A Systematic Literature Review on Long-Term Localization and Mapping for Mobile Robots*

Ricardo B. Sousa Héber M. Sobreira António Paulo Moreira

August 30, 2022

A Records Removed at the Data Extraction Phase

Table 1: Records not included in the review for having extended, more detailed or similar versions

Included	Corresponding versions removed from the review
Hochdorfer, Lutz, et al. 2009, Hochdorfer and Schlegel 2009b	Hochdorfer and Schlegel 2009a, Hochdorfer and Schlegel 2010
Dayoub, Cielniak, et al. 2011	Dayoub and Duckett 2008
Latif et al. 2012	Latif et al. 2013a, Latif et al. 2013b
Bacca et al. 2013	Bacca et al. 2010, Bacca et al. 2011
Kawewong et al. 2013	Kawewong et al. 2010, Kawewong et al. 2011a, Kawewong et al. 2011b
Paul and Newman 2013	Paul and Newman 2011
Carlevaris-Bianco, Kaess, et al. 2014	Carlevaris-Bianco and Eustice 2013
Neubert et al. 2015	Neubert et al. 2013
Ozog, Carlevaris-Bianco, et al. 2016	Ozog and Eustice 2014
Biswas and Veloso 2017	Biswas and Veloso 2014
Griffith and Pradalier 2017	Griffith and Pradalier 2016
Krajník, Fentanes, Santos, et al. 2017	Krajník, Fentanes, Hanheide, et al. 2016
Arroyo et al. 2018	Arroyo et al. 2015, Arroyo et al. 2016
Han, Wang, Huang, et al. 2018	Zhang et al. 2016
Han, Beleidy, et al. 2018	Han, Wang, and Zhang 2018
MacTavish et al. 2018	Paton et al. 2016
Bürki, Cadena, et al. 2019	Bürki, Gilitschenski, et al. 2016, Bürki, Dymczyk, et al. 2018
Labbé and Michaud 2019	Labbé and Michaud 2011, Labbé and Michaud 2013, Labbé and Michaud 2018
Gao and Zhang 2020b	Gao and Zhang 2020a
Berrio, Worrall, et al. 2021	Berrio, Ward, et al. 2019
Piasco et al. 2021	Piasco et al. 2019
Bouaziz et al. 2022	Bouaziz et al. 2021

Acknowledgments

This study was supported by FCT – Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia and INESC TEC – Institute for Systems and Computer Engineering, Technology and Science.

ORCID

Ricardo B. Sousa https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4537-5095
Héber M. Sobreira https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8055-1093
António Paulo Moreira https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8573-3147

*This work is financed by National Funds through the Portuguese funding agency, FCT – Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, within scholarship 2021.04591.BD.

Ricardo B. Sousa[1, 2]
up201503004@edu.fe.up.pt

Héber M. Sobreira[2]
heber.m.sobreira@inesctec.pt

António Paulo Moreira[1, 2]
amoreira@fe.up.pt

[1] Faculty of Engineering of the University of Porto, Electrical Engineering Department, Porto, 4200-465 Porto, Portugal
[2] INESC TEC – Institute for Systems and Computer Engineering, Technology and Science, CRIIS – Centre for Robotics in Industry and Intelligent Systems, Porto, 4200-465 Porto, Portugal

References

Arroyo, R., Alcantarilla, P. F., Bergasa, L. M., & Romera, E. Towards life-long visual localization using an efficient matching of binary sequences from images. In: *2015-June*. (June). Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2015, 6328–6335. ISBN: 9781479969234. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA.2015.7140088.

Arroyo, R., Alcantarilla, P. F., Bergasa, L. M., & Romera, E. OpenABLE: An open-source toolbox for application in life-long visual localization of autonomous vehicles. In: Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2016, 965–970. ISBN: 9781509018895. https://doi.org/10.1109/ITSC.2016.7795672.

Arroyo, R., Alcantarilla, P. F., Bergasa, L. M., & Romera, E. (2018). Are you ABLE to perform a life-long visual topological localization? *Autonomous Robots*, *42*(3), 665–85. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10514-017-9664-7

Bacca, B., Salví, J., & Cufí, X. (2010). Mapping and localization for mobile robots through environment appearance update. *Frontiers in Artificial Intelligence and Applications*, *220*, 291–300. https://doi.org/10.3233/978-1-60750-643-0-291

Bacca, B., Salví, J., & Cufí, X. (2011). Appearance-based mapping and localization for mobile robots using a feature stability histogram. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *59*(10), 840–857. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2011.06.008

Bacca, B., Salví, J., & Cufí, X. (2013). Long-term mapping and localization using feature stability histograms. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *61*(12), 1539–58. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2013.07.003

Berrio, J. S., Ward, J., Worrall, S., & Nebot, E. Updating the visibility of a feature-based map for long-term maintenance. In: *2019-June*. Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2019, 1173–1179. ISBN: 9781728105604. https://doi.org/10.1109/IVS.2019.8814189.

Berrio, J. S., Worrall, S., Shan, M., & Nebot, E. (2021). Long-term map maintenance pipeline for autonomous vehicles. *IEEE Transactions on Intelligent Transportation Systems*. https://doi.org/10.1109/TITS.2021.3094485

Biswas, J., & Veloso, M. M. Episodic non-Markov localization: Reasoning about short-term and long-term features. In: Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2014, 3969–3974. ISBN: 9781479936854. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA.2014.6907435.

Biswas, J., & Veloso, M. M. (2017). Episodic non-Markov localization. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *87*, 162–176. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2016.09.005

Bouaziz, Y., Royer, E., Bresson, G., & Dhome, M. Keyframes retrieval for robust long-term visual localization in changing conditions. In: Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2021, 93–100. ISBN: 9781728180533. https://doi.org/10.1109/SAMI50585.2021.9378614.

Bouaziz, Y., Royer, E., Bresson, G., & Dhome, M. (2022). Map management for robust long-term visual localization of an autonomous shuttle in changing conditions. *Multimedia Tools and Applications*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11042-021-11870-4

Bürki, M., Cadena, C., Gilitschenski, I., Siegwart, R., & Nieto, J. (2019). Appearance-based landmark selection for visual localization. *Journal of Field Robotics*, *36*(6), 1041–1073. https://doi.org/10.1002/rob.21870

Bürki, M., Dymczyk, M., Gilitschenski, I., Cadena, C., Siegwart, R., & Nieto, J. Map management for efficient long-term visual localization in outdoor environments. In: *2018-June*. Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2018, 682–688. ISBN: 9781538644522. https://doi.org/10.1109/IVS.2018.8500432.

Bürki, M., Gilitschenski, I., Stumm, E., Siegwart, R., & Nieto, J. Appearance-based landmark selection for efficient long-term visual localization. In: *2016-November*. Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2016, 4137–4143. ISBN: 9781509037629. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2016.7759609.

Carlevaris-Bianco, N., & Eustice, R. M. Long-term simultaneous localization and mapping with generic linear constraint node removal. In: Tokyo, 2013, 1034–1041. ISBN: 9781467363587. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2013.6696478.

Carlevaris-Bianco, N., Kaess, M., & Eustice, R. M. (2014). Generic node removal for factor-graph SLAM. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics*, *30*(6), 1371–1385. https://doi.org/10.1109/TRO.2014.2347571

Dayoub, F., Cielniak, G., & Duckett, T. (2011). Long-term experiments with an adaptive spherical view representation for navigation in changing environments. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *59*(5), 285–295. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2011.02.013

Dayoub, F., & Duckett, T. An adaptive appearance-based map for long-term topological localization of mobile robots. In: Nice, 2008, 3364–3369. ISBN: 9781424420582. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2008.4650701.

Gao, P., & Zhang, H. Long-term loop closure detection through visual-spatial information preserving multi-order graph matching. In: AAAI press, 2020, 10369–10376. ISBN: 9781577358350. https://doi.org/10.1609/aaai.v34i06.6604.

Gao, P., & Zhang, H. Long-term place recognition through worst-case graph matching to integrate landmark appearances and spatial relationships. In: 2020, 1070–1076. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA40945.2020.9196906.

Griffith, S., & Pradalier, C. (2016). A spatially and temporally scalable approach for long-term lakeshore monitoring. *Springer Tracts in Advanced Robotics*, *113*, 3–16. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-27702-8_1

Griffith, S., & Pradalier, C. (2017). Survey registration for long-term natural environment monitoring. *Journal of Field Robotics*, *34*(1), 188–208. https://doi.org/10.1002/rob.21664

Han, F., Beleidy, S. E., Wang, H., Ye, C., & Zhang, H. (2018). Learning of holism-landmark graph embedding for place recognition in long-term autonomy. *IEEE Robotics and Automation Letters*, *3*(4), 3669–3676. https://doi.org/10.1109/LRA.2018.2856274

Han, F., Wang, H., Huang, G., & Zhang, H. (2018). Sequence-based sparse optimization methods for long-term loop closure detection in visual SLAM. *Autonomous Robots*, *42*(7), 1323–1335. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10514-018-9736-3

Han, F., Wang, H., & Zhang, H. Learning integrated holism-landmark representations for long-term loop closure detection. In: AAAI press, 2018, 6501–6508. ISBN: 9781577358008.

Hochdorfer, S., Lutz, M., & Schlegel, C. Lifelong localization of a mobile service-robot in everyday indoor environments using omnidirectional vision. In: 2009, 161–166. https://doi.org/10.1109/TEPRA.2009.5339626.

Hochdorfer, S., & Schlegel, C. Landmark rating and selection according to localization coverage: Addressing the challenge of lifelong operation of SLAM in service robots. In: St. Louis, MO, 2009, 382–387. ISBN: 9781424438044. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2009.5354433.

Hochdorfer, S., & Schlegel, C. Towards a robust visual SLAM approach: Addressing the challenge of life-long operation. In: 2009, 1–6. https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/document/5174794

Hochdorfer, S., & Schlegel, C. 6 DoF SLAM using a ToF camera: The challenge of a continuously growing number of landmarks. In: Taipei, 2010, 3981–3986. ISBN: 9781424466757. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2010.5651229.

Kawewong, A., Tongprasit, N., & Hasegawa, O. (2010). Position-invariant robust features for long-term recognition of dynamic outdoor scenes. *IEICE Transactions on Information and Systems*, *E93-D*(9), 2587–2601. https://doi.org/10.1587/transinf.E93.D.2587

Kawewong, A., Tongprasit, N., & Hasegawa, O. (2011a). Online and incremental appearance-based slam in highly dynamic environments. *International Journal of Robotics Research*, *30*(1), 33–55. https://doi.org/10.1177/0278364910371855

Kawewong, A., Tongprasit, N., & Hasegawa, O. (2011b). PIRF-Nav 2.0: Fast and online incremental appearance-based loop-closure detection in an indoor environment. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *59*(10), 727–739. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2011.05.007

Kawewong, A., Tongprasit, N., & Hasegawa, O. (2013). A speeded-up online incremental vision-based loop-closure detection for long-term SLAM. *Advanced Robotics*, *27*(17), 1325–1336. https://doi.org/10.1080/01691864.2013.826410

Krajník, T., Fentanes, J. P., Hanheide, M., & Duckett, T. Persistent localization and life-long mapping in changing environments using the frequency map enhancement. In: *2016-November*. Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2016, 4558–4563. ISBN: 9781509037629. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2016.7759671.

Krajník, T., Fentanes, J. P., Santos, J. M., & Duckett, T. (2017). FreMEn: Frequency map enhancement for long-term mobile robot autonomy in changing environments. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics*, *33*(4), 964–977. https://doi.org/10.1109/TRO.2017.2665664

Labbé, M., & Michaud, F. Memory management for real-time appearance-based loop closure detection. In: San Francisco, CA, 2011, 1271–1276. ISBN: 9781612844541. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2011.6094602.

Labbé, M., & Michaud, F. (2013). Appearance-based loop closure detection for online large-scale and long-term operation. *IEEE Transactions on Robotics*, *29*(3), 734–745. https://doi.org/10.1109/TRO.2013.2242375

Labbé, M., & Michaud, F. (2018). Long-term online multi-session graph-based SPLAM with memory management. *Autonomous Robots*, *42*(6), 1133–1150. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10514-017-9682-5

Labbé, M., & Michaud, F. (2019). RTAB-Map as an open-source lidar and visual simultaneous localization and mapping library for large-scale and long-term online operation. *Journal of Field Robotics*, *36*(2), 416–446. https://doi.org/10.1002/rob.21831

Latif, Y., Cadena, C., & Neira, J. Realizing, reversing, recovering: Incremental robust loop closing over time using the iRRR algorithm. In: 2012, 4211–4217. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2012.6385879.

Latif, Y., Cadena, C., & Neira, J. (2013a). Robust loop closing over time. *2012 Robotics: Science and Systems (RSS)*, *vol.8*, 233–40. https://doi.org/10.15607/RSS.2012.VIII.030

Latif, Y., Cadena, C., & Neira, J. (2013b). Robust loop closing over time for pose graph SLAM. *International Journal of Robotics Research*, *32*(14), 1611–1626. https://doi.org/10.1177/0278364913498910

MacTavish, K., Paton, M., & Barfoot, T. D. (2018). Selective memory: Recalling relevant experience for long-term visual localization. *Journal of Field Robotics*, *35*(8), 1265–1292. https://doi.org/10.1002/rob.21838

Neubert, P., Sünderhauf, N., & Protzel, P. (2013). Appearance change prediction for long-term navigation across seasons. *2013 European Conference on Mobile Robots (ECMR)*, 198–203. https://doi.org/10.1109/ECMR.2013.6698842

Neubert, P., Sünderhauf, N., & Protzel, P. (2015). Superpixel-based appearance change prediction for long-term navigation across seasons. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, *69*, 15–27. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2014.08.005

Ozog, P., Carlevaris-Bianco, N., Kim, A., & Eustice, R. M. (2016). Long-term mapping techniques for ship hull inspection and surveillance using an autonomous underwater vehicle. *Journal of Field Robotics*, *33*(3), 265–289. https://doi.org/10.1002/rob.21582

Ozog, P., & Eustice, R. M. Toward long-term, automated ship hull inspection with visual slam, explicit surface optimization, and generic graph-sparsification. In: Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2014, 3832–3839. ISBN: 9781479936854. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA.2014.6907415.

Paton, M., Mactavish, K., Warren, M., & Barfoot, T. D. Bridging the appearance gap: Multi-experience localization for long-term visual teach and repeat. In: *2016-November*. Institute of Electrical; Electronics Engineers Inc., 2016, 1918–1925. ISBN: 9781509037629. https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2016.7759303.

Paul, R., & Newman, P. (2011). Self Help: Seeking out perplexing images for ever improving navigation. *2011 IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Automation (ICRA)*, 445–51. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA.2011.5980404

Paul, R., & Newman, P. (2013). Self-help: Seeking out perplexing images for ever improving topological mapping. *International Journal of Robotics Research*, *32*(14), 1742–1766. https://doi.org/10.1177/0278364913509859

Piasco, N., Sidibé, D., Gouet-Brunet, V., & Demonceaux, C. (2019). Learning scene geometry for visual localization in challenging conditions. *2019 IEEE International Conference on Robotics and Automation (ICRA)*, 9094–100. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRA.2019.8794221

Piasco, N., Sidibé, D., Gouet-Brunet, V., & Demonceaux, C. (2021). Improving image description with auxiliary modality for visual localization in challenging conditions. *International Journal of Computer Vision*, *129*(1), 185–202. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11263-020-01363-6

Zhang, H., Han, F., & Wang, H. Robust multimodal sequence-based loop closure detection via structured sparsity. In: *12*. MIT Press Journals, 2016, 1–10. ISBN: 9780992374723. https://doi.org/10.15607/rss.2016.xii.043.

Ricardo B. Sousa obtained a Master of Science (M.Sc.) degree in Electric and Computers Engineering (ECE) at Faculty of Engineering of the University of Porto (FEUP), in 2020. He is currently working towards the Ph.D. degree in electrical and computer engineering with FEUP, and he has a graduate research scholarship from FCT – Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia at the Centre for Robotics in Industry and Intelligent Systems from INESC TEC. Also, he is an invited assistant lecturing the courses Software Design and Industrial Informatics from the M.Sc. in ECE at FEUP. His research interests include robotics, sensor fusion, and localization and mapping for autonomous robots.

Héber M. Sobreira was born in Leiria, Portugal, in July 1985. He graduated with an M.Sc. degree (2009) and a Ph.D. degree (2017) in Electrical Engineering from the University of Porto. Since 2009, he has been developing his research within the Centre for Robotics in Industry and Intelligent Systems at INESC TEC. His main research areas are navigation and control of indoor autonomous vehicles.

António Paulo Moreira graduated with a degree in electrical engineering at the University of Oporto, in 1986. Then, he pursued graduate studies at University of Porto, obtaining a M.Sc. degree in electrical engineering – systems in 1991 and a Ph.D. degree in electrical engineering in 1998. Presently, he is Associate Professor with tenure at the Faculty of Engineering of the University of Porto and researcher and head of the Centre for Robotics in Industry and Intelligent Systems at INESC TEC. His main research interests are process control and robotics.