



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

Children fail [Ask] because they assume adults omniscient?



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

If assumed adults omniscient, should also fail [Tell]

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

Children fail [Ask] because they assume adults omniscient?

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

If assumed adults omniscient, should also fail [Tell]

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

~~Children fail [Ask] because they assume adults omniscient?~~

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

Children fail [Ask] because they don't understand knowledge can be transferred via answers



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

Children fail [Ask] because they don't understand knowledge can be transferred via answers

Objection 1: So why do children ask more often when ignorant?



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

Children fail [Ask] because they don't understand knowledge can be transferred via answers

Objection 1: So why do children ask more often when ignorant?

Objection 2: Children could succeed on [Ask] even though our hypothesis is true



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

(a) questions yield testimony,
(b) true testimony is preferable,
(c) knowledgeable speakers' testimony more likely to be true

Children fail [Ask] because they don't understand knowledge can be transferred via answers

Objection 1: So why do children ask more often when ignorant?

Objection 2: Children could children succeed on [Ask] even though our hypothesis is true



Puzzle: Why can 3-5 year olds discriminate knowledgeable from obviously ignorant experimenters when deciding who to believe but not when deciding whether to ask a question?

[Tell] Children evaluate unsolicited information appropriately* (exp 3, others)

[Ask] When they have to ask, children do not seem to decide to ask appropriately* (exp. 1, 2)

[Seek] When the message exists but has not been transmitted, children do decide to seek it appropriately* (exp. 3, 4)

* appropriately = taking into account E's knowledge

(a) questions yield testimony,
(b) true testimony is preferable,
(c) knowledgeable speakers' testimony more likely to be true

Children fail [Ask] because they don't understand knowledge can be transferred via answers

Objection 1: So why do children ask more often when ignorant?

Objection 2: Children could succeed on [Ask] even though our hypothesis is true



(a) questions yield testimony,
(b) true testimony is preferable,
(c) knowledgeable speakers'
testimony more likely to be true

other's knowledge -> testimony (/other manifestation) -> my knowledge

↑
(c)

↑
(b)