



COPYRIGHT CLAIMS BOARD

Docket number: 25-CCB-0171

June 18, 2025

Maria Lee

CLAIMANT

v.

Renae Goodhew

RESPONDENT

SECOND ORDER TO AMEND NONCOMPLIANT CLAIM

The Copyright Claims Board finds that your claim, as amended, still does not comply with the requirements of the CASE Act and related regulations. The claim cannot move forward unless it is properly amended.

If you wish to proceed with this claim, you must file a second amended claim in this proceeding by **July 18, 2025**. If you do not, the Board must dismiss your claim without prejudice, although you may file again in the future before the Board or in federal court. There is no additional filing fee for an amended claim. If you file a second amended claim and it is found compliant you will be notified and directed to proceed with service. However, if your second amended claim also is found not to comply, the Board will dismiss the proceeding without prejudice. 17 U.S.C. § 1506(f)(1)(B); 37 C.F.R. § 224.1(d).

To make your second amended claim compliant, you must resolve the issues identified below. 37 C.F.R. § 224.1(c)(2). You may also choose to correct or edit any errors or other information in your claim before you file it again. You do not need to provide a legal argument in your claim – just a statement of facts and circumstances. Being specific in your description gives the other party and the Board more information about your claim. There is no character limit, so please be as detailed as possible.

Substantial Similarity

Your infringement claim still does not identify any similarities between your work and the respondent's allegedly infringing work that would amount to copyright infringement. To move forward, your infringement claim must provide some specific allegations about how the allegedly infringing work is substantially similar to elements of your work that copyright protects, or it must include documents that show those substantial similarities.

None of the similarities that you identify appear to relate to similarities in copyrightable expression. You allege infringement of a website, www.marialeemakeup.com, which you describe as: "My established SF & LA business website with original content created by me, the author." You have not shown any substantial similarity between the specific expressive elements in your website and the expressive elements used in the respondent's website.

In the "Describe the infringement" section of the claim, you state that the respondent "worked for my business from 2018 to 2021" and "started her own website in November 2023 copying my service packages, package names, services within my packages, and pricing." You state that her website had "the exact same service packages, similar

wording, and pricing as mine” when you discovered it, and it was “taken down by DMCA notice,” and “[w]hen she reactivated it, she copied the same pricing as my current pricing.”

A valid copyright only extends to copyrightable subject matter, and copyright law only protects the components of a work that are original to the author. Copyright law does not protect ideas or facts; it only protects original elements of expression. For example, a copyright can protect the content of a website, but it does not protect any facts, business operations, or procedures that are shown or described on the website. The similarity of respondent’s business services might support a claim of trademark infringement or unfair competition, but not a copyright claim that the Board could hear. Copyright also does not protect words or short phrases such as names and titles. Information about copyrightable authorship is available in Sections 302, 308, and 313 of [Chapter 300](#) of the *Compendium of U.S. Copyright Office Practices, Third Edition*, and in [Circular 33: Works Not Protected by Copyright](#).

Your amended claim does not provide detailed information describing how any of the respondent’s website is substantially similar to *protectable* elements of your website. Copyright does not protect your business services, your prices, or the names of your service packages, even if they are described or shown on your website. You state that the respondent’s website has included “similar wording” to your website, but general, unsupported assertions of similarity are not sufficient; your amended claim does not describe or show how any such similarities are expressed in either website so that the Board and the respondent could understand the alleged similarities. In addition, you did not include screenshots of either website as supplemental documents with the amended claim. As a result, the amended claim does not provide enough information about the websites for the Board to evaluate the similarity of any copyright-protected expressive material.

The same day you filed the amended claim, you separately filed a document titled “Copyright Infringement Claim Evidence – Lee vs. Goodhew-2.pdf” that includes several screenshots from your website and the respondent’s website. However, even if that document and its screenshots had been included in the amended claim, it would not have resolved the issue of substantial similarity, because the only similarities between the websites indicated in the document are in materials that are not protected by copyright:

- certain services that the two businesses provide,
- the prices of those services,
- the names or titles of those services (for example, “Makeup Only” and “Queen”), and
- a few short phrases (“custom lashes,” “wig styling,” and “press-on nails”).

For instance, on page 4 of that document, you state that the respondent “had plagiarized and infringed on my website - copying my male to female services and packages by naming them the same or similar names and having the same or similar pricing.” Copyright law does not treat such uses as infringement. While you may have a viable claim under trademark or unfair competition law, copyright law does not give you any right to prevent the respondent from engaging in the competitive uses alleged.

If you submit a second amended claim, it must include more factual allegations that support the element of substantial similarity. Please provide more details and background regarding this element in your second amended

claim, including a clear, detailed statement regarding which elements of your website, other than those listed above, were taken by the respondent in the allegedly infringing website, or documents that are sufficient to show the similarities, such as screenshots of both websites. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other.

More information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook. The [Introduction](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook includes more information about copyright and the kinds of disputes that the Board can hear. You should only file a second amended claim if you believe you actually have a claim under copyright law that can be heard by the Board.

Final Amendment

Your amended claim resolves some, but not all, of the compliance issues raised in the May 13, 2025 Order to Amend Noncompliant Claim, but the remaining issues, discussed above, also must be resolved for the claim to move forward.

This is your third and final opportunity to submit a compliant claim in this proceeding. If your claim remains noncompliant, the entire proceeding will be dismissed. 17 U.S.C. § 1506(f)(1)(B).

To submit an amended claim, log into your eCCB account and take the following steps:

1. From your dashboard, click the “**Amend claim**” button and select your docket number from the dropdown list.
2. Your claim will unlock for editing. The information you originally entered will appear in the same order as in your original claim.
3. Make the necessary edits. If you have filed supplemental documents, you must re-upload any documents you wish to include in the amended claim on the “**Documentation**” page. Please include only documents directly related to your claim, and label them clearly.
4. Once you have completed your edits, continue to click through the fillable claim form until you reach the “**Review**” page. The Review page includes all the information that you have provided in the claim up to this point. Carefully double-check the information on this page. If you have any corrections, you can select “**Edit**” to revise any entries necessary. Each section of information has an “**Edit**” button, which will take you back to that section so you can make changes. After you make changes, you can click “**Save & review**” to return to the Review page. Please review your claim carefully. Once you submit your amended claim, you will be unable to edit the claim while it is in compliance review.
5. Once you have completed your review and any revisions, you must confirm that the information in your claim is accurate and truthful to the best of your knowledge. To complete the declaration, type your full name into the “**Digital signature**” box near the bottom of the “**Review filing**” page and click “**Agree & submit.**”

If you have questions, please contact asktheboard@ccb.gov. Include your docket number in the subject line. The Board is unable to provide legal advice. We can only provide legal information and assistance concerning Board procedures and requirements. If you would like to seek further guidance from a lawyer or a law student at reduced or no cost, please visit the [Pro Bono Assistance](#) page on ccb.gov. You may also refer to the [Compliance Review](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook for more assistance.

Copyright Claims Board