



COPYRIGHT CLAIMS BOARD

Docket number: 24-CCB-0190
July 12, 2024

Gadzhi Makulevskii

CLAIMANT

v.

Yiwu Feihong Trade Co.,Ltd,

RESPONDENT

ORDER TO AMEND NONCOMPLIANT CLAIM

The Copyright Claims Board (Board) finds that your claim does not comply with the requirements of the CASE Act and related regulations. The claim cannot move forward unless it is amended.

If you wish to proceed with this claim, you must file an amended claim by **August 12, 2024**. If you do not, the Board must dismiss your claim without prejudice, although you may file again in the future before the Board or in federal court. If you file an amended claim and it is found compliant, you will be notified and directed to proceed with service. There is no additional filing fee for an amended claim. 17 U.S.C. § 1506(f)(1)(B).

To make your amended claim compliant, you must resolve the issues identified below. [37 C.F.R. § 224.1\(c\)\(2\)](#). You may also choose to correct or edit any errors or other information in your claim before you file it again. You do not need to provide a legal argument in your claim – just a statement of facts and circumstances. Being specific in your description gives the other party and the Board more information about your claim. There is no character limit, so please be as detailed as possible.

Respondent Contact Information

To assert a claim before the Board you must include the respondent's contact information including their mailing address. In your claim, you have provided contact information for the respondent including an email address and mailing address for the respondent at "Robinson Law PLLC." To address this issue, your amended claim must include a mailing address for the respondent itself. The address must be a United States address of the respondent as the CCB may not hear claims against persons who reside outside the United States. 17 U.S.C. § 1504(d)(4).

Copyright Infringement — Elements

You have brought a copyright infringement claim before the Board. Your claim must make enough factual allegations to support each "element" of the claim. Information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook. The elements of a copyright infringement claim are:

1. You own a valid copyright in the work, or have been given an exclusive license to the copyright rights at

issue in the work,

2. The respondent used one of your exclusive rights in the work without permission,
3. The respondent had access to your work, meaning a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work, and
4. The respondent's work is substantially similar to the original elements of expression in your work.

Your claim does not provide enough facts about how the respondent had access to your work and how your work and the respondent's work are substantially similar. Please provide more details and background regarding these elements in your amended claim.

Access

Your claim does not provide facts about how the respondent had access to your work. "Access" means a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work before the alleged infringement took place. In your claim, you do not state how the respondent had access to your work. To address this issue, you must file an amended claim with allegations that make access a reasonable possibility, not just hypothetically or theoretically possible. Acceptable allegations of access may include how your work (a) was sent directly to the respondent or a close associate of the respondent; (b) was widely disseminated or was available to the respondent; or (c) is so strikingly similar to the respondent's work that the respondent could not have created it independently.

Alternatively, you can upload copies of your work and the allegedly infringing work if those images demonstrate that the works are so strikingly similar that they could not have been created independently. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other.

Substantial Similarity

Your claim also does not include enough facts that explain the similarities between your work and the respondent's allegedly infringing work. If it is not readily apparent from supplemental documents that are submitted with the claim, you must provide some specific allegations about how your work and the allegedly infringing work are similar.

Your claim states that your work is "a sculpture in the shape of a rose, bronze in color, with two bends in the stem and leaves with a textured surface. The rosebud consists of petals with an original shape." You separately filed what appears to be a screenshot of your work. However, you do not provide enough information describing or showing the allegedly infringing work. No allegations in the "Describe the infringement" field of the claim describe your work or the allegedly infringing work, or state or show how they are identical or substantially similar. It also appears as though you may have included a hyperlink to the allegedly infringing work. In part because hyperlinks can lead to material that is no longer available online, the Board will not take into account material that is solely referred to in a hyperlink and not uploaded as supplemental documentation.

As a result, the claim does not provide enough information to enable the respondent to understand the claim and respond to it. When you submit an amended claim, it must include more factual allegations that support the

element of substantial similarity. Please provide more details and background regarding this element in your amended claim, including a clear, detailed statement regarding which portions of your work were taken by the respondent in the allegedly infringing work, or documents that are sufficient to show the similarities. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other. Attach any supplemental materials that you want the Board to consider by uploading them as part of the claim rather than referring to them only with hyperlinks. In your claim, it appears that there may have been some labeling inconsistencies between the documents described in your claim and the documents that were uploaded. Please make sure that your documents are properly labeled in your amended claim.

More information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook.

To submit an amended claim, log into your eCCB account and take the following steps:

1. From your dashboard, click the “**Amend claim**” button and select your docket number from the dropdown list.
2. Your claim will unlock for editing. The information you originally entered will appear in the same order as in your original claim.
3. Make the necessary edits. If you have filed supplemental documents, you must re-upload any documents you wish to include in the amended claim on the “**Documentation**” page. Please include only documents directly related to your claim, and label them clearly.
4. Once you have completed your edits, continue to click through the fillable claim form until you reach the “**Review**” page. The Review page includes all the information that you have provided in the claim up to this point. Carefully double-check the information on this page. If you have any corrections, you can select “**Edit**” to revise any entries necessary. Each section of information has an “**Edit**” button, which will take you back to that section so you can make changes. After you make changes, you can click “**Save & review**” to return to the Review page. Please review your claim carefully. Once you submit your amended claim, you will be unable to edit the claim while it is in compliance review.
5. Once you have completed your review and any revisions, you must confirm that the information in your claim is accurate and truthful to the best of your knowledge. To complete the declaration, type your full name into the “**Digital signature**” box near the bottom of the “**Review filing**” page and click “**Agree & submit.**”

If you have questions, please contact asktheboard@ccb.gov. Include your docket number in the subject line. The Board is unable to provide legal advice. We can only provide legal information and assistance concerning Board procedures and requirements. If you would like to seek further guidance from a lawyer or a law student at reduced or no cost, please visit the [Pro Bono Assistance](#) page on ccb.gov. You may also refer to the [Compliance Review](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook for more assistance.

