

**Institute of Curriculum Services' (ICS) Review of the
December 11, 2020 Third Field Review Draft of the
Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC)
for the California State Board of Education
January 21, 2020**

Navigation Notes:

CDE: Click this link <https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/cf/modelcurriculumprojects.asp> and select Third Field Review to access the December 2020 Third Field Review Draft of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

Review Legend:

~~Strikethrough~~ = Recommended deletion

Underline = Recommended addition

Comments = Explanation and rationale provided to support recommendations

General Comments: The revisions made by the Instructional Quality Commission to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum at the November meeting are commendable and a significant improvement over the second draft. The revisions have clarified key concepts, added helpful implementation guidance for districts, and aligned the model curriculum to the State Board Guidelines, notably the requirement to be “inclusive and supportive of multiple users.... and encourage cultural understanding of how different groups have struggled and worked together....”

Especially strong are the four primary themes of the model curriculum: Identity, History and Movement, Systems of Power, and Social Movements and Equity. This thematic approach offers important advantages to teachers and districts designing their ethnic studies courses:

1. These themes can be used to teach about all ethnic groups including Jewish Americans.
2. Teachers can address how treatment of different groups changes over time, and explore diversity within a given ethnic group.
3. Diving into these themes illustrates commonalities, explores parallel experiences, and builds interethnic bridges of understanding.
4. The opening of Appendix A offers several pages of excellent essential questions, which frame all the lessons in a positive, non-divisive manner, and move lessons and curriculum away from an us-versus-them approach.
5. This shift to a thematic organization makes it easier to adapt syllabi to the demographics of the classroom or school district.

Given the centrality of the State Board Guidelines, we applaud the full inclusion of the Guidelines in the Preface. This will make it easier for districts and teachers to ensure alignment with the Guidelines as they develop or update ethnic studies classes.

The addition of sample lessons with a thematic approach on Jewish Americans, Sikh Americans, Vietnamese Americans, Armenian Americans, Arab Americans, and others also meets the Guidelines and shows responsiveness to the call made in

thousands of public comments for inclusion from many California ethnic communities, which was echoed by Governor Newsom and Superintendent Thurmond.

We greatly appreciate that the California Department of Education wrote a detailed section for Appendix A providing examples of how teaching about additional groups adds to the ethnic studies classroom. While focusing on the four traditional disciplines, these additions move the model curriculum in a more inclusive direction that acknowledges that ethnic studies is a class for all California students.

We have organized our comments and recommendations on the Third Field Review into two sections. The first section addresses a few remaining concerns and offers specific actionable suggestions to strengthen consistency, clarity, and alignment across chapters. The second section highlights important changes made by the IQC which were reflected in the Third Field Review and which we believe should be retained in the final version of the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum.

Section 1: Third Field Draft ESMC Review

Preface

Preface, p. 4, footnote 1 to line 44, **Abridege:** “[1] Race: There are multiple definitions of race. One is that race is the idea that the human species is divided into distinct groups on the basis of inherited physical and behavioral differences. Genetic studies in the late 20th century refuted the existence of biogenetically distinct races, and scholars now argue that “races” are cultural interventions [inventions] reflecting specific attitudes and beliefs that were imposed on different populations in the wake of western European conquests beginning in the 15th century. Race, Human, *Encyclopedia Britannica*, Audrey Smedley, July 28, 2020 <https://www.britannica.com/topic/race-human>, accessed 9/1/2020.

~~Within the field of ethnic studies, 'race' is defined as "a (neo)colonial social construction. It is viewed as a “master category” based upon a Eurocentric biological fallacy that is central to inequitable power relations in society. In *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*, the authors note that “As a social and historical construct, the idea of race is primarily filtered through physical traits (phenotype), including pigmentation (skin color) and other physical features; where people's ancestral origins are from (precolonial geographic ancestry); cultural traits; and sometimes economic class. Since race produces material impacts, it also produces racial consciousness and facilitates the process of racialization and racial projects, including both the oppositional projects of racism/colorism/anti-Blackness/anti-Indigeneity and anti-racism/racial justice. The People of Color Power movements that emerged in the 1960s (“Black Power, Red Power, Brown Power, Yellow Power”) are key examples of how race has also been embraced and leveraged in the resistance against racism; they are the movements that Ethnic Studies rose from. In the United States today, races very broadly break down as people of color (POC) and white people.” Cuauhtin, R. T., Zavala, M., Sleeter, C., & Au, W. (Eds.). (2018). *Rethinking Ethnic Studies* (1st edition). Milwaukee, OR: Rethinking Schools.~~

Comments: Both definitions emphasize the constructed or invented nature of race, so that suggests the centrality of those concepts to the definition of the term. To keep the

definitions concise and digestible to teachers (and by extension, one that teachers can use with students), we recommend abridging the second definition. Much of the information that was provided goes beyond definition into ethnic studies history, which is addressed in detail in Chapter 1 of the model curriculum. Furthermore, the inclusion of this source text allows teachers to access more information if needed for their teaching purposes, while still providing a more succinct definition.

Preface, p. 5, Lines 61-64, **Change:** “The focus on the experiences of these four disciplines provides an opportunity for students to learn of the histories, cultures, struggles, and contributions to American society of these historically marginalized peoples which have ~~are~~ often been untold in U.S. history courses.”

Comments: This sentence presents an outdated depiction of what is taught in U.S. History in California. The California History-Social Science Framework was rewritten to include multiculturalism and to teach the stories of the many different groups who make up the American people. The current version of the California History-Social Science Framework, adopted by the CA SBE in 2016, has increased the integration of ethnic studies topics into general history classes. While recognizing the insufficiencies of both the current HSS Framework and how history is taught and implemented, it is not accurate to state that these stories are completely untold, but rather they have often been untold. These small changes make the assertion more accurate and grounded in California’s current HSS Framework.

Preface, p. 5, Lines 73-74, **Change:** “This model curriculum builds on the 2016 History-Social Science Framework to provide more depth on ~~is a step to rectifying omission of~~ the experiences and cultures of communities within California.”

Comments: The above sentence in the Preface would benefit from some refinement as they are based on broad generalizations, which may be true in some places, but do a disservice to the state’s 2016 *History-Social Science Framework*, which includes a wide array of perspectives and writings by key thinkers from the four traditional groups. The above slight tweaks would make the draft more accurate, connect to the HSS Framework as indicated by the Guidelines (“When appropriate, be consistent with the content and instructional shifts in the 2016 *History–Social Science Framework*”), and still maintain an emphasis on the four groups and the importance of their experiences.

California’s History-Social Science Framework adopted in 2016 went through a lengthy and rigorous review process that included robust public comment. Reflecting the success of the process, this Framework provides greater voice and agency to groups that have historically been marginalized in history courses.

The following are a few examples from the 2016 *History–Social Science Framework*, which provides guidance to educators on expectations of teaching history in California. From Grade Eleven – United States History and Geography: Continuity and Change in Modern United States History (Chapter 16). The following excerpts from Chapter 16 highlight the new California Framework’s broader coverage of various different civil rights movements, literature by key figures in those movements, and

collections of key ethnic studies primary sources. These examples underscore the appropriateness of amending the sentence above.

- “Students should understand the significance of President Obama’s election as the first African-American president and be able to place it in the context of the fight, both historical and ongoing, for African-American civil rights. Well-chosen readings heighten students’ sensitivity to the issues raised in this unit, such as *The Autobiography of Malcolm X*, Lerone Bennett’s *Before the Mayflower: A History of Black America*, Anne Moody’s *Coming of Age in Mississippi*, Ralph Ellison’s *Invisible Man*, Richard Wright’s *Native Son*, and Lorraine Hansberry’s *A Raisin in the Sun*.” (H-SS Framework, p. 568, lines 1187-1194)
- “The advances of the black Civil Rights Movement encouraged other groups—including women, Hispanics and Latinos, American Indians, Asian Americans, Pacific Islanders, LGBT Americans, students, and people with disabilities—to mount their own campaigns for legislative and judicial recognition of their civil equality. Students can use the question **How did various movements for equality build upon one another?** to identify commonalities in goals, organizational structures, forms of resistance, and members. Students can note major events in the development of these movements and their consequences. Students may study how Cesar Chavez, Dolores Huerta, and the United Farm Workers’ movement used nonviolent tactics, educated the general public about the working conditions in agriculture, and worked to improve the lives of farmworkers. Students should understand the central role of immigrants, including Latino Americans and Filipino Americans, in the farm labor movement. This context also fueled the brown, red, and yellow power movements. The manifestos, declarations, and proclamations of the movements challenged the political, economic, and social discriminations faced by their groups. They also sought to combat the consequences of their “second-class citizenship” by engaging in grassroots mobilization?” (H-SS Framework, pp. 568-569, lines 1195-1212.)
- “*Asian Americans: The Movement and the Moment*, edited by Steve Louie and Glenn Omatsu; *The Latino Reader*, edited by Harold Augenbraum and Margarite Olmos; and *Native American Testimony*, edited by Peter Nabokov, are a few of the readily available collections of personal histories and literature of a period of intense introspection and political activism.” (H-SS Framework, p. 570, lines 1232-36.)
- “In addition to the civil rights groundwork laid by the Reconstruction-era Constitutional Amendments, students should closely read the Fourteenth Amendment as it has been continually reinterpreted and applied to different contexts by the courts; for example, sometimes it has been employed as a protection for workers and other times as a protection for corporations. In the context of the late nineteenth century, civil right advocates such as Booker T. Washington, the founder of Tuskegee Institute and author of the 1895 Atlanta Exposition address, and W. E. B. Du Bois, a founder of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) and author of *The Souls of Black Folk*, had different perspectives on the means of achieving greater progress and equality for African Americans. Racial violence, discrimination, and

segregation inhibited African Americans' economic mobility, opportunity, and political participation. As background for their later studies about challenges to Jim Crow segregation, students understand the meaning of "separate but equal," as both a legal term and as a reality that effectively limited the life chances of African Americans by denying them equal opportunity for jobs, housing, education, health care, and voting rights." (H-SS Framework, p. 512-513, lines 83-99.)

Preface, p. 9, lines 179-184, **Add:** "The *History–Social Science Framework* in particular provides support for the implementation of ethnic studies, including a brief outline of a ninth-grade elective course in the field, and the document overall emphasizes key principles and outcomes of ethnic studies teaching and learning, such as diversity, inclusion, challenging systems of inequality, and support for student civic engagement." **Comments:** This addition brings the closing sentence in the Preface into alignment with Chapter 1, pp. 13-17, on Eight Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching, and with pedagogical best practices which emphasize outcomes in learning.

Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview

Chapter 1, p. 5, lines 90-97, **Change:** "Beyond providing an important history of groups underrepresented in traditional accounts and an analysis of oppression and power, ethnic studies offers a dynamic inquiry-based approach to the study of Native people and communities of color that encourages utilizing ~~transnational and comparative thematic frameworks to compare ethnic groups in the local community.~~ Thus, the fruitful themes and topics discussed within the field are boundless can range widely from migration to social movements, such as a study of Mexican American texts, the implications of war and imperialism on experiences of Southeast Asian refugees (Vietnamese, Laos, Cambodian, Hmong) in different waves of immigration to the U.S., of African American social movements, and modes of civic engagement, transformational change for the better, pursuit of justice and equity resistance, and Native American/Indigenous cultural retentions, to name a few."

Comments: Chapter 1 defines the focus and emphasis of ethnic studies: "At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States." (p. 4). In a course that has a lot of ground to cover as this course does, the model curriculum wisely lays out some disciplinary boundaries to prevent students and teachers from being overwhelmed with too much to cover by keeping the emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States.

To expand the content to include "transnational and comparative" topics will make the course unmanageable from the outset. Adding language that suggests thematic frameworks and comparing ethnic groups from local demographics will add complexity without overwhelming teachers, and fulfills the intention of the legislation AB-2016 to customize the course for student demographics. The emphasis on themes is important and aligns with the ESMC Guidelines, section 3, first bullet.

Similarly including language about themes and topics being “boundless” fails to provide teachers with structured guidance, and seems at odds with the goal of this section, which is to share some examples of potential fruitful topics to explore with students.

Civic engagement should be included here as it is key method of transformational change and a key value in:

- The California History-Social Science Framework
- College, Career and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards (C3 Framework)
- The State Seal of Civic Engagement AB-24
<https://www.cde.ca.gov/pd/ca/hs/hssstatesseal.asp>

The suggested addition of “transformational change for the better” is a direct quote that comes from R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview, p. 74 in Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, eds. *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*. Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018. The full quote is:

As critically conscious holistic beings, how do we understand ourselves and our world in relation to the four macroscales and help to bring about transformational change for the better.” This phrase emphasizes the ultimate outcome, overcoming inequality and discrimination, rather than one means, resistance. The foundational values by Cuauhtin emphasize positive change and transformation, imagining a better society, not merely resistance for resistance sake, but towards positive goals. Including the methods (social movements, civic engagement, change) and the end goals (transformation, cultural continuity, the holistic well-being of all, pursuit of justice and equity, overcoming inequality) sets an important tone for teachers, less about violence than transformation.

This revision around transformational change and the addition of “pursuit of justice and equity” is also in keeping with the first of the Carlos E. Cortés Guiding Principles and Outcomes (Pursuit of Justice and Equity) which states: “Ethnic studies should also examine individual and collective efforts to challenge and overcome inequality and discriminatory treatment. (Chapter 1, p. 10).

If the detailed content of lessons is expanded to cover all push factors, this will no longer be a course studying racial and ethnic groups within the United States. There is a difference between a summary of push factors in migration, and a lesson on war and imperialism in world history. Teaching lessons on the experiences of Southeast Asian refugees (Vietnamese, Laos, Cambodian, Hmong) in the U.S. and the different waves of immigration before and after the Migration and Refugee Assistance Act of 1975 and the Refugee Act of 1980, will acknowledge push factors while honoring the emphasis of ethnic studies as defined in Chapter 1 (cited above). Doing this, also recognizes the fact that students will study conflicts and wars in greater depth in world history.

The suggestions on this paragraph were accepted by the CDE following the Second Field Review, and they should be accepted and incorporated into the final version, see item 31 in Attachment C.

Chapter 1, pp. 5-6, lines 98-101, **Change:** ~~“Furthermore, considering that European American culture is already robustly taught in the~~ While coverage of diverse ethnic and racial groups in school curriculum can be further improved, ethnic studies presents an opportunity for different cultures to be highlighted in-depth and studied in a manner that is meaningful and can be transformative for all students.”

Comments: The term “European American” here is ambiguous and unclear. Does it mean the dominant American culture? Does it mean white culture? If either are intended, this seems to reinforce a problematic view that equates American culture with whiteness or being European. Consistent with points made earlier, the suggested revision acknowledges that there has been an increase of coverage of race and the history of racial and ethnic groups in California and that there is room for further improvement, while emphasizing that ethnic studies’ courses present the opportunity for more in-depth coverage and study of marginalized or historically underrepresented groups.

The word furthermore is not needed and does not fit as a transitional word since what follows does not build upon what came before.

Chapter 1, p. 8, lines 171-174, **Change:** “Meanwhile, at the other end of the state, as early as 1968 students at California State University, Los Angeles and California State University, Northridge were establishing Chicano Studies and Black Studies departments.”

Comment: Names of university departments are proper nouns and should be capitalized. Elsewhere in the same chapter, the ‘S’ in Studies is capitalized, so these should be for consistency. See lines 135, 141, 142, 160, and 161.

Chapter 1, p. 12, line 244, **Change:** “Guiding Values and Principles of Ethnic Studies”

Comment: The paragraph that follows this header refers to “key values” and “foundational values,” while the source for the eight outcomes uses the term “principles”. To avoid confusion, it would be more consistent and accurate to refer to the first list as Guiding Values, and the second list as Eight Principles and Outcomes. Conforming edits should be made throughout the text where the values are referenced.

Chapter 1, p. 13, lines 272-274, **Add:**

“Eight Principles and Outcomes of K-12 Ethnic Studies Teaching

The following eight essential principles and outcomes for ethnic studies teaching and learning are offered to assist with K–12 implementation of ethnic studies:”

Comments: The source for the list is identified as “Suggested Basic Curriculum Principles.” For fidelity to the original source, we recommend adding “Principles” to the title and other places where this list is referenced. This addition will bring the title into alignment with the current text later in the chapter, which includes a number of references to the eight principles, for example, “achieving the preceding principles” (line 378) and “By operating on the basis of these eight principles” (line 406).

The addition of this list is an excellent one and provides concrete implementation guidance, which directly aligns with the State Board Guidelines.

Conforming edits should be made throughout the text where the eight principles and outcomes are referenced.

Chapter 1, p. 15, lines 341-242, **Change:** “Chapter 4 of the document is a bibliography to assist the local school district and committees to further inform their discussion on ethnic studies by providing the sources cited within the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum itself.”

Comment: The CA Department of Education has repeatedly said in public meetings that this bibliography is only for references to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum itself, and not a general resource for teachers or administrators to develop curricula or content. The criteria for inclusion should be made clear. If there is no such restriction, then other books and resources for ethnic studies teachers can be added.

Chapter 1, p. 19, lines 428-429, **Add:** “These language conventions are not foregrounded in this model curriculum for those just beginning to gain familiarity with ethnic studies;”

Comment: Some words seemed to be missing, so these additions improve the readability and clarity of this sentence.

Chapter 2: District Implementation Guidance

Chapter 2, p., 5, footnote 1 to line 92, **Change link:** Footnote 1 “2017 the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team, “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum,”

~~<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf> accessed 9/22/2020~~

<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf>

Comments: The link published in the Third Field Review does not work, perhaps due to punctuation or formatting. Please replace it with the working link provided here. Please take care to not add a final period, punctuation, or additional characters to the link.

Chapter 2, p., 13, footnote 7 to line 288, **Change link:** Footnote 7 “California Education Code 60044.

~~http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC§ionNum=60044 accessed 9/22/2020.~~

http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC§ionNum=60044

Comments: The link published in the Third Field Review does not work, perhaps due to punctuation or formatting. Please replace it with the working link provided here. Please take care to not add a final period, punctuation, or additional characters to the link.

Chapter 2, p., 13, footnote 8 to line 291, **Change link:** Footnote 8 “See “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017.

~~<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf>. Accessed 9/22/2020.~~

<https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf>

Comments: The link published in the Third Field Review does not work, perhaps due to punctuation or formatting. Please replace it with the working link provided here. Please take care to not add a final period, punctuation, or additional characters to the link.

Chapter 2, p. 6-7, lines 123-128, **Change:** “Develop, implement, monitor, and evaluate instructional support. In order for teachers to provide a robust ethnic studies learning experience they should be engaged in continual professional development, and supported by their site and district administrators who are working in tandem with students and community. Administrators should consider creating a department or distinct lane of work specifically dedicated to developing, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating ethnic studies instructional materials and professional development (preferably differentiated professional development trainings specifically based on varying levels of ethnic studies content knowledge). Administrators can develop their own models of ethnic studies professional development and/or instructional materials by consulting other districts with well-established ethnic studies departments and teachers. It is imperative to consider the number of teachers who currently have experience in this subject area and those who will need additional support and professional development prior to implementation. ~~Furthermore, a~~Administrators can draw upon the expertise of scholars and other stakeholders to help create this tailored training. It is important that administrators seek advisors from multiple communities who are aligned with the model curriculum and the State Board Guidelines, and who are well versed in K-12 education.

- *Consult with other districts, higher education institutions, and relevant community organizations and resources that have implemented ethnic studies programs at the high school level to see if there are other models and resources that can be adapted to the local program, and ensure a balance of advisors from multiple communities.* [italics in original] Appendix C contains a selection of course descriptions from various districts across the state; listings of other courses can be found at the University of California’s A–G Course Management Portal at <https://hs-articulation.ucop.edu/>.

Comments: In order to avoid the undue influence of a single advisor, or one specific point of view, it is advisable to ensure a balance of advisors from multiple communities, when consulting scholars, other districts, or community resources. Additionally, teaching ethnic studies at the K-12 level requires different considerations than in academia at the university level. It is important that advisors understand the model curriculum and Guidelines, are in alignment with them, and understand the needs and expectations of pre-collegiate education, particularly at the high school level. In this way, districts will ensure balanced and supportive professional development that aligns with the state’s Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum, the State Board’s Guidelines, California’s Education Code, and the needs of teachers and students at the pre-collegiate level.

Chapter 3: Instructional Guidance for K–12 Education

Chapter 3, pp. 4-5, lines 65-69, **Change:** “• Community- Ethnic studies teaching and learning is meant to serve as a bridge between educational spaces/institutions and community. Thus, encouraging students to apply their knowledge to practice being agents of change, social justice organizers and advocates, and engaged citizens at the local, state, and national, ~~and global~~ levels.”

Comment: We recommend these changes for consistency with Chapter 1, which states: “At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States.” With a lot of ground to cover in an ethnic studies course centered on the four foundational groups, and with instructional time constraints, it makes sense to follow the disciplinary boundaries laid out by the model curriculum in Chapter 1.

Chapter 3, p. 10, lines 201-204, **Change:** “Furthermore, these types of activities are appropriate for an ethnic studies course as they provide a lens for students to identify institutional/structural inequities, advocate for change at the local, state, and national, ~~or international~~ levels, and to engage in healthy debate and dialogue with their peers.”

Comment: With limited instructional time, the course should focus on the disciplinary boundaries of the United States in areas in which students can achieve the greatest impact.

Chapter 3, p. 5, lines 79-87, **Delete:** “With much of the field focusing on issues related to race and identity, teachers, especially those with limited ethnic studies knowledge, should engage in activities that allow them to unpack their own identities, privilege, marginalization, lived experiences, and understanding and experience of race, culture, and social justice. ~~For teachers who may feel especially concerned with teaching ethnic studies, leading ethnic studies scholars highly recommend that they work through assignments like critical autobiography, critical storytelling, critical life history, or keeping a subjectivity journal, to begin the process of “constructively situating oneself in relationship to Ethnic Studies”.³~~”

Comment: This sentence seems unnecessary following the one that precedes it, which makes clear the importance of self-reflection and self-awareness for ethnic studies teachers. The language is jargon-y, yet no clear explanations of the terms are found in a web search, so these terms may not endure as clear ones for educators in future years. Teachers wary of the preparation required to teach a new course, may be discouraged by this, and the terminology may scare off potentially strong ethnic studies teachers. It also comes across as patronizing and shaming.

Chapter 3, p. 7, lines 127-132, **Add:** “For additional support on identifying a multitude of sources that can be used in the classroom, ethnic studies educators should consult the sample lessons in Appendix A, the University of California ethnic studies course outlines that are included in Appendix C of this document, collaborate with other teachers at their sites, and engage materials that can be found at local and community archives and libraries, especially those housed by the University of California, California State University, and local community colleges.”

Comment: In offering suggested sources for the classroom, it would be valuable to mention the sample lessons in Appendix A as well.

Chapter 3, p. 18, lines 402-409, **Change:** “However, it is strongly encouraged that both educators and administrators consult ethnic studies coordinators at the district level and county level, professional development offered by ethnic studies classroom teachers, county offices of education, faculty at institutions of higher education, relevant community resources, and other support providers. These diverse sources, contacts, and institutions can help educators and administrators stay abreast of useful theory, research, and content knowledge that can be leveraged in the classroom and/or professional development. Administrators can ensure that implementation of such learning is aligned with this model curriculum, the State Board Guidelines, and California’s Education Code.”

Comments: Consistent with other references to the importance of diverse perspectives, the addition of “diverse” is important to mention here. It is also valuable to note the importance of administrators ensuring that new knowledge gleaned from the sources is implemented in a manner consistent with the model curriculum, ESMC Guidelines, and the Education Code.

Chapter 3, p. 34, lines 850-857, **Change:** “Some examples of topics that could be used to explore questions of identity are the “model minority” myth and its historic and contemporary implications for Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, the experiences of Arab Americans and the rise of Islamophobia and discrimination against Sikhs in the aftermath of 9/11 and the War on Terror, the recent rise in ~~anti-Semitic~~ antisemitic violence, hatred, and rhetoric, and the way that Native Americans have challenged the use of native iconography and dress for mascots on college campuses and professional sports leagues.”

Comments: The spelling of “anti-Semitic” should be changed to “antisemitic,” just as “anti-Semitism” was changed to “antisemitism” for consistency. The CDE noted in Attachment C: Table of Submitted Line Edits, line item 9, “Change “anti-Semitism” to “antisemitism.” At the November meeting, the IQC approved CDE’s recommended change: “CDE Recommends: If this edit is approved, CDE will make the change throughout the document.”

Chapter 3, p. 42, line 1040, Sample Lesson Template, **Change:** “Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment”

After Ethnic Studies Values, **Move and Add:** “Ethnic Studies Outcomes Alignment”

Comments: These edits bring the template into alignment with Chapter 1, in which we noted the confusion caused by the names. At present, “Ethnic Studies Outcomes” appear at the bottom of the template. Given the importance of outcomes in education and curriculum design, the template would be strengthened by positioning Ethnic Studies Outcomes higher up on the template after values. The addition of the word “alignment” is also important as it then reminds teachers of the specific Eight Outcomes for ethnic studies, which were reiterated on p. 32 of this chapter.

Chapter 3, p. 43, lines 1043 and 1044, **Change:** **“Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment:** Each lesson should draw from and be informed by the ethnic studies values and principles described in eChapter 1.”

Comment: For consistency based on previous comments on this in Chapter 1.

Chapter 3, p. 43, **Add:** **“Ethnic Studies Outcomes Alignment:** Each lesson should draw from and be informed by the Eight Principles and Outcomes described in Chapter 1.”

Comment: See previous comments in Chapter 1, including the original source for the Eight Outcomes which referred to them as both outcomes and principles.

Chapter 3, p. 46, lines 1144 and 1145, **Move and Modify per previous Edit:** **“Ethnic Studies Outcomes:** Each lesson should address one or more of the outcomes described in chapter 1.”

Comment: See previous comments regarding outcomes alignment and placement in the template.

Brief Copy Edit and Consistency Notes

- Chapter 3, p. 13, line 290 has “socioemotional” while p. 14, line 304 has “social-emotional.” The CDE may want to choose a consistent style.
- Chapter 3, p. 18, line 401, which uses a compound noun, may want to add hyphen after healing for punctuation consistency in: “trauma-informed and healing informed educational practices...”
- Chapter 3, p. 20 line 460, p. 31 line 779, p. 43 line 1044, capitalize the c in chapter 1, as the rest of the uses in Chapter 3 capitalize the word Chapter. The CDE may want to choose a consistent style.
- Chapter 3, p. 25, line 603, needs a period before “Consequently”.
- Chapter 3, p. 27, lines 666-680 repeat information covered extensively earlier in the chapter.
- Chapter 3, pp. 25-28, lines 634-705, “Grade Level” section. Chapter 3 seems to describe three possible approaches to teaching ethnic studies, which are stated in the ESMC Guidelines - standalone courses, integrated ethnic studies in other subjects, and a thematic approach. It may be helpful to the user to organize these three approaches together and to enumerate them (currently, the thematic approach follows a section on grades rather than following the integrated approach section). It would be clearer to put the Grade Level section after the three approaches sections, moving it to after the section titled “Thematic/Comparative Race and Ethnic Studies Approach.”

Chapter 4: Bibliography

Chapter 4, p. 5, line 105, **Add:** **“Schaefer, Richard T. *Racial and Ethnic Groups*, 15th Edition. Hoboken, N.J.: Pearson, 2019.”**

Comments: This textbook is cited in the third draft, Appendix C, page 14, line 348 and so should be included in the bibliography in Chapter 4. This comprehensive ethnic studies textbook, used by Los Angeles Unified School District for their ethnic studies

course, starts with chapters about theories of race, ethnicity, prejudice, and discrimination, before addressing specifically many racial and ethnic minority groups in the United States. It includes first person accounts, primary sources, and covers race and ethnic relations in a sociohistorical context. The book and its online resources provide teachers with a digital collection of tools to aid in classroom instruction.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics

Overall Note to Appendix A Sample Lessons:

- The comments that follow are organized by lesson.
- Lessons should include alignments to the Eight Principles and Outcomes, consistent with best pedagogical practices that orient learning around outcomes.

Appendix A Sample Lessons and Topics, **Add:** Alignments to Outcomes to Lessons 1-19, 21-40, and 43.

Comments: Chapter 1 explains the Ethnic Studies Outcomes, and Chapter 3 states that all sample lessons should include an alignment with the outcomes. However, only three out of 43 lessons include alignments to the “Ethnic Studies Outcomes” (These include outcomes: Sample Lesson 20: The Immigrant Experience of Lao Americans; Sample Lesson 41: Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race; and Sample Lesson 42: Arab American Stereotypes in Literature, Film, and Media Pre- and Post-9/11.)

The current Sample Lesson Template shows in a table of all the elements that the sample lessons should include. (Chapter 3, p. 42, line 1040) The eleventh row states: “Ethnic Studies Outcomes.” Page 46, lines 1144-1145 state: **“Ethnic Studies Outcomes:** Each lesson should address one or more of the outcomes described in chapter 1.” The intent is that the lessons include alignments to the Eight Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching, detailed in Chapter 1, pp. 13- 19, lines 272-424, summarized in Chapter 3 on page 32, lines 800-807, and repeated in question form in Appendix A on pp. 7-9-, lines 169-228.

Please add Ethnic Studies outcome alignments to all the remaining 40 lessons missing them as required by Chapter 3 and consistent with pedagogical best practice.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, **Sample Lesson 4:** Introducing Narratives, p. 28, lines 642-652, **Change:**

“Additional Resources:

- Equality and Human Rights Commission, “Lesson 11 – Influencing Attitudes” – <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/secondary-education-resources/lesson-plan-ideas/lesson-11-influencing-attitudes>
- UC Berkeley Greater Good Magazine, “How to Avoid Picking Up Prejudice from the Media” https://greatergood.berkeley.edu/article/item/how_to_avoid_picking_up_prejudice_from_media
- Fairness & Accuracy in Reporting, “How to Detect Bias in News Media” – <https://fair.org/take-action-now/media-activism-kit/how-to-detect-bias-in-news-media/>

- Civic Online Reasoning, “News Versus Opinions,” “Who’s Behind the Information?,” “What’s the Evidence?,” “What do Other Sources Say?” “How to Find Better Information Online,” and “Civic Online Reasoning,” <https://cor.stanford.edu/curriculum/>
- Center for Media Literacy, “Questions/ Tips: Media Deconstruction/Construction Framework” <http://www.medialit.org/educator-resources>

Comments: The goal of this lesson is to teach media literacy and how to evaluate online sources. For lesson 4, the Lesson Objectives are: “identify sources of narratives; articulate how narratives are shaped by who is telling the story; explain how what’s featured and left out in a story produces an interpretation; and critically evaluate the sources of narratives they come across in their own lives” (p. 25, lines 578-582).

The first two links are useful towards these goals, but the third one by FAIR is not. We suggest adding two links of objective and ready-to-use resources that teachers can easily use in their classrooms to achieve the goals of the lesson.

- **Civic Online Reasoning** <https://cor.stanford.edu/curriculum/> is produced by the Stanford History Education Group (SHEG) and provides accessible lessons and videos, such as News Versus Opinions, Who’s Behind the Information? What’s the Evidence? What do Other Sources Say? How to Find Better Information Online, Civic Online Reasoning, and Fact Checking Wikipedia, among others.
- **Center for Media Literacy** <http://www.medialit.org/educator-resources> has worked in the field of media literacy for decades and provides their resources in multiple languages, including Spanish, Mandarin, Arabic, and six others as well as English. It has a free resource packet “LITERACY for the 21st Century: An Overview & Orientation Guide To Media Literacy Education and handouts like Questions/Tips: Media Deconstruction/Construction Framework” ready to use in the classroom in multiple languages.

These additions strengthen the lesson, help it meet its goals, and come from reputable sources.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, **Sample Lesson 6:** Important Historical Figures Among People of Color, p. 40 line 904, **Add:** “1. Teachers can let students choose a figure from the list provided, depending on the students’ interest. The teacher may assign students a historical figure. Teachers can challenge students by choosing a figure that is not from their ethnic background to expand their knowledge of other groups.

The figures taught in this lesson should meet at least one of the following five criteria:

1. A person whose leadership and achievements have contributed to the movement for racial and economic equality
2. A person who has made a contribution or played a role in the building of the United States
3. A person who has contributed to a broader social movement that challenged racism, bigotry, sexism, or classism
4. A person who has made a significant cultural contribution, such as in the arts, sciences, medicine, business, economics, or politics
5. A person who has had an impact on their community or the United States”

Comments: Lesson 6 lacks clear criteria for inclusion and these should be added to this lesson. Examining the language of the lesson itself, scattered criteria should be consolidated into a clear list, as suggested above.

One of the new lessons focuses on African American innovators (Lesson 10), and yet there are no African American scientists/inventors included on the Lesson 6 list. Lesson 6 would be strengthened by aligning it with the call in Chapter 1 to highlight “the often-overlooked contributions to many areas of government, politics, the arts, medicine, economics, etc., made by people of color” (p. 5). Doing this would provide overdue recognition of the diverse and many contributions made by Americans of color to America in many spheres of life.

The above specific criteria suggestions come directly from the text itself Appendix A, pp. 39-41:

- On p. 40, lines 895-896 in the Essential Questions it states: “3. How did their leadership and achievements contribute to the movement for racial and economic equality?” Therefore, one criteria should be: “A person whose leadership and achievements have contributed to the movement for racial and economic equality.”
- On p. 39, lines 876-877 in the Lesson Purpose and Overview it states: “understanding the contributions and role that people of color have played in the building of the United States.” Therefore, one criteria should be: “A person who has made a contribution or played a role in the building of the United States.”
- On p. 39, lines 878-880 in the Lesson Purpose and Overview it states: “Furthermore, students will understand how these historical figures contributed to a broader social movement that challenged racism, sexism or classism.” Therefore, one criteria should be: “A person who has contributed to a broader social movement that challenged racism, bigotry, sexism or classism.”
- On p. 41, lines 935-937, in the Lesson Steps/Activities, it states: “6. Some of these figures are on the list because they have made key cultural contributions. Has your figure made a significant cultural contribution?” Therefore, one criteria should be: “A person who has made a significant cultural contribution, such as in the arts, sciences, business, or politics.”
- On p. 39, lines 880-881, in the Lesson Purpose and Overview it states: Students will analyze the impact of that broader movement on the community.” Therefore, one criteria should be: “A person who has had an impact on their community or the United States.

The current lack of criteria makes it unclear why some figures are included and other significant figures are omitted.

Two Additional Notes:

- SBE may wish to solicit input from the different communities represented about the individuals deemed significant and important to their communities so that the lists reflect community/stakeholder input.
- Per our next comment, **we strongly encourage the SBE to add a disqualifying criterion for individuals who are racist or bigoted against other groups.** Hatred against any group should not be tolerated and cannot be excused or

justified with a note about controversy. This should be obvious, but unfortunately, the list includes people with clear prejudices against other groups.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, **Sample Lesson 6: Important Historical Figures Among People of Color**, p. 50, lines 1117, 1120, **Remove:** “Linda Sarsour” “Helen Thomas”

Comments: Listed figures should have a clear anti-racism/anti-bigotry stance. Individuals who have expressed hate against other groups should not be included in this lesson since bigotry of any sort conflicts with the values of ethnic studies and California. This does not set a good example for students. We should take special care to not hold up individuals who have made inflammatory statements about specific groups. While readings by some controversial figures might be of value to study, this is different than naming them in the list of important historical figures. Bigotry cannot be excused under the banner of being controversial.

To this end, we request the removal of two listed individuals: Helen Thomas and Linda Sarsour. As an individual who trafficked in antisemitic tropes on multiple occasions, Helen Thomas should not be included as we noted in our original review of the ESMC.¹ Just as we would rightfully reject the inclusion of individuals who traffic in hate against African Americans, Native Americans, Arab Americans, LGBTQ Americans, women, or any other marginalized group, individuals who traffic in hate against Jews or any other race, religion, ethnicity, nationality, etc, should be rejected from the model curriculum. Linda Sarsour should be excluded because of attitudes and statements that are intolerant of most American Jews, that deny Jews the right to define antisemitism for themselves, and that amplifies antisemitism from the far left.

Linda Sarsour is seen by many in the Jewish community as extremely problematic because of her hateful statements about Jews who feel connected to Israel. Sarsour declared that one cannot be a feminist if one is a Zionist, which made many Jewish women feel excluded from participating in the Women’s March in 2017 and 2018 (<https://www.tabletmag.com/sections/news/articles/even-the-womens-march-apology-erases-jewish-women> and <https://www.thenation.com/article/archive/can-you-be-a-zionist-feminist-linda-sarsour-says-no/>). This litmus test effectively precludes most American Jews, a significant majority of whom support the right of Jews to self-determination in their historic homeland and who feel a connection to the State of

¹ From the ICS review of the first ESMC draft: “Helen Thomas should be deleted from the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum. By listing individuals as significant figures, they may be perceived as role models. However, individuals who traffic in hate targeting particular groups should not be lauded. Helen Thomas should not be included because of her blatantly antisemitic comments. When Rabbi David Nesenoff asked her about Israel she said that they [the Jews] should “get the hell out of Palestine” and “go home” to Poland and Germany. This comment was insensitive, prejudiced, and wrong on many levels - at that time, 38 percent of Jewish Israelis were born in Israel. However, the comments to the Rabbi were not a one-off. Thomas doubled down with classic antisemitic tropes (while denying she was anti-Jewish) about Jewish power and control of the financial markets in a Playboy interview (she spoke of “total control”, said that Jews “own the White House”, and agreed that there’s a “Jewish conspiracy at work in this country.”) Her interchangeable use of Jewish and Zionist underscored her prejudice. Therefore, she should not be highlighted as a significant figure.” https://www.scribd.com/document/50980781/Interview-Helen-Thomas?ad_group=35871X943606X897b03213b8c5a8afeeb8a2307fb51d7&campaign=SkimbitLtd&key_word=660149026&medium=affiliate&source=hp_affiliate

Israel.² Her words and attitudes stand in stark contrast to the values of ethnic studies that support self-definition, the right to self-determination for all people, and promotion of true diversity and inclusion.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, **Sample Lesson 6: Important Historical Figures Among People of Color**, p. 50, line 1122, **Add:**

“Jewish Americans

1. Rabbi Angela Warnick Buchdahl
2. Daveed Diggs
3. Eric Garcetti
4. Alma Hernandez
5. Jamaica Kincaid
6. Rabbi Sandra Lawson
7. Emma Lazarus
8. Alejandro Mayorkas
9. Yavilah McCoy
10. Isaac Mizrahi
11. Raquel Montoya-Lewis
12. Walter Mosley
13. Samuel Rahbar
14. Rabbi Shais Rishon
15. Ilan Stavens
16. Michael Twitty”

Comments: This lesson should reflect the additions and direction of the third draft of the ESMC, therefore Jewish Americans of color, Armenian Americans, and Sikh Americans should be identified and added. Specifically, we recommend including notable Jewish Americans of color in a range of fields, from scholars and writers, to community leaders, to those who have made a significant cultural contribution in political leadership, the law, the arts, or sports. In preparing this list, ICS consulted with Be’chol Lashon (which raises awareness of the ethnic, racial, and cultural diversity of

² Additional background on Linda Sarsour: While the majority of Jews are Zionist and the common definition of Zionism among Jews is supporting the right to Jewish self-determination, Linda Sarsour continuously vilifies Zionism and Zionists

([https://twitter.com/search?q=zionism%20\(from%3Alsarsour\)&src=typed_query](https://twitter.com/search?q=zionism%20(from%3Alsarsour)&src=typed_query) and [https://twitter.com/search?q=zionist%20\(from%3Alsarsour\)&src=recent_search_click](https://twitter.com/search?q=zionist%20(from%3Alsarsour)&src=recent_search_click)). Sarsour presents herself as an expert on Judaism and antisemitism, and decides who is a “good Jew”. In so doing, she promotes groups whose views are not consistent with nor representative of most of the Jewish community, such as Jewish Voice for Peace (JVP) and the radical branch of the Ultra-Orthodox Neturei Karta sect, whose views on Zionism, Israel, and other Jews are highly offensive (<https://twitter.com/lsarsour/status/486995365200420864/photo/1>).

Sarsour disputes that Jews can define what is antisemitic for themselves and regularly defends or excuses antisemitism coming from the left, including Louis Farrakhan, who makes antisemitic and homophobic statements along with his organization Nation of Islam, which is considered a hate group by the Southern Poverty Law Center. (<https://www.splcenter.org/fighting-hate/extremist-files/group/nation-islam>). See also: <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/03/womens-march/555122/> and <https://jewishjournal.com/news/314358/linda-sarsour-tamika-mallory-pen-tributes-to-late-nation-of-islam-leader/>”).

the Jewish people), and the Jews of Color Initiative. This list includes a number of notable Californians. In creating this list, we ensured that each individual meets at least one of our recommended criteria for inclusion.

Note: Lesson 6 currently includes two Sikhs under the Asian American category, but it would be worth asking the Sikh community about this and if these are the individuals they would recommend or if there are others.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, **Sample Lesson 6: Important Historical Figures Among People of Color**, pp. 50-5, lines 1122-1137. **Delete:**

~~“International Experience
Frantz Fanon
Feliciano Ama
Comandanta Ramona
Reque Dalton
Rubén Darío
Eduardo Galeano
Benito Juárez
Farabundo Martí
Maria de Jesus Patricia Martinez (Marichuy)
Rigoberta Menchú
Violeta Parra
Monseñor Oscar Arnulfo Romero
Emiliano Zapata
Brian Fuata
Su'a Suluape”~~

Comments: The international figures are not in keeping with the ESMC’s emphasis on the experiences of people in the United States. In Chapter 1, the model curriculum states: “At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States.” (ESMC, Chapter 1, p. 4) The model curriculum maintains this focus on the American experience, so coupled with our recommendations above to broaden the range of contributions and backgrounds of people of color that are the focus of the lesson, we recommend removing the international figures, and developing and expanding the list of names from different communities of color in the U.S. In a lesson that has a lot of material to include, as this lesson does with many important Americans of color, coupled with instructional time constraints, it makes sense to follow the disciplinary boundaries laid out by the model curriculum and maintain the focus on the American experience.

Appendix B: Lesson Resources

ICS has no suggestions on Appendix B.

Appendix C: UC Approved Course Outlines

ICS has no suggestions on Appendix C.

Section 2: ESMC Third Field Draft Edits to Retain

The IQC approved many important revisions at the November meeting, which strengthen the model curriculum. In particular, we want to ensure the following valuable revisions are retained in the final draft.

Preface, p. 4, line 42, Ethnicity footnote 3 to line 45, **Retain**: “Ethnicity: an identity marker based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, religion, language, history, tradition, etc., that comprise a social group.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this footnote. This footnote defining ethnicity should be retained, including the components of identity, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, religion, language, history, tradition. In ethnic studies, religion is discussed as a key part of ethnicity, ethnic groups, and should be included.

Ethnicity should include religion as an identity marker because religion is often a central component of ethnic identity, and also because it is important in ensuring proper representation of the diversity of California. Religious identity intersects with racial, ethnic, gender, cultural, and other social identities in ways that cannot be reduced to simple racial categories, but in fact contribute to the diversity found in California’s diverse demographics. For example, there are important and different histories of African Americans and Arab Americans who are Muslim or Christian. Membership in a religious group is often an important part of ethnic identity among American immigrant communities, and a central component of understanding their persecution and immigration to the United States, as is clearly demonstrated by the Yazidis from Syria and Iraq and the Maronite Christians from Lebanon. Catholicism is also an important part of Latinx culture, the church is a central part of African American culture and social activism, and the legal fight to recognize Native American freedom of religion is central to Native American Studies.

Chapter 1, p. 5, lines 77-83, **Retain**: “At its core, the field of ethnic studies is the interdisciplinary study of race, ethnicity, and indigeneity, with an emphasis on the experiences of people of color in the United States. People or person of color is a term used primarily in the United States and is meant to be inclusive among non-white groups, emphasizing common experiences of racism. The field also addresses the concept of intersectionality, which recognizes that people have different overlapping identities, for example, a transgender Latina or a Jewish African American. These intersecting identities shape individuals’ experiences of racism and bigotry.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this passage. Because the concept of intersectionality is complicated and is referenced in the previous passage from the California History-Social Science Framework, adding some examples of intersectional identities will help students appreciate how these multifaceted identities shape individuals’ experiences of racism and bigotry. The addition of the term bigotry is helpful here since the Framework reference to intersectionality includes non-racial identities (gender, sexuality, class, and others) that are also subject to prejudice and discrimination, and also because bigotry is specifically referenced in the Preface.

Chapter 1, pp. 11-12, lines 228-243, How Do You Teach Ethnic Studies in a K–12 Environment? **Retain:** “**How Do You Teach Ethnic Studies in a K–12 Environment?** Ethnic studies highlights the importance of untold stories, and emphasizes the danger of a single story. In *The Danger of a Single Story*, Nigerian writer Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie argues that reducing people to a single story creates stereotypes and denies their humanity. Each ethnic community has its own unique history, struggles, and contributions, and these are to be taught, understood, and celebrated as ethnic studies focuses on U.S. culture and history from the perspective of marginalized groups. In addition, diversity and diverse perspectives within an ethnic group should also be taught to avoid reducing a group to a single story. In order to do this, teachers should trust students’ intellect and teach them to think critically, understand different and competing perspectives and narratives, and encourage them to form their own opinions. Care should be taken to ensure that (1) teachers present topics from multiple points of view and represent diverse stories and opinions within groups, (2) teaching resources represent a range of different perspectives, and (3) lessons are structured so students examine materials from multiple perspectives and come to their own conclusions.[new footnote]: Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie, TED Talk, October 7, 2009: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D9lhs241zeg>.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this section. This is an excellent section in the chapter and provides actionable and helpful guidance to districts and educators. This addition highlights that a major goal of ethnic studies is to teach diverse stories and empower students to engage with and analyze complex information, construct their own understandings, and imagine new futures.

Before delving into the Values, Principles and Outcomes, this additional framing is helpful, especially as many new teachers and districts will be looking for high level essential considerations before getting into the nitty gritty of implementation as laid out nicely in Chapter 2.

In a powerful TED Talk, Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie expressed an idea central to ethnic studies, the danger of a single story, in which people are dehumanized. Ethnic studies centers humanity and emphasizes the multidimensionality of people. This addition highlights the multidimensionality of people, while challenging dominant narratives and stereotypes. R. Tolteka Cuauhtin speaks of the importance of “respecting students as intellectuals,” a concept reflected in this suggested addition (see R. Tolteka Cuauhtin, “The Ethnic Studies Framework: A Holistic Overview,” in *Rethinking Ethnic Studies*, eds. Cuauhtin, R. Tolteka, Miguel Zavala, Christine Sleeter, and Wayne Au, Milwaukee, WI: Rethinking Schools, 2018, p. 68).

Chapter 1, p. 13, Footnote to line 264, **Retain:** Footnote 20 “Such as, but not limited to, patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, exploitative economic systems, ableism, ageism, anthropocentrism, xenophobia, misogyny, antisemitism, anti-blackness, anti-indigeneity, Islamophobia, and transphobia.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this section. This definition of other forms of power and oppression should be retained because it spells out exactly the types of oppressions meant here. One strong addition is exploitative economic systems. All

economic systems have their challenges, and under any economic system, the crucial problem to address is exploitative economic systems.

Chapter 3, pp. 10-11, lines 218-230, **Retain**: “This emphasis on citizenship within the pedagogy provides students with a keen sense of ethics, respect, and appreciation for all people, regardless of ethnicity, nationality, gender, sexual orientation, ability, religion, and beliefs. By democratizing the classroom, educators are allowing multiple entry points for students to discuss ethnic studies theories like, intersectionality—an analytic framework coined by Black feminist legal scholar, Kimberlé Crenshaw, that captures how multiple identities (race, class, religion, gender, sexuality, ability, etc.) overlap or intersect, creating unique experiences, especially for those navigating multiple marginalized or oppressed identities.⁸ Intersectionality helps students better understand the nuances around identity, and provides them with skills to be able to engage and advocate for/with communities on the margins of the margins. Further, it helps those with privilege at different intersections recognize their societal advantages in these areas, and build solidarity with oppressed groups.

Footnote 8: Kimberlé Crenshaw, "Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics," *University of Chicago Legal Forum*: Vol. 1989: Issue 1, Article 8.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this explanation of intersectionality and its suggestion to empower students to discuss navigating multiple parts of identity and their intersections. Religion as a key component of identity for most ethnic groups, and it helps that the text notes that the term Intersectionality has grown to include a variety of components of identities, including religious identity, as well as race, class, gender, sexuality, ability, and so it is helpful that religion is on the list of multiple intersecting identities that captures other important identities. For example, Sikhs may be oppressed or discriminated against on the basis of their outward religious appearance or on the basis of their racial identities as people of color. The same is true for Jews of Color, or Middle Eastern and North African American Jews.

Chapter 3, p. 23 lines 559-570, **Retain**: “This course can explore a broad range of topics and events pertaining to the Asian American and Pacific Islander experiences, and examine their contributions to the state and U.S. throughout history. Topics may include: immigration, intergenerational conflict, the myth of the model minority, the incarceration of Japanese Americans during World War II, U.S. Supreme Court Case *Lau v. Nichols* regarding the right to an equal education, the unique experiences of Southwest Asians (Middle Eastern populations) such as Arabs, Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Coptic-Christians, Iranians, Mizrahi Jews, Kurds, and Yazidis; South Asians such as Sikhs, Hindus, Afghans, Bangladeshis, Indians, Pakistanis, and Sri Lankans; Southeast Asians such as Cambodians, Hmong, Laotians, Indonesians, Malaysians, Myanmarese, Thais, and Vietnamese; East Asians such as Chinese, Japanese, Koreans, and Taiwanese; Filipina/o/x; Pacific Islanders, and U.S. colonialism and imperialism in the Pacific.”

Comments: We recommend retaining this paragraph because it illustrates and clarifies the wide range of communities that may be covered in Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies. Since this area covers a large geographical range, and what groups

are included in both the westernmost and easternmost areas are not so obvious, providing some examples of those regions is very helpful. It is especially useful to include ethnic communities with significant populations in California, (<https://data.census.gov/cedsci/table?q=ACSDP1Y2019.DP05%20California&g=0400000US06&tid=ACSDP1Y2019.DP05&hidePreview=true>), and (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Asian_Americans_in_California),.

The geographic boundaries of the origins of the Latinx community (North, Central and South America, and the Iberian Peninsula) are easier to define, but the boundaries of the origins of Asian American and Pacific Islander communities are more challenging, so need to be delineated explicitly.

Southwest Asia (often but not completely synonymous with the Middle East) contains many non-Arab ethnic groups, many of whom have significant populations residing within California. It is very helpful to delineate these distinct ethnic communities with unique experiences of these Southwest Asian American communities, listing Arabs, Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Iranians, Jews, Kurds, and Yazidis.

South Asia includes Afghanistan, Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and a few others, and includes the Sikhs, a separate group from the Hindu majority in India. There is a large Sikh diaspora community in California mainly from Punjab. Listing Sikhs avoids their omission from ethnic studies and reminds teachers of their experiences of explicit discrimination based on their religion and as a community of color.

Southeast Asia includes Cambodia, Laos, Myanmar, Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand and Vietnam. There is also a sizable Hmong community in California.

East Asia includes China, Japan, Korea, and Taiwan, and there are significant populations of all four of these communities in California.

Chapter 3, p. 36 lines 913-925, **Retain**: “Populations Displaced by War and Genocide – Students can conduct studies of how other populations affected by war or genocide have migrated to the United States. Historical examples include the population of Armenian Americans that settled in California in the aftermath of the Armenian Genocide, the effect that World War II and the Holocaust had upon the American Jewish population, and the Southeast Asian Refugee Crisis. A more contemporary study could be based on the migration of Iranians, Iraqis, Syrians, Afghans, along with other refugees from the Middle East to California and the United States as a result of the recent wars in that region. Topics can include the experiences of the members of these groups and the political shifts and reactions that each event prompted within the United States. The CDE’s Model Curriculum for Human Rights and Genocide is a useful resource on these topics (<https://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/hs/im/documents/modelcurrichrgenoc.pdf>).

Comments: We recommend retaining this paragraph because California has a significant population of groups displaced by war and genocide, with many refugees from the Middle East and Afghanistan, the majority of whom have arrived since the 1970s up to recent years as a result of war. This includes Afghans, Iranians including Armenians and Jews, Iraqis including Assyrians and Chaldeans, and Syrians.

Chapter 4, p. 6, lines 126-129, **Retain**: “Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror: A History of Multicultural America*. Revised Edition. NY: Hachette Book Group, 2008.

Takaki, Ronald. *A Different Mirror for Young People: A History of Multicultural America*. Adapted by Rebecca Stefoff. NY: Seven Stories Press, 2012.

Comments: Ronald Takaki's ethnic studies textbook *A Different Mirror* is cited in the ESMC Chapter 3, p. 18, lines 411-414, and there are nine references to *A Different Mirror* in Appendix C, so it should be cited in Chapter 4 in the bibliography.

This ethnic studies textbook is the most widely-used textbook in California ethnic studies classrooms as of 2020, and is listed on the ethnic studies syllabi and guidelines of a wide variety of school districts in the state. There are two versions in use today, a shorter adapted text, and the longer, original text, long used in lower division ethnic studies classrooms. Both are appropriate reading levels for high school students, and both can be used to provide the history of the four core groups, African Americans, Asian Americans, LatinX Americans, and Native Americans, and so both should be added to this bibliography.

Christine Sleeter states of this text: "Written by arguably the leader of ethnic studies in the United States, this book is one of the best multicultural U.S. histories." (Christine Sleeter and Curtis Acosta, "Ethnic Studies in the United States," <https://www.oxfordbibliographies.com/view/document/obo-9780199756810/obo-9780199756810-0104.xml> August 2020, accessed 9/14/2020. Takaki was a major founding scholar of the field of ethnic studies from UC Berkeley, and his seminal work, so often used as the foundational text in high school ethnic studies classrooms, and his text is rightfully included in the bibliography in both editions.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, pp. 472-479, lines 9,883-10,086, **Retain:** Additional Appendix A language that provides context for expanding the lessons to further reflect California's diversity

Comments: We support retaining the language written by the California Department of Education to frame additions that move the model curriculum in a more inclusive direction, and that acknowledges that ethnic studies is a class for all California students. While focusing on the four traditional core disciplines, this eight-page section provides examples of what teaching about additional groups adds to the ethnic studies classroom.

The section "Affirming Identity" allows students to look for commonalities, explore parallel experiences and connections between populations, with the goal of allowing "all students to see their own identity affirmed such that the curriculum can move away from a sense of competition between groups and towards compassion for each other."

"Exploring and Embracing Your Own Community" suggests that teachers help "students develop a deep understanding of the community's history" through oral histories, and exploring cultural institutions and memorials.

"Complicating Single Stories" encourages the exploration of the diversity of experience within a community, transcending single stories, and examining the increase in stereotyping during times of heightened fear. We appreciate the examples provided of diversity within a community, with the connection to lessons on the diversity of Jewish Americans and Arab Americans.

Encouraging civic participation is fostered by "Sharing a Wide Picture of Democratic Participation" and showing students to see leaders from the widest range of

individual backgrounds, as well as recognizing the contributions already made to our democracy by different groups.

Studying the Holocaust and genocides provides students with a lens on the violent targeting of individuals based on the identities they are perceived to hold. In addition to explaining antisemitism and teaching about the dangers of racism, this section “Widening Our Universe of Obligation” provides teachers with a tool for countering antisemitism, racism, and forms of othering that can have tragic outcomes with a tool to help students widen the circle of people who are included, respected, and protected in our society.

The final section highlights collaboration between ethnic communities, advocating for constructive dialogue, finding common ground, joining forces with those with a broad range of racial, ethnic, and religious affiliations and range of opinions toward common goals. Teaching about historical collaborations aids in “Seeking Models of Interethnic Bridge-building” because interethnic collaboration towards a shared purpose is crucial to strengthening democracy in the United States.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, pp. 485-493, lines 10214-10382, **Sample Lesson 40: Antisemitism and Jewish Middle Eastern-Americans, Retain.**

Comments: This is an excellent lesson, which adds depth and relevant insights for all students with regards to antisemitism, and Jewish Middle Eastern Americans. It should be retained.

Appendix A: Sample Lessons and Topics, pp.494-514, lines 10383-10841, **Sample Lesson 41: Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race, Retain.**

Comments: This is an excellent lesson, which adds depth and relevant insights for all students with regards to identity and intersectionality. It should be retained.