

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338656899>

Pneumonia of Unknown Etiology in Wuhan, China: Potential for International Spread Via Commercial Air Travel

Article in *Journal of Travel Medicine* · January 2020

DOI: 10.1093/jtm/taaa008

CITATIONS

277

READS

798

6 authors, including:



I. I. Bogoch

University of Toronto - University Health Network

199 PUBLICATIONS 3,647 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)



Alexander Watts

St. Michael's Hospital

32 PUBLICATIONS 1,271 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)



Andrea Thomas-Bachli

BlueDot

13 PUBLICATIONS 507 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)



Kamran Khan

128 PUBLICATIONS 4,264 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:



B&MGF Accelerated Grant Proposal (OPP1132415) [View project](#)

Article Type: Rapid Communication

Title: Pneumonia of Unknown Etiology in Wuhan, China: Potential for International Spread Via Commercial Air Travel

Authors: Isaac I. Bogoch,^{1,2,*} Alexander Watts,^{3,4} Andrea Thomas-Bachli,^{3,4} Carmen Huber,^{3,4} Moritz U.G. Kraemer,^{5,6} Kamran Khan^{1,3,4}

Affiliations:

1. Department of Medicine, University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada
2. Divisions of General Internal Medicine and Infectious Diseases, University Health Network, Toronto, Canada
3. Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute, St. Michael's Hospital, Toronto, Canada
4. BlueDot, Toronto, Canada
5. Department of Zoology, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
6. Centre for the Mathematical Modelling of Infectious Diseases, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London, UK

***Correspondence:** Isaac I. Bogoch, Divisions of General Internal Medicine and Infectious Diseases, Toronto General Hospital, 14EN 209, 200 Elizabeth Street, Toronto, ON, Canada M5G 2C4. E-mail: isaac.bogoch@uhn.ca

Keywords: SARS; Air Travel; Coronavirus; Pneumonia; Outbreak; Zoonosis

Word count: 659

Tables: 1

Figures: 0

Highlight: There is currently an outbreak of a pneumonia of unknown etiology in Wuhan, China. While there are still several unanswered questions, we evaluate the potential for international dissemination of this disease via commercial air travel should the outbreak continue.

On December 30, 2019, a report of a cluster of pneumonia of unknown etiology was published on ProMED-mail, possibly related to contact with a seafood market in Wuhan, China.¹ Hospitals in the region held an emergency symposium, and support from federal agencies is reportedly helping to determine the source of infection and causative organism. The seafood market has since been closed, but purportedly sold a variety of live animal species. On January 5, 2020, the World Health Organization (WHO) published a document outlining their request for more information from Chinese public health authorities, and detailed 44 patients had “pneumonia of unknown etiology”, with 121 close contacts under surveillance (www.who.int/csr/don/05-january-2020-pneumonia-of-unknown-cause-china/en/). The WHO reported that 11 patients were severely ill, and many affected individuals had contact with the Huanan Seafood market. Some patients were reported to have fever, dyspnea, and pulmonary infiltrates on chest radiography. At the time of publication, limited information has been produced directly by Chinese public health authorities, however media reports documenting interviews with such authorities have stated that the etiology is not yet identified, that there are now 59 affected patients, and that Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS), the Middle East Respiratory Syndrome (MERS), avian influenza, and several other common respiratory pathogens have been ruled out (<http://news.hebei.com.cn/system/2020/01/05/100154729.shtml>). On January 8, 2020, news outlets and ProMED-mail reported that genetic sequencing demonstrated a novel coronavirus as the potential causative organism.² Given the recent history of zoonotic transmission of a coronavirus emerging from a live-animal market in China in 2002, and the potential for novel pathogens to rapidly spread globally via commercial air travel,^{3,4} we sought to evaluate international travel patterns from Wuhan, China in order to anticipate patterns of disease dispersion should this outbreak evolve.

We evaluated 2018 travel data generated from the International Air Transport Association (IATA) to quantify passenger volumes originating from the international airport in Wuhan, China, between January through March, inclusive. IATA data accounts for approximately 90% of passenger travel itineraries on commercial flights, excluding transportation via unscheduled charter flights (the remainder is modelled using market intelligence). These data represent direct origin (Wuhan) to destination trips, and indirect trips that originated in Wuhan, but had connecting flights to a final destination. We also report Infectious Disease Vulnerability Index (IDVI) scores for countries receiving significant numbers of travellers from Wuhan.⁵ The IDVI score is a validated tool to estimate a country's capacity to prepare for and manage infectious disease threats. A score is based on metrics from seven domains; demographic, health care, public health, disease dynamics, political (domestic), political (international), and economic. Countries are scored between 0-1, with higher scores representing greater capacity to respond to outbreaks.⁵

Table 1 outlines the top 20 destination cities with passengers arriving from Wuhan; Bangkok, Hong Kong, Tokyo, and Taipei received the largest volumes with 41 080, 23 707, 20 001, and 17 645 arrivals between January and March, respectively. The IDVI for these leading destinations all exceed 0.65. Sydney and Victoria, Australia, and Dubai, UAE are the only three cities in the top 20 destinations that are outside of Asia. Bali, Indonesia has the lowest IDVI score (0.563) in the top 20 destination cities.

At the time of publication, much is still unknown about this etiology of this respiratory syndrome. Enhanced surveillance at airports has been enacted in several Asian cities. There are now reports of respiratory illnesses in travellers from Wuhan under investigation in Singapore, Hong Kong, and Seoul, however to date these illnesses are not confirmed to be related to the Wuhan outbreak. Public health agencies around the world are reminding frontline healthcare providers to be vigilant for potential imported cases, however this may be complicated in the northern hemisphere by high levels of influenza-like illnesses at this time of year. To our knowledge, no advisories against travel to Wuhan have been issued. Fortunately, most countries receiving the largest volumes of passengers from Wuhan, China appear to have high IDVI scores, corresponding to relatively strong public health and healthcare capacity.

Seventeen years after the global SARS epidemic, the current outbreak in Wuhan, China serves as a reminder of how rapidly novel pathogens can appear and spread with potentially serious global consequences. Although it is unclear what the current burden of disease is or the potential for human-to-human transmission, major Asian hubs are the most probable sites of exportation should this epidemic continue, and public health officials are already on alert in those locations.

Author contributions:

IIB, KK, AW conceived the idea

AW, ATB, CH conducted data analysis

IIB, KK, AW, ATB, MK interpreted data and contributed to writing

Conflict of interest/disclosure

KK is the founder of BlueDot, a social enterprise that develops digital technologies for public health. KK, AW, ATB, and CH are employed at BlueDot. IIB has consulted for BlueDot. MK has no conflicts of interest to declare.

References

1. ProMED-mail, available from: <https://promedmail.org/promed-post/?id=6864153>. [Date accessed: January 7, 2020].
2. ProMED-mail, available from: <https://promedmail.org/promed-post/?id=20200108.6878869>. [Date accessed: January 9, 2020].
3. Findlater A., Bogoch, II. Human Mobility and the Global Spread of Infectious Diseases: A Focus on Air Travel. *Trends Parasitol.* 2018; 34: 772-83.
4. Poutanen S. M., Low D. E., Henry B., et al. Identification of severe acute respiratory syndrome in Canada. *N Engl J Med.* 2003; 348: 1995-2005.
5. Moore M, Gelfeld B, Okunogbe A, Paul C.
Identifying Future Disease Hot Spots: Infectious Disease Vulnerability Index. *Rand Health Q.* 2017; 6: 5.

Table 1: Top 20 passenger destination cities from Wuhan, China, January to March, 2018, and corresponding Infectious Disease Vulnerability Index (IDVI) of destination countries

DESTINATION CITY	POPULATION* (IN MILLIONS)	DESTINATION PROVINCE	DESTINATION COUNTRY	IDVI	DIRECT VOLUME**	TOTAL VOLUME**
BANGKOK	8.28	Bangkok Metropolis	Thailand	0.711	38,457	41,080
HONG KONG	7.39	Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (SAR)	Hong Kong (SAR)	0.664*	23,608	23,707
TOKYO	9.27	Tokyo	Japan	0.926	18,581	20,001
TAIPEI	2.62	Taipei	Taiwan	0.710	15,086	17,645
PHUKET	0.39	Phuket	Thailand	0.711	14,097	16,656
SEOUL	9.78	Seoul	Korea (South)	0.879	11,771	13,727
SINGAPORE	5.61	Singapore	Singapore	0.878	8,599	13,123
KOTA KINABALU	0.25	Sabah	Malaysia	0.761	12,340	12,661
MACAU	0.62	Macau Special Administrative Region (SAR)	Macao (SAR)	0.664*	10,918	10,932
DENPASAR BALI	0.79	Bali	Indonesia	0.563	7,759	9,065
SYDNEY	5.23	New South Wales	Australia	0.913	5,093	8,431
DUBAI	3.14	Dubai	United Arab Emirates	0.765	6,389	7,389
KUALA LUMPUR	1.81	WP Kuala Lumpur	Malaysia	0.761	2,393	6,822
KAHHSIUNG	2.77	Kaohsiung City	Taiwan	0.710	6,373	6,617
OSAKA	2.69	Osaka	Japan	0.926	3,062	5,745
KRABI	0.46	Krabi	Thailand	0.711	5,012	5,718
MELBOURNE	4.94	Victoria	Australia	0.913	0	5,648
SURAT THANI	0.13	Surat Thani	Thailand	0.711	5,044	5,624
CHIANG MAI	0.13	Chiang Mai	Thailand	0.711	4,354	5,293
PENANG	1.77	Pulau Pinang	Malaysia	0.761	4,436	5,059

*2018 estimates (United Nations)

**IDVI value estimated for China

***IATA data between January through March, 2018, inclusive