

Creating Inclusive and Equitable Communities – A Call to Action

Understanding the origins and impact of bigotry in the U.S. today and what we can do about it

Lesson 2: Introducing Dominant Narratives

Contributors:

Melissa Levinson, MA in Arab Studies Nikhil Laud, MA in Education Magdalena Gross, PhD in Religious Studies Ameena Jandali, MA in Near Eastern Studies

Islamic Networks Group (ING)

3031 Tisch Way, 110 Plaza West San Jose, CA 95128 Phone: 408.296.7312 Website: www.ing.org

Facebook: facebook.com/ing.org
Instagram: Instagram.com/ing_org
Twitter: twitter.com/ing.org
LinkedIn: linkedin.com/company/ing.org



Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Relevant Curriculum Standards	2
Background Information for Educators	2
Learning Objectives	2
Guiding Questions	3
Key Concepts and Terminology	3
In-Class Activities	3
Discussion Questions	5
Homework	5
Additional Resources	5
Student Worksheets	7
What is a Dominant Narrative?	7
Note-taking Sheet for "What is a Dominant Narrative?"	9

Introduction

According to the <u>Inclusive Teaching Collaborative</u>, a dominant narrative is "an explanation or story that is told in service of the dominant social group's interests and ideologies. It usually achieves dominance through repetition, the apparent authority of the speaker (often accorded to speakers who represent the dominant social groups), and the silencing of alternative accounts. Because dominant narratives are so normalized through their repetition and authority, they have the illusion of being objective and apolitical, when in fact they are neither."¹

This lesson plan is designed to teach students how to identify and critically evaluate dominant narratives they encounter in their daily lives. This lesson plan also addresses the role of power in perpetuating dominant narratives and determining who benefits from or is harmed by the persistence of these narratives. Students will watch a TedTalk by Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie and read an article that discusses the consequences of dominant narratives.

Theme: Systems of Power

Disciplinary Area: General Ethnic Studies

¹ "Dominant Narratives," Inclusive Teaching Collaborative (University of Michigan), accessed September 6, 2020, https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/inclusive-teaching/sample-activities/dominant-narratives/.



Ethnic Studies Values and Principles Alignment: 3, 4, 5

Relevant Curriculum Standards

California's <u>Literacy in History/Social Studies Standards</u>:

- Reading Standards for Literacy in History/Social Studies: RH.9.10.5; RST.11.12.7;
 RH.11.12.8
 - Analyze how a text uses structure to emphasize key points or advance an explanation or analysis.
 - Integrate and evaluate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively as well as in words) in order to address a question or solve a problem.
 - Evaluate an author's premises, claims, and evidence by corroborating or challenging them with other information.
- Writing Standards for Literacy in History/Social Studies, Science, and Technical Subjects: WHST.9.10.4; 9.10.9
 - Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.
 - Draw evidence from informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

Background Information for Educators

Please see "What is a Dominant Narrative?" (page 7) for more information on dominant narratives.

Learning Objectives

Identity: How will my instruction help students learn something about themselves and/or others?

- Students will be able to recognize dominant narratives that they encounter in their lives.
- Students will be able to explain how dominant narratives impact their perceptions about themselves and others.

Skills: How will my instruction build students' skills relating to the content?

- Students will be able to critically interrogate authoritative sources of information.
- Students will be able to demonstrate critical reading skills to analyze dominant narratives.

Intellect: How will my instruction build students' knowledge and mental powers?

- Students will be able identify examples of dominant narratives.
- Students will be able to recognize bias in dominant narratives.

Criticality: How will my instruction inform students' views of power and equity and the disruption of oppression?

• Students will be able to articulate how dominant narratives benefit dominant groups and harm oppressed groups.



- Students will be able to question whose voices are missing from dominant narratives and why.
- Students will be able to demonstrate ways to challenge or interrupt dominant narratives.

Guiding Questions

- 1. What are dominant narratives and why do they exist?
- 2. Where do we encounter dominant narratives and how can you identify them?
- 3. How do dominant narratives benefit dominant groups and harm oppressed groups?

Key Concepts and Terminology

- **Dominant Narrative** an explanation or story that is told in service of the dominant social group's interests and ideologies.
- **Power** political or social authority.
- **Authority** the power or ability to make rules and influence others.
- Oppression unjust treatment of and control over an individual or group.
- **Normalization** making something conform to, or reducing something to a norm or standard.

In-Class Activities

- 1. The Hook Write the following quote by Chinua Achebe on the board "Until the lions have their own historians, the story of the hunt will always glorify the hunter." Ask students to write a reflective paragraph about what this quote means to them. Encourage students to use the words "narrative" and "perspective" in their response. Students may share their responses with the class. Next, write the words "Dominant Narrative" on the whiteboard. Ask students to say what words or phrases come to their mind when they hear the term "dominant narrative." Using WordClouds, create a word cloud based on the students' answers. You will create another word cloud at the end of the class to compare how students' understanding of dominant narratives has progressed through the lesson.
- 2. **Main Activity (Part 1)** Play Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie's Ted Talk "The Danger of a Single Story" for the class. This Ted Talk further explores the concept of dominant narratives by explaining the damaging effects of being exposed to only one powerful narrative. This video will help students recognize one-sided perspectives, missing voices, and bias in the dominant narratives they encounter about various marginalized groups.



- 3. Class Discussion (Part 1) Class Discussion about Narrative, Perspective, and Power Lead a class discussion based on the main takeaways from Adichie's Ted Talk to help students understand the importance of critically engaging with and interrogating the dominant narratives they encounter in their daily lives.
- 4. Class Discussion (Part 2) Class Discussion on Confronting Dominant Narratives Write an example of a contemporary dominant narrative on the whiteboard. Some examples could include:
 - "America is a land of equal opportunity. If someone does not succeed, it is because they did not try hard enough."
 - "South and Central American migrants come to the United States to get free public benefits and take American jobs."

(Note: you may also want to ask students to brainstorm examples of dominant narratives that they have heard of, but only do so if you believe your students have the appropriate maturity to do this). Some of these examples may be uncomfortable for students. As the class facilitator, try to create an accepting environment where students feel "comfortable being uncomfortable" but never feel unsafe or triggered. Students are exposed to dominant narratives like the ones above in many different settings, so the goal of this lesson is to help students explicitly identify these narratives in order to confront them. In other words, students must recognize and understand dominant narratives before they can challenge or change them.

Lead a class discussion around the example you wrote on the board. Use the Guiding Questions on page 5 to guide the discussion.

- 5. **Main Activity (Part 2)** Provide each student with a copy of the "What is a Dominant Narrative?" article (page 7) and the note-taking sheet (page 9). Explain that this article will help students deepen their understanding of how dominant narratives function and why they are so persistent. Divide the class into groups of three or four students. Ask the students to read the article with their group members and take notes on the provided note-taking sheet.
- 6. **Reflection** After students have finished reading and taking notes, bring the class back together to lead a reflective discussion about the main takeaways from the article and from the earlier class discussion. Guiding questions may include:
 - How has your understanding of dominant narratives changed?
 - How do dominant narratives benefit dominant groups?
 - How do dominant narratives harm oppressed groups?
 - What are some ways to challenge or change dominant narratives?
 - What questions do you still have? What more would you like to learn about dominant narratives?

Now that students have a better understanding of dominant narratives, ask students to say what words or phrases come to their mind when they hear the term "dominant narrative." Using WordClouds, create a word cloud based on the students' answers. Compare this word



cloud with the one created at the beginning of class to help students visualize how their understanding of dominant narratives has progressed through the lesson.

- 7. **Extension Activities** Here are some ideas for further student exploration into the colonial roots of dominant narratives:
 - Students watch the Stanford video on <u>Lateral Reading</u>, which introduces students to the steps they should take to critically analyze a source's narrative. Students write down three main takeaways from the video and any questions they may have.
 - Students create Quizlet.com flashcards for the key vocabulary words and concepts from the lesson.

Discussion Questions

- 1. Have you ever heard this narrative? If so, where?
- 2. Whom does this narrative serve? (or who benefits from this narrative?)
- 3. Whom does this narrative harm?
- 4. What assumptions are being made?
- 5. What stereotypes are being used?
- 6. Whose perspective is represented by this narrative?
- 7. What narratives or perspectives is it trying to silence?
- 8. Why do you suppose this narrative is powerful?
- 9. What is your personal reaction to this narrative?
- 10. How has this narrative impacted you? Do you benefit from it? Does it harm you?
- 11. How have you participated in or resisted this narrative?

Homework

Create a Reference Guide - Ask students to create a reference guide about how to evaluate the various narratives they encounter in their lives. Students should use this homework assignment to design a plan for how to determine a narrative's reliability, motivation, and bias. If students need inspiration, refer them to the <u>Lateral Reading</u> technique or to the discussion questions presented in class.

Assessment, Application, Action, and Reflection

• Refer to steps 3-6 of the In-Class Activities section



Additional Resources

- University of Michigan's Inclusive Teaching Collaborative, "Dominant Narratives" https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/inclusive-teaching/sample-activities/dominant-narratives/
- Reclaim Philadelphia, "What is a Dominant Narrative?" by Kelly Morton https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative
- Teaching Tolerance, "Shifting Out of Neutral" by Jonathan Gold http://www.tolerance.org/sites/default/files/general/TT52 Shifting%20Out%20of%20Neutral.pdf
- Teaching Tolerance, "The Danger of a Single Story" by Jonathan Gold https://www.tolerance.org/magazine/the-danger-of-a-single-story
- Culturally Responsive Teaching & the Brain, "The First Six Weeks--Create a Counter Narrative" by Zaretta Hammond - https://crtandthebrain.com/the-first-six-weeks create-a-counter-narrative/
- Journal of Language & Literacy Education, "Disrupting the Dominant Narrative: Beginning English Teachers' Use of Young Adult Literature and Culturally Responsive Pedagogy" by Elsie Lindy Olan & Kia Jane Richmond - http://jolle.coe.uga.edu/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/Olan_JoLLE2017_28.pdf
- Facing History and Ourselves, "Teaching with The 1619 Project in Ethnic Studies" by Kimberly Young - https://lanetwork.facinghistory.org/teaching-with-the-1619-project-in-ethnic-studies
- Opportunity Agenda, "Vision, Values, and Voice: A Communications Toolkit" <u>https://www.opportunityagenda.org/sites/default/files/2019-</u>
 <u>05/2019.05.06%20Toolkit%20Without%20Comic%20Book.pdf</u>



Student Worksheets

What is a Dominant Narrative?

Every day we encounter narratives that shape the way we view the world around us. The narratives we hear or read every day on the news or in movies and books often represent the voices or perspectives of a society's dominant group. These narratives therefore often portray information in a way that is meant to serve the dominant social group's interests. These narratives are called "dominant narratives."

Dominant narratives "achieve dominance through repetition, the apparent authority of the speaker (often accorded to speakers who represent the dominant social groups), and the silencing of alternative accounts." Dominant narratives are normalized by being presented as objective facts.

According to Kelly Morton, an activist from Philadelphia, "narratives around gender roles, body types, power, family, immigration, age, ability are all around us. They repeat to us who is dangerous, who is a hard worker, who is lazy, who is attractive, who deserves power. Even if we become aware of them and resist them, the world around us is still playing them on loop and holding us to those narratives."

Even though everyday people's experiences often contradict the information dominant narratives tell us, dominant narratives are so powerful because they are repeated with the authority that comes with a mainstream source. Think of the American government: many Americans see the government as a credible source of information, so when a governmental official tells us something, we tend to believe it. This information is often presented as apolitical, objective truth, but often governmental officials have motivations for telling us certain information or framing a policy in a certain light.

For example, the "War on Drugs" campaign began in the 1970s. The government framed this initiative as an attempt to create law and order and combat a drug epidemic by increasing prison sentences for drug-related offenses. The dominant narrative of the "War on Drugs" was that drug dealers and users were causing violence, poverty, and addiction in cities across the country. In actuality, this narrative was used to justify disproportionate arrests of communities of color, even though Blacks and Whites use drugs at similar rates. These discriminatory policies were meant to perpetuate racialized social control.⁵

Dominant narratives in the United States often target non-White ethnic groups who face oppression at the hands of the dominant social group. We must constantly be vigilant when we read the news,

² "Dominant Narratives," Inclusive Teaching Collaborative (University of Michigan), accessed September 6, 2020, https://sites.lsa.umich.edu/inclusive-teaching/sample-activities/dominant-narratives/.

³ Kelly Morton, "What Is a Dominant Narrative?" Reclaim Philadelphia, February 11, 2019, https://www.reclaimphiladelphia.org/blog/2019/2/11/what-is-a-dominant-narrative.

⁴ Betsy Pearl, "Ending the War on Drugs: By the Numbers," Center for American Progress, June 27, 2018, https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/criminal-justice/reports/2018/06/27/452819/ending-war-drugs-numbers/.

⁵ "Parallels Between Mass Incarceration and Jim Crow," Teaching Tolerance (Southern Poverty Law Center), accessed September 7, 2020, https://www.tolerance.org/classroom-resources/tolerance-lessons/parallels-between-mass-incarceration-and-jim-crow.



study our textbooks, watch movies, or listen to politicians. Dominant narratives are so pervasive because they are everywhere and are repeated by the illusion of authority that accompanies mainstream media, educational, and governmental sources. When we encounter dominant narratives, we must always ask "what is the motivation behind this narrative?" and "whose voice or voices am I missing?"



Note-taking Sheet for "What is a Dominant Narrative?"

1.	What is a dominant narrative?
2.	Whom do dominant narratives serve?
3.	How do dominant narratives achieve their dominance? (If you aren't familiar with the term "normalize," look up a definition.)
4.	Where do we often find dominant narratives?
5.	What should we do when we encounter dominant narratives?