

Mathematical and Logical Foundations of Computer Science

Lecture 5b - Propositional Logic (Natural Deduction & Sequent Calculus)

Vincent Rahli

(some slides were adapted from Rajesh Chitnis' slides)

University of Birmingham

Where are we?

- ▶ Symbolic logic
- ▶ **Propositional logic**
- ▶ Predicate logic
- ▶ Constructive vs. Classical logic
- ▶ Type theory

Today

- ▶ Sequent Calculus vs. Natural Deduction
- ▶ Sequent Calculus proofs
- ▶ Natural Deduction proofs

Today

- ▶ Sequent Calculus vs. Natural Deduction
- ▶ Sequent Calculus proofs
- ▶ Natural Deduction proofs

Further reading

- ▶ Section 5 in “Proof and Types”
<https://www.paultaylor.eu/stable/prot.pdf>
- ▶ Chapter 3 of
http://leanprover.github.io/logic_and_proof/

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

Syntax:

$$P ::= a \mid P \wedge P \mid P \vee P \mid P \rightarrow P \mid \neg P$$

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

Syntax:

$$P ::= a \mid P \wedge P \mid P \vee P \mid P \rightarrow P \mid \neg P$$

Lower-case letters are atoms: p , q , r , etc.

Upper-case letters stand for any proposition: P , Q , R , etc.

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

Syntax:

$$P ::= a \mid P \wedge P \mid P \vee P \mid P \rightarrow P \mid \neg P$$

Lower-case letters are atoms: p, q, r , etc.

Upper-case letters stand for any proposition: P, Q, R , etc.

Two special atoms:

- ▶ \top which stands for True
- ▶ \perp which stands for False

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

Syntax:

$$P ::= a \mid P \wedge P \mid P \vee P \mid P \rightarrow P \mid \neg P$$

Lower-case letters are atoms: p, q, r , etc.

Upper-case letters stand for any proposition: P, Q, R , etc.

Two special atoms:

- ▶ \top which stands for True
- ▶ \perp which stands for False

We also introduced four connectives:

- ▶ $P \wedge Q$: we have a proof of both P and Q
- ▶ $P \vee Q$: we have a proof of at least one of P and Q
- ▶ $P \rightarrow Q$: if we have a proof of P then we have a proof of Q
- ▶ $\neg P$: stands for $P \rightarrow \perp$

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

How would you express these sentences in propositional logic?

- ▶ “if $x > 2$ then $x > 1$ ”

- ▶ “if $x > 2$ and x is even then $x > 3$ ”

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

How would you express these sentences in propositional logic?

- ▶ “if $x > 2$ then $x > 1$ ”
 - ▶ atom p : “ $x > 2$ ”
 - ▶ atom q : “ $x > 1$ ”
 - ▶ proposition: $p \rightarrow q$
- ▶ “if $x > 2$ and x is even then $x > 3$ ”

Recap: Propositional logic syntax

How would you express these sentences in propositional logic?

- ▶ “if $x > 2$ then $x > 1$ ”
 - ▶ atom p : “ $x > 2$ ”
 - ▶ atom q : “ $x > 1$ ”
 - ▶ proposition: $p \rightarrow q$
- ▶ “if $x > 2$ and x is even then $x > 3$ ”
 - ▶ atom p : “ $x > 2$ ”
 - ▶ atom q : “ x is even”
 - ▶ atom r : “ $x > 3$ ”
 - ▶ proposition: $(p \wedge q) \rightarrow r$
 - ▶ we don't need parentheses, and can just write: $p \wedge q \rightarrow r$

Recap: Natural deduction vs. Sequent Calculus

2 deduction systems for propositional logic (don't mix their rules!)

Recap: Natural deduction vs. Sequent Calculus

2 deduction systems for propositional logic (don't mix their rules!)

Natural Deduction

- ▶ “natural” style of constructing a proof
- ▶ start with the given premises
- ▶ repeatedly apply the given inference rules
- ▶ until you obtain the conclusion
- ▶ Can work both forwards and backwards
- ▶ “natural” doesn't mean there is a unique proof

Recap: Natural deduction vs. Sequent Calculus

2 deduction systems for propositional logic (don't mix their rules!)

Natural Deduction

- ▶ “natural” style of constructing a proof
- ▶ start with the given premises
- ▶ repeatedly apply the given inference rules
- ▶ until you obtain the conclusion
- ▶ Can work both forwards and backwards
- ▶ “natural” doesn't mean there is a unique proof

Sequent Calculus

- ▶ hypotheses are made explicit in a **context**
- ▶ instead of deriving proposition, we derive **sequents**
 - ▶ a sequent is of the form $\Gamma \vdash P$
 - ▶ where the environment/context Γ is a list of propositions
 - ▶ and P is a proposition
 - ▶ intuitively: P is true assuming that the formulas in Γ are true
- ▶ we typically go backward

Recap: Natural Deduction

Natural Deduction rules:

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\perp}{A} [\perp E] \qquad \frac{}{\top} [\top I] \qquad \frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ B \end{array}}{A \rightarrow B}^1 [\rightarrow I] \qquad \frac{A \rightarrow B \quad A}{B} [\rightarrow E] \\
 \\
 \frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ \perp \end{array}}{\neg A}^1 [\neg I] \qquad \frac{\neg A \quad A}{\perp} [\neg E] \\
 \\
 \frac{A}{A \vee B} [\vee I_L] \qquad \frac{A}{B \vee A} [\vee I_R] \qquad \frac{A \vee B \quad A \rightarrow C \quad B \rightarrow C}{C} [\vee E] \\
 \\
 \frac{A \quad B}{A \wedge B} [\wedge I] \qquad \frac{A \wedge B}{B} [\wedge E_R] \qquad \frac{A \wedge B}{A} [\wedge E_L]
 \end{array}$$

Recap: Sequent Calculus

Sequence Calculus rules:

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma, B \vdash C}{\Gamma, A \rightarrow B \vdash C} [\rightarrow L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow B} [\rightarrow R]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma, \neg A \vdash B} [\neg L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash \perp}{\Gamma \vdash \neg A} [\neg R]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash C \quad \Gamma, B \vdash C}{\Gamma, A \vee B \vdash C} [\vee L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash A \vee B} [\vee R_1]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash B \vee A} [\vee R_2]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, A, B \vdash C}{\Gamma, A \wedge B \vdash C} [\wedge L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash A \quad \Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \wedge B} [\wedge R]$$

$$\frac{}{A \vdash A} [Id]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash B \quad \Gamma, B \vdash A}{\Gamma \vdash A} [Cut]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, B, A, \Delta \vdash C}{\Gamma, A, B, \Delta \vdash C} [X]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma \vdash B}{\Gamma, A \vdash B} [W]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma, A, A \vdash B}{\Gamma, A \vdash B} [C]$$

Recap: Sequent Calculus

In addition we allow using the following **derived rules**:

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash A \quad \Gamma_1, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \rightarrow B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} \quad [\rightarrow L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash A}{\Gamma_1, \neg A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} \quad [\neg L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash C \quad \Gamma_1, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \vee B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} \quad [\vee L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \wedge B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} \quad [\wedge L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash B}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} \quad [W]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} \quad [C]$$

$$\frac{}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash A} \quad [Id]$$

Recap: Sequent Calculus

In addition we allow using the following **derived rules**:

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash A \quad \Gamma_1, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \rightarrow B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} [\rightarrow L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash A}{\Gamma_1, \neg A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} [\neg L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash C \quad \Gamma_1, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \vee B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} [\vee L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C}{\Gamma_1, A \wedge B, \Gamma_2 \vdash C} [\wedge L]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, \Gamma_2 \vdash B}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} [W]$$

$$\frac{\Gamma_1, A, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash B} [C]$$

$$\frac{}{\Gamma_1, A, \Gamma_2 \vdash A} [Id]$$

All these **derived rules** can be proved/derived using the rules on the previous slide

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

Sequent Calculus

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

natural proofs

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

amenable to automation

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

natural proofs

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ B \end{array}}{A \rightarrow B}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

amenable to automation

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow B} [\rightarrow R]$$

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

natural proofs

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ B \end{array}}{A \rightarrow B}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

amenable to automation

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow B} [\rightarrow R]$$

- ▶ in the Sequent Calculus the discharged hypothesis A is kept in the context!

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

natural proofs

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ B \end{array}}{A \rightarrow B}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

amenable to automation

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow B} [\rightarrow R]$$

- ▶ in the Sequent Calculus the discharged hypothesis A is kept in the context!
- ▶ all the available hypotheses are always kept in the context part of sequents

Recap: Proofs

Natural Deduction

introduction/elimination rules

natural proofs

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \overline{A}^1 \\ \vdots \\ B \end{array}}{A \rightarrow B}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Sequent Calculus

right/left rules

amenable to automation

$$\frac{\Gamma, A \vdash B}{\Gamma \vdash A \rightarrow B} [\rightarrow R]$$

- ▶ in the Sequent Calculus the discharged hypothesis A is kept in the context!
- ▶ all the available hypotheses are always kept in the context part of sequents
- ▶ a proposition provable in one system is provable in the other

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\quad}{\quad} \quad \frac{\quad}{\quad}}{\frac{\quad}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}}$$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{\overline{A \wedge B}} \quad \frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{\overline{A \wedge B}}}{\frac{B \wedge A}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}^1 [\rightarrow I]}$$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{B}}{\frac{A}{B \wedge A}} [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{A} [\wedge I]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{\overline{A \wedge B}^1}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

How do we know where the introduced hypotheses ($A \wedge B$ above) will be used in the proof?

Example 1

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Here is an example of a backward proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I] \quad \frac{}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

How do we know where the introduced hypotheses ($A \wedge B$ above) will be used in the proof?

We typically don't so we can keep track of them on the side while doing the proof as follows:

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

_____	_____
_____	_____

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\quad}{\quad} \quad \frac{\quad}{\quad}}{\quad}}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}$$

Hypotheses:

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{}{} \quad \frac{}{} }{B \wedge A}}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} \text{ } 1 \text{ } [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{B}}{} \quad \frac{}{A}}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{A \wedge B}{B} \quad [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{}{A} \quad [\wedge I]}{B \wedge A} \quad [\wedge I]}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} \quad 1}{B} \quad [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{}{A} \quad [\wedge I]}{B \wedge A} \quad [\wedge I] \quad \frac{}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B}}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I] \quad \frac{}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I] \quad \frac{}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

Example 1

Let us prove $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$ again:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{B} [\wedge E_R] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B} 1}{A} [\wedge E_L]}{B \wedge A} [\wedge I] \quad \frac{}{(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- ▶ hypothesis 1: $A \wedge B$

This can be achieved using the Sequent Calculus!

Example 1

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

Example 1

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

$$\frac{}{\frac{}{\vdash (A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)}}$$

Example 1

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

$$\frac{\frac{}{A \wedge B \vdash B \wedge A}}{\vdash (A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 1

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A, B \vdash B \wedge A}}{A \wedge B \vdash B \wedge A} [\wedge L]}{\vdash (A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 1

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of $(A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{A, B \vdash B} \quad [Id] \quad \overline{A, B \vdash A} \quad [Id]}{A, B \vdash B \wedge A} \quad [\wedge R]}{A \wedge B \vdash B \wedge A} \quad [\wedge L]}{\vdash (A \wedge B) \rightarrow (B \wedge A)} \quad [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

	_____	_____
	_____	_____
	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____

$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$		

Hypotheses:

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side



Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$

$$\frac{\frac{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \ [\rightarrow I]}$$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side



Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \overline{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \\
 \overline{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \ [\rightarrow I] \\
 \overline{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \ [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad {}^3 [\rightarrow I]}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad {}^2 [\rightarrow I]}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad {}^1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{A \vee C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad \frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{\frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}} [\vee E] \\
 \frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 3 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 1 [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \\
 \\
 \\
 \frac{}{A \vee C} \quad {}^3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \qquad \frac{}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \\
 \hline
 B \vee D \\
 \frac{}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad {}^3 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad {}^2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \hline
 (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad {}^1 [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{\frac{}{B \vee D}}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\vee E]}{\frac{\frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I]} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{B}}{B \vee D} [\vee I_L]}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 [\rightarrow I]}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{B \vee D} [\vee E] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 [\rightarrow I]}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 [\rightarrow I]}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad \frac{}{A}}{B} [\rightarrow E] \quad \frac{}{B \vee D} [\vee I_L]}{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 [\rightarrow I]}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\vee E]} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \vee D}}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 [\rightarrow I]}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A}}{B} \quad [\rightarrow E]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee I_L] \quad \frac{}{} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee E]}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1}{A \rightarrow B} \quad \frac{\frac{}{A} \quad 4}{A}}{B} [\rightarrow E] \\
 \frac{B}{B \vee D} [\vee I_L] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3}{A \vee C} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\vee E]}{B \vee D} \\
 \frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 3 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 1 [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 4}{B} \quad [\rightarrow E]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee I_L] \quad \frac{}{B \vee D} \quad 5 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee E]}{B \vee D} \quad 3 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]}
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 4}{\frac{}{B}} \quad [\rightarrow E]}{\frac{}{B \vee D}} \quad [\vee I_L] \quad \frac{\frac{}{D}}{\frac{}{B \vee D}} \quad [\vee I_R] \\
\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{\frac{}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)}} \quad 5 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
\hline
\frac{}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee E] \\
\frac{}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
\frac{}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
\hline
\frac{}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
\end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 4}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad \frac{}{B}}{[\vee I_L]} \quad \frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D} \quad \frac{}{C}}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad \frac{}{D}}{[\vee I_R]} \\
 \frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{\frac{}{B \vee D} \quad 4 [\rightarrow I]}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{A \vee C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad \frac{\frac{}{B \vee D} \quad 5 [\rightarrow I]}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{B \vee D \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \vee D} \quad 3 [\rightarrow I]}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{\frac{}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 [\rightarrow I]}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 4}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad \frac{}{B}}{[\vee I_L]} \quad \frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D} \quad 2 \quad \frac{}{C}}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad \frac{}{D}}{[\vee I_R]} \quad \frac{}{B \vee D} \\
 \frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{[\vee E]} \quad \frac{}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 5 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{[\vee E]} \quad \frac{}{B \vee D} \\
 \frac{}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 3 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{[\rightarrow I]} \quad \frac{}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{[\rightarrow I]} \quad \frac{}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]}
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 4}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad B}{[\vee I_L]} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D} \quad 2 \quad \frac{}{C} \quad 5}{[\rightarrow E]} \quad D}{[\vee I_R]} \quad \frac{B \vee D}{[\vee E]} \\
 \frac{A \vee C \quad 3 \quad \frac{A \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad 4 [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D} \quad \frac{C \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad 5 [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D}}{\frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad 3 [\rightarrow I]}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad 2 [\rightarrow I]}} \quad 1 [\rightarrow I] \\
 (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} 1}{A} 4 \quad [\rightarrow E]}{B} \quad [\vee I_L] \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D} 2}{C} 5 \quad [\rightarrow E]}{D} \quad [\vee I_R] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} 3 \quad \frac{B \vee D}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{A \vee C} 3 \quad \frac{D}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 5 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee E] \\
 \frac{\frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 3 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 3 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

- If an hypothesis is introduced in a branch, make sure you don't use it in another branch (e.g. 4 cannot be used in the far right branch)

Example 2

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} 1}{A} 4 \quad [\rightarrow E]}{B} \quad [\vee I_L] \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D} 2}{C} 5 \quad [\rightarrow E]}{D} \quad [\vee I_R] \\
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \vee C} 3 \quad \frac{B \vee D}{A \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 4 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{A \vee C} 3 \quad \frac{B \vee D}{C \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 5 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{B \vee D} \quad [\vee E] \\
 \frac{\frac{B \vee D}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 3 \quad [\rightarrow I]}{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $A \rightarrow B$
- hyp. 2: $C \rightarrow D$
- hyp. 3: $A \vee C$
- hyp. 4: A
- hyp. 5: C

- ▶ If an hypothesis is introduced in a branch, make sure you don't use it in another branch (e.g. 4 cannot be used in the far right branch)
- ▶ This is enforced by sequents in the Sequent Calculus

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B}}{} \quad \frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow D}}{}}{A \vee C} \quad \frac{}{B \vee D}}{} \\ \hline \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B} \quad \frac{}{C \rightarrow D}}{A \rightarrow B \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D)} \quad \frac{}{A \vee C} \quad \frac{}{B \vee D}}{A \rightarrow B \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\frac{\frac{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D}}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R]}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D$$

$$A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D$$

[$\vee L$]

$$A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D$$

[$\rightarrow R$]

$$A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

[$\rightarrow R$]

$$A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

[$\rightarrow R$]

$$\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad \frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\rightarrow L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad [Id] \quad \frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad \frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} \quad [Id] \quad \frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{} \quad \frac{}{} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad \frac{\frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} [Id]}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [Id] \quad \frac{}{} [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D \quad A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D \quad [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad \frac{\frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} [Id]}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [Id] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \vdash C} [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash B \vee D} [\vee R_2] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} [\vee L] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \frac{}{\vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad \frac{\frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} [Id]}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [Id] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \vdash C} [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash B \vee D} [Id] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} \quad [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} [Id]}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \vdash C} \quad [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash D} [Id]}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee R_2] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\rightarrow L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} \quad [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} \quad [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) \quad [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 2

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow D, A \vdash A} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B} [Id]}{B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [\vee R_1] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \vdash C} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash D} [Id]}{A \rightarrow B, D, C \vdash B \vee D} [\vee R_2] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \quad \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, C \vdash B \vee D} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D, A \vee C \vdash B \vee D} [\vee L] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B, C \rightarrow D \vdash (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow B \vdash (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \hline
 \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D) \rightarrow (A \vee C) \rightarrow (B \vee D) [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

$$\frac{\begin{array}{c} \frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \rightarrow A}{\neg(B \wedge C)}}{} \end{array}}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$

$$\frac{\overline{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A

$$\begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \\ \text{_____} \end{array}$$
$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\neg(B \wedge C)}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \ [\rightarrow I]}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 \ [\rightarrow I]$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 [\rightarrow I]}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 [\neg I]}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 [\rightarrow I]$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \ [\rightarrow I]}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 \ [\neg I]}{\perp} \quad 3 \ [\neg E] \\
 \frac{\neg A \quad A}{\perp} \quad 1 \ [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}{} \quad 1 \ [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \\
 \\
 \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \neg A \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ A \end{array} \quad \begin{array}{c} \text{_____} \\ \text{_____} \end{array} \\
 \hline
 \perp \quad \text{_____} \quad \text{_____} \\
 \hline
 \neg(B \wedge C) \quad \text{_____} \quad \text{_____} \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C) \quad \text{_____} \quad \text{_____} \\
 \hline
 (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C) \quad \text{_____} \quad \text{_____}
 \end{array}$$

²
 $[\neg E]$
³ $[\neg I]$
² $[\rightarrow I]$
¹ $[\rightarrow I]$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{\frac{\frac{}{C \rightarrow \neg A}}{} \quad \frac{\frac{}{C}}{A} \quad [\rightarrow E]}{\neg A} \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 2}{\perp} \quad [\neg E] \\
 \frac{}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 \quad [\neg I] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c} \frac{\frac{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A}{C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad \frac{B}{C} [\rightarrow E]}{\neg A} \quad \frac{A}{\perp} [\neg E] \\ \frac{\perp}{\neg(B \wedge C)} 3 [\neg I] \\ \frac{\neg(B \wedge C)}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} 2 [\rightarrow I] \\ \frac{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} 1 [\rightarrow I] \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{B} \quad \frac{}{C} \\
 \hline
 C \rightarrow \neg A \quad [\rightarrow E] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\neg A} \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 2 \\
 \hline
 \perp \quad [\neg E] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 \quad [\neg I] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad 1 \quad \frac{\overline{B \wedge C}}{B} \quad [\wedge E_L] \quad \frac{}{} \\
 \hline
 \frac{C \rightarrow \neg A}{C} \quad [\rightarrow E] \\
 \hline
 \frac{\neg A}{A} \quad [\rightarrow E] \quad 2 \\
 \hline
 \frac{\perp}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 \quad [\neg I] \\
 \hline
 \frac{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{B \wedge C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{} \quad \text{[}\wedge E_L\text{]} \quad \frac{}{} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad \frac{}{B} \quad \text{[}\rightarrow E\text{]} \quad \frac{}{C} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\neg A} \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 2 \quad \text{[}\rightarrow E\text{]} \quad \frac{}{} \quad \text{[}\neg E\text{]} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\perp} \quad 3 \quad \text{[}\neg I\text{]} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \quad \text{[}\rightarrow I\text{]} \\
 \hline
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 \quad \text{[}\rightarrow I\text{]} \\
 \hline
 (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{B \wedge C} \quad 3 \\
 \frac{}{C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad [\rightarrow E] \quad \frac{}{B} \quad [\wedge E_L] \quad \frac{}{B \wedge C} \quad [\wedge E_R] \\
 \frac{}{C} \quad [\wedge E_R] \\
 \frac{}{\neg A} \quad [\rightarrow E] \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 2 \\
 \frac{}{\perp} \quad [\neg E] \\
 \frac{}{\neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 3 \quad [\neg I] \\
 \frac{}{A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \frac{}{(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Natural Deduction proof of
 $(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

We will keep track of our hypotheses on the side

Hypotheses:

- hyp. 1: $B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A$
- hyp. 2: A
- hyp. 3: $B \wedge C$

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A} \quad 1 \quad \frac{}{B \wedge C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{B} \quad [\wedge E_L] \quad \frac{}{B \wedge C} \quad 3 \quad \frac{}{C} \quad [\wedge E_R] \\
 \hline
 C \rightarrow \neg A \quad \frac{}{C} \quad [\rightarrow E] \quad \frac{}{A} \quad 2 \quad \frac{}{\neg A} \quad [\neg E] \\
 \hline
 \perp \quad 3 \quad [\neg I] \\
 \hline
 \neg(B \wedge C) \quad 2 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \hline
 A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C) \quad 1 \quad [\rightarrow I] \\
 \hline
 (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\frac{\overline{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \quad [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)}}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp}}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

Here is a proof:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{A, B, C \vdash B}{\quad} \quad \frac{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}{\quad} [\rightarrow L]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\neg R]}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} \\
\hline
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\hline
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L] \\
\hline
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R] \\
\hline
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R] \\
\hline
\frac{}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]
\end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} \text{ [Id]} \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash C} \quad \frac{}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} \text{ } \quad \text{[} \rightarrow L \text{]} \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} \text{ [} \rightarrow L \text{]} \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} \text{ [} \wedge L \text{]} \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} \text{ [} \neg R \text{]} \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \text{ [} \rightarrow R \text{]} \\
 \frac{}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} \text{ [} \rightarrow R \text{]}
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash C} [Id] \quad \frac{}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [Id] \quad \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L] \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R] \\
 \frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R] \\
 \frac{}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]
 \end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash C} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash A}}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\neg L]}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R] \\
\frac{}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]
\end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash C} [Id] \quad \frac{A, B, C \vdash A}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\neg L]}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L] \\
\frac{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R] \\
\frac{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R] \\
\frac{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]
\end{array}$$

Example 3

Provide a Sequent Calculus proof of

$$(B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)$$

Here is a proof:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash C} [Id] \quad \frac{\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash A} [Id]}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\neg L]}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\neg L] \\
\frac{}{A, B, C \vdash B} [Id] \quad \frac{}{\neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\neg L]}{C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B, C \vdash \perp} [\rightarrow L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A, B \wedge C \vdash \perp} [\wedge L] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash \neg(B \wedge C)} [\neg R] \\
\frac{}{B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R] \\
\frac{}{\vdash (B \rightarrow C \rightarrow \neg A) \rightarrow A \rightarrow \neg(B \wedge C)} [\rightarrow R]
\end{array}$$

Note that compared to the Natural Deduction proof, we only have to eliminate $B \wedge C$ once here

Natural Deduction and Sequent Calculus

- ▶ sequents are useful to keep track of available hypotheses

Natural Deduction and Sequent Calculus

- ▶ sequents are useful to keep track of available hypotheses
- ▶ however, we have to keep hypotheses around all the time

Natural Deduction and Sequent Calculus

- ▶ sequents are useful to keep track of available hypotheses
- ▶ however, we have to keep hypotheses around all the time
- ▶ the Sequent Calculus provides more structure to proofs

Natural Deduction and Sequent Calculus

- ▶ sequents are useful to keep track of available hypotheses
- ▶ however, we have to keep hypotheses around all the time
- ▶ the Sequent Calculus provides more structure to proofs
- ▶ however, it is less “natural”

Conclusion

What did we cover today?

- ▶ Sequent Calculus vs. Natural Deduction
- ▶ Sequent Calculus proofs
- ▶ Natural Deduction proofs

Conclusion

What did we cover today?

- ▶ Sequent Calculus vs. Natural Deduction
- ▶ Sequent Calculus proofs
- ▶ Natural Deduction proofs

Further reading

- ▶ Section 5 in “Proof and Types”
<https://www.paultaylor.eu/stable/prot.pdf>
- ▶ Chapter 3 of
http://leanprover.github.io/logic_and_proof/

Conclusion

What did we cover today?

- ▶ Sequent Calculus vs. Natural Deduction
- ▶ Sequent Calculus proofs
- ▶ Natural Deduction proofs

Further reading

- ▶ Section 5 in “Proof and Types”
<https://www.paultaylor.eu/stable/prot.pdf>
- ▶ Chapter 3 of
http://leanprover.github.io/logic_and_proof/

Next time?

- ▶ Classical reasoning