

Extend the intuitionistic logic Nature Deduction with Kolmogorov double negation

Idea

The difference between intuitionistic logic and classical logic is whether one has the excluded middle rule.

For the nature deduction we have the above rules for introduction and elimination.

Introduction Rules

$$\frac{\vdash A \quad \vdash B}{\vdash A \wedge B} \wedge I$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{\vdash A}^u \\ \vdots \\ \vdash B \end{array}}{\vdash A \supset B} \supset I^u$$

$$\frac{\vdash A}{\vdash A \vee B} \vee I_L \quad \frac{\vdash B}{\vdash A \vee B} \vee I_R$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{\vdash A}^u \\ \vdots \\ \vdash p \end{array}}{\vdash \neg A} \neg I^{p,u}$$

$$\frac{}{\vdash \top} \top I$$

Elimination Rules

$$\frac{\vdash A \wedge B}{\vdash A} \wedge E_L \quad \frac{A \wedge B}{B} \wedge E_R$$

$$\frac{\vdash A \supset B \quad \vdash A}{\vdash B} \supset E$$

$$\frac{\begin{array}{ccc} \overline{\vdash A}^{u_1} & & \overline{\vdash B}^{u_2} \\ \vdots & & \vdots \\ \vdash A \vee B & \vdash C & \vdash C \end{array}}{\vdash C} \vee E^{u_1, u_2}$$

$$\frac{\vdash A \quad \vdash \neg A}{\vdash C} \neg E$$

$$\frac{\vdash \perp}{\vdash C} \perp E$$

Nature deduction is intuitionistic logic since it doesn't force one complement for each proposition. If we use a \neg on some proposition A and get $\neg A$. We can not repeat this process to $\neg A$ and get back to A. This property makes ND non classical logic.

To extend ND to classical logic we need to make a rule to embed the excluded middle property. Our method is by adding the Kolmogorov double negation rule. The Kolmogorov double negation rule is that for some proposition $\neg\neg A$, we can proof A. we call this rule \neg kdE(not Kolmogorov double Elimination, nkde). With this new rule our new logic – ND with the Kolmogorov double negation rule, we call it KND is almost well defined. We need also to add the sole complement for \top , which is \perp as an atomic formula and it is now surely a classical logic.

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{\neg(A \vee \neg A)}^u}{\neg A} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A}^v}{A \vee \neg A} \vee I}{\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \vee E}{\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \neg E \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{P}^p}{\neg A} \neg I^{p,v}}{\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \vee I_2}{\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \neg E \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{P}^p}{\neg\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \neg I^{p,u}}{\neg\neg(A \vee \neg A)} \neg E}{A \vee \neg A} \neg\neg E
 \end{array}$$

Now in our hand we have the intuitionistic logic ND and classical logic KND. We want to show that both these two logic are “the same” by proving that for any logical formula provable in KND it can also be proven in ND(soundness) and any logical formula provable in ND can also be proven in KND(completeness).

To do this first we need to define a translation function that translates formulas in ND or KND to their counterparts. We use the ktrans–kolmogorov translation and it is defined as (n for $\neg\neg$)

$$\begin{array}{ll}
 A^* & = nA \quad \text{if } A \text{ is atomic} \\
 (A \wedge B)^* & = n(A^* \wedge B^*) \\
 (A \supset B)^* & = n(A^* \supset B^*) \\
 (A \vee B)^* & = n(A^* \vee B^*) \\
 (\neg A)^* & = n(\neg A^*) \\
 \top^* & = n\top \\
 \perp^* & = n\perp
 \end{array}$$

Inference rule

Before we step into the proof of soundness and completeness we need some inference rule to help us eliminate double negation in ND.

First, since we can prove $\neg\neg A$ from A in ND we have the inference rule $\neg\neg X$. Same with $\neg\neg kX$. Also we can eliminate $\neg\neg A$ to A , we make it as $\neg\neg R$.

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{\neg A} u \\
 \frac{\neg A \quad A}{\neg\neg A} \neg E \Rightarrow \boxed{\frac{A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I}
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{\neg A} u \\
 \frac{\neg A \quad A}{\neg\neg A} \neg E \Rightarrow \boxed{\frac{A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg kI}
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{A} u \\
 \frac{A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I \\
 \frac{\neg\neg A \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg A} \neg E \Rightarrow \boxed{\frac{\neg\neg A}{\neg A} \neg\neg R}
 \end{array}$$

Soundness

Now with the help of our derivation rule. We can prove our soundness theorem. We do structure proof on the last used operation.

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \wedge I_1$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A \quad \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B} \wedge I \quad \neg\neg X}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg X$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \wedge B}{A} \wedge E_1$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg A} \wedge E_1 \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg X}{\frac{P}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I_1} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \supset B \quad A}{B} \supset E$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A \supset \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg A} \supset E \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg\neg B} \supset E \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \supset \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg X}{\frac{P}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I_1} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A}{A \vee B} \vee I_1 \Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A}{\neg\neg A \vee \neg\neg B} \vee I_1 \quad \neg\neg X}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \vee \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg X$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{B}{A \vee B} \vee I_2 \Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg B}{\neg\neg A \vee \neg\neg B} \vee I_2 \quad \neg\neg X}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \vee \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg X$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \wedge B}{B} \wedge E_2$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg B} \wedge E_2 \quad \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg B} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg X}{\frac{P}{\neg\neg B} \neg\neg I_1} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A}{A} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg I_1 \quad \neg\neg A}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A)} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\frac{\neg\neg B}{\neg\neg B} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\frac{\neg\neg A \supset \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg(\neg\neg A \supset \neg\neg B)} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \vee B \quad \frac{A}{C} \vee E_1 \quad \frac{B}{C} \vee E_2}{C} \vee E$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A \vee \neg\neg B}{\neg\neg C} \vee E \quad \neg\neg C}{\neg\neg C} \neg\neg I_1$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\neg\neg A}{A} \neg\neg E$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\neg\neg\neg\neg A}{\neg\neg A} \neg\neg R$$

Decomposability

//TODO

We need to show that for every formula A there exist a C such that $A = \neg C$

Completeness

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} \wedge I$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A'}{A'} \neg E \quad \frac{\neg\neg B'}{B'} \neg E}{A' \wedge^k B'} \wedge I$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{\frac{A''}{\vdots} B}{A \supset B} \supset I$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A''}{\vdots} B'}{\neg\neg A' \supset^k \neg\neg B'} \supset I^u \quad \frac{A'}{\neg\neg A'} \neg I^v}{\frac{\neg\neg B'}{B'} \neg E} \supset I^v$$

$$\frac{\neg\neg B'}{B'} \neg E$$

$$\frac{A' \supset^k B'}{\neg\neg A' \supset^k \neg\neg B'} \supset I^v$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \wedge B}{A} \wedge E_1$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A' \wedge^k \neg\neg B'}{\neg\neg A'} \neg E}{A'} \neg E$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \wedge B}{B} \wedge E_2$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A' \wedge^k \neg\neg B'}{\neg\neg B'} \neg E}{B'} \neg E$$

$$\text{Case: } \frac{A \supset B \quad A}{B} \supset E$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\frac{\neg\neg A' \supset^k \neg\neg B'}{\neg\neg B'} \supset E \quad \neg\neg A'}{B'} \neg E$$

Case:

$$\frac{A}{A \vee B} \vee I_1$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A'}{A'} \neg E}{A' \vee^k B'} \vee I_1$$

Case:

$$\frac{B}{A \vee B} \vee I_2$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$\frac{\frac{\neg\neg B'}{B'} \neg E}{A' \vee^k B'} \vee I_2$$

Case:

$$\frac{A \vee B \quad \frac{A^u}{C} \quad \frac{B^v}{C}}{C} \vee E^{u,v}$$

$$A = \neg\neg A'$$

$$B = \neg\neg B'$$

$$C = \neg\neg C'$$

$$\frac{\frac{\neg\neg A' \vee^k \neg\neg B'}{\neg\neg C'} \vee E^{u,v} \quad \frac{\neg\neg C'}{C'} \neg E}{C'} \neg E$$