

## LITERATURE REVIEW

# Systematic review of factors contributing to penicillin treatment failure in *Streptococcus pyogenes* pharyngitis

Michael E. Pichichero, MD, and Janet R. Casey, MD, Rochester, NY

**OBJECTIVE:** Review the evidence for various explanations for microbiologic treatment failure following use of penicillin in group A streptococcal (GAS) tonsillopharyngitis.

**DATA SOURCE:** Systematic review of the literature based on Medline and EMBASE searches, and review of reference lists of included studies.

**RESULTS:** The explanations for penicillin treatment failure in GAS tonsillopharyngitis include 1) carrier state, 2) lack of compliance, 3) recurrent exposure, 4) in vivo copathogenicity of  $\beta$ -lactamase–producing normal pharyngeal flora, 5) in vivo bacterial coaggregation, 6) poor antibiotic penetration to tonsillopharyngeal tissue, 7) in vivo eradication of normal protective flora, 8) early initiation of antibiotic therapy resulting in suppression of an adequate host immune response, 9) intracellular localization of GAS, 10) GAS tolerance to penicillin, 11) contaminated toothbrushes or orthodontic appliances, and 12) transmission from the family pet. There is very little type I or II evidence to support any of the above-cited explanations for treatment failure in GAS tonsillopharyngitis; available studies are mostly observational (in patients) or laboratory-based without clinical confirmation.

**CONCLUSION:** Multiple explanations have been offered by investigators to explain penicillin treatment failures in GAS tonsillopharyngitis, but the evidence base to support the proposed explanations is generally weak by current standards. Further research is needed to better understand the mechanism(s) of penicillin treatment failure in GAS tonsillopharyngitis.

© 2007 American Academy of Otolaryngology–Head and Neck Surgery Foundation. All rights reserved.

Group A streptococcal (GAS) microbiologic treatment failure following penicillin use was reported in 4 to 8 percent of children with GAS pharyngitis in the 1950s.<sup>1,2</sup> Whereas, in the past 15 years, most studies find treatment failure in the range of 20 to 40 percent.<sup>3</sup> In this review, various proposed explanations for microbiological treatment failures following penicillin will be discussed. The explanations include 1) carrier state,<sup>4,5-12</sup> 2) lack of compliance, 3) recurrent exposure (family or peers), 4) in vivo copathogenicity of  $\beta$ -lactamase–producing flora (BLPF),<sup>13-36</sup> 5) in vivo bacterial coaggregation,<sup>37</sup> 6) poor tonsillar penetration of antibi-

otic,<sup>38-43</sup> 7) in vivo eradication of protective throat microflora,<sup>14,26,29,36,44-52</sup> 8) early initiation of antibiotics resulting in inadequate host immune response,<sup>53-55</sup> 9) intracellular localization of GAS,<sup>56-65</sup> 10) streptococcal tolerance to penicillin,<sup>66-72</sup> 11) fomites,<sup>73,74</sup> and 12) family pet<sup>75-78</sup> (Table 1). In addition, there may be other factors acting alone or in concert that result in the phenomenon of microbiologic treatment failure, such as host and/or characteristics specific to the strain of GAS.

## METHODS

The streptococcal pharyngitis literature was accessed with a Medline search from 1960 to 2006, and an EMBASE search from 1980 to 2006. Search terms included streptococcal pharyngitis, streptococcal carrier, recurrence, and treatment failure. There was no language restriction. To search for articles published prior to 1960, the extensive library of one of the authors (Pichichero) was searched and all relevant articles were reviewed. Reference lists of included articles were searched to identify any articles missed in the online searches.

Inclusion criteria for studies included in this systematic review were 1) studies of recurrent streptococcal pharyngitis including randomized clinical trials, epidemiological trials, case studies, and literature reviews; 2) in vitro studies examining the microbiology of patients with recurrent streptococcal pharyngitis; 3) animal trials; 4) no age restrictions of the patient population.

Exclusion criteria for articles were 1) randomized trials evaluating the efficacy of a treatment in a nonrecurrent streptococcal pharyngitis; 2) treatment trials that did not discuss explanations for recurrences.

All articles were examined for indicators of quality by both authors. For particular recommendations and statements, the strength of the supporting evidence and quality of the data were rated by a modification of The Infectious Diseases Society of America—United States Public Health

Received March 19, 2007; revised July 6, 2007; accepted July 25, 2007.

**Table 1**  
**Explanations for recurrent streptococcal pharyngitis**

Explanation	Number of studies with evidence type				
	I	II	III	In vitro	Animal studies
Carrier state; no disease <sup>4-12</sup>	1 <sup>10</sup>	3 <sup>5,9,12</sup>	8 <sup>4,5-8</sup>	0	0
Poor patient compliance	0	4	0	0	0
Recurrent exposures	0	3	1	0	0
Copathogenicity <sup>13-36</sup>	1 <sup>33</sup>	7 <sup>14,16,21,22,27,28,35</sup>	11 <sup>13,17,20,21,24,25,30-34</sup>	3 <sup>15,18,26</sup>	2 <sup>29,37</sup>
Coaggregation <sup>37</sup>	0	0	0	1 <sup>37</sup>	0
Poor tonsillar penetration <sup>37-43</sup>	0	0	1 <sup>39</sup>	5 <sup>38,40-43</sup>	0
Eradication of protective nonpathogenic pharyngeal flora <sup>14,26,29-36,44-52</sup>	3 <sup>58,59,62</sup>	3 <sup>45,47,51</sup>	1 <sup>14</sup>	3 <sup>26,44,46</sup>	3 <sup>29,36,50</sup>
Early antibiotic treatment <sup>53-55</sup>	3 <sup>63-65</sup>	0	0	0	0
Intracellular localization of GAS <sup>56-58</sup>	0	2 <sup>59,65</sup>	0	7 <sup>56-58,60-64</sup>	0
Penicillin tolerance <sup>66-72</sup>	0	2 <sup>69,70</sup>	1 <sup>71</sup>	3 <sup>66-68</sup>	0
Toothbrush or orthodontic appliance contamination <sup>73-74</sup>	0	0	0	2 <sup>73-74</sup>	0
Family pets as source of reinfection <sup>75-78</sup>	0	1 <sup>75</sup>	2 <sup>76,77</sup>	0	1 <sup>78</sup>

GAS, Group A streptococcal.

Service grading system.<sup>79</sup> Roman numerals I-III indicate the quality of the supporting evidence. The articles were classified as “I” if it was a randomized, clinical trial; “II” if the trial was an epidemiological study without randomization; “III” if the trial was a case study or a review of the literature; “in vitro” if the manuscript was of in vitro studies of patient samples (such as throat culture specimens); and “animal studies” if the manuscript involved an animal model to evaluate a hypothesis to examine a possible explanation for recurrent streptococcal pharyngitis.

## RESULTS

The literature searches, personal library search, and reviews of the identified manuscripts' reference lists yielded >900 articles related to streptococcal pharyngitis. The majority of the articles were excluded because they were not about recurrent streptococcal infections. A total of 96 articles fulfilled the inclusion criteria; however, 10 articles could not be obtained for review.

Eighty-six articles were reviewed and quality of the evidence recorded by both authors (Table 1). Eight randomized clinical trials were graded as I, 26 nonrandomized epidemiological trials as II, 26 case studies or reviews as III. There were 22 in vitro studies and six animal studies.

### Explanations of Penicillin Treatment Failure

*The carrier.* Twelve studies were identified that discussed the streptococcal carrier as the explanation of recurrent

GAS pharyngitis. One study<sup>10</sup> was a randomized clinical trial, three studies<sup>5,9,12</sup> were nonrandomized clinical trials of epidemiological trials, and eight<sup>4,6-8,11</sup> were case studies and/or reviews of the literature (Table 1). The majority of the evidence for this explanation of penicillin treatment failures relies on nonrandomized trials, epidemiological studies, case studies, and reviews.

*Identifying the carrier.* Carriers of GAS harbor the organism in their noses or throats but display no symptoms of acute infection and do not mount an antibody response to the organism (Table 2). It may be possible, although not practical in the routine setting, to distinguish between a patient with acute GAS infection and a streptococcal carrier by comparing the titers of antibody to GAS antigens (usually antistreptolysin) in acute and convalescent serum specimens. Unfortunately, the initiation of early antibiotic treatment of GAS pharyngitis will significantly dampen or completely prevent a rise in antistreptococcal antibodies. A

**Table 2**  
**Definition of the group A streptococcal (GAS) tonsillopharyngeal carrier**

Positive GAS throat culture or rapid antigen detection test, plus
Clinically well with no symptoms or signs of acute GAS throat infection, plus
If measured, no detectable immune response to GAS strain

low antibody titer in two consecutive specimens may suggest continuous carriage of GAS rather than an acute GAS infection.

See the Appendix for discussions of prevalence and significance of carriers, how children become carriers, treatment of the carrier, and other explanations for penicillin treatment failure.

### Copathogens

Twenty-four trials were identified that discussed copathogenicity as the explanation of penicillin failures<sup>13-36</sup> (Table 1). One trial<sup>33</sup> was a randomized clinical trial, seven<sup>14,16,21,22,27,28,35</sup> were nonrandomized clinical trials or epidemiological studies, 11<sup>13,17,20,21,24,25,30-34</sup> trials were either case studies or reviews of the literature, three<sup>15,18,26</sup> trials were in vitro studies of patient specimens, and two<sup>27,37</sup> trials studied animal models of copathogenicity.

Copathogenicity has become an acknowledged mechanism to explain penicillin treatment failure.<sup>82</sup> The presence of co-colonizing bacteria, termed copathogens, that elaborate  $\beta$ -lactamase in the tonsillopharynx has been proposed as a possible mechanism by which penicillin is inactivated prior to bactericidal action on GAS.<sup>13-36</sup> *Staphylococcus aureus*, *Haemophilus influenzae*, *Moraxella catarrhalis*, and  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing anaerobic species are common flora in the pharynx. The prevalence of these  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria may be increased as a consequence of penicillin treatment of patients with GAS pharyngitis, thereby leading to increased penicillin failures. Indirect evidence suggests that when copathogens are present in the pharynx, use of antibiotics that are effective despite the presence of  $\beta$ -lactamase may enhance bacteriological and clinical success<sup>3,13,35,82,97,98</sup> although this is not a universal finding.<sup>84</sup> It is not necessary to eradicate the copathogens that produce  $\beta$ -lactamase. Rather, it is necessary for the antibiotic employed to remain active despite the presence of  $\beta$ -lactamase in vivo. Patients who have recurrent bouts of GAS pharyngitis and/or in whom penicillin does not eradicate GAS might be colonized with copathogens. Selecting an alternative antibiotic that is  $\beta$ -lactamase stable and can be bactericidal to GAS despite the presence of  $\beta$ -lactamase, in some cases, proves an important therapeutic strategy in copathogen-colonized patients who experience GAS pharyngitis.

### Coaggregation

Another explanation for penicillin failure may involve an interaction of GAS with *Moraxella catarrhalis*. One in vitro study was identified.<sup>37</sup> Colonization with *M catarrhalis* can facilitate GAS pharyngeal attachment because GAS can attach to *M catarrhalis* adhesins. In this way, a high concentration of  $\beta$ -lactamase to inactivate penicillin in the tonsillopharyngeal tissues may occur. In a recent study, Brook and Gober<sup>105</sup> evaluated the cohabitation of the tonsillopharynx by GAS and certain other bacterial species that may contribute to the inflammatory process and the failure of penicillin therapy. The study evaluated the recovery of *H influenzae*, *M catarrha-*

*lis*, *Staphylococcus aureus*, and *Streptococcus pneumoniae* in association with acute tonsillopharyngitis. An association between the recovery of GAS and *H influenzae* and *M catarrhalis* from patients with acute tonsillopharyngitis and *M catarrhalis* from healthy children was found.

### Poor Tonsillar Penetration of Antibiotic

Eradication failure might be due to the lack of sufficient antibiotic concentration at the site of infection during the recommended treatment time.<sup>38-43</sup> Six studies identified this phenomenon as a possible mechanism of penicillin treatment failures. One trial<sup>39</sup> was a case study and five were in vitro studies.<sup>38,40-43</sup>

### Alteration of Microbial Ecology/Bacterial Interference

Eradication of the normal pharyngeal flora, especially  $\alpha$ -hemolytic streptococci, may enhance the susceptibility of patients to subsequent infection with GAS; their presence has been shown to be associated with resistance to GAS infection by a mechanism termed "bacterial interference."<sup>14,26,29,36,44-52</sup> Thirteen trials were identified that discussed bacterial interference as a possible explanation of penicillin treatment failures. Three trials<sup>48,49,52</sup> were randomized clinical trials, three trials<sup>45,47,51</sup> were nonrandomized clinical trials, one trial<sup>14</sup> was a review, and three trials each were in vitro studies<sup>26,44,46</sup> or animal studies.<sup>29,36,50</sup> Penicillin may eradicate or suppress host indigenous bacterial flora. Such alterations may result in clinical or subclinical superinfections, resulting in quantitative and qualitative changes in the pharyngeal ecosystem. Penicillin treatment causes a significant quantitative decrease in  $\alpha$ -hemolytic streptococci,  $\gamma$ -hemolytic streptococci, peptostreptococci, and *Prevotella* in the throat; thereby the ecological balance in the throat is disturbed. These effects can persist weeks after therapy. Elimination of  $\alpha$ -streptococci from the throat eliminates their ability to produce bacteriocins, which are a part of the natural host resistance to GAS colonization. Using throat gargles of live  $\alpha$ -streptococci prepared from a patient's own throat bacteria has been suggested as a possible therapeutic strategy for prevention of GAS infection, particularly in prevention of relapse or recurrent disease.<sup>48-51</sup> The role of bacterial interference in eradication failure has not always been observed.

### Early Treatment Suppresses Immunity

Prompt initiation of penicillin treatment with the onset of acute symptoms may suppress the antistreptolysin and anti-DNase B antibody rise typically observed to follow GAS infections. Three articles, all randomized clinical trials, were identified.<sup>53-55</sup> Antibody suppression has been associated with GAS pharyngitis relapse and recurrence.<sup>53-54</sup> These observations have been challenged<sup>84,85</sup>; however, no study of similar design with a placebo control has produced contrary results. Although delaying treatment is probably not necessary in most cases of GAS pharyngitis, it may be

a useful strategy for patients who have frequent, recurrent mild-to-moderate infections.

### Intracellular Localization

A number of published reports now describe the capacity of various GAS strains to enter and survive within epithelial and macrophage-like cells of the upper respiratory tract cells.<sup>56-65</sup> Nine such trials were identified: Two were non-randomized trials<sup>59,65</sup> and seven were in vitro studies<sup>56-58,60-64</sup> (Table 1). Consequently, it has been suggested that the cell entry by GAS may enable the bacterium to survive in an environment that is shielded from the bactericidal effect of penicillin, as well as other  $\beta$ -lactams, which cannot reach bactericidal intracellular concentrations.

The first genes implicated with high-efficiency internalization of various GAS strains were *sfbl* and *prtF1*, which encode for a closely related fibronectin-binding protein.<sup>64,65</sup> The prevalence of the *prtF1* gene in GAS strains derived from asymptomatic patients with eradication failure following penicillin therapy has been compared with the prevalence in strains derived from patients with successful bacterial eradication. A strong correlation between the presence of *prtF1* and GAS eradication failure was found.<sup>52</sup>

### Penicillin Tolerance

Despite the extensive use of penicillin in the past six decades, no resistance has emerged among GAS.<sup>86,87</sup> Tolerance, whereby bacteria repeatedly or continuously exposed to sublethal concentrations of penicillin become increasingly resistant to eradication, has been suggested to cause penicillin treatment failure.<sup>66-72</sup> Six such articles were identified. Two articles<sup>69,70</sup> were nonrandomized clinical trials, one article<sup>71</sup> was a review of the literature, and three articles<sup>66-68</sup> were in vitro studies (Table 1). Sporadic reports correlated in vitro penicillin tolerance (ie, significantly decreased bactericidal effect of penicillin) with GAS eradication failure, but conflicting findings have been reported by others. Disagreement on a uniform and accepted method of testing penicillin tolerance in GAS may explain the conflicting results. Of importance are stored versus freshly isolated strains; the number of colonies selected for subculture; phase of growth; size of inoculum; macrobroth or microbroth method; composition of the test medium including the pH; length of incubation; mixing of tubes during the test; volume of subculture taken from liquid medium; use of  $\beta$ -lactamase for minimal bactericidal concentration (MBC) determination; ratio of MBC to minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) used to define tolerance. An ineffective bactericidal effect might be associated with the growth phase of GAS. GAS might survive in a stationary-like phase, in which cell-wall synthesis is minimal (Eagle effect). Several penicillin-binding proteins of GAS are lost when the bacterium enters the stationary phase in vitro.

### Toothbrushes and Orthodontic Appliances

A limited amount of research has been done on the ability of GAS to adhere to toothbrushes and orthodontic appliances<sup>73,75</sup>

(Table 1). The studies were in vitro simulations to demonstrate the possibility of the organism to contaminate these objects that go in the mouth and results of a study of 104 children, but there is no direct evidence to link GAS recurrences to use of the same toothbrush before and after acute infection nor to a benefit by disinfecting orthodontic retainers.

### Family Pet

Small, descriptive reports and one animal study have suggested that, in rare instances, dogs or cats may be carriers of GAS although GAS are not a normal colonizer of these animals; however, this possibility has not been corroborated in other investigations<sup>75-78</sup> (Table 1).

### Host and Strain Factors

Explanations for susceptibility to GAS tonsillopharyngitis have been elusive. Some data suggest differences in expression of oropharyngeal epithelial cell receptors that allow GAS attachment.<sup>88,89</sup> There may be pharmacogenomic variation in penicillin pharmacokinetics<sup>90</sup> similar to that for amoxicillin.<sup>91,92</sup>

Some GAS strains express a thicker polysaccharide capsule (so-called mucoid strains). These strains have been associated with acute rheumatic fever (ARF) outbreaks<sup>93</sup>; notably about 40 percent of the patients experiencing ARF during the Salt Lake City<sup>94,101</sup> and western Pennsylvania/northeast Ohio outbreaks<sup>99,100</sup> had received penicillin or amoxicillin.

## CONCLUSION

Factors that may contribute to penicillin treatment failure include the carrier state, a lack of compliance, recurrent exposure, in vivo copathogenicity of  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing normal pharyngeal flora, in vivo bacterial coaggregation, poor antibiotic penetration into tonsillopharyngeal tissue, in vivo eradication of normal protective flora, early initiation of antibiotic therapy resulting in suppression of an adequate host immune response, intracellular localization of GAS, GAS tolerance, contaminated toothbrushes or orthodontic appliance, and transmission of GAS from a family pet. There is a need for type I or II evidence to support the above explanations. However, it is very clear and the evidence base is abundant that microbiological treatment failure with penicillin has been reported with increased frequency since around 1970,<sup>97,98</sup> coincident with the explosion of  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing normal oropharyngeal flora and early initiation of antibiotic treatment (owing to rapid antigen detection testing), which may result in suppression of an adequate host immune response and reduce antibiotic penetration. Although all guidelines continue to advocate penicillin as the sole treatment of choice and argue that penicillin treatment failures are occurring in only carriers, this argument has no evidence base. That is, there is no evidence that more children are GAS carriers today or since



1970 compared with the 1950s and 1960s. Nor is there evidence that, during the past 35 years, more GAS carriers have enrolled in clinical trials of GAS tonsillopharyngitis in which treatment with penicillin or amoxicillin was rendered.

Despite increasing microbiological treatment failures with penicillin, rheumatic fever has not returned to the developed world as a consequence. However, rheumatic fever occurs in the specific and special circumstance when GAS infection of the throat involves a rheumatogenic strain and illness occurs in a genetically susceptible host—often in a circumstance of poorly defined environmental factors that may influence the inoculum of GAS and/or the ability to mount an appropriate immune response. In this regard, Shulman et al<sup>95</sup> recently reported that the reason we are not seeing an increase in rheumatic fever is because we have not had widespread circulation of rheumatogenic GAS strains in the United States since around 1950. Besides the new morbidity of GAS, tonsillopharyngitis is related to pediatric autoimmune neuropsychiatric disorders associated with streptococcal infections (PANDAS).<sup>96,102-104</sup> and the need to limit contagion and to return children to school and parents to work with the lowest risk possible of treatment failure.<sup>80,81</sup>

## AUTHOR INFORMATION

From the University of Rochester, and Legacy Pediatrics.

Corresponding author: Dr Michael E. Pichichero, University of Rochester Medical Center, 601 Elmwood Avenue, Box 672, Rochester, New York 14642.

E-mail address: Michael\_pichichero@urmc.rochester.edu.

## AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

**Michael E. Pichichero** and **Janet R. Casey**, study concept, literature review, writing, and revision.

## FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE

**Michael E. Pichichero** and **Janet R. Casey**, no conflicts for this article; however, both authors serve as consultants to or receive research grant from Abbott, Advancis, Bristol-Myers/Squibb, GlaxoSmithKline, Innovia Medical, Johnson & Johnson, Medimmune, Merck, Replidyne, Sanofi Aventis, Sanofi Pasteur, Shionogi USA, Welch Allyn.

## REFERENCES

1. Denny FW, Wannamaker LW, Brink WR, et al. Prevention of rheumatic fever. JAMA 1950;143(2):151-4.
2. Wannamaker LW, Rammelkamp CH Jr, Denny FW, et al. Prophylaxis of acute rheumatic fever by treatment of the preceding streptococcal infection with various amounts of depot penicillin. Am J Med 1951;June:673-95.
3. Pichichero ME. The rising incidence of penicillin treatment failures in group A streptococcal tonsillopharyngitis: an emerging role for the cephalosporins? Pediatr Infect Dis J 1991;10(Suppl):50S-5S.
4. Cockerill FR, MacDonald KL, Thompson RL, et al. An outbreak of invasive group A streptococcal disease associated with high carriage rates of the invasive clone among school-aged children. JAMA 1997; 277:38-43.
5. Kaplan EL, Top FH Jr, Dudding BA, et al. Diagnosis of streptococcal pharyngitis: differentiation of active infection from the carrier state in the symptomatic child. J Infect Dis 1971;123(5):490-501.
6. Denny FW. Current problems in managing streptococcal pharyngitis. Pediatrics 1987;111(66):797-806.
7. Bisno AL. Acute pharyngitis. N Engl J Med 2001;344(3):205-211.
8. Shulman ST. Acute streptococcal pharyngitis in pediatric medicine: current issues in diagnosis and management. Paediatr Drugs 2003; 5(Suppl 1):13-23.
9. Hoffman S. The throat carrier rate of Group A and other beta hemolytic streptococci among patients in general practice. Acta Path Microbiol Immunol (Scand) 1985;Sect. B 93:347-51.
10. Rosenstein BH, Markowitz M, Goldstein E, et al. Factors involved in treatment failures following oral penicillin therapy of streptococcal pharyngitis. Pediatrics 1968;73(4):513-20.
11. Gerber MA. Treatment failures and carriers: perception or problems? Pediatr Infect Dis J 1994;13:576-9.
12. Kaplan EL, Gastanaduy AS, Huwe BB. The role of the carrier in treatment failures after antibiotic therapy for group A streptococci in the upper respiratory tract. J Lab Clin Med 1981;98(3):326-35.
13. Brook I. Penicillin failure and copathogenicity in streptococcal pharyngotonsillitis. J Fam Pract 1994;38(2):175-9.
14. Brook I, Gober AE. Bacterial interference by aerobic and anaerobic bacteria in children with recurrent group A  $\beta$ -hemolytic streptococcal tonsillitis. Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 1999;125:552-4.
15. Brook I, Yocum P. In vitro protection of group A beta-hemolytic streptococci from penicillin and cephalothin by *Bacteroides fragilis*. Chemotherapy 1983;29:18-23.
16. Brook I. Emergence and persistence of beta-lactamase-producing bacteria in the oropharynx following penicillin treatment. Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg 1988;114:667-70.
17. Brook I. The role of  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria in the persistence of streptococcal tonsillar infection. Rev Infect Dis 1984;6(5): 601-7.
18. Brook I, Calhoun L, Yocum P. Beta lactamase-producing isolates of *Bacteroides* species from children. Antimicrob Agents Chemother 1980;18:164-6.
19. Brook I, Yocum P, Friedman EM. Aerobic and anaerobic bacteria in tonsils of children with recurrent tonsillitis. Ann Otol Rhinol Laryngol 1987;90:261-3.
20. Simon HJ, Sukai W. Staphylococcal antagonism to penicillin-G therapy of hemolytic streptococcal pharyngeal infection: effect of oxacillin. Pediatrics 1968;31:463-9.
21. Kundsinn RB, Miller JM. Significance of the *Staphylococcus aureus* carrier state in the treatment of disease due to group A streptococci. N Engl J Med 1964;271:1395-7.
22. Quie PG, Pierce HC, Wannamaker LW. Influence of penicillinase producing staphylococci on the eradication of group A streptococci from the upper respiratory tract by penicillin treatment. Pediatrics 1966;37:467-76.
23. Markowitz M, Kramer I, Goldstein E, et al. Persistence of group A streptococci as related to penicillin producing staphylococci: comparison of penicillin V potassium and sodium nafcillin. J Pediatr 1967;71:132-7.
24. Reilly S, Imms P, Beeden AG, et al. Possible role of the anaerobe in tonsillitis. J Clin Pathol 1981;34:542-7.
25. Tunér K, Nord CE. The role of  $\beta$ -lactamase producing *Bacteroides* in recurrent tonsillitis. Acta Otolaryngol (Stockh) 1983;95:191-2.

26. Bernstein SH, Stillerman M, Allerhand J. Demonstration of penicillin inhibition by pharyngeal microflora in patients treated for streptococcal pharyngitis. *J Lab Clin Med* 1964;63:14–22.
27. Brook I, Gober AE. Emergence of beta lactamase-producing aerobic and anaerobic bacteria in the oropharynx of children following penicillin. *Clin Pediatrics (Phila)* 1984;23:338–9.
28. Brook I, Pazzaglia G, Coolbaugh JC, et al. In vitro protection of Group A beta hemolytic streptococci by beta lactamase producing *Bacteroides* species. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 1983;12:599–606.
29. Brook I, Pazzaglia G, Coolbaugh JC, et al. In vivo protection of penicillin susceptible streptococcus pyogenes from penicillin by facultative bacteria which produce beta lactamase. *Can J Microbiol* 1984;30:98–103.
30. Frank P, Miller L. Antagonistic effect of a penicillinase-producing *Staphylococcus* on penicillin therapy of a streptococcal throat infection. *Am J Med Sci* 1962;243:582–5.
31. Brook I.  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria recovered after clinical failures with various penicillin therapy. *Arch Otolaryngol* 1984;110:228–31.
32. Brook I. Microbial factors leading to recurrent upper respiratory tract infections. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1998;17:S62–7.
33. Brook I. The role of  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria in respiratory tract infections. *Scand J Infect Dis Suppl* 1988;57:41–9.
34. Brook I. Role of anaerobic  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria in upper respiratory tract infections. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1987;6:310–6.
35. Smith TD, Huskins WC, Kim KS, et al. Efficacy of  $\beta$ -lactamase-resistant penicillin and influence of penicillin tolerance in eradicating streptococci from the pharynx after failure of penicillin therapy for group A streptococcal pharyngitis. *J Pediatr* 1987;110:777–82.
36. Brook I, Gober AE. Role of bacterial interference and  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing bacteria in the failure of penicillin to eradicate group A streptococcal pharyngotonsillitis. *Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 1995;121:1405–9.
37. Lafontaine E, Wall D, Vanlerberg S, et al. *Moraxella catarrhalis* coaggregates with *Streptococcus pyogenes* and modulates interactions of *S. pyogenes* with human epithelial cells. *Infect Immun* 2004;72(11):6689–93.
38. Holm S, Ekedahl C. Comparative study of the penetration of penicillin V and cefadroxil into tonsils in man. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 1982;10(Suppl B):121–3.
39. Stjernquist-Desatnik A, Samuelsson P, Walder M. Penetration of penicillin V to tonsillar surface fluid in healthy individuals and in patients with acute tonsillitis. *J Laryngol Otol* 1993;107:309–12.
40. Strömberg A, Friberg U, Cars O. Concentrations of phenoxymethylpenicillin and cefadroxil in tonsillar tissue and tonsillar surface fluid. *Eur J Clin Microbiol* 1987;6:525–9.
41. Roos K, Grahn E, Ekedahl C, et al. Pharmacokinetics of phenoxymethylpenicillin in tonsils. *Scand J Infect Dis* 1986;18:125–30.
42. Sundberg L, Edén T, Ernstson S. Penetration of erythromycin in Waldeyer's ring—tonsil tissue. *Acta Oto-Laryngologica (Stockh)* 1981;384(Suppl):10–7.
43. Kaplan JM, McCracken GA, Culburtson MC. Penicillin and erythromycin concentrations in tonsils. *Am J Dis Child* 1974;127:206–11.
44. Sanders WE. Bacterial interference, I: its occurrence among the respiratory tract flora and characterization of inhibition of group A streptococci by viridans streptococci. *J Infect Dis* 1969;120:698–707.
45. Crowe CC, Sanders WE Jr, Longley S. Bacterial interference, II: role of the normal throat flora in prevention of colonization by group A *Streptococcus*. *J Infect Dis* 1973;128:527–32.
46. Sanders CC, Sanders WE Jr, Harrowe DJ. Bacterial interference: effects of oral antibiotics on the normal throat flora and its ability to interfere with group A streptococci. *Infect Immun* 1976;13:808–12.
47. Sanders CC, Nelson GE, Sanders WE. Bacterial interference, IV: epidemiologic determinants of the antagonistic activity of the normal throat flora against group A streptococci. *Infect Immun* 1977;16:599–603.
48. Roos K, Holm SE, Grahn E, et al. Alpha-streptococci as supplementary treatment of recurrent streptococcal tonsillitis: a randomized placebo-controlled study. *Scand J Infect Dis* 1993;25:31–5.
49. Roos K, Holm SE, Grahn-Hakansson E, et al. Recolonization with selected alpha-streptococci for prophylaxis of recurrent streptococcal pharyngotonsillitis—a randomized placebo-controlled multicentre study. *Scand J Infect Dis* 1996;28:459–62.
50. Brook I, Gillmore JD. Evaluation of bacterial interference and  $\beta$ -lactamase production in the management of experimental infection with group A  $\beta$ -hemolytic streptococci. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1993;37:1452–5.
51. Sprunt K, Redman W. Evidence suggesting importance of role of interbacterial inhibition in maintaining balance of normal flora. *Ann Intern Med* 1968;68:579–90.
52. Falck G, Grahn-Hakansson E, Holm SE, et al. Tolerance and efficacy of interfering alpha-streptococci in recurrence of streptococcal pharyngopharyngitis: a placebo-controlled study. *Acta Otolaryngol* 1999;119:944–8.
53. Pichichero ME, Disney FA, Talpey WB, et al. Adverse and beneficial effects of immediate treatment of Group A beta-hemolytic streptococcal pharyngitis with penicillin. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1987;6:635–43.
54. el-Daher NT, Hijazi SS, Rawashdeh NM, et al. Immediate vs. delayed treatment of group A beta-hemolytic streptococcal pharyngitis with penicillin V. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1991;10:126–30.
55. Gerber MA, Randolph MF, DeMeo KK, et al. Lack of impact of early antibiotic therapy for streptococcal pharyngitis on recurrence rates. *J Pediatr* 1990;117(6):853–8.
56. LaPenta D, Rubens C, Chi E, et al. Group A streptococci efficiently invade human respiratory epithelial cells. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 1994;91:12115–9.
57. Osterlund A, Engstrand L. Intracellular penetration and survival of *Streptococcus pyogenes* in respiratory epithelial cells in vitro. *Acta Otolaryngol (Stockh)* 1995;115:685–8.
58. Osterlund A, Engstrand L. An intracellular sanctuary for *Streptococcus pyogenes* in human tonsillar epithelium—studies of asymptomatic carriers and in vitro cultured biopsies. *Acta Otolaryngol (Stockh)* 1997;117:883–8.
59. Osterlund A, Popa R, Nikkila T, et al. Intracellular reservoir of *Streptococcus pyogenes* in vivo: a possible explanation for recurrent pharyngotonsillitis. *Laryngoscope* 1997;107:640–7.
60. Molinari G, Chhatwal GS. Invasion and survival of *Streptococcus pyogenes* in eukaryotic cells correlates with the source of the clinical isolates. *J Infect Dis* 1998;177:1600–7.
61. Jadoun J, Ozeri V, Burstein E, et al. Protein F1 is required for efficient entry of *Streptococcus pyogenes* into epithelial cells. *J Infect Dis* 1998;178:147–58.
62. Dombek PE, Cue D, Sedgewick J, et al. High-frequency intracellular invasion of epithelial cells by serotype M1 group A streptococci: M1 protein-mediated invasion and cytoskeletal rearrangements. *Mol Microbiol* 1999;31:859–70.
63. Bennett-Wood VR, Carapetis JR, Robins-Browne RM. Ability of clinical isolates of group A streptococci to adhere to and invade HEp-2 epithelial cells. *J Med Microbiol* 1998;47:899–906.
64. Molinari G, Talay SR, Valentin-Weigand P, et al. The fibronectin-binding protein of *Streptococcus pyogenes*, SfbI, is involved in the internalization of group A streptococci by epithelial cells. *Infect Immun* 1997;65:1357–63.
65. Neeman R, Keller N, Barzilai A, et al. Prevalence of internalization-associated gene, prtF1, among persisting group-A *Streptococcus* strains isolated from asymptomatic carriers. *Lancet* 1998;352:1974–7.
66. Grahn E, Holm SE, Roos K. Penicillin tolerance in  $\beta$ -streptococci isolated from patients with tonsillitis. *Scand J Infect Dis* 1987;19:421–6.
67. Kim KS, Kaplan EL. Association of penicillin tolerance with failure to eradicate group A streptococci from patients with pharyngitis. *Pediatrics* 1985;107(5):681–4.

68. Kim KS, Anthony, BF. Use of penicillin-gradient and replicate plates for the demonstration of tolerance to penicillin in streptococci. *J Infect Dis* 1983;148(3):488–91.
69. Dagan R, Ferne M, Sheinis M, et al. An epidemic of penicillin-tolerant group A streptococcal pharyngitis in children living in a closed community: mass treatment with erythromycin. *J Infect Dis* 1987; 156(3):514–6.
70. Stjernquist-Desatnik A, Orrling A, Schalen C, et al. Penicillin tolerance in group A streptococci and treatment failure in streptococcal tonsillitis. *Acta Otolaryngol Suppl* 1992;492:68–71.
71. van Asselt GJ, Mouton RP, van Boven CP. Penicillin tolerance and treatment failure in group A streptococcal pharyngotonsillitis. *Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis* 1996;15:107–15.
72. Orrling A, Stjernquist-Desatnik A, Schalen C, et al. Treatment failure in streptococcal pharyngotonsillitis: an attempt to identify penicillin tolerant *Streptococcus pyogenes*. *Scand J Infect Dis* 1996;28:143–7.
73. Kahtib R, Posios V. Recurrent *Streptococcus pyogenes* pharyngitis due to an inadequately cleaned orthodontic appliance. *Clinical Infect Dis* 1995;21:230.
74. Brook I, Gober AE. Persistence of group A  $\beta$ -hemolytic streptococci in toothbrushes and removable orthodontic appliances following treatment of pharyngotonsillitis. *Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 1998;124:993–5.
75. Wilson KS, Maroney SA, Gander RM. The family pet as unlikely source of group A beta-hemolytic streptococcal infection in humans. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1995;14:372–5.
76. Mayer G, Van Ore S. Recurrent pharyngitis in family of four: household pet as reservoir of group A streptococci. *Postgrad Med* 1983; 74:277–9.
77. Roos K, Lind L, Holm SE. Beta-haemolytic streptococci group A in a cat, as a possible source of repeated tonsillitis in a family. *Lancet* 1988;2:1072.
78. Biberstein EL, Brown C, Smith T. Serogroups and biotypes among beta-hemolytic streptococci of canine origin. *J Clin Microbiol* 1980; 11:558–61.
79. Gross PA, Barrett TL, Dellinger EP, et al. Purpose of quality standards for infectious diseases. *Clin Infect Dis* 1994;18:421.
80. Wannamaker L. Perplexity and precision in the diagnosis of streptococcal pharyngitis. *Am J Dis Child* 1972;124:352–8.
81. Bisno A, Ofek I. Serologic diagnosis of streptococcal infection. *Am J Dis Child* 1974;127:676–81.
82. Committee on Infectious Diseases—American Academy of Pediatrics. Pickering LK, ed. Red Book: 2006 Report of the committee on infectious diseases. American Academy of Pediatrics. 2006.
83. Reed BD, Huck W, Zazove P. Treatment of  $\beta$ -hemolytic streptococcal pharyngitis with cefaclor or penicillin: efficacy and interaction with  $\beta$ -lactamase-producing organisms in the pharynx. *J Fam Pract* 1991;32:138–44.
84. Tanz R, Shulman S, Sroka P, et al. Lack of influence of beta-lactamase-producing flora on recovery of group A streptococci after treatment of acute pharyngitis. *J Pediatr* 1991;117(6):859–63.
85. Randolph MF, Gerber MA, DeMeo KK, et al. Effect of antibiotic therapy on the clinical course of streptococcal pharyngitis. *J Pediatr* 1985;106(6):870–5.
86. Macris MJ, Hartman N, Murray B, et al. Studies of the continuing susceptibility of group A streptococcal strains to penicillin during eight decades. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1998;17:377–81.
87. Gerber MA. Antibiotic resistance in group A streptococci. *Pediatr Clin North Am*. 1995;42:539–51.
88. Selinger DS, Julie N, Reed WP, et al. Adherence of Group A streptococci to pharyngeal cells: a role in the pathogenesis of rheumatic fever. *Science* 1978;201(4):455–7.
89. Reed WP, Selinger DS, Albright EL, et al. Streptococcal adherence to pharyngeal cells of children with acute rheumatic fever. *J Infect Dis* 1980;142(6):803–10.
90. Kearns GL, Abdel-Rahman SM, Alander SW, et al. Developmental pharmacology—drug disposition, action, and therapy in infants and children. *N Eng J Med* 2003;349(12):1157–67.
91. Sjövall J, Alvan G, Westerlund D. Dose-dependent absorption of amoxycillin and bacampicillin. *Clin Pharmacol Ther* 1985;38: 241–50.
92. Welling PG, Huang H, Koch PA, et al. Bioavailability of ampicillin and amoxicillin in fasted and nonfasted subjects. *J Pharm Sci* 1977; 66:549–52.
93. Miner LJ, Petheram SJ, Daly JA, et al. Molecular characterization of *Streptococcus pyogenes* isolates collected during periods of increased acute rheumatic fever activity in Utah. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2004;23: 56–61.
94. Veasy LG, Weidmeier SE, Orsmond GS, et al. Resurgence of acute rheumatic fever in the intermountain area of the United States. *N Engl J Med* 1987;316:421–7.
95. Shulman ST, Stollerman G, Beall B, et al. Temporal changes in streptococcal M protein types and the near-disappearance of acute rheumatic fever in the United States. *Clin Inf Dis* 2006;42:441–7.
96. Mell LK, Davis RL, Owens D. Association between streptococcal infection and obsessive-compulsive disorder, Tourette's Syndrome and tic disorder. *Pediatrics* 2005;116(1):56–60.
97. Pichichero ME, Margolis PA. A comparison of cephalosporins and penicillins in the treatment of group A  $\beta$ -hemolytic streptococcal pharyngitis: a meta-analysis supporting the concept of microbial copathogenicity. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1991;10:275–81.
98. Casey JR, Pichichero ME. Meta-analysis of cephalosporin versus penicillin treatment of Group A streptococcal tonsillopharyngitis in children. *Pediatrics* 2004;113(4):866–82.
99. Wald ER, Dashefsky B, Feidt C, et al. Acute rheumatic fever in western Pennsylvania and the Tristate area. *Pediatrics* 1987; 80(3):371–4.
100. Congeni B, Rizzo C, Congeni J, et al. Outbreak of acute rheumatic fever in northeast Ohio. *J Pediatr* 1987;111(2):176–9.
101. Veasy LG, Tani LY, Hill HR. Persistence of acute rheumatic fever in the intermountain area of the United States. *J Pediatr* 1994;124(1): 9–16.
102. Swedo SE, Leonard HL, Mittleman BB, et al. Identification of children with pediatric autoimmune neuropsychiatric disorders associated with streptococcal infections by a marker associated with rheumatic fever. *Am J Psychiatry* 1997;154(1):110–2.
103. Bottas A, Richter MA. Pediatric autoimmune neuropsychiatric disorders associated with streptococcal infections (PANDAS). *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2002;21:67–71.
104. Cardona F, Orefici G. Group A streptococcal infections and tic disorders in an Italian pediatric population. *J Pediatr* 2001; 138(1):71–5.
105. Brook I, Gober, A. Increased recovery of *Moraxella catarrhalis* and *Haemophilus influenzae* in association with group A  $\beta$ -haemolytic streptococci in healthy children and those with pharyngo-tonsillitis. *J Med Microbiol* 2006;55:000–000.



## APPENDIX

### Prevalence of Carriers

In longitudinal surveys among children in such closed or semiclosed populations such as residential homes, orphanages, and schools, carrier rates vary from 10 to 40 percent.<sup>A11-A17</sup> An overall average might be 15 to 20 percent. If one were to assume that at least 15 to 20 percent of all children with pharyngitis have a positive culture for GAS on a carrier basis alone, then a conclusion might be reached that about half of all patients from whom GAS can be isolated are carriers. However, review of these studies clarifies why this logic is not applicable to the patient encountered in private practice.

Detection of carriage of GAS will occur much more commonly in a longitudinal survey of children in which multiple throat cultures are taken from a child over a time span of months in a closed or semiclosed population. Such findings do not reflect the prevalence of carriage in a community-based practice or clinic. Studies from our private practice suggest that about 2.5 percent of well 5- to 10-year-olds can be detected as GAS carriers during well-child visits.<sup>A17</sup> If a schoolage child has a sore throat along with an apparent viral upper respiratory infection (URI) (cough, rhinitis, hoarseness), the carrier prevalence increases to about four to eight percent.<sup>A17</sup> Other practice settings have described similar results regarding carrier prevalence.<sup>A18-A22</sup> Our group<sup>A40</sup> has documented a positive GAS rapid antigen detection test or throat culture rate of 25 to 30 percent among children suspected to have GAS pharyngitis. Therefore, in a practice among the 25 to 30 percent of children with positive rapid tests/cultures, there may be about five percent who are carriers with a viral URI mimicking GAS pharyngitis, leaving about 20 to 25 percent with likely bona fide GAS infections.

### Significance of the Carrier

There is disagreement with regard to the significance of the carrier state. The widely held notion that GAS carriers are harmless to themselves and to others is not disingenuous, but it is an oversimplification.<sup>A13,A23-A26</sup> Kuttner and Krumwiede<sup>A41</sup> described a number of GAS outbreaks caused by carriers on the rheumatic fever wards at the Irvington House on the Hudson River, NY, prior to the

advent of antibiotics. They showed in their institutional setting that a newly established GAS carrier (defined as a person who was asymptomatic but GAS-positive on culture, with cultures being regularly taken) could be an important vector for GAS infections. Some major and minor acute rheumatic fever outbreaks were introduced by asymptomatic children who carried newly acquired strains of GAS (Table 3). Similarly, in a family setting, James et al<sup>A37</sup> showed that children with clinical illness due to GAS pharyngitis infected other members of the family approximately 25 percent of the time, whereas children who were carriers infected other members of the family about nine percent of the time. The contagion of carriers was found to occur during the first two to four weeks after acquisition of a GAS strain; thereafter, contagion was minimal.<sup>A37,A26</sup> More recently, the same GAS strains prevalent among carriers and patients with symptomatic pharyngitis in a community have been described to be responsible for invasive, toxic shock, and necrotizing fasciitis infections; transmission of these strains from the carriers likely occurred.<sup>A1-A8</sup>

### How Children Become Carriers

From studies in the preantibiotic era, school surveys, and family studies since the 1950s already referenced in this paper, we know that some children who become colonized in their nasopharynx or oropharynx with GAS, do not show evidence of illness, and do not demonstrate an immune response to the acquisition of the bacteria. These children would be classified as carriers. A second common mechanism whereby a child becomes a carrier is after antibiotic treatment of an acute GAS pharyngitis episode. In this regard, there are data indicating that about 12 percent of children treated with penicillin for acute GAS pharyngitis emerge as carriers after treatment (Table 4).<sup>A44-A46</sup> Cephalosporins, macrolides, and clindamycin less frequently are followed by development of the carrier state (Table 4).<sup>A44,A46</sup>

### Treatment of the Carrier

There are some circumstances in which antibiotic treatment of the GAS carrier has been endorsed (Table 5).<sup>A9,A10,A31</sup> Penicillin is generally ineffective in eradicating GAS from carriers.<sup>A9,A10</sup> Cephalosporins, specifically cefprozil<sup>A28</sup> and cefixime<sup>A29</sup> are more effective.

**Table 3**  
**Contagion of carriers**

Household study: Clinically ill family member infected 20% of family members, carriers infected 9% of family members. <sup>A37</sup>
Good Samaritan Hospital in Boston and Irvington House on The Hudson studies showed importance of carrier as agent of transmission of GAS early on when carrier state first established. <sup>A25,A41</sup>
Nasal carriers of GAS are more contagious. <sup>A24</sup>
Carrier contagiousness is highest within 2-4 weeks after acquisition of a GAS strain. <sup>A37,A41</sup>

GAS, Group A streptococcal infection.



**Table 4**  
**Group A streptococcal tonsillopharyngitis**  
**posttreatment carrier rates**

Penicillin	41/300 (13.6%) <sup>A44</sup> 81/718 (11.3%) <sup>A46</sup>
Cephalosporin	22/508 (4.3%) <sup>A46</sup>
Macrolide	10/140 (7.1%) <sup>A46</sup>
Clindamycin	10/285 (3.5%) <sup>A44</sup>

Clindamycin<sup>A27,A43</sup> or a combination of penicillin and rifampin<sup>A45,A47</sup> are the best regimens for eradication of GAS from carriers,<sup>A28,A28,A42-A46</sup> perhaps owing to the capability of clindamycin and rifampin to penetrate inside pharyngeal cells (discussed later) and/or their bactericidal activity even when GAS are not replicating.

## Other Explanations of Penicillin Treatment Failure

**Compliance.** Poor patient compliance could be an explanation for penicillin treatment failures. Four studies address patient compliance as a cause of penicillin failures; all four studies were nonrandomized clinical trials or epidemiological trials.<sup>A32-A35</sup> For optimal absorption, oral penicillin V should be administered one hour before or two hours after meals. The 3-times-daily dosing and administration away from meal time recommended by the American Heart Association for penicillin represents a significant compliance barrier. Three-times-daily dosing typically is associated with 30 to 50 percent compliance, whereas 1- to 2-times-daily dosing produces 70 to 90 percent compliance. Intramuscular benzathine penicillin injections obviate compliance issues, but the most recent study that included treatment with benzathine penicillin reported a 37 percent bacterial eradication failure rate.<sup>A30</sup>

**Table 5**  
**When to treat Group A streptococcal (GAS) carriers**

Definitely
With a history of ARF
Carriers living with a person who has ARF
Carriers working in hospitals, nursing homes, chronic care facilities
Carriers in communities experiencing an ARF outbreak
Possibly
Carriers in families exhibiting "ping-pong" spread of GAS
Carriers with particularly anxious family members regarding GAS infection
Recently established carriers (within 1 month of onset)

ARF, Acute rheumatic fever.

**Repeated Exposure.** Four trials were identified that studied recurrent GAS exposures as an explanation of penicillin treatment failure<sup>A36-A39</sup> (Table 1). Three trials were classified as type II evidence, nonrandomized clinical trials, or epidemiological studies; one trial was a literature review.

Some patients with GAS tonsillitis treatment failure represent cases of successful antibiotic treatment, that is, resolution of signs and symptoms and complete eradication of the original infecting strain followed by reinfection with the same strain or a new one.

The symptoms of GAS tonsillopharyngitis symptomatically resolve spontaneously within two to five days of onset even when the patient is untreated. Infected individuals remain contagious for several weeks thereafter. Crowded living conditions encourage the transmission of GAS within the family, at work, at school, or in day care settings. After treatment, if there is a recurrence of GAS tonsillopharyngitis and the infection involves the same serotype, then patients may display milder symptoms.<sup>A47</sup> These individuals are contagious to others in their environment and are, themselves, susceptible to rheumatic fever. Because it is not feasible for the routine bacteriological laboratory to subtype GAS strains, the physician cannot determine whether the etiological source for recurrent infection represents a true eradication failure or reinfection.

## REFERENCES

- Schwartz B, Elliott JA, Butler JC, et al. Clusters of invasive group A streptococcal infections in family, hospital and nursing home settings. *Clin Infect Dis* 1992;15:277-84.
- DiPersio JR, File TM Jr, Stevens DL, et al. Spread of serious disease-producing M3 clones of Group A *Streptococcus* among family members and health care workers. *Clin Infect Dis* 1996;22:490-5.
- Kiska DL, Thiede B, Caracciolo J, et al. Invasive Group A streptococcal infections in North Carolina: epidemiology, clinical features, and genetic and serotype analysis of causative organisms. *J Infect Dis* 1997;176:992-1000.
- O'Brien KL, Beall B, Barrett NL, et al. Epidemiology of invasive Group A *Streptococcus* disease in the United States, 1995-1999. *Clin Infect Dis* 2002;35:268-76.
- Ichiyama S, Nakashima K, Shimokata K, et al. Transmission of *Streptococcus pyogenes* causing toxic shock-like syndrome among family members and confirmation by DNA macrorestriction analysis. *J Infect Dis* 1997;175:723-6.
- Cockerill FR III, Schlievert PM, Musser JM. Epidemiology of invasive streptococcal infections. *J Infect Dis* 1998;177:1773-4.
- Musser JM, Kapur V, Peters JE, et al. Real-time molecular epidemiologic analysis of an outbreak of *Streptococcus pyogenes* invasive disease in US Air Force trainees. *Arch Pathol Lab Med* 1994;118:128-33.
- Muotiala A, Seppälä H, Huovinen P, et al. Molecular comparison of group A streptococci of TIMI serotype from invasive and non-invasive infections in Finland. *J Infect Dis* 1998;175:392-5.
- Gerber MA. Diagnosis and treatment of pharyngitis in children. *Pediatr Clin N Am* 2005;52:729-47.
- Tanz R, Shulman S. Streptococcal pharyngitis: The carrier state, definition, and management. *Pediatr Ann* 1998;27(5):281-5.
- Cornfeld D, Hubbard JP. A four-year study of the occurrence of beta-hemolytic streptococci in 64 school children. *N Engl J Med* 1961;264:211-5.

- A12. Quinn RW. Hemolytic streptococci in Nashville school children. *South Med J* 1980;73(3):288–96.
- A13. Quinn RW, Federspiel CF. The occurrence of hemolytic streptococci in school children in Nashville, Tennessee, 1961–1967. *Am J Epidemiol* 1973;97(1):22–33.
- A14. Holmes MC, Williams REO. Streptococcal infections among children in a residential home, IV: outbreaks of infection. *J Hyg* 1958;56:211–37.
- A15. Mozziconacci P, Gerbeaux C, Caravano R, et al. A study of group A hemolytic carriers among school children. *Acta Paediatr Scand* 1960;49:711.
- A16. Moffett HL, Cramblett HG, Smith A. Group A streptococcal infections in a children's home. *Pediatrics* 1964;33:11.
- A17. Pichichero ME, Marsocci SM, Lynd-Murphy AM, et al. Incidence of streptococcal carriers in private pediatric practice. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med* 1999;153:624–8.
- A18. Ginsburg CM, McCracken GH, Crow SD, et al. Seroepidemiology of the group-A streptococcal carriage state in a private pediatric practice. *Am J Dis Child* 1985;139:614–7.
- A19. Hoffmann S. The throat carrier rate of group A and other beta hemolytic streptococci among patients in general practice. *Acta Path Microbiol Immunol Scand* 1985;93:347–51.
- A20. Pike RM, Fashena GJ. Frequency of hemolytic streptococci in the throats of well children in Dallas. *Am J Public Health*. 1946;36:611–22.
- A21. Kincaid CK, Nelson EC, Burnham TW. Incidence of  $\beta$  hemolytic *Streptococcus*. *Wisc Med J* 1961;60:643–48.
- A22. Breese BB. A simple scorecard for the tentative diagnosis of streptococcal pharyngitis. *Am J Dis Child* 1977;131:514–7.
- A23. Krause RM, Rammelkamp CH Jr, Denney FW Jr, et al. Studies of the carrier state following infection with Group A streptococci, I: effect of climate. *J Clin Invest* 1962;41:568–74.
- A24. Hamburger M Jr, Green MJ, Hamburger VG. The problem of the "dangerous carrier" of hemolytic streptococci. *J Infect Dis* 1945;77:68–81.
- A25. Wheeler SM, Jones TD. Studies on the aerial transmission of hemolytic streptococci in a rheumatic fever hospital. *Science* 1941;17:237–41.
- A26. Dunlap MB, Harvey HS. The carrier state and type-specific immunity in streptococcal disease. *AJDC* 1967;114:229–43.
- A27. Randolph MF, Redys JJ, Cope JB, et al. Streptococcal pharyngitis: posttreatment carrier prevalence and clinical relapse in children treated with clindamycin palmitate or phenoxymethyl penicillin. *Clin Pediatr* 1975;14(2):119–22.
- A28. Standaert BB, Finney K, Taylor MT, et al. Comparison between cefprozil and penicillin to eradicate pharyngeal colonization of group A beta-hemolytic streptococci. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 1998;17:39–43.
- A29. Davies HD, Low DE, Schwartz B, et al. Evaluation of short-course therapy with cefixime or rifampin for eradication of pharyngeally carried group A streptococci. *Clin Infect Dis* 1995;21:1294–6.
- A30. Kaplan EL, Johnson DR. Unexplained reduced microbiological efficacy of intramuscular benzathine penicillin G and of oral penicillin V in eradication of Group A streptococci from children with acute pharyngitis. *Pediatrics* 2001;108(5):1180–6.
- A31. Pichichero ME. The development of immunity and the carrier state following streptococcal pharyngitis. *Pediatr Ann* 1992;21(12):1–5.
- A32. Green JL, Ray SP, Charney E. Recurrence rate of streptococcal pharyngitis related to oral penicillin. *J Pediatr* 1969;75(2):292–4.
- A33. Mohler D, Wallin D, Dreyfus D. Studies in the home treatment of streptococcal disease: failure of patients to take penicillin by mouth as prescribed. *N Engl J Med* 1955;252:1116–8.
- A34. Bergman A, Werner R. Failure of children to receive penicillin by mouth. *N Engl J Med* 1963;268:1334–8.
- A35. Charney E, Bynum R, Eldredge D, Frank D, et al. How well do patients take oral penicillin? A collaborative study in private practice. *Pediatrics* 1967;40(2):188–95.
- A36. Breese B, Disney F. Factors influencing the spread of beta hemolytic streptococcal infections with the family group. *Pediatrics* 1956;17:834–8.
- A37. James WES, Badger GF, Dingle JH. A study of illness in a group of Cleveland families: the epidemiology of the acquisition of Group A streptococci and of associated illnesses. *N Engl J Med* 1960;262(14):687–94.
- A38. Martin J, Green M, Barbadora K, et al. Group A streptococci among school-aged children: clinical characteristics and the carrier state. *Pediatrics* 2004;114(5):1212–9.
- A39. Breese BB, Disney FA, Talpey W. The incidence of beta hemolytic streptococcal illness in a private pediatric practice. *Pediatrics* 1966;38(2):277–85.
- A40. Pichichero ME. Group A streptococcal tonsillopharyngitis: cost-effective diagnosis and treatment. *Ann Emerg Med* 1995;25(3):390–403.
- A41. Kuttner AG, Krumwiede E. Observations on the effect of streptococcal upper respiratory infections on rheumatic children: a three-year study. *J Clin Invest* 1941;20:273–87.
- A42. Kaplan EL. The Group A streptococcal upper respiratory tract carrier state: an enigma. *J Pediatr* 1980;97:337.
- A43. Tanz RR, Poncher JR, Corydon DE, et al. Clindamycin treatment of chronic pharyngeal carriage of group A streptococci. *J Pediatr* 1991;119:123–8.
- A44. Randolph MF, Redys JJ, Hibbard EW. Streptococcal pharyngitis, III: streptococcal recurrence rates following therapy with penicillin or with clindamycin (7-cholrolincomycin). *Del Med J* 1970;42:87–92.
- A45. Tanz RR, Shulman ST, Barthel MJ, et al. Penicillin plus rifampin eradicates pharyngeal carriage of group A streptococci. *J Pediatr* 1985;106:876–80.
- A46. Chaudhary S, Bilinsky SA, Hennessy JL, et al. Penicillin V and rifampin for the treatment of group A streptococcal pharyngitis: a randomized trial of 10 days penicillin vs 10 days penicillin with rifampin during the final 4 days of therapy. *J Pediatr* 1985;106(3):481–6.
- A47. Lee LH, Ayoub E, Pichichero ME. Fewer symptoms occur in same-serotype recurrent streptococcal tonsillopharyngitis. *Arch Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg* 2000;126:1359–62.