FINDING POINTS ON VARIETIES WITH MACAULAY2

SANKHANEEL BISUI, ZHAN JIANG, SARASIJ MAITRA, THÁI THÀNH NGUYỄN, AND KARL SCHWEDE

ABSTRACT. We present RandomPoints, a package in *Macaulay2* designed mainly to identify rational and geometric points in a variety over a finite field. We provide tools to estimate the dimension of a variety. We also present methods to obtain non-vanishing minors of a given size in a given matrix, by evaluating the matrix at a point.

1. Introduction

Let I be an ideal in a polynomial ring $k[x_1, \ldots, x_n]$ over a finite field k. Let X := V(I) denote the corresponding set of rational points in affine n-space. Finding one such rational point or geometric point (geometric meaning a point over some finite field extension), in an algorithmically efficient manner, is our primary motivation for this package. The authors of the package are Sankhaneel Bisui, Zhan Jiang, Sarasij Maitra, Thái Thành Nguyễn, Frank-Olaf Schreyer, and Karl Schwede.

There is an existing package called RationalPoints [Sta09], which we took inspiration from, which aims to find *all* the rational points of a variety; our aim here is to find one or more random rational or geometric points on a variety quickly. We also note that the package Cremona [Sta21] can find rational points on projective varieties, as can the core function randomKRationalPoint [GS] – our methods frequently appear to be faster and apply in the affine setting as well.

We develop functions that apply various strategies to generate random rational and geometric points on the given variety. We also provide functions that will expedite the process of determining properties of the singular locus of X.

We provide the following core functions:

- randomPoints: This tries to find a point in the vanishing set of an ideal. (Section 2)
- dimViaBezout: This tries to compute the dimension of an algebraic set by intersecting with hyperplanes. (Section 3.1)
- projectionToHypersurface and genericProjection: These functions provide customizable projection. (Section 4)
- findANonZeroMinor and extendIdealByNonZeroMinor: The first function finds a submatrix of a given matrix that is nonsingular at a point of a given ideal. The second adds said submatrix to an ideal, which is useful for computing partial Jacobian ideals. (Section 5.1)

All polynomial rings considered here will be over finite fields. In the subsequent sections, we explain the core and helper functions and describe the strategies that we have implemented.

Acknowledgements: The authors would like to thank David Eisenbud and Mike Stillman for useful conversations and comments on the development of this package. The authors began work on this package at the virtual Cleveland 2020 Macaulay2 workshop. The authors are also grateful to the reviewers for suggesting and providing preliminary codes to speed up computations, thereby improving the efficacy of the package substantially. Frank-Olaf Schreyer is also an author on this

Key words and phrases. RandomPoints, Macaulay2.

Schwede was supported by NSF Grants #1801849, #2101800, FRG #1952522 and a Fellowship from the Simons Foundation.

package, as he provided code related to the MultiplicationTable decomposition strategy and suggested using a probabilistic approach to compute dimension.

2. OUR PRIMARY PURPOSE: randomPoints

We start with the core function in this package: randomPoints is a function to find rational or geometric points in a variety. The typical usages are as follows:

```
- randomPoints(I),
- randomPoints(n, I)
```

where n is a positive integer denoting the number of points desired, and I is an ideal inside a polynomial ring. If n is omitted, then it is assumed to be 1.

2.1. **Options.** The user may also choose to provide some additional information, which may accelerate the computation and improve the probability that a point is found.

Strategy \Rightarrow \bullet : Here the \bullet can be Default, BruteForce or LinearIntersection

- Default performs the strategies below in a sequence, with the aim of finding a point quickly. It begins begins with brute force and moves to linear intersections with particularly simple linear forms, and gradually ramps up the randomness of the linear forms.
- BruteForce simply tries random points and sees if they are on the variety.
- LinearIntersection intersects with a random linear space.

The speed and the probability of success depend on the strategy (see also Section 3).

Example 2.1. Consider the following example.

ExtendField => Boolean: Intersection with a general linear space will naturally find scheme theoretic points that are not rational over the base field. Setting ExtendField => true will tell the function that such points are valid. Setting ExtendField => false will tell the

function to ignore such points. In fact, ExtendField => true will also tell Macaulay2 to use linear spaces defined over a field extension, which can improve randomness properties. This sometimes can slow computation, and other times can substantially speed it up when the variety has few rational points. For some applications, points over extended fields may also have better randomness properties.

DecompositionStrategy: Within the LinearIntersection strategy, one can also specify the option DecompositionStrategy. Valid values are Decompose and MultiplicationTable, the latter of which is currently only implemented for homogeneous ideals. The point is, after intersecting the linear space and obtaining an ideal defining a set of (possibly thickened) points, we need to find the minimal associated primes. By default we use Macaulay2's built-in decompose command. We also have implemented a MultiplicationTable algorithm, as provided by Frank-Olaf Schreyer, which utilizes the action of a variable on the residue fields of these points computed in more than one way. This method is frequently faster for rings with smaller numbers of variables.

The Default strategy switches back and forth between Decompose and MultiplicationTable for homogeneous ideals (starting with one the function thinks will be fastest). Setting this to Decompose in the default strategy will force only Decompose to be used; setting it to MultiplicationTable will force only MultiplicationTable to be used (if the ideal is homogeneous).

Homogeneous: Setting this true specifies that the origin (corresponding to the irrelevant ideal) is not a valid point.

Replacement => Monomial, Binomial, Trinomial, Full: When intersecting with a random linear space, it is frequently much faster to use a linear space defined by relatively sparse equations (ie, equations that do not involve all variables). Specifying Monomial will mean linear forms such as ax + b are used (for constants a and b), involving only one variable. Binomial means forms like ax + by + c, using two variables. Trinomial means forms like ax + by + cz + d. Full means all variables will have coefficients.

DimensionFunction \Rightarrow Function: Our current implementation does not need to know the dimension of V(I). However, there are places where we try to verify the dimension of an ideal before we decompose the ideal. You can pass this function \dim (the default) or our probabilistic $\dim ViaBezout$ or any other dimension function you might prefer.

PointCheckAttempts => ZZ: When calling randomPoints with a BruteForce strategy, this denotes the number of trials for brute force point checking. It also controls how many linear spaces to simultaneously study in the LinearIntersection strategy.

Example 2.2. We re-compute Example 2.1 this time specifying more attempts.

```
i7 : time randomPoints(J, Strategy => BruteForce, PointCheckAttempts => 10000)
-- used 1.16294 seconds

o7 = {{-43, 25, 29}}
```

NumThreadsToUse => ZZ: When calling randomPoints and functions that call it with a BruteForce strategy, this options allows the user to specify the number of threads to use in brute force point checking.

2.2. Comments on performance and implementation. When working over very small fields, especially with hypersurfaces, frequently BruteForce is most efficient. This is not surprising as there may not be many points to check. However, if the field size is larger, BruteForce will perform poorly. Even for some simple examples, it could not provide any rational points if the number of

trials is not large enough. Other strategies work differently on different examples, and the same strategy can sometimes work very quickly even if it typically works very slowly.

The current version of the LinearIntersection strategy no longer computes the dimension of the algebraic set. Instead, it first finds a point defined by linear equations. If the point is on the algebraic set, we are done. If not, we throw away one of the forms and so now have a line and we see if this line intersects our algebraic set. We continue in this way until we find a point. This appears to avoid a number of bottlenecks in our previous implementation since Macaulay2 is relatively fast at identifying when a linear space and a variety do *not* intersect.

Example 2.3. We begin with an example over a small field.

```
i2 : R = ZZ/7[x_1..x_10];
      i3 : I = ideal(random(2, R), random(3, R));
       o3 : Ideal of R
       i4 : time randomPoints(I, Strategy => BruteForce, PointCheckAttempts => 20000)
               -- used 0.00311884 seconds
       04 = \{\{-1, -1, 0, 2, 2, -2, -2, -3, -3, -3\}\}
       o4 : List
      i5 : time randomPoints(I, Strategy => Default)
               -- used 0.081349 seconds
       05 = \{\{3, 0, 3, 3, 2, -2, 1, -1, 3, 1\}\}
Example 2.4. Now we work over a larger field.
      i6 : S = ZZ/211[x_1..x_10];
      i7 : J = ideal(random(2, S), random(3, S));
      o7 : Ideal of S
       i8 : time randomPoints(J, Strategy => BruteForce, PointCheckAttempts => 2000000)
               -- used 17.7988 seconds
       08 = \{\{15, 67, -27, -103, 56, 66, -23, 28, -50, 13\}\}
       o8 : List
       i9 : time randomPoints(J, Strategy => Default)
               -- used 0.0864013 seconds
       09 = \{\{0, 0, 0, 0, 34, 76, 51, 0, 1, 0\}\}
Example 2.5. Finally, we can allow our functions to extend our field.
       i11 : time randomPoints(J, Strategy => Default, ExtendField => true)
                   -- used 0.144332 seconds
      o11 = {{0, -a + 62a - 47a - 76, 0, 0, 13a - 18a + 63a - 31, 0, 0,
                                         3 2
               - 20a - 82a + 35a - 19, 55a - 64a - 8a - 50, 1}}
```

```
i12 : coefficientRing ring first first o11
o12 = GF 1982119441
i13 : log_211 1982119441
o13 = 4
```

In this case, we found a degree 4 point.

Remark 2.2.1 (Comments on the probability of finding a point). In the case of an absolutely irreducible hypersurface in $\mathbb{A}^n_{\mathbb{F}_q}$ (defined by f say), there is significant discussion in the literature estimating lower bounds of number of rational points (see for instance, [Sch, LW54, GL02, CM06]) all of which point to the fact that there is "good probability" of finding a rational point in this case when we intersect with a random line. Heuristically, we can make the following rough estimation. We expect that each equation $f = \lambda$ for $\lambda \in \mathbb{F}_q$ has approximately the same number of solutions. Since each point on \mathbb{F}^n_q solves exactly one of these equations, we expect that f = 0 has approximately q^{n-1} solutions, or in other words, our hypersurface has q^{n-1} -points. Now, a random line L has q points. We want to find the probability that one of these points is rational for V(f). We would expect that if these points are randomly distributed, then the probability that our line contains one of those points $1 - (1 - \frac{1}{q})^q$ which tends to $1 - e^{-1} \approx 0.63$ for q large. Alternately, one can use the proof of [BS05, Proposition 2.12] for a more precise statement. For each point of L, we see that the probability that the chosen point does not lie in the intersection, $L \cap V(f)$, is $1 - \frac{1}{q}$. We then exhaust this search over all the points on L to get the probability that there is indeed a successful intersection is $1 - (1 - \frac{1}{q})^q$. As q gets larger, this value tends to $1 - e^{-1} \approx 0.63$.

Of course, there are schemes over \mathbb{F}_q with no rational points at all, even for plane curves.

Remark 2.2.2 (Projecting to a hypersurface first). Suppose $X \subseteq \mathbb{A}^n$ is an algebraic set. In a number of existing algorithms, one first does a generic (or even not very generic) projection $h: \mathbb{A}^n \to \mathbb{A}^m$ and so that h(X) is a hypersurface (at least set theoretically). Then one finds a point $x \in h(X)$ (say as above), and computes $h^{-1}(\{x\})$, which is a linear space in \mathbb{A}^n that typically intersects X in a rational point. For example, this is done in randomKRationalPoint in core Macaulay2. Note that projecting to a hypersurface still is intersecting with a linear space, since $h^{-1}(\{x\})$ is linear, but it tries to choose the linear space intelligently.

However, in our experience, doing this generic projection first yields slower results. First, one has to compute the dimension. There are also numerous cases where computing this hypersurface h(X) can be quite slow. This particularly appears in cases when one is computing successive minors to identify the locus where some variety is nonsingular.

On the other hand, instead of using a truly random linear space to intersect with, in the default strategy we initially try linear spaces whose defining equations have as few terms as possible For example, in a ring with 10 variables, we first try binomial linear forms like

$$-27x_2 + 38x_7$$

instead of a random linear form like

$$-28x_1 - 27x_2 + 29x_3 + 27x_4 - 28x_5 + 27x_6 + 38x_7 - 13x_8 + 21x_9 - 3x_{10}.$$

Such simple linear spaces are the ones implicitly considered in randomKRationalPoint for instance since that generic projection is so simple. In practice, our approach seems to give at least as good performance compared to projecting to a hypersurface, without the chance of the code getting hung up on the generic projection or dimension computations. We also do successive intersections in a way that avoids computing the dimension as described above in Section 2.2.

3. USEFUL FUNCTIONS dimViaBezout AND randomCoordinateChange

- 3.1. dimViaBezout: We thank Frank-Olaf Scheyer for pointing out that in most of the computations, computing the codimension of the given ideal is a significant bottleneck. While we have avoided most dimension computations in our current implementation, we have also implemented a probibalistic dimension computation of V(I). This function takes as input an ideal I in a polynomial ring over a field and intersects V(I) with random linear spaces of increasing dimension until there is an intersection. For example, if the intersection of V(I) with a random line has a point, then we expect that V(I) contains a hypersurface. If there was no intersection, this function tries a 2-dimensional linear space, and so on. This can speed up a number of computations. The function also takes in optional inputs as described below:
 - DimensionIntersectionAttempts: Our function actually estimates dimension several times and then averages the result (rounding down) since we tend to overestimate the dimension by the above. By default it does this 3 times unless the Homogeneous flag is set, in which case it is done 5 times.
 - MinimumFieldSize: If the ambient field is smaller than this integer value, it will automatically be replaced with an extension field. For instance, there are relatively few linear spaces over a field of characteristic 2, and this can cause incorrect results to be returned to the user. The user may set the MinimumFieldSize to ensure that the field being worked over is big enough. If this is not set, the program tries to choose a reasonable minimum field size based on the ambient ring.
 - Homogeneous: If the ideal is homogeneous, we can use homogeneous linear spaces to compute dimension. Sometimes this is faster and other times slower.

Example 3.1. We illustrate the speed difference in this example.

As you can see doing a single intersection attempt is about three times faster, and it usually gives the right answer (far more than 99% of the time in this particular example, but in others doing the computation in triplicate avoids returning incorrect answers).

3.2. randomCoordinateChange: This function takes a polynomial ring as an input and outputs a coordinate change map, i.e. given a polynomial ring, this will produce a linear automorphism of the ring. This function checks whether the map is an isomorphism by computing the Jacobian.

In some applications, a full random change of coordinates is not desired, as it might cause code to run very slowly. A binomial change of coordinates might be preferred, or we might only replace some monomials by other monomials. This is controlled with the following options.

- Replacement: This works like the Replacement option for RandomPoints.
- MaxCoordinatesToReplace: The user can specify that only a specified number of coordinates should be non-monomial (assuming Homogeneous => true).
- Homogeneous: Setting Homogeneous => false will cause degree zero terms to be added to modified coordinates (including monomial coordinates).

Example 3.2. We demonstrate some of these options.

4. OTHER FUNCTIONS: genericProjection, projectionToHypersurface

We include two functions providing customizable projections. We describe them here.

4.1. **genericProjection.** This function finds a random (somewhat, depending on options) generic projection of the ring or ideal. The typical usages are as follows:

```
- genericProjection(n, I)
- genericProjection(n, R)
```

where I is an ideal in a polynomial ring, R can denote a quotient of a polynomial ring and $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ is an integer specifying how many dimensions to drop. Note that this function makes no attempt to verify that the projection is actually generic with respect to the ideal.

to verify that the projection is actually generic with respect to the ideal. This gives the projection map from $\mathbb{A}^N \mapsto \mathbb{A}^{N-n}$ and the defining ideal of the projection of V(I). If no integer n is provided then it acts as if n = 1.

Example 4.1. We project a curve in 4-space to one in 2-space.

```
i1 : R = ZZ/5[x, y, z, w];
i2 : I = ideal(x, y^2, w^3 + x^2);
i3 : genericProjection(2, I)
```

```
ZZ 2 2 o3 = (map(R,--[z, w],{-x-2y-z, -y-2z}), ideal(z - z*w - w ))
```

Alternatively, instead of I, we may pass it a quotient ring. It will then return the inclusion of the generic projection ring into the given ring, followed by the source of that inclusion.

This method works by calling randomCoordinateChange (Section 3) before dropping variables. It passes the options Replacement, MaxCoordinatesToReplace, Homogeneous to that function.

- 4.2. projectionToHypersurface. This function creates a projection to a hypersurface. The typical usages are as follows:
 - projectionToHypersurface I,
 - projectionToHypersurface R

where I is an ideal in a polynomial ring, respectively, R is a quotient of a polynomial ring. The output is a list with two entries: the generic projection map and the ideal (respectively the ring).

It differs from genericProjection(codim I - 1, I) as it only tries to find a hypersurface equation that vanishes along the projection, instead of finding one that vanishes exactly at the projection. This can be faster and can be useful for finding points. The same approach was used in the point command in the Cremona package [Sta21]. If we already know the codimension is c, we can set Codimension=>c so the function does not compute it.

5. AN APPLICATION: findANonZeroMinor, extendIdealByNonZeroMinor

As mentioned in the introduction, the two functions in this section will provide further tools for computing singular locus, in addition to those available in the package FastLinAlg.

- 5.1. findANonZeroMinor: The typical usage of this function is as follows:
 - findANonZeroMinor(n, M, I)

where I is an ideal in a polynomial ring over QQ or ZZ/p for p prime, M is a matrix over the polynomial ring and $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ denotes the size of the minors of interest.

The function outputs the following:

- randomly chosen point P in V(I) which it finds using randomPoints.
- the indexes of the columns of M that stay linearly independent upon plugging P into M,
- the indices of the linearly independent rows of the matrix extracted from M in the above step,
- a random $n \times n$ sub-matrix of M that has full rank at P.

Besides the options from randomPoints which are automatically passed to that function, the user may also provide the following additional information:

MinorPointAttempts => ZZ: This controls how many points at which to check the rank.

Example 5.1. We demonstrate this function.

5.2. extendIdealByNonZeroMinor: The typical usage is

```
- extendIdealByNonZeroMinor(n, M, I)
```

where n, M, I are same as before. This function finds a submatrix of size $n \times n$ using findANonZeroMinor; it extracts the last entry of the output, finds its determinant and adds it to the ideal I, thus extending I. It has the same options as findANonZeroMinor.

One can use this function to show that rings are regular in codimension 1, that is, satisfy Serre's condition (R1).

Example 5.2. Consider the following 3-dimensional example which is regular in codimension 1. Note, in this example, computing the dimension of the singular locus takes around 30 seconds as there are 15500 minors of size 4×4 coming from the associated 7×12 Jacobian matrix. However, we can use our function to quickly find interesting minors.

```
i2 : T = ZZ/101[x1, x2, x3, x4, x5, x6, x7];
i3 : I = ideal(x5*x6-x4*x7,x1*x6-x2*x7,x5^2-x1*x7,x4*x5-x2*x7,x4^2-x2*x6,x1*x4-x2*x5,
x2*x3^3*x5+3*x2*x3^2*x7+8*x2^2*x5+3*x3*x4*x7-8*x4*x7+x6*x7
x1*x3^3*x5+3*x1*x3^2*x7+8*x1*x2*x5+3*x3*x5*x7-8*x5*x7+x7^2
x2*x3^3*x4+3*x2*x3^2*x6+8*x2^2*x4+3*x3*x4*x6-8*x4*x6+x6^2,
x2^2*x3^3+3*x2*x3^2*x4+8*x2^3+3*x2*x3*x6-8*x2*x6+x4*x6
x1*x2*x3^3+3*x2*x3^2*x5+8*x1*x2^2+3*x2*x3*x7-8*x2*x7+x4*x7,
x1^2*x3^3+3*x1*x3^2*x5+8*x1^2*x2+3*x1*x3*x7-8*x1*x7+x5*x7);
o3 : Ideal of T
i4 : M = jacobian I;
                   12
o4 : Matrix T <--- T
i5 : i = 0; J = I;
o6 : Ideal of T
i7: elapsedTime(while (i < 10) and dim J > 1 do (
                                i = i + 1;
                                J = extendIdealByNonZeroMinor(4, M, J)));
           -- 0.640164 seconds elapsed
```

i8 : dim J
o8 = 1
i9 : i

09 = 5

In this particular example, there tend to be about 5 associated primes when adding the first minor to J, and so one expects about 5 steps as each minor will typically eliminate one of those primes.

There is some similar functionality for computing partial Jacobian ideals obtained via heuristics (as opposed to actually finding rational or geometric points) in the package FastLinAlg, see [MRSY]. That package now uses the functionality contained here in RandomPoints in some of its functions.

6. The latest version

The latest version of the package is available in the FastLinAlg branch of

References

- [BS05] H-C Graf v Bothmer and F-O Schreyer. A quick and dirty irreducibility test for multivariate polynomials over \mathbb{F}_q . Experimental Mathematics, 14(4):415–422, 2005.
- [CM06] Antonio Cafure and Guillermo Matera. Improved explicit estimates on the number of solutions of equations over a finite field. Finite Fields and Their Applications, 12(2):155–185, 2006.
- [GL02] Sudhir R Ghorpade and Gilles Lachaud. Number of solutions of equations over finite fields and a conjecture of Lang and Weil. In *Number theory and discrete mathematics*, pages 269–291. Springer, 2002.
- [GS] Daniel R. Grayson and Michael E. Stillman. Macaulay2, a software system for research in algebraic geometry. Available at http://www.math.uiuc.edu/Macaulay2/.
- [LW54] Serge Lang and André Weil. Number of points of varieties in finite fields. American Journal of Mathematics, 76(4):819–827, 1954.
- [MRSY] Boyana Martinova, Marcus Robinson, Karl Schwede, and Yuhui (Wei) Yao. FastLinAlg: faster linear algebra operations. Version 1.0. A *Macaulay2* package available at https://github.com/Macaulay2/M2/tree/master/M2/Macaulay2/packages.
- [Sch] Frank Schreyer. randomKRationalPoint: A core Macaulay2 function. Available at http://www2.macaulay2.com/Macaulay2/doc/Macaulay2-1.16/share/doc/Macaulay2/Macaulay2Doc/html/_random___K__Rational__Point.html.
- [Sta09] Nathaniel Stapleton. RationalPoints: A *Macaulay2* package. Version 0.95. A *Macaulay2* package available at https://github.com/Macaulay2/M2/tree/master/M2/Macaulay2/packages, 2009.
- [Sta21] Giovanni Staglianò. Cremona: rational maps between projective varieties. Version 5.1. A *Macaulay2* package available at https://github.com/Macaulay2/M2/tree/master/M2/Macaulay2/packages, 2021.

Email address: Sankhaneel.Bisui@umanitoba.ca

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, UNIVERSITY OF MANITOBA, WINNIPEG, MB R3T 2M8

Email address: zoeng@umich.edu

Department of Mathematics, University of Michigan, 530 Church St, Ann Arbor, MI 48109

Email address: maitra@math.utah.edu

Department of Mathematics, University of Utah, 155 S 1400 E Room 233, Salt Lake City, UT, 84112

 $Email\ address:$ nguyt161@mcmaster.ca

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, L8S 4L8

Email address: schwede@math.utah.edu

Department of Mathematics, University of Utah, 155 S 1400 E Room 233, Salt Lake City, UT, 84112