

Searching and Selection

Hengfeng Wei

hfwei@nju.edu.cn

April 8 ~ April 9, 2017



Searching and Selection

1 Selection

2 Searching

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

$$V_k(n) :$$

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

$$V_k(n) :$$

$$V_1(n) = n - 1$$

$$V_2(n) = (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1)$$

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

$$V_k(n) :$$

$$V_1(n) = n - 1$$

$$V_2(n) = (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1)$$

$$V_3(n) = ?$$

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

$$V_k(n) :$$

$$V_1(n) = n - 1$$

$$V_2(n) = (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1)$$

$$V_3(n) = ?$$

$$V_3(n) \leq (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1) + (n - 3)$$

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

$$V_k(n) :$$

$$V_1(n) = n - 1$$

$$V_2(n) = (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1)$$

$$V_3(n) = ?$$

$$V_3(n) \leq (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1) + (n - 3)$$

$$V_3(n) \leq (n - 1) + (\lceil \log n \rceil - 1) + (\lceil \rceil)$$

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

“Does your algorithm need to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

“Does your algorithm need to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“YES!”

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

“Does your algorithm need to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“YES!”

“Do all algorithms have to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

“Does your algorithm need to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“YES!”

“Do all algorithms have to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“NO!”

The 3rd largest element (Problem 3.1)

“Does your algorithm need to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“YES!”

“Do all algorithms have to find the 1st and the 2nd elements?”

“NO!”

References

“Selecting the Top Three Elements” by Aigner, 1982.

(Problem 3.2, Problem 2.4)

- ▶ Selecting the median of 5 elements using 6 comparisons.
- ▶ Sorting 5 elements using 7 comparisons ($S(5) = 7$).

(Problem 3.2, Problem 2.4)

- ▶ Selecting the median of 5 elements using 6 comparisons.
- ▶ Sorting 5 elements using 7 comparisons ($S(5) = 7$).

Reference

“The Art of Computer Programming, Vol 3: Sorting and Searching (Section 5.3.1)” by Donald E. Knuth.

$$S(21) = 66$$

Medians of sorted arrays (Problem 3.7)

The largest k elements (Problem 3.5)

Close to median (Problem 3.6)

Dynamic median (Problem 3.8)

Weighted median (Problem 3.9)

Searching and Selection

1 Selection

2 Searching

max / min differences (Problem 4.5)

- (a) unsorted; $\max |x - y|$; $O(n)$
- (b) sorted; $\max |x - y|$; $O(1)$
- (c) unsorted; $\min |x - y|$; $O(n \log n)$
- (d) sorted; $\min |x - y|$; $O(n)$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

$$T(m, n) = 3T\left(\frac{m}{2}, \frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

$$T(m, n) = 3T\left(\frac{m}{2}, \frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

$$m = n \implies T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

$$T(m, n) = 3T\left(\frac{m}{2}, \frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

$$m = n \implies T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1 \implies T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_2 3})$$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

$$T(m, n) = 3T\left(\frac{m}{2}, \frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

$$m = n \implies T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1 \implies T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_2 3})$$

Always checking the lower left corner.

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

- ▶ M : matrix $m \times n$
- ▶ row: increasing from left to right
- ▶ col: increasing from top to down
- ▶ Is $x \in M$?

Divide and conquer.

$$T(m, n) = 3T\left(\frac{m}{2}, \frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

$$m = n \implies T(n) = 3T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1 \implies T(n) = \Theta(n^{\log_2 3})$$

Always checking the lower left corner.

$$T(m, n) = m + n - 1$$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

Assume $M : n \times n$

$$W(n) \leq 2n - 1$$

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

Assume $M : n \times n$

$$W(n) \leq 2n - 1$$

$W(n) \geq 2n - 1$ by adversary argument!

Searching in matrix (Problem 4.6)

Assume $M : n \times n$

$$W(n) \leq 2n - 1$$

$W(n) \geq 2n - 1$ by adversary argument!

$$i + j \leq n - 1 \implies x > M_{ij}$$

$$i + j > n - 1 \implies x < M_{ij}$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

- ▶ Array $A[0 \dots n]$
- ▶ Boundary conditions:

$$\begin{aligned}A[0] &\geq A[1] \\ A[n-2] &\leq A[n-1]\end{aligned}$$

- ▶ Local minimum $A[i]$:

$$A[i-1] \geq A[i] \leq A[i+1]$$

- ▶ Goal: Find *any* local minimum.

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

1. Checking each element:

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

2. min A :

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

1. Checking each element:

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

2. $\min A$:

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

3. Required:

$$T(n) = O(n \log n)$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

1. Checking each element:

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

2. $\min A$:

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

3. Required:

$$T(n) = O(n \log n)$$

$$T(n) = T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

2D local minimum:

- ▶ Matrix $M : n \times n$
- ▶ Boundary conditions:

∞

- ▶ Local minimum $A[i, j]$:

$$A[i, j - 1] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i, j + 1]$$

$$A[i - 1, j] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i + 1, j]$$

- ▶ Goal: Find *any* local minimum.

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

2D local minimum:

- ▶ Matrix $M : n \times n$
- ▶ Boundary conditions:

∞

- ▶ Local minimum $A[i, j]$:

$$A[i, j - 1] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i, j + 1]$$

$$A[i - 1, j] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i + 1, j]$$

- ▶ Goal: Find *any* local minimum.

$$O(n^2)$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

2D local minimum:

- ▶ Matrix $M : n \times n$
- ▶ Boundary conditions:

∞

- ▶ Local minimum $A[i, j]$:

$$A[i, j - 1] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i, j + 1]$$

$$A[i - 1, j] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i + 1, j]$$

- ▶ Goal: Find *any* local minimum.

$$O(n^2) \implies O(n \log n)$$

Local minimum (Problem 4.11)

2D local minimum:

- ▶ Matrix $M : n \times n$
- ▶ Boundary conditions:

∞

- ▶ Local minimum $A[i, j]$:

$$A[i, j - 1] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i, j + 1]$$

$$A[i - 1, j] \geq A[i, j] \leq A[i + 1, j]$$

- ▶ Goal: Find *any* local minimum.

$$O(n^2) \implies O(n \log n) \implies O(n)$$

$a_i = i$ (Problem 4.2)

- ▶ Sorted integer sequence $\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$:

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal:

$$\exists i : a_i = i$$

$a_i = i$ (Problem 4.2)

- ▶ Sorted integer sequence $\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$:

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal:

$$\exists i : a_i = i$$

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

$a_i = i$ (Problem 4.2)

- ▶ Sorted integer sequence $\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$:

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal:

$$\exists i : a_i = i$$

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

$$T(n) = T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1 = O(\log n)$$

Smallest missing positive integer (Problem 4.3)

- ▶ Sorted array $A[1 \dots n]$:

$$a_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+$$

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal: Find the smallest missing positive integer.

Smallest missing positive integer (Problem 4.3)

- ▶ Sorted array $A[1 \dots n]$:

$$a_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+$$

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal: Find the smallest missing positive integer.

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

Smallest missing positive integer (Problem 4.3)

- ▶ Sorted array $A[1 \dots n]$:

$$a_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+$$

$$\forall i \neq j : a_i \neq a_j$$

- ▶ Goal: Find the smallest missing positive integer.

$$T(n) = O(n)$$

$$T(n) = T\left(\frac{n}{2}\right) + 1 = O(\log n)$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

- ▶ Given an n -bit natural number N ($0 \leq N < 2^n - 1$)
- ▶ Goal: Compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using $O(n)$ additions and shifts.

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

- ▶ Given an n -bit natural number N ($0 \leq N < 2^n - 1$)
- ▶ Goal: Compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using $O(n)$ additions and shifts.

Elementary operations:

- ▶ n -bit $+$ n -bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ n -bit shifted by 1-bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ $\Rightarrow x^2 : O(n)$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

- ▶ Given an n -bit natural number N ($0 \leq N < 2^n - 1$)
- ▶ Goal: Compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using $O(n)$ additions and shifts.

1. Naïve search: $O(2^n \cdot n)$

Elementary operations:

- ▶ n -bit + n -bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ n -bit shifted by 1-bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ $\Rightarrow x^2 : O(n)$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

- ▶ Given an n -bit natural number N ($0 \leq N < 2^n - 1$)
- ▶ Goal: Compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using $O(n)$ additions and shifts.

1. Naïve search: $O(2^n \cdot n)$
2. Binary search: $O(n \cdot n)$

Elementary operations:

- ▶ n -bit + n -bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ n -bit shifted by 1-bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ $\Rightarrow x^2 : O(n)$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

- ▶ Given an n -bit natural number N ($0 \leq N < 2^n - 1$)
- ▶ Goal: Compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using $O(n)$ additions and shifts.

Elementary operations:

- ▶ n -bit + n -bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ n -bit shifted by 1-bit: $O(1)$
- ▶ $\Rightarrow x^2 : O(n)$

1. Naïve search: $O(2^n \cdot n)$
2. Binary search: $O(n \cdot n)$
3. Binary search in range:

$$2^{\lfloor \frac{n-1}{2} \rfloor} \leq \lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil \leq 2^{\lceil \frac{n}{2} \rceil}$$

$$\lg(2^{\lceil \frac{n}{2} \rceil} - 2^{\lfloor \frac{n-1}{2} \rfloor}) = O(n)$$

$$O(n \cdot n)$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

A Little History:

2007: Mid-term problem

$O(n)$ required; NO $O(n)$ solutions, however

~ 2013: $O(n^2)$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

A Little History:

2007: Mid-term problem

$O(n)$ required; NO $O(n)$ solutions, however

~ 2013: $O(n^2)$

2014: $O(n)$

Compute square root using (bit) additions and shifts as primitives



5



Question: Given an n -bit natural number N , how to compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using only $O(n)$ (bit) additions and shifts?

The tip is to use binary search. However, I could not achieve the required complexity (I got $O(n^2)$).

asked 2 years ago

viewed 1039 times

active 2 years ago

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

A Little History:

2007: Mid-term problem

$O(n)$ required; NO $O(n)$ solutions, however

~ 2013: $O(n^2)$

2014: $O(n)$

Compute square root using (bit) additions and shifts as primitives



5



Question: Given an n -bit natural number N , how to compute $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ using only $O(n)$ (bit) additions and shifts?

The tip is to use binary search. However, I could not achieve the required complexity (I got $O(n^2)$).

asked 2 years ago

viewed 1039 times

active 2 years ago

$$x^2 : O(n) \rightarrow O(1)$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

Given

$$M = \lfloor N/4 \rfloor, x = \lceil \sqrt{M} \rceil, \text{ and } (x, x^2),$$

what is

$$y = \lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil \text{ and } (y, y^2)?$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

Given

$$M = \lfloor N/4 \rfloor, x = \lceil \sqrt{M} \rceil, \text{ and } (x, x^2),$$

what is

$$y = \lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil \text{ and } (y, y^2)?$$

An Example:

$$N = 280$$

$$y = \lceil \sqrt{280} \rceil = 17 \quad y^2 = 289$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

Given

$$M = \lfloor N/4 \rfloor, x = \lceil \sqrt{M} \rceil, \text{ and } (x, x^2),$$

what is

$$y = \lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil \text{ and } (y, y^2)?$$

An Example:

$$\begin{array}{lll} N = 280 & y = \lceil \sqrt{280} \rceil = 17 & y^2 = 289 \\ M = \lfloor 280/4 \rfloor = 70 & x = \lceil \sqrt{70} \rceil = 9 & x^2 = 81 \end{array}$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

Given

$$M = \lfloor N/4 \rfloor, x = \lceil \sqrt{M} \rceil, \text{ and } (x, x^2),$$

what is

$$y = \lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil \text{ and } (y, y^2)?$$

An Example:

| | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------|
| $N = 280$ | $y = \lceil \sqrt{280} \rceil = 17$ | $y^2 = 289$ |
| $M = \lfloor 280/4 \rfloor = 70$ | $x = \lceil \sqrt{70} \rceil = 9$ | $x^2 = 81$ |
| $M = \lfloor 70/4 \rfloor = 17$ | $x = \lceil \sqrt{17} \rceil = 5$ | $x^2 = 25$ |
| $M = \lfloor 17/4 \rfloor = 4$ | $x = \lceil \sqrt{4} \rceil = 2$ | $x^2 = 4$ |
| $M = \lfloor 4/4 \rfloor = 1$ | $x = \lceil \sqrt{1} \rceil = 1$ | $x^2 = 1$ |

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$ (Problem 4.12)

Algorithm 1 Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$.

procedure SQRT-ROOT(N)

if $N < 3$ **then**

return $1 \Rightarrow (1, 1); 2 \Rightarrow (2, 4); 3 \Rightarrow (2, 4)$

$M \leftarrow \lfloor N/4 \rfloor$

$(x, x^2) \leftarrow \text{SQRT-ROOT}(M)$

return the (y, y^2) with $y^2 \sim N$:

$$(y, y^2) = \begin{cases} y = 2x & y^2 = 4x^2 \\ y = 2x + 1 & y^2 = 4x^2 + 4x + 1 \\ y = 2x - 1 & y^2 = 4x^2 - 4x + 1 \end{cases}$$

Computing $\lceil \sqrt{N} \rceil$

$$T(n) = T(n/4) + O(1) = \Theta(\lg n)$$

$$T(n) = T(n-2) + O(1) = \Theta(n)$$