

# Text Generation with the Transformer Decoder

NOTE: All changed parts after Oct. 18 are highlighted using **[CHANGED]**

**Brief Summarization:** 1. Implementation of Top-k decoding; 2. Comparing Top-k sampling with other decoding algorithms; 3. Further clarify the Transformer architecture in order to keep consistent with the code; 4. Adding a thinking question 4.

## Background

After implementing the details about MLP and CNN in python with Numpy and PyTorch, we believe that you have already learned basic skills in deep learning. In this homework, we will implement a **language model with the decoder of Transformer to generate sentences.**

To train a language model, we minimize the **cross-entropy loss** conditioned on the ground-truth prefixes. To be specific, given a sentence  $\{x_0, x_1, \dots, x_T\}$ , the loss should be formulated as follows:

$$\mathcal{L} = -\frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^T \log P(x_t | x_{<t}) \quad (1)$$

Usually,  $x_0$  is a special token, which indicates the beginning of a sentence (i.e., the so-called `bos` token);  $x_T$  is a special token, which indicates the end of a sentence (i.e., the `eos` token). We regard `<|endoftext|>` as both the `bos` and `eos` tokens in this homework. We also use `<|endoftext|>` to fill the useless space for a batch of sentences, where the short sentences are padded to match the longest one.

The language model should be trained in the **Teacher-Forcing mode (See the slides of RNN)**. We first convert the input sentence  $X = \{x_0, x_1, \dots, x_{T-1}\}$  to the embedding sequence  $E = \{e_0, e_1, \dots, e_{T-1}\}$ . Then, the Transformer decoder transforms the embedding sequence  $E$  into hidden states  $H = \{h_0, h_1, \dots, h_{T-1}\}$ .  $h_t$  is used to predict the next token, i.e.  $x_{t+1}$ . To be formal,

$$P(x_{t+1} | x_{<t+1}) = \text{Softmax}(\text{Linear}(h_t)) \quad (2)$$

At last, we can calculate  $\mathcal{L}$  following Equation (1) and optimize it with Adam optimizer.

In this homework, you should finish TODO parts in codes, which includes several parts:

- The base architecture in `model_tfmr.py`, including the following several parts:
  - The **mask matrix for attention weights** (i.e., the `_attn` function), which restricts the model to attend on only the prefix tokens.
  - Functions for splitting and merging attention heads (i.e., the `_split_heads` function and `_merge_heads` function). If interested, we encourage you to think about the superiority of multi-head attention w.r.t. single-head attention when conducting experiments.
  - **[CHANGED]** Connections of different modules in the Transformer Block (i.e., the `forward` function of the `TfmrBlock` class). You should follow the original Transformer decoder design of the GPT2 paper [4], i.e., `layer normalization` - `multi-head attention` - `residual connection` - `layer normalization` - `feedforward` - `residual connection`. Note that we do not have an encoder in this homework so that there is no `cross-attention` to the encoder.

- Positional encoding in the `forward` function of the `TfmrModel` class. Note that you should consider the length of the cache hidden states (i.e., `past_key_values`), which are used during inference.

**Note:** You are not allowed to use the pre-defined modules in `torch.nn`, `torch.nn.functional` or any APIs provided by `HuggingFace`, etc. for implementing the above modules (except `torch.nn.Softmax` for computing attention weights).

- Training Loss in `model_tfmr.py` and the perplexity in `main.py`: You should calculate the loss for the language model (Equation 1), which is exactly the corresponding perplexity after the `exp` operation.

**Note:** The lengths of a batch of sentences may be different, where we add paddings for short sentences to match the longest one. However, you must **NOT** calculate losses for paddings. You should calculate **the average loss of each token in a mini-batch**, i.e., you divide the sum of cross-entropy loss by the number of all valid tokens.

- **[CHANGED]** Top-p decoding and top-k decoding in `model_tfmr.py`: You should implement both the top-k decoding[6] and top-p decoding strategy (Nucleus Sampling[1]). The decoding strategy is used in Free-Run mode for inference, where the model should read its generated prefix and predict the next token. Specifically, we first take a `<|endoftext|>` token as the first step of Transformer's input. Then, the next token distribution can be obtained by decoding strategies. For the **random decoding strategy** with temperature  $\tau$ , we randomly take a sample from the following distribution:

$$P^*(x_t|x_{<t}) = \text{Softmax}(\text{Linear}(h_{t-1})/\tau) \quad (3)$$

Then  $x_t$  can be used as the next step's input. We repeat the process until an `<eos>` token is generated.

For **top-p decoding strategy** with temperature  $\tau$ , the next token distribution should be formulated as follows:

$$P^{**}(x_t|x_{<t}) = \begin{cases} P^*(x_t|x_{<t}) / \sum_{x \in \mathcal{D}_t} (P^*(x|x_{<t})) & x_t \in \mathcal{D}_t \\ 0 & x_t \notin \mathcal{D}_t \end{cases} \quad (5)$$

where  $P^*$  is from Equation (3); For **top-k decoding**,  $\mathcal{D}_t$  is the set of  $k$  tokens with the maximum probabilities; For **top-p decoding**,  $\mathcal{D}_t$  is the minimal set satisfying  $\sum_{x \in \mathcal{D}_t} P^*(x_t|x_{<t}) \geq p$ . That is, in each decoding step, you should randomly choose tokens from **the top words** whose sum of probability is larger than  $p$ . See [1, 6] and our RNN slides for details.

We encourage you to rewrite part of the codes in `main.py` to use TensorBoard to visualize your experimental results.

## Requirements

- python >=3.6
- PyTorch >= 1.1
- nltk == 3.5 (Higher versions may lead to throwing errors during evaluation)

## Dataset Description

Microsoft COCO (MSCOCO) dataset is an image caption dataset, where we only extract the sentences and ignore images for language generation. We extract 25,000 sentences and split them into the training / validation / test parts, containing 15,000 / 5,000 / 5,000 sentences respectively.

## Metric Description

We use 4 metrics to evaluate your result:

- Perplexity:  $PPL = \exp(-\frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^T \log P(x_t|x_{<t}))$ . Lower perplexity indicates better performance (you should implement this metric by yourself).
- Forward BLEU, Backward BLEU, Harmonic BLEU: BLEU is a metric first used for machine translation, which evaluates the model by n-gram precision [2]. We use three variants of BLEU for our task [3]: Forward BLEU measures fluency, Backward BLEU measures diversity, and Harmonic BLEU is their harmonic average indicating overall performance. A larger BLEU score indicates better performance.

The evaluation can be very slow, so we do not evaluate the models on the BLEU metrics when training. You should choose the checkpoint with the lowest perplexity on the validation set, and evaluate it by these four metrics.

## Python Files Description

- `main.py` contains the main script to run and evaluate the whole program.
- `model_tfmr.py` contains the script for model implementation.
- `configuration.py` defines the hyper-parameters for the model.
- `config.json` specify the hyper-parameters for the model.
- `tokenizer.py` defines the BPE tokenizer of GPT2 [4]. The vocabulary is saved under the `tokenizer` directory.
- `data` contains `train.txt`, `dev.txt` and `test.txt`, which are the training set, development set (validation set) and test set, respectively.
- pretrained checkpoint: `pretrain/pretrained_ckpt.tar` is the pre-trained 3-layer Transformer checkpoint. `pretrain_full/pretrained_ckpt.tar` is the pre-trained 12-layer Transformer checkpoint. You can download them from [THUCloud](#).

## Command

- Train: `python main.py --name NAME`. Run the model with the experiment name (default: run).
- Test: `python main.py --test NAME`. Load the best model for the experiment NAME, and evaluate it with the four metrics.

See `main.py` for more arguments.

**NOTE:** After you run the test command, you'll get the result and a file named `output.txt` with generated sentences. You should choose the best experiment and submit this file as your final result.

# Report

You should conduct the following experiments in this homework:

1. Train two models, where one is trained from scratch (i.e., parameters are randomly initialized) and the other one is trained with parameters initialized from the pre-trained checkpoint (constructed from GPT-2 base). We call them Tfmr-scratch and Tfmr-finetune, respectively. Plot the loss value of Transformer (using the default hyper-parameters) against every epoch until converging during training (on both training parts and validation parts) for them. Choose the best model on the development set and report the test results on 4 metrics (Perplexity, Forward BLEU, Backward BLEU, Harmonic BLEU). Compare and analyze the results of two models.

(Note: In order to save time, we set the default number of Transformer blocks to 3, which is smaller than the default number of Transformer blocks in GPT2-base, i.e., 12. Therefore, we only take the first 3 layers of GPT2-base to construct the pre-trained checkpoint used in this homework)

2. **[CHANGED]** During inference, tune the temperature (at least including random sampling with temperature=1, random sampling with temperature=0.7, top-p sampling with p=0.9 with temperature=1, top-p sampling with p=0.9 and temperature=0.7, top-k sampling with k=40 with temperature=1, top-k sampling with k=40 and temperature=0.7), and report the test results on 4 metrics. You should conduct experiments based on both Tfmr-scratch and Tfmr-finetune. How do the decoding strategies influence the generated results?
3. Read the sentences generated by the different decoding strategies above. Randomly choose 10 sentences for each strategy and list them in your report for both Tfmr-scratch and Tfmr-finetune. Are there any grammar errors? Which strategy/model generate the best sentences? Discuss whether the 4 metrics (Perplexity, Forward BLEU, Backward BLEU, Harmonic BLEU) are consistent with your judgment?
4. Describe your final network with the hyper-parameters (if you change them) and decoding strategies. Report the result on 4 metrics, and submit the generation result with your report.
5. By carefully reading the source code of Transformer decoder, discussion the following questions briefly :
  1. Why multi-head attention outperforms single-head attention?
  2. Try to use the BPE tokenizer to tokenize several sentences. Discuss the superiority of the BPE tokenizer compared with splitting by space.
  3. Compare Transformer and RNN from at least two perspectives such as time/space complexity, performance, positional encoding, etc.
  4. **[CHANGED]** Regarding the inference time complexity, answer the following question.
    1. During inference, we usually set `use_cache` in `model_tfmr.py` to `True`. What is the argument used for?
    2. Denote the whole sequence as  $L = (l_0 = < \text{endoftext} >, l_1, l_2, \dots, l_T)$ , please give the inference time complexity when decoding the token  $l_t$ , i.e., the  $t$ -th loop in the `inference` function of `model_tfmr.py` when decoding the first example, and the whole time complexity for decoding the whole sequence  $L$ . We denote the hidden state dimension as  $d$  (so that the dimension of the intermediate state of the feed forward layer is  $4d$ ), the number of heads in multi-head attention as  $n$ , the number of hidden Transformer blocks as  $B$ , the vocab size as  $V$ .

3. Based on your analysis for the last question, in which case the self-attention module dominate the time complexity? And in which case the feed-forward layer is dominant?
5. Discuss the influence of pre-training regarding the generation results, convergence speed, etc. Discuss why pre-training brings such effect.

#### Bonus ( $\leq 2$ ):

- We also provide the 12-layer pretrained checkpoint (i.e., exactly GPT2-base). Observe the performance when fine-tuning the 12-layer model, compare and analyze the 12-layer Tfmr\_finetune model with the 3-layer Tfmr\_finetune model.
- You can take different 3 layers from the original 12 layers in GPT2-base, and observe the performance. For example, taking the last 3 layers or the 1-st, 6-th and 12-th layers instead of simply the first 3 layers may lead to different generation results.
- Discuss the effect of the number of heads used in multi-head attention, etc. You can refer to config.json to obtain inspiration.

**Note that you should conduct elaborate experiments and carefully analyze the results to get the bonus.**

**NOTE:** To save your time, the default hyper-parameters should provide a reasonable result. However, you can still tune them if you want to do more explorations.

**NOTE:** When using the default hyper-parameters, it will cost about 5G GPU memory and 5 minutes per epoch. If you use CPU for training, it will cost 15 minutes per epoch. The validation ppl should be less than **60** after the first epoch when training from scratch. Accordingly, You can stop training in time and correct your code if the validation ppl is larger than 60 after the first epoch.

**NOTE:** TensorBoard may be helpful when you plot figures in your experiment.

**NOTE:** The perplexity on the validation set should be lower than **28**, or some penalty will be imposed on your score.

**NOTE:** If you are out of memory when testing your model, see the comments in the evaluate function of main.py. Setting cpu\_count=0 in FwBwBleuCorpusMetric will solve the problem but become much slower.

**NOTE:** You are **NOT** allowed to use other advance neural network packages, e.g., fairseq, texar.

## Code Checking

We introduce a code checking tool this year to avoid plagiarism. You **MUST** submit a file named `summary.txt` along with your code, which contains what you modified and referred to. You should follow the instructions below to generate the file:

1. Fill the blanks in the codes. Notice that you should only modify the codes between `# TODO START` and `# TODO END`, and the other changes should be explained in `README.txt`. **DO NOT** change or remove the lines starting with `# TODO`.
2. Add references if you use or refer to online codes, or discuss with your classmates. You should add a comment line just after `# TODO START` in the following formats:

1. If you use a code online: # Reference: `https://github.com/xxxxx`
2. If you discuss with your classmates: # Reference: Name: Xiao Ming Student ID: 2018xxxxxx

You can add multiple references if needed.

**Warning:** You should not copy codes from your classmates, or copy codes directly from the Internet, especially for some codes provided by students who did this homework. In all circumstances, you should at least write more than 70% codes. (You should not provide your codes to others or upload them to Github before the course ends.)

**警告：**作业中不允许复制同学或者网上的代码，特别是往年学生上传的答案。我们每年会略微的修改作业要求，往年的答案极有可能存在错误。一经发现，按照学术不端处理（根据情况报告辅导员或学校）。在任何情况下，你至少应该自己编写70%的代码。在课程结束前，不要将你的代码发送给其他人或者上传到github上。

3. Here is an example of your submitted code:

```
1 def forward(self, input):
2     # TODO START
3     # Reference: https://github.com/xxxxx
4     # Reference: Name: Xiao Ming Student ID: 2022xxxxxx
5     your codes...
6     # TODO END
```

4. At last, run `python ./code_analyze/analyze.py`, the result will be generated at `./code_analyze/summary.txt`. Open it and check if it is reasonable. A possible code checking result can be:

```
1 #####
2 # Filled Code
3 #####
4 # ..\codes\layers.py:1
5     # Reference: https://github.com/xxxxx
6     # Reference: Name: Xiao Ming Student ID: 2018xxxxxx
7     your codes...
8
9 #####
10 # References
11 #####
12 # https://github.com/xxxxx
13 # Name: Xiao Ming Student ID: 2018xxxxxx
14
15 #####
16 # Other Modifications
17 #####
18 # _codes\layers.py -> ..\codes\layers.py
19 # 8 -         self._saved_tensor = None
20 # 8 +         self._saved_tensor = None # add some thing
```

# Submission Guideline

You need to submit a report document, codes, the model output, and the code checking result, as required as follows:

- **Report:** well-formatted and readable summary to describe the results, discussions, and your analysis. Source codes should *not* be included in the report. Only some essential lines of codes are permitted. The format of a good report can be referred to as a top-conference paper.
- **Codes:** organized source code files of your final network with README for extra modifications or specific usage. Ensure that TAs can easily reproduce your results following your instructions. **DO NOT include model weights/raw data/compiled objects/unrelated stuff over 50MB.**
- **Model Output (Important):** Submit the generation result which contains 5,000 sentences generated by your model.
- **Code Checking Result:** You should only submit the generated `summary.txt`. **DO NOT** upload any codes under `code_analysis`. However, TAs will regenerate the code checking result to ensure the correctness of the file.

You should submit a `.zip` file named after your student number, organized as below:

- `Report.pdf/docx`
- `summary.txt`
- `codes/`
  - `*.py`
  - `output.txt`
  - `README.md/txt`

## Deadline

**November 1st**

**TA contact:** 关键, [j-guan19@mails.tsinghua.edu.cn](mailto:j-guan19@mails.tsinghua.edu.cn)

## Reference

- [1] Holtzman, Ari, Jan Buys, Li Du, Maxwell Forbes, and Yejin Choi. "The curious case of neural text degeneration." ICLR2020.
- [2] Papineni, K., Roukos, S., Ward, T., & Zhu, W. J. (2002, July). BLEU: a method for automatic evaluation of machine translation. In *Proceedings of the 40th annual meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics* (pp. 311-318).
- [3] Shi, Z., Chen, X., Qiu, X., & Huang, X. (2018). Toward diverse text generation with inverse reinforcement learning. *arXiv preprint arXiv:1804.11258*.
- [4] Radford, A., Narasimhan, K., Salimans, T., & Sutskever, I. Improving Language Understanding by Generative Pre-Training.
- [5] Vaswani, A., Shazeer, N., Parmar, N., Uszkoreit, J., Jones, L., Gomez, A. N., ... & Polosukhin, I. (2017). Attention is all you need. *Advances in neural information processing systems*, 30.

[6] Fan, A., Lewis, M., & Dauphin, Y. (2018, July). Hierarchical Neural Story Generation. In *Proceedings of the 56th Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics (Volume 1: Long Papers)* (pp. 889-898).