

Guess And Verify Method – Example – 4

Consider the recurrence $T(n) = \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n$.

Solution:

So, let us guess that $T(n) = \Theta(n \log n)$, and then try to prove that our guess is correct.

1st we have to remember:

Decreasing Rates of Growth:

$$2^{2n} < n! < 4^{2n} < 2^n < n^3 < n^2 < n \log n < \log(n!) < n \\ < 2^{\log n} < \log^2 n < \sqrt{\log n} < \log \log n < 1$$

2nd we have to remember that we are finding out the average case Θ i.e. both upper bound and lower bound.

Lets start by trying to prove an upper bound ,

$T(n) < cn \log n$:

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\ &\leq \sqrt{n} \times c \times \sqrt{n} \log \sqrt{n} + n \\ &\leq c \times n \times \log \sqrt{n} + n [\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&\leq c \times n \times \log n^{\frac{1}{2}} + n [\log_a b^c = c \times \log_a b] \\
&\leq cn \times \frac{1}{2} \log n + n \\
&\leq cn \log n [`n \log n` is higher here comparing with \\
&\quad `n`]
\end{aligned}$$

The last inequality assumes only that $1 \leq c \times \frac{1}{2} \times \log n$.

This is correct if n is sufficiently large and for any constant c , no matter how small. From the above proof, we can see that our guess is correct for the upper bound. Now, let us prove the lower bound for this recurrence.

$$\begin{aligned}
T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\
&\leq \sqrt{n} \times k \times \sqrt{n} \log \sqrt{n} + n \\
&\leq k \times n \times \log \sqrt{n} + n [\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n] \\
&\leq k \times n \times \log n^{\frac{1}{2}} + n [\log_a b^c = c \times \log_a b] \\
&\leq kn \times \frac{1}{2} \log n + n \\
&\leq kn \log n [`n \log n` is higher here comparing with \\
&\quad `n`]
\end{aligned}$$

The last inequality assumes only that $1 \geq k \times \frac{1}{2} \times \log n$.

This is incorrect if n is sufficiently large and for any constant k . From the above proof, we can see that our guess is incorrect for the lower bound.

From the above discussion, we understood that $\Theta(n \log n)$ is too big. How about $\Theta(n)$? The lower bound is easy to prove directly:

$$T(n) = \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \geq n$$

Now, let us prove the upper bound for this $\Theta(n)$.

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\ &\leq \sqrt{n} \times c \times \sqrt{n} + n \\ &\leq c \times n + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\ &\leq cn + n \\ &\leq n(c + 1) \\ &\leq cn \end{aligned}$$

From the above induction, $\Theta(n)$ is too small and $\Theta(n \log n)$ is too big. Therefore, we need something bigger than n and smaller than $n \log n$. How about $n\sqrt{\log n}$?

Proving the upper bound for $n\sqrt{\log n}$:

$$\begin{aligned}T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\&\leq \sqrt{n} \times c \times \sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{\log \sqrt{n}} + n \\&\leq c \times n \times \sqrt{\log \sqrt{n}} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\&\leq c \times n \times \log \sqrt{n^{\frac{1}{2}}} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\&\leq c \times n \times \frac{1}{2} \log \sqrt{n} + n \\&\leq cn \log \sqrt{n}\end{aligned}$$

Proving the lower bound for $n\sqrt{\log n}$:

$$\begin{aligned}T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\&\geq \sqrt{n} \times k \times \sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{\log \sqrt{n}} + n \\&\geq k \times n \times \sqrt{\log \sqrt{n}} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\&\geq k \times n \times \log \sqrt{n^{\frac{1}{2}}} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\&\geq k \times n \times \frac{1}{2} \log \sqrt{n} + n \\&\geq kn \log \sqrt{n}\end{aligned}$$

The last step doesn't work . What else is between n and $n \log n$? How about $n \log \log n$?

Proving upper bound for $n \log \log n$:

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\ &\leq \sqrt{n} \times c \times \sqrt{n} \log \log \sqrt{n} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\ &= c \times n \log \log \sqrt{n} + n \\ &= c \times n \log \log n - cn + n \end{aligned}$$

i. e. we can say , $n \log \log \sqrt{n} = n \log \log n - cn$, where c is constant.

$$\leq cn \log \log n , \text{ if } c \geq 1$$

Proving lower bound for $n \log \log n$:

$$\begin{aligned} T(n) &= \sqrt{n} T(\sqrt{n}) + n \\ &\geq \sqrt{n} \times k \times \sqrt{n} \log \log \sqrt{n} + n \quad (\sqrt{n} \times \sqrt{n} = n) \\ &\geq k \times n \log \log \sqrt{n} + n \\ &\geq k \times n \log \log n - kn + n \end{aligned}$$

i. e. we can say , $n \log \log \sqrt{n} = n \log \log n - cn$, where c is constant.

$$\geq kn\log\log n, \text{ if } k \leq 1$$

From the above proofs, we can see that

$$T(n) \leq cn\log\log n, \text{ if } c \geq 1 \text{ and } T(n) \geq kn\log\log n, \text{ if } k \leq 1.$$

Hence it is fair : $T(n) = \Theta(n\log\log n)$.
