

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum May 2019 Draft

(Download and use to provide specific recommendations)

Include the chapter of the model curriculum, the page number, and line number(s) to ensure that the California Department of Education and Instructional Quality Commission can reference the content of the document when reviewing your comments. Please email this document as a Word document to [ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov](mailto:ethnicstudies@cde.ca.gov). You may contact Kenneth McDonald, Education Programs Consultant, at [kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov](mailto:kmcdonal@cde.ca.gov) with any questions regarding this template or the public input process.

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?	Kevin Dayton, Resident of California	<i>General Argument:</i> Despite the self-referential claims within the model curriculum overview that certain criticism of it is inherently illegitimate (see references to “blatant resistance to implementation” and “where parents or community members are hostile to the field”), the State of California is still governed by a higher legal authority: the United States Constitution, which states in the First Amendment that the government is prohibited from making any law “respecting an establishment of religion.” This Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum establishes a religion, and thus is illegal. Examples from the Introduction and Overview are below.
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		“Further, it is the xdisciplinary, loving, and critical praxis of holistic humanity – as educational and racial justice. It is from communities of color and our intergenerational worldviews, memories, experiences, identities, narratives, and voices.”  <i>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," because “loving” and “praxis of holistic humanity” refer to subjective spiritual conditions.</i>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 2 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Ethnic Studies is xdisciplinary, in that it variously takes the forms of being interdisciplinary, multidisciplinary, transdisciplinary, undisciplinary, and intradisciplinary. As such, it can grow its original language to serve these needs with purposeful respellings of terms, including history as herstory and women as womxn, connecting with a gender and sexuality lens, along with a socioeconomic class lens at three of its intersections.”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," because they use spiritual terms that lack objective definition or understanding.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“As a field catalyzed by a righteous angst for justice and access to knowledge (rather than merely “closing a gap”), Ethnic Studies intentionally works toward helping pay this education debt.”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," as there is no objective definition or measurement of “righteous angst” or an “education debt.” These are spiritual concepts.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Ethnic Studies has created a space for all students to learn about and analyze their identities and hxrstories, feel proud of them, and actualize their full humanity.”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," as there is no objective definition of the spiritual concepts of identity, pride, and actualization.</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 3 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“the themes and topics discussed within the field are boundless”</i></p> <p>This indicates it is acceptable to insert religious content into the curriculum, thus allowing for “establishment of religion” within the curriculum.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Ethnic Studies is about people whose cultures, hxrstories, and social positionalities are forever changing and evolving. Thus, Ethnic Studies also examines borders, borderlands, mixtures, hybridities, nepantlas, double consciousness, and reconfigured articulations, even within and beyond the various names and categories associated with our identities. People do not fit neatly into boxes, and identity is complex.”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," as there is no objective definition of such spiritual terms as “hybridities, nepantlas, double consciousness, and reconfigured articulations.”</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Critical solidarities are imperative for Ethnic Studies, it is out of these solidarities that the field emerged with the Third World Liberation Front (TWLF), and with these solidarities that Ethnic Studies is growing nationally today.”</i></p> <p>This statements is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it appears to refer to some sort of religious movement related to human liberation from a subjective spiritual experience.</p>

## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 4 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“...students refused to attend classes for five months until administrators met their demands”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it appears to refer to a fast or deprivation for spiritual purposes.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Christine Sleeter, Critical Education scholar, posits, ‘rather than being divisive, Ethnic Studies helps students to bridge differences that already exists in experiences and perspectives,’ highlighting that division is antithetical to Ethnic Studies.”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it insinuates a purpose of the curriculum is to eliminate division in various individual viewpoints, presumably including religious or spiritual viewpoints.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“students are encouraged to reflect on the course’s relationship to their own ancestries and lives as hxrstorically situated human beings.”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it refers to a subjective spiritual condition of being “situated.”</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 5 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“The foundational values of Ethnic Studies are housed in the conceptual model of the “double helix” which interweaves holistic humanization and critical consciousness. Humanization includes the values of love, respect, hope, and solidarity are based on celebration of community cultural wealth. The values rooted in humanization and critical consciousness shapes the following guiding principles for Ethnic Studies teaching and learning.”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," as there is no objective definition of “holistic humanization” or “critical consciousness.” In addition, there is no objective definition of “interweave” in the context of spiritual concepts.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>1. “cultivate empathy, community actualization, cultural perpetuity, self-worth, self-determination, and the holistic well-being...”</i></p> <p>This statement is “respecting an establishment of religion,” as there is no objective definition or measurement of these spiritual concepts.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>4. “critique empire and its relationship to white supremacy, racism, patriarchy, cisheteropatriarchy, capitalism, ableism, anthropocentrism, and other forms of power and oppression at the intersections of our society;”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion" because it refers to the undesirability of other systems of belief that presumably include spiritual elements.</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 6 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p>5. <i>“challenge imperialist/colonial hegemonic beliefs and practices on the ideological, institutional, interpersonal, and internalized levels;”</i></p> <p>This statement is “respecting an establishment of religion,” as it indicates an effort to convert students from some spiritual beliefs and practices to others.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p>7. <i>“conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for post-imperial life that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it refers to a utopian transformative spiritual condition of existence (described here as “post-imperial life”) and uses spiritual terms that lack objective meaning such as “critical hope” and “radical healing.”</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“This five element approach and praxis-centered definition of Ethnic Studies will help ensure that educators recognize that one’s pedagogy cannot be solely based on pedagogical theories or ‘teaching style’. Teaching Ethnic Studies necessitates that pedagogues consider the larger principles and purpose of Ethnic Studies, the context in which the course is being taught, and even a reflection on the pedagogue’s identity and positionality.”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it suggests that the teacher of the curriculum needs to be a spiritual convert to the religion in order to be qualified to teach it.</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 7 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Dawn Mabalon provides the following essential questions that guide the purpose of Ethnic Studies: ‘(1) Who am I? (2) Who is my family and community? (3) What can I do to bring positive change to my community and world?’”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as such questions lack objective meaning or measurement. In addition, the curriculum insinuates that some definitions of “I,” “family,” “community,” and “positive change” are spiritually heretical.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>"democratize their classrooms by creating a learning environment where both students and teachers are equal active participants in the co-constructing knowledge, replacing what Paulo Freire describes as the 'banking' concept with problem-posing education."</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," in that a formalized assembly determines doctrinal standards for what knowledge is and what it is not. Knowledge is not defined but presumably includes spiritual content. It is unclear in the model curriculum how dissenters are disciplined by the democratic majority that reaches agreement on knowledge. (Receipt of failing grade, perhaps?)</p>

# Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 8 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“Finally, it is important that Ethnic Studies educators be aware of their own identities, positionalities, subjectivities, and privilege. More specifically, a reflection on how their identities may impact Ethnic Studies teaching and learning. With much of the field focusing on issues related to race and identity, teachers, especially those with limited Ethnic Studies knowledge, should engage in activities that allow them to unpack their own identities, marginalization, lived experiences, and understanding of race, culture, and social justice...leading Ethnic Studies scholars highly recommend that they work through assignments like critical autobiography, critical storytelling, critical life history, or keeping a subjectivity journal, to begin the process of 'constructively situating oneself in relationship to Ethnic Studies.'”</i></p> <p>These statements are "respecting an establishment of religion," as they suggests that the teacher of the curriculum needs to be a spiritual convert to the religion in order to be qualified to teach it.</p>
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>"The 'Privilege Walk' activity allows students to confront aspects of potential personal privilege, and learn about the challenges that others face that they may not have considered."</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it refers to a practice of spiritual meditation for the purposes of spiritual transformation.</p>



## Public Input Template–2020 Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum

Page 9 of 9

Chapter of Model Curriculum	Your Name and Affiliation	Comment (include page and line numbers where applicable)
Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview Why Teach Ethnic Studies?		<p><i>“For if they do not see themselves in the ‘mirror,’ they may fall victim to believing, that there is in fact nothing to see, or even worse, that they, like monsters, indeed have no reflection, no meaningful nor positive contribution to this society.”</i></p> <p>This statement is "respecting an establishment of religion," as it refers to a practice of spiritual meditation for the purposes of spiritual transformation.</p>

California Department of Education, June 2019