

DEAR 310A STUDENTS; ON OUR NEXT TO LAST HOMEWORK (ON STEIN'S METHOD) I ASKED A VAGUELY WORDED QUESTION ABOUT THE BIRTHDAY PROBLEM WITH UNEQUAL BOX PROBABILITIES. I ASSUMED THAT IF $(\sum p_i^2) \rightarrow 0 \Rightarrow$ THEN $P\{\text{NO MATCH}\} \sim e^{-\sum p_i^2}$. SEVERAL OF YOU NOTICED THAT THIS DOES NOT FOLLOW FROM OUR BOUND (STEIN'S METHOD) AND SOME EXTRA HYPOTHESIS ON THE $\{p_i\}_i$ IS NEEDED. THEY ARE RIGHT!

THE SITUATION IS A BIT COMPLICATED BUT A REASONABLY DEFINITIVE ANSWER CAN BE FOUND IN: CAMARILLI, M. AND PITMAN, J. (2000) LIMIT DISTRIBUTIONS AND RANDOM TREES DERIVED FROM THE BIRTHDAY PROBLEM WITH UNEQUAL PROBABILITIES. ELECTRONIC JOURNAL OF PROBABILITY VOL 5, #2, PG 1-18. HERE IS A BRIEF DESCRIPTION/DISCUSSION.

FOR EACH n , LET $p_{n1} \geq p_{n2} \geq \dots$ BE A PROBABILITY, p_{ni} = CHANCE OF BOX i IN n^{TH} ROW OF A TRIANGULAR ARRAY. LET (FOR THE n^{TH} ROW), BILLS BE DROPPED INTO BOXES. LET R_n BE THE FIRST REPEAT TIME. THE CLASSICAL BIRTHDAY PROBLEM HAS $p_{ni} = 1/n$ $1 \leq i \leq n$, WE KNOW $P\{R_n > c\sqrt{n}\} = P\{\text{IF } c\sqrt{n} \text{ BILLS DROPPED INTO } n \text{ BOXES, NO MATCH}\} \sim e^{-c^2/2}$ WITH $\lambda = (c\sqrt{n}) \frac{1}{n} \sim \frac{c^2}{2}$, SO $P\{R_n > c\sqrt{n}\} \sim e^{-c^2/2}$. HERE IS THEIR RESULT

THEOREM LET $\lambda_n = \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^n p_{ni}^2}$ AND $\theta_{ni} = p_{ni}/\lambda_n$.

(1) IF $p_{ni} \rightarrow 0$ AS $n \rightarrow \infty$ AND $\theta_i = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \theta_{ni}$ EXISTS FOR EACH i , THEN, FOR ANY $c \geq 0$

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P\{R_n > c/\lambda_n\} = e^{-\frac{1}{2}(1-\sum \theta_i^2)c^2} \prod_i (1+\theta_i c) e^{-\theta_i c}$$

(2) CONVERSELY, IF THERE ARE POSITIVE CONSTANTS $\varepsilon_n \rightarrow 0$, d_n SUCH THAT $\varepsilon_n(R_n - d_n)$ HAS A NON DEGENERATE LIMIT, THEN $p_{ni} \rightarrow 0$, THE LIMITS θ_i EXIST AND SO THE LIMIT IS AS ABOVE WITH $\varepsilon_n/\lambda_n \rightarrow \alpha$ FOR SOME $0 < \alpha < \infty$ AND $\varepsilon_n d_n \rightarrow 0$.

EXAMPLES (A) IF $p_{ni} = 1/n$ $1 \leq i \leq n$, $\lambda_n = 1/\sqrt{n}$, $\theta_i \equiv 0$ AND $P\{R_n > c\sqrt{n}\} \rightarrow e^{-c^2/2}$.

(B) IF $p_{ni} = \frac{1}{i \ln n}$ $1 \leq i \leq n$, $\lambda_n = 1 + \frac{1}{2} \ln n + \frac{1}{n} \sim \ln n$, $\lambda_n \sim \ln n$, $\theta_i = 1/i \sqrt{\ln n}$ $1 \leq i < \infty$ AND NOTHING LIKE A POISSON APPROXIMATION HOLDS!

SORRY, BUT THAT'S WHY WE PROVE THEOREMS!

PS YOU MAY CHECK (PLEASE!) THAT IF $(\sum p_i^2) \rightarrow 0$ AND $p_{ni}/\sqrt{\sum p_{ni}^2} \rightarrow 0$ THEN POISSON APPROX OK.