

Table 4

Coefficients from pooled regressions of the various performance measures on selected variables with the errors clustered at the firm level for the full sample and various sub-samples. Robust Huber/White/sandwich estimator of variance is used to calculate the t statistics in brackets. Dstate equals 1 if a bank has at least 20% of state ownership; 0 otherwise. Dforeign equals 1 if there is foreign ownership in the bank; 0 otherwise. The sample period is from 1989 to 2004. D9396 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1993-1996; 0 otherwise. D9700 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1997-2000; 0 otherwise. D0104 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 2001-2004. Size is the ratio of total assets to country GDP. The year dummies, country dummies and country-year dummies are included in the regressions but their coefficients are not reported here to conserve space.

| Dependent Variable | Sample | Dstate | Dstate x D9396 | Dstate x D9700 | Dstate x D0104 | Dforeign | Size | Intercept | No. of Obs. | R ² |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------|
| A. Core capital / Assets | Full | -0.0299*** [2.83] | -0.0019 [0.19] | -0.02 [1.27] | 0.0127 [0.84] | 0.0352*** [4.22] | -0.2026*** [3.34] | 0.0402*** [3.08] | 5633 | 0.2216 |
| | Extreme crisis | -0.0182* [1.76] | -0.0049 [0.56] | -0.0840*** [3.09] | 0.0021 [0.10] | 0.0197*** [2.72] | -0.2810*** [3.37] | 0.1086*** [17.28] | 2198 | 0.2451 |
| | Minimal government | -0.0173 [1.13] | -0.01 [0.83] | -0.0037 [0.25] | 0.007 [0.46] | 0.0096 [1.01] | -0.1572** [2.52] | 0.1541*** [6.27] | 1388 | 0.2244 |
| | Heavy government | -0.0286** [2.34] | -0.0007 [0.06] | -0.0254 [1.34] | 0.0123 [0.70] | 0.0423*** [4.11] | -0.3123*** [4.47] | 0.0400*** [3.07] | 4245 | 0.2222 |
| B. Allowance for loan losses / Loans | Full | 0.0035 [1.49] | 0.0106** [2.14] | 0.0239** [2.29] | 0.0187** [2.04] | 0.0065* [1.67] | -0.0268 [1.42] | 0.0068 [0.51] | 5197 | 0.3956 |
| | Extreme crisis | 0.0051 [1.22] | 0.0198** [2.07] | 0.0372* [1.81] | 0.0415** [2.07] | 0.0164*** [2.84] | -0.0868 [1.10] | 0.0073** [2.22] | 2174 | 0.3896 |
| | Minimal government | 0.0115 [1.14] | 0.0022 [0.29] | 0.0347* [1.84] | 0.0065 [0.37] | -0.0137** [2.00] | -0.0186 [0.83] | 0.0325*** [4.34] | 1341 | 0.2908 |
| | Heavy government | 0.0040* [1.74] | 0.0119* [1.96] | 0.0186 [1.49] | 0.0194* [1.81] | 0.0131*** [2.82] | -0.0452 [1.54] | 0.0059 [0.43] | 3856 | 0.4186 |
| C. Nonperforming loans / Loans | Full | 0.0442*** [3.41] | | 0.0303 [1.49] | -0.0298* [1.66] | 0.001 [0.10] | -0.0693** [2.55] | 0.0519*** [4.28] | 2049 | 0.3454 |
| | Extreme crisis | 0.0014 [0.07] | | 0.0994*** [2.62] | 0.013 [0.45] | 0.0470*** [2.86] | 0.0959 [0.50] | -0.0005 [0.02] | 736 | 0.4689 |
| | Minimal government | 0.0622*** [2.84] | | 0.0416 [1.25] | -0.0243 [0.63] | -0.0224 [1.25] | -0.0509 [1.47] | 0.0399** [2.54] | 678 | 0.2678 |
| | Heavy government | -0.0032 [0.22] | | 0.0529** [2.25] | 0.0083 [0.43] | 0.0158 [1.30] | 0.1647 [1.16] | 0.1087*** [3.87] | 1371 | 0.4298 |
| D. Personnel expenses / Loans | Full | -0.0056*** [3.36] | 0.0108*** [5.23] | 0.0111*** [4.02] | 0.0102*** [3.95] | -0.0056** [2.53] | -0.0239*** [2.88] | 0.0217*** [11.21] | 4104 | 0.2243 |
| | Extreme crisis | -0.0067*** [4.01] | 0.0045*** [2.99] | 0.0038 [1.09] | 0.0083** [2.19] | -0.0063*** [3.14] | -0.0370*** [2.93] | 0.0204*** [15.17] | 2049 | 0.2448 |
| | Minimal government | 0.0112*** [2.87] | -0.0006 [0.13] | 0.003 [0.54] | -0.0039 [0.63] | -0.0079 [0.87] | -0.0194* [1.70] | 0.0819** [2.41] | 855 | 0.1833 |
| | Heavy government | -0.0077*** [4.53] | 0.0117*** [5.30] | 0.0107*** [3.42] | 0.0119*** [4.19] | -0.0052*** [3.39] | -0.0381*** [3.08] | 0.0223*** [11.96] | 3249 | 0.2597 |

| Dependent Variable | Sample | Dstate | Dstate x D9396 | Dstate x D9700 | Dstate x D0104 | Dforeign | Size | Intercept | No. of Obs. | R ² |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------|---------------------|---------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------|
| E. Loans / Deposits | Full | 0.1365** [2.28] | -0.0551 [0.65] | -0.0865 [1.05] | -0.0986 [1.26] | 0.2508*** [5.30] | -0.3991*** [2.84] | 0.5104*** [10.02] | 5592 | 0.1511 |
| | Extreme crisis | 0.2942*** [2.73] | -0.1603 [1.06] | -0.1906 [1.50] | -0.1108 [0.63] | 0.3406*** [5.23] | -0.4869 [1.04] | 1.2793*** [11.25] | 2191 | 0.1756 |
| | Minimal government | 0.0534 [0.58] | 0.0863 [0.62] | -0.0801 [0.66] | -0.0586 [0.59] | 0.0531 [1.10] | -0.4305** [2.33] | 0.6583*** [9.81] | 1375 | 0.1098 |
| | Heavy government | 0.1681** [2.45] | -0.0913 [0.93] | -0.1053 [1.09] | -0.1267 [1.40] | 0.3133*** [5.23] | -0.3066 [1.16] | 0.5075*** [9.11] | 4217 | 0.1864 |
| F. Government securities / Assets | Full | -0.0098 [1.58] | 0.0166*** [3.01] | 0.0223** [2.40] | 0.0573*** [4.36] | -0.0079* [1.69] | 0.0387*** [2.67] | 0.0468** [2.37] | 5533 | 0.6038 |
| | Extreme crisis | -0.003 [0.61] | 0.0016 [0.39] | 0.014 [0.79] | 0.1141*** [3.57] | -0.0047 [0.67] | 0.2015* [1.70] | 0.0056 [1.65] | 2193 | 0.3145 |
| | Minimal government | -0.0291 [1.55] | 0.018 [0.90] | 0.0131 [0.92] | 0.0223 [0.92] | -0.0099 [1.08] | 0.0410*** [3.48] | 0.0372*** [2.96] | 1374 | 0.6173 |
| | Heavy government | -0.0065 [1.32] | 0.0179*** [3.39] | 0.0252** [2.35] | 0.0644*** [4.25] | -0.0073 [1.32] | 0.0539 [1.27] | 0.0447** [2.26] | 4159 | 0.6037 |
| G. Asset growth rate | Full | -0.1440*** [2.67] | 0.0006 [0.01] | 0.0666 [1.14] | 0.0602 [1.42] | 0.0094 [0.55] | 0.0131 [0.07] | 0.4097*** [3.64] | 5143 | 0.1489 |
| | Extreme crisis | -0.0105 [0.16] | -0.0571 [0.82] | 0.0231 [0.30] | -0.0404 [0.58] | -0.0048 [0.20] | -0.0498 [0.25] | 0.2296*** [8.32] | 1996 | 0.2076 |
| | Minimal government | -0.1134 [1.11] | 0.0831 [0.69] | 0.0603 [0.59] | 0.0404 [0.43] | 0.0432 [1.63] | 0.2334 [0.75] | 0.1283* [1.86] | 1277 | 0.1432 |
| | Heavy government | -0.1442** [2.46] | -0.0224 [0.33] | 0.0715 [1.09] | 0.0648 [1.52] | -0.0068 [0.34] | -0.4974*** [5.10] | 0.4261*** [3.77] | 3866 | 0.1573 |

*, **, *** Significantly different from zero at the 10%, 5%, and 1% levels respectively, using a two-tailed tests.

Table 5

Coefficients from pooled regressions of the ratio of operating pretax cash flows returns on selected variables with the errors clustered at the firm level for the full sample and various sub-samples. Robust Huber/White/sandwich estimator of variance is used to calculate the t statistics in brackets. Dstate equals 1 if a bank has at least 20% of state ownership; 0 otherwise. Dforeign equals 1 if there is foreign ownership in the bank; 0 otherwise. OWNstate is the proportion of state ownership. OWNforeign is the proportion of foreign ownership. The sample period is from 1989 to 2004. D9396 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1993-1996; 0 otherwise. D9700 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1997-2000; 0 otherwise. D0104 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 2001-2004. The year dummies, country dummies and country-year dummies are included in the regressions but their coefficients are not reported here to conserve space.

| | British-American accounting model | Continental accounting model | British-American accounting and minimal government involvement | British-American accounting and heavy government involvement |
|----------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|
| Dstate | -0.0067*** [4.69] | -0.0027 [0.86] | -0.0085** [2.36] | -0.0070*** [4.32] |
| Dstate x D9396 | -0.0049*** [2.63] | 0.0009 [0.38] | -0.0181*** [3.38] | -0.0033* [1.66] |
| Dstate x D9700 | -0.0374*** [3.98] | -0.0076 [0.90] | -0.0068 [0.93] | -0.0413*** [3.93] |
| Dstate x D0104 | 0.0042 [1.54] | 0.0055 [1.05] | 0.0069 [1.28] | 0.0041 [1.39] |
| Dforeign | 0.0013 [0.51] | 0.001 [0.28] | 0.0037 [1.18] | 0.0009 [0.31] |
| Size | 0.0164 [1.61] | 0.0308 [1.35] | 0.0022 [0.22] | 0.0340* [1.67] |
| Intercept | 0.0115** [2.18] | 0.0036*** [2.98] | 0.0087 [1.63] | 0.0108** [2.07] |
| Year Dummies | Included | Included | Included | Included |
| Country Dummies | Included | | Included | Included |
| Country-Year dummies | Included | | Included | Included |
| Observations | 4055 | 291 | 647 | 3408 |
| R-squared | 0.2489 | 0.4104 | 0.1084 | 0.2599 |

*, **, *** Significantly different from zero at the 10%, 5%, and 1% levels respectively, using a two-tailed tests.

Table 8

Coefficients from pooled regressions of the ratio of operating pretax cash flows returns on selected variables with the errors clustered at the firm level for the full sample and various sub-samples. Robust Huber/White/sandwich estimator of variance is used to calculate the t statistics in brackets. Dstate equals 1 if a bank has at least 20% of state ownership; 0 otherwise. Dforeign equals 1 if there is foreign ownership in the bank; 0 otherwise. OWNstate is the proportion of state ownership. OWNforeign is the proportion of foreign ownership. The sample period is from 1989 to 2004. D9396 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1993-1996; 0 otherwise. D9700 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 1997-2000; 0 otherwise. D0104 equals 1 if an observation is from the period 2001-2004. The country-year dummy variables are included in the regressions but are not reported here to conserve space. The instrumental variable (IV) regressions instrument the proportion of state ownership variable by 3-year lagged variables of proportion of state ownership, operating cash flow returns, core capital to assets, allowance for loan losses to loans, personnel expenses to loans, and government securities to assets. The year dummies, country dummies and country-year dummies are included in the regressions but their coefficients are not reported here to conserve space.

| | Full Sample | | | Extreme-Crisis Sample | | | Less Government Involvement Sample | | | Greater Government Involvement Sample | | |
|------------------------------|-----------------------|--|------------------------------|-----------------------|--|------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|
| | Instrumental variable | Without banks that increased state ownership | Top 10 banks in each country | Instrumental variable | Without banks that increased state ownership | Top 10 banks in each country | Instrumental variable | Without banks that increased state ownership | Top 10 banks in each country | Instrumental variable | Without banks that increased state ownership | Top 10 banks in each country |
| D _{state} | | -0.0051*** [4.15] | -0.0034** [2.06] | | -0.0045** [2.13] | -0.0033 [1.51] | | -0.0024 [1.03] | -0.0033 [1.28] | | -0.0057*** [3.89] | -0.0022 [0.91] |
| D _{state} × D9396 | | -0.0043*** [2.62] | -0.003 [1.23] | | -0.0028 [1.33] | -0.0006 [0.34] | | -0.0078** [2.55] | -0.0057 [1.20] | | -0.0033* [1.72] | -0.002 [0.71] |
| D _{state} × D9700 | | -0.0258*** [3.56] | -0.0197** [2.05] | | -0.0829*** [4.24] | -0.0384* [1.88] | | -0.0103* [1.80] | -0.0154** [2.39] | | -0.0303*** [3.25] | -0.0236* [1.66] |
| D _{state} × D0104 | | 0.0027 [0.99] | -0.0008 [0.27] | | 0.0069 [0.99] | 0.0038 [0.82] | | 0.0037 [0.95] | -0.0009 [0.20] | | 0.0047 [1.60] | -0.0023 [0.53] |
| OWN _{state} | -0.0182*** [4.51] | | | -0.0079** [2.52] | | | 0.0028 [0.39] | | | -0.0193*** [4.66] | | |
| OWN _{state} × D9396 | 0.004 [1.03] | | | -0.0027 [0.80] | | | -0.0216*** [2.91] | | | 0.0058 [1.47] | | |
| OWN _{state} × D9700 | -0.0480*** [2.93] | | | -0.1415*** [4.48] | | | -0.0274*** [3.02] | | | -0.0620*** [2.94] | | |
| OWN _{state} × D0104 | 0.0168*** [2.64] | | | 0.0081 [0.93] | | | -0.0034 [0.52] | | | 0.0178** [2.25] | | |
| D _{foreign} | | 0.0032 [1.59] | 0.0043** [2.03] | | 0.0004 [0.11] | 0.0059 [1.65] | | 0.0026 [1.03] | 0.0001 [0.02] | | 0.0027 [1.06] | 0.0068** [2.29] |
| OWN _{foreign} | 0.0042 [0.52] | | | 0.0001 [0.02] | | | 0.0043 [0.94] | | | 0.0042 [0.44] | | |
| Size | 0.0379** [2.10] | -0.0022 [0.36] | 0.002 [0.35] | 0.034 [1.06] | -0.0037 [0.17] | 0.0062 [0.27] | 0.0174 [1.18] | -0.0003 [0.04] | 0.0044 [0.51] | 0.0404 [1.59] | -0.0028 [0.34] | -0.0016 [0.24] |
| Intercept | 0.0164*** [5.37] | 0.0119*** [4.85] | 0.0066*** [4.33] | 0.0157*** [6.45] | 0.0201*** [10.51] | 0.0168*** [4.24] | 0.0066*** [2.98] | 0.0098** [2.02] | 0.0210*** [6.18] | 0.0173*** [8.54] | 0.0106** [2.02] | 0.0085*** [3.58] |
| No. of Obs. | 2264 | 4895 | 1998 | 1281 | 2009 | 721 | 521 | 982 | 544 | 1743 | 3913 | 1454 |
| R ² | 0.3241 | 0.2117 | 0.7206 | 0.3495 | 0.2581 | 0.746 | 0.2900 | 0.1542 | 0.2947 | 0.3278 | 0.2299 | 0.7395 |

*, **, *** Significantly different from zero at the 10%, 5%, and 1% levels respectively, using a two-tailed tests.