Jessyca Campos
Peer Review

Dine – The Acoustics of Shouting

I think he did really well on his presentation. His paper was a little confusing but I think its more on me than on him because I don't have the same level of experience in phonetics as he does.

I really liked his study, I think it's really interesting and fun. I would have never come up with something like this. I'm interested to know how this study could be applied to other languages. I mentioned it in the comment kind of, but it would be interesting to compare the different tones (high, mid, low) to one another and then a rising or falling tone. I would expect the rising and falling tones to have longer durations than the single level tones (but maybe that's obvious or completely wrong who knows). I think you would need to understand sociolinguistic factors to fully grasp what's going on. I see this as a sociolinguistics meets phonetics experiment (but, the fun kind with questions sociolinguists never bother to ask, no shade).

His study would have been more reproducible had he included the words he used in the study in his manuscript. Plus, I'm curious to know what they were.

His R^2 values might be wrong. I think the r.squaredGLMM() is used to get the marginal and conditional R^2 in generalized mixed-effects models. I tried using it in my project (I used the GLM with gaussian family distribution and identity linking function too) but found that the R^2 given from the r.squaredGLMM() was lower than the one I got from using the rsq() (using the rsq package). I also did it manually (mainly because R hates me) using the formula $R^2 = 1 - ($residual deviance / null deviance$)$. I got the same result from using rsq() as I did from using the formula.

I think he should have used either two monolingual speakers of English or both speakers of German descent. What if experience with German influenced his shouting? What if he has an accent or is a native speaker of German. Maybe Germans have different shouting patterns than those of American English. *Or* what if there is a different ranking of faithfulness constraints of shouting in German than in English. TETU!

Francisco – Disproving the Functional Load Hypothesis with Stronger Data Analysis

There is *a lot* going on.

I would have approached the data differently. I would have picked a few variables, found theoretical motivation, and created a hypothesis (different than hers) using her data instead of trying to analyze it as a whole. Plus, there are so many components that if you do all possible comparisons, you weaken your statistical power and risk alpha slippage. The way the original author presented the information and the amount of information provided was a little overwhelming. Kudos to Francisco for taking this on.

I think he did a good job explaining what he was going to do and why. The original author provided every aspect of the language you need know for understanding stress in that language. It makes sense that he removed so many of the sections of the data for his analysis. Although, he did gamble with omitting a relevant variable by removing vowel reduction from his analysis. In all honesty, all the variables mentioned are important, but not when they're isolated from the others, so it's hard to decide which ones to remove.

I don't think I really understand the FLH. Most if not all of the literature I've read on stress mentions that acoustic correlates of stress don't really influence perception on their own. I don't really know what the original author did to disprove the FLH, but I think Francisco did a good job describing what he was going to do and then what he did!

Orange you glad he converted the excel spreadsheet to a csv file? (I think yes)

Unrelated to anyone's project specifically, I think we all should have added a readme file in our documents explaining the column names in our datasets--similar to what you get with ?(dataframe) in R--to make the projects more reproducible.