

Analysis and Recommendations for the November 18th IQC Meeting Regarding the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Dear Members of the Instructional Quality Commission,

The detailed analysis and recommendations below cover proposed changes to the Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum (ESMC), which you will be voting on during your November 18th meeting. This includes the submitted line edits in Attachment C and a number of lesson plans that have been edited by the CDE for your review.

Please note that a change submitted by our organization is listed inaccurately in Attachment C: Table of Submitted Line Edits. Our recommended change in item #53 is meant for Chapter 3, page 9, lines 193-204, rather than Chapter 1.

Broadly speaking, we urge you to **accept** revisions to the ESMC that will:

1. Include diverse Jewish experiences and accurately define antisemitism in all its forms.
2. Treat Middle Eastern communities equally. This means adding the lesson plan submitted by JIMENA in the same section as the one about Arab Americans.
3. Change "Guiding Values and Principles" which can and will be used to justify bringing hate and bias into our classrooms.

We also urge you to **reject**:

1. Recommendations to exclude or edit down any definition of antisemitism to the point where it no longer reflects the experiences of Jewish students (i.e. by removing references to the fact that anti-Israel rhetoric can and does descend into hate speech against Jews far too often).
2. Pressure to give Arab Americans a special place in the curriculum above Jews, Armenians, Sikhs, Koreans or others. These communities should be treated equally.
3. Demands that you vote against changes that encourage critical thinking instead of one sided political agendas in the curriculum. It is crucial to include guidelines that will help prevent hatred and bias in our schools.

Submitted Line Edits in Attachment C

We urge you to vote in favor of the following line edits:

| | | | | |
|----|-------------|--|--|--|
| 3 | 9-30-20 ICS | Preface, page 3, line 42 | Add a new entry to the sentence to read, “(3) The model curriculum shall be written as a guide to allow school districts to adapt their courses to reflect the pupil demographics in their communities...” Adjust numbering for the subsequent entries. | CDE Recommends |
| 4 | 9-30-20 ICS | Preface, page 3, line 42 (footnote #3) | Change footnote to read, “Ethnicity: an identity marker based on ancestry, including nationality, lands/territory, regional culture, religion, language, history, tradition, etc., that comprise a social group.” | CDE Recommends |
| 9 | 9-30-20 ICS | Preface, page 4, lines 66–69 | Change “anti-Semitism” to “antisemitism.” | CDE Recommends If this edit is approved, CDE will make the change throughout the document. |
| 10 | 9-30-20 ICS | Preface, page 4, lines 66–69 | Add a footnote to the term “antisemitism,” which reads: “Antisemitism is hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Jews based on stereotypes and myths that target their ethnicity, culture, religion, traditions, right to self-determination, or connection to the State of Israel.” | [Intentionally blank] |

- It is essential to include a comprehensive definition covering antisemitism in all its forms in the curriculum. According to [two](#) recent [studies](#), nearly half of Americans don’t know the meaning of “antisemitism” and shocking numbers of young people are ignorant about the Holocaust. The definition should be included in full, and not edited down to remove crucial context that reflects the experiences of Jewish students who face this hate.

| | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|-----------------------|
| 42 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, pages 8–14, lines 173–336 | <p>Commenter suggested adding the following bullets to the Guiding Principles/Outcomes section (specific location not provided):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In K-12 education it is imperative that students are exposed to multiple perspectives, taught to think critically, and form their own opinions. • Curriculum, resources, and materials should include a balance of topics, authors, and concepts, including primary and secondary sources that represent multiple, and sometimes opposing, points of view or perspectives • Students will actively seek to understand, analyze and articulate multiple points of view, perspectives and cultures. • The instruction, material, or discussion must be appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students, and be a fair and balanced academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship | CDE Recommends |
|----|--|--|--|-----------------------|

- This change is essential to help ensure the ESMC is not used to promote bias or one-sided political agendas in the classroom, as was the case with the 1st draft of the curriculum. Additional action is also needed to ensure this guidance is repeated throughout Appendix B, as the current “Guiding Values and Principles” currently are.

| | | | | |
|----|--|-------------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| 47 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, lines 181–182 | Change to read, “These are the guiding outcomes each Ethnic Studies lesson should include.” | [intentionally blank] |
|----|--|-------------------------------------|---|-----------------------|

| | | | | |
|----|--|---|--|--|
| 48 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, lines 184– 199; Chapter 3, pages 28–29, lines 730–747; Appendix B, lines 47–64 | Remove the Guiding Values and Principles. If the section is not removed, make the edits below and rename the section “Ethnic Studies Values.” | Commenter provided alternative options if the Guiding Values and Principles are not deleted (see below). |
| 49 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, line 194 | Change principle 5 to, “Examine how race and ethnicity have been constructed in the United States, have changed over time, and continue to shape the country today” | Overlaps with recommendation above. |
| 50 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, lines 195–196 | Change principle 6 to, “Teach students about social justice and social responsibility, and to understand that they can become agents of change at local, state, national, and global levels.” OR “Learn about past and contemporary social justice efforts to create a more perfect union” | Commenter provided two options. Overlaps with recommendation above. |
| 51 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, lines 197–199 | Change principle 7 to, “Focus on the experiences, histories, cultures, struggles and accomplishments of specific ethnic/racial groups within American history and society, with an emphasis on truth and healing through empathy and education.” | Overlaps with recommendation above. Conflicts with the edit below. |

- Line edits 47-51 would fix serious problems with the ESMC’s “Guiding Values and Principles,” helping to ensure that this curriculum does not enable harmful political agendas or hate. For example, item #6 in the current draft reads, “connect ourselves to past and contemporary **resistance movements** that struggle for social justice on the **global** and local levels”. To see how such language can be used to justify hate in the classroom, look no further than San Francisco State University (SFSU). A program within SFSU’s the College of Ethnic Studies [planned an event](#) on September 23rd called “Gender, **Justice, & Resistance**: A conversation with Leila Khaled”. Khaled, a member of the PFLP terrorist group, was personally responsible for a plane hijacking that nearly ended in the mass murder of 148 civilians. The professor hosting this event, Rabab Abdulhadi, is cited in [Appendix A](#) of the ESMC.

| | | | | |
|----|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|
| 53 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 9, lines 193–204 | <p>Insert the following language (unspecified):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “An ethnic studies course should provide students with depth of understanding in relation to ethnic and social issues, rather than promoting specific political activism, demonstration, protest or the like. Ethnic studies is a scientific inquiry of ethnic groups and their interrelations (Yang, 2010, pg. 14). • An Ethnic Studies course: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Should include examples of civic engagement (e.g., voting and other peaceful social justice activities) and the impact they have had on United States history. Students who are considering volunteering, social justice activities, community engagement, etc., should consult with their school teacher/advisor and parents/guardians to evaluate that the activities are lawful, peaceful, and nonviolent. • Whenever possible, should [create] opportunities for participation and for reflection on the responsibilities of citizens in a free society” (History Social Science Framework for California Public Schools, 2016, p. 19).” | No specific location for addition was provided. The lines listed cut across two sections. |
|----|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|---|

- This change was originally submitted for inclusion in Chapter 3, page 9, lines 193-204, not chapter 1. Adding this language to chapter 3 will provide crucial guidance for any “community engagement project that allows for students to use their knowledge and voice to affect social transformation in their community.”

| | | | | |
|----|--|---------------------------------|--|---|
| 54 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 10, line 200 | Change section header to, “Guiding Principles and Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching.” | Proposed edit conflicts with the below. |
| 55 | 9-30-20 ICS | Chapter 1, page 10, line 200 | Change section header to, “Guiding Principles and Eight Outcomes of K–12 Ethnic Studies Teaching.” | Proposed edit conflicts with the above. |

- One of the two edits above should be made, and this section together with change #42 should be repeated throughout the lesson plans in Appendix B to provide consistent guidance for educators. This is essential to help ensure the ESMC is not used to promote bias or one-sided political agendas in the classroom, as was the case with the 1st draft.

| | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|
| 60 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Chapter 1, page 13, lines 281– 282 | Change to read, “It can also help students connect current resistance movements to those of the past, and to imagine new possibilities for a more perfect union.” OR “It can also help students connect current resistance movements to those of the past, and to imagine new possibilities for a more just society.” | CDE Recommends |
| 64 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 1, page 14, lines 316- 323 | Revise paragraph to read, “Ethnic studies should help students learn to value and appreciate differences and each other’s lived experiences as valuable assets in our diverse society in order to communicate more effectively and constructively with students of different backgrounds. It should help them communicate and interact with empathy, appreciation, empowerment, and clarity, to interact with curiosity, to listen empathically without judgment, and to critically consider new ideas and perspectives. It should also encourage students to modify their positions in the light of new evidence and compelling insights. Students should not seek to dominate in conversations and debates, but rather practice a model of engagement which places a greater priority on listening, seeking to understand before seeking to persuade.” | CDE Recommends with modification (delete “and debates”) |

| | | | | |
|----|-------------|----------------------------|---|---|
| 70 | 9-30-20 ICS | Chapter 2, page 3, line 66 | <p>Insert before line 66:</p> <p><i>“Ensure that students receive appropriate and non-discriminatory instruction and materials.</i> Ensure that district guidelines, professional development, syllabi, classroom instructional materials, and other contents of a locally developed ethnic studies course meet requirements for presenting potentially controversial issues in K-12 public school classrooms. While developing instruction and materials, school districts and local education agencies will follow the additions to the Education Code from AB-331 Pupil Instruction: High School Graduation Requirements: Ethnic Studies:</p> <p>(G) (iv) Instruction and materials for a course described in clause (ii) shall meet all of the following requirements:</p> <p>(I) Be appropriate for use with pupils of all races, religions, genders, sexual orientations, and diverse ethnic and cultural backgrounds, pupils with disabilities, and English learners.</p> <p>(II) Not reflect or promote, directly or indirectly, any bias, bigotry, or discrimination against any person or group of persons on the basis of any category protected by Section 220.</p> <p>(III) Not teach or promote religious doctrine</p> <p>See https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billCompareClient.xhtml?bill_id=201920200AB331&showamends=false accessed 9/17/2020.”</p> | <p>CDE Recommends with revisions</p> <p>Assembly Bill 331 was not signed into law. If accepted, the requirements should not be presented as Ed. Code changes from AB-331, but rather be reframed as existing requirements.</p> |
|----|-------------|----------------------------|---|---|

| | | | | |
|----|-------------|----------------------------|--|-----------------------|
| 71 | 9-30-20 ICS | Chapter 2, page 3, line 66 | <p>Insert after line 66, after the previous addition:</p> <p><i>“Ensure fair and balanced pedagogy. Ensure that pedagogy ‘must support that, in the investigation, presentation and interpretation of facts and ideas within the prescribed course of study, teachers shall be free to examine, present and responsibly discuss various points of view in an atmosphere of open inquiry, provided that the instruction, material, or discussion: is appropriate to the age and maturity level of the students; is a fair and balanced academic presentation of various points of view consistent with accepted standards of professional responsibility, rather than advocacy, personal opinion, bias or partisanship (adapted from the United Teachers – Los Angeles/Los Angeles Unified School District Contract 2014-2017, Article XXV Academic Freedom and responsibility, 1.0 Lesson Content).^{5’} ”</i></p> <p>“Footnote 5 2017 the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team, “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum,” https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf accessed 9/22/2020.”</p> | CDE Recommends |
|----|-------------|----------------------------|--|-----------------------|

- Line edits 70 and 71 are essential to help ensure the ESMC is not used to promote bias or hate in the classroom, as was the case with the 1st draft of the curriculum.

| | | | | |
|----|-------------|------------------------------|---|---|
| 86 | 9-30-20 ICS | Chapter 2, page 10, line 249 | <p>Insert after line 249:</p> <p>“For example, the Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials in the California History-Social Science Framework states that: “Materials include the study of issues and historical and social science debates. Students are presented with different perspectives and come to understand the importance of reasoned debate and reliable evidence, recognizing that people in a democratic society have the right to disagree.”⁵ In addition, districts and LEAs should keep in mind Section 60044 of the California Education Code that schools may not use instructional materials that contain “any matter reflecting adversely upon persons on the basis of race or ethnicity, gender, religion, disability, nationality, or sexual orientation, occupation.” California Education Code, Section 60044.⁶</p> <p>An example of guidelines written by a district on how to implement ethnic studies is “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017.”⁷ When districts and LEAs create their own guidelines for teaching ethnic studies in their district, this may serve as a model guideline. LAUSD gathered many district stakeholder groups, found language to summarize how to address balanced pedagogy and instructional materials, and address student and teacher needs in support of teaching ethnic studies.</p> | <p>CDE Recommends</p> <p>If the edits above are made, adjust footnote numbers appropriately.</p> |
|----|-------------|------------------------------|---|---|

| | | | | |
|----|-------------|------------------------------|--|---|
| 86 | 9-30-20 ICS | Chapter 2, page 10, line 249 | <p>(continued)</p> <p>Footnote 5 See <i>History–Social Science Framework for California Public Schools</i>, p.182, Criteria for Evaluating Instructional Materials, item 7. Accessed 9/22/2020.</p> <p>Footnote 6 California Education Code 60044. http://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/codes_displaySection.xhtml?lawCode=EDC&sectionNum=60044 accessed 9/22/2020.</p> <p>Footnote 7 See “Elements of a Balanced Curriculum, adopted by the Los Angeles Unified School District (LAUSD) Multidisciplinary Ethnic Studies Advisory Team in 2017. https://achieve.lausd.net/cms/lib/CA01000043/Centricity/Domain/226/Balance%202017.pdf. Accessed 9/22/2020.”</p> | <p>CDE Recommends</p> <p>If the edits above are made, adjust footnote numbers appropriately.</p> |
|----|-------------|------------------------------|--|---|

- Line edit 86 will help ensure the ESMC is not used to promote bias or hate in the classroom, as was the case with the 1st draft of the curriculum.

| | | | | |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| 124 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 12, lines 279–281 | Change to, “Ethnic studies educators are encouraged to establish community agreements or classroom norms in collaboration with their students where empathetic listening is prioritized and conflicting views are valued as opportunities for deeper learning, incorporate community building activities into lessons, and create time for regular reflection and debrief.” | CDE Recommends |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------|

| | | | | |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| 128 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 13, lines 304–306 | Change to, “Facilitating thoughtful, respectful, and generative discussions of controversial issues can be especially challenging in classrooms where students bring a diversity of social, personal, cultural, and academic backgrounds, mindsets, and experiences to the conversation.” | CDE Recommends |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|-----------------------|

| | | | | |
|-----|--|--|--|---|
| 129 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 13, lines 306– 309 | Change to, “Yet the richness of these discussions and their importance for future citizenship drives many teachers whose classes are relatively homogeneous to seek out opportunities for their students to engage with counterparts of different backgrounds.” | CDE Recommends |
| 130 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 13, lines 310– 311 | Change to, “It is equally challenging to consistently facilitate honest or insightful dialogue in classrooms where there is a greater degree of social, personal, economic and/or political homogeneity.” | CDE Recommends |
| 132 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 14, lines 320– 322 | Change to, “Knowledge of their students’ backgrounds and the ability to elicit students’ questions and perspectives, monitor their understanding, push them to think critically, and help them appreciate the insights, wisdom, and moral courage of themselves and others.” | CDE Recommends If edit is approved, remove the period to match other bullets. |
| 133 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 14, lines 323– 325 | Change to, “A map of anticipated challenges – and a set of strategies, supports, and mentors that they can turn to when students’ confusion, lack of engagement, misconceptions, prejudices, or hurtful comments and behavior prove challenging” | CDE Recommends |
| 135 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Chapter 3, page 14, line 329 | Add bullet, “Careful attention to their own political viewpoints and potential biases, to ensure students are empowered to form their own opinions rather than simply adopting the views of the teacher or particular educational materials.” | CDE Recommends |

| | | | | |
|-----|-----|-----------------------------------|---|--|
| 157 | CDE | Chapter 3, page 21, lines 535–537 | Change to read, “...the unique experiences of Southwest Asians (Middle Eastern populations) such as Arabs, Armenians, Assyrians, Chaldeans, Coptic-Christians, Iranians, Mizrahi Jews, Kurds, and Yazidis, South Asians such as Sikhs, Hindus, Afghans, Bangladeshis, Indians, Pakistanis, and Sri Lankans, Southeast Asians, such as Cambodians, Hmong, Laotians, Indonesians, Malaysians, Myanmarers, Thais, and Vietnamese, East Asians, such as Chinese, Japanese, Koreans, and Taiwanese, Filipina/o/x, Pacific Islanders, and U.S. colonialism and imperialism in the Pacific.” | CDE Recommends Combine the three edits directly above. |
|-----|-----|-----------------------------------|---|--|

- This is an important acknowledgement of diverse Middle Eastern populations in California.

| | | | | |
|-----|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| 186 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Chapter 3, page 31, lines 797–799 | Change to, “Other times, especially when we are able to get to know a person, we are able to see past labels and, perhaps, find common ground and value and appreciate differences.” | CDE Recommends |
| 187 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Chapter 3, page 31, lines 799–805 | Change to read, “Some examples of topics that could be used to explore questions of identity are the "model minority myth" and its historic and contemporary implications for Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders, the experiences of Arab Americans and the rise of Islamophobia and discrimination against Sikhs in the aftermath of 9/11 and the War on Terror, the recent rise in anti-Semitic violence, hatred, and rhetoric, and the way that Native Americans have challenged the use of native iconography and dress for mascots on college campuses and professional sports leagues.” | CDE Recommends, with modification (move quotes: “model minority” myth) Proposed edit conflicts with the below. |

- Line edit 187 acknowledges that antisemitic hate and rhetoric have increased, alongside violence.

| | | | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|
| 197 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Chapter 3, page 33, lines 861– 862 | Change to read, “Another example is the American Jewish population, including those who immigrated to California from Europe after World War II and the Holocaust, from Arab states after facing escalating oppression and violence, from Iran after the Islamic Revolution, and from the former Soviet Union after a decades-long struggle to be granted the right to leave.” | Proposed edit conflicts with the below. |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--|--|---|

- This change would acknowledge Jewish immigration stories which have been ignored or underrepresented in public education – a key goal of ethnic studies.

| | | | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|---|-----------------------|
| 236 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Appendix A, pages 5–9 | Remove course outline titled “CP Introduction to Ethnic Studies.” | CDE Recommends |
|-----|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|---|-----------------------|

- This removes a problematic course outline which wrongly equates Jewish and Irish American experiences, and frames the diverse Jewish community as “gaining racial privilege”.

| | | | | |
|-----|--|---------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|
| 252 | 9-30-20 Cevallos and Tan Attachment 1 | Appendix B, page 3, lines 45–47 | Change to, “The following sample lessons are aligned to the ethnic studies outcomes from chapter 1 and the state-adopted content standards in history–social science, English language arts and literacy, and English language development. | This edit conflicts with the below. |
| 253 | 9-30-20 ICS | Appendix B, page 3, lines 45–47 | Change to, “The following sample lessons are aligned to the ethnic studies values, and to the guiding principles and outcomes from Chapter 1 and the state-adopted content standards in history–social science, English language arts and literacy, and English language development.” | This edit conflicts with the above. |

- It is important to combine one of the two options above with earlier edits to the “Guiding Values and Principles” and “Outcomes” section in Chapter 1.

| | | | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|-----------------------|
| 292 | 9-22-20 Rothstein Attachment 1 | Appendix B, page 13, line 279 | Add sentence, “Include as well that in addition to rightfully demanding the inclusion of marginalized communities within higher education, TWLF leaders and activists also promoted destructive ideas such as antisemitism and celebrated Communist revolutionaries responsible for tens of millions of deaths.” | [intentionally blank] |
|-----|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|-----------------------|

- The above change would add unpleasant but important context about the TWLF, helping students understand that social movements can promote good ideas about some issues and bad ideas about others. The language above is based on well documented facts which should not be swept under the rug. One of the most prominent leaders of TWLF gave a [speech in 1968](#) in which he, “attacked Jewish people as exploiters of the Negroes in America and South Africa and called for ‘victory to the Arab people’ over Israel,” according to a news report from that period. In [another speech](#) about TWLF, this same leader said, “it is up to us to make the revolution, to break the system, to smash it, shatter it, and destroy it, as brother Lenin said”. Vladimir Lenin was the founder of the Soviet Union, one of the most violent and oppressive empires in history. TWLF also drew [significant inspiration](#) from Mao Zedong, the communist dictator of China who was responsible for the deaths of tens of millions of people. Students have a right to know this context.

| | | | | |
|-----|--|--|---|--|
| 306 | 9-30-20 Lee Hueling Attachment 3 | Appendix B, page 22, lines 464–465 | Change to, “Students will conduct research (identifying primary sources) on the history of housing discrimination and redlining across California cities, some of the housing issues today and how different ethnic groups are impacted.” | CDE Recommends Edit overlaps with the one below. |
|-----|--|--|---|--|

Line edits that would add lesson plans, which require additional action

| | | | | |
|-----|-------------------------------------|-------------------------|---|--|
| 423 | 9-30-20 Fa and Lee Attachment | Appendix B, page 111 | Add lesson, “Important Asian American Historical Figures” to the Asian American and Pacific Islander section. | See Attachment D. A version of this lesson with suggested edits by CDE was posted in the subfolder, “Publicly-Submitted Lessons with CDE Edits.” |
|-----|-------------------------------------|-------------------------|---|--|

- Additional action required to address problematic content within the lesson (see the following section below).

| | | | | |
|-----|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| 426 | 9-30-20 Levin Attachment | Appendix B (location unspecified) | Add submitted lesson, "Antisemitism and Middle Eastern-American Jews." | See Attachment D. A version of this lesson with suggested edits by CDE was posted in the subfolder, "Publicly-Submitted Lessons with CDE Edits." If this lesson is added, CDE recommends combining it with language from Attachment E (see comment 446). |
|-----|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|

- Additional action required to ensure this lesson is included properly within the curriculum (see below).

| | | | | |
|-----|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|
| 444 | 9-30-20 Lee and Fa Attachment 1 | Appendix B (location unspecified) | Add submitted lesson, "Important Historical Figures Among People of Color." | See Attachment D. Submitters provided two versions of this lesson; the second uses "hxrstory." A version of this lesson with suggested edits by CDE was posted in the subfolder, "Publicly-Submitted Lessons with CDE Edits." |
|-----|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|

- Additional action required to address problematic content within the lesson (see below).

| | | | | |
|-----|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|
| 446 | 9-30-20 Elias Attachment | Appendix B (location unspecified) | Add submitted lesson, "Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race." | See Attachment D. A version of this lesson with suggested edits by CDE was posted in the subfolder, "Publicly-Submitted Lessons with CDE Edits." If this lesson is added, CDE recommends combining it with language from Attachment E (see comment 447). |
|-----|--------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|

- Additional action required to ensure this lesson is included properly within the curriculum (see below).

| | | | | |
|-----|-----|------------|--|--|
| 447 | CDE | Appendix B | <p>Insert language from Attachment E, "Additional Language for Appendix B" at the end of Appendix B as a new section. If the IQC approves them, insert the following lessons in this section:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Sikh-American Community in California • Antisemitism and Jewish Middle Eastern-Americans • Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race • Arab American Stereotypes in Literature, Film, and Media Pre- and Post-9/11 • Armenian Migration Stories and Oral History | <p>CDE Recommends See Attachment D.</p> |
|-----|-----|------------|--|--|

- Additional action required to address problematic content within the lesson "Arab American Stereotypes..." (see below).

Additional Lesson Plans Edited by the CDE

Antisemitism and Jewish Middle Eastern Americans

- JIMENA has requested that this lesson plan be included in the Asian American and Pacific Islander Studies section. If a lesson plan about Arab Americans is included in that section, JIMENA's request should be honored as well. The same is true for all additional lesson plans about Asian American communities that CDE has recommended for inclusion in Appendix B.
- The definitions of antisemitism on [pages 6-7 of the original version](#) should be included in full, rather than the ones edited by the CDE. The edited versions remove crucial context that is essential for students to fully understand antisemitism. At the very least, the links to these definitions should be added back into the lesson plan:
 - <https://www.adl.org/anti-semitism>
 - <https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/working-definition-antisemitism>

Jewish Americans: Identity, Intersectionality, and Complicating Ideas of Race

- The original definition of antisemitism should be included in full on page 8, rather than the one edited by the CDE. The edited version removes crucial context that is essential for students to fully understand antisemitism. This is the original definition that should be restored:
 - **antisemitism** - Hatred, discrimination, fear, and prejudice against Jews based on stereotypes and myths that target their ethnicity, culture, religion, traditions, right to self-determination, or connection to the State of Israel.

Arab American Studies – Sample Unit Plan

- Page 22 includes a lesson where students watch a [stand-up comedy routine](#) in which the comic, Mo Amer, finishes by joking that the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and/or the fact that Palestine isn't a state is "all your [Germany's] fault to begin with." While it is unreasonable to expect historical accuracy from comedians, this segment would certainly mislead students about the roots and causes of the conflict.

Important Asian American Historical Figures & Important Historical Figures Among People of Color

- These lessons encourage students to learn "how we should challenge white supremacy today" from specific historical figures, and examine how those figures contributed to "the movement for racial and economic equality." Among the figures listed are:

- Yuri Kochiyama, an activist who [praised](#) Chairman Mao and Osama Bin Laden.
 - Helen Thomas, a prominent reporter who made widely reported [antisemitic comments](#) towards the end of her career.
 - Congresswoman Ilhan Omar, who has been [widely criticized](#) for multiple antisemitic comments.
 - Congresswoman Rashida Tlaib, who has been widely criticized for [antisemitic comments](#) and [working closely](#) with [hate groups](#).
 - Activist Linda Sarsour, who has a long record of antisemitic [actions](#) and [statements](#), close ties to infamous antisemite and homophobe [Louis Farrakhan](#) and his [organization](#), and facing [criticism from fellow activists](#) for leading Women's March Inc. in ways that, "are detrimental to the movement."
 - Reies Tijerina, an activist who "turned many previous supporters away as he moved toward a singularly novel, but unmistakable, anti-Semitism," according to the [New York Times](#).
- The above list is non-exhaustive. While it is legitimate to **teach about** significant current or historical figures who promoted components of white supremacy (i.e. antisemitism) or other destructive ideas, it is not legitimate to frame those figures in positive or celebratory terms. The lesson should be revised to either remove figures who have espoused such ideas or require students to grapple directly with their flaws.