



Debanjan Mahata &lt;dxmahata@ualr.edu&gt;

---

**ACMMM 2015: Paper 862**

4 messages

**Conference Management Toolkit** <cmt@microsoft.com>

Thu, Jul 23, 2015 at 11:39 PM

Reply-To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

Debanjan Mahata has uploaded review draft for Paper ID 862 : Evento 360: Social Event Discovery from Web-scale Multimedia Collection

-- Review Draft Summary --

Question 1 : OVERALL EVALUATION

accept

Question 2 : REVIEWER'S CONFIDENCE

high

Question 3 : RELEVANCE TO GRAND CHALLENGE

good

Question 4 : PAPER PRESENTATION

Question 5 : DEMO PRESENTATION

good

Question 6 : ORIGINALITY

Question 7 : CORRECTNESS

good

Question 8 : SIGNIFICANCE

good

Question 9 : REFERENCES

fair

Question 10 : REVIEW

The authors have presented Event0 360, a social event browser working on top of an event detection/summarization engine that allows users to search and browse through events from a web-scale multimedia collection.

The most positive aspect of the presented system is the use of different types of features which could prove to be very effective for the purpose of the challenge. The authors have not only used textual features and spatial features, but have also used acoustic and visual features, which is very apt for the type of dataset.

The entire system is divided into smaller modules mainly focusing on event detection and summarization, which is in accordance to the task.

The authors have used already existing algorithms, which they thought would be suitable for the dataset and scale well for the task. The novelty lies in deciding and putting together all of it in a system for fulfilling the major aims of the task.

The visualization or the user interface of the system is very intuitive and easy to use. There could have been more effort in showing the timeline.

Certainly, there are scopes of improvement. Not much rigorous validation was done by the authors in order to show the effectiveness of the system except the demo. The only question that arises in such a scenario is that whatever, can be seen at the website <http://evento360.info> is what they get in the actual results or not? But given the scope of the competition and the number of pages to report the results I do agree that it must have been a tough job in fitting in all the results.

Pros: Very appealing demo. Good choice of features and techniques.

Cons: Not very novel and hardly any validation.

Overall, a good job was done for the demo in a short time.

Question 11 : CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS FOR THE PROGRAM COMMITTEE

---

**Conference Management Toolkit** <cmt@microsoft.com>

Fri, Jul 24, 2015 at 12:03 AM

Reply-To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

Debanjan Mahata has uploaded review draft for Paper ID 862 : Evento 360: Social Event Discovery from Web-scale Multimedia Collection

-- Review Draft Summary --

Question 1 : OVERALL EVALUATION

accept

Question 2 : REVIEWER'S CONFIDENCE

high

Question 3 : RELEVANCE TO GRAND CHALLENGE

good

Question 4 : PAPER PRESENTATION

good

Question 5 : DEMO PRESENTATION

good

Question 6 : ORIGINALITY

poor

Question 7 : CORRECTNESS

good

Question 8 : SIGNIFICANCE

good

Question 9 : REFERENCES

good

#### Question 10 : REVIEW

The authors have presented Event0 360, a social event browser working on top of an event detection/summarization engine that allows users to search and browse through events from a web-scale multimedia collection.

The most positive aspect of the presented system is the use of different types of features which could prove to be very effective for the purpose of the challenge. The authors have not only used textual features and spatial features, but have also used acoustic and visual features, which is very apt for the type of dataset.

The entire system is divided into smaller modules mainly focusing on event detection and summarization, which is in accordance to the task.

The authors have used already existing algorithms, which they thought would be suitable for the dataset and scale well for the task. The novelty lies in deciding and putting together all of it in a system for fulfilling the major aims of the task.

The visualization or the user interface of the system is very intuitive and easy to use. There could have been more effort in showing the timeline.

Certainly, there are scopes of improvement. Not much rigorous validation was done by the authors in order to show the effectiveness of the system except the demo. The only question that arises in such a scenario is that whatever, can be seen at the website <http://evento360.info> is what they get in the actual results or not? But given the scope of the competition and the number of pages to report the results I do agree that it must have been a tough job in fitting in all the results.

Pros: Very appealing demo. Good choice of features and techniques.

Cons: Not very novel and hardly any validation.

Overall, a good job was done for the demo in a short time.

#### Question 11 : CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS FOR THE PROGRAM COMMITTEE

This is the best paper overall out of the three I reviewed. That paper is very balanced. Although, its very hard to completely trust the results but it can be considered for the scope of the competition. There is not much novelty in the individual techniques used for event detection and summarization. It is very hard to say how good might be the actual results given the techniques used on the provided dataset as the paper is not corroborated by validation. But after going through the literature behind the referred techniques it seems that they certainly suits the task and has been very wisely chosen. Most importantly I think this system can be implemented in practical world to get good results, more easily than the other papers reviewed by me.

Most positive point is the use of visual and acoustic features. The use of these features and the demo makes it stand out from the other two papers that I reviewed.

---

**Conference Management Toolkit** <cmt@microsoft.com>

Fri, Jul 24, 2015 at 12:03 AM

Reply-To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Conference Management Toolkit** <cmt@microsoft.com>

Fri, Jul 24, 2015 at 12:10 AM

Reply-To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

To: dxmahata@ualr.edu

Debanjan Mahata has uploaded review for Paper ID 862 : Evento 360: Social Event Discovery from Web-scale Multimedia Collection

-- Review Summary --

[Quoted text hidden]