

# Gibbs sampler in Python

With R and OpenBUGS comparisons

Tyler Olson   Alex Zajichuk  
Fall 2016

December 5, 2016

# Table of contents

## Introduction

- Gibbs sampling

## Models

- Multi-parameter Normal model with conjugate prior

  - Full - conditional derivations

  - Results

- Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

  - Full - conditional derivations

  - Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

  - Results

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems
- ▶ Full conditional distributions for model parameters

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems
- ▶ Full conditional distributions for model parameters
  1. Unnormalized joint-posterior distribution

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems
- ▶ Full conditional distributions for model parameters
  1. Unnormalized joint-posterior distribution
  2. Factor out terms containing parameter of interest

# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems
- ▶ Full conditional distributions for model parameters
  1. Unnormalized joint-posterior distribution
  2. Factor out terms containing parameter of interest
  3. Product of terms is proportional to full conditional distribution



# Gibbs sampling

Goal: Sample from joint posterior distribution

- ▶ Reduce a single multi-dimensional problem into multiple univariate problems
- ▶ Full conditional distributions for model parameters
  1. Unnormalized joint-posterior distribution
  2. Factor out terms containing parameter of interest
  3. Product of terms is proportional to full conditional distribution
  4. If possible, identify parametric family

[1] Cowles, 2013

# Multi-parameter Normal model with conjugate prior

# Multi-parameter Normal model with conjugate prior

$$(\mu, \sigma^2) \sim IG(\alpha, \beta) \times N(\mu_0, \frac{\sigma^2}{\kappa})$$

# Multi-parameter Normal model with conjugate prior

$$(\mu, \sigma^2) \sim IG(\alpha, \beta) \times N(\mu_0, \frac{\sigma^2}{\kappa})$$

$$\bar{y}|\mu, \sigma^2 \sim N(\mu, \frac{\sigma^2}{n})$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

# Joint-posterior distribution

$$p(\mu, \sigma^2 | \mathbf{y}) \propto p(\mu, \sigma^2, \mathbf{y})$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu, \sigma^2 | \mathbf{y}) &\propto p(\mu, \sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) \\ &= p(\bar{y} | \mu, \sigma^2) p(\mu | \sigma^2) p(\sigma^2) \end{aligned}$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu, \sigma^2 | \mathbf{y}) &\propto p(\mu, \sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) \\ &= p(\bar{y} | \mu, \sigma^2) p(\mu | \sigma^2) p(\sigma^2) \\ &= \frac{\sqrt{n}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2} \frac{\sqrt{\kappa}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} e^{\frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2} \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+1}} e^{\frac{-\beta}{\sigma^2}} \end{aligned}$$



# Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

$$p(\mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) \propto e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) &\propto e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \kappa(\mu-\mu_0)^2)} \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) &\propto e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \kappa(\mu-\mu_0)^2)} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}^2 - 2\bar{y}\mu + \mu^2) + \kappa(\mu^2 - 2\mu\mu_0 + \mu_0^2))} \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) &\propto e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \kappa(\mu-\mu_0)^2)} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}^2 - 2\bar{y}\mu + \mu^2) + \kappa(\mu^2 - 2\mu\mu_0 + \mu_0^2))} \\ &\propto e^{\frac{-(n+\kappa)}{2\sigma^2}(\mu^2 - 2\mu\frac{n\bar{y} + \kappa\mu_0}{n+\kappa})} \end{aligned}$$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\mu$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y}) &\propto e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \kappa(\mu-\mu_0)^2)} \\ &= e^{\frac{-1}{2\sigma^2}(n(\bar{y}^2 - 2\bar{y}\mu + \mu^2) + \kappa(\mu^2 - 2\mu\mu_0 + \mu_0^2))} \\ &\propto e^{\frac{-(n+\kappa)}{2\sigma^2}(\mu^2 - 2\mu\frac{n\bar{y} + \kappa\mu_0}{n+\kappa})} \\ &\propto e^{\frac{-(n+\kappa)}{2\sigma^2}(\mu^2 - 2\mu\frac{n\bar{y} + \kappa\mu_0}{n+\kappa} + (\frac{n\bar{y} + \kappa\mu_0}{n+\kappa})^2)} \\ \mu|\sigma^2, \mathbf{y} &\sim N\left(\frac{n\bar{y} + \kappa\mu_0}{n + \kappa}, \frac{\sigma^2}{n + \kappa}\right) \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\sigma^2$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\sigma^2$

$$p(\sigma^2 | \mu, \mathbf{y}) \propto \frac{\sqrt{n}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\sqrt{\kappa}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+1}} e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2 + \frac{-\beta}{\sigma^2}}$$



## Derivation of full-conditional for $\sigma^2$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\sigma^2 | \mu, \mathbf{y}) &\propto \frac{\sqrt{n}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\sqrt{\kappa}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+1}} e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2 + \frac{-\beta}{\sigma^2}} \\ &\propto \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+2}} e^{\frac{-1}{\sigma^2}(\frac{n}{2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{\kappa}{2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2 + \beta)} \end{aligned}$$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\sigma^2$

$$\begin{aligned}p(\sigma^2|\mu, \mathbf{y}) &\propto \frac{\sqrt{n}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\sqrt{\kappa}}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma} \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+1}} e^{\frac{-n}{2\sigma^2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{-\kappa}{2\sigma^2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2 + \frac{-\beta}{\sigma^2}} \\&\propto \frac{1}{(\sigma^2)^{\alpha+2}} e^{\frac{-1}{\sigma^2}(\frac{n}{2}(\bar{y}-\mu)^2 + \frac{\kappa}{2}(\mu-\mu_0)^2 + \beta)} \\ \sigma^2|\mu, \mathbf{y} &\sim IG\left(\alpha + 1, \frac{n}{2}(\bar{y} - \mu)^2 + \frac{\kappa}{2}(\mu - \mu_0)^2 + \beta\right)\end{aligned}$$

# Results

# Results

	Python ( $\approx .763$ sec)			R ( $\approx .496$ sec)			OpenBUGS		
Parameter	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median
$\mu$	50.335	0.629	50.336	50.349	0.630	50.355	50.330	0.634	50.330
$\sigma^2$	11.939	1.976	11.736	11.920	1.948	11.720	11.93	1.98	11.730

# Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

# Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

$$x_i | \theta_i, t_i, \alpha, \beta \sim \text{Poisson}(\theta_i t_i)$$

# Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

$$\begin{aligned}x_i | \theta_i, t_i, \alpha, \beta &\sim \text{Poisson}(\theta_i t_i) \\ \theta_i | \alpha, \beta &\sim \text{Gamma}(\alpha, \beta)\end{aligned}$$

# Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

$$\begin{aligned}x_i | \theta_i, t_i, \alpha, \beta &\sim \text{Poisson}(\theta_i t_i) \\ \theta_i | \alpha, \beta &\sim \text{Gamma}(\alpha, \beta) \\ \alpha &\sim \text{Exponential}(\lambda_1)\end{aligned}$$



# Gamma-poisson hierarchical model

$$x_i | \theta_i, t_i, \alpha, \beta \sim \text{Poisson}(\theta_i t_i)$$

$$\theta_i | \alpha, \beta \sim \text{Gamma}(\alpha, \beta)$$

$$\alpha \sim \text{Exponential}(\lambda_1)$$

$$\beta \sim \text{Exponential}(\lambda_2)$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) \propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x})$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) &\propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) \end{aligned}$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) &\propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha, \beta) \end{aligned}$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) &\propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha, \beta) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha) p(\beta) \end{aligned}$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) &\propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha, \beta) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha) p(\beta) \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{e^{-\theta_i t_i} (\theta_i t_i)^{x_i}}{x_i} \times \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \theta_i^{\alpha-1} e^{-\beta \theta_i} \times \lambda_1 e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \lambda_2 e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \end{aligned}$$

# Joint-posterior distribution

If  $\boldsymbol{\theta} = (\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_n)$  and  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta} | \mathbf{x}) &\propto p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha, \beta) \\ &= p(\mathbf{x} | \alpha, \beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}) p(\boldsymbol{\theta} | \alpha, \beta) p(\alpha) p(\beta) \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{e^{-\theta_i t_i} (\theta_i t_i)^{x_i}}{x_i} \times \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{\beta^\alpha}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \theta_i^{\alpha-1} e^{-\beta \theta_i} \times \lambda_1 e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \lambda_2 e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \\ &= \frac{\beta^{n\alpha}}{\Gamma(\alpha)^n} \lambda_1 e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \lambda_2 e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \times \prod_{i=1}^n \frac{e^{-\theta_i (t_i + \beta)} \theta_i^{x_i + \alpha - 1} t_i^{x_i}}{x_i} \end{aligned}$$



# Derivation of full-conditional for $\theta$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\theta$

$$p(\theta_i | \boldsymbol{\theta}_{-i}, \alpha, \beta, \mathbf{x}) \propto e^{-\theta_i(t_i + \beta)} \theta_i^{x_i + \alpha - 1}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\theta$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\theta_i | \boldsymbol{\theta}_{-i}, \alpha, \beta, \mathbf{x}) &\propto e^{-\theta_i(t_i + \beta)} \theta_i^{x_i + \alpha - 1} \\ \theta_i | \boldsymbol{\theta}_{-i}, \alpha, \beta, \mathbf{x} &\sim \text{Gamma}(x_i + \alpha, t_i + \beta) \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

$$p(\beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i t_i - \theta_i \beta}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i t_i - \theta_i \beta} \\ &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i \beta} \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i t_i - \theta_i \beta} \\ &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i \beta} \\ &= \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} e^{-\sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i \beta} \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i t_i - \theta_i \beta} \\ &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i \beta} \\ &= \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2\beta} e^{-\sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i \beta} \\ &= \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\beta(\lambda_2 + \sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i)} \end{aligned}$$



# Derivation of full-conditional for $\beta$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i t_i - \theta_i \beta} \\ &\propto \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} \prod_{i=1}^n e^{-\theta_i \beta} \\ &= \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\lambda_2 \beta} e^{-\sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i \beta} \\ &= \beta^{n\alpha} e^{-\beta(\lambda_2 + \sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i)} \\ \beta|\alpha, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x} &\sim \text{Gamma}(n\alpha + 1, \lambda_2 + \sum_{i=1}^n \theta_i) \end{aligned}$$

# Derivation of full-conditional for $\alpha$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\alpha$

$$p(\alpha|\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) \propto \frac{\beta^{n\alpha}}{\Gamma(\alpha)^n} e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \prod_{i=1}^n \theta_i^{x_i + \alpha - 1}$$

## Derivation of full-conditional for $\alpha$

$$\begin{aligned} p(\alpha|\beta, \boldsymbol{\theta}, \mathbf{x}) &\propto \frac{\beta^{n\alpha}}{\Gamma(\alpha)^n} e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \prod_{i=1}^n \theta_i^{x_i + \alpha - 1} \\ &\propto \frac{\beta^{n\alpha}}{\Gamma(\alpha)^n} e^{-\lambda_1 \alpha} \prod_{i=1}^n \theta_i^\alpha \end{aligned}$$

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

If  $f(x)$  is the unnormalized density of interest,  $x_i$  is the value at the  $i^{th}$  iteration, and  $q(x|x_{i-1})$  is the chosen proposal function, then

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

If  $f(x)$  is the unnormalized density of interest,  $x_i$  is the value at the  $i^{th}$  iteration, and  $q(x|x_{i-1})$  is the chosen proposal function, then

1. Sample  $x^* \sim q(x|x_{i-1})$

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

If  $f(x)$  is the unnormalized density of interest,  $x_i$  is the value at the  $i^{th}$  iteration, and  $q(x|x_{i-1})$  is the chosen proposal function, then

1. Sample  $x^* \sim q(x|x_{i-1})$
2. Calculate the acceptance probability

$$p = P(\text{accept } x^*) = \min\left(1, \frac{f(x^*)q(x_{i-1}|x^*)}{f(x_{i-1})q(x^*|x_{i-1})}\right)$$



# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

If  $f(x)$  is the unnormalized density of interest,  $x_i$  is the value at the  $i^{th}$  iteration, and  $q(x|x_{i-1})$  is the chosen proposal function, then

1. Sample  $x^* \sim q(x|x_{i-1})$
2. Calculate the acceptance probability

$$p = P(\text{accept } x^*) = \min\left(1, \frac{f(x^*)q(x_{i-1}|x^*)}{f(x_{i-1})q(x^*|x_{i-1})}\right)$$

3. If  $Y \sim \text{Bernoulli}(p)$ , then

$$x_i = \begin{cases} x^* & \text{if } Y=1 \\ x_{i-1} & \text{if } Y=0 \end{cases}$$

[2] Niemi, 2013

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

Our Implementation:

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

## Our Implementation:

For each iteration of the Gibbs sampler:

- ▶ For  $i$  in 1:1000

# Metropolis-Hastings algorithm

## Our Implementation:

For each iteration of the Gibbs sampler:

- ▶ For  $i$  in 1:1000
  - ▶ Proposal function:

$$x|x_{i-1} \sim \textit{Gamma}(\alpha = x_{i-1}, \beta = 1)$$

# Results

# Results

	Python ( $\approx 1$ hr )			R (18.24 min )			OpenBUGS		
Parameter	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median
$\alpha$	0.780	0.307	0.739	0.789	0.319	0.749	0.795	0.295	0.754
$\beta$	1.193	0.635	1.092	1.208	0.661	1.093	1.218	0.634	1.116
$\theta_1$	0.060	0.025	0.057	0.061	0.025	0.057	0.060	0.025	0.057
$\theta_2$	0.106	0.081	0.086	0.106	0.080	0.087	0.106	0.081	0.087
$\theta_3$	0.091	0.038	0.086	0.090	0.038	0.085	0.090	0.038	0.085
$\theta_4$	0.116	0.030	0.113	0.116	0.030	0.114	0.116	0.030	0.113
$\theta_5$	0.593	0.310	0.544	0.590	0.307	0.534	0.590	0.306	0.539
$\theta_6$	0.606	0.137	0.594	0.606	0.137	0.596	0.608	0.136	0.598
$\theta_7$	0.808	0.640	0.651	0.825	0.660	0.659	0.822	0.658	0.655
$\theta_8$	0.837	0.680	0.650	0.829	0.658	0.662	0.829	0.665	0.655
$\theta_9$	1.512	0.739	1.392	1.487	0.718	1.362	1.477	0.715	1.356
$\theta_{10}$	1.955	0.414	1.922	1.950	0.417	1.920	1.949	0.419	1.918

# Results

	Python ( $\approx 1$ hr )			R (18.24 min )			OpenBUGS		
Parameter	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median	Mean	SD	Median
$\alpha$	0.780	0.307	0.739	0.789	0.319	0.749	0.795	0.295	0.754
$\beta$	1.193	0.635	1.092	1.208	0.661	1.093	1.218	0.634	1.116
$\theta_1$	0.060	0.025	0.057	0.061	0.025	0.057	0.060	0.025	0.057
$\theta_2$	0.106	0.081	0.086	0.106	0.080	0.087	0.106	0.081	0.087
$\theta_3$	0.091	0.038	0.086	0.090	0.038	0.085	0.090	0.038	0.085
$\theta_4$	0.116	0.030	0.113	0.116	0.030	0.114	0.116	0.030	0.113
$\theta_5$	0.593	0.310	0.544	0.590	0.307	0.534	0.590	0.306	0.539
$\theta_6$	0.606	0.137	0.594	0.606	0.137	0.596	0.608	0.136	0.598
$\theta_7$	0.808	0.640	0.651	0.825	0.660	0.659	0.822	0.658	0.655
$\theta_8$	0.837	0.680	0.650	0.829	0.658	0.662	0.829	0.665	0.655
$\theta_9$	1.512	0.739	1.392	1.487	0.718	1.362	1.477	0.715	1.356
$\theta_{10}$	1.955	0.414	1.922	1.950	0.417	1.920	1.949	0.419	1.918

- Runtime: find optimal proposal function

# References

[1] Cowles, M. K. (2013). Applied bayesian statistics: With R and OpenBUGS examples. New York: Springer.

[2] Niemi, J. (2013, March 3). Video. Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VGRVRjr0vyw>