

[Business](#) | Bartleby

Would you rather be a manager or a leader?

你更像成为一名项目管理者还是一名领导

The distinction is both valid and unhelpful

这个区别有其合理性，但对问题的解决没有太多帮助。



image: paul blow

Oct 23rd 2023

conjure up 想象出、使人想起

If you were asked to imagine a manager, you might well conjure up someone comically boring, desk-bound and monotonal. Now do the same for a leader. You may well be picturing someone delivering a rousing speech. A horse may be involved. You almost certainly have different types in mind. There is indeed a distinction between managers and leaders, but it should not be overdone.

/ˈkɑːndʒər/ 设想

/ˈkɑːmɪk(ə)l/ 滑稽的、好笑的

做办公室工作的

单一的

/ˈraʊzɪŋ/ 充满活力的

过于劳累

如果让你想象一个经理，你可能会想到一个滑稽、坐在办公桌前、单调乏味的形象。现在同样来想象一个领导者。你可能会想到一个激励人心的演讲者，或许还牵涉到一匹马。你几乎肯定会想到两种不同类型的人。的确，经理和领导者之间存在区别，但不应该夸大其分别。

确定某事的确切情况

Various attempts have been made to pin down the differences between the two, but they boil down to the same thing. Managers, according to an influential article by Abraham Zaleznik in the *Harvard Business Review* in 1977, value order; leaders are tolerant of chaos. A later article in the same publication, by John Kotter, described management as a problem-solving discipline, in which planning and budgeting creates predictability. Leadership, in contrast, is about the embrace of change and inspiring people to brave the unknown. Warren Bennis, an American academic who made leadership studies respectable, reckoned that a manager administers and a leader innovates.

有许多尝试去界定这两者之间的差异，但归根结底是相同的。根据阿伯拉罕·扎勒尼克 (Abraham Zaleznik) 于 1977 年在《哈佛商业评论》中发表的一篇有影响力的文章，项目经理们重视秩序；而领导者则能够容忍混乱。同样在该刊物上发表的约翰·科特 (John Kotter) 的一篇后续文章中，将管理描述为一个解决问题的学科，通过规划和预算创造可预测性。而领导则是关于拥抱变革，激励人们勇敢面对未知的能力。美国学者沃伦·贝尼斯 (Warren Bennis) 认为，项目经历是管理者，而领导者是创新者。

给...贴标签

/ 'ɑ:rbɪtrəri / 任意的、随心所欲的

Some of these definitions might be a tad arbitrary but they can be useful nonetheless. Too many firms promote employees into management roles because that is the only way for them to get on in their careers. But some people are much more suited to the ethos of management. They are more focused on process; they like the idea of spreadsheets, orderliness and supporting others to do good work. Shopify, an e-commerce firm, has created

/ 'i:θ ɑ:s / (某团体的) 精神特质，道德意识

电子表格

有序性

separate career paths for managers and developers with these differences in motivation in mind.

这些定义可能有些主观，但仍然有一定的用处。许多公司之所以将员工提升为管理职位，是因为这是他们在职业生涯中唯一能够进步的方式。但有些人更适合管理的理念。他们更关注流程；他们喜欢电子表格、有序性，并愿意支持他人做出出色的工作。电商公司 Shopify 考虑到这些动机的差异，为项目管理者 and 开发人员分别创建了不同的职业发展路径。

The difference between managing and leading is not just a matter of ^{/sɪ'mæntiks/ 语义学} semantics. Research by Oriana Bandiera of the London School of Economics and her co-authors looked at the ^{diary: 日记、专栏} diaries of 1,114 ceos in six countries, and categorised their behaviours into two types.

管理和领导之间的区别不仅仅是语义上的问题。伦敦经济学院的奥丽亚娜·班迪埃拉 (Oriana Bandiera) 及其合著者的研究分析了来自六个国家的 1,114 位首席执行官的日志，并将他们的行为分为两种类型。

On their definitions, “leaders” have more meetings with other ^{/sɪˈswiːt/ 高管} c-suite ^{有执行权的、行政部门} executives, and more interactions with multiple people inside and outside the company. “Managers” spend more time with employees involved in operational activities and have more one-to-one meetings. Leaders communicate and co-ordinate; managers ^{/drɪl/ 训练} drill ^{/'daʊnwərd/ 向下的} downwards and focus on individuals. The research suggested that firms that are run by leaders perform better than those run by managers.

根据他们的定义，“领导者”与其他高层主管进行的会议更多，与公司内外进行的互动的人也更多。“项目管理者”与参与运营活动的员工在一起的时间更多，并且有更多的一对一的会议。领导者进行沟通 and 协调；项目管理者向下层下达指令，并专注于个体。研究表明，由领导者管理的公司比由项目经理管理的公司表现更好。

But pointing to the differences between managers and leaders can also be unhelpful, for two reasons. The first is that being a leader seems so much sexier than being a manager. That is partly because leadership qualities are associated with ^{/ˌsiːnɪjəˈrɪti/ 年长、职位高} seniority. As people scale the ^{/ˈkɔːrpəreɪt/ 公司的、法人的} corporate ladder, they go on leadership courses, join leadership teams and start sentences with ^{/ˈfreɪz/ 短语、词组} phrases like “as a leader”. It is also because the two ^{/ˈɑːrkɪtaɪp/ 原型、典型} archetypes are not created equal. Would you rather be the person who likes to do budgeting or the one who holds others in ^{/θrɔːl/ 奴隶、束缚} thrall? The type that likes the ^{现状} status quo or the one that wants to change the world? “It takes neither ^{天赋} genius nor ^{/ˈheroʊɪzəm/ 英雄气概} heroism to be a manager,” wrote Zaleznik. No wonder there are ^{/ˈfeɪt/ 宴请} feted programmes for young global leaders but not for young global managers.

然而，将项目经理和领导之间的区别夸大也可能没有太多帮助，原因有两个。首先，成为领导者似乎比成为项目经理更具吸引力。这部分是因为领导素质与资历高度相关。随着人们在企业阶梯中不断攀升，他们参加领导力培训课程，加入领导团队，并以“作为领导者”开头的句子开始表达自己的观点。同时，这两个角色的形象并不平等。你更愿意成为喜欢做预算的人，还是那个能够激发他人热情的人？是喜欢保持现状的类型，还是渴望改变世界的类型？“成为项目经理既不需要天才也不需要英雄主义，”扎勒尼克写道。难怪有许多备受赞誉的项目专门培养年轻的全球领袖，而没有专门培养年轻的全球项目经理的项目。

The capacity to inspire others and to head into ^{/ˌʌnˈtʃɑːrtɪd/ 未知的} uncharted waters does become more ^{/ˈseɪliənt/ 凸出的、显著的} salient the higher you rise. But management skill does not become less important. Dr Bandiera and colleagues concluded that although ceos who displayed the behaviour of leaders were associated with better company performance overall, different firms may require different types of boss. Some would be ^{擅长于} better off with “manager” ceos. And performance is independently correlated with other things, including the quality of management practices.

随着职位的升高，激励他人和冒险进入未知领域的能力确实变得更加重要。然而，管理技能并没有变得不重要。班迪埃拉博士及其同事的研究得出结论，虽然展现领导者行为的首席执行官整体上与公司绩效更好相关，但不同公司可能需要不同类型的领导者。有些公司的首席执行官更适合具备"项目经理"特质的人。而绩效与其他因素，包括管理实践的质量，也存在独立的相关性。

The second unhelpful ^{附带产生的结果}by-product of the debate about managers and leaders is that it tends to separate people into one camp or the other. In fact, bosses must combine the qualities of both. Just as it is hard to motivate people if you are highly efficient but have the inspirational qualities of feta cheese, so it is not much use laying out ^{有抱负的、野心勃勃的}ambitious visions for the future if you don't have a clue how to make them reality. You need to turn the dial back and forth—
from strategy to execution, change to order, passion to process, leader to
manager.

经过辩论关于经理和领导者的讨论，第二个无益的副作用是它往往将人们分为两个阵营。事实上，领导者必须兼具两者的素质。如果你虽然高效但缺乏激励性，那么很难激发员工的动力；同样，如果你对如何实现宏伟愿景毫无头绪，那么仅仅展现雄心勃勃的愿景也没有太大用处。你需要在战略和执行、变革和秩序、激情和过程、领导者和项目经理之间找到平衡点。不断调整这些要素，才能实现成功。