

## General notes for all framing schemas:

1. Take the tweets at face value! Only label tweets with frames that are explicitly cued according to these guidelines.
2. There's a lot of historical/political knowledge required. If there's some word, name, or event you're unfamiliar with, take a few seconds to look it up, because it might directly cue an issue-generic frame.
3. Label any **issue-generic frames** that appear (even if not directly in the context of immigration/immigrants), but **immigration-specific frames** are about how immigrants themselves are framed and don't follow straight from the issue-generic labels.
  - a. Don't put "victim/discrimination" solely because the tweet cues "fairness". Don't put "victim/humanitarian" solely because the tweet cues "morality". Sometimes, frames like "fairness" and morality" are cued, but the tweet does not frame immigrants as victims.
4. Any time a tweet cues a frame, that frame should be labeled, even if it seems like the author disagrees with that viewpoint (e.g. complaining about how anti-immigration activists are viewed as racist). The frames are still being invoked, and the tweets still draw attention to that aspect of the issue.
5. For tweets that are **irrelevant** (incomprehensible, non-English, about the Immigrant Song, immigration lines at airports, tech migrations, bird migrations etc.), mark all frames as **None** and mark **Irrelevant** in the "Other" category
6. Treat hashtags as normal words, so include any frames cued by hashtags
7. For privacy reasons, we do not include real tweets labeled for each frame. Please contact the authors privately if you need examples.

## Issue-Generic Policy Frame Coding Guidelines

Instructions: Code all tweets for zero or more of the following issue-generic policy frames. If no frames seem to fit, select *None*.

### List of issue-generic Policy Frames

1. Economic
2. Capacity & Resources
3. Morality & Ethics
4. Fairness & Equality
5. Legality, Constitutionality & Jurisdiction
6. Crime & Punishment
7. Security & Defense
8. Health & Safety
9. Quality of Life

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- 10. Cultural Identity
- 11. Public Sentiment
- 12. Political Factors & Implications
- 13. Policy Description, Prescription & Evaluation
- 14. External Regulation & Reputation

### 1:Economic

- The costs, benefits, or any monetary/financial implication of the issue (to an individual, family, organization, community or to the economy as a whole)
- Can include the effect of policy issues on trade, markets, wages, employment, unemployment, viability of specific industries or businesses, implications of taxes or tax breaks, financial incentives, etc.
- The **economic** frame includes mentions of:
  - Money, funding, or taxes
  - Immigrants receiving economic benefits, social security, welfare, “free handouts”, or being “freeloaders”
  - Employment and workers (but not specific job listings)
    - Job ads (e.g. tweets about firm hiring immigration attorney) do not receive any issue-generic frame. Code these as **irrelevant** in the **Other** category
  - Socio-economic class (working-class, middle-class, rich, poor)
    - Inequalities based on SES would also get **fairness** frame
  - Specific business and marketing practices
  - Employers that (illegally) hire undocumented immigrants
  - Labor shortages (also gets **resources** frame)
  - Trade deals (also gets **external** and **policy** frames)
  - Tax reform (also gets **policy** frame)
  - Colonialism (also **policy** and **external**)
  - Austerity (also **policy** in context of British policy)

### 2: Capacity & Resources

- The availability/lack of time, physical, geographical, human, and financial resources.
- This frame stresses finite resources, and specifically deals with limitations or availability of resources. Think of it in terms of there being “not enough” or “enough” of something
- The capacity or availability of resources to deal with a new issue -- capacity or resources could be an impediment to solving a problem or adequately addressing an issue.
- Focus on availability/scarcity/surplus of physical resources (farmland, classroom space, prisons, etc.), human resources (law enforcement, engineers, doctors, etc.) or financial resources (availability of credit, commercial items, funds, etc.)
- The **capacity & resources** frame includes mentions of:
  - Labor shortages (also get **economic** frame)
  - Not enough money to fund something (also gets **economic** frame)

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Supply/demand of employees and staff (also gets **economic** frame)
- Lack/provisions of natural resources (e.g. leaving water for immigrants)
- Availability of specialized labor (e.g. immigrants are doctors and engineers)
- Discussions about demographic shift is NOT **capacity & resources** (it is **cultural identity**) unless emphasis is on the strain on resources due to the changing population.

### 3: Morality & Ethics

- Any perspective compelled by religious doctrine or interpretation, duty, honor, righteousness or any other sense of ethics or social responsibility (religious or secular)
- [Morality frame refers to social responsibility \(while fairness refers to social justice\)](#)
- Non-religious morality frames could include general moral imperatives to help others
- Appeals that something “is just the right thing to do” or “would indicate a recognition of our shared humanity”, or arguing against something with “I don’t think it’s right”
- Lawbreakers, including illegal immigrants, can be presented as fundamentally immoral, but breaking a law that is unjust can also be presented as moral (e.g. Rosa Parks)
- The **morality** frame includes mentions of:
  - Morals or ethics
  - Humanitarian crisis
  - Human rights
  - Anything religious or related to religion
    - EXCEPTION: religious terms cue cultural identity when referring to immigrants’ identities because it addresses *what type of immigrants*
  - Emphasis on vulnerability
  - Discussions of harming innocent children and family separations, but only when there is a value judgment clearly made.
  - Making the world better/worse for descendants
    - “spending our grandchildren’s money”
    - “leaving something for our children”
  - References to Nazis, concentration camps, slavery, fascism etc as moral critique of policy
  - Virtue-signaling (despite negative connotation)
  - Statements about obligation to welcome immigrants

### 4: Fairness & Equality

- The fairness, equality, or inequality with which laws, punishment, rewards, and resources are applied or distributed among individuals or groups.
- The balance between rights or interests of one individual or group compared to another
- **Fairness and Equality** frame cues often focus on whether society and its laws are equally distributed and enforced across region, race, gender, economic class, etc.
- Often used in discussing social justice issues
- [Fairness frame refers to social justice, while \(morality refers to social responsibility\)](#)
- The **fairness** frame includes discussions of:

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Discrimination, racism, xenophobia
  - Includes claims that somebody hates certain social groups, e.g. “the government hates Hispanics”
  - Attacking immigrants because of their identity
  - Stereotypes or microaggressions
- Exploitation: treating immigrants unfairly in order to benefit from their work
- Freedom of movement (abbrev. FoM)
- Contrasts with legal immigrants/citizens (may also get **crime**) frames, but only when the message is clearly about fairness. These include:
  - Illegal immigrants receive privileges/benefits that aren’t fair to others
  - It’s unfair that legal immigrants went through the process and illegal immigrants don’t
  - Immigrants being “taken care of” or “treated” better than nonimmigrants.
    - In USA, this appears a lot when talking about military veterans
- Gerrymandering because it gives some people more political power over others (also is **political**)

## 5: Legality, Constitutionality & Jurisdiction

- The legal, constitutional, or jurisdictional aspects of an issue.
  - Legal: court cases and existing laws *that regulate immigration policies*
  - Constitutional: discussion of constitutional interpretation or potential revisions
  - Jurisdiction: which government body should be in charge of a policy decision and/or the appropriate scope of a body’s policy reach.
- Legality and constitutionality of “rules” (federal law, business regulations, etc.) and court cases on whether the rules were upheld
- All aspects of jurisdiction: US vs United Nations, state vs federal, voters vs courts, etc.
  - Proposed laws framed as jurisdictional issue from the outside (can states regulate immigration?) gets both **policy** and **legality**
- The **legality** frame includes explicit mentions of:
  - The Constitution, Bill or Rights, Constitutional Amendments, etc.
  - Legal documentation
    - Green card, visas, passports, drivers licenses, marriage licenses
    - Use of “undocumented” literally to mean the lack of legal documentation, but *not* when used to describe immigrants (as in *undocumented workers*)
  - Citizenship status or process of obtaining citizenship
    - Including anchor babies (part of citizenship process)
  - Seeking asylum or granting amnesty
  - Court cases
  - Facing prosecution (also gets **crime** frame)
- Explicit contrast with legal immigration or legal immigrants or discussions of breaking the law do NOT cue the legality frame (they cue the **crime** frame)
- The legality frame does NOT include Congressional legislation (which is **policy**)

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- See [Crime vs. Legality vs. Policy](#) for help distinguishing these frames

### 6: Crime & Punishment (Retribution)

- The violation of policies in practice and the consequences of these violations
- Breaking the rules and/or getting punished
- Any criminal activity mentioned within the tweet gets the issue-generic crime frame, even if it doesn't specifically say that immigrants are criminals.
  - Crimes against immigrants get issue-generic **crime** frame
- The **crime** frame includes mentions of:
  - Any crime (murder, robbery, fraud, trespassing, etc)
    - Crimes that cause physical harm are also tagged as **health & safety**
  - Deportation:
    - Any mention of deporting immigrants or deportations cues **crime**
    - Deportation court cases gets both **crime** and **legality**
    - Deportation policy gets both **crime** and **policy**
  - Anything about undocumented immigrants voting in elections (also **political**)
  - Detention centers
  - Sanctuary Cities (freedom from punishment regarding federal immigration laws)
  - Groups that engage with criminal activity (e.g. MS-13, the mafia)
  - Gun violence (also **health and safety**)
  - Increases or reductions in crime levels
  - Potential criminals facing prosecution (also **legality**)
  - Sentences delivered in a court case (also **legality**)
  - Punishments for law-breaking (fines are also tagged as **economic**)
  - Explicit contrast with legal immigration or legal immigrants because it emphasizes that they are doing something illegal
    - Includes correcting headline to specify "illegal"
- Terrorism does NOT cue **crime** (it is **security**) but arrests of terrorists are **crime**
- See [Crime vs. Legality vs. Policy](#) for help distinguishing these frames

### 7: Security & Defense

- Any threat to a person, group, or nation
- Any defense that needs to be taken to avoid that threat, including tools and technologies (e.g. facial recognition to prevent immigrants from entering country)
- Includes issues of national security including resource security, and efforts of individuals to secure homes, neighborhoods or schools
- **Security & Defense** addresses a preemptive action to stop a threat from occurring, whereas **Health & Safety** frames address steps taken when something happens.
- The **security & defense** frame includes mentions of:
  - General need for greater security
  - Borders
    - Building a border fence or wall

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Efforts to “secure the borders”
- “Crossings” or “illegal crossings” (that obviously refer to border)
- Arrests at the border (also cue **crime**)
- Ports or shores as points of entry
- Terrorism or risk of immigrants being terrorists
- Invasions or descriptions of immigrants as invaders
- No-go zones (areas that pose a threat to people)
- Taking over a country (similar to invasion)
  - If message indicates *what type of immigrants* are doing the taking over (e.g. Islamist takeover), it also cues the **cultural identity** frame
- Open (door) immigration, (un)controlled immigration (also cue **policy**)
- Death threats or other violent threats

## 8: Health & Safety

- The potential health and safety outcomes of any policy issue
- Health care access and effectiveness, illness, disease, sanitation, obesity, mental health, infrastructure/building safety
- Policies taken to ensure safety should a tragedy occur (emergency preparedness kits, lock down training, disaster awareness classes, etc)
- Includes trying to protect against factors of inadvertent or accidental injury, but NOT protecting against external threat (which would get **security** frame)
- The health and safety frame includes mentions of:
  - Disaster relief (likely also **economic**)
  - Healthcare, medicine, vaccines, etc
  - Medical and health organizations (e.g. CDC, NHS)
  - Physical harm: words like carnage, death, bodily wound, injury, bloodshed etc.
    - Gun violence, killing, shooting, other violent crime also get **crime** frame
    - Female genital mutilation (FGM) (also **cultural identity**)
  - Immigrants dying or suffering during journey to host country
    - For US, especially in the desert. For Europe, esp. in the Mediterranean
    - Hardships in arriving to host country get **Health and Safety**, NOT Quality of Life (which focuses on when immigrants already arrived)
  - Immigrants dying in jail or detention centers, unsafe/unsanitary conditions
  - Climate change

## 9: Quality of Life

- The benefits and costs of any policy on quality of life
- The effects of a policy on people’s wealth (also **economic**), mobility, access to resources, happiness, social structures, ease of day-to-day routines, quality of community life, etc.
- General hardship that immigrants face after arriving in host country
  - Could include discussions of working conditions and terrible wages

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Facing a “hostile environment” in host country (also **policy** in UK)
- Discussions of poverty, homelessness, needing food stamps
- Day-to-day fear of deportation, job loss, being stopped by police, or not being able to participate in normal social activities due to these fears
- Taking actions (such as working long hours) to improve their family’s quality of life (e.g. giving children educational opportunities)
- Generic statements about seeking a better life, looking for an escape, etc.
- Hardships in crossing the border or arriving in the United States get **Health and Safety**, NOT **Quality of Life**.
  - **Quality of life** is about when immigrants are already in the US
- Mentions of people receiving generic “benefits” typically **economic**, NOT **quality of life**
  - Exception: emphasizes benefits’ impact on quality of life of immigrants or nonimmigrants.

## 10: Cultural Identity

- Social norms, trends, values and customs constituting any culture as they relate to a specific policy issue
- The **cultural identity** frame includes discussions about:
  - Demographics and census in relation to immigration
    - Population changes, including replacement migration
      - Aging population creating need for migrants
    - How many immigrants, what types of immigrants
    - Numbers of immigrants coming to/remaining in host country
      - Exception: emphasis is on the strain on resources due to such demographic shifts (which cues **capacity and resources**).
  - Immigrants’ identities (addresses the *what types of immigrants* question above)
    - Religion, country of origin, ethnicity, etc.
    - Windrush migration, Windrush generation
    - Phrases such as “Islamist takeover” that specify something about the immigrants’ identities (this particular phrase also cues **security**)
  - Integration and assimilation efforts (or lack thereof)
    - English Language Acquisition (ESL/EFL)
      - Exception: focus is on how learning English improves quality of life
  - A nation’s values (and possibly destroying those values)
    - E.g. patriotism
  - Emphasis on immigrants’ identities as foreigners
  - Unity or division of the host country
  - Host country having a long history/culture for which immigration was essential
  - Being a “nation of immigrants”
  - Stories of individual immigrants throughout history
  - Personal (or familial) immigration stories and experiences
  - Artwork (books, songs, etc.) depicting immigrant experience (good or bad)

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Music/entertainment/foods that immigrants like, or that immigrants create
  - Including immigrants participating in sports (as form of entertainment)
- Cultural norms or stereotypes of ethnic and political groups
  - Includes practices such as female genital mutilation (FGM, also **health**)
- Trends, attitudes, or beliefs sweeping the nation
- Associations with notable people in order to make a cultural reference
- Celebrity endorsements for policy issues

## 11: Public Sentiment

- The public's opinion
- Includes references to general social attitudes, protests, polling, as well as implied or actual consequences of diverging from or "getting ahead of" public opinion or polls.
  - Saying "millions of people" support/oppose some policy, even if not formal poll
  - Joe Public/Joe Schmoie etc. as generic member of the public
- Includes references to a party's base or constituency (would overlap with **Politics**)
  - Brexiteers, Remainers, Leavers, Trump supporters etc. when giving generalizations about how they feel and their opinions
- Includes any public passage of a proposition/law (e.g. CA voters passed Prop 8)
  - Explicit mentions of referendum
- All interest groups coded as public sentiment because they represent part of the population (e.g. the NRA, National Rifle Association)
- Includes protests, riots, and strikes (incl. hunger strikes)
- Sharing petitions and encouraging people to take political action

## 12: Political Factors & Implications

- Any political considerations surrounding an issue
- Includes issue actions or efforts or stances that are political, such as partisan filibusters, lobbyist involvement, bipartisan efforts, deal-making and vote-trading, appealing to one's base, explicit statements that a policy issue is good or bad for a particular political party
- Discussions of political maneuvering, partisan conflicts
- Mentions of a political entity or political party
  - Tweets mentioning a politician or party by name (or well-known nickname) or tagging politicians (e.g. @POTUS)
    - **EXCEPTION:** Do **not** mark "**political**" when a politician is tagged at the beginning (these are just replies to political accounts). Only mark "**political**" when the politician's name is mentioned within the text or intentionally tagged outside of the reply.
    - This only includes people who work/have worked in government, not just well-known partisan public figures
  - Parties: Democrat, Republican, Dems, Libs, Libertarian, Green Party, Tea Party
    - Recent political labels: Leavers, Remainers, Brexiteers, Trumpers, etc.
  - Politicians: Trump, Bush, Corbyn, Farage, Boris Johnson, Malcolm Turnbull, etc



## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Structure: Congress, Senate, Governors, Parliament, Government, etc.
- Immigration Departments: Home Office, Department of Homeland Security
  - NOT ICE (which is law enforcement agency)
- Partisan: “Both sides”, “the left”, “the right”, or partisan conflict
- Political Acronyms: DNC (Democratic National Convention), RNC (Republican National Convention), MP (Member of Parliament), PM (Prime Minister)
- The **political** frame includes mentions of:
  - Political entities, parties, partisan conflict (see above)
  - Voting and elections
    - Both general voting and congressional voting
    - Bills passing or being defeated (implies vote was taken)
  - Political debates (including in hashtags like #DebateNight)
  - Gerrymandering because it is political maneuvering (also coded as **fairness**)
  - Political Agendas (e.g. something being part of the Dem’s agenda)
  - Lobbying or campaigning
  - Socialism, fascism, etc. when discussed as political philosophies

## 13: Policy Description, Prescription & Evaluation

- Existing policies, policies proposed for addressing an identified problem, as well as analysis of whether hypothetical policies will work or existing policies are effective.
- Refers to “rules” (federal/state law, business policy, regulation, Congressional bills)
  - What the rules are
  - What the rules will be
  - What the rules should be
    - Here, “rules” should be limited to what politicians (or businesses) can reasonably take action on, otherwise this guideline is too broad
    - E.g. “build the wall” is a policy, but “libs should invite immigrants to live in their homes” is not
  - How well or poorly the rules are working
- Things the government (or other institutions) does (or contemplates doing) in order to help or harm immigrants
- Mere mention of existing policy, such as recently passed laws, are marked as **policy** (even without evaluation or analysis)
  - For tweets, any explicit mention of anything as “policy” should get policy frame
- Includes formal governmental regulation (e.g. federal or state law) as well as regulation by businesses (e.g. sports arenas not allowing the sale of alcohol)
- Includes Congressional legislation and discussion of proposed bills
  - Everything about laws passed by Congress are **Policy** (NOT Legality)
- The **policy** frame includes mentions of:
  - Deportation policy (also is **crime & punishment**)
  - Brexit
  - Trade deals are tagged with **economic, external, and policy frames**

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Proposals/actions to build border wall (both **policy and security**)
  - Executive orders, declaration of state/national emergencies
  - Tax reform (both **economic and policy frames**)
  - America First (often #AmericaFirst)
  - Chain Migration
  - Austerity (in reference to UK policy, also **economic**)
  - Hostile Environment (in reference to UK policy, also **quality of life**)
  - Imperialism, colonialism (both also **external**, colonialism also **economic**)
- See [Crime vs. Legality vs. Policy](#) for help distinguishing these frames

### 14: External Regulation & Reputation

- The United States' external relations with another nation; the external relations of one US state with another. The external frame only focuses on explicit relationships between countries and states, not just any mention of something happening in another country.
  - International efforts to achieve policy goals, alliances or disputes between groups
  - Anything about the United Nations (UN) and its organizations (such as World Health Organization)
  - Regulations or agreements between states
    - Includes trade deals (also **economic** and **policy**)
    - Most international agreements also get **policy** frame
  - Comparisons of policy outcomes between different regions
  - Perception or reputation of one nation/state/group by another state
  - How one entity (city/state/nation) might influence another (think: peer pressure)
- Anything about globalization, globalism, globalists, (even if you suspect it's just there as an antisemitic dogwhistle)
- Policies that involve interactions across countries, Includes imperialism (also **policy**) and colonialism (also **economic** and **policy**)

### Crime vs. Legality vs. Policy

Crime	Legality	Policy
The actual application of a law	Legality focuses on courts, constitutionality, jurisdiction, <u>questioning</u> whether something is legal	What the rules (incl. laws): are, will be, or should be
(1) Breaking the rules (2) Getting punished for breaking the law (paying fines, jail, deportation)	(1) Discussions of legality and/or constitutionality of the rules (2) Court cases on whether rules were upheld (3) Legal precedent related to violation of a law (3) Deciding whether or not a law was broken (4) Deciding if a policy is constitutional or not	(1) How well the rules are working (2) How a policy should work (3) May talk about new policy, where it regulates, what punishments are for violation

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

		(4) Congressional/Parliament legislation
--	--	--

### Clarifying examples (constructed so as to preserve privacy)

- Contrasts between legal and illegal immigration would be **crime**, NOT necessarily **legality** or **policy**. The focus is on breaking the law (the actual application of the law), not decisions about whether or not a law was broken.
  - We've all learned that you don't break the law or you go to jail and get taken from your family so why don't illegal immigrants get it
  - I have no problem with LEGAL immigration. We have laws for a reason, follow them!
  - Sure we're a nation of immigrants, but we did it LEGALLY, not like those illegals that Dems love so much
- Mentions of "legal", "illegal", or "law" are NOT necessarily legality, or any of these frames
  - I'm so mad at the illegal aliens who voted these morons into office (**only crime and political**)
  - Lol I thought you were talking about being an illegal immigrant, not about being of legal age (**no issue-generic frames**)
- Discussions of prosecution, lawsuits, judges, courtrooms, other entities relevant for deciding whether or not a law was broken (or a policy breaks existing law) are **legality**
  - Undocumented immigrants can face U.S. prosecution now
  - Obama Judge stops deportation of illegals
  - NY is about to file a "multi-agency lawsuit against the Trump administration for violating the Constitutional rights of immigrant children & their families who have been separated at the border."

### Morality vs Fairness

- Morality/Humanitarian → social responsibility
  - Organizations and individuals have obligation to act for the benefit of society
  - People have obligations to help their larger society of people, even if they don't know them personally
  - Responsibilities that we owe to society/each other
  - Moral obligation to keep families together, protect children
- Fairness/Discrimination → social justice
  - Idea that people who lack certain rights/opportunities/status or are victims of injustice are owed remedy/restoration by the larger society
  - All people deserve and should have access to the same rights and resources

# Immigration-Specific Frames Coding Guideline

## General Notes

- First decide if immigrants/immigration are framed as **victims, heroes, or threats**. Then, label frames within those categories.

## List of Immigration-Specific Frames

1. Victim: Global Economy
2. Victim: Humanitarian
3. Victim: War
4. Victim: Discrimination
5. Hero: Cultural Diversity
6. Hero: Integration
7. Hero: Workers
8. Threat: Jobs
9. Threat: Public Order
10. Threat: Fiscal
11. Threat: National Cohesion

### 1: Victim: Global Economy

- Focus on the economic motives for immigrants to leave home countries
- Emphasizes problems of global poverty, underdevelopment and inequality, of which migration from the Global South to North is only one symptom
- Immigration is a subset of the larger problem of laissez-faire economic globalization and unjust North-South relations
- Immigrants are people who are hit hard by economic insecurity, global economic injustices, and economic crises/turmoil
- Includes descriptions such as economic migrant or third-world immigration (even though these sometimes have underlying connotations of immigrants as threats)

### 2: Victim: Humanitarian

- Highlights economic, social, and political suffering and hardships of immigrants on the basis of their ethnicity, culture, or religion
- Immigrants are victims of unjust government policies (violations of human rights, fair legal process) or business practices

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- They suffer from poor living conditions, poverty, lack of access to health care and welfare services, dangers related to border crossing etc.
- Immigrants suffer due to the hardship and stress of the legal immigration process
- They have difficulties in adapting to their host society
- Immigrants are abused, suffer in poor working conditions
- Emphasis on immigrants being vulnerable
- Includes references/metaphors to Nazis, concentration camps, slavery, etc.
- Includes discussions about how deporting immigrants harms communities
- Includes discussions of how the sole goal of ICE (or other agencies) is to harm immigrants (dedicating time and money specifically to harm people is inhumane)
- Often aligns with the **morality** issue-generic frame

### 3: Victim: War

- Focus on war as a reason that immigrants leave countries of origin. War includes any named conflict or officially declared war, both within and between countries.
- Immigrants are refugees who are escaping from specifically war
  - NOT immediately cued by mentions of refugees without additional context
- Immigrants are attacked in wars/named violent conflicts.
- Host countries have obligation to help as a matter of international solidarity
- Host countries contributed to generating situations that immigrants escape from
  - Bombing Libya, Iraq, etc.
  - Failing to negotiate peace in the Balkans, Syria, etc.

### 4: Victim: Discrimination

- Immigrants are victims of discrimination based on national origin, race/ethnicity, religion, culture, or gender/sexuality
- Immigrants are victims of racist or xenophobic slurs or hate crimes
- Existing immigration laws and policies are racist, encourage racial profiling, or stereotyping of immigrants as criminals, violent, dirty, or lazy
- Immigrants are attacked because of their identity or (perceived) citizenship status
- Immigrants are exploited
- Includes discussions of immigration policies being “too tough”
- Often aligns with the **fairness** issue-generic frame

### 5: Hero: Cultural Diversity

- Highlights positive aspects of the differences that immigrants bring to society
- Immigrants bring positive differences to a society, from new cuisines to the unique contributions of immigrant artists, musicians, and writers
- Art about immigration/immigrant experience (books, movies, etc.)

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Positive view that society becomes more diverse in terms of values, culture and religion, and that national norms and conventions are being challenged
- The host country has been a nation of immigrants throughout its history
- Mentions of host country's long history of immigration, including stories of individual immigrants/immigrant groups from a long time ago
- The USA is a melting pot, and we all have immigrant backgrounds.
- Host country benefits from multiculturalism

## 6: Hero: Integration

- Positive spin on immigrants adapting and fitting into their host society
- Immigrants enthusiastically adopt mainstream cultural mores or civic obligations, including paying taxes
- Immigrants successfully take part in work, education, and society.
- Immigrants are devoted to American values (e.g. patriotism)
- Includes discussions of immigrants serving in the military
- Highlighting accomplishments of Immigrants (or their families)
  - Includes sports victories, other awards, or entrepreneurial success
- Immigrants giving their children opportunities (financial, education, etc), since this implies successful integration

## 7: Hero: Worker

- Immigrants contribute to economic prosperity and growth
- Immigrants are important source of labor, both cheap labor and skilled workers
- Immigrants perform work that citizens or legal residents will not or cannot do
- Immigrants are particularly skilled in certain professions
- Immigrants are hard workers

## 8: Threat: Jobs

- Immigrants take nonimmigrants' jobs or lower their wages
- More immigration means that there will be high unemployment and low wages
- In USA, particularly: immigrants are threatening African-American jobs
- Examples
  - *Kenyan journalist on Huffpost. Blame Legal Immigrants Like Me for Taking Your American Jobs* <http://t.co/A3wMFbUZ> via @HuffPostPol
  - *@TuxcedoCat freeing illegals to take American jobs& bid down wages, job killing Ombamacare & minimum wage hike killing low level jobs=Obama*
  - *Young Britons beaten to jobs by 'new servant class' of immigrants.*
  - *Ben Carson: Trump picking up support from blacks who don't want to lose jobs to illegals* <https://t.co/YQFCGuoLtk> via @lisafedup

## 9: Threat: Public Order

- Claims that immigrants are criminals or terrorists
- Emphasizes law-breaking of any kind by immigrants, as well as health or environmental threats posed by unlimited immigration
  - Including correcting headlines to specify that immigrants are “illegal”
- Illegal immigrants break the law by coming to this country
- Immigrants are coming in such numbers that it leads to overcrowding and environmental degradation
- Immigrants cluster together in ghetto-like areas with high levels of social unrest
- Immigrants are a threat to public safety. Potential consequences are terrorism, drug cartels, violent and petty crimes, or increased health problems (e.g. H1N1)
- Advocating for border protection & security, which protect against public threats.
  - Responding to attempted border crossings by sending troops to border, declaring national emergency
- Explicit descriptions of immigrants as invaders or leading invasions/taking over
- Undocumented immigrants voting (because it's a crime)

## 10: Threat: Fiscal

- Immigrants abuse government social service programs (health, education, social security, etc.)
- Immigrants are a burden on resources, such as tax dollars, healthcare, housing, food, schools, etc
- Immigrants impose an unfair tax burden on taxpayers. Immigrants use your tax dollars on health, education, and other services.
- Immigrants are recipients of benefits, welfare at the expense of nonimmigrants.
  - Immigrants receive preferential treatment compared to nonimmigrants, and are unjustly prioritized compared to other groups in need.
  - In the USA, this often contrasts with how veterans are treated
  - Includes vague statements about immigrants being “treated better” in economic contexts (e.g. in comparison to poor people, paying for healthcare, etc)
- Includes accusations that immigrants don't pay taxes
- Focuses on general economic burden on country/citizens, rather than jobs
- Welfare immigration threatens the normative foundations and/or future fiscal sustainability of the welfare state (could be especially prominent in EU)

## 11: Threat: National Cohesion

- Treats immigrant cultural differences (customs, religion, language) as a threat to national unity and social harmony

## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Immigrants bring foreign customs and values that threaten to undermine the host country's culture or national identity
- Immigrants are unassimilable
- Immigrants are diluting our culture, language, and values
- Emphasis on foreignness/otherness
- Emphasis on some outside group taking over a country (e.g. Islamist takeover)
  - Shifting cultural values as result of immigration, takeover suggests that this is happening in a forced/unwanted way
- Generic statements of immigration destroying countries (or Europe)

## Narrative Frames

### General Notes

- There are four options for labeling narrative frames, with different balances of episodic and thematic frames (see descriptions of episodic and thematic below):
  1. **Episodic**
  2. **Thematic**
  3. **Mixed** (mark both Episodic and Thematic)
    - a. Episodic and thematic frames are both prominent. Often occurs when one sentence is clearly episodic and another is clearly thematic.
    - b. Also occurs when there's an episode (e.g. speech or bill being passed) but the content is thematic.
  4. And **None** (includes unclear/irrelevant)
- Don't consider conversations within Twitter (e.g. when a tweet is directed at another user or responding to what somebody else said, or personal insults) when annotating narrative frames. Focus on their actual message itself.
- Mark Narrative Frame as **none** if the tweet is irrelevant (job ads, airport immigration queue, "Immigrant Song", etc.), it's really unclear what's going on, or not enough context to confidently assign any narrative frame
  - If one part of the tweet is unclear, but the other part is clearly episodic or thematic, label tweet with the frame clearly invoked

### Episodic

- Message focuses on the place, event, or individual person involved
- The message provides concrete information on how an event occurred and evolved
- Present an issue by offering a specific example, case study, or event oriented report
  - E.g. Covering immigration with story on plight of an individual who immigrated
- Specific time-bound political events
  - Messages about politicians' specific statements and speeches



## Codebook for Mendelsohn, Budak, and Jurgens (2021)

- Focus on concrete actions, such as passing or signing a bill
  - Single action that takes a short amount of time
  - Discussion of bills would be **thematic** if they focus on context of the bill or the broader problems it's trying to address
- Discussion of legal decisions, where the focus is on the single (nearly instantaneous) action of making a decision
- Politicians:
  - Specific things a candidate says in debate or primary focus on debate
  - Focus on how a politician talks about an issue at a particular moment
- Individuals:
  - Focus on a specific person (non-public figure)
  - Focus on personal experiences, feelings, or actions
  - Emphasis on individual people or families
- Specific cultural artifact about immigration (book/movie/etc)
- Focus on a very specific crime and a specific person/group that committed that crime
- Specific actions completed in a small time frame
  - Main verb like *ask, say, told, meet*

## Thematic

- More abstract, generic views of an event or issue
- Places story in broader political, social, and cultural context
- Broad statements about immigrants impact the economy or society
- Includes emphasis on larger social groups, rather than individuals
- Focus on a country or society's big problems
- Situate policies in broader, long-term context
  - Political leader's platforms (represent long-term commitment)
  - Longer-term implications of a law or policy (as opposed to just passing the law)
  - General opinions about politicians, policy, media bias etc.
  - Broad interpretation of a politician's or government's policies or opinions (interpreting what Trump's stance on immigration is)
  - General beliefs or long-term actions taken by political entities
- Thoughts about what immigrants do/don't do generally, or what they do/don't deserve
- Focus on demographics or demographic trends is thematic because the focus is on the composition of society (which is broader context of immigration within society)