

EECS 336 Problem 1.2

a. False

Counterexample: $f(n) = 1, g(n) = 2$

First we prove $f(n)$ is $\Omega(g(n))$

$\exists n_0 = 1, C = \frac{1}{3}$ (both are constants), such that $\forall n > n_0$,

$$f(n) = 1 > \frac{1}{3} \cdot 2 = Cg(n)$$

Therefore, $f(n)$ is $\Omega(g(n))$

Then we prove that $\log(f(n))$ is not $\Omega(\log(g(n)))$ by contradiction:

Suppose $\log(f(n))$ is $\Omega(\log(g(n)))$, which implied by definition

$\exists n_1, C_1 > 0$ (both are constants), such that $\forall n > n_1$,

$$\log(f(n)) \geq C_1 \log(g(n)).$$

$$0 \geq C_1 \log(2)$$

Since $C_1 > 0 \Rightarrow C_1 \log(2) > 0$,

This contradicts the supposition that C_1 is a positive constant. Therefore, the supposition is false.

b. False

Counterexample: $f(n) = 2e^n, g(n) = e^n$

Firstly we prove $f(n)$ is $\theta(g(n))$:

$$\begin{aligned} \exists n_0 = 1, C_0 = 3, \text{ such that, } \forall n > n_0, f(n) = 2e^n < 3e^n = C_0 g(n) \\ \Rightarrow f(n) \text{ is } \Omega(g(n)) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Similarly, } \exists n_1 = 1, C_1 = 1, \text{ such that, } \forall n > n_0, f(n) = 2e^n > e^n = C_1 g(n) \\ \Rightarrow f(n) \text{ is } O(g(n)) \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, $f(n)$ is $\theta(g(n))$

Then we prove that $2^{f(n)}$ is not $\theta(2^{g(n)})$ by contradiction:

Suppose that $2^{f(n)}$ is $\theta(2^{g(n)})$, then $2^{f(n)}$ is $O(2^{g(n)})$, which implies

$$\exists n_2, C_2 (\text{constants}), \text{ such that } \forall n > n_2, 2^{f(n)} \leq C_2 2^{g(n)} \Rightarrow C_2 \geq 2^{f(n)-g(n)} = 2^{e^n}$$

Since $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} 2^{e^n} = +\infty$, C_2 cannot be a constant. This contradicts the supposition that C_2 is a constant. Hence the supposition is false.

c. True

Since $f(n)$ is $\theta(g(n))$, $f(n)$ is both $\Omega(g(n))$ and $O(g(n))$.

1). Since $f(n)$ is $\Omega(g(n))$, $\exists n_0, C_0$ (constants), $\forall n > n_0, f(n) \geq C_0 g(n)$

$$\text{Because } x^{0.5} \text{ is a monotonically increasing function, } f(n)^{0.5} \geq (C_0 g(n))^{0.5} \Rightarrow \sqrt{f(n)} \geq \sqrt{C_0} \sqrt{g(n)}$$

$$\text{Then } \exists n_1 = n_0, C_1 = \sqrt{C_0}, \text{ such that } \forall n > n_1, \sqrt{f(n)} \geq C_1 \sqrt{g(n)}$$

$$\text{So } \sqrt{f(n)} \text{ is } \Omega(\sqrt{g(n)})$$

2). Since $f(n)$ is $O(g(n))$, $\exists n_2, C_2$ (constants), $\forall n > n_2, f(n) \leq C_2 g(n)$

$$\text{Because } x^{0.5} \text{ is a monotonically increasing function, } f(n), C_2 \text{ and } g(n) \text{ are all positive, } f(n)^{0.5} \leq (C_2 g(n))^{0.5} \Rightarrow \sqrt{f(n)} \leq \sqrt{C_2} \sqrt{g(n)}$$

$$\text{Then } \exists n_3 = n_2, C_3 = \sqrt{C_2} \text{ (so that } C_3 > 0), \text{ such that } \forall n > n_1, \sqrt{f(n)} \leq C_3 \sqrt{g(n)}$$

$$\text{So } \sqrt{f(n)} \text{ is } O(\sqrt{g(n)})$$

$$\text{By combining 1) and 2), } \sqrt{f(n)} \text{ is } \theta(\sqrt{g(n)})$$

d. False

$$\text{counterexample: } f(n) = 2\log(n), g(n) = \log(n) + 1$$

Firstly we prove that $f(n)$ is $\theta(g(n))$:

$$\exists n_0 = 5, C_0 = 1, \text{ such that } \forall n > n_0, f(n) = 2\log(n) \geq \log(n) + 1 = C_0 g(n) \Rightarrow f(n) \text{ is } \Omega(g(n))$$

$$\exists n_1 = 1, C_1 = 3, \text{ such that } \forall n > n_1, f(n) = 2\log(n) \leq 3\log(n) + 3 = 3g(n) = C_1 g(n) \Rightarrow f(n) \text{ is } O(g(n))$$

Therefore $f(n)$ is $\theta(g(n))$.

Secondly we prove that $f(n) - \log(n)$ is not $\theta(g(n) - \log(n))$ by contradiction:

Suppose that $f(n) - \log(n)$ is $\theta(g(n) - \log(n))$, then $f(n) - \log(n)$ is $O(g(n) - \log(n))$.

So $\exists n_2, C_2$, such that $\forall n > n_2$, $f(n) - \log(n) \leq C_2(g(n) - \log(n))$

$$\Rightarrow 2\log(n) - \log(n) = \log(n) \leq C_2(\log(n) - \log(n) + 1) = C_2$$

Since $\lim_{n \rightarrow +\infty} \log(n) = +\infty$, C_2 cannot be a constant. This contradicts the supposition that C_2 is a constant. So the supposition is false.