

**BOARD OF ETHICS
OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA**

J. Shane Creamer, Jr.
Executive Director
Board of Ethics
of the City of Philadelphia
1515 Arch Street, 18th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

V.

Celena Morrison

Respondent.

Matter No: 2106ET19

PROCEDURAL INSTRUCTIONS

The Executive Director of the Board of Ethics has served a Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding upon Celena Morrison, Respondent, on June 9, 2021 by personal service. I am the Hearing Officer appointed by the Board of Ethics to preside over this enforcement proceeding and to issue appropriate orders necessary to the fair adjudication of this matter. The Board of Ethics will make the final decision in this enforcement proceeding.

The Notice you received is the first step in an administrative enforcement proceeding before the Board of Ethics. This Notice means that the Executive Director has conducted an investigation and believes that have you violated the City's Ethics Code ([Phila. Code §20-600, et seq.](#)). The Executive Director is now asking the Board to review the results of the investigation and decide whether the facts show that you violated the Ethics Code.

Responding to the Notice

Under the Board's regulations, you have twenty (20) days to respond to the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. Since the Notice was served on June 9, 2021, you have until **June 29, 2021** to file your Response.

You may file your Response by either email or mail (USPS or other mail delivery service). If you file by email, your Response must be an attachment in PDF format (not in the text body of an email) and must be **received** by the Board of Ethics no later than the due date. You must address your email to Jordana.Greenwald@phila.gov and copy (cc) Michael.Cooke@phila.gov and Thomas.Klemm@phila.gov. You must also copy the Executive Director (Shane.Creamer@phila.gov) on your email.

If you file by mail, your Response must be **received** by the Board of Ethics by the due date. If you file by mail, you must address your Response to:

City of Philadelphia Board of Ethics
Michael Cooke, General Counsel
1515 Arch Street, 18th floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

If you file by mail, you must also send the Executive Director a copy of your Response.

It is very important that you file your Response by the due date. If you do not file a Response, you are giving up your right to have the Board of Ethics hear your side of the story. If you want to file a Response but are unable to do so within 20 days for a good reason, you may request (in writing) an extension of time in which to file a Response. Instructions for requesting an extension can be found in the attached Introduction to Board of Ethics Administrative Enforcement Proceedings.

Hearing Request

You have a right to have a hearing. However, you must request a hearing in your Response if you want a hearing. To obtain a hearing, state clearly in your Response, "I request a hearing." **If you fail to request a hearing in your Response, a hearing will not be provided to you.** Without a hearing, you will not have an opportunity to present witnesses, documents, or other evidence to the Board.

If you request a hearing, the hearing will be closed to the public unless you consent in writing to make it a public hearing.

Respond to Each Numbered Paragraph in your Response

If you file a Response, you must answer each numbered paragraph in the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. Use paragraphs with the same numbers as those that appear in the Notice. For example, your response to paragraph 1 of the Notice should be numbered paragraph 1 of your Response.

You must admit or deny the statements in each paragraph of the Notice. If you admit some facts in a paragraph but deny others, you must explain which parts of the paragraph you admit and which you deny.

You may also choose to include in your Response additional facts that you believe are helpful to your defense. This is not required, but if you believe important facts are missing from the Notice you may want to state them in your Response.

Legal Representation

If you have a lawyer or plan to obtain one, you may have that lawyer represent you in this proceeding. The Board, however, cannot provide you with a lawyer. While you are not required to have a lawyer and you may represent yourself, you are encouraged to consult with a lawyer, if possible. If at any point you obtain a lawyer to represent you, your lawyer must file an Entry of Appearance.

The Executive Director may also designate an additional lawyer(s) to act on his behalf. Any lawyer appearing for the Executive Director (other than the Executive Director himself) must also file an Entry of Appearance. A form Entry of Appearance is attached.

Preliminary Status Conference

At various times during the administrative enforcement proceeding, I will hold conferences or request information to help move the case forward. **The first conference will be held on Zoom at 1:00 p.m. on Thursday, June 17, 2021.**

Link: us02web.zoom.us/j/83485327959?pwd=RkVLQkxxYldKUdRoY3dlOGUrbTJpQT09

Meeting ID: 834 8532 7959

Passcode: 2106ET19

During this conference, I will go over the requirements for the Response, as well as some general procedures. I will also introduce the Case Management Form, which both you and the Executive Director are required to complete, and I will set a deadline for returning the form.

If you or your lawyer are unable to attend the conference at the scheduled date and time, you must contact General Counsel Staff promptly by emailing Jordana.Greenwald@phila.gov (with copies to Michael.Cooke@phila.gov and Thomas.Klemm@phila.gov) or by leaving a message at 215-686-9450 so that we can reschedule the conference.

Do You Have Questions?

If you have any questions about the Board's procedures or what is required of you, please contact Associate General Counsel Jordana Greenwald by email at Jordana.Greenwald@phila.gov (with copies to Michael.Cooke@phila.gov and Thomas.Klemm@phila.gov). This includes questions about deadlines, how to file documents, and general questions about how the administrative enforcement process works. If you do not have access to email, you may leave a message at 215-686-9450 and someone will follow up with you. Please remember this is only for procedural questions and not for questions or statements about the substance of the case.

It is very important to the fairness of this proceeding that any communication you have with me or with the General Counsel Staff about the substance of your case also include the Executive Director. Similarly, any communication that the Executive Director has with me or with General Counsel Staff must also include you. Therefore, when you file your Response or submit your completed Case Management Form, you must send a copy to the Executive Director. The same rule applies to the Executive Director. This prevents either party from having private conversations about the substance of the case with me or General Counsel Staff. In addition, neither the Executive Director nor you may communicate directly with Board members about this case.

More Information

For more information about administrative enforcement proceedings, please see the Introduction to Board of Ethics Administrative Enforcement Proceedings and Board Regulation No. 2 (with procedural supplement), which are attached to these instructions.

Date: June 11, 2021

/s/ Louis S. Rulli, Esq.
Louis S. Rulli, Esq.
Hearing Officer

PHILADELPHIA BOARD OF ETHICS

REGULATION NO. 2

INVESTIGATIONS AND ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS.

Table of Contents

Subpart A.	Scope; Definitions.....	pg. 2
Subpart B.	Separation of Functions	pg. 3
Subpart C.	Investigations	pg. 3
Subpart D.	Confidentiality of Complaints and Investigations	pg. 6
Subpart E.	Administrative Enforcement.....	pg. 8
Subpart F.	Judicial Enforcement	pg. 13
Subpart G.	Settlement and Conciliation.....	pg. 14
Subpart G.	Penalties	pg. 14

SUBPART A. SCOPE; DEFINITIONS.

2.0 Scope. This Regulation is promulgated by the Board pursuant to its authority under §§ 4-1100 and 8-407 of the Home Rule Charter and § 20-606(1) of the Philadelphia Code and interprets Code §§ 20-606(1)(f)-(k) and 20-606(2) regarding complaints, investigations enforcement proceedings, confidentiality, and related matters.

2.1 Definitions. As used herein, the following words and phrases shall have the meanings indicated.

- a. Board.** The Board of Ethics and its individual members.
- b. Board Staff.** Employees of the Board of Ethics.
- c. Complainant.** A person who has submitted a complaint to the Board.
- d. Complaint.** A written document submitted to the Board for the purpose of initiating a Board investigation or enforcement action.
- e. Executive Director.** The Executive Director of the Board and his or her designees.
- f. General Counsel.** The General Counsel of the Board and his or her designees.
- g. Investigation.** The Board's inquiry into an alleged violation of the Public Integrity Laws.
- h. Person.** A business, individual, corporation, non-profit, union, association, firm, partnership, committee, political committee, club, or other organization or group of persons.
- i. Public Integrity Laws.** Chapters 20-600, 20-1000, and 20-1200 of the Philadelphia Code and Sections 10-100, 10-102, 10-105, and 10-107 of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, and any other matters assigned to the Board by ordinance.
- j. Referral.** Information that a City department or a federal, state, or local governmental entity with civil or criminal enforcement powers, or an employee or representative of any of the foregoing, provides to the Board or Board Staff so they may determine whether a potential violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred.
- k. Respondent.** A person against whom the Executive Director has instituted an administrative enforcement proceeding or against whom the Board has instituted a judicial enforcement proceeding.
- l. Subject.** A person who is identified in a complaint, referral, investigation, or preliminary inquiry as having potentially violated the Public Integrity Laws.

SUBPART B. SEPARATION OF FUNCTIONS.

2.2 As required by law, in the context of administrative enforcement proceedings and related investigations the Board shall maintain a separation between the adjudicative functions and the investigatory or prosecutorial functions. In this regard, the individual members of the Board, any Hearing Officer in a particular case, and the General Counsel shall be considered to be part of the “adjudicative function,” and the Executive Director and professional staff or consultants directed by the Executive Director shall be considered to be part of the “investigatory” or “prosecutorial” function.

SUBPART C. INVESTIGATIONS.

2.3 Preliminary Inquiry. The Executive Director may, at his or her discretion, conduct a preliminary inquiry to determine if there is reason to believe a violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred. Board and Board staff shall keep preliminary inquiries confidential as required by this Regulation. A preliminary inquiry is not an investigation and is not subject to the disclosure limitations of Paragraph 2.11(a) or the notice provisions of Paragraph 2.6(e).

2.4 Initiation of Investigations. The Executive Director shall have the authority to initiate an investigation upon:

- a. Receipt of a complaint that meets the requirements of Paragraph 2.5;
- b. Receipt of a referral from another government and/or law enforcement agency, if the referral describes a potential violation of the Public Integrity Laws; or
- c. Determining, through a preliminary inquiry, that there is reason to believe a violation of the Public Integrity Laws may have occurred.

An investigation that is not initiated in response to a complaint shall not be subject to the requirements of Paragraph 2.5.

2.5 Complaints.

- a. Any person who believes a violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred may submit a written complaint to the Executive Director. A complaint shall:
 - i. Provide the full name and address of the complainant, and identify as the subject of the complaint the person or persons who is alleged to have committed violations of the Public Integrity Laws, including their names and addresses if known; and
 - ii. Contain facts that describe a violation of the Public Integrity Laws and shall include relevant times, places, and names of witnesses, if known.

- b. **Initial Review.** Upon receipt of a complaint, the Executive Director shall review the complaint for substantial compliance with the requirements of Paragraph 2.5(a). If the complaint is in compliance, the Executive Director shall notify the complainant that the complaint has been accepted. If a complaint does not comply with Paragraph 2.5(a), the Executive Director shall dismiss the complaint and shall notify the complainant of dismissal and the reasons therefore.
- c. **De Minimis Complaints.** The Executive Director may dismiss or suspend further processing of a complaint or other investigation if, in his or her judgment, the alleged violation is trivial, typographical or clerical, or in other respects a *de minimis* violation; provided, however, that the Executive Director shall report regularly to the Board on the number and nature of complaints dismissed or suspended under this Paragraph.
- d. **Frivolous Complaints prohibited.** No person shall submit a false or frivolous complaint to the Board. If the Executive Director receives information that a complaint is false or frivolous, he or she may initiate an investigation into the circumstances surrounding the drafting and filing of the complaint.

2.6 Conduct of an Investigation.

- a. **Purpose.** The purpose of an investigation is to determine whether there is probable cause to believe that a violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred. An investigation ends when the Executive Director either makes a finding of probable cause or terminates the investigation pursuant to Paragraph 2.6(e) or when the matter is resolved by a settlement agreement approved pursuant to Subpart G.
- b. **General.** An investigation may include, but is not limited to, field investigations and inspections, the issuance of subpoenas, the taking of sworn testimony, requests for the production of documents, interrogatories, requests for admissions, the review of public filings, and other methods of information gathering.
- c. **Subpoenas and Subpoenas Duces Tecum.** The Executive Director or the Board Chair shall have the authority to issue subpoenas and subpoenas duces tecum on behalf of the Board in connection to any investigation conducted pursuant to this Regulation. If any person refuses to comply with a subpoena issued under this Paragraph, or while appearing pursuant to it, refuses to answer any question or produce any records or materials, the Board, by majority vote, may direct the Executive Director to apply for the enforcement of the subpoena in the appropriate Court of Common Pleas.
- d. **Testimony.** The Executive Director shall have the authority to administer oaths and affirmations on behalf of the Board and to take testimony from any person in connection to any investigation conducted pursuant to this Regulation.

- e. **Termination.** The Executive Director shall have discretion to terminate an investigation upon reasonable notice to the Board. If the investigation is based on a complaint meeting the requirements of Paragraph 2.5(a), the Executive Director shall notify the complainant of the termination and the reasons therefore.

If the Executive Director knows that the subject of an investigation was aware of the investigation, he or she shall notify the subject of the termination and the reasons therefore. When notifying a complainant or subject of an investigation of the termination of an investigation, the Executive Director shall inform them that they are no longer bound by the disclosure prohibition of Paragraph 2.11(a).

The Executive Director may notify persons who have provided testimony or other information to the Board during the course of an investigation that the investigation has been terminated and that they are no longer bound by such disclosure prohibitions.

- f. **Referring matters to other government agencies.** The Board or Executive Director may refer any matter related to, or discovered in, an investigation to any other governmental or law enforcement agency as the Board or Executive Director deems appropriate. If the Board deems a potential violation by an officer or employee to be too minor to warrant enforcement by the Board, it may refer the matter to the head of the officer's or employee's agency to take appropriate disciplinary action.

2.7 Retaliation Prohibited. No officer or employee shall discharge, change the official rank, grade or compensation, or deny a promotion of an officer or employee, or threaten to do so, for filing a complaint with or providing information to the Board or Board staff, or for testifying in any Board proceeding.

2.8 Mandatory Cooperation with the Board. All City officers and employees shall cooperate fully with any request of the Board or Board staff made pursuant to the execution of the Board's powers and duties. Failure to cooperate with the Board or Board staff includes:

- a. Refusal to meet with Board staff to provide information related to an investigation or preliminary inquiry;
- b. Responding untruthfully to questions Board staff ask regarding an investigation or preliminary inquiry;
- c. Telling another person not to meet with Board staff or answer questions relating to an investigation or preliminary inquiry;
- d. Directing or suggesting that another person provide false information to the Board or Board staff; or
- e. Destroying evidence related to an investigation or preliminary inquiry.

SUBPART D. CONFIDENTIALITY OF COMPLAINTS AND INVESTIGATIONS

2.9 Board records, reports, memoranda, or files related to a complaint, preliminary inquiry, or investigation shall be confidential and shall not be disclosed, except as provided by this Subpart.

2.10 Confidentiality of complaints and referrals.

- a. **Disclosures by persons other than the Board or Board staff.** A person may disclose his or her intention to file a complaint or make a referral, the fact that he or she has filed a complaint or made a referral, or the substance of the complaint or referral itself.
- b. **Disclosures by the Board or Board staff.** The Board and Board staff shall not disclose the identity of a complainant or the complaint itself unless compelled to do so by court order. The Board and Board Staff may disclose the source of a referral in an approved settlement agreement or in the course of a judicial or administrative enforcement proceeding, appeal, or other legal proceeding, or in a public announcement concerning any of the foregoing.

2.11 Confidentiality of Investigations.

- a. **Disclosures by persons other than the Board or Board staff.** While an investigation is ongoing, a person may not disclose any information or documents related to that investigation that he or she has learned or obtained solely from the Board or Board staff, including the fact that an investigation is ongoing, except as follows:
 - i. A disclosure made for the purpose of seeking the advice of legal counsel;
 - ii. A disclosure made in the course of a judicial proceeding;
 - iii. A disclosure made to a law enforcement official or agency for the purpose of initiating, participating in or responding to an investigation or prosecution by the law enforcement official or agency;
 - iv. A disclosure made in testimony under oath before a governmental body or court; and
 - v. A disclosure required by law.

A person may disclose information or documents related to an investigation that he or she has obtained from a source other than the Board or Board staff, including the content of any statements he or she has made to the Board or Board staff. Once an investigation has ended, a person may disclose any information about that investigation.

- b. **Disclosures by the Board or Board staff.** The Board and Board Staff shall not disclose or acknowledge at any time any information or documents related to a preliminary inquiry or investigation except as necessary to fulfill their duties or if otherwise required by law. The following are examples of permissible disclosures:
- i. A disclosure made for the purpose of seeking the advice of legal counsel;
 - ii. A disclosure made to a law enforcement official or agency for the purpose of initiating, participating in or responding to an investigation or prosecution by the law enforcement official or agency;
 - iii. A disclosure made in a referral by the Board to a government agency, as provided in Paragraph 2.6(f);
 - iv. A disclosure made in testimony under oath before a governmental body or court;
 - v. A disclosure made to a complainant, source of a referral, or subject of a complaint, investigation, or preliminary inquiry or his or her legal counsel or agent;
 - vi. A disclosure made to a witness in a preliminary inquiry or investigation or his or her legal counsel or agent;
 - vii. A disclosure made in order to initiate or pursue a judicial enforcement proceeding or in a public announcement concerning a judicial enforcement proceeding; and
 - viii. A disclosure made in an approved settlement agreement or in a public announcement concerning such settlement agreement.

SUBPART E. ADMINISTRATIVE ENFORCEMENT.

2.12 Initiation of an Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. If the Executive Director finds there is probable cause to believe that a violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred, and that the matter is appropriate for an administrative adjudication by the Board, the Executive Director shall initiate an administrative enforcement proceeding. The Executive Director shall not engage in any *ex parte* communications with the Board, its General Counsel, or any Hearing Officer appointed by the Board, with respect to a pending administrative enforcement proceeding.

2.13 Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. To commence the enforcement proceeding, the Executive Director shall serve a Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding (“Notice”) on each respondent whom he or she alleges has violated the Public Integrity Laws.

- a. **Contents.** The Notice shall contain the following: (i) a description of the acts and/or omissions of the respondent that form the basis for each alleged violation; (ii) the applicable provisions of law that are alleged to be violated; and (iii) the deadline for the respondent’s response required under Paragraph 2.14. The Notice shall inform the respondent of his or her right to request a hearing. The Notice shall also inform respondent that a request for a hearing shall be made in his or her written response to the Notice and that a respondent’s failure to request a hearing is a waiver of the right to a hearing as set forth in Paragraph 2.14(c).
- b. **Service.** The Executive Director shall serve the Notice on each respondent by personal service, certified mail, or any other method that provides proof of delivery. The Executive Director may serve a respondent whose address is unknown either by personally delivering the Notice to such respondent, or his or her attorney or agent, or by any means of substituted or constructive service authorized by Pennsylvania statute or civil rule. The Executive Director shall serve a copy of the Notice on the General Counsel.

2.14 Opportunity to Respond. The respondent has the right to respond in writing to the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. The response is due within twenty (20) days of the date of service of the Notice, unless, for exigent circumstances, the Board or its Hearing Officer shall fix a shorter time. Upon the request of the respondent, the Board its designee may grant an extension of time to respond to the Notice. A request for an extension shall be in writing and shall set forth the basis for the request.

- a. **Appearance before Board.** If the respondent wishes to appear before the Board to contest the allegations in the Notice, the respondent shall timely request a hearing in his or her response to the Notice. The respondent may be represented by counsel, and may call witnesses and present evidence in his or her defense at such hearing.
- b. **Representation.** If the respondent is represented by counsel, he or she shall so notify the Board and shall provide the General Counsel with counsel’s name, address, e-mail address, telephone number, and attorney number.

- c. **Waiver.** A respondent's failure to request a hearing in his or her written response to the Notice is a waiver of the right to a hearing. A respondent's failure to respond in writing to the Notice by the deadline set forth in this Paragraph is a waiver of the right to a hearing. The Board may grant an untimely request for a hearing if such request is made before the Board votes to approve its final determination in the matter as provided in Paragraph 2.20.

2.15 Confidentiality of Administrative Enforcement Proceedings.

- a. The Board's administrative enforcement proceedings shall be confidential with closed hearings, unless the respondent has provided written consent to a public proceeding.
- b. Unless a respondent requests a public proceeding:
 - i. The Board and Board staff shall not make the proceeding public or disclose any information about it except as necessary to carry out their duties. Only persons who are necessary for the proceeding may be present during a hearing.
 - ii. Respondent and respondent's counsel may make such disclosures as are necessary to participate in the proceeding and to seek or provide legal advice or representation. In addition, respondent and counsel may disclose information related to a proceeding that they have obtained from a source other than the Board, Board staff, or the proceeding.
 - iii. A witness may make such disclosures as are necessary to participate in the proceeding or seek legal advice. In addition, a witness may disclose information related to a proceeding that he or she has obtained from a source other than the Board, Board staff, or the proceeding.
- c. If a respondent provides written consent to a public proceeding, it may not be withdrawn. If a respondent consents to a public proceeding, the Board will make all filings in the proceeding public while it is pending and will hold a public hearing.
- d. Once the Board has served notice of its final determination on the respondent, the adjudication is no longer pending and the Board and Board staff, respondents, respondents' counsel, and witnesses may disclose any information about the proceeding. However, the Board and Board staff shall not disclose the identity of a complainant or the complaint itself unless compelled to do so by court order.

2.16 Administrative Enforcement Hearings. The Board may conduct hearings to adjudicate alleged violations of the Public Integrity Laws. A quorum of Board members need not be present for a hearing to proceed. One or more Board members shall preside over all such hearings, and determine the conduct and order of the proceeding. The Board may, however, appoint a Hearing Officer to oversee pre-hearing disclosures, preside over a hearing, and prepare Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for the Board's consideration. Respondents to an enforcement proceeding will be afforded a full and fair opportunity to be heard, as set forth below.

- a. Notice of Hearing.** The Board shall notify the parties of the date and time of the hearing in advance of the hearing. All hearings shall be held at the offices of the Board of Ethics, unless otherwise specified by the Board.
- b. Oaths and Affirmations.** The Board and its designees shall have the power to administer oaths and take testimony on any matter relevant to the alleged violations that are the subject of the hearing.
- c. Subpoenas.** The Board and its designees shall have the power pursuant to Charter § 8-409 to issue subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents and materials relevant to the alleged violations that are the subject of the hearing. After the Board issues subpoenas for administrative adjudication hearings, the Executive Director and respondents shall have the authority to apply for enforcement of the subpoenas in the appropriate Court of Common Pleas if any person refuses to comply with any such subpoena, or while appearing pursuant to it, refuses to answer any question or produce any records or materials.
- d. Ex parte communications.** No party shall engage in a substantive *ex parte* communication with any member of the Board (including, for purposes of this subparagraph, the General Counsel and any Hearing Officer) concerning the administrative enforcement proceeding. Communicating with the General Counsel regarding issues such as scheduling is not a substantive *ex parte* communication.
- e. Resolution of Pre-hearing Matters.** The Board may designate a single Board member or a Hearing Officer to resolve matters related to pre-hearing disclosures and submissions.
- f. Maintenance of Order.** The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may exclude an individual from a hearing or limit the number of persons attending a hearing as necessary to limit disruption and maintain an orderly and efficient hearing.
- g. Additional Procedures.*** The Board may approve additional procedures for the conduct and management of administrative enforcement proceedings. Any additional procedures approved by the Board will be provided to the parties in advance of a hearing.

* On November 19, 2014, the Board approved the additional procedures that are described in the document titled "Procedures for Administrative Enforcement Proceedings that Supplement Regulation No. 2," which immediately follows the last page of this copy of the Regulation.

2.17 Discovery.

- a. **Pre-hearing exchange and submission of information.**
 - i. At least 21 days prior to the hearing, the Executive Director and the respondent shall exchange the names and addresses of witnesses they plan to call to testify and copies of any documents they intend to offer as evidence.
 - ii. At least 14 days prior to the hearing, the Executive Director and respondent shall submit to the Board the names of any witnesses they plan to call to testify and copies of any documents they intend to offer as evidence.
 - iii. The Board may approve additional requirements for the pre-hearing submission of information to the Board. Any additional requirements approved by the Board will be provided to the parties in advance of a hearing.
 - iv. The Board or its Hearing Officer may, for exigent circumstances, fix a shorter time for the exchange and submission of information described in this Paragraph.
 - v. The Executive Director and the respondent shall not offer any contested evidence at the hearing other than from witnesses and documents identified as required by this Paragraph, provided that the Board or its Hearing Officer may grant exceptions for good cause shown.
- b. **No other discovery.** Except for the exchanges of information described in this Paragraph, there shall be no other discovery, unless voluntarily agreed to by the Executive Director and the respondent.

2.18 Examination and Cross-Examination. Witnesses shall testify under oath or affirmation, and shall be subject to reasonable examination and cross-examination. Witnesses shall appear on behalf of or at the invitation or subpoena of the Board or on behalf of the parties to the proceeding.

- a. **Written Testimony.** The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may allow any party or witness to offer testimony in written form. Such written testimony shall be received in evidence with the same force and effect as though it were stated orally at the hearing by the party or witness who has given the evidence, provided that such testimony is sworn under penalty of perjury, and the party or witness is available to appear at the hearing for cross examination as requested by any party to the proceeding.
- b. **Examination of Witnesses by the Board.** Board members, or the Board's Hearing Officer, may ask questions of witnesses at any time.
- c. **Limitation of Witnesses and Examination.** The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may limit the testimony of witnesses whose testimony is cumulative or similar. The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may limit the time to be spent on the direct or cross-examination of a witness or of a party's overall examination and cross examination of witnesses.

2.19 Evidence. The Board, or its Hearing Officer, shall not be bound by technical rules of evidence in administrative enforcement proceedings, and all relevant evidence of reasonably probative value may be received.

- a. **Official Notice.** The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may take official notice of relevant laws, official regulations and transcripts of prior administrative enforcement proceedings; and of judicially cognizable facts, facts of common public knowledge, and physical, technical or scientific facts within the Board's specialized knowledge.
- b. **Documentary Evidence.** The Board, or its Hearing Officer, may accept, at its discretion, copies and excerpts of documents and other records if the original is not in the possession of a party or readily available.

2.20 Final Board Determinations.

- a. After providing the respondent with an opportunity to respond to the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding and to contest any alleged violations at a hearing conducted pursuant to this Regulation, the Board shall deliberate on the evidence and determine, by a preponderance of the evidence, whether a violation of applicable law has occurred, and whether to assess penalties for any such violations. A determination to find a violation and assess a penalty requires a majority vote of Board members present and voting. A quorum of Board members must participate in the vote on a final determination. The decision of the Board shall be the final agency action.
- b. If the respondent does not request a hearing, the Board may make its final determination based on:
 - i. Undisputed allegations in the Executive Director's Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding; or
 - ii. Evidence submitted by the Executive Director in support of the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding, including but not limited to deposition transcripts, documents, and affidavits or declarations.
- c. The Board shall serve notice of the final determination on the respondent by any method identified in Paragraph 2.13(b).

2.21 Publication of Final Determinations. The Board shall make its final determination public, including all adjudication filings and the hearing transcript. The Board shall not make public internal documents concerning the adjudication, such as internal legal memoranda drafted by General Counsel staff for the Board or by Enforcement staff for the Executive Director. The Board and Board staff shall not disclose the identity of a complainant or the complaint itself unless compelled to do so by court order.

SUBPART F. JUDICIAL ENFORCEMENT

2.22 Scope. This Subpart shall apply to enforcement actions initiated by the Board in the Court of Common Pleas.

2.23 Request for Authorization of Judicial Enforcement. If the Executive Director finds there is probable cause to believe that a violation of the Public Integrity Laws has occurred, and that the matter is appropriate for judicial enforcement, then the Executive Director shall present the Board with the allegations and an explanation of his or her finding of probable cause and request authorization from the Board to initiate judicial enforcement.

2.24 Opportunity to Address the Board. The Executive Director shall notify the subject of the finding of probable cause by the Executive Director and shall provide him or her with the allegations submitted to the Board pursuant to Paragraph 2.23. The Executive Director shall inform the subject that he or she may appear at the next public meeting of the Board to address the Board and respond to the allegations.

The provisions of Paragraph 2.24 shall not apply to actions to enforce a subpoena issued by the Board or to actions seeking emergency relief.

2.25 Board Action on Request for Authorization of Judicial Enforcement. After reviewing the allegations submitted by the Executive Director and considering the information, if any, provided by the subject, the Board shall:

- a. Reject the Executive Director's finding of probable cause and direct that the matter be dismissed;
- b. Direct the Executive Director to initiate judicial enforcement; or
- c. Determine that the matter is appropriate for administrative enforcement and direct the Executive Director to proceed under Subpart E of this Regulation, but only if the subject consents, in writing, to the matter being so resolved and agrees to waive any due process challenge based on the commingling of adjudicatory and prosecutorial functions arising from prior consideration of or exposure by any member of the Board or its staff to the relevant facts, allegations, or legal theories.

The Board shall notify the subject of its decision regarding the Executive Director's request for authorization of judicial enforcement.

SUBPART G. SETTLEMENT AND CONCILIATION

2.26 Settlement negotiations. At any time, the Executive Director may seek to settle a matter that is the subject of an investigation or enforcement proceeding.

2.27 Settlement Agreement. The Board and a subject of an investigation or a respondent to administrative or judicial enforcement may agree to enter into a written settlement agreement resolving violations of the Public Integrity Laws. The Executive Director shall submit a proposed settlement agreement to the Board in writing with a copy provided to the subject of the investigation or the respondent to the administrative or judicial enforcement. A proposed settlement agreement must be signed by both the Executive Director and the subject or respondent before being submitted to the Board for approval. The adoption of a settlement agreement is entirely within the discretion of the Board. A settlement agreement is not binding until it is signed by the subject or respondent and the Executive Director and approved by a majority vote of the Board. All approved settlement agreements shall be made available to the public.

SUBPART H. PENALTIES

2.28 Any person who does not comply with Subpart D or Paragraphs 2.5(d), 2.7, 2.8, or 2.15 of this Regulation shall be subject to a civil penalty of \$1,000, which may be increased \$2,000 if aggravating factors are present or decreased to \$250 if mitigating factors are present, as set forth in Code Chapter 20-1300.

Initially approved for public comment by Board on April 17, 2007
Public Hearing held on June 19, 2007
Adopted by Board, with modifications on June 26, 2007
Effective July 12, 2007

Proposed amendments approved for public comment by the Board on December 16, 2009
Public Hearings held on January 20, 2010 and February 17, 2010
Adopted by Board, with modifications on February 17, 2010
Effective February 28, 2010

Proposed amendments approved for public comment by the Board on May 21, 2014
Posted at Department of Records on May 27, 2014
Public Hearing held on July 16, 2014
Adopted by Board, with modifications on August 6, 2014
Effective August 18, 2014



CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

BOARD OF ETHICS
One Parkway Building
1515 Arch Street
18th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102
(215) 686 – 9450 (t)
(215) 686 – 9453 (f)

Procedures for Administrative Enforcement Proceedings that Supplement Board Regulation No.2

The following procedures for Board of Ethics administrative enforcement proceedings supplement the requirements and procedures described in Board Regulation No. 2 (“Investigations and Enforcement Proceedings”) at Subpart E. These additional procedures have been approved by the Board pursuant to Regulation No. 2 Paragraphs 2.16(g) and 2.17(a)(iii). The terms used here have the same meaning as in Regulation No. 2, and the Executive Director and respondent are referred to as the parties. To understand the procedures required for Board of Ethics administrative enforcement proceedings, it is important to read Regulation No. 2 Subpart E as well as this memo. Please contact the Board’s General Counsel with questions regarding these procedures.

1. Submission of Filings to the Board. Filings shall be submitted to the Board as follows:

- i. By email as a PDF less than fifteen megabytes in size to BOEGCStaff@phila.gov; or
- ii. By mail to Acting General Counsel Michael Cooke, City of Philadelphia Board of Ethics, 1515 Arch Street, 18th floor, Philadelphia, PA 19102.

Filings shall be received by the Board (not merely be postmarked) by the date due. All filings submitted to the Board must simultaneously be served on the opposing party. Filings shall include a signed certificate of service that indicates the date and method of service on the opposing party. Service may be made upon opposing counsel by email. The parties shall not send filings directly to individual Board members.

2. Requests for Extension of Time. A party may be granted an initial extension for the submission of a filing upon written request that alleges good cause for an extension and that is filed at least four days prior to a deadline. A Hearing Officer or the General Counsel (if a Hearing Officer has not been appointed) may grant an initial extension of up to 30 days to a party for good cause shown. The Board Chair may grant further extension if extraordinary circumstances are demonstrated by a party in a written request that is filed at least four days prior to the extended deadline. Extensions granted will correspondingly advance other administrative enforcement proceeding deadlines.

3. Format of Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. The allegations in the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding (the “Notice”) shall be set forth in consecutively numbered paragraphs.

4. Format of Response to Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. A Response to the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding shall be set forth in consecutively numbered paragraphs that admit or deny each allegation in the corresponding numbered paragraphs of the Notice. A respondent may provide any additional facts that are relevant to the respondent's defense.

5. Briefs by the Executive Director and Respondent. If a respondent does not request a hearing, the Executive Director may file a brief in support of the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. The Executive Director may attach to the brief exhibits such as deposition transcripts, documents, affidavits or declarations. The Executive Director's brief shall be filed within 14 days of the date that respondent's Response to the Notice was due. A respondent may file a brief in response within 14 days of service of the Executive Director's brief.

6. Scheduling and Pre-Hearing Orders. Within 14 days of the date that Respondent's Response to the Notice is filed, the Hearing Officer or the General Counsel (if a Hearing Officer has not been appointed) shall issue a Scheduling and Pre-Hearing Order setting forth the dates and instructions for:

- i. the exchange of witness lists and exhibits;
- ii. the filing of pre-hearing statements and motions;
- iii. the issuance of subpoenas;
- iv. the order of the parties' presentations at hearing;
- v. the distribution of hearing transcripts;
- vi. and the submission of post-hearing briefs.

The Hearing Officer or the General Counsel (if a Hearing Officer has not been appointed), shall also have the discretion to schedule such pre-hearing conferences and issue amended or supplemental orders as are necessary for the fair and expeditious adjudication of the case.

The Board's Administrative Enforcement Proceedings Are Confidential. The City Code requires that the Board's administrative enforcement proceedings, including filings and testimony, are confidential while pending unless the respondent provides written consent to a public proceeding. Paragraph 2.15 of Regulation 2 describes the confidentiality requirements with which the Board, the parties, and all witnesses must comply.

Approved by the Board on: June 19, 2019

**BOARD OF ETHICS
OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA**

J. Shane Creamer, Jr.
Executive Director
Board of Ethics
of the City of Philadelphia
1515 Arch Street, 18th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

v.

Respondent.

Matter No: _____

APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL

To: The Hearing Officer and all parties of record

I am admitted or otherwise authorized to practice in Pennsylvania, and I appear in this matter as counsel for Respondent _____.

Date: _____

Attorney Signature

Printed Name

PA Bar ID

Mailing Address

Email Address

Phone

Fax

Introduction to Board of Ethics

Administrative Enforcement Proceedings

What is an administrative enforcement proceeding?

An administrative enforcement proceeding is like a court case, but instead of a judge, it is decided by the Board of Ethics with help from a Hearing Officer and General Counsel Staff. This proceeding is happening because you and the Executive Director disagree about whether you have violated the law. You are called the Respondent in this case because you are expected to respond to the allegations against you.

Here are a few key terms you may hear used:

Party or Parties. You and the Executive Director are each a “party” in this case.

Pleadings. This is the legal term used for the Notice and your Response to the Notice.

Discovery. This is the exchange of information between the parties.

Hearing. A hearing is like a trial. During the hearing, each party gets a chance to explain their side of the story through documents and witness testimony.

Ex parte. This term means one-sided, and covers any communication that does not include both parties.

Adjudication or Administrative Adjudication. These are other terms you may hear used to describe the administrative enforcement proceeding.

[Board Regulation No. 2](#) has more details about the administrative enforcement process, including the rules for pleadings, discovery, and hearings.

Is this a public proceeding?

An administrative enforcement proceeding is confidential and private unless you ask that it be made public. It stays confidential until the Board makes a decision. Once the Board decides the case, the written decision and all other documents that are officially part of the administrative enforcement proceeding will become public. You can decide at any point to make the proceeding public. Once you ask in writing for the proceeding be made public, it cannot go back to being a confidential proceeding.

Who is involved in this process?

Enforcement Staff (*Executive Director, Enforcement Staff Attorney, Compliance Services Supervisor*). You have already interacted with Enforcement staff during their investigation. In an administrative enforcement proceeding, Enforcement staff members are the prosecution team. Their role is not neutral – their goal is to prove that you violated the law. Enforcement staff will present facts through documents and witnesses. They may also submit legal arguments explaining how they believe those facts show that you violated the law.

Board Members. The Board of Ethics has five members that were appointed by the Mayor and confirmed by City Council. The Board is the neutral decision-maker. The Board will review the evidence and decide whether the facts show that you violated the law. The Board will issue a written order explaining the law and facts that support its decision.

Hearing Officer. The Hearing Officer is an individual appointed by the Board to move the case through the pre-hearing process, hold a hearing, and help the Board reach a

decision. The Hearing Officer is also neutral. The Hearing Officer advises and assists the Board, but does not make the final decision.

General Counsel Staff (*General Counsel, Associate General Counsel, Senior Staff Attorney, Staff Attorney*). The Board's General Counsel and his staff advise and assist the Board and the Hearing Officer. General Counsel Staff is neutral in this proceeding. General Counsel Staff was not involved in the investigation. General Counsel Staff may answer procedural questions but may not give legal advice. For example, they can explain how to file a document, but cannot tell you (or Enforcement Staff) what legal arguments to make in that document.

What is the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding?

The Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding is the first step in an administrative enforcement proceeding before the Board of Ethics. The Notice means that the Executive Director conducted an investigation and believes that have you violated the law. The Executive Director is now asking the Board to review the results of the investigation and decide whether the facts show that you violated the law.

I received the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding – now what?

There are a few key steps you need to take if you received the Notice:

- (1) Attend the Preliminary Status Conference
- (2) File a written Response to the Notice within 20 days
- (3) Complete the Case Management Form

You can find more detail about these steps below.

How do I know when my Response to the Notice is due?

You have until the 20th day after the Notice was served to file your Response. The exact due date will be listed in the Procedural Instructions issued by the Hearing Officer shortly after the Notice is served. If you do not get the Procedural Instructions within seven days after you receive the Notice, call the Board's offices at 215-686-9450.

How do I file my Response?

You can file by either email or mail. If you file by email, your Response must be an attachment in PDF format (not in the text body of an email) and must be **received** by the Board of Ethics by the due date. You must address your email to BOEGCStaff@phila.gov and you must copy (cc) the Executive Director (Shane.Creamer@phila.gov) on your email.

If you file by mail, your Response must be **received** by the Board of Ethics by the due date. If you file by mail, you must address your Response to:

City of Philadelphia Board of Ethics
Michael Cooke, General Counsel
1515 Arch Street, 18th floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

If you file by mail, you must also send the Executive Director a copy of your Response.

It is very important that you file your Response by the due date. If you do not file a Response, you are giving up your right to have the Board of Ethics hear your side of the story. If you want to file a Response but need more time, see below for more information on how to request an extension.

How do I request a hearing?

You have a right to have a hearing. However, you must request a hearing in your Response if you want a hearing. To obtain a hearing, state clearly in your Response, "I request a hearing." **If you fail to request a hearing in your Response, a hearing will not be provided to you.** Without a hearing, you will not have an opportunity to present witnesses, documents, or other evidence to the Board.

What do I need to say in my Response?

If you file a Response, you must answer each numbered paragraph in the Notice of Administrative Enforcement Proceeding. Use paragraphs with the same numbers as those that appear in the Notice. For example, your response to paragraph 1 of the Notice should be numbered paragraph 1 of your Response.

You must admit or deny the statements in each paragraph of the Notice. If you admit some facts in a paragraph but deny others, you must explain which parts of the paragraph you admit and which you deny.

The chart on the next page gives a more detailed example of how to answer paragraph-by-paragraph in your Response. You do not need to repeat the content of the Notice in your response – it is included in the chart for illustration only.

Intro. to Admin. Enforcement Proceedings (cont'd)

Notice	Response
1. Respondent was employed by the City for 25 years as a building inspector.	1. Admitted in part and denied in part. Respondent worked for the City for 25 years, including 22 years as a building inspector.
2. As a building inspector, Respondent's job included inspecting buildings in response to complaints.	2. Admitted.
3. Respondent inspected buildings owned by Respondent's spouse.	3. Denied.

You may also choose to include in your Response additional facts that you believe are helpful to your defense. This is not required, but if you believe important facts are missing from the Notice you may want to state them in your Response.

Preliminary Status Conference

The Hearing Officer will include a date, time, and location for a Preliminary Status Conference in the Procedural Instructions. This conference is the first opportunity for the Hearing Officer to explain the procedures for the Response and other aspects of this proceeding.

Both parties must attend the conference. That means you and your lawyer, if you have one, must attend. The Executive Director and the Enforcement Staff Attorney handling the matter must also attend. At least one member of General Counsel Staff will also attend.

Case Management Form

Both you and the Executive Director are required to complete a Case Management Form. The form has instructions for what information to include and how to submit it to the Hearing Officer. The due date for the form will be set by the Hearing Officer during the Preliminary Status Conference. You will get a copy of the form before the Preliminary Status Conference.

What if I need more time?

If you need more time you can ask for an extension. Do not wait until the deadline to ask for more time. ***If you need more time, you must ask (1) in writing and (2) at least four days before the deadline.*** A request in writing can be an email or letter, but a letter may not get to the Hearing Officer before the deadline depending on when it is sent. If you do not have access to email, you should call the Board's offices to let the Hearing Officer and General Counsel Staff know you are mailing a request for extra time. Your request must explain the reason that you need more time.

The Hearing Officer can only grant one extension on each deadline. The Hearing Officer is not required to grant extensions. They will only give extra time to either party if there is a good reason for the delay. Anything beyond the first request for more time must be approved by the Board Chair.

Do I need a lawyer?

If you have a lawyer or plan to obtain one, you may have that lawyer represent you in this proceeding. The Board, however, cannot provide you with a lawyer. While you are not required to have a lawyer and you may represent yourself, you are encouraged to consult with a lawyer, if possible. If at any point you obtain a lawyer to represent you, your lawyer must file an Entry of Appearance. A form Entry of Appearance will be attached to the Procedural Instructions or can be obtained from General Counsel Staff.

What if I have questions?

If you have any questions about the Board's procedures or what is required of you, please contact the General Counsel Staff at BOEGCStaff@phila.gov. This includes questions about deadlines, how to file documents, and general questions about how the administrative enforcement process works. If you do not have access to email, you may leave a message at 215-686-9450 and someone will follow up with you. Please remember this is only for procedural questions and not for questions or statements about the substance of the case.

It is very important to the fairness of this proceeding that any communication you have with the Hearing Officer or with the General Counsel Staff about the substance of your case also include the Executive Director. Similarly, any communication that the Executive Director has with the Hearing Officer or with General Counsel Staff must also include you.

Therefore, when you file your Response or submit your completed Case Management Form, you must send a copy to the Executive Director. The same rule applies to the Executive Director. This prevents either party from having private conversations about the substance of the case with the Hearing Officer or General Counsel Staff. In addition, neither the Executive Director nor you may communicate directly with Board members about this case.

Where can I find more information about administrative enforcement proceedings?

Board Regulation No. 2 has more details about administrative enforcement proceedings and hearings. A copy will be attached to the Procedural Instructions issued by the Hearing Officer. You can also find Regulation No. 2 online at bit.ly/BOEReg2.