

 Review settings (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/settings/)

sousarbarb (/sousarbarb/) / A Systematic Review on Long-Term Localization and Mapping for Mobile Robots (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/)

Review (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/)

Planning (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/planning/)

Conducting (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/)

Reporting (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/reporting/)

1. Search (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/search/)

2. Import Studies (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/import/)

3. Study Selection (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/studies/)

4. Quality Assessment (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/quality/)

5. Data Extraction (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/extraction/)

6. Data Analysis (/sousarbarb/a-systematic-review-on-long-term-localization-and-mapping-for-mobile-robots/conducting/analysis/)

Quality Assessment

Detailed (/reviews/conducting/quality_assessment_detailed/)

Summary (/reviews/conducting/quality_assessment_summary/)

Show: All Done Pending Score higher than 7.5 Score lower or equal to 7.5

Order by: Year (0 - 9) ▾

To answer the form you may click on the desired answer on the following tables.

Simultaneous map building and localization for an autonomous mobile robot (1991)						3.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Continuous localization in changing environments (1997)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Incorporating environmental measurements in navigation (1998)	5.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

PERSES - a vision-based interactive mobile shopping assistant (2000)					2.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

A contribution to vision-based localization, tracking and navigation methods for an interactive mobile service-robot (2001)					2.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mobile robotics in the long term - Exploring the fourth dimension (2001)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Simultaneous localization and map-building using active vision (2002) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Terrain-Aided Tracking Algorithm for Marine Systems (2003) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Rotation invariant features from omnidirectional camera images using a polar higher-order local autocorrelation feature extractor (2004) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards exteroceptive based localisation (2004) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Simultaneous localisation and mapping on the great barrier reef (2004)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Design of an unmanned underwater vehicle for reef surveying (2004)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SLAM- Loop closing with visually salient features (2005)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Use of classification and segmentation of sidescan sonar images for long term registration (2005)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Terrain aided localisation and mapping for marine environments (2006)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Active airborne localisation and exploration in unknown environments using inertial SLAM (2006)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A visual bag of words method for interactive qualitative localization and mapping (2007)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

BiCamSLAM: Two times mono is more than stereo (2007)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Shopbot: Progress in developing an interactive mobile shopping assistant for everyday use (2008)	4.0
--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

An adaptive appearance-based map for long-term topological localization of mobile robots (2008) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Towards a robust visual SLAM approach: Addressing the challenge of life-long operation (2009) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Experimental analysis of sample-based maps for long-term SLAM (2009) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

The Autonomous City Explorer (ACE) project-mobile robot navigation in highly populated Urban environments (2009)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Keypoint design and evaluation for place recognition in 2D lidar maps (2009)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust outdoor visual localization using a three-dimensional-edge map (2009) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lifelong localization of a mobile service-robot in everyday indoor environments using omnidirectional vision (2009) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Landmark rating and selection according to localization coverage: Addressing the challenge of lifelong operation of SLAM in service robots (2009) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Towards lifelong visual maps (2009)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Uncalibrated monocular based simultaneous localization and mapping for indoor autonomous mobile robot navigation (2009)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance-based SLAM for mobile robots (2009)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Subjective local maps for hybrid metric-topological SLAM (2009)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Position-invariant robust features for long-term recognition of dynamic outdoor scenes (2010) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust mobile robot localization in highly non-static environments (2010) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

6 DoF SLAM using a ToF camera: The challenge of a continuously growing number of landmarks (2010) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

FAB-MAP + RatSLAM: Appearance-based SLAM for multiple times of day (2010)						10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

Map updating in dynamic environments (2010)						7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual robot localization using compact binary landmarks (2010) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lifelong Map Learning for Graph-based SLAM in Static Environments (2010) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Fast Odometry Integration in Local Bundle Adjustment-based Visual SLAM (2010)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mapping and localization for mobile robots through environment appearance update (2010)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

1-Point RANSAC for Extended Kalman Filtering: Application to Real-TimeStructure from Motion and Visual Odometry (2010) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SIFT based monocular SLAM with multi-clouds features for indoor navigation (2010)	3.5
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Global localization using multiple hypothesis tracking: A real-world approach (2011)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Memory management for real-time appearance-based loop closure detection (2011) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term experiments with an adaptive spherical view representation for navigation in changing environments (2011) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Online and incremental appearance-based slam in highly dynamic environments (2011) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Self Help: Seeking Out Perplexing Images for Ever Improving Navigation (2011) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

PIRF-Nav 2.0: Fast and online incremental appearance-based loop-closure detection in an indoor environment (2011) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

CD SLAM - Continuous localization and mapping in a dynamic world (2011) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual topometric localization (2011)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Efficient information-theoretic graph pruning for graph-based SLAM with laser range finders (2011)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Appearance-based mapping and localization for mobile robots using a feature stability histogram (2011)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Natural landmark-based monocular localization for MAVs (2011)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Minimalistic vision-based cognitive SLAM (2012)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Information-theoretic compression of pose graphs for laser-based SLAM (2012) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Dynamic pose graph SLAM: Long-term mapping in low dynamic environments (2012) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Capping Computation Time and Storage Requirements for Appearance-based Localization with CAT-SLAM (2012) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Scale-preserving long-term visual odometry for indoor navigation (2012)	7.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Monitoring of Benthic Reference Sites: Using an Autonomous Underwater Vehicle (2012)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Multi-robot map updating in dynamic environments (2012)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hierarchical loop detection for mobile outdoor robots (2012)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Realizing, reversing, recovering: Incremental robust loop closing over time using the iRRR algorithm (2012) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Laser-only road-vehicle localization with dual 2D push-broom LIDARS and 3D priors (2012) 4.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Adaptive Visual Memory For Mobile Robot Navigation In Dynamic Environment (2012) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance change prediction for long-term navigation across seasons (2013) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance-based loop closure detection for online large-scale and long-term operation (2013)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust Loop Closing Over Time (2013)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hierarchical SLAM using spectral submap matching with opportunities for long-term operation (2013)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual memory update for life-long mobile robot navigation (2013)			7.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Fast place recognition with plane-based maps (2013)			6.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Temporally scalable visual SLAM using a reduced pose graph (2013) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

LaneLoc: Lane marking based localization using highly accurate maps (2013) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term mapping and localization using feature stability histograms (2013)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A speeded-up online incremental vision-based loop-closure detection for long-term SLAM (2013)	9.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Localization and navigation of the CoBots over long-term deployments (2013) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Robust Vision-Aided Navigation Using Sliding-Window Factor Graphs (2013)			7.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A framework for RF-Visual SLAM (2013)			7.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Selective combination of visual and thermal imaging for resilient localization in adverse conditions: Day and night, smoke and fire (2013) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Self-help: Seeking out perplexing images for ever improving topological mapping (2013) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

3D normal distributions transform occupancy maps: An efficient representation for mapping in dynamic environments (2013) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term simultaneous localization and mapping with generic linear constraint node removal (2013) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Part-based SLAM for partially changing environments (2013)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

How to learn an illumination robust image feature for place recognition (2013)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
OpenRatSLAM: An open source brain-based SLAM system (2013)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A metric approach for environments mapping (2013) 3.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Consistent sparsification for graph optimization (2013) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards persistent localization and mapping with a continuous appearance-based topology (2013) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Experience-based navigation for long-term localisation (2013) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Generic 2D/3D SLAM with NDT maps for lifelong application (2013)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Dynamic scene models for incremental, long-term, appearance-based localisation (2013)					7.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust loop closing over time for pose graph SLAM (2013)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Lifelong localization in changing environments (2013) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A spatio-temporal Long-term Memory approach for visual place recognition in mobile robotic navigation (2013) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Image Based Place Recognition and Lidar Validation for Vehicle Localization (2014)			7.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term ground robot localization architecture for mixed indoor-outdoor scenarios (2014)			4.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A SLAM based on auxiliary marginalised particle filter and differential evolution (2014)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Generic node removal for factor-graph SLAM (2014)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term 3D map maintenance in dynamic environments (2014) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Featureless visual processing for SLAM in changing outdoor environments (2014)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mining visual phrases for long-term visual SLAM (2014)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term topological localisation for service robots in dynamic environments using spectral maps (2014) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Toward long-term, automated ship hull inspection with visual SLAM, explicit surface optimization, and generic graph-sparsification (2014) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Concurrent filtering and smoothing: A parallel architecture for real-time navigation and full smoothing (2014) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Episodic non-Markov localization: Reasoning about short-term and long-term features (2014) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Integration of Monte Carlo Localization and place recognition for reliable long-term robot localization (2014) 6.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards background flow based AUV localization (2014)	3.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Multiple map hypotheses for planning and navigating in non-stationary environments (2014)			8.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Online global loop closure detection for large-scale multi-session graph-based SLAM (2014)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Incremental unsupervised topological place discovery (2014)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Optical flow localisation and appearance mapping (OFLAAM) for long-term navigation (2015)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Environment selection and hierarchical place recognition (2015)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Loop closure detection by compressed sensing for exploration of mobile robots in outdoor environments (2015) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

An Adaptive Gaussian Particle Filter based Simultaneous Localization and Mapping with dynamic process model noise bias compensation (2015) 6.5					

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

IMPROVEMENT OF 3D MONTE CARLO LOCALIZATION USING A DEPTH CAMERA and TERRESTRIAL LASER SCANNER (2015) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

An Optimization Technique for Positioning Multiple Maps for Self-Driving Car's Autonomous Navigation (2015) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Light Visual Mapping and Navigation Framework for Low-Cost Robots (2015) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Enabling persistent autonomy for underwater gliders through terrain based navigation (2015)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Semi-Markov Process Based Localization using Radar in Dynamic Environments (2015)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

The gist of maps - Summarizing experience for lifelong localization (2015) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Relaxing the planar assumption: 3D state estimation for an autonomous surface vessel (2015)	7.5
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

High-Level Visual Features for Underwater Place Recognition (2015) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Long-term RFID SLAM using short-range sparse tags (2015)					4.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Predicting the long-term robustness of visual features (2015)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Development of autonomous wheelchair for indoor and outdoor traveling (2015)					4.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Improved SeqSLAM for real-time place recognition and navigation error correction (2015)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Work smart, not hard: Recalling relevant experiences for vast-scale but time-constrained localisation (2015) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning place-dependant features for long-term vision-based localisation (2015) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Generic NDT mapping in dynamic environments and its application for lifelong SLAM (2015)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

ORB-SLAM: A Versatile and Accurate Monocular SLAM System (2015)						10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

Efficient and effective matching of image sequences under substantial appearance changes exploiting GPS priors (2015)						9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Automatic image scaling for place recognition in changing environments (2015)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Multi-robot 6D graph SLAM connecting decoupled local reference filters (2015)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

An open-source bio-inspired solution to underwater SLAM (2015) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards life-long visual localization using an efficient matching of binary sequences from images (2015) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Distributed real-time cooperative localization and mapping using an uncertainty-aware expectation maximization approach (2015) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Superpixel-based appearance change prediction for long-term navigation across seasons (2015)	10.0
--	------

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Enhanced Monte Carlo Localization with Visual Place Recognition for Robust Robot Localization (2015) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Vision-based Markov localization across large perceptual changes (2015)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Localizing Ground Penetrating RADAR: A Step Toward Robust Autonomous Ground Vehicle Localization (2016)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mining visual phrases for visual robot localization (2016)			7.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Bathymetric factor graph SLAM with sparse point cloud alignment (2016)			6.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mining DCNN landmarks for long-term visual SLAM (2016) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Texture-aware SLAM using stereo imagery and inertial information (2016) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Persistent localization and life-long mapping in changing environments using the frequency map enhancement (2016) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Ceiling vision-based active SLAM framework for dynamic and wide-open environments (2016) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Building an Enhanced Vocabulary of the Robot Environment with a CeilingPointing Camera (2016) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Curating long-term vector maps (2016)			7.5	
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance

An integrated model of autonomous topological spatial cognition (2016)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Opportunistic sampling-based active visual SLAM for underwater inspection (2016) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lifelong Information- Driven Exploration to Complete and Refine 4-DSpatio-Temporal Maps (2016) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Cooperative bathymetry-based localization using low-cost autonomous underwater vehicles (2016) 6.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards autonomous lakeshore monitoring (2016)						7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
A spatially and temporally scalable approach for long-term lakeshore monitoring (2016)						8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Information-based Active SLAM via topological feature graphs (2016)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Pole-based localization for autonomous vehicles in urban scenarios (2016)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term place recognition using multi-level words of spatial densities (2016) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

OpenABLE: An open-source toolbox for application in life-long visual localization of autonomous vehicles (2016) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hybrid Metric-Topological 3D Occupancy Grid Maps for Large-scale Mapping (2016)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards lifelong feature-based mapping in semi-static environments (2016)	7.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term Mapping Techniques for Ship Hull Inspection and Surveillance using an Autonomous Underwater Vehicle (2016) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Summary Maps for Lifelong Visual Localization (2016)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Bridging the appearance gap: Multi-experience localization for long-term visual teach and repeat (2016)			8.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Nonlinear factor recovery for long-term SLAM (2016) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust multimodal sequence-based loop closure detection via structured sparsity (2016) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Exploration and Mapping Technique Suited for Visual-features Based Localization of MAVs (2016)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Checkout my map: Version control for fleetwide visual localisation (2016)	8.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Erasing bad memories: Agent-side summarization for long-term mapping (2016) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Underwater robot visual place recognition in the presence of dramatic appearance change (2016)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Will it last? Learning stable features for long-term visual localization (2016)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance-based landmark selection for efficient long-term visual localization (2016)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

AEKF-SLAM: A new algorithm for robotic underwater navigation (2017)			6.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Modelling scene change for large-scale long term laser localisation (2017)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Sparse optimization for robust and efficient loop closing (2017)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Research of large-scale offline map management in visual SLAM (2017)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term 3D Localization and Pose from Semantic Labellings (2017)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Place recognition in semi-dense maps: Geometric and learning-based approaches (2017)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Migratory birds-inspired navigation system for unmanned aerial vehicles (2017) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust and accurate monocular vision-based localization in outdoor environments of real-world robot challenge (2017) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Episodic non-Markov localization (2017) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Survey Registration for Long-Term Natural Environment Monitoring (2017) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A robust RGB-D image-based SLAM system (2017)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Multi-sensor three-dimensional Monte Carlo localization for long-term aerial robot navigation (2017)	6.0
--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual place recognition with CNNs: from global to partial (2017)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Semantics-aware visual localization under challenging perceptual conditions (2017)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

FreMEn: Frequency map enhancement for long-term mobile robot autonomy in changing environments (2017)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Performance evaluation of graph-reduction in SLAM through pose rejection (2017)			6.5	
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance

A continuously learning feature-based map using a bernoulli filtering approach (2017)			7.0	
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Dynamic Map Update of Non-static Facility Logistics Environment with a Multi-robot System (2017)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Affine-Invariant Geometric Constraints-Based High Accuracy Simultaneous Localization and Mapping (2017)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Model-aided monocular visual-inertial state estimation and dense mapping (2017)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Air-SSLAM: A Visual Stereo Indoor SLAM for Aerial Quadrotors (2017)					4.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Robust relocalization based on active loop closure for real-time monocular SLAM (2017)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SemanticFusion: Dense 3D semantic mapping with convolutional neural networks (2017)			7.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SLAM++1-A highly efficient and temporally scalable incremental SLAM framework (2017)			9.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SRAL: Shared Representative Appearance Learning for Long-Term Visual Place Recognition (2017)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Bio-Inspired Robotics: A Spatial Cognition Model integrating PlaceCells, Grid Cells and Head Direction Cells (2018)			4.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual Place Recognition in Long-term and Large-scale Environment based on CNN Feature (2018)	8.5				
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Are you ABLE to perform a life-long visual topological localization? (2018)	8.5
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Enabling Robust Localization for Automated Guided Carts in Dynamic Environments (2018)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Visual Odometry and Place Recognition Fusion for Vehicle Position Tracking in Urban Environments (2018) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Inertial Navigation Aided by Dynamics of Flow Field Features (2018) 6.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

DynaSLAM: Tracking, Mapping, and Inpainting in Dynamic Scenes (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Marker-based multi-sensor fusion indoor localization system for micro air vehicles (2018) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Elastic LiDAR Fusion: Dense Map-Centric Continuous-Time SLAM (2018)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Efficient Map Compression for Collaborative Visual SLAM (2018)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Visual Localization Using Semantically Segmented Images (2018)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust Place Recognition and Loop Closing in Laser-Based SLAM for UGVs in Urban Environments (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Sequence-based sparse optimization methods for long-term loop closure detection in visual SLAM (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning integrated holism-landmark representations for long-term loop closure detection (2018)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning of Holism-Landmark graph embedding for place recognition in Long-Term autonomy (2018)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Online probabilistic change detection in feature-based maps (2018) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Distributed and collaborative monocular simultaneous localization and mapping for multi-robot systems in large-scale environments (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Exactly sparse delayed state filter on Lie groups for long-term pose graph SLAM (2018)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Selective memory: Recalling relevant experience for long-term visual localization (2018)	10.0
--	------

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Simultaneous localization and change detection for long-term map learning: A scalable scene retrieval approach (2018) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Deformable map matching to handle uncertain loop-less maps (2018)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Recurrent-OctoMap: Learning State-Based Map Refinement for Long-Term Semantic Mapping with 3-D-Lidar Data (2018)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Map Management for Efficient Long-Term Visual Localization in Outdoor Environments (2018)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term online multi-session graph-based SPLAM with memory management (2018)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Efficient Multi-Drive Map Optimization towards Life-long Localization using Surround View (2018)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Efficient Long-term Mapping in Dynamic Environments (2018)	9.5
--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Sparse Gaussian Process SLAM, Storage and Filtering for AUV Multibeam Bathymetry (2018)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Robust long-term registration of UAV images of crop fields for precision agriculture (2018) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning Place-and-Time-Dependent Binary Descriptors for Long-Term Visual Localization (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

PoseMap: Lifelong, Multi-Environment 3D LiDAR Localization (2018) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Stabilize an Unsupervised Feature Learning for LiDAR-based Place Recognition (2018) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A B-Spline Mapping Framework for Long-Term Autonomous Operations (2018)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

LLama-SLAM: Learning High-Quality Visual Landmarks for Long-Term Mapping and Localization (2018)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Omnidirectional multisensory perception fusion for long-term place recognition (2018) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

AUV robust bathymetric simultaneous localization and mapping (2018)						7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

Real-time dense map fusion for stereo SLAM (2018)						7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Scalable Change Detection from 3D Point Cloud Maps: Invariant Map Coordinate for Joint Viewpoint-Change Localization (2018) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning Context Flexible Attention Model for Long-Term Visual Place Recognition (2018) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Geometric mapping for sustained indoor autonomy (2018) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Indoor Environment RGB-DT Mapping for Security Mobile Robots (2019) 4.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Updating the visibility of a feature-based map for long-term maintenance (2019)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Network uncertainty informed semantic feature selection for visual SLAM (2019)					8.0
--	--	--	--	--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust Visual Place Recognition Based on Context Information (2019)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Visual place recognition via robust `2-norm distance based holism and landmark integration (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term urban vehicle localization using pole landmarks extracted from 3-D lidar scans (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A pose graph-based localization system for long-term navigation in CAD floor plans (2019)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust loop-closure detection with a learned illumination invariant representation for robot vSLAM (2019)			7.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Approximating Marginalization with Sparse Global Priors for Sliding Window SLAM-Graphs (2019)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

On the Redundancy Detection in Keyframe-Based SLAM (2019)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Visual Inertial SLAM based on Time Series Map Prediction (2019)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Clustermap building and relocalization in urban environments for unmanned vehicles (2019)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Robust photogeometric localization over time for map-centric loop closure (2019)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A DenseNet feature-based loop closure method for visual SLAM system (2019)			8.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Weighted Grid Partitioning for Panel-Based Bathymetric SLAM (2019)			4.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Novel Global Relocalization Method Based on Hierarchical Registration of 3D Point Cloud Map for Mobile Robot (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Distributed stereo vision-based 6D localization and mapping for multi-robot teams (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Obstacle persistent adaptive map maintenance for autonomous mobile robots using spatio-temporal reasoning (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Mapping and Localization using Semantic Road Marking with Centimeter-level Accuracy in Indoor Parking Lots (2019)

7.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Simultaneous Positioning and Map Construction of Mobile Robots Based on the Cartographer Algorithm (2019)

3.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

The quest for “always-on” autonomous mobile robots (2019)					3.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term Localization of Mobile Robots in Dynamic Changing Environments (2019)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

RTAB-Map as an open-source lidar and visual simultaneous localization and mapping library for large-scale and long-term online operation (2019) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Communication constrained cloud-based long-term visual localization in real time (2019) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards elderly assistance identification for service robot using combination of mappings (2019)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Identifying robust landmarks in feature-based maps (2019)	8.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance-based landmark selection for visual localization (2019) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Mobile robot localization based on low-cost LTE and odometry in GPS-denied outdoor environment (2019) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A unified framework for mutual improvement of SLAM and semantic segmentation (2019) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust Outdoor Self-localization In Changing Environments (2019)					6.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Vision-Aided Multi-UAV Autonomous Flocking in GPS-Denied Environment (2019)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Tightly-Coupled Monocular Visual-Odometric SLAM Using Wheels and a MEMS Gyroscope (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual Localization Using Sparse Semantic 3D Map (2019) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Topological local-metric framework for mobile robots navigation: a long term perspective (2019) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning Scene Geometry for Visual Localization in Challenging Conditions (2019)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Seamless navigation and mapping using an INS/GNSS/grid-based SLAM semi-tightly coupled integration scheme (2019)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Real-Time, Environmentally-Robust 3D LiDAR Localization (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Linear-Complexity EKF for Visual-Inertial Navigation with Loop Closures (2019) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SDF-Loc: Signed distance Field based 2D relocalization and map update in dynamic environments (2019) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lifelong Mapping using Adaptive Local Maps (2019) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

AUV Bathymetric Simultaneous Localisation and Mapping Using Graph Method (2019)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

View management for lifelong visual maps (2019)	7.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

MRS-VPR: a multi-resolution sampling based global visual place recognition method (2019)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Deep Supervised Hashing with Similar Hierarchy for Place Recognition (2019) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Hybrid Map with Permanent 3D Wireframes and Temporal Line Segments toward Long-Term Visual Localization (2019) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning Local Feature Descriptor with Motion Attribute For Vision-based Localization (2019) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Localizing backscatters by a single robot with zero start-up cost (2019) 4.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Tightly coupled semantic RGB-D inertial odometry for accurate long-term localization and mapping (2019) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

FLAME: Feature-Likelihood Based Mapping and Localization for Autonomous Vehicles (2019) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Augmenting visual SLAM with Wi-Fi sensing for indoor applications (2019)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

1-Day Learning, 1-Year Localization: Long-Term LiDAR Localization Using Scan Context Image (2019)						10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
A real-time visual-inertial mapping and localization method by fusing unstable GPS (2019)						5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance	

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

How to Match Tracks of Visual Features for Automotive Long-Term SLAM (2019)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Geographical Map Registration and Fusion of Lidar-Aerial Orthoimagery inGIS (2019)					3.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

AVP-SLAM: Semantic visual mapping and localization for autonomous vehicles in the parking lot (2020) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term localization with time series map prediction for mobile robots in dynamic environments (2020) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Visual Localization in Large Scale Urban Environments Exploiting Street Level Imagery (2020) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual SLAM with Drift-Free Rotation Estimation in Manhattan World (2020)	7.5
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

LiPMatch: LiDAR Point Cloud Plane Based Loop-Closure (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

3D LiDAR-Based Global Localization Using Siamese Neural Network (2020) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Radar-on-Lidar: Metric radar localization on prior lidar maps (2020) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

High-definition map update framework for intelligent autonomous transfer vehicles (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hierarchical Quadtree Feature Optical Flow Tracking Based Sparse Pose-Graph Visual-Inertial SLAM (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards life-long mapping of dynamic environments using temporal persistence modeling (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lightweight SLAM with automatic orientation correction using 2D LiDAR scans (2020)					2.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

LCPF: A Particle Filter Lidar SLAM System with Loop Detection and Correction (2020)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Segmented matching method of multi-geophysics field SLAM data based on LSTM (2020)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term loop closure detection through visual-spatial information preserving multi-order graph matching (2020)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term Place Recognition through Worst-case Graph Matching to Integrate Landmark Appearances and Spatial Relationships (2020) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Localization in unstructured environments: Towards autonomous robots in forests with Delaunay triangulation (2020) 4.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SLAM for autonomous planetary rovers with global localization (2020)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

kRadar++: Coarse-to-fine FMCW scanning radar localisation (2020)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Relocalization with Submaps: Multi-Session Mapping for Planetary Rovers Equipped with Stereo Cameras (2020) 5.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Appearance-invariant place recognition by adversarially learning disentangled representation (2020)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

UcoSLAM: Simultaneous localization and mapping by fusion of keypoints and squared planar markers (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SolarSLAM: Battery-free loop closure for indoor localisation (2020)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Graph optimization methods for large-scale crowdsourced mapping (2020)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Improving visual SLAM in car-navigated urban environments with appearance maps (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Edge-SLAM: Edge-assisted visual simultaneous localization and mapping (2020)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Merging of appearance-based place knowledge among multiple robots (2020)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A New Landmark Detection Approach for Slam Algorithm Applied in Mobile Robot (2020)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Voxel-based representation learning for place recognition based on 3D point clouds (2020)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Day and Night Collaborative Dynamic Mapping in Unstructured Environment Based on Multimodal Sensors (2020)			8.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SGC-VSLAM: A semantic and geometric constraints VSLAM for dynamic indoor environments (2020)			9.0		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robot-Assisted Backscatter Localization for IoT Applications (2020)					4.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Structured feature enhanced deep visual relocalization (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Localising Faster: Efficient and precise lidar-based robot localisation in large-scale environments (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Voxgraph: Globally Consistent, Volumetric Mapping Using Signed Distance Function Submaps (2020)					4.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Navigation Engine Design for Automated Driving Using INS/GNSS/3D LiDAR-SLAM and Integrity Assessment (2020) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

SLAM using LTE Multipath Component Delays (2020)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Persistent Stereo Visual Localization on Cross-Modal Invariant Map (2020)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Using Image Sequences for Long-Term Visual Localization (2020) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Monocular localization in HD maps by combining semantic segmentation and distance transform (2020) 6.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Structure-SLAM: Low-Drift Monocular SLAM in Indoor Environments (2020)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Learning Matchable Image Transformations for Long-Term Metric Visual Localization (2020)					9.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Highly Robust Visual Place Recognition Through Spatial Matching of CNN Features (2020)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

CREATING MULTI-TEMPORAL MAPS of URBAN ENVIRONMENTS for IMPROVED LOCALIZATION of AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES (2020) 6.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual Semantic Mapping and Localization Using Parameterized Road Lanes (2021) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Real-Time Robot Localization Based on 2D Lidar Scan-to-Submap Matching (2021)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Deep Samplable Observation Model for Global Localization and Kidnapping (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Keyframes retrieval for robust long-term visual localization in changing conditions (2021)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Ground Enhanced RGB-D SLAM for Dynamic Environments (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

What if there was no revisit? Large-scale graph-based SLAM with traffic sign detection in an HD map using LiDAR inertial odometry (2021) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Multi-session Lake-Shore Monitoring in Visually Challenging Conditions (2021)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Map-less long-term localization in complex industrial environments (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Geodetic Normal Distribution Map for Long-Term LiDAR Localization on Earth (2021)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

FusionVLAD: A Multi-View Deep Fusion Networks for Viewpoint-Free 3D Place Recognition (2021)			8.5		
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Sequence-based mapping for probabilistic visual loop-closure detection (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Development of an Autonomous Robotic System Using the Graph-based SPLAM Algorithm (2021)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Explicit feature disentanglement for visual place recognition across appearance changes (2021) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

MP3: A unified model to map, perceive, predict and plan (2021)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Change detection using weighted features for image-based localization (2021)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-term vehicle localization in urban environments based on pole landmarks extracted from 3-D lidar scans (2021) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Panoramic Visual-Inertial SLAM Tightly Coupled with a Wheel Encoder (2021) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

ExMaps: Long-term localization in dynamic scenes using exponential decay (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Using UHF-RFID Signals for Robot Localization Inside Pipelines (2021)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Visual slam-based robotic mapping method for planetary construction (2021)					5.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Robust Localization Method in Indoor Dynamic Environment (2021)	5.5
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hough2Map-Iterative Event-Based Hough Transform for High-Speed Railway Mapping (2021)					5.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Geometry-based Graph Pruning for Lifelong SLAM (2021)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Modest-vocabulary loop-closure detection with incremental bag of tracked words (2021)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Towards Semi-autonomous Robotic Inspection and Mapping in Confined Spaces with the EspeleoRobo (2021) 6.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Invariant Extended Kalman Filtering for Underwater Navigation (2021) 2.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Improving Image Description with Auxiliary Modality for Visual Localization in Challenging Conditions (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Map Maintenance Pipeline for Autonomous Vehicles (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust Method for Static 3D Point Cloud Map Building using Multi-View Images with Multi-Resolution (2021) 7.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	----------------------------	-----------------	-------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

A lightweight localization strategy for lidar-guided autonomous robots with artificial landmarks (2021)	4.5				
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Reference Pose Generation for Long-term Visual Localization via Learned Features and View Synthesis (2021)	7.5				
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Long-Term Map Maintenance in Complex Environments (2021)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

High-precision and robust localization system for mobile robots in complex and large-scale indoor scenes (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Condition-invariant robot localization using global sequence alignment of deep features (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Lifelong Localization in Semi-Dynamic Environment (2021)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Range-Focused Fusion of Camera-IMU-UWB for Accurate and Drift-Reduced Localization (2021) 5.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A multi-feature fusion slam system attaching semantic in-variant to points and lines (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Semi-Direct Monocular SLAM With Three Levels of Parallel Optimizations (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Robust LiDAR State Estimation and Map Building Approach for Urban Road (2021) 6.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Pole-like Objects Mapping and Long-Term Robot Localization in Dynamic Urban Scenarios (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Preventing and correcting mistakes in lifelong mapping (2021)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Hierarchical Loop Closure Detection for Long-term Visual SLAM with Semantic-Geometric Descriptors (2021)					10.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Multi-layer VI-GNSS Global Positioning Framework with Numerical Solution aided MAP Initialization (2021) 6.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

An EKF-Based Fusion of Visual-Inertial Odometry and GPS for Global Robot Pose Estimation (2021)	4.0
---	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Self-Supervised Learning of Lidar Segmentation for Autonomous Indoor Navigation (2021)					8.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

R-LOAM: Improving LiDAR Odometry and Mapping with Point-to-Mesh Features of a Known 3D Reference Object (2021) 6.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

PLSAV: Parallel loop searching and verifying for loop closure detection (2021) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A brain-inspired compact cognitive mapping system (2021) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Variational Bayesian approach to condition-invariant feature extraction for visual place recognition (2021) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Tightly-Coupled Multi-Sensor Fusion for Localization with LiDAR Feature Maps (2021)					7.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Research on Autonomous Underwater Vehicle Homing Method Based on Fuzzy-Q-FastSLAM (2021)					4.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Life-Long SLAM Approach Using Adaptable Local Maps Based on Rasterized LIDAR Images (2021) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Robust and Long-term Monocular Teach and Repeat Navigation using a Single-experience Map (2021) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
Radar-to-Lidar: Heterogeneous Place Recognition via Joint Learning (2021) 8.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Driven by vision: Learning navigation by visual localization and trajectory prediction (2021)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Globally optimal fetoscopic mosaicking based on pose graph optimisation with affine constraints (2021)					4.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

A Flexible and Efficient Loop Closure Detection Based on Motion Knowledge (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Autonomous vehicle localization with prior visual point cloud map constraints in gnss-challenged environments (2021) 7.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

DiSCO: Differentiable Scan Context with Orientation (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Loop-Closure Detection with a Multiresolution Point Cloud Histogram Mode in Lidar Odometry and Mapping for Intelligent Vehicles (2021)	9.0
--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Season-Invariant and Viewpoint-Tolerant LiDAR Place Recognition in GPS-Denied Environments (2021) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

VIRAL-Fusion: A Visual-Inertial-Ranging-Lidar Sensor Fusion Approach (2022)					8.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Weighted triplet loss based on deep neural networks for loop closure detection in VSLAM (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

DE-SLAM: SLAM for highly dynamic environment (2022) 10.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Domain-Invariant Similarity Activation Map Contrastive Learning for Retrieval-Based Long-Term Visual Localization (2022) 8.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

HybVIO: Pushing the Limits of Real-time Visual-inertial Odometry (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

I am Not Afraid of the GPS Jammer: Resilient Navigation via Signals of Opportunity in GPS-Denied Environments (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Keeping an Eye on Things: Deep Learned Features for Long-Term Visual Localization (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

GVINS: Tightly Coupled GNSS–Visual–Inertial Fusion for Smooth and Consistent State Estimation (2022)

4.0

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Novel robust simultaneous localization and mapping for long-term autonomous robots (2022)

7.5

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Bio-inspired Relocalization for Indoor Robots in Visual Ambiguous Scenarios (2022)					6.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Improved-UWB/LiDAR-SLAM Tightly Coupled Positioning System with NLOS Identification Using a LiDAR Point Cloud in GNSS-Denied Environments (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Map management for robust long-term visual localization of an autonomous shuttle in changing conditions (2022) 9.5					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Topographic SLAM Using a Single Terrain Altimeter in GNSS-Restricted Environment (2022) 5.5				
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance

QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Accurate Dynamic SLAM Using CRF-Based Long-Term Consistency (2022)					9.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Tightly-Coupled Magneto-Visual-Inertial Fusion for Long Term Localization in Indoor Environment (2022)	8.0
--	-----

QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

Appearance-Based Loop Closure Detection via Locality-Driven Accurate Motion Field Learning (2022) 9.0					
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
---	-------------------------------	-----------------	----------------------------------	--------------------	---------------

Contrastive Learning for Image Registration in Visual Teach and RepeatNavigation (2022)					7.5
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

RadarSLAM: A robust simultaneous localization and mapping system for allweather conditions (2022)					9.0
QE1: Does the paper have an updated state of the art on long-term localization and mapping?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE2: Is the methodology appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE3: Does the methodology consider both localization and mapping problems?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE4: Is the hardware and/or software used in the experiments detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE5: Does the paper presents any kind of long-term experimental results?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

QE6: Does the paper presents comparative results with other methods and/or ground-truth data?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE7: Does the work's implementation and the data used in the experiments publicly available?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance
QE8: Is the discussion of the results and conclusions appropriate and detailed?	Full compliance (QE3, QE5)	Full compliance	Partial compliance (QE3, QE5)	Partial compliance	No compliance

© 2021 Simple Complex

v2.1.1

(<https://github.com/vitorfs/parsifal/releases/latest>)

(<https://github.com/vitorfs/parsifal>)



(<https://twitter.com/parsifal>)



(<https://youtube.com/ParsifalF>)