



COPYRIGHT CLAIMS BOARD

Docket number: 23-CCB-0141
May 3, 2023

Bailey Barton

CLAIMANT

v.

Chris Bennett

RESPONDENT

ORDER TO AMEND NONCOMPLIANT CLAIM

The Copyright Claims Board finds that your claim does not comply with the requirements of the CASE Act and related regulations. The claim cannot move forward unless it is amended.

If you wish to proceed with this claim, you must file an amended claim by **June 2, 2023**. If you do not, the Board must dismiss your claim without prejudice, although you may file again in the future before the Board or in federal court. If you file an amended claim and it is found compliant, you will be notified and directed to proceed with service. There is no additional filing fee for an amended claim. 17 U.S.C. § 1506(f)(1)(B).

To make your amended claim compliant, you must resolve the issues identified below. [37 C.F.R. § 224.1\(c\)\(2\)](#). You may also choose to correct or edit any errors or other information in your claim before you file it again. You do not need to provide a legal argument in your claim – just a statement of facts and circumstances. Being specific in your description gives the other party and the Board more information about your claim. There is no character limit, so please be as detailed as possible.

Copyright Infringement – Elements

You have brought a copyright infringement claim before the Board. Your claim must make enough factual allegations to support each “element” of the claim. Information about the elements required to assert a claim of copyright infringement is available in the [Starting an Infringement Claim](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook. The elements of a copyright infringement claim are:

1. You own a valid copyright in the work, or have been given an exclusive license to the copyright rights at issue in the work,
2. The respondent used one of your exclusive rights in the work without permission,
3. The respondent had access to your work, meaning a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work, and
4. The respondent’s work is substantially similar to the original elements of expression in your work.

Your claim does not present clear facts to support the elements of a copyright infringement claim related to the respondent’s access to the allegedly infringed work and substantial similarity, as discussed below.

Access

Your claim does not provide clear facts about how the respondent had access to your work. “Access” means a reasonable opportunity to view or hear your work before the alleged infringement took place. You allege that you are the author of a visual artwork titled “Hot Dogger” that you describe as a “hot dog on skis.” You allege that a “Hot dogger sticker was given to a customer of Anchorage Brewing co.,” and that the customer took the sticker to the respondent, who made a tattoo. However, your allegations do not draw a clear sequence of events beginning with your authorship of the artwork to when the sticker was given to the customer. Your claim does not state allegations about where or how you made your work available before the alleged infringement such that the customer and respondent had an opportunity to see or obtain a copy of it.

To address this issue, you must file an amended claim with allegations that make access a reasonable possibility, not just hypothetically or theoretically possible. Acceptable allegations of access may include that your work (a) was sent directly to the respondent or a close associate of the respondent; (b) was widely disseminated or were available to the public or the respondent; or (c) is so strikingly similar to the respondent’s work that they could not have been created independently. Alternatively, you can upload copies of your work and the allegedly infringing work if those images demonstrate that the works are so strikingly similar that they could not have been created independently.

Substantial Similarity

Your claim also does not include enough facts that explain the similarities between your work and the respondent’s allegedly infringing work. If it is not readily apparent from supplemental materials submitted with the claim, you must provide some specific allegations about how your work and the allegedly infringing work are similar or identical. You do not provide information clearly describing or showing your allegedly infringed work, or stating or showing how it is substantially similar to the respondent’s allegedly infringing work.

Supplemental documents filed with the claim appear to show screenshots and a video of the allegedly infringing work on social media accounts bearing the respondent’s name. However, you do not provide enough information describing or showing your allegedly infringed work. No allegations in the “Describe the infringement” section of the claim describe your work or state or show how it is identical or substantially similar to the allegedly infringing work. In addition, you have not provided a copy of your work as a supplemental document. As a result, the claim does not provide enough information to enable the respondent to understand the claim and respond to it.

If you submit an amended claim, it must include more factual allegations that support the element of substantial similarity. Please provide more details and background regarding this element in your amended claim, including a clear, detailed statement regarding which portions of your work were taken by the respondent in the allegedly infringing work, or documents that are sufficient to show the similarities. If you include copies of the works at issue as supplemental documents, they must be clearly labeled and identified so they can be properly compared to each other.

To submit an amended claim, log into your eCCB account and take the following steps:

1. From your dashboard, click the “**Amend claim**” button and select your docket number from the dropdown list.
2. Your claim will unlock for editing. The information you originally entered will appear in the same order as in your original claim.
3. Make the necessary edits. If you have filed supplemental documents, you must re-upload any documents you wish to include in the amended claim on the “**Documentation**” page. Please include only documents directly related to your claim, and label them clearly.
4. Once you have completed your edits, continue to click through the fillable claim form until you reach the “**Review**” page. The Review page includes all the information that you have provided in the claim up to this point. Carefully double-check the information on this page. If you have any corrections, you can select “**Edit**” to revise any entries necessary. Each section of information has an “**Edit**” button, which will take you back to that section so you can make changes. After you make changes, you can click “**Save & review**” to return to the Review page. Please review your claim carefully. Once you submit your amended claim, you will be unable to edit the claim while it is in compliance review.
5. Once you have completed your review and any revisions, you must confirm that the information in your claim is accurate and truthful to the best of your knowledge. To complete the declaration, type your full name into the “**Digital signature**” box near the bottom of the “**Review filing**” page and click “**Agree & submit.**”

If you have questions, please contact asktheboard@ccb.gov. Include your docket number in the subject line. The Board is unable to provide legal advice. We can only provide legal information and assistance concerning Board procedures and requirements. If you would like to seek further guidance from a lawyer or a law student at reduced or no cost, please visit the [Pro Bono Assistance](#) page on ccb.gov. You may also refer to the [Compliance Review](#) chapter of the CCB Handbook for more assistance.

Copyright Claims Attorney