



COPYRIGHT CLAIMS BOARD

Docket number: 24-CCB-0220

August 7, 2024

Tad Brown

CLAIMANT

v.

Ryan Cleverly

RESPONDENT

ORDER TO AMEND NONCOMPLIANT CLAIM

The Copyright Claims Board (Board) finds that your claim does not comply with the requirements of the CASE Act and related regulations. The claim cannot move forward unless it is amended.

If you wish to proceed with this claim, you must file an amended claim by **September 6, 2024**. If you do not, the Board must dismiss your claim without prejudice, although you may file again in the future before the Board or in federal court. If you file an amended claim and it is found compliant, you will be notified and directed to proceed with service. There is no additional filing fee for an amended claim. 17 U.S.C. § 1506(f)(1)(B).

To make your amended claim compliant, you must resolve the issues identified below. [37 C.F.R. § 224.1\(c\)\(2\)](#). You may also choose to correct or edit any errors or other information in your claim before you file it again. You do not need to provide a legal argument in your claim – just a statement of facts and circumstances. Being specific in your description gives the other party and the Board more information about your claim. There is no character limit, so please be as detailed as possible.

Registration

The Board can only hear a copyright infringement claim if, before the claim was filed, (1) the Copyright Office issued a registration certificate for the copyrighted work or (2) the legal or beneficial owner of the copyright applied to register the copyright by delivering a completed application, deposit, and fee to the Copyright Office, and the Copyright Office has not refused the application. 17 U.S.C. § 1505(a).

In your claim, you list “VA1835534” as the registration number of the work “Californiabeachfeet” and provided a number of photographs as supplementary documents. A Board search of Copyright Office records revealed that only two photographs, both featuring a woman in a black leather jacket, were registered as VA1835534. The information included in the “Describe the infringement” section of the claim does not specifically identify these two photographs as the allegedly infringing works. Further, these two photographs were not provided in the screenshots showing the alleged infringement. Additionally, it is unclear if the photographs that were provided as supplementary documents were registered.

If the allegedly infringing work(s) were neither registered nor subject to a pending application before you filed your claim on July 30, 2024, the claim cannot be successfully amended and cannot proceed. Instead, you would

need to apply to register the copyright for the allegedly infringed works before you could refile your claim as a new claim. For each work that you are alleging has been infringed, you should separately provide (in the “Infringement claim: Works infringed” section of the claim form) the title, author, registration number, and work of authorship category for each photograph that is involved in the claim. For more information on registration, please refer to the Copyright Office [Registration Portal](#).

Copyright Infringement—Elements

You have brought a copyright infringement claim before the Board. Your claim must make enough factual allegations to support each “element” of the claim. Information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook. The elements of a copyright infringement claim are:

1. You own a valid copyright in the work, or have been given an exclusive license to the copyright rights at issue in the work,
2. The respondent used one of your exclusive rights in the work without permission,
3. The respondent had access to your work, meaning a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work, and
4. The respondent’s work is substantially similar to the original elements of expression in your work.

Your claim does not provide enough facts about how the respondent had access to your works and how your works and the respondent’s works are substantially similar. Please provide more details and background regarding these elements in your amended claim.

Access

Your claim does not provide any facts about how the respondent had access to your work. “Access” means a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work before the alleged infringement took place. To address this issue, you must file an amended claim with allegations that make access a reasonable possibility, not just hypothetically or theoretically possible. Acceptable allegations of access may include how your work (a) was sent directly to the respondent or a close associate of the respondent; (b) was widely disseminated or was available to the respondent; or (c) is so strikingly similar to the respondent’s work that the respondent could not have created it independently. Alternatively, you can upload copies of your work and the allegedly infringing work if they demonstrate that the works are so strikingly similar that they could not have been created independently. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other.

Substantial Similarity

Your claim also does not include enough facts that explain the similarities between your work and the respondent’s allegedly infringing work. If it is not readily apparent from supplemental documents that are submitted with the claim, you must provide some specific allegations about how your work and the allegedly infringing work are similar.

Your claim states that your work is a “collection of photographs.” However, you do not provide enough information describing or showing your works. You uploaded a number of unlabeled .jpeg files and screenshots as supplementary documents. The unlabeled supplementary documents may depict a copy of your works, or screenshots of the allegedly infringing works, but it is hard to tell. You do not provide any other information describing or depicting the individual works, stating whether a particular work is one of your allegedly infringed works or one of respondent’s allegedly infringing works, or stating or showing how they are identical or substantially similar.

Additionally, some of the copyrightable expression you described in the “Describe the infringement” section of the claim is too general for copyright protection. In the claim you allege that “these works are *based on* photographs originally copyrighted by CaliforniaBeachFeet” (emphasis added). “Copyrights do not protect ideas—only expressions of ideas.” *Universal Athletic Sales Co. v. Salkeld*, 511 F.2d 904, 908 (3d Cir.1975). For more information about what is protected by copyright please review “[Works Not Protected by Copyright](#).”

As a result, the claim does not provide enough information to enable the respondent to understand the claim and respond to it. When you submit an amended claim, it must include more factual allegations that support the element of substantial similarity. Please provide more details and background regarding this element in your amended claim, including a clear, detailed statement regarding which portions of your work were taken by the respondent in the allegedly infringing work, or documents that are sufficient to show the similarities. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other. More information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook.

To submit an amended claim, log into your eCCB account and take the following steps:

1. From your dashboard, click the “**Amend claim**” button and select your docket number from the dropdown list.
2. Your claim will unlock for editing. The information you originally entered will appear in the same order as in your original claim.
3. Make the necessary edits. If you have filed supplemental documents, you must re-upload any documents you wish to include in the amended claim on the “**Documentation**” page. Please include only documents directly related to your claim, and label them clearly.
4. Once you have completed your edits, continue to click through the fillable claim form until you reach the “**Review**” page. The Review page includes all the information that you have provided in the claim up to this point. Carefully double-check the information on this page. If you have any corrections, you can select “**Edit**” to revise any entries necessary. Each section of information has an “**Edit**” button, which will take you back to that section so you can make changes. After you make changes, you can click “**Save & review**”

to return to the Review page. Please review your claim carefully. Once you submit your amended claim, you will be unable to edit the claim while it is in compliance review.

5. Once you have completed your review and any revisions, you must confirm that the information in your claim is accurate and truthful to the best of your knowledge. To complete the declaration, type your full name into the “**Digital signature**” box near the bottom of the “**Review filing**” page and click “**Agree & submit.**”

If you have questions, please contact asktheboard@ccb.gov. Include your docket number in the subject line. The Board is unable to provide legal advice. We can only provide legal information and assistance concerning Board procedures and requirements. If you would like to seek further guidance from a lawyer or a law student at reduced or no cost, please visit the [Pro Bono Assistance](#) page on ccb.gov. You may also refer to the [Compliance Review](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook for more assistance.

Copyright Claims Attorney