

Internal Language of Rel

Molly Stewart-Gallus

16th February 2022

I wanted an internal language corresponding to the double category **Rel** the double category with sets as objects, relations as horizontal arrows and functions as vertical arrows.

I present three different calculi: a substructural “context calculus” corresponding to the horizontal edge of **Rel**; a “term calculus” corresponding to **Set**, the vertical edge category of **Rel**; and a simple “command calculus” corresponding to commuting squares of **Rel**.

First, I give the basic framework of the calculi. Then I discuss semantics and applications. And finally I list a few possible extensions such as coproduct and dependent sum types.

Core Calculi

The core context calculus is the linear lambda calculus with a few symbol changes and corresponds to the closed monoidal structure of the horizontal edge of **Rel**. The core term calculus is a little language with only product types and corresponds to the Cartesian structure of **Set**. I am still figuring out the core command calculus which ought to correspond to commuting squares in **Rel**.

The context calculus has a linear variable rule. To make mechanization easier and ensure the typing environment can always be directly inferred from context expressions linear variables are explicitly indexed by their types and variable binding is more imperative.

Grammar, Syntax and Reductions

$$\begin{array}{lcl} \text{type, } t & ::= & \\ & | & \top \\ & | & t \times t' \end{array}$$
$$\text{term, } v \quad ::=$$

	$ \begin{array}{c} \quad ! \\ \quad \pi_1 v \\ \quad \pi_2 v \\ \quad v, v' \\ \quad (v) \qquad \qquad \qquad S \end{array} $
<i>normal</i> , N	$ \begin{array}{c} ::= \\ \quad ! \\ \quad N, N' \\ \quad (N) \qquad \qquad \qquad S \end{array} $
<i>context</i> , E	$ \begin{array}{c} ::= \\ \quad x \\ \quad \lambda x: t. E \qquad \text{bind } x \text{ in } E \\ \quad E E' \\ \quad ! \\ \quad E; E' \\ \quad E, E' \\ \quad \text{let } (x, y) := E \text{ in } E' \quad \text{bind } x \cup y \text{ in } E' \\ \quad (E) \qquad \qquad \qquad S \end{array} $
<i>environment</i> , Γ	$ \begin{array}{c} ::= \\ \quad \bullet \\ \quad \Gamma, x: t \\ \quad \Gamma \cup \Gamma' \end{array} $
<i>store</i> , σ	$ \begin{array}{c} ::= \\ \quad \bullet \\ \quad \sigma, x[N] \\ \quad \sigma \cup \sigma' \end{array} $

$\boxed{\Gamma \vdash E: t}$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{\bullet, x: t \vdash x: t} \text{ JE_var} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma, x: t_1 \vdash E: t_2}{\Gamma \vdash \lambda x: t_1. E: t_1 \times t_2} \text{ JE_abs} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma_1 \vdash E_1: t_1 \times t_2 \quad \Gamma_2 \vdash E_2: t_1}{\Gamma_1 \cup \Gamma_2 \vdash E_1 E_2: t_2} \text{ JE_app} \\
\\
\frac{}{\bullet \vdash !: \top} \text{ JE_tt}
\end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\Gamma_1 \vdash E_1 : \top \quad \Gamma_2 \vdash E_2 : t}{\Gamma_1 \cup \Gamma_2 \vdash E_1; E_2 : t} \quad \text{JE_step} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma_1 \vdash E_1 : t_1 \quad \Gamma_2 \vdash E_2 : t_2}{\Gamma_1 \cup \Gamma_2 \vdash E_1, E_2 : t_1 \times t_2} \quad \text{JE_fanout} \\
\\
\frac{\Gamma_1 \vdash E_1 : t_1 \times t_2 \quad \Gamma_2, x_0 : t_1, x_1 : t_2 \vdash E_2 : t_3}{\Gamma_1 \cup \Gamma_2 \vdash \mathbf{let} (x_0, x_1) := E_1 \mathbf{in} E_2 : t_3} \quad \text{JE_let}
\end{array}$$

$$\boxed{\vdash v : t}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{\vdash ! : \top} \quad \text{Jv_tt} \\
\\
\frac{\vdash v_1 : t_1 \quad \vdash v_2 : t_2}{\vdash v_1, v_2 : t_1 \times t_2} \quad \text{Jv_fanout} \\
\\
\frac{\vdash v : t_1 \times t_2}{\vdash \pi_1 v : t_1} \quad \text{Jv_fst} \\
\\
\frac{\vdash v : t_1 \times t_2}{\vdash \pi_2 v : t_2} \quad \text{Jv_snd}
\end{array}$$

$$\boxed{v \Downarrow N}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{! \Downarrow !} \quad \text{big_tt} \\
\\
\frac{v_1 \Downarrow N'_1 \quad v_2 \Downarrow N'_2}{(v_1, v_2) \Downarrow (N'_1, N'_2)} \quad \text{big_fanout} \\
\\
\frac{v \Downarrow N_1, N_2}{\pi_1 v \Downarrow N_1} \quad \text{big_fst} \\
\\
\frac{v \Downarrow N_1, N_2}{\pi_2 v \Downarrow N_2} \quad \text{big_snd}
\end{array}$$

$$\boxed{\sigma \vdash c : E[N]}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{\bullet, x[N] \vdash x := N : x[N]} \quad \text{sat_var} \\
\\
\frac{}{\bullet \vdash ! : ![!]} \quad \text{sat_tt}
\end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\sigma \vdash c: E[!]}{\sigma' \vdash c': E[N]} \quad \text{sat_step} \\
\frac{\sigma \cup \sigma' \vdash c; c': (E; E')[N]}{\sigma \cup \sigma' \vdash c; c': (E; E')[N]} \\
\frac{\sigma \vdash c: E[N] \quad \sigma' \vdash c': E'[N']}{\sigma \cup \sigma' \vdash c; c': (E, E')[N, N']} \quad \text{sat_fanout} \\
\frac{\sigma \vdash c: E[N_0, N_1] \quad \sigma', x[N_0], y[N_1] \vdash c': E'[N_2]}{\sigma \cup \sigma' \vdash \mathbf{let} (x, y) := c \mathbf{in} c': (\mathbf{let} (x, y) := E \mathbf{in} E')[N_2]} \quad \text{sat_let} \\
\frac{\sigma, x[N] \vdash c: E[N']}{\sigma \vdash \lambda x: t. c: (\lambda x: t. E)[N, N']} \quad \text{sat_lam} \\
\frac{\sigma \vdash c: E[N, N'] \quad \sigma' \vdash c': E'[N]}{\sigma \cup \sigma' \vdash c c': (E E')[N]} \quad \text{sat_app}
\end{array}$$

Types	$t ::= * \mid t \times t$
Contexts	$E ::= x_t \mid E E \mid \lambda(x: t).E$
Terms	$v ::= x \mid \pi_1(v) \mid \pi_2(v) \mid v, v$
Environment	$\Gamma ::= \cdot \mid \Gamma, x: t$
Command Env	$\Delta ::= \cdot \mid \Delta, x \otimes v$

Context Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\mathbf{V}} \cdot, x: t \vdash x_t: t \\
\boxed{\times \mathbf{I}} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t_1}{\Gamma \setminus x \vdash \lambda(x: t_0).E: t_0 \times t_1} \{x: t_0 \in \Gamma\} \\
\boxed{\times \mathbf{E}} \frac{\Gamma_0 \vdash E_0: t_0 \times t_1 \quad \Gamma_1 \vdash E_1: t_0}{\Gamma_0, \Gamma_1 \vdash E_0 E_1: t_1} \\
\boxed{\times \beta} (\lambda(x: t).E_0) E_1 \rightsquigarrow [x_t := E_1]E_0
\end{array}$$

Term Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\mathbf{V}} \frac{x: t \in \Gamma}{\Gamma \vdash x: t} \\
\boxed{\times \mathbf{I}} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v_0: t_0 \quad \Gamma \vdash v_1: t_1}{\Gamma \vdash v_0, v_1: t_0 \times t_1} \\
\boxed{\times \mathbf{E}_1} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: t_0 \times t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \pi_1(v): t_0} \quad \boxed{\times \beta_1} \pi_1(v_0, v_1) \rightsquigarrow v_0 \\
\boxed{\times \mathbf{E}_2} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: t_0 \times t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \pi_2(v): t_1} \quad \boxed{\times \beta_2} \pi_2(v_0, v_1) \rightsquigarrow v_1
\end{array}$$

Command Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\text{V}} \frac{\Delta \vdash E \otimes v_0 \quad v_0 \rightsquigarrow v_1}{\Delta \vdash E \otimes v_1} \quad \boxed{\text{V}} \cdot, x_t \otimes v \vdash x_t \otimes v \quad \boxed{\text{E}} \frac{\Delta \vdash E_0 \otimes v \quad E_0 \rightsquigarrow E_1}{\Delta \vdash E_1 \otimes v} \\
\boxed{\times \text{I}} \frac{\Delta, x_t \otimes v_0 \vdash E \otimes v_1}{\Delta \vdash \lambda(x:t).E \otimes v_0, v_1} \\
\boxed{\times \text{E}} \frac{\Delta_0 \vdash E_0 \otimes v \quad \Delta_1 \vdash E_1 \otimes \pi_1(v)}{\Delta_0, \Delta_1 \vdash E_0 E_1 \otimes \pi_2(v)}
\end{array}$$

Examples

Identity

$$\text{id}_t = \lambda(x:t).x_t \quad \frac{\frac{\top}{\cdot, x:t \vdash x_t:t} (\text{V})}{\cdot \vdash \lambda(x:t).x_t:t \times t} (\times \text{I}) \quad \frac{\frac{\top}{\Delta, x_t \otimes v \vdash x_t \otimes v} (\text{V})}{\Delta \vdash \lambda(x:t).x_t \otimes v, v} (\times \text{I})$$

Composition

$$f \circ_t g = \lambda(x:t).f(g x_t)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\cdot \vdash f:t_1 \times t_2 \quad \frac{\cdot \vdash g:t_0 \times t_1 \quad \frac{\top}{\cdot, x:t_0 \vdash x_{t_0}:t_0} (\times \text{V})}{\cdot, x:t_0 \vdash g x_{t_0}:t_1} (\times \text{E})}{\cdot, x:t_0 \vdash f(g x_{t_0}):t_2} (\times \text{E}) \\
\frac{\cdot, x:t_0 \vdash f(g x_{t_0}):t_2}{\cdot \vdash \lambda(x:t_0).f(g x_{t_0}):t_0 \times t_2} (\times \text{I}) \\
\frac{\cdot \vdash f \otimes v_1, v_2 \quad \frac{\cdot \vdash g \otimes v_0, v_1 \quad \frac{\top}{\cdot, x_{t_0} \otimes v_0 \vdash x_{t_0} \otimes v_0} (\text{V})}{\cdot, x_{t_0} \otimes v_0 \vdash g x_{t_0} \otimes v_1} (\times \text{E})}{\cdot, x_{t_0} \otimes v_0 \vdash f(g x_{t_0}) \otimes v_2} (\times \text{E}) \\
\frac{\cdot, x_{t_0} \otimes v_0 \vdash f(g x_{t_0}) \otimes v_2}{\cdot \vdash \lambda(x:t_0).f(g x_{t_0}) \otimes v_0, v_2} (\times \text{I})
\end{array}$$

Categorical Semantics

The intent is to create calculi encoding the core features of the double category **Rel**. If this is successful then terms and types ought to map to **Rel** as follows.

I think you want pullbacks for the environment arrows?

$$\begin{array}{ccc}
? & \xrightarrow{?} & \times_{x: t \in \Gamma_v} t \\
\downarrow ? & \Downarrow \Delta \vdash E \otimes v & \downarrow v \\
\times_{x: t \in \Gamma_E} t & \xrightarrow{E} & t
\end{array}$$

I have no idea about universe issues and such. Dependent sum is probably wrong. Really need to think about denotation again.

$$\llbracket t_0 \times t_1 \rrbracket = \llbracket t_0 \rrbracket \times \llbracket t_1 \rrbracket$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\llbracket x \rrbracket(\sigma) &= \sigma(x) \\
\llbracket v_0, v_1 \rrbracket(\sigma) &= (\llbracket v_0 \rrbracket(\sigma), \llbracket v_1 \rrbracket(\sigma))
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\llbracket x_t \rrbracket(\sigma, s) &= \sigma(x, s) \\
\llbracket E_0 E_1 \rrbracket(\sigma, s_0) &= \exists s_1, \llbracket E_1 \rrbracket(\sigma, s_1) \wedge \llbracket E_0 \rrbracket(\sigma, (s_1, s_0)) \\
\llbracket \lambda(x: t). E_0 \rrbracket(\sigma, (s_0, s_1)) &= \lambda E_1, \llbracket E_1 \rrbracket(\sigma, s_0) \rightarrow \llbracket E_0 \rrbracket([x := s \mapsto \llbracket E_1 \rrbracket(\sigma, s)]\sigma, s_1)
\end{aligned}$$

Applications to Synthetic Category Theory

A category is a monad in **Span**. Once this system has been generalized to **Span** we can define monads internal to **Span**.

This is not fully internal but a simple approach to defining an equivalence relation might be something like:

$$\begin{array}{l}
\boxed{\text{object}} \cdot \vdash O : * \qquad \qquad \qquad \boxed{\text{arrow}} \cdot \vdash R : O \times O \\
\boxed{\text{refl}} \frac{\cdot \vdash o : O}{\cdot \vdash R \otimes o, o} \\
\boxed{\text{trans}} \frac{\cdot \vdash \lambda(x: O). R(Rx) \otimes o_0, o_1}{\cdot \vdash R \otimes o_0, o_1} \{ \cdot \vdash o_1, o_0 : O \times O \} \\
\boxed{\text{sym}} \frac{\cdot \vdash R \otimes o_0, o_1}{\cdot \vdash R \otimes o_1, o_0} \{ \cdot \vdash o_1, o_0 : O \times O \}
\end{array}$$

Generalizing to a constructive interpretation in terms of spans and groupoids is future work.

Extensions

Singleton set, disjoint union and dependent sum types.

Unit Type

Types	$t ::= \dots \mid 1$
Contexts	$E ::= \dots \mid \mathbf{true} \mid E \gg E$
Terms	$v ::= \dots \mid !$

Context Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\top\mathbf{I}} \cdot \vdash \mathbf{true} : \top \\
\\
\boxed{\top\mathbf{E}} \frac{\Gamma_0 \vdash p_0 : \top \quad \Gamma_1 \vdash p_1 : t}{\Gamma_0, \Gamma_1 \vdash E_0 \gg E_1 : t} \\
\\
\boxed{\top\beta} \mathbf{true} \gg E \rightsquigarrow E
\end{array}$$

Term Calculus

$$\boxed{\top\mathbf{I}} \Gamma \vdash ! : \top$$

Command Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\top\mathbf{I}} \cdot \vdash \mathbf{true} \otimes ! \\
\\
\boxed{\top\mathbf{E}} \frac{\Delta_0 \vdash \mathbf{true} \otimes ! \quad \Delta_1 \vdash E \otimes v}{\Delta_0, \Delta_1 \vdash E \otimes v}
\end{array}$$

Disjoint Unions

Disjoint unions in **Set** become Cartesian products/coproducts in **Rel**.

As a technical hack **false** is explicitly indexed by the environment it ignores. This hack also requires inferring the environment in certain reduction rules.

Types	$t ::= \dots \mid \emptyset \mid t + t$
Contexts	$E ::= \dots \mid \mathbf{abort}_t(E) \mid \mathbf{i}_{1t}(E) \mid \mathbf{i}_{2t}(E) \mid$ $\mathbf{m}(v, E.v, x.E) \mid \mathbf{false}_\Gamma \mid \mathbf{l}(E) \mid \mathbf{r}(E) \mid E; E$
Terms	$v ::= \dots \mid \mathbf{abort}_t(v) \mid \mathbf{i}_{1t}(v) \mid \mathbf{i}_{2t}(v) \mid \mathbf{m}(v, x.v, x.v)$

Context Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\emptyset E^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: \emptyset}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{abort}_t(E): t} \\
\boxed{+I_1^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t_0}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{i}_{1t_1}(E): t_0 + t_1} \quad \boxed{+I_2^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{i}_{2t_0}(E): t_0 + t_1} \\
\boxed{+E^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E_0: t_0 + t_1 \quad \Gamma, x_0: t_0 \vdash E_1: t_2 \quad \Gamma, x_1: t_1 \vdash E_2: t_2}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{m}(E_0, x_0.E_1, x_1.E_2): t_2} \\
\boxed{\emptyset I} \Gamma \vdash \mathbf{false}_\Gamma: \emptyset \\
\boxed{+E_1} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t_0 + t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{l}(E): t_0} \quad \boxed{+E_2} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t_0 + t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{r}(E): t_1} \\
\boxed{+I} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E_0: t_0 \quad \Gamma \vdash E_1: t_1}{\Gamma \vdash E_0; E_1: t_0 + t_1} \\
\boxed{+\beta_1^T} \mathbf{m}(\mathbf{i}_{1t}(E_0), x_0.E_1, x_1.E_2) \rightsquigarrow [x_0 := E_0]E_1 \\
\boxed{+\beta_2^T} \mathbf{m}(\mathbf{i}_{2t}(E_0), x_0.E_1, x_1.E_2) \rightsquigarrow [x_1 := E_0]E_2 \\
\boxed{+\beta_1} \mathbf{l}(E_0; E_1) \rightsquigarrow E_0 \quad \boxed{+\beta_2} \mathbf{r}(E_0; E_1) \rightsquigarrow E_1 \\
\boxed{+\beta\beta_1^T} \mathbf{l}(\mathbf{i}_{1t}(E)) \rightsquigarrow E \quad \boxed{+\beta\beta_2^T} \mathbf{r}(\mathbf{i}_{2t}(E)) \rightsquigarrow E \\
\boxed{+RR_3^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t}{\mathbf{l}(\mathbf{i}_{2t}(E)) \rightsquigarrow \mathbf{abort}_t(\mathbf{false}_\Gamma)} \quad \boxed{+RR_4^T} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: t}{\mathbf{r}(\mathbf{i}_{1t}(E)) \rightsquigarrow \mathbf{abort}_t(\mathbf{false}_\Gamma)} \\
\boxed{+R^T R_1} \mathbf{m}(E_0; E_1, x_0.E_2, x_1.E_3) \rightsquigarrow [x_0 := E_0]E_2 \\
\boxed{+R^T R_2} \mathbf{m}(E_0; E_1, x_0.E_2, x_1.E_3) \rightsquigarrow [x_1 := E_1]E_3
\end{array}$$

Term Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\emptyset E} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: \emptyset}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{abort}_t(v): t} \\
\boxed{+I_1} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: t_0}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{i}_{1t_1}(v): t_0 + t_1} \quad \boxed{+I_2} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{i}_{2t_0}(v): t_0 + t_1} \\
\boxed{+E} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v_0: t_0 + t_1 \quad \Gamma, x_0: t_0 \vdash v_1: t_2 \quad \Gamma, x_1: t_1 \vdash v_2: t_2}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{m}(v_0, x_0.v_1, x_1.v_2): t_2} \\
\boxed{+\beta_1} \mathbf{m}(\mathbf{i}_{1t}(v_0), x_0.v_1, x_1.v_2) \rightsquigarrow [x_0 := v_0]v_1 \\
\boxed{+\beta_2} \mathbf{m}(\mathbf{i}_{2t}(v_0), x_0.v_1, x_1.v_2) \rightsquigarrow [x_1 := v_0]v_2
\end{array}$$

Command Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{+I_1} \frac{\Delta \vdash E_0 \otimes v}{\Delta \vdash E_0; E_1 \otimes \mathbf{i}_{1t}(v)} \quad \boxed{+I_2} \frac{\Delta \vdash E_1 \otimes v}{\Delta \vdash E_0; E_1 \otimes \mathbf{i}_{2t}(v)} \\
\boxed{\emptyset I} \frac{\Delta \vdash E \otimes \mathbf{abort}_t(v)}{\Delta \vdash \mathbf{false}_\Gamma \otimes v}
\end{array}$$

Dependent Sums

If product of sets becomes an internal hom in the predicate calculus then dependent sums ought to become a little like Π types. So the predicate calculus effectively becomes

like a linear System-F.

Some things become awkward to interpret here though.

I also really can't figure out unpacking. It's messy if you don't want full dependent types.

Not really good at the typing judgements for dependent sum types.

Types	$t ::= \dots \mid x \mid * \mid \mathbf{h}(v) \mid \Sigma(x: *) . t$
Contexts	$E ::= \dots \mid E t \mid \lambda(x: *) . E$
Terms	$v ::= \dots \mid \mathbf{t}(v) \mid \langle x := t, v \rangle$
Command Env	$\Delta ::= \dots \mid \Delta, x \otimes t$

Context Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\Sigma E} \frac{\Gamma_0 \vdash E: \Sigma(x: *) . t_1 \quad \Gamma_1 \vdash t_0: *}{\Gamma_0, \Gamma_1 \vdash E t_0: [x := t_0] t_1} \\
\boxed{\Sigma I} \frac{\Gamma, x: * \vdash E: t}{\Gamma \vdash \lambda(x: *) . E: \Sigma(x: *) . t} \\
\boxed{\Sigma \beta} (\lambda(x: *) . E) t \rightsquigarrow [x := t] E
\end{array}$$

Term Calculus

$$\begin{array}{c}
\boxed{\Sigma E_1} \frac{\Gamma \vdash E: \Sigma(x: *) . t}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{h}(v): *} \\
\boxed{\Sigma E_2} \frac{\Gamma \vdash v: \Sigma(x: *) . t}{\Gamma \vdash \mathbf{t}(v): [x := \mathbf{h}(v)] t} \\
\boxed{\Sigma I} \frac{\Gamma \vdash t_0: * \quad \Gamma, x: * \vdash v: t_1}{\Gamma \vdash \langle x := t_0, v \rangle: \Sigma(x: *) . t_0} \\
\boxed{\Sigma \beta_1} \mathbf{h}(\langle x := t, v \rangle) \rightsquigarrow t \qquad \boxed{\Sigma \beta_2} \mathbf{t}(\langle x := t, v \rangle) \rightsquigarrow [x := t] v
\end{array}$$

Command Calculus

$$\boxed{\Sigma I} \frac{\Delta, x \otimes t \vdash E \otimes v}{\Delta \vdash \lambda(x: *) . E \otimes \langle x := t, v \rangle}$$

I can't figure out commands here at all.

The Future?

Satisfies judgments correspond to thin squares. Moving to more general categories such as **Span** or **Prof** or **Vect** for matrix math requires an interpretation of squares carrying constructive content.