

## **MKT6v99.0U1 Special Topics: Bayesian Dynamic Models in Marketing**

Summer 2013

Instructor: Dr. Norris Bruce, PhD  
Meeting Time: Tuesday 10:30AM-2:30pm  
Class Room: SOM 1.117  
Office Hours: Tuesday 4:00pm-6:00pm, by appointment  
Office: SOM 3.220  
Phone: 972-883-6293  
Email: norris.bruce@utdallas.edu  
TA: Abhishek Rishabh

### **Course Description**

This is an advanced PhD seminar that introduces you to Bayesian dynamic models. Its objective is to help you learn how to develop, estimate, and assess these dynamic models; and how to add to the marketing dynamics literature.

### **Recommended Textbooks**

#### *General Bayesian Statistics:*

Bayesian Statistics and Marketing (2005). Peter E. Rossi, Greg M. Allenby, Rob McCulloch.

#### *Dynamic Linear Models:*

Petris, Petrone and Campagnoli (2009). Dynamic Linear Models with R. Springer.

West and Harrison (1999). Bayesian Forecasting and Dynamic Models. 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition, Springer.

#### *Dynamic Non-Linear Models:*

Branko Ristic, Sanjeev Arulampalam Neil Gordon (2004). Beyond the Kalman Filter: Particle Filters for Tracking Applications. Artech House Radar Library.

Other readings including journal articles and/or book chapters are referenced in the “Class Schedule, Topics and Readings” section below.

### **Course Requirements:**

*Course Project:* For this project students are encouraged to work in pairs. The purpose of the project is to have you apply some of the techniques covered in the course to a substantive marketing problem. My hope is that some of your ideas will eventually be publishable. Please submit a two page report by June 25th containing detailed explanation of the potential problem you want to work on, the plans for collecting the data, and the modeling approach you hope to

take. The project consists of two deliverables: 1) a copy of your code (properly documented and preferably written in Matlab); and 2) a 30-minutes presentation which should include a description of your problem, data, model, estimation and results.

### Weekly Schedule, Topics and Readings

Readings with asterisks are recommended, not required.

#### **Meeting 1, June 4: Course overview; introduction to Bayesian Dynamic Models**

Richard J. Meinhold and Nozer D. Singpurwalla (1983). Understanding the Kalman Filter. The American Statistician, Vol. 37, No. 2, pp. 123-127.

#### **Meeting 2, June 11: Bayesian Dynamic Linear Model (DLM)**

West and Harrison (1999), "Bayesian Forecasting and Dynamic Models", 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition, Springer (Ch. 4).

\*Carter, C., R. Kohn. 1994. On Gibbs sampling for state space models. Biometrika 81 541–553.

Frank M. Bass, Norris Bruce, Sumit Majumdar, and B. P. S. Murthi (2007). Wearout Effects of Different Advertising Themes: A Dynamic Bayesian Model of the Advertising-Sales Relationship. Marketing Science, vol. 26, issue 2, pages 179-195.

Norris I. Bruce, Natasha Zhang Foutz, Ceren Kolsarici (2012). Dynamic Effectiveness of Advertising and Word of Mouth in Sequential Distribution of New Products. Journal of Marketing Research: Vol. 49, No. 4, pp. 469-486.

#### **Meeting 3, June 18: Dynamic Factor Models**

Lopes, H.F. and West, M. (2004). Bayesian Model assessment in factor analysis. Statistica Sinica, 14, 41-67.

Lopes, Hedibert F., Esther Salazar, and Dani Gamerman (2008), "Spatial Dynamic Factor Analysis," Bayesian Analysis, 3 (4), 759–92.

- ① Norris I. Bruce, Kay Peters, Prasad A. Naik (2012). Discovering How Advertising Grows Sales and Builds Brands. Journal of Marketing Research: Vol. 49, No. 6, pp. 793-806.

#### **Meeting 4, June 25: Hierarchical DLM and its applications**

Gamerman and Migon (1993). Dynamic Hierarchical Models. Journal of the Royal Statistical Society; Series B, 55, 629–642.

Neelamegham and Chintagunta (2004). Modeling and Forecasting the Sales of Technology Products. Quantitative Marketing and Economics, 2, 195-232.

### **Meeting 5, July 2: Dynamic GLMS and Conditional Linear Models**

\*Ferreira and Gamerman (2000). Dynamic Generalized Linear Models: in Generalized Linear Models: A Bayesian Perspective, CRC.

\*Claudia Cargnoni, Peter Müller & Mike West (1997). Bayesian Forecasting of Multinomial Time Series through Conditionally Gaussian Dynamic Models. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*. Volume 92, Issue 438, pages 640-647.

Teixeira, Wedel and Pieters (2010). Moment-to-Moment Optimal Branding in TV-commercials: Preventing Avoidance by Pulsing. *Marketing Science*, Vol. 29, No. 5, pp. 783-804

④ Rutz, Oliver J.; Sonnier, Garrett P. (2011). The Evolution of Internal Market Structure. *Marketing Science*. Mar/Apr2011, Vol. 30 Issue 2, p274.

Gamerman (1998). Markov Chain Monte Carlo for Dynamic Generalized Linear Models. *Biometrika*, 85, 215-227.

### **Meeting 6: July 9: No Class – *Marketing Science Conference, Istanbul Turkey***

### **Meeting 7, July 16: Latent Variable Approach to Measurement Error in DLMs**

Bayesian instrumental variables pp183-187: *Bayesian Statistics and Marketing*, Rossi et al.

Naik, Prasad A.; Tsai, Chih-Ling (2000). Controlling Measurement Errors in Models of Advertising Competition. *Journal of Marketing Research (JMR)*;Feb2000, Vol. 37 Issue 1, p113.

 Garrett P. Sonnier, Leigh McAlister, and Oliver J. Rutz (2011). A Dynamic Model of the Effect of Online Communications on Firm Sales. *Marketing Science*. Vol. 30, No. 4, 702-716.

### **Meeting 8, July 23: Nonlinear Filters**

Understanding the Extended and Unscented Kalman Filters: in Beyond the Kalman Filter, Ristic et al (2004).

Jinhong Xie, X. Michael Song, Marvin Sirbu, Qiong Wang (1997). Kalman Filter Estimation of New Product Diffusion Models. *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. 34, No. 3 (Aug., 1997), pp. 378-393.

Prasad A. Naik, Ashutosh Prasad, Suresh P. Sethi (2208). Building Brand Awareness in Dynamic Oligopoly Markets. *Management Science*, Vol. 54, No. 1, pp. 129-138.

**Meeting 9, July 30: The Ensemble Kalman Filter**

Jonathan R. Strouda, Michael L. Steina, Barry M. Leshta, David J. Schwaba & Dmitry Beletskya (2010). An Ensemble Kalman Filter and Smoother for Satellite Data Assimilation. Journal of the American Statistical Association. Volume 105, Issue 491, 2010.

Chao Gao, Han Wang, Ensheng Weng, S. Lakshmivarahan, Yanfen Zhang, and Yiqi Luo (2011). Assimilation of multiple data sets with the ensemble Kalman filter to improve forecasts of forest carbon dynamics. Ecological Applications. Volume 21, Issue 5.

**Meeting 10, Aug. 6: Project Presentations:**

Research Question; Data Collection and Analysis; Model Development and Estimation; Results.

## Understanding the Kalman Filter

(American Statistician 1983)

 $\theta_t, \theta_{t+1}, \dots, \theta_n$  observable at  $t=t_1, \dots$  $\theta_t$ : state of nature unobservable $\theta_t = G_t \theta_{t-1} + w_t$  obs-error, Regressor AR(1) $y_t = F_t \theta_t + v_t \sim N(0, V_t)$  state of nature

↳ known quant

Dynamic, in system equation:  $\theta_t = G_t \theta_{t-1} + w_t \sim N(0, W_t)$ (assuming)  $w_t \perp w_t$  (indep) ↳ looking according to encr or sci. prior in time $\theta_t$ : position of satellite at time  $t$  $y_t$ : measurements of distance to the satellite

② angle of measure

 $v_t$ : measurement error $G_t$ : position and speed change over time (physical laws of orbit) $w_t$ : deviation from laws (non-uniformity of the earth gravitational field)param interest:  $\theta_t$ Familiarity / linear regression  
time series analysis $y_t$ : number of defective observed $\theta_1, \theta_2$ : true defective index of the process, & drift

$$\hat{\theta}_t = \theta_{1,t} + v_t, \quad \theta_{1,t} = \theta_{1,t-1} + w_{1,t} \quad \theta_{2,t} = \theta_{2,t-1} + w_{2,t}$$

$$\theta_t = G \theta_{t-1} + u_t \quad u_t = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ \theta_{1,t} \\ \theta_{2,t} \end{bmatrix} \quad u_t = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ \theta_{1,t-1} \\ \theta_{2,t-1} \end{bmatrix} \quad G = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\text{if } \sqrt{v_t} / \sqrt{w_t} = k \Rightarrow y_t - y_{t-1} \sim \text{ARIMA}(0, 1, 1) \quad \text{Box & Jenkins}$$

Kalman filter ~ Recursive procedure infer  $\theta_t$   
PfST of Natural Data & PfDf Stat. Natr. & PfST Natr.

$$P(\theta_t | Y_t) \propto P(Y_t | \theta_t) P(\theta_t | Y_{t-1})$$

Likelihood, prior dist

 $Y_{t-1} = (Y_{t-1}, Y_{t-2}, \dots, Y_1)$  matrix form

$$(\theta_{t-1} | Y_{t-1}) \sim N(G_{t-1} \Sigma_{t-1}) \quad \text{Posterior} \quad \text{look time } t$$

Rec. Proc. start at  $t=0$ ,  $\hat{\theta}_0, \Sigma_0$

$$\xrightarrow{\text{Stg 1}} (\theta_t | Y_{t-1}) \sim N(G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} + R_t, \Sigma_t)$$

$$\xrightarrow{\text{Stg 2}} (\theta_t | Y_t) \sim ? \quad \text{on observing } \theta_t \Rightarrow \text{nd: } \hat{\theta}_t = ? \quad P(\theta_t | Y_t) = ?$$

$$\text{err prediction: } e_t = Y_t - \hat{Y}_t = Y_t - F_t G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}$$

$$P(\theta_t | Y_t, Y_{t-1}) = P(\theta_t | Y_{t-1}) \propto P(e_t | Y_{t-1}, \theta_t) \propto P(e_t | Y_t)$$

$$\xrightarrow{\text{Stg 3}} \hat{\theta}_t = F_t \theta_t + v_t \Rightarrow e_t = F_t (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1})$$

$$\Rightarrow \hat{\theta}_t \sim N(0, V_t) \Rightarrow (e_t | \theta_t, Y_{t-1}) \sim N(F_t (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}), V_t)$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{[we bayes theorem]} \quad P(\theta_t | Y_t, Y_{t-1}) \propto P(e_t | \theta_t, Y_{t-1}) \times P(\theta_t | Y_{t-1})$$

$$(X_t) \sim N\left(\begin{pmatrix} \mu_1 \\ \mu_2 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} \Sigma_{11} & \Sigma_{12} \\ \Sigma_{21} & \Sigma_{22} \end{pmatrix}\right) \quad \text{Set } P(e_t | \theta_t, Y_{t-1}) d\theta_t$$

$$(X_t | X_{t-1} = x_{t-1}) \sim N\left(M_t + \Sigma_{12} \Sigma_{22}^{-1} (x_{t-1} - \mu_2), \Sigma_{11} - \Sigma_{12} \Sigma_{22}^{-1} \Sigma_{21}\right)$$

Regression func

Coefficient of least sq. reg  $x_2$  on  $x_2$  $X_t \leftrightarrow x_t \quad X_2 \leftrightarrow 0$ 

$$(\theta_t | Y_{t-1}) \sim N(G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} + R_t) \quad M_t \Leftrightarrow G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} + \Sigma_{22}^{-1} R_t$$

$$(e_t | \theta_t, Y_{t-1}) \sim N(F_t (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}), V_t)$$

$$\mu_1 + \Sigma_{12} R_t^{-1} (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}) \Leftrightarrow F_t (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1})$$

$$\Rightarrow (e_t | \theta_t, Y_{t-1}) \sim N(F_t (\theta_t - G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}), V_t), M_t \rightarrow 0 \quad \Sigma_{12} \Leftrightarrow F_t$$

$$\Sigma_{11} - \Sigma_{12} \Sigma_{22}^{-1} \Sigma_{21} = \Sigma_{11} - F_t R_t F_t' \quad F_t \nleftrightarrow V_t, \Sigma_{11} \nleftrightarrow V_t + F_t R_t F_t'$$

$$\Rightarrow [(\theta_t | Y_{t-1}) \sim N\left(\begin{pmatrix} G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} R_t & R_t F_t' \\ 0 & V_t + F_t R_t F_t' \end{pmatrix}\right)]$$

$$\Rightarrow (G_t | Y_{t-1}) \sim N\left[G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} + R_t F_t' (V_t + F_t R_t F_t')^{-1} e_t, R_t - R_t F_t' (V_t + F_t R_t F_t')^{-1} F_t R_t\right] \Rightarrow \text{posterior}$$

$$\text{Prior: } \theta_t \sim (G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}, R_t = G_t \Sigma_{t-1} G_t' + W_t)$$

$$e_t = Y_t - F_t G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1}$$

$$\text{Posterior: } \hat{\theta}_t = G_t \hat{\theta}_{t-1} + R_t F_t' (V_t + F_t R_t F_t')^{-1} e_t$$

$$\Sigma_t = R_t - R_t F_t' (V_t + F_t R_t F_t')^{-1} F_t R_t$$

evolution of series of regression Functions of  $(\theta_t | Y_{t-1})$   
= Learning process

GPS devices tracking mobile phones, signal processing, tracking

- Inverting Cov matrix (huge matr) is costly (Battle neck)

- Satellite picture  $\Rightarrow$  ensemble Common Filter

- Awareness as measure of enthusiasm, loyalty

- Sequential Monte Carlo

- Assumptions { ① normality  
② linearity  
③ State parameter

- Name: Linear Space model

- Sales function of advertising effectiveness/loyalty,

F\_t: Vector of known constant (linear or nonlinear)

G\_t: Known matrix related to vec. state

↳ could be advertising (Kelin Keller brand equity model)

- Strong data over time

- Attribution: Last touch point attributed to sales

(all learning done beforehand)

- stat. evolat for indiv  $\Rightarrow$  heterogeneity

⇒ identify segments

- Filter step: create cond. dist.  $\Rightarrow$  create posteriormove to next side of bar  $\equiv$  assume that as data

- heterogeneity is problem in max. Likelihood

- Gibbs sampler  $\Rightarrow$  very flexible

- MAD: mean absolute deviation

- goodness of fit: how good your track data

## How to estimate

### Bayesian Seminar

- retrospective analysis  $\Leftrightarrow$  go back & revise the prior (smoothing)
- general goal: (1) make inference (2) make forecast
- model well defined by

$$\begin{cases} \vec{\gamma}_t = F_t \vec{\theta}_t + \vec{v}_t \\ \vec{\theta}_t = G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t \end{cases}$$

vector  $\downarrow$  matrix  $\downarrow$   $\rightarrow$  variance  $w_t$   
(reg) (Varianc)  $w_t$

Prior:  $\vec{\theta}_0 | D_0 \sim N(m_0, C_0)$

$\vec{\theta}_{t-1} | D_{t-1} \sim N(m_{t-1}, C_{t-1})$   
posterior on  $t-1$

info set

Prior on  $t$ :  $\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1} \sim N(\bar{\theta}_t, R_t)$

$$E(\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1}) = \bar{\theta}_t = G_t m_{t-1}$$

$$V(\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1}) = R_t = G_t C_{t-1} G_t' + w_t$$

Predictive dist:  $\vec{Y}_t | D_{t-1} \sim N(F_t Q_t)$

$$E(\vec{Y}_t | D_{t-1}) = \vec{F}_t = F_t \bar{\theta}_t$$

$$V(\vec{Y}_t | D_{t-1}) = Q_t = F_t R_t F_t' + V_t$$

Posterior on  $t$ :  $Q_t | Y_t, D_{t-1} \sim N\left(\frac{(a_t)}{f_t}, \frac{(R_t R_t' F_t)}{(R_t F_t)' Q_t}\right)$

$$\text{Cov}(\vec{\theta}_t, \vec{Y}_t) = \text{Cov}(\vec{\theta}_t, F_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + \vec{v}_t) = \text{Var}(\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1}) F_t R_t F_t'$$

MVN theory:  $\vec{F}_t | \vec{\theta}_t \sim N(m_t, C_t)$

$$m_t = a_t + A_t(Y_t - F_t) \quad C_t = R_t(I - F_t A_t) \quad A_t = R_t F_t Q_t^{-1}$$

$$\text{MSE} = e^2 \quad \text{MADG} = \text{abs}(e)$$

plays with:  $w \gg v$  ( $v \gg w$ )  $\rightarrow$  problematic

The Dynamic Linear Model (DLM)

- given time  $t$ , past, present future independent (Conditional independence)

$\{m_t, C_t\}$  contains all relevant info about fut.

$\equiv$  suffic. for  $\{Y_{t+1}, \theta_{t+1}, \dots, Y_{t+k}, \theta_{t+k}\}$

- Any lin. Comb. of indep. normal DLMs is a normal DLM

-  $\vec{\theta}_t = (\vec{\theta}_{t1}, \vec{\theta}_{t2})$  two series of compnt evolue independently

-  $P(Y_t | D_{t-1}) = P(Y_t | \vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1}) \cdot P(\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1})$  - inf from any relevant src

- Forecast & Compnt Consistent with total forecast

- Mgmt by Expp. of relevant src of info external to syst.

② Feedback

- DLM: characterized by quadruple  $\{F, G, V, W\} = \{F_t, G_t, V_t, W_t\}$

$\Rightarrow (Y_t | D_t) \sim N(F_t \vec{\theta}_t, V_t)$

$(\vec{\theta}_t | D_{t-1}) \sim N(G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t, V_t)$   $\rightarrow$  observation equation

$Y_t = F_t \vec{\theta}_t + v_t \sim N(0, V_t)$   $\vec{\theta}_t = G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t \sim N(0, W_t)$   $\rightarrow$  evolution, state, syst. eq.

$\vec{\theta}_t = G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t \sim N(0, W_t)$   $\rightarrow$  evolution, state, syst. eq.

$M_t = F_t \vec{\theta}_t$ : mean response / level  $\rightarrow$  observational error matrix

$\rightarrow$  design matrix of known unmeasured independent variables

Def:  $\{F, G\}$ : const.  $\rightarrow$  time series DLM TSDLM

② TSDLM: obs. & eva. var = cte  $\vec{\theta}_t = \text{Const. DLM}$

$\{F_t, G_t, V_t, W_t\} \leftrightarrow$  classical time series

③

general DLM:  $\{\vec{\theta}_t, G_t, V_t, W_t\}$

$$(Y_t | \vec{\theta}_t) \sim N(F_t \vec{\theta}_t, V_t) \quad (\vec{\theta}_t | D_t) \sim N(m_t, C_t)$$

$$\text{obs. eq.: } Y_t = F_t \vec{\theta}_t + v_t \quad v_t \sim N(0, V_t)$$

$$\text{syst. eq.: } \vec{\theta}_t = G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t \quad w_t \sim N(0, W_t)$$

$$\text{Initial info: } (\vec{\theta}_0 | D_0) \sim N(m_0, C_0)$$

Cover and k-step marginal dist:

$$(a) \text{State dist: } (\vec{\theta}_{t+k} | D_t) \sim N(a_{t+k}(k), R_{t+k}(k))$$

$$(b) \text{Forecast dist: } (Y_{t+k} | D_t) \sim N(F_{t+k} \vec{\theta}_{t+k}, Q_{t+k})$$

$$(b) \text{State Cover: } C[\vec{\theta}_{t+k} | D_t] = C(k, i)$$

$$(b) \text{Obsn. Cover: } C[Y_{t+k} | D_t] = F_{t+k}^T C(k, i) F_{t+k}$$

$$(c) \text{Other Cover: } C[\vec{\theta}_{t+k} | D_t] = C(k, i) F_{t+k}$$

$$C[Y_{t+k} | D_t] = F_{t+k}^T C(k, i)$$

$$f_t(k) = F_{t+k}^T C(k) \quad Q_t(k) = F_{t+k}^T R_t(k) F_{t+k} + V_t$$

$$a_t(k) = G_{t+k}^T C(k-1) \quad R_t(k) = G_{t+k}^T R_t(k-1) G_{t+k} + W_t$$

$$C_t(k, i) = G_{t+k}^T C_t(k-1, i) \quad k = i+1, \dots$$

$$a_t(i) = m_t \quad R_t(i) = C_t(i, i) = R_t(i)$$

$V_t = V$   $\forall t$   $\vec{F} = \frac{1}{V} V$  observation precision

Conjugate: DLM definition:

$$\text{obs. equation: } Y_t = F_t \vec{\theta}_t + v_t \quad v_t \sim N(0, V_t)$$

$$\text{sys. eq.: } \vec{\theta}_t = G_t \vec{\theta}_{t-1} + w_t \quad w_t \sim N(0, W_t)$$

$$\text{Initial info: } (\vec{\theta}_0 | D_0, \phi) \sim N(m_0, V C_0)$$

$$(\phi | D_0) \sim G\left[\frac{n_0}{2}, \frac{n_0 S_0}{2}\right]$$

initial quant:  $m_0, C_0, n_0, S_0$ , specif:  $\frac{1}{V} F_t^T G_t + W_t$

$$E(\phi | D_0) = \frac{1}{S_0} \rightarrow$$
 prior point est. of obsv. variance  $V$

Student t-distr:  $\{n \times 1\}$  multivar t dis (df = deg freedom)

mean  $m$ , postiv. def. scale matrx:  $G$

$$P(B) \propto \{B + (B-m)^T C (B-m)\}^{-\frac{df}{2}}$$

$$B \sim T_k(M, G) \quad E(B) = m \quad R(B) = \frac{C}{k-2}$$

DLM dist result

$$\textcircled{1} \text{ Cond on } V: (Y_{t-1} | D_{t-1}, V) \sim N(m_{t-1}, V C_{t-1}^*)$$

$$(Y_t | D_{t-1}, V) \sim N(a_t, V R_t^*)$$

$$(Y_t | D_{t-1}, V) \sim N(F_t, V C_t^*)$$

$$(Y_t | D_t, V) \sim N(m_t, V C_t^*)$$

$$a_t = G_t m_{t-1} \quad R_t^* = G_t C_{t-1}^* G_t' + W_t^*$$

$$F_t = F_t a_t \quad Q_t^* = I + F_t R_t^* F_t$$

$$e_t = Y_t - F_t \quad A_t = R_t^* F_t / Q_t^*$$

$$m_t = a_t + A_t e_t \quad C_t^* = R_t^* - A_t A_t' Q_t^*$$

\textcircled{2} For precision:  $\vec{\Phi} = V^{-1}$

$$(\phi | D_{t-1}) \sim G\left[\frac{n_{t-1}}{2}, \frac{n_{t-1} S_{t-1}}{2}\right]$$

$$(\phi | D_t) \sim G\left[\frac{n_t}{2}, \frac{n_t S_t}{2}\right]$$

\textcircled{3} Unconditional on  $V$ :

$$(Y_{t-1} | D_{t-1}) \sim T_{n_{t-1}}[m_{t-1}, C_{t-1}]$$

$$(Y_t | D_{t-1}) \sim T_{n_t}[a_t, R_t]$$

# Bayesian Seminar

$$\begin{aligned}
 (Y_t | D_{t-1}) &\sim T_{n_{t-1}}[F_t, Q_t] & R_t = S_{t-1} R_t^* \\
 (G_t | D_t) &\sim T_n[m_t, C_t] & G_t = S_t - Q_t^* \\
 C_t &= S_t C_t^* \\
 \textcircled{1} \quad \text{Operational def. of updating eq:} \\
 Q_t &= F_t R_t F_t + S_t & A_t = R_t F_t / Q_t \\
 n_t &= n_{t-1} + 1 & S_t = S_{t-1} \frac{S_{t-1}^T (e_t^2 - 1)}{n_t} \\
 m_t &= a_t + A_t e_t & C_t = \frac{S_t}{S_{t-1}} (R_t - A_t A_t^* Q_t)
 \end{aligned}$$

- Conditionally independent model components
- Forecast as prob. dist. → incorp expert info
- sequential model def. & anal. ⇒ as info arrives model param revised
- step ahead forecast:  $p(Y_t | \bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, D_{t-1})$  prior  $(\bar{\Phi}_t | P_{t-1})$
- posterior:  $p(\bar{\Phi}_t | Y_t, D_{t-1})$

- simple reg: (saves as func. of prev. elast. change in time)

$$\begin{aligned}
 Y_t &= \alpha_t + \beta_t X_t + 2\epsilon_t & \epsilon_t \sim N(0, V) \\
 a_t &= a_{t-1} + S_{t-1} & \text{info set: } D_t = D_{t-1} \cup Y_t \\
 \beta_t &= \beta_{t-1} + \delta \beta_t & \rightarrow \text{random changes}
 \end{aligned}$$

- when  $V \gg W$  responding properly could happen, but  $V \gg W \equiv$  data noisy you can't

-  $\Phi_t$ : latent measure (goal: find true measure)

- Dynamic Bayesian = dynamic w.r.t parameter

- monitoring and assessment through bayes factors

posterior at  $t-1$ :  $(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | D_{t-1}) \sim N(m_{t-1}, C_{t-1})$

$$\begin{aligned}
 Y_t &= \bar{\Phi}_t + \epsilon_t & \text{prior: } (\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1}) \sim N(m_{t-1}, R_t) \quad R_t = C_{t-1} + W \\
 \bar{\Phi}_t &= \bar{\Phi}_{t-1} + \omega_t & \text{1-step ahead: } (Y_t | D_{t-1}) \sim N(F_t, Q_t), F_t = m_{t-1} \\
 \text{forecast error, etc.} & \quad \text{posterior at } t: (\bar{\Phi}_t | D_t) \sim N(m_t, C_t) & Q_t = R_t + F_t^* Q_{t-1} F_t
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{(intuition)} \quad m_t &= m_{t-1} + A_t(Y_t - F_t), C_t = (R_t - R_t^2 / Q_t) = R_t V / Q_t \\
 \text{rate of update} & \quad A_t = R_t / Q_t \Rightarrow \text{bigger when } Q_t \text{ lower} \\
 \text{of mean} & \quad \text{bound by one} \equiv \text{data more informative}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Variance evolve: } C_t &= R_t (1 - \frac{R_t}{R_t + V_t}) \quad \text{learning as info comes} \\
 & \quad \text{in sample measure: } \text{MAE: mean absolute deviation} \\
 & \quad \text{prior: } \text{MSE: mean square errors} \\
 & \quad \text{prior: } \text{well defined} \quad \text{DLM: } \bar{\Phi}_t \sim N(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, W_t) \\
 & \quad \text{prior: } \text{fully defines } \bar{\Phi}_t \sim N(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, W_t) \quad \text{no singularity problem}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{(intuition)} \quad \text{next side of bar} \equiv \text{param is now known} \equiv \text{data} \equiv \text{variables} \\
 \text{- trajectory of param = e.g. adv. goodwill} \\
 \text{- latent sample: utility, goodwill}
 \end{aligned}$$

- No data: moment prior = posterior moment

$R_t$ : inflated (slight inflation in error)

keep have missing data  $\equiv$  increased uncertainty  
missing data tells us something about it = uncertainty

- out of sample forecast: break 100 Sample into two  
80 for in sample 20 for out of sample

- K-step ahead

- ③ - smoothing by going back: Retrospective approach
- $m_t = m_{t-1} + A_t(Y_t - F_t)$
  - $A_t = R_t / Q_t = \frac{C_{t-1} + W}{C_{t-1} + W} \Rightarrow \frac{dA_t}{d(W)} < 0$
  - w influences how posterior mean adapts to data
  - MAD:  $\sum_{t=1}^T |e_t| / T$  MSE:  $\sum_{t=1}^T e_t^2 / T$   $e_t = y_t - F_t$
  - two phases
    - ① use prior  $(\bar{\Phi}_t | P_{t-1}) \Rightarrow$  calc posterior  $(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_t)$
    - ② take posterior  $(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | D_{t-1}) \Rightarrow$  calc prior next  $(\bar{\Phi}_t | P_t)$  (mean equation)

phase 2:  $\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1} \sim N(m_{t-1}, C_{t-1})$

calc prior:  $\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1} \sim N(a_t, R_t)$

$$E(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1}) = a_t = G_t m_{t-1}$$

$$\text{Var}(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1}) = R_t = G_t C_{t-1} G_t^* + W_t$$

④ pred. dist:  $Y_t | D_{t-1} \sim N(F_t, Q_t)$

$$E(Y_t | D_{t-1}) = F_t = F_t a_t \quad \text{Var}(Y_t | D_{t-1}) = Q_t = F_t' R_t F_t + W_t$$

⑤ posterior on t:  $\bar{\Phi}_t | Y_t | D_{t-1} \sim N\left[\frac{a_t}{m_t}, \frac{R_t}{m_t + R_t}\right]$

$$\text{Cov}(\bar{\Phi}_t, Y_t) = \text{Cov}(\bar{\Phi}_t, F_t \bar{\Phi}_t + 2\epsilon_t) = \text{Var}(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1}) F_t = R_t F_t$$

⑥ k-step ahead forecast:  $\{P_t(k)\} = E(Y_{t+k} | D_t) = F_{t+k} a_t$

$$Q_t(k) = F_{t+k}' R_t F_{t+k} + V_{t+k}$$

recursive calc:  $a_t(k) = G_{t+k} a_{t+(k-1)}$

$$R_t(k) = G_{t+k} R_{t+(k-1)} G_{t+k} + W_{t+k}$$

$a_t(0) = m_t \quad R_t(0) = C_t$

⑦ retrospective analysis:  $\bar{\Phi}_t | D_{t-1} \sim N\left[\frac{a_t}{m_{t-1}}, \frac{R_t}{m_{t-1} + R_t}\right]$

push  $\bar{\Phi}_t$  to the other side:

$$\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | \bar{\Phi}_t, D_{t-1} \sim N[m_t + B_t(\bar{\Phi}_t - a_t), C_{t-1} - B_t R_t B_t^*]$$

where  $B_t = G_t C_{t-1} R_t^{-1} \Rightarrow$  update idea about post

$$E(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | D_t) = E(E(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | \bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, D_{t-1}) | D_t) = E(m_{t-1} + B_t(\bar{\Phi}_t - a_t)) = m_{t-1} + B_t(m_t - a_t)$$

$$\text{Var}(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | D_t) = \text{Var}(E(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | \bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, D_{t-1}) | D_t) + E(\text{Var}(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | \bar{\Phi}_{t-1}, D_{t-1})) | D_t = C_{t-1} - B_t R_t B_t^* + B_t^* C_t B_t = C_{t-1} - B_t^* (R_t - C_t) B_t$$

⑧  $\bar{\Phi}_t, \bar{\Phi}_t$  Conditionally independent given  $y_{t+1}$ , since if know  $\bar{\Phi}_{t-1}$  don't need  $y_{t+1}$  ⇒ sequence of conditions (once we know  $\bar{\Phi}_t$ ,  $\bar{\Phi}_{t-1}$  does not require the data.)

⑨ forward filtering backward sampling (FFBS):

① go forward and get:  $(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_t) \sim N(m_t, C_t)$  determine dist. fully

② go backward:  $p(\bar{\Phi}_t | \bar{\Phi}_{t+1}, D_t)$

MCMC bayesian: not just point estimate, but dist.

⑩ conditional independent:

$$\bar{\Phi}^T = \{\bar{\Phi}_0, \bar{\Phi}_1, \bar{\Phi}_2, \dots, \bar{\Phi}_T\}$$

$$P(\bar{\Phi}^T | D_t) = P(\bar{\Phi}_t | D_t) P(\bar{\Phi}_{t-1} | \bar{\Phi}_t, D_{t-1}) \dots P(\bar{\Phi}_1 | \bar{\Phi}_0, D_0) P(\bar{\Phi}_0 | D_0)$$

② simulation based computation:

objective: joint posterior sample:  $p(\theta^* | \Omega^*, D_T)$

⑩ each cycle: FFBS

① first do YF: get  $m_t, C_t$

② Do bw sampling: access dist  
draw last & come back

⑪  $m_t, C_t$ : initial guess  $\Rightarrow$  revised in bw

⑫ if not finite variance  $\begin{cases} \text{① Frequentist: max likelihood} \\ \text{② Bayesian: simple reg.} \end{cases}$

⑬ independent  $\Rightarrow$  estimate each variance separately

⑭ Elements of  $F$  and  $G$ :  $\begin{cases} \text{① without forgetting} \\ \text{② forgetting} \\ \text{③ Ban et al.} \end{cases}$

⑮ MCMC in PGM:

repeat  $p(\Omega^* | \theta^* | D_T)$  iterative resample

① apply FFBS to draw  $\theta^*$  from  $p(\theta^* | \Omega^*, D_T)$

② Draw new value  $\Omega^*$  from  $p(\Omega^* | \theta^*, D_T)$

⑯ standard Gibbs - Conjugate prior for  $B$  constant of  $\Omega^*$   
if not  $\Rightarrow$  metropolis hastings.

other Monte Carlo

⑰  $y_t = \alpha_t + \beta_t^\top X_t + \varepsilon_t$   $\varepsilon_t \sim N(0, V) \equiv$  Rand. Walk Param eval  
 $\alpha_t = \alpha_{t-1} + w_t \rightarrow \beta_t = \beta_{t-1} + w_{2t}$  ( $w_t, w_{2t} \sim N(0, W)$ )  
 $\Psi_t = (\alpha_t, \beta_t)$ : state vector  $\Psi_0 \sim N(m_0, C_0)$   
 $\rightarrow p(\Psi_T | y_T, V, W)$  FFBS  
 $\downarrow$   
 $p(W, V | \Psi_t, y_T)$  Gibbs Sampling

⑱  $F_t = [1 \ X_t]$   $G$ : identity matrix (transition matrix)

⑲ Pritt: Fix parameter effect

Reversible jump MCMC (Factor loading)

① number of factors  $K$  as parameter

②  $K$ -factor model:  $y_t = \beta f_t + \varepsilon_t$   $f_t \sim \text{iid } N(0, I_K)$   
 $\beta \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times K}$   $\varepsilon_t \sim \text{iid } N(0, \Sigma)$   
 $\text{diag}(\sigma_1^2, \dots, \sigma_m^2) \in \Sigma$

$$\Omega = V(y_t | \Omega) = V(y_t | \beta, \Sigma) \quad \Omega = \beta \beta^\top + \Sigma$$

$$V(y_t | \beta) = \sigma_t^2 \quad \text{Cov}(y_{it}, y_{jt} | \beta) = 0 \quad \text{Var}(y_{it}) = \sum_{j=1}^K \beta_{ij}^2 \sigma_j^2$$

$$Cov(y_{it}, y_{jt}) = \sum_{k=1}^K \beta_{ik} \beta_{jk} \sigma_k^2$$

$$y_t = F \beta + \varepsilon_t \rightarrow (T \times m)$$

$$T \times m \rightarrow E(T \times K) \quad \beta \in \mathbb{R}^{T \times K} \quad \varepsilon_t \sim N(0, \Sigma)$$

$$p(y_t | \beta, \Sigma) \propto 1 / \sqrt{\det(\Sigma)} \exp(-\frac{1}{2} y_t^\top \Sigma^{-1} y_t)$$

$$\Rightarrow p(y | \beta, \Sigma) \propto |\Sigma|^{-T/2} \exp(-\frac{1}{2} y^\top \Sigma^{-1} y)$$

model inverse  $\rightarrow \beta^* = P \beta^T$ ,  $P_t^* = P_t P_t^T$   $P \rightarrow$  any ortho.  $K \times K$  matrix  
block lower triang. matrix (positive semi-def.)  
identification, ex. unitary interpretation  
loading matrix elements:  $r = m - \frac{K(K-1)}{2}$  Free param

β rank  $r$ :  $r \leq K \Rightarrow \exists Q: \beta Q = 0, Q^\top Q = I$  ⑧

orthogonal matrix  $M$ :  $\Omega = P \beta^T + \Sigma = (\beta + M Q^\top)(\beta + M Q)$

+  $(\Sigma - M M^\top)$  lack of identification, Symmetry or multimodal

③ Prior:  $\beta_{ij} \sim N(0, C_{ij})$  when  $i \neq j$   $\rightarrow$  rather large

$\beta_{ii} \sim N(0, C_{ii})$ ,  $1(\beta_{ii} > 0)$  upper diag.  $\Rightarrow$  positive diag

$\sigma_i^2$ : idiosyncratic variance  $\sim IG((V+T)/2, (2S^2 + d_i)/2)$

Prior deg form  $\xrightarrow{\text{Prior}} \xleftarrow{\text{How to diffuse prior}}$

$\propto p(\sigma_i^2) \propto \frac{1}{\sigma_i^2}$  Heywood problem (tend to zero  $\Rightarrow$  singularity)

④ Full cond posterior:

$$f_t \sim N(I_K + \beta \Sigma^{-1} \beta^\top, \beta \Sigma^{-1} \beta^\top + I_K)$$

$$\sigma_i^2 \sim IG((V+T)/2, (2S^2 + d_i)/2) \quad d_i = (y_i - F \beta_i)^\top (y_i - F \beta_i)$$

⑤ Full Conditional:  $\beta_i \sim N(m_i, C_i)$   $i = 1, \dots, K$

$$m_i = C_i(C_i^{-1} \mu_0 + \xi_i^{-2} P_i^\top y_i)$$

$$C_i^{-1} = C_0^{-1} I_i + \xi_i^{-2} P_i^\top P_i$$

$$\beta_i \sim N(m_i, C_i) \quad i = 1, \dots, K$$

$$m_i = C_i(C_i^{-1} \mu_0 + \xi_i^{-2} F_i^\top \xi_i)$$

$$C_i^{-1} = C_0^{-1} I_K + \xi_i^{-2} F_i^\top F_i$$

⑥ dependence on  $\alpha$  show  $\beta \rightarrow \beta_K \rightarrow F \rightarrow F_K \quad G_K = (\beta_K | \Sigma)$

⑦ RJMCMC w/o Metropolis Hastings  $(K, \theta_K) \rightarrow (K', G_{K'})$   
reversible jump to maintain diff. sim.  $\xrightarrow{\text{detail swap balance of chain}}$

⑧ For  $\forall K \in K$   $q_{KL}(\beta_K) = N(b_K, b_K B_K)$   $i = 1, \dots, m$

$$q_{KL}(\sigma_i^2) = IG(a, a \sigma_{ki}^{-2}) \quad a, b \text{ scale param}$$

$$\Rightarrow q_K(\theta_K) = q_{KL}(\beta_K | \Sigma) = q_{KL}(\beta_K) \prod_{i=1}^m q_{KL}(\sigma_i^2)$$

⑨ accept reject ratio:

$$a = \min \{ f_{KL}, \frac{p(\theta_K | \Omega_K, G_K) \cdot p(\theta_K | \Omega_K) p(K)}{p(\theta_{K'} | \Omega_{K'}, G_{K'}) \cdot p(\theta_{K'} | \Omega_{K'}) p(K' | K \rightarrow K')} \}$$

Spatial Dynamic Factor analysis 2008

① temporal dependance  $\rightarrow$  latent factors (trend, seasonality)  
spatial dependance  $\rightarrow$  Factor loading (location, stoch)  
reduce complexity

② nonseparable & nonstationary space-time models (standard dynamic factor model):

$$y_t = \mu_t^* + \beta f_t + \varepsilon_t \quad \varepsilon_t \sim N(0, \Sigma)$$

$$\text{mean } \mu_t = T f_{t-1} + w_t \quad w_t \sim N(0, A)$$

$$\text{spacetime } f_t = T f_{t-1} + w_t \quad w_t \sim N(0, A)$$

$$y_t = (y_{1t}, \dots, y_{Nt})^\top \quad N \text{-dim. Vect. of obs.}$$

$$f_t: m \text{-dim. Vect. of common factor} \quad m \in \mathbb{N}$$

$$\Sigma = \text{diag}(\sigma_1^2, \dots, \sigma_N^2) \quad A = \text{diag}(A_1, \dots, A_m)$$

dynamic evolution of factors  $T = \text{diag}(V_1, \dots, V_m)$

③ Conditionally independent, distance-based Gaussian process  
or Gaussian random field (GRF)

$$P_{ij} \sim GRF(\mu_j | P^*, T_j^2 | P_j, \cdot) \equiv N(\mu_j | P_j^\star, T_j^2 R_{ij})$$

$$R_{ik} = P_{ik} / (1 | S_2 - S_1 |) \quad k = 1, \dots, N \quad j = 1, \dots, m$$

## ④ Bessel function

⑤ mean level of the space-time process option  $\mu_t^{y^*}$

i) Constant mean level model:  $\mu_t^{y^*} = \mu^y \quad \forall t$

ii) regression model:  $\mu_t^{y^*} = X_t^y \mu^y$

$$X_t^y = (1_N, X_{1t}^y, \dots, X_{yt}^y) \quad \text{q time varying cov}$$

iii) dynamic Ceff model

$$\mu_t^{y^*} = X_t^y \mu^y \quad \mu^y \sim N(\mu_{t-1}^y, W)$$

$$(6) Cov(y_{it}, y_{it+h}) = \sum_{k=1}^m (2\pi Y_k^h) (I - Y_k^2)^{-1} (\Gamma_k^2 p(u, \phi) + M_{ik} \beta_{jk})$$

⑥ weekly seasonal:  $\beta = (\beta_{11}, 0, \dots, \beta_{10}, 0) \quad T = \text{diag}(T_1, \dots, T_{10})$

$$\Gamma_2 = \begin{pmatrix} \cos(2\pi k p) & \sin(2\pi k p) \\ -\sin(2\pi k p) & \cos(2\pi k p) \end{pmatrix} \quad k=1, \dots, h = P_2$$

$$(7) \mu_t^{y^*} = 0, \quad M_j \beta^* = X_j^y \mu^y \quad \Rightarrow \quad y = F \beta + \epsilon \quad y = (y_1, \dots, y_T)$$

$$F = (f_1, \dots, f_T)^T \quad [T \times m]$$

$$\text{likelihood: } p(y | \theta, F, \beta, m) = (2\pi)^{-TN/2} \prod_{j=1}^T \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^m e^{-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=1}^m (y_j - f_j \beta_i)^2}$$

$$\theta = (\sigma, \lambda, Y, M, T, \phi) \quad \sigma = (\sigma_1^2, \dots, \sigma_N^2)$$

$$\lambda = (\lambda_1, \dots, \lambda_m) \quad Y = (Y_1, \dots, Y_m)^T \quad M = (M_1, \dots, M_m)^T$$

$$T = (T_1^2, \dots, T_{10}^2)^T \quad \phi = (\phi_1, \dots, \phi_m)^T \quad \text{etr}(x) = \exp(\ln(x))$$

## ⑦ Conjugate Prior

$$(8) \boxed{\text{prior}} \quad f_0 \sim N(m_0, C_0) \quad \sigma_i^2 \sim \text{IG}(n_{\sigma}/2, n_{\sigma} S_{\sigma}/2) \quad i=1-N$$

$$\lambda_j \sim \text{IG}(n_{\lambda}/2, n_{\lambda} S_{\lambda}/2)$$

$$(9) \quad Y \text{ specification: } (i) \quad Y_j \sim \text{N}_{(-1, 1)}(m_Y, S_Y) \quad \text{prior: } \widetilde{\text{truncate normal } (-1, 1)}$$

$$(ii) \quad Y_j \sim \text{N}_{(-1, 1)}(m_Y, S_Y) + (1-d)\delta(Y_j) \quad d \in (0, 1) + a, m_Y, S_Y \text{ hyperparam.}$$

$$(10) \quad \mu_j^y \sim \phi_j \tau_j^2:$$

(i) vague but proper priors

(ii) reference type:  $\mu_j^y \sim N(m_{\mu}, S_{\mu})$ ,  $\phi_j \sim \text{IG}(2, b)$

$$\{j \mid \text{IG}(n_{\mu}/2, n_{\mu} S_{\mu}/2) \text{ hyperparam. } m_{\mu}, S_{\mu}, n_{\mu}\}$$

$$(11) \quad \pi_{IG}(\tau_j^2, \phi_j) = \pi_{IG}(\tau_j^2) \pi_{IG}(\phi_j) \propto \tau_j^{-(n_{\mu}+2)} e^{-S_{\mu} \tau_j^2} e^{-\phi_j^{-1}}$$

$$(12) \quad \pi_R(M_j \beta | \tau_j^2, \phi_j) = \pi_R(M_j \beta | \tau_j^2, \phi_j) \pi_R(\tau_j^2, \phi_j)$$

$$\pi_R(M_j \beta | \tau_j^2, \phi_j) = 1$$

$$\pi_R(\tau_j^2 | \phi_j) = \pi_R(\tau_j^2) \pi_R(\phi_j) \propto \tau_j^{-2} \{ \text{tr}(W_{\phi_j}^2) - \frac{1}{N-\beta_j} \} \tau_j^{1/2}$$

$$W_{\phi_j} = ((\partial/\partial \phi_j) R \phi_j) R \phi_j^T \quad [I_N - X_j^y \beta^* (X_j^y \beta^* R \phi_j^{-1} X_j^y \beta^*)^{-1} X_j^y \beta^* R \phi_j^{-1}]$$

$$w_{\phi_j} = ((\partial/\partial \phi_j) R \phi_j) R \phi_j^T$$

$$(13) \quad \boxed{\text{prior const}} \quad p(y_{T+h} | y) = \int p(y_{T+h} | f_{T+h}, \beta, \theta) \cdot p(f_{T+h} | f_T, \beta, \theta)$$

$$\times p(f_T | \beta, \theta | y) df_{T+h} df_T d\beta d\theta$$

$$(y_{T+h} | f_{T+h}, \beta, \theta) \sim N(\beta f_{T+h}, \Sigma)$$

$$(f_{T+h} | f_T, \beta, \theta) \sim N(M_h | V_h) \quad M_h = T f_T$$

$$V_h = \sum_{n=1}^h T^{n-1} A(T^{n-1})$$

## ⑬ Interpolation

$$S_n = \{S_{N+1}, \dots, S_{N+n}\}$$

$$p(\beta^n | y^*) = \int p(\beta^n | \beta^0, \theta) p(f_{T+h}^0 | y^*) d\beta^0 d\theta$$

$$p(\beta^n | \beta^0, \theta) = \prod_{j=1}^m p(\beta_{ij}^n | \beta_{ij}^0, M_j \beta^0, \tau_j^2, \phi_j)$$

$$(\beta_{ij}^n | \beta_{ij}^0) \sim N \left[ \left( \frac{x_{ij} \beta^0}{x_{ij} \beta^0 + R_{ij}^{\phi,n}} \right) M_j \beta^0, \tau_j^2 \left( \frac{R_{ij}^{\phi,n}}{R_{ij}^{\phi,n} + R_{ij}^{\beta,n}} \right) \right]$$

$$\beta_{ij}^0 | \beta_{ij}^0, \theta \sim N(x_{ij} \beta^0 / (x_{ij} \beta^0 + R_{ij}^{\phi,n}), R_{ij}^{\phi,n} / (R_{ij}^{\phi,n} + R_{ij}^{\beta,n}))$$

$$p(\beta^n | y^*) = 2^{-\sum_{l=1}^L p(\beta_l^n | \beta_l^0, \theta^{(l)})}$$

$$\hat{E}(y^n | y^*) = 2^{-\sum_{l=1}^L \beta_l^{(2)} \beta_l^{(2)}}$$

⑭ Condition on  $m$ , posterior dist. of  $(F, \beta, \theta)$

$$p(F, \beta, \theta | y) \propto \prod_{t=1}^T p(y_t | f_t, \beta, \theta) p(f_t | m_t, C_0) \prod_{t=1}^T p(f_t | f_{t-1})$$

$$\times \prod_{j=1}^m p(\beta_{ij}) | M_j \beta^0, \tau_j^2, \phi_j) p(Y_j) p(\phi_j) \cdot p(M_j \beta^0) p(\tau_j^2 | \phi_j)$$

$$\times \prod_{i=1}^N p(\phi_i^2)$$

$$(15) \quad \Phi_m = (F_m, \beta_m, \theta_m) \quad \boxed{\text{proposal dist.}}$$

$$q_m(\Phi_m) = \prod_{j=1}^m f_N(f_{ij} | M_{fij}, \sigma_{fij}) f_N(\beta_{ij} | M_{\beta_{ij}}, \beta_{ij}^0)$$

$$f_N(Y_j | M_{Yj}, \sigma_{Yj}) \times \prod_{j=1}^m f_{IG}(2, 1, d, d M_{\phi_j}) f_N(\phi_j | M_{\phi_j}, \phi_j^0)$$

$$f_{IG}(\phi_j | 1, \sigma_{\phi_j}) \times \prod_{i=1}^N f_{IG}(\phi_i^2 | g, g M_{\phi_i}) f_{IG}(\phi_i^2 | 1, \sigma_{\phi_i}^2)$$

$a, b, c, d, \sigma, F, G$ : tuning param.  $M_x, V_x$  sample mean & cov.

$$p(y_m, \Phi_m) = p(y_m | \Phi_m) p(\Phi_m | m) p(m)$$

⑮ Metropolis Hastings

accept  $(m', \Phi_{m'})$  with probability:

$$\alpha = \min \{ 1, \frac{p(y_m, \Phi_m)}{p(y_{m'}, \Phi_{m'})} \times \frac{q_m(\Phi_{m'}) q(m' | m)}{q_{m'}(\Phi_m) q(m | m')} \}$$

- ① Werout Effects of different advertising themes, (Bar, Bruce 2007) - adv. sales relationship  
 - theme: price vs. prod ad. - werout vs. forgetting  
 - reallocation of resources across themes  $\rightarrow$  imprint demand  
 Research Q: ① How different werout effect for different theme?  
 ② How researcher can assess model of werout effect?  
 ③ How nature of interaction b/w themes?  
 ④ How alloc resrc for adv bdgt?

- Gibbs Sampling and DLM

- Dynamic path of response coeff over time  
 Literature related ① Response model ③ Need for time-varying coeff.  
 ② wein and werout ④ need for interaction  
 ③ forgetting  
 ⑤ Differential Effects of Werout across themes (Experiment)

- demand advertising expenditure

$$\begin{aligned} \text{rate of } \frac{dG(t)}{dt} &= q(A_t) - S(G_t) \\ \text{Change in Goodwill } \frac{dG}{dt} &\downarrow \xrightarrow{\text{adv. Expnd.}} \text{Copy weout param} \quad \xrightarrow{\text{repetition}} \\ q(A_t) &= -\alpha(A_t)q + (1-I(A_t))S(1-q) \quad \alpha(A_t) = C_t + w_t A_t \\ \frac{dq}{dt} &= -\alpha(A_t)q + (1-I(A_t))S(1-q) \quad m \rightarrow \# \text{ themes} \\ \frac{dG}{dt} &= \sum_{i=1}^m q_i(g_i(\beta_i) + \beta_i \sum_{j \neq i} h(A_i, A_j)) - S_{\text{tot}} \\ &\quad \downarrow \quad \downarrow \quad \downarrow \\ \text{func. adv. expndt.} & \quad \text{adv. expndt.} \quad \text{Goodwill} \\ &\quad \text{each theme} \end{aligned}$$

interaction

$$\begin{aligned} g(A_i) &= \ln(1+A) \\ p_i(A_i, A_j) &= \ln(1+A_i) \ln(1+A_j) \quad \text{reason: diminishing return} \quad \checkmark(1-q_i) \\ \text{change in effectiveness} & \quad \frac{dq_i}{dt} = -\alpha(A_i)q_i + S(1-I(A_i)) \\ a(A_i) &= C_i + w_i A_i \quad i=1, 2, \dots, m \end{aligned}$$

DLM good method to handle non-stationarity  
 Compete random coeff: problem of no est. point in time

demand  $\leftarrow Y_t = G_t + \beta X_t + \varepsilon_t$  where  $\varepsilon_t \sim N(0, \sigma^2_\varepsilon)$   
 $\hookrightarrow$  prior number of lines, and competitive adv

w: Instruments: (1) retail price index (2) # household (3) Con. Sustmat  
 (4) household spending

$$P_t = P_t(w|\alpha) + \eta_t$$

$$\begin{aligned} Y_t &= [1 \ 0 \ \dots \ 0] \begin{bmatrix} G_t \\ q_{1,t} \\ q_{2,t} \\ \vdots \\ q_{m,t} \end{bmatrix} + \beta X_t + \varepsilon_t \\ \begin{bmatrix} G_t \\ q_{1,t} \\ q_{2,t} \\ \vdots \\ q_{m,t} \end{bmatrix} &= \begin{bmatrix} (1-\delta) & g(A_t) & \dots & g(A_{mt}) \\ 0 & (1-\alpha(A_t)) & \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & (1-\alpha(A_{mt})) - S(1-I(A_{mt})) \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} G_{t-1} \\ q_{1,t-1} \\ \vdots \\ q_{m,t-1} \end{bmatrix} \\ &\quad \underbrace{\Phi_{t-1}}_{H_t} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} &+ \begin{bmatrix} S(1-I(A_t)) \\ S(1-I(A_{mt})) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} w_{1,t} \\ w_{2,t} \\ \vdots \\ w_{m,t} \end{bmatrix} \quad g(A_t)g(A_i) + \beta_i \sum_{j=1}^m h(A_{it}, A_{jt}) \\ Y_t &= F_t \Phi_{t-1} + \beta X_t + \varepsilon_t \quad \varepsilon_t \sim N(0, \sigma^2_\varepsilon) \quad \Phi_t = H_t \Phi_{t-1} + u_t + w_t \quad w_t \sim N(0, W) \end{aligned}$$

DLM spec:  $\{F_t, H_t, \Sigma \varepsilon^2, W\}$

solve large scale nonlinear:

$$\max_{A_{1:T}, A_{M+1:T}} \sum_{t=1}^T E(Y_t | D_{t-1})$$

$$\text{s.t. } \sum_{i=1}^m A_{it} \leq b_i \quad A_{it} \geq 0 \quad t=1, \dots, T \quad \text{linear constraint}$$

$$V(Y_t | D_{t-1}) \leq \sigma^2_{Y_t} \quad t=1, \dots, T$$

- ② Dynamic effectiveness of advertising and word of mouth in sequential dist. of new products.  
 Bruce, Foufoula, et al. 2012

- sequential stages release (adv. dist. Stages) - spill over
- Wom more powerful at later stages
- reallocate advertising - windowing (sequential distribution)
- Extends product life cycle
- forgetting vs. consumer - werout vs. wein
- spillover advertisement across stages
- Wom effectiveness interaction with advertising effectiveness

- ③ ① how Ad eff. & Wom eff. fluct across dist. Stgs  
 ② how differ and interact?  
 ③ how vary across products?  
 ④ more efficient to alloc. more adv?

Compare across the stages

- related literature { ① Sequential Distribution  
 ② Dynamic Ad Effectiveness  
 ③ Dynamic WOM Effectiveness  
 ④ Aggregate Demand and Goodwill Stock

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(i) } q_{it} &= G_{it} + \beta_i X_{it} + \varepsilon_{it} \quad \text{where } \varepsilon_{it} \sim N(0, \sigma^2_{\varepsilon}) \\ &\quad \downarrow \quad \text{forgetting ratio} \\ \text{goodwill } & \quad \text{goodwill} \quad \text{goodwill} \quad \text{goodwill} \\ \text{(ii) } G_{it} &= (1-\delta_i)G_{it-1} + q_{it} \quad \text{if } G_{it-1} & \quad \text{if } G_{it-1} \\ &+ q_{2it} R_{it} &+ q_{2it} R_{it} \\ &\quad \downarrow \quad \text{studio spending} \\ w_{it} & \sim N(0, w_{it}) \quad \downarrow \quad \text{lagged goodwill} \quad \text{entire rating} \end{aligned}$$

$g(A) = \ln(1+A)$ : diminishing return of advertising

$$\begin{aligned} \text{copy weout: time} &\Rightarrow (1-\delta) \quad \text{rate of forgetting} \\ \text{repetition weout} &\Rightarrow (1-\alpha) \quad \uparrow \\ q_{1it} &= (1-\alpha_{1it}) - w_{1it} A_{it} \quad q_{1it} + \beta_{1it} [1 - I(A_{it})] (1 - q_{2it}) \\ &+ q_{2it} \quad \text{word of mouth} \\ &+ q_{2it} I(A_{it}) + w_{2it} \quad \text{effectiveness} \\ &\quad \downarrow \quad \text{interaction} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{ad effectiveness} & \\ I(A_{it}) &= \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } A_{it} \neq 0, \\ 0 & \text{if } A_{it} = 0 \end{cases} \quad I(G_{it}) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } G_{it} \neq 0, \\ 0 & \text{if } G_{it} = 0 \end{cases} \\ w_{2it} & \sim N(0, w_{2it}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Wom evolution:} & \quad \text{set of film} \\ q_{2it} &= (1-\alpha_{2it})q_{2it-1} + w_{2it} Q_{it}(1-q_{2it-1}) \\ &+ q_{2it} \quad \text{chead. e.g. genre, sequel} \\ &+ q_{2it} I(A_{it}) + w_{2it} \quad \text{where } w_{2it} \sim N(0, w_{2it}) \\ &\quad \downarrow \quad \text{ad-wom interdep.} \\ \text{demand} & \quad \text{weout} \\ \text{forgetting} & \quad \text{wom rate} \\ \text{param} & \quad \{ \alpha_{1it}, w_{1it}, \alpha_{2it}, w_{2it} \} \end{aligned}$$

$$\text{obs. eq.: } y_{it}^{(i)} = [1 \ 0 \ 0] \begin{bmatrix} G_{it}^{(i)} \\ q_{1it}^{(i)} \\ q_{2it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix} + \beta_i X_{it}^{(i)} + \varepsilon_{it}^{(i)}$$

$$\text{str. eq.: } \begin{bmatrix} G_{it}^{(i)} \\ q_{1it}^{(i)} \\ q_{2it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 - s_i^{(i)} & \beta_i^{(i)} & R_{it}^{(i)} \\ 0 & (1 - \alpha_i^{(i)} - w_i) A_{it}^{(i)} & y_{it}^{(i)} I(Q_{it}^{(i)}) \\ 0 & q_{2i}^{(i)} I(A_{it}^{(i)}) & (1 - \alpha_i^{(i)} - w_i) Q_{it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix} \underbrace{\begin{bmatrix} G_{it}^{(i)} \\ q_{1it}^{(i)} \\ q_{2it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix}}_{H_{it}^{(i)}}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} G_{it}^{(i)} \\ q_{1it}^{(i)} \\ q_{2it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ Y_{44} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ w_{it}^{(i)} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow y_{it}^{(i)} = F_{it}^{(i)} + \beta_i X_{it}^{(i)} + \varepsilon_{it}^{(i)} \quad \varepsilon_{it}^{(i)} \sim \text{NN}(0, \sigma_i^{(i)})$$

$$B_{it}^{(i)} = H_{it}^{(i)} B_{it-1}^{(i)} + u_{it}^{(i)} + w_{it}^{(i)} \quad w_{it}^{(i)} \sim \text{NN}(0, W_i^{(i)})$$

## ① Model Comparisons

$$\text{② Optimization: } \max_{A_{it}^{(i)}} \sum_t E(y_{it}^{(i)}), \text{ st. } \sum_t A_{it}^{(i)} \leq b_i \text{ and } A_{it}^{(i)} \geq 0$$

## ① Themes of advertising:

- ① Reconnect ad. ③ Emotional ad. ⑤ Price ad  
 ② Reinforcement ad. ④ Product ad

## ② Optimization: optimize one step ahead expectation

## ① Discovering how advertising grows: Sales and builds brands. Bruley, Peters, Naik 2012

- ① think-feel-do hierarchy, intermediate effect of adv. induce sales (importance of intermediaries role) Factor of mindset matrix  
 ② cognition, affect, and experience: unobservable  
 ③ batteries of mindset matrices to assess how adv. builds brands

- ④ cont.: augment dynamic adv. sales response model by integrating dyn. evolv. purchase reinf. of int. effects

- ⑤ filtering out measurement noise (Extract factor loadings)

## ⑥ Brand operating hierarchy:

adv.  $\rightarrow$  experience  $\rightarrow$  cognition  $\rightarrow$  affect  $\leftrightarrow$  sales

- ⑦ purchase reinforcement exists for all

- ⑧ adv.  $\rightarrow$  simult. effect of ① sales growth ② brand building

- ⑨ Riccati equation, reversible jump markov chain monte carlo

- ⑩ mkt  $\rightarrow$  sales agencies: 6 mind-set metrics.

- ⑪ cognition(C), affect(A), Experience(E) of creative ad?

- ⑫ advantage of factor loading: ① Avg. losses info  $\Rightarrow$  inaccuracy

② Factorization reduces measurement noise (more reliable than any single metric alone)

③ factor loading corr b/w metric & factor

- ⑭ cover b/w intern. factors

- ⑮ media exposure  $\rightarrow$  purchase intention

- state space model: [Obs eq.] Composition of 3 intermediate factors (reflected mindset matrix)

[transition eq.] dynamic evolution of sales & 3 intermediate factors, alt. hierarchy & purchase reinforcement effect

[drift vector] how advertising triggers one or more intermediate factors to brand sales

## Dynamic advertising

$$\begin{bmatrix} C_t \\ A_t \\ E_t \\ S_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & Y_{44} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \\ S_{t-1} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ w_{at} \end{bmatrix}$$

$w_t \sim \text{NN}(0, W)$   $\rightarrow$  specific error

[Classical hierarchical model]  $E \rightarrow C \rightarrow A$

$$\begin{bmatrix} C_t \\ A_t \\ E_t \\ S_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & Y_{13} & 0 \\ Y_{21} & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & Y_{42} & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \\ S_{t-1} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ \beta_3 g(u_t) \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} w_{1t} \\ w_{2t} \\ w_{3t} \\ w_{4t} \end{bmatrix}$$

advertising affects experience  $w_t \sim \text{NN}(0, W)$

( $w_1, w_2, w_3, w_4$   $\rightarrow$  specific error)

[Katrutsas-Ambler model] adv. ignites all 3 fact. simult.

then all factors affect sales, brand purchase reinf.

Experience (adv  $\rightarrow$  (E, C, A)  $\rightarrow$  S  $\rightarrow$  S  $\rightarrow$  E)

$$\begin{bmatrix} C_t \\ A_t \\ E_t \\ S_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & Y_{34} \\ Y_{41} & Y_{42} & Y_{43} & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \\ S_{t-1} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} \beta_1 g(u_t) \\ \beta_2 g(u_t) \\ \beta_3 g(u_t) \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} w_{1t} \\ w_{2t} \\ w_{3t} \\ w_{4t} \end{bmatrix}$$

ignore dynamics

[tagged integrated  $E \rightarrow C \rightarrow A$ ]

$$\begin{bmatrix} C_t \\ A_t \\ E_t \\ S_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} Y_{11} & 0 & Y_{13} & Y_{14} \\ Y_{21} & Y_{22} & 0 & Y_{24} \\ 0 & 0 & Y_{33} & Y_{34} \\ 0 & Y_{42} & 0 & Y_{44} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \\ S_{t-1} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} \beta_1 g(u_t) \\ \beta_2 g(u_t) \\ \beta_3 g(u_t) \\ \beta_4 g(u_t) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} w_{1t} \\ w_{2t} \\ w_{3t} \\ w_{4t} \end{bmatrix}$$

adv: carry over tangible & intangible effects of adv

[transformation]

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & -Y_{13} & 0 \\ -Y_{21} & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & -Y_{42} & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_t \\ A_t \\ E_t \\ S_t \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} Y_{11} & 0 & 0 & Y_{14} \\ 0 & Y_{22} & 0 & Y_{24} \\ 0 & 0 & Y_{33} & Y_{34} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & Y_{44} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} C_{t-1} \\ A_{t-1} \\ E_{t-1} \\ S_{t-1} \end{bmatrix}$$

$$+ \begin{bmatrix} \beta_1 g(u_t) \\ \beta_2 g(u_t) \\ \beta_3 g(u_t) \\ \beta_4 g(u_t) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} w_{1t} \\ w_{2t} \\ w_{3t} \\ w_{4t} \end{bmatrix}$$

⑥  $\rightarrow$   $w_t$   $\rightarrow$   $f_t = f_{t-1}^T f_{t-1} + dt + wt$   $\rightarrow$  all permutation

[general model]  $f_t = f_{t-1}^T f_{t-1} + dt + wt$   $\rightarrow$  all permutation

[Intermediate factor composition]  $\{X_{it}\}_{i=1}^n$  mind-set metrics

$$\begin{bmatrix} x_{1t} \\ x_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ x_{nt} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & \dots & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} f_{1t} \\ f_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ f_{nt} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} e_{1t} \\ e_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ e_{nt} \end{bmatrix}$$

need to set some to zero, 1 per identification

$$\begin{bmatrix} x_{1t} \\ x_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ x_{nt} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} f_{1t} \\ f_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ f_{nt} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} e_{1t} \\ e_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ e_{nt} \end{bmatrix}$$

Simple structure

$$\begin{bmatrix} x_{1t} \\ x_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ x_{nt} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} f_{1t} \\ f_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ f_{nt} \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} e_{1t} \\ e_{2t} \\ \vdots \\ e_{nt} \end{bmatrix}$$

Purchase Reinforcement

$$x_t = Af_t + Ec$$

Estimation techniques } ① max likelihood  
② expectation maximization algorithm  
③ Bayesian techniques

estimation } ④ Kalman filter smoother recursions  
⑤ MCMC  
⑥ stable factor corr. by solving discrete algebraic Riccati eq. (non orthog. alg)  
⑦ RJ-MCMC: determine # of factors to retain

$\hat{\theta} = \{\theta_0, \theta_1, \dots, \theta_T\}$  state param.:  $(C, A, E, S)$   $x^T$ : observation

$\Theta = \{\Lambda, P, \beta\}$   $\{A_t, P_t, \beta_t, Q_t, W_t\}$   
Factor loadings  $\hookrightarrow$  ad effectiveness  $\hookrightarrow$  intermediate dynamics  $\hookrightarrow$  inverse Wishart

direct Gibbs sampling  $\Rightarrow$  joint posterior:  $p(\hat{\theta}^T, W, Q, \Theta, x^T)$

iterative resampling from  $\begin{cases} p(\hat{\theta}^T | x^T, W, Q, \Theta) & \text{Gibbs} \\ p(W, Q, \Theta | x^T, \hat{\theta}^T) & \text{Sampling} \end{cases}$

⑮ repeated measurement  $\Rightarrow$  relax orthogonality assumption  $\Phi_t = V(t)$

⑯ time invariant:  $\hat{\Phi}_\infty = \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \hat{\Phi}_T$   
 $P \hat{\Phi}_\infty P^T - \hat{\Phi}_\infty + P \hat{\Phi}_\infty \Lambda' (\Lambda \hat{\Phi}_\infty \Lambda' + Q)^{-1} A \hat{\Phi}_\infty P^T + W = 0$   
discrete algebraic riccati equation

⑰ Factor retention: RJ-MCMC # param: uncertainty

⑱ joint posterior:  $p(\Theta^{(k)} | x^T) \propto \prod_{t=1}^T p(\alpha_t | P_t, \beta_t Q_t) p(P_t | m_0, C_0) \times p(C_t) p(Q_t) \times \prod_{t=1}^T p(\theta_t | \theta_{t-1}, A_t, \beta_t, W_t) p(A_t) p(\beta_t) p(W_t)$   
 $q(\Theta^{(k)}) = \prod_{t=1}^T f_N(\mu_{\theta_t}, M_{\theta_t(k)} | a V_{\theta_t(k)}) \cdot f_N(\mu_w | M_w(k) / b V_{\theta_t(k)})$   
 $\cdot f_N(\nu_w, M_{\nu_w(k)} | c V_{\nu_w(k)}) \cdot f_N(\omega_{\theta_t}^2 | M_{\omega_{\theta_t}(k)} | d V_{\theta_t(k)}) f_{IG}(\omega_{\theta_t}^2 | e, M_{\omega_{\theta_t}(k)}) \cdot f_{IG}(\sigma_{\theta_t}^2 | g, g M_{\sigma_{\theta_t}(k)})$   
 $a_i \rightarrow a_k$ : turning point.

inverse gamma  $V_2$ : sample variance  $M_2$ : sample mean

⑲  $p(x^T, k, \Theta^{(k)}) = p(x^T | \Theta^{(k)}, k) p(\Theta^{(k)} | k) p(k)$   $p(k) \propto k^{-k}$   
MC MC initial values:  $(k, \Theta^{(k)})$

draw candidate model:  $k' \sim p(k | k')$   
conditional on model  $k'$  draws  $\Theta^{(k')}$  from  $q(\Theta^{(k')} | \Theta^{(k)})$   
accept with prob:  $\alpha = \min \frac{p(x^T | \Theta^{(k')}, k') p(\Theta^{(k')} | k') p(k') q(\Theta^{(k)})}{p(x^T | \Theta^{(k)}, k) p(\Theta^{(k)} | k) p(k) q(\Theta^{(k)})}$

⑳ test on DGP.

㉑ unit root: Dickey Fuller

㉒ Advertising: budget approved in advance

㉓ Instrument: two lagged

㉔ emotional advertising prevails