Median Filtering Regeneration

Tuna Alikaşifoğlu

March 19, 2023

1 Full Comparison

Full result comparison between the reported and regenerated median filtering experiments on sea surface temperature dataset is provided in table 1. The underlying graph of reported results are not provided in the original paper [1], the generated results are obtained with k-NN underlying graph structure with several k values. The k-NN structure is used because the papers that use the sea surface temperature dataset usually use 5-NN graph for underlying graph [2], [3], which are also cited in [1]. The best overall results are bolded, where best generated results are underlined.

	Reported with			Generated with k -NN Graph								
	Unknown Graph			$\forall k$	k = 1		k = 3		k = 5		k = 10	
σ	Noisy	\mathcal{M}_1	\mathcal{M}_2	Noisy	\mathcal{M}_1	\mathcal{M}_2	\mathcal{M}_1	\mathcal{M}_2	\mathcal{M}_1	\mathcal{M}_2	\mathcal{M}_1	\mathcal{M}_2
0.05	22.63	27.69	27.26	$22.63{\pm}0.05$	27.00 ± 0.06	26.39 ± 0.06	$26.58 {\pm} 0.08$	24.93 ± 0.06	25.87 ± 0.06	23.40 ± 0.06	$22.59{\pm}0.04$	$20.64{\pm}0.02$
0.10	16.62	23.54	25.09	$16.61 {\pm} 0.05$	21.68 ± 0.06	$22.64{\pm}0.08$	$22.30 {\pm} 0.08$	$22.86{\pm}0.07$	$22.21{\pm}0.07$	$22.02{\pm}0.07$	$20.87 {\pm} 0.08$	$20.24{\pm}0.07$
0.15	13.10	20.59	22.93	$13.08{\pm}0.05$	$18.33{\pm}0.06$	$19.72 {\pm} 0.09$	$19.38{\pm}0.09$	20.93 ± 0.08	$19.69{\pm}0.08$	$20.71 {\pm} 0.09$	$19.43{\pm}0.08$	$19.72{\pm}0.09$
0.20	10.61	18.30	21.05	$10.59 {\pm} 0.05$	$15.90 {\pm} 0.07$	$17.45{\pm}0.09$	$17.15 {\pm} 0.10$	$\overline{19.17 \pm 0.09}$	17.71 ± 0.09	$19.44{\pm}0.10$	$18.10 {\pm} 0.07$	$19.12 {\pm} 0.10$
0.25	8.66	16.50	19.49	$8.65{\pm}0.05$	$13.99 {\pm} 0.07$	$15.63{\pm}0.09$	$15.34{\pm}0.10$	$17.63 {\pm} 0.10$	$16.05{\pm}0.09$	$\overline{18.24{\pm}0.11}$	$16.87{\pm}0.08$	$18.45{\pm}0.12$
0.30	7.06	14.96	18.08	$7.06{\pm}0.05$	$12.43 {\pm} 0.07$	$14.11 {\pm} 0.09$	$13.83 {\pm} 0.10$	$16.28{\pm}0.10$	$14.64{\pm}0.09$	$17.12 {\pm} 0.11$	$15.74{\pm}0.08$	$\overline{17.77 \pm 0.13}$
0.35	5.72	13.59	16.78	$5.72 {\pm} 0.05$	$11.10 {\pm} 0.07$	$12.81 {\pm} 0.09$	$12.53 {\pm} 0.11$	$15.10 {\pm} 0.10$	$13.42{\pm}0.09$	$16.09 {\pm} 0.12$	$14.71 {\pm} 0.08$	$\overline{17.08{\pm0.14}}$
0.40	4.57	12.53	15.73	$4.57{\pm}0.05$	$9.94{\pm}0.07$	$11.67 {\pm} 0.09$	$11.40 {\pm} 0.11$	$14.04 {\pm} 0.11$	$12.33 {\pm} 0.09$	$15.15 {\pm} 0.12$	$13.77 {\pm} 0.08$	$16.39 {\pm} 0.15$

Table 1: Full result comparison of SNR values of denoised signals between reported and generated versions.

2 Best Comparison

σ	\mathcal{M}_1 Reported	\mathcal{M}_1 Generated
0.05	27.69	
0.10	23.54	
0.15	20.59	
0.20	18.30	
0.25	16.50	
0.30	14.96	
0.35	13.59	
0.40	12.53	

Table 2: Best Comparison of \mathcal{M}_1

References

[1] D. B. Tay and J. Jiang, "Time-varying graph signal denoising via median filters," *IEEE Transactions on Circuits and Systems II: Express Briefs*, vol. 68, no. 3, pp. 1053–1057, 2021. DOI: 10.1109/TCSII.2020.3017800.

- [2] K. Qiu, X. Mao, X. Shen, X. Wang, T. Li, and Y. Gu, "Time-varying graph signal reconstruction," *IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Signal Processing*, vol. 11, no. 6, pp. 870–883, 2017. DOI: 10.1109/JSTSP.2017.2726969.
- [3] J. H. Giraldo, A. Mahmood, B. Garcia-Garcia, D. Thanou, and T. Bouwmans, "Reconstruction of time-varying graph signals via sobolev smoothness," *IEEE Transactions on Signal and Information Processing over Networks*, vol. 8, pp. 201–214, 2022. DOI: 10.1109/TSIPN.2022.3156886.