Christian B. Mendl, Pedro Hack, Keefe Huang, Irene López Gutiérrez

Tutorial 6 (The no-cloning theorem¹)

The no-cloning theorem states that, surprisingly, one cannot make a copy of an unknown quantum state. In more detail, we consider a system of two qubits (source and target): the first qubit is the source state $|\psi\rangle$, and the second qubit starts out in some standard state $|s\rangle$, for example $|s\rangle = |0\rangle$. Thus the initial state is $|\psi\rangle \otimes |s\rangle \equiv |\psi\rangle |s\rangle$. One would like to copy $|\psi\rangle$ into $|s\rangle$, that is, find some unitary transformation $U \in \mathbb{C}^{4\times 4}$ such that

$$|\psi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle\mapsto U(|\psi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle)=|\psi\rangle\otimes|\psi\rangle.$$

Show that such a copying procedure is impossible: the equation cannot hold for arbitrary source qubits $|\psi\rangle$.

Solution Suppose the copying procedure works for two particular states $|\psi\rangle$ and $|\varphi\rangle$. Then

$$U(|\psi\rangle \otimes |s\rangle) = |\psi\rangle \otimes |\psi\rangle,$$

$$U(|\varphi\rangle \otimes |s\rangle) = |\varphi\rangle \otimes |\varphi\rangle.$$

Taking inner products gives for the left sides

$$\Big\langle U(|\psi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle)\Big|U(|\varphi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle)\Big\rangle = (\langle\psi|\otimes\langle s|)U^{\dagger}U(|\varphi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle) = (\langle\psi|\otimes\langle s|)(|\varphi\rangle\otimes|s\rangle) = \langle\psi|\varphi\rangle\langle s|s\rangle = \langle\psi|\psi\rangle\langle s|\psi\rangle\langle s|s\rangle = \langle\psi|\psi\rangle\langle s|\psi\rangle\langle s|\psi\rangle\langle$$

and for the right sides

$$\Big\langle \left. |\psi\rangle \otimes |\psi\rangle \, \right| |\varphi\rangle \otimes |\varphi\rangle \, \Big\rangle = \langle \psi|\varphi\rangle \langle \psi|\varphi\rangle = (\langle \psi|\varphi\rangle)^2,$$

leading to $\langle \psi | \varphi \rangle = (\langle \psi | \varphi \rangle)^2$. But this can only hold for $\langle \psi | \varphi \rangle = 1$ or $\langle \psi | \varphi \rangle = 0$, so either $|\psi \rangle = |\varphi \rangle$ or $|\psi \rangle$ and $|\varphi \rangle$ are orthogonal. In other words, general quantum cloning is impossible; for example, a potential quantum cloner cannot copy the qubit states $|\psi \rangle = |0\rangle$ and $|\varphi \rangle = (|0\rangle + |1\rangle)/\sqrt{2}$.

¹M. A. Nielsen, I. L. Chuang: Quantum Computation and Quantum Information. Cambridge University Press (2010), page 532