiding Values and Principles, rather than aligned with the “Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies.” Guiding Principles and Values are a direction toward goals, while Outcomes indicate specific educational goals and the means to achieve them. Guiding Principles and Values are a broad philosophy, and Outcomes are the basis for evaluative criteria. Both the Guiding Values and Principles and the Eight Outcomes are included in the ESMC Chapter 1.

Consequently, the ESMC should specify that lessons be aligned with “Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies,” not with the “Guiding Values and Principles” as they are now. The Outcomes are from Carlos E. Cortés’, “High School Ethnic Studies Graduation Requirement, State of California, Suggested Basic Curriculum Principles.”¹

Dr. Denise Clark Pope, curriculum studies specialist at Stanford Graduate School of Education, states that “The pedagogically sound way to measure the quality of lesson plans is to base assessments on the desired outcomes for students.” To that end, the ESMC and its lessons should be aligned with the Outcomes, rather than Guiding Values and Principles, and should be consistent with existing CA frameworks and state standards.

The following table contrasts the ESMC Guiding Values and Principles with both the Outcomes and the History-Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools. This comparison highlights notable differences between them, as well as the natural alignment between the Eight Outcomes and the current HSS Framework.

¹ In the ESMC, this section was adapted from Carlos E. Cortés, “High School Ethnic Studies Graduation Requirement, State of California, Suggested Basic Curriculum Principles,” essay dated June 26, 2020.
ESMC Educators’ Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests - 10/2020

ESMC Guiding Principles and Values	Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies	History-Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools
<p>Cultivate empathy, community actualization, cultural perpetuity^[1], self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being of all participants, <u>especially Native People/s and people of color</u></p>	<p>Pursuit of justice and equity. Ethnic studies...arose with the intent of giving voice to stories long silenced, including stories of injustice, marginalization, and discrimination, <u>as well as stories of those who became part of our nation in different ways, such as through slavery, conquest, colonization, and immigration.</u></p> <p>Developing a better understanding of others. With <u>mutual respect and dignity</u> being emphasized, <u>students will develop an appreciation for the complexity of diversity and how it continues to shape the American experience.</u> Additionally, students will learn how to transform their appreciation of diversity into action that aims to build community and solidarity.</p>	<p>Students can investigate the <u>history of the experience of various ethnic groups</u> in the United States, as well as the <u>diversity of these experiences</u> based on race, gender, and sexuality, among other identities.</p>
<p>Celebrate and honor Native People/s of the land and communities of color by providing a space to share <u>their stories of struggle and resistance</u>, along with their intellectual and cultural wealth;</p>	<p>Pursuit of justice and equity. Ethnic studies did not arise in a vacuum. It arose with the intent of giving voice to stories long silenced, <u>including stories of injustice, marginalization, and discrimination, as well as stories of those who became part of our nation in different ways, such as through slavery, conquest, colonization, and immigration.</u></p> <p>Furthering self understanding. Building from the concept of student-based inquiry, ethnic studies should <u>provide an opportunity for all students to examine their own ethnic heritages.</u> Increasing numbers of students have multiple ethnic heritages.</p>	<p>It is important for ethnic studies courses to <u>document the experiences of people of color</u> in order for students to construct counter-narratives and <u>develop a more complex understanding of the human experience.</u> Through these studies, students should develop <u>respect for cultural diversity and see the advantages of inclusion.</u></p>
<p><u>Center and place high value</u> on the</p>	<p>Working toward greater</p>	<p>From the earliest grade levels,</p>

pre-colonial, ancestral knowledge of <u>Native people/s and people of color</u> that is typically marginalized in society	inclusivity. California ethnic studies should emphasize educational equity by being <u>inclusive of all students, regardless of their backgrounds.</u> This means <u>incorporating the experiences of a broad range of ethnic groups.</u>	students learn... to respect the rights of the minority even if this minority is only a single, dissenting voice and <u>to recognize the dignity of every person.</u> High quality civic education fosters ... <u>respect for diversity and different points of view, ... respect for and support of the rights of others,</u> responsibility, equity and inclusiveness...
<u>Critique empire-building in history</u> and its relationship to white supremacy, racism [<u>patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism</u>] and other forms of power and oppression.	Promoting self-empowerment for civic engagement. Ethnic studies ...can help students become more astute in <u>critically analyzing documents, historical events, and multiple perspectives...</u> It can help students learn to present their ideas in <u>strong, compelling, jargon-free language.</u>	Students <u>interpret past events and issues in their original context, rather than in terms of present-day norms and values,</u> while explaining how perspectives of people in the present shape interpretations of the past. Students use deliberative discussion, including consideration of <u>multiple points of view,</u> in making decisions or judgments on controversial political and social issues.
<u>Challenge imperialist/colonial [and hegemonic] beliefs</u> and practices on multiple levels (ideological, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized]	Pursuit of justice and equity. Ethnic studies should address those experiences...with both <u>honesty and nuance, drawing upon multiple perspectives...</u> The exploration of injustice and inequality <u>should not merely unearth the past. It should also create a better understanding of dissimilar and unequal ethnic trajectories</u> in order to strive for a future of greater equity and inclusivity.	Students will become aware of the <u>constant themes of social justice and responsibility, while recognizing these are defined differently over time"</u> <u>Examine how race and ethnicity have been constructed</u> in the United States, have changed over time, and continue to shape the country today. High quality civic education fosters respect for legitimate authority, <u>opposition to tyranny...</u>
<u>Connect ourselves to past and contemporary resistance movements</u> that <u>struggle</u> for social justice on the global and local levels to ensure a truer democracy.	Promoting self-empowerment for civic engagement. ...Can also help students <u>connect current resistance movements to those of</u>	Students may consider how to <u>improve their own community,</u> what <u>constructive actions</u> can be taken, and whether they are providing a <u>model for change</u> [in their

<p>Notes: “True Democracy” is a synonym for communism. It is a Marxist term for the elimination of private property.²</p> <p>In addition, this is potentially in violation of the CA Education Code 51530 Article 4. Advocacy or Teaching of Communism³: “No teacher giving instruction...shall advocate or teach communism with the intent to indoctrinate or to inculcate in the mind of any pupil a preference for communism.”</p>	<p><u>the past</u>, and to imagine new possibilities for a true democracy. It can <u>help students assess various strategies for bringing about change...while evaluating the strengths and limitations of each approach</u>...Students can develop civic participation skills, a greater sense of self-empowerment, and a deeper commitment to life-long civic engagement.</p> <p>Developing a better understanding of others. Students will learn how to transform their appreciation of diversity into <u>action that aims to build community and solidarity</u>.</p> <p>Developing interpersonal communication. This includes the ability to meet, discuss, and analyze sometimes controversial topics and issues that <u>garner multiple diverse points of view</u>.”</p> <p>Notes: “True Democracy” is a synonym for communism. It is a Marxist term for the elimination of private property.⁴</p> <p>In addition, this is potentially in violation of the CA Education Code 51530 Article 4. Advocacy or Teaching of Communism⁵: “No teacher giving instruction...shall advocate or teach communism with the intent to indoctrinate or to inculcate in the mind of any pupil a preference for communism.”</p>	<p>communities] and for those in other parts of the state, country, and world.</p> <p>(The curriculum should include) opportunities to teach students “to both understand our increasingly complex society and <u>participate fully in our democratic system</u>”.</p> <p>High quality civic education fosters <u>respect for legitimate authority</u>...being informed and interested in political and community issues, and <u>active participation in civic life</u>.</p>
<p><u>Conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for post-imperial life</u> that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and</p>	<p>Pursuit of justice and equity. The exploration of injustice and inequality...should ...<u>strive for a future of greater equity and inclusivity</u>.</p>	<p>People demonstrate civic engagement when they address public problems individually and collaboratively and when they <u>maintain, strengthen, and improve</u></p>

² Mikkel Flohr, “The Young Marx on Constituent Power and ‘True Democracy.’,” Roskilde University Research Portal, September 10, 2016, <https://forskning.ruc.dk/en/publications/the-young-marx-on-constituent-power-and-true-democracy>.

³ California Education Code §51530 Article 4 (1976), https://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=EDC.

⁴ Mikkel Flohr, “The Young Marx on Constituent Power and ‘True Democracy.’,” Roskilde University Research Portal, September 10, 2016, <https://forskning.ruc.dk/en/publications/the-young-marx-on-constituent-power-and-true-democracy>.

⁵ California Education Code §51530 Article 4 (1976), https://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=EDC.

radical healing.	<p>Developing a better understanding of others. With mutual respect and dignity being emphasized, students will develop an appreciation for the complexity of diversity and how it continues to shape the American experience. Additionally, <u>students will learn how to transform their appreciation of diversity into action that aims to build community and solidarity.</u></p>	<p><u>communities and societies.</u></p> <p>The desire of educators is to have <u>students recognize their responsibility as members of the global community to participate ethically and with humanity</u> in their interactions with various nations, cultures, and peoples.</p> <p>High quality civic education fosters respect for legitimate authority, opposition to tyranny, tolerance, respect for diversity and different points of view, adherence to law, respect for and support of the rights of others, responsibility, equity and inclusiveness, being informed and interested in political and community issues, and active participation in civic life.</p>
------------------	--	--

Recommendations:

- Rename the “Eight Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies” as “Guiding Principles and Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies” and align instruction and lessons to these outcomes.
- Because lessons and content in the ESMC are informed by and aligned with the existing Guiding Values and Principles, thoroughly review the curriculum to remove/revise content that reflects this alignment, including:
 - “Each unit and lesson plan should be founded on the key values and principles of ethnic studies as described in Chapter 1.” (Chapter 3, lines 730-31)
 - “These are the guiding values and principles each Ethnic Studies lesson should include.” (Chapter 1, lines 181-82)
 - “The following sample lessons are aligned to the ethnic studies values, principles...” (Appendix B, line 45).
 - Remove the “Guiding Values and Principles” (Appendix B lines 49–64).
 - Remove the Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment listed in individual lessons (Appendix B, lines 136, 242, 382, 622, 736, 968, 1123, 1326, 1529, 1715, 1889, 2262, 2468, 2759).

Remove the political agenda from the ESMC, including the Guiding Values and Principles

Political agendas have no place in K-12 classrooms. Teaching a one-sided political agenda opposes the Common Core State Standards for ELA⁶, which state that “Students actively seek to understand other perspectives and cultures through reading and listening, and they...evaluate other points of view critically and constructively.” In addition, for CA public school teachers, a one-sided political agenda violates the National Education Association Code of Ethics⁷ that states that teachers “Shall not unreasonably deny the student's access to varying points of view.”

The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards (C3 Framework)⁸, which is cited in the History Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools⁹, asserts that “students need the intellectual power to...separate evidence-based claims from parochial opinions.” When one-sided parochial political opinions are being taught as factual in the classroom, then this equates to political indoctrination. In fact, elements of the political ideology espoused in the ESMC and the exclusion of others may violate Assembly Bill 331 which stipulates that the ESMC “Not reflect or promote, directly or indirectly, any bias, bigotry, or discrimination against any person or group of persons on the basis of any category protected by Section 220.”

Political bias is embedded in the Guiding Values and Principles (“critique empire building” and challenge “imperial/colonialist beliefs,” including “patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism.”), advocating an anti-capitalist political agenda. Because lessons are aligned with these Guiding Values and Principles, political bias becomes embedded throughout the ESMC and in the sample lessons, as well.

One example is the lesson about the Third World Liberation Front (Appendix A). This lesson presents a monolithic, positive view of the organization and avoids discussing the highly controversial nature of their mission which included: anti-capitalism; pro-militancy; support for communist governments in China, Cuba, Laos and North Korea; opposing self-determination for Jewish people in Israel; and berating non-violent US civil rights leaders as “docile.”

Recommendations:

- Revise the Guiding Values and Principles to remove political bias and comply with accepted standards for K-12 to be free of a specific political viewpoint or frame of reference.

⁶ California Common Core State Standards English Language Arts & Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects

⁷ Nea, “Code of Ethics,” NEA, 2020, <https://www.nea.org/resource-library/code-ethics>.

⁸ National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards: Guidance for Enhancing the Rigor of K-12 Civics, Economics, Geography, and History. Silver Spring, MD. <http://www.socialstudies.org/c3>

⁹ History-Social Science Framework - History-Social Science Framework (CA Dept of Education), 2016, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/cf/hssframework.asp>.

- Because lessons and content in the ESMC are informed by and aligned with the existing Guiding Values and Principles, thoroughly review the curriculum to remove/revise content that reflects this alignment, including:
 - Remove Chapter 1, Lines 173-199
 - Remove Chapter 3, Lines 730-747
 - Remove the “Guiding Values and Principles” (Appendix B lines 49–64).
 - Remove the Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment listed in individual lessons (Appendix B, lines 136, 242, 382, 622, 736, 968, 1123, 1326, 1529, 1715, 1889, 2262, 2468, 2759).

Provide course outlines that are balanced and unbiased, and that develop 21st century critical thinking skills.

Educators need lessons - sample course outlines and existing UC-approved course outlines - that we can teach right out of the box. These lessons must actively develop the collaboration, critical thinking, communication, and creativity that our students need in order to succeed in school, work, and life. This requires that they teach multiple perspectives and points of view. They cannot teach one-sided perspectives and dogma.

The California Department of Education supports this. As stated in the Civic Learning Task Force Final Report (CDE)¹⁰, teachers should “encourage informed, respectful discussion and debate among all students, and work to ensure participation by all students.” Students should “comprehend as well as critique,” “value evidence,” and “evaluate other points critically and constructively” (Common Core State Standards for ELA¹¹).

However, compare this with the ESMC Guiding Values and Principles, which call for students to “critique empire building” “challenge imperialist/colonialist beliefs,” and “imagine...new possibilities for post-imperial life that promote...transformative resistance.”

Objectives from the CCSS like “comprehend”, “evaluate,” and “examine” result in students critically thinking to form evidence-based conclusions. The Guiding Principles and Values from the ESMC like “critique,” “challenge,” and “promote” presume a predetermined outcome and obviate the need for analysis.

The Los Angeles Unified School District Elements of a Balanced Curriculum for Ethnic Studies¹² and LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice¹³ are examples of guiding documents that inform a balanced, unbiased curriculum. Their principles promote viewpoint diversity, the “values of civic engagement and civic responsibility,” and “rigorous analysis of history” as required by the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines.¹⁴

¹⁰ “Revitalizing K-12 Civic Learning In California: A Blueprint For Action,”

<https://www.cde.ca.gov/eo/in/documents/cltffinalreport.pdf>.

¹¹ California Common Core State Standards English Language Arts & Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects, 2013, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/be/st/ss/documents/finalelaccsstandards.pdf>

¹² Los Angeles Unified School District’s Elements of a Balanced Curriculum for Ethnic Studies

<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf> or see attached

¹³ LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidelines on Social Justice, n.d.

<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Social%20Justice%202017.pdf> or see attached

¹⁴ “Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines.” Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines - Curriculum Frameworks & Instructional Materials (CA Dept of Education), 2020. <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/ethnicguidelines.asp>.
ESMC Educators’ Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests - 10/2020

The following table compares several of the ESMC's Guiding Principles and Values with the LAUSD Elements of a Balanced Curriculum and LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice.

ESMC Guiding Principles and Values	LAUSD Elements of a Balanced Curriculum	LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice
<u>Critique empire-building in history</u> and its relationship to white supremacy, racism [patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism] <u>and other forms of power and oppression.</u>	<p><u>Promote critical thinking about</u> the complexity of the intersections of race with gender, class, sexuality and other <u>systems of difference that have power effects and result in privilege.</u></p> <p>Teach students to understand the concepts of intersectionality, power, privilege and/or oppression in relation to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Their own identities as human beings and acknowledging their ancestral roots.</u> • <u>The complexity and diversity of the American experience</u> 	An ethnic studies course should <u>provide students with depth of understanding</u> in relation to ethnic and social issues, <u>rather than promoting specific political activism, demonstration, protest or the like.</u> (Yang, 2010, pg. 14).
<u>Challenge imperialist/colonial [and hegemonic] beliefs</u> and practices on multiple levels [ideological, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized]	<u>Examine how race and ethnicity have been constructed</u> in the United States, have changed over time, and continue to shape the country today (History-Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, 2016).	Students will become aware of the <u>constant themes of social justice and responsibility, while recognizing these are defined differently over time</u> " (History-Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, p. 420).
<p>Connect ourselves to past and contemporary <u>resistance movements that struggle</u> for social justice on the global and local levels to ensure a <u>truer democracy.</u></p> <p>Notes: "True Democracy" is a synonym for communism. It is a Marxist term for the elimination of private property.¹⁵</p> <p>In addition, this is potentially in violation of the CA Education Code 51530 Article 4. Advocacy or Teaching of Communism¹⁶: "No teacher giving instruction...shall advocate or teach communism with the intent to indoctrinate or to inculcate in the mind of any pupil a</p>	<p>(The curriculum should include) opportunities to teach students "to both understand our increasingly complex society and <u>participate fully in our democratic system</u>" (History-Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, 2016).</p>	<p>Students may consider how to <u>improve their own community</u>, what <u>constructive actions</u> can be taken, and whether they are providing a <u>model for change</u> [in their communities] and for those in other parts of the state, country, and world. (History-Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, p. 422)</p> <p>Should include examples of civic engagement (e.g., <u>voting and other peaceful social justice activities</u>) and the impact they have had on United States history...(teacher should ensure that) activities are lawful, peaceful, and nonviolent.</p>

¹⁵ Mikkel Flohr, "The Young Marx on Constituent Power and 'True Democracy,'" Roskilde University Research Portal, September 10, 2016, <https://forskning.ruc.dk/en/publications/the-young-marx-on-constituent-power-and-true-democracy>.

¹⁶ California Education Code §51530 Article 4 (1976), https://leginfo.ca.gov/faces/codes_displayText.xhtml?lawCode=EDC.
ESMC Educators' Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests - 10/2020

preference for communism.”		Students will <u>learn about social justice and social responsibility, and understand that they can become agents of change</u> at local, state, national, and global levels.
----------------------------	--	---

Recommendations:

- Revise the Guiding Values and Principles to protect against political bias and to comply with accepted standards for K-12 to present diverse viewpoints and promote critical analysis.
- Include principles from the LAUSD Elements of a Balanced Curriculum and LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice to provide guidance ensuring that Ethnic Studies lessons are balanced and unbiased.
- Because lessons and content in the ESMC are informed by and aligned with the existing Guiding Values and Principles, thoroughly review the curriculum to remove/revise content that reflects this alignment, including:
 - Remove the parenthetical examples which only show an extreme perspective of Black political thought: “Evolution of Black Political and Intellectual Thought (e.g., racial accommodationism, Black nationalism, and revolutionary intercommunalism).” (Appendix B, lines 714-15).
 - Revise the focus on “eras” and instead compare and contrast the “approaches and accomplishments of the Civil Rights and Black Power Movements.” (Appendix B, line 723)
 - Recognize the importance of non-violent resistance and civic engagement and do not denigrate those who work within the system to improve it. The Materials and Resources for Lesson 4: Social Change and #BlackLivesMatter¹⁷ (Appendix B, lines 704-06) describe non-violent change agents such as John Lewis and Martin Luther King as “passive” and “docile.” While it is legitimate to study both approaches to change, “more militant tactics” should not be presented to students as the preferred or only good solution.
- Add a balanced sample of refugees from a wider variety of political orientations. Refugee issues mentioned throughout Appendix B fit the Guiding Values’ political criteria, but ignore the many ethnic groups fleeing from Marxist or Maoist persecution including a large number of Chinese-Americans and Cambodians, among others. It also ignores the large number of economic refugees, who emigrated to the US for job opportunities, given the strong US economy and economic problems in Latin American and various parts of Asia. More balanced examples should be added.

¹⁷ Jamilah Pitts, “Bringing Black Lives Matter Into the Classroom: Part II,” Teaching Tolerance, 2017, <https://www.tolerance.org/magazine/summer-2017/bringing-black-lives-matter-into-the-classroom-part-ii>.
ESMC Educators’ Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests - 10/2020

- Include the LAUSD Ethnic Studies Survey Course¹⁸ in the Appendix A A-G approved courses.

Ensure that the model and sample lessons are developmentally appropriate for K-12 students per accepted standards of grade-level civic readiness.

The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards (C3 Framework)¹⁹, which is included in the History Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools²⁰, specifies that civics education “teaches the virtues—such as honesty, mutual respect, cooperation, *and* attentiveness to multiple perspectives—that citizens should use when they interact with each other on public matters. Principles such as equality, freedom, liberty, respect for individual rights, and deliberation apply to both official institutions and informal interactions among citizens.”

These principles are taught differently at different ages/grades, and it’s essential that instruction and resources are appropriate for the grades at which they are being taught. The C3 specifies a progression of grade-level civic readiness for students with which curricula and lessons should comply (see Table 10: Suggested K-12 Pathway for College, Career, and Civic Readiness.” The C3 instructional goal by the end of 12th grade is for students to “Analyze the impact and the appropriate roles of personal interests and perspectives on the application of civic virtues, democratic principles, constitutional rights, and human rights.”

As an example, contrast this with the instructional goals and related resources in an introductory Ethnic Studies course, included in the ESMC, designed for students as young as 9th grade. The goals of this specific lesson are for students to “connect resistance movements...to themselves” and to study how media can “promote people’s empowerment against oppression.” This goal is very different than the one stated in the History Social Science Framework, which states that “the influence of the media on the framing and formation of identity” is a potential Ethnic Studies theme. The reading for this specific lesson includes “Malcolm, Garvey, Huey” by Dead Prez (Appendix A, line 2045), which contains these lyrics:

“I study Malcolm Garvey Huey, Malcolm Garvey Huey
 Monster Kody (*violent L.A. gang member who earned his nickname by beating a victim until he was disfigured*) with a UZI, listening to Fela Kuti
 I’m a goon with the machete, especially if it’s deadly
 Got the Santos for the Xe to protect me, so respect me
 This is heavy legendary, revolutionary...
 Bang bang, pig shooting, we should blame Rudy Julie...
 Unless you’re banging on the system, you’re a gangsta wearing panties...
 Police cannot stand me packing y’all like a manny

¹⁸ “Ethnic Studies Survey Course,” LAUSD Instructional Materials, n.d., <https://achieve.lausd.net/Page/5106>.

¹⁹ National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards: Guidance for Enhancing the Rigor of K-12 Civics, Economics, Geography, and History. Silver Spring, MD. <http://www.socialstudies.org/c3>

²⁰ History-Social Science Framework - History-Social Science Framework (CA Dept of Education), 2016, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/cf/hssframework.asp>.

Call me Little Bobby Hutton (*Treasurer of the Black Panther Party who ambushed and wounded two Oakland police officers*), cause I'm first to push the button
Rappers don't be saying nothing to the system, we say fuck 'em"

The goals of this lesson and materials provided do not support the C3 instructional goals related to civic virtues and democratic principles; rather, they assign value to violence. In addition, by highlighting these lyrics as an example of "promot(ing) empowerment against oppression," this lesson is at odds with Ethnic Studies goals of "promot(ing) the values of civic engagement and civic responsibility"²¹ to enact change. Finally, students in 9th grade can be as young as 14 years old. Consistent standards must be applied to ensure the age-appropriateness of instruction and material.

Recommendations

- In the ESMC Chapter 1, revise the Guiding Values and Principles to safeguard against the promotion of violence and to ensure age-inappropriate instruction and material.
- Include the following guidelines from the attached "LAUSD's Elements of a Balanced Curriculum"²² and the LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice²³:
 - The instruction, material, or discussion must be appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students, and be a fair and balanced academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship.
 - Should include examples of civic engagement (e.g., voting and other peaceful social justice activities) and the impact they have had on United States history...(the teacher should ensure that) activities are lawful, peaceful, and nonviolent.
- Evaluate all content and resources against consistent standards for age and grade appropriateness before including them in the ESMC.
- Because lessons and content in the ESMC are informed by and aligned with the existing Guiding Values and Principles, thoroughly review the curriculum to remove/revise content that reflects this alignment.

²¹ "Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines." Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Guidelines - Curriculum Frameworks & Instructional Materials (CA Dept of Education), 2020. <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/ethnicguidelines.asp>.

²² Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, LAUSD Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017, <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf>

²³ Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice, 2017, Los Angeles Unified School District, <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Social%20Justice%202017.pdf>
ESMC Educators' Detailed Analysis and Revision Requests - 10/2020

Provide clear guidance about the role of educators in student civic engagement projects.

Civic engagement projects are a proven method for grounding student learning in real-world action and preparing students for lives as active and engaged citizens. The History Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools²⁴ states that, “Whenever possible, opportunities should be available for participation and for reflection on the responsibilities of citizens in a free society.” Proven Practice #3 of the 6 Proven Practices of Civic Learning²⁵ calls for teachers to “identify curricular objectives that align with the project,...determine specific learning objectives and work with students to ...meet those objectives.”

The ESMC calls for “ethnic studies courses to include a community engagement project that allows for students to use their knowledge and voice to affect social transformation in their community.” However, it’s essential that guidelines should be included specifically to address the possibility that a movement chosen by a teacher or student has faced criticism, including from individuals, organizations, intellectuals, and leaders who are part of various ethnic minority groups. Per the History Social Science Framework, students “should learn to respect the rights of the minority even if this minority is only a single, dissenting voice and to recognize the dignity of every person.” LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice guides against “promoting specific political activism, demonstration, protest, or the like” and calls for community engagement projects to be “lawful, peaceful, and nonviolent.”

The ESMC currently does not contain such guidelines.

Recommendations:

- Revise the Guiding Values and Principles to promote peaceful democratic engagement and to safeguard against the promotion of specific political activism and violent protest.
- Because lessons and content in the ESMC are informed by and aligned with the existing Guiding Values and Principles, thoroughly review the curriculum to remove/revise content that reflects this alignment and elevates violent resistance, including:
 - The inclusion of a book edited by Rabab Abdulhadi, professor at SFSU’s College of Ethnic Studies, as a resource. Raba Abdulhadi has said, “We really idolize somebody like Leila Khalid (convicted hijacker and member of a terrorist group on the US and EU terror lists)...somebody who actually goes to a plane and hijacks it.” Rabab Abdulhadi recently invited Leila Khaled to speak at SFSU about “Gender, Justice, & *Resistance*: A conversation with Leila Khaled.” This resistance is violent and opposes the civic engagement that the History Social Science Framework for CA Public Schools²⁶ mandates. (Appendix A, line 1993)

²⁴ “History-Social Science Framework,” History-Social Science Framework - History-Social Science Framework (CA Dept of Education), 2016, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/cf/hssframework.asp>.

²⁵ Michael Hansen et al., “2018 Brown Center Report on American Education: An Inventory of State Civics Requirements,” Brookings (Brookings, July 5, 2018), <https://www.brookings.edu/research/2018-brown-center-report-on-american-education-an-inventory-of-state-civics-requirements/>.

²⁶ History-Social Science Framework - History-Social Science Framework (CA Dept of Education), 2016, <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/cf/hssframework.asp>.

- Resources attributed to Franz Fanon, the Marxist philosopher who argued that violence is a necessary tool of people’s political engagement, and who is mentioned six times in Appendix A. (Appendix A: lines 1718-19, 2028-29, 3544, 5133, 6239, 7492)
- Resources attributed to Mumia Abu Jamal, a Marxist advocate who murdered a police officer (Appendix A, line 2043).
- Clarify the term “resistance” throughout the ESMC so it reflects the civic engagement appropriate for a K-12 curriculum, similar to the LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice²⁷, which calls for “depth of understanding in relation to ethnic and social issues, rather than promoting specific political activism, demonstration, protest or the like.”²⁸ This includes:
 - Chapter 1, lines 188, 195, 198, 281
 - Chapter 3, lines 736, 743, 746, 899, 934
 - Appendix B, lines 53, 60, 63, 635, 639, 665
- Add guidelines for civic engagement projects to the ESMC to protect against the promotion of political activism and to ensure lawful and peaceful civic engagement. similar to these in the LAUSD Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice:
 - An ethnic studies course should provide students with depth of understanding in relation to ethnic and social issues, rather than promoting specific political activism, demonstration, protest or the like. Ethnic studies is a scientific inquiry of ethnic groups and their interrelations.²⁹
 - Students who are considering volunteering, social justice activities, community engagement, etc., should consult with their school teacher/advisor and parents/guardians to evaluate that the activities are lawful, peaceful, and nonviolent.

²⁷ Ethnic Studies Guidance on Social Justice, 2017, Los Angeles Unified School District, <https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Social%20Justice%202017.pdf>

²⁸ Yang, Philip. Ethnic Studies: Issues and Approaches. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2000.

²⁹ Yang, Philip. Ethnic Studies: Issues and Approaches. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2000.