

AVC Member Participation Rewards - Q3 2023

This forum post is the official record of Aligned Voter Committee (AVC) Member Participation Rewards for Q3 2023.

We extend our gratitude to all AVCs for their service and contributions to Maker Governance.

Payment Amounts and Calculations

Per [The Atlas](#), AVC compensation is paid on a per member, per Scope basis.

- [10 million NewGovToken](#) for all Scopes annually
- This equals 500,000 NewGovToken or 41.67 MKR ([12,000:1 ratio](#)) per Scope, per Quarter
- This is [split evenly](#) across a total of [10 Reward Slots](#).
- Number of AVC Member Reward Slots = Number of paid Delegate (PD & RD) Slots.
- Number of AVC Member Reward Slots = Number of paid Delegate (PD & RD) Slots.

Therefore, per Scope, each AVC Member can earn 4.17 MKR

in this Quarter.

AVC Participation Requirements and Member Eligibility

Summarizing the pertinent Atlas provisions, an AVC Member qualifies for Participation Rewards if two (2) general conditions are met:

- their respective AVC has fulfilled specific Participation Requirements so as to be considered “active”; and
- the AVC Member has fulfilled specific criteria so as to be individually eligible for the Rewards.

The AVC Participation Requirements for “active” status include:

- Per [Atlas 2.5.4](#): the AVC follows a standardized internal governance process for making all pertinent decisions, including scheduling Subcommittee Meetings and creating/ratifying the Aligned Governance Strategy and Aligned Scope Proposals (“Position Documents”).
- Per [Atlas 2.5.2.3](#) and [2.5.4](#): the AVC has properly ratified its Position Docs.
- The AVC must post the Position Documents on its communication channels (ie, the Forum).
- The AVC must ratify a hash of the Position Documents via a successful AVC decision.
- The AVC must post the Position Documents on its communication channels (ie, the Forum).
- The AVC must ratify a hash of the Position Documents via a successful AVC decision.
- Per [Atlas 2.5.4.5](#): the AVC scheduled its Q3 Subcommittee Meetings through an AVC decision.
- Per [Atlas 2.5.5.1](#): the AVC adhered to the specified 10-week sequence of meetings

. Currently, the plain language of this provision requires that a specific week cover a specific Scope; it does not allow for rescheduled meetings falling outside of the specified 10-week meeting sequence.

To be eligible for Participation Rewards, individual AVC Members must meet the following criteria:

- Per [Atlas 2.5.10.1.1](#): the Member must have attended both

Subcommittee Meetings devoted to a specific Scope to qualify to receive Rewards for that Scope. Depending on the Member’s attendance record, they may be eligible to receive Rewards for 1 Scope, all 5, or anything in between.

- Per [Atlas 2.5.10.1.1](#) and [2.5.10.1.2](#): the Member co-authored both the AVC’s Aligned Governance Strategy and Aligned Scope Proposals.
- Per [Atlas 2.5.4.2](#): the AVC Member’s designated blockchain account must contain MKR equal to, or greater than, their verified MKR amount. (This Quarter, we performed this check this week. See further discussion of this Atlas requirement below.)

This Quarter, there are fewer than 10 eligible AVC Members in active AVCs. Therefore, all eligible AVC Members will receive Participation Rewards this Quarter.

Enforcing Atlas/Scope Artifact Requirements

Last Quarter, GovAlpha allowed for some flexibility in the observance of Atlas requirements for AVCs, given the mid-quarter revision of the Atlas rules. This Quarter, all relevant rules were known in advance.

We observed some discrepancies in adhering to the Atlas rules concerning: 1) the specified 10-week sequence of Subcommittee Meetings; 2) scheduling Subcommittee Meetings by an AVC decision; and 3) keeping the MKR balance in one's blockchain account above the verified amount.

We have decided, for one final Quarter (i.e., Q3 2023), to extend flexibility in the enforcement of the Atlas rules. However, starting with Q4 2023, we will observe our mandate to enforce the explicit terms and spirit of the Atlas rules.

We recognize that objections may arise that enforcing these rules in a given instance is unfair, overly particular, etc. Should the current rules be dissatisfactory, the community is able to take action via the customary governance channels. (And the Governance Facilitator teams will be glad to assist community members through this process.)

Please note, however, that we cannot be in the position of interpreting the rules based on subjective opinion or enforcing them on an ad hoc basis. We want to avoid a future situation in which there are many more eligible AVC Members than there are paid Reward Slots, and Members are requesting exceptions of various kinds (on the basis of exceptions given in the past).

In the course of preparing AVC Member Rewards this quarter, we came across several issues or outstanding questions. We make a note of them below to signal that work on these issues is in process.

Verified MKR vs Total MKR Held

In the future, should the number of eligible AVC Members exceed the total number of Rewards Slots [Atlas 2.5.10.4](#) provides that the 10 AVC Members with the "highest verified MKR balances" in their designated blockchain accounts will receive Rewards. However, [Atlas 2.5.4.2](#) provides that total MKR held in an AVC Member's blockchain account (verified MKR, plus any excess) counts towards AVC Rewards qualification. The Governance Facilitators will consult on this matter to formally resolve the ambiguity.

Requirements re: Verified MKR

Per [Atlas 2.5.4.2](#), "the effective verified MKR of members is specified in their application" for AVC Membership. However, the Governance Scope Artifact elements pertaining to AVC Member applications do not include this requirement, and thus it has not been consistently enforced. The Governance Facilitators will discuss the possibility of updating the Governance Scope language to remedy this oversight, which may be suitable for a [GOV3 Scope Artifact edit](#). Going forward, we will also require that new AVC Member applications specify their verified MKR amount.

This same Atlas provision provides that the effective verified MKR amount of an AVC Member "can only be increased or decreased through another application that must be accepted by another AVC decision." The use of the phrase "another application" evidently indicates that an AVC decision, by itself, is not enough to effect a Member's desired change in their verified MKR amount. Rather, the AVC Member must submit another application to the AVC, which application specifies the new verified MKR amount. We will enforce this rule going forward.

Finally, this Atlas provision requires that an AVC member is "automatically removed" from their AVC, should their blockchain account have less MKR than their verified amount. We are working on a Dune query to monitor MKR held on a daily basis and hope to get this implemented later this Quarter (h/t [@Patrick_J](#)).

Schedule of 10 Subcommittee Meetings

As mentioned above, [Atlas 2.5.5.1](#) requires that, each Quarter, the 10 Subcommittee Meetings are held in a specific sequence. Should the week's scheduled meeting be canceled for whatever reason, we believe the plain language of Atlas 2.5.5.1 allows for "make-up" meetings, but these must be held that same week so that the overall sequence of meetings is adhered to.

As noted above, AVC Subcommittee Meetings must be scheduled through a successful AVC Decision; this includes any make-up meetings. This should take place on the Forum.

AVCs' Standardized Internal Governance Process

[Atlas 2.5.4](#) requires AVCs to "follow a standardized internal governance process

" for AVC decisions. Does the Atlas require all AVCs to follow the same

internal governance process (ie, voting on New Member applications, etc.), in order to remain in “active” status?

Verified Message Signatures

When the use of cryptographically signed messages is required for AVC decisions: we kindly request that AVC Members include the url linking to the verified Message Signature directly

in their Forum post.

Authorship of Position Documents

Going forward, please explicitly list

the authors of each Position Document directly on the documents and the Forum post sharing them. It is not necessarily the case that all members of an AVC have participated in authoring a Position Document; the [Atlas](#) has no requirement to this effect. A general statement that “X AVC has issued a Position Document”, for instance, does not justify any assumption about authorship on our part.

We’re grateful for your cooperation in these matters. It streamlines the process of AVC Rewards management, enabling timely payout to all AVC Members. Similarly, anything you can do to keep your AVC Forum communications well organized, including using tags, clear titles (“Q4 Subcommittee Meeting Schedule”), etc., would be of immense help.

Payment Details

Below, we list all AVC Members who were co-authors of their AVC’s Position Documents this Quarter. The Notes column indicates whether each Member met the further eligibility requirement of attending both Subcommittee Meetings devoted to each of the five (5) Scopes.

AVC Member Name

Address

AVC

Amount (MKR)

Notes

opensky

[0x8e67ee3bbeb1743dc63093af493f67c3c23c6f04](#)

Composable

20.85

LDF

[0xC322E8Ec33e9b0a34c7cD185C616087D9842ad50](#)

Composable

0

Ineligible: missed 5 mtgs - did not qualify for any Scopes

stefdelev

[0xaAA1D204D78De81a6EfF5264928A6B49eE748050](#)

Composable

0

Ineligible: missed 6 mtgs - did not qualify for any Scopes

twblack88

[0x80882f2A36d49fC46C3c654F7f9cB9a2Bf0423e1](#)

Composable

0

Ineligible: missed 7 mtgs - did not qualify for any Scopes

DAI-Vinci

[0x9ee47F0f82F1A6F45C4E1D25Ce95C321D8C8356a](#)

KISS

12.51

Missed 2 mtgs; qualified for 3 Scopes

IamMeeoh

[0x47f7A5d8D27f259582097E1eE59a07a816982AE9](#)

KISS

20.85

fhomoney.eth

[0xdbD5651F71ce83d1f0eD275aC456241890a53C74](#)

Regenerative Finance

0

Ineligible: Missed 7 mtgs - did not qualify for any Scopes

ACRE DAOs

[0xBF9226345F601150F64Ea4fEaAE7E40530763cbd](#)

Regenerative Finance

20.85

Harmony

[0xE20A2e231215e9b7Aa308463F1A7490b2ECE55D3](#)

Resiliency

20.85

Res

[0x8c5c8d76372954922400e4654AF7694e158AB784](#)

Resiliency

20.85

seedlatam.eth

[0x0087a081a9b430fd8f688c6ac5dd24421bfb060d](#)

Sovereign Finance

20.85

This Quarter, AVC Member Participation Rewards comes to a total of 137.61 MKR

.

Payments will be made in the upcoming Executive Vote scheduled for 2023-10-11.

Note on RISK AVC Status

RISK AVC was in [“pending” status](#) during Q3. However, it did not publish Position Documents, among other requirements that were not met. Therefore, it cannot be considered “active” in Q4, per [Atlas 2.5.3](#):

New AVC can become recognized as Active AVCs by the Governance Scope if they fulfill the AVC eligibility requirements for participation and internal governance for at least one full quarterly governance cycle.

Don't hesitate to let us know if you have questions about any of the above.