By: Frank H.B. No. 3414

A BILL TO BE ENTITLED

1 AN ACT

- 2 relating to advance directives and health care and treatment
- 3 decisions.
- 4 BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF TEXAS:
- 5 SECTION 1. Section 166.002, Health and Safety Code, is
- 6 amended by adding Subdivision (16) to read as follows:
- 7 (16) "Reasonable medical judgment" means a medical
- 8 judgment that would be made by a reasonably prudent physician,
- 9 knowledgeable about the case and the treatment possibilities with
- 10 respect to the medical conditions involved.
- SECTION 2. Sections 166.045(c) and (d), Health and Safety
- 12 Code, are amended to read as follows:
- 13 (c) If an attending physician refuses to comply with a
- 14 directive or treatment decision for a reason permitted by Section
- 15 166.046(a-1) and not prohibited by Section 166.0455 and does not
- 16 wish to follow the procedure established under Section 166.046,
- 17 life-sustaining treatment shall be provided to the patient, but
- 18 only until a reasonable opportunity has been afforded for the
- 19 transfer of the patient to another physician or health care
- 20 facility willing to comply with the directive or treatment
- 21 decision.
- 22 (d) A physician, health professional acting under the
- 23 direction of a physician, or health care facility is not civilly or
- 24 criminally liable or subject to review or disciplinary action by

- H.B. No. 3414
- 1 the person's appropriate licensing board if the person has complied
- 2 with the procedures and limitations outlined in Sections 166.0455
- 3 and [Section] 166.046.
- 4 SECTION 3. Subchapter B, Chapter 166, Health and Safety
- 5 Code, is amended by adding Section 166.0455 to read as follows:
- 6 Sec. 166.0455. LIMITATION ON REFUSAL TO EFFECTUATE CERTAIN
- 7 ADVANCE DIRECTIVES OR TREATMENT DECISIONS. A physician or other
- 8 health care professional, a health care facility, or an ethics or
- 9 medical committee shall not override or refuse to honor and comply
- 10 with a patient's advance directive or a health care or treatment
- 11 decision made by or on behalf of a patient that directs the
- 12 provision of life-sustaining treatment and shall not consider
- 13 <u>life-sustaining treatment to be inappropriate treatment under</u>
- 14 Section 166.046 based on:
- (1) the lesser value the physician or professional,
- 16 facility, or committee places on sustaining the life of an elderly,
- 17 disabled, or terminally ill patient compared to the value of
- 18 sustaining the life of a patient who is younger, not disabled, or
- 19 not terminally ill; or
- 20 (2) a disagreement between the physician or
- 21 professional, facility, or committee and the patient, or the person
- 22 <u>authorized to make a treatment decision for the patient under</u>
- 23 <u>Section 166.039</u>, over the greater weight the patient or person
- 24 places on sustaining the patient's life than the risk of
- 25 disability.
- SECTION 4. Section 166.046, Health and Safety Code, is
- 27 amended by amending Subsections (a) and (g) and adding Subsections

- 1 (a-1) and (c-1) to read as follows:
- 2 (a) If an attending physician refuses to honor or comply
- 3 with a patient's advance directive or a health care or treatment
- 4 decision made by or on behalf of a patient for a reason permitted by
- 5 Subsection (a-1) and not prohibited by Section 166.0455, the
- 6 physician's refusal shall be reviewed by an ethics or medical
- 7 committee. The attending physician may not be a member of that
- 8 committee. The patient shall be given life-sustaining treatment
- 9 during the review. A person may not coerce or attempt to coerce a
- 10 physician not to comply with a patient's advance directive or a
- 11 health care or treatment decision made by or on behalf of a patient
- 12 by threatening or implementing adverse employment decisions or
- 13 professional discipline.
- 14 (a-1) The ethics or medical committee reviewing the
- 15 physician's refusal under Subsection (a) shall not consider
- 16 <u>life-sustaining treatment inappropriate unless</u>, based on
- 17 reasonable medical judgment, the life-sustaining treatment
- 18 requested by or on behalf of the patient is:
- 19 (1) futile because the treatment is physiologically
- 20 ineffective in achieving the specific intended benefit to the
- 21 patient as intended by or on behalf of the patient; or
- 22 (2) medically inappropriate because providing the
- 23 treatment to the patient would clearly create a substantially
- 24 greater risk of causing or hastening the death of the patient than
- 25 would withholding or withdrawing the treatment.
- 26 <u>(c-1)</u> The ethics or medical committee shall not approve
- 27 withdrawing or withholding life-sustaining treatment if the ethics

- 1 or medical committee determines during the review described by
- 2 Subsection (a) that the physician refused to honor a patient's
- 3 advance directive or a health care or treatment decision made by or
- 4 on behalf of the patient for a reason prohibited by Section
- 5 166.0455.
- 6 (g) At the request of the patient or the person responsible
- 7 for the health care decisions of the patient, the appropriate
- 8 [district or county] court shall extend the time period provided
- 9 under Subsection (e) [only] if the court finds, by a preponderance
- 10 of the evidence, that there is a reasonable expectation that a
- 11 physician or health care facility that will honor the patient's
- 12 directive will be found if the time extension is granted.
- SECTION 5. Subchapter B, Chapter 166, Health and Safety
- 14 Code, is amended by adding Section 166.0465 to read as follows:
- Sec. 166.0465. COURT PROCEEDINGS; APPEAL; FILING FEE AND
- 16 COURT COSTS. (a) A patient, the person responsible for the
- 17 patient's health care decisions, or the person who has made the
- 18 decision regarding the advance directive or treatment decision may
- 19 file a motion for injunctive relief in any county court at law,
- 20 court having probate jurisdiction, or district court, including a
- 21 family district court, based on:
- 22 (1) a request for extension of time to effect a patient
- 23 <u>transfer for relief under Section 166.046(g); or</u>
- 24 (2) an allegation that a physician or other health
- 25 care professional, health care facility, or ethics or medical
- 26 committee is violating or threatening to violate this chapter.
- 27 (b) The person filing a motion under Subsection (a) shall

- 1 <u>immediately serve a copy of the motion on the defendant.</u>
- 2 (c) The court shall promptly set a time for a hearing on a
- 3 motion filed under Subsection (a) and shall keep a record of all
- 4 testimony and other oral proceedings in the action. The court shall
- 5 rule on the motion and issue written findings of fact and
- 6 conclusions of law not later than the fifth business day after the
- 7 date the motion is filed with the court.
- 8 (d) The time for the hearing and the date by which the court
- 9 must rule on the motion under Subsection (c) may be extended, for
- 10 good cause shown, by the court.
- 11 (e) Any party may appeal the decision of the court under
- 12 Subsection (c) to the court of appeals having jurisdiction over
- 13 civil matters in the county in which the motion was filed by filing
- 14 a notice of appeal with the clerk of the court that ruled on the
- 15 motion not later than the first business day after the date the
- 16 <u>decision of the court was issued.</u>
- 17 (f) On receipt of a notice of appeal under Subsection (e),
- 18 the clerk of the court that ruled on the motion shall deliver a copy
- 19 of the notice of appeal and record on appeal to the clerk of the
- 20 court of appeals. On receipt of the notice and record, the clerk of
- 21 the court of appeals shall place the appeal on the docket of the
- 22 court, and the court of appeals shall promptly issue an expedited
- 23 <u>briefing schedule and set a time for a hearing.</u>
- 24 (g) The court of appeals shall rule on an appeal under
- 25 Subsection (f) not later than the fifth business day after the date
- 26 the notice of appeal is filed with the court that ruled on the
- 27 motion.

- 1 (h) The times for the filing of briefs, the hearing, and the
- 2 date by which the court of appeals must rule on the appeal under
- 3 Subsection (g) may be extended, for good cause shown, by the court
- 4 of appeals.
- 5 (i) Any party may file a petition for review of the decision
- 6 of the court of appeals under Subsection (g) with the clerk of the
- 7 supreme court not later than the third business day after the date
- 8 the decision of the court of appeals was issued. Other parties may
- 9 file responses not later than the third business day after the date
- 10 the petition for review was filed. The supreme court shall grant,
- 11 deny, refuse, or dismiss the petition, without regard to whether a
- 12 reply to any response has been filed, not later than the third
- 13 business day after the date the response was due. If the supreme
- 14 court grants the petition for review, the court shall exercise the
- 15 court's sound discretion in determining how expeditiously to hear
- 16 and decide the case.
- 17 (j) If a motion is filed under Subsection (a) and the
- 18 dispute concerns whether life-sustaining treatment should be
- 19 provided to the patient, life-sustaining treatment must be provided
- 20 through midnight of the day by which a notice of appeal must be
- 21 filed unless the court directs that the life-sustaining treatment
- 22 be provided for a longer period. If a notice of appeal under
- 23 Subsection (e) is filed, life-sustaining treatment must be provided
- 24 through midnight of the day by which a petition for review to the
- 25 supreme court must be filed, unless the court of appeals directs
- 26 that the life-sustaining treatment be provided for a longer period.
- 27 If a petition for review to the supreme court is filed under

- H.B. No. 3414
- 1 Subsection (i), life-sustaining treatment must be provided through
- 2 midnight of the day on which the supreme court denies, refuses, or
- 3 dismisses the petition or issues a ruling on the merits, unless the
- 4 supreme court directs that the life-sustaining treatment be
- 5 provided for a longer period.
- 6 (k) A filing fee or court cost may not be assessed for any
- 7 proceeding in a trial or appellate court under this section.
- 8 SECTION 6. Section 166.051, Health and Safety Code, is
- 9 amended to read as follows:
- 10 Sec. 166.051. LEGAL RIGHT OR RESPONSIBILITY NOT AFFECTED.
- 11 This subchapter does not impair or supersede any legal right or
- 12 responsibility a person may have to effect the withholding or
- 13 withdrawal of life-sustaining treatment in a lawful manner,
- 14 provided that if an attending physician or health care facility is
- 15 unwilling to honor <u>and comply with</u> a patient's advance directive or
- 16 a treatment decision to provide life-sustaining treatment for a
- 17 reason permitted by Section 166.046(a-1) and not prohibited by
- 18 Section 166.0455, life-sustaining treatment is required to be
- 19 provided the patient, but only until a reasonable opportunity has
- 20 been afforded for transfer of the patient to another physician or
- 21 health care facility willing to comply with the advance directive
- 22 or treatment decision.
- SECTION 7. Sections 166.052(a) and (b), Health and Safety
- 24 Code, are amended to read as follows:
- 25 (a) In cases in which the attending physician refuses to
- 26 honor an advance directive or treatment decision requesting the
- 27 provision of life-sustaining treatment, the statement required by

- 1 Section $166.046(b)(3)(A) = [\frac{166.046(b)(2)(A)}{2}]$ shall be in
- 2 substantially the following form:
- When There Is A Disagreement About Medical Treatment: The
- 4 Physician Recommends Against Life-Sustaining Treatment That You
- 5 Wish To Continue
- 6 You have been given this information because you have
- 7 requested life-sustaining treatment,* which the attending
- 8 physician believes is not appropriate. This information is being
- 9 provided to help you understand state law, your rights, and the
- 10 resources available to you in such circumstances. It outlines the
- 11 process for resolving disagreements about treatment among
- 12 patients, families, and physicians. It is based upon Section
- 13 166.046 of the Texas Advance Directives Act, codified in Chapter
- 14 166, [of the Texas] Health and Safety Code.
- When an attending physician refuses to comply with an advance
- 16 directive or other request for life-sustaining treatment because of
- 17 the physician's judgment that the treatment would be inappropriate,
- 18 the case will be reviewed by an ethics or medical committee.
- 19 Life-sustaining treatment will be provided through the review.
- You will receive notification of this review at least 48
- 21 hours before a meeting of the committee related to your case. You
- 22 are entitled to attend the meeting. With your agreement, the
- 23 meeting may be held sooner than 48 hours, if possible.
- A physician or other health care professional, a health care
- 25 facility, or an ethics or medical committee may not deny a patient
- 26 life-sustaining treatment based on:
- 27 1. the lesser value the physician or professional,

- H.B. No. 3414
- 1 facility, or committee places on sustaining the life of an elderly,
- 2 disabled, or terminally ill patient compared to the value of
- 3 sustaining the life of a patient who is younger, not disabled, or
- 4 not terminally ill; or
- 5 2. a disagreement between the physician or professional,
- 6 facility, or committee and the patient, or the person authorized to
- 7 make a treatment decision for the patient under Section 166.039,
- 8 over the greater weight the patient or person places on sustaining
- 9 the patient's life than the risk of disability.
- Life-sustaining treatment may be denied if the treatment is:
- 11 <u>1. futile because the treatment is physiologically</u>
- 12 ineffective in achieving the specific intended benefit to the
- 13 patient as intended by or on behalf of the patient; or
- 2. medically inappropriate because providing the treatment
- 15 to the patient would clearly create a substantially greater risk of
- 16 causing or hastening the death of the patient than would
- 17 withholding or withdrawing it.
- 18 You are entitled to receive a written explanation of the
- 19 decision reached during the review process.
- 20 If after this review process both the attending physician and
- 21 the ethics or medical committee conclude that life-sustaining
- 22 treatment is inappropriate and yet you continue to request such
- 23 treatment, then the following procedure will occur:
- 1. The physician, with the help of the health care facility,
- 25 will assist you in trying to find a physician and facility willing
- 26 to provide the requested treatment.
- 2. You are being given a list of health care providers and

- 1 referral groups that have volunteered their readiness to consider
- 2 accepting transfer, or to assist in locating a provider willing to
- 3 accept transfer, maintained by the Texas Health Care Information
- 4 Council. You may wish to contact providers or referral groups on
- 5 the list or others of your choice to get help in arranging a
- 6 transfer.
- 7 3. The patient will continue to be given life-sustaining
- 8 treatment until he or she can be transferred to a willing provider
- 9 for up to 10 days from the time you were given the committee's
- 10 written decision that life-sustaining treatment is not
- 11 appropriate.
- 12 4. If a transfer can be arranged, the patient will be
- 13 responsible for the costs of the transfer.
- 14 5. If a provider cannot be found willing to give the
- 15 requested treatment within 10 days, life-sustaining treatment may
- 16 be withdrawn unless a court of law has <u>ruled otherwise</u> [granted an
- 17 extension].
- 18 6. You may ask the [appropriate district or county] court to
- 19 extend the 10-day period if the court finds that there is a
- 20 reasonable expectation that a physician or health care facility
- 21 willing to provide life-sustaining treatment will be found if the
- 22 extension is granted.
- 23 <u>7. The law gives you the right to seek a court order to</u>
- 24 require a physician or other health care professional, health care
- 25 facility, or ethics or medical committee to comply with your rights
- 26 under the Texas Advance Directives Act if the physician or
- 27 professional, facility, or committee is violating or threatening to

- 1 violate a provision of that Act. You may wish to talk to legal
- 2 counsel for further information about your right to seek a court
- 3 order.
- 4 *"Life-sustaining treatment" means treatment that, based on
- 5 reasonable medical judgment, sustains the life of a patient and
- 6 without which the patient will die. The term includes both
- 7 life-sustaining medications and artificial life support, such as
- 8 mechanical breathing machines, kidney dialysis treatment, and
- 9 artificial nutrition and hydration. The term does not include the
- 10 administration of pain management medication or the performance of
- 11 a medical procedure considered to be necessary to provide comfort
- 12 care, or any other medical care provided to alleviate a patient's
- 13 pain.
- 14 (b) In cases in which the attending physician refuses to
- 15 comply with an advance directive or treatment decision requesting
- 16 the withholding or withdrawal of life-sustaining treatment, the
- 17 statement required by Section 166.046(b)(3)(A) shall be in
- 18 substantially the following form:
- 19 When There Is A Disagreement About Medical Treatment: The
- 20 Physician Recommends Life-Sustaining Treatment That You Wish To
- 21 Stop
- You have been given this information because you have
- 23 requested the withdrawal or withholding of life-sustaining
- 24 treatment* and the attending physician refuses to comply with that
- 25 request. The information is being provided to help you understand
- 26 state law, your rights, and the resources available to you in such
- 27 circumstances. It outlines the process for resolving disagreements

- 1 about treatment among patients, families, and physicians. It is
- 2 based upon Section 166.046 of the Texas Advance Directives Act,
- 3 codified in Chapter 166, [of the Texas] Health and Safety Code.
- 4 When an attending physician refuses to comply with an advance
- 5 directive or other request for withdrawal or withholding of
- 6 life-sustaining treatment for any reason, the case will be reviewed
- 7 by an ethics or medical committee. Life-sustaining treatment will
- 8 be provided through the review.
- 9 You will receive notification of this review at least 48
- 10 hours before a meeting of the committee related to your case. You
- 11 are entitled to attend the meeting. With your agreement, the
- 12 meeting may be held sooner than 48 hours, if possible.
- 13 You are entitled to receive a written explanation of the
- 14 decision reached during the review process.
- 15 If you or the attending physician do not agree with the
- 16 decision reached during the review process, and the attending
- 17 physician still refuses to comply with your request to withhold or
- 18 withdraw life-sustaining treatment, then the following procedure
- 19 will occur:
- 1. The physician, with the help of the health care facility,
- 21 will assist you in trying to find a physician and facility willing
- 22 to withdraw or withhold the life-sustaining treatment.
- 2. You are being given a list of health care providers and
- 24 referral groups that have volunteered their readiness to consider
- 25 accepting transfer, or to assist in locating a provider willing to
- 26 accept transfer, maintained by the Texas Health Care Information
- 27 Council. You may wish to contact providers or referral groups on

- 1 the list or others of your choice to get help in arranging a
- 2 transfer.
- 3 3. The law gives you a right to seek a court order to require
- 4 a physician or other health care professional, health care
- 5 facility, or ethics or medical committee to comply with your rights
- 6 under the Texas Advance Directives Act if the physician, facility,
- 7 or committee is violating or threatening to violate a provision of
- 8 that Act. You may wish to talk to legal counsel for further
- 9 information about your right to seek a court order.
- 10 *"Life-sustaining treatment" means treatment that, based on
- 11 reasonable medical judgment, sustains the life of a patient and
- 12 without which the patient will die. The term includes both
- 13 life-sustaining medications and artificial life support, such as
- 14 mechanical breathing machines, kidney dialysis treatment, and
- 15 artificial nutrition and hydration. The term does not include the
- 16 administration of pain management medication or the performance of
- 17 a medical procedure considered to be necessary to provide comfort
- 18 care, or any other medical care provided to alleviate a patient's
- 19 pain.
- SECTION 8. Section 166.158(c), Health and Safety Code, is
- 21 amended to read as follows:
- (c) A principal's health or residential care provider who
- 23 finds it impossible to follow a directive by the agent because of a
- 24 conflict with this subchapter or the medical power of attorney
- 25 shall inform the agent as soon as is reasonably possible. The agent
- 26 may select another attending physician. The procedures and
- 27 limitations established under Sections 166.045, 166.0455, and

- H.B. No. 3414
- 1 166.046 apply if the agent's directive concerns providing,
- 2 withholding, or withdrawing life-sustaining treatment.
- 3 SECTION 9. Section 166.166, Health and Safety Code, is
- 4 amended to read as follows:
- 5 Sec. 166.166. OTHER RIGHTS OR RESPONSIBILITIES NOT
- 6 AFFECTED. This subchapter does not limit or impair any legal right
- 7 or responsibility that any person, including a physician or health
- 8 or residential care provider, may have to make or implement health
- 9 care decisions on behalf of a person, provided that if an attending
- 10 physician or health care facility is unwilling to honor and comply
- 11 with a patient's advance directive or a treatment decision to
- 12 provide life-sustaining treatment for a reason permitted by Section
- 13 166.046(a-1) and not prohibited by Section 166.0455,
- 14 life-sustaining treatment is required to be provided the patient,
- 15 but only until a reasonable opportunity has been afforded for
- 16 transfer of the patient to another physician or health care
- 17 facility willing to comply with the advance directive or treatment
- 18 decision.
- 19 SECTION 10. Not later than December 1, 2015, the Supreme
- 20 Court of Texas shall issue the rules and prescribe the forms
- 21 necessary for the process established by Section 166.0465, Health
- 22 and Safety Code, as added by this Act. The rules shall prescribe
- 23 the method of service of the application under Section 166.0465,
- 24 Health and Safety Code, and may require filing and service of
- 25 notices, petitions, and briefs electronically to the extent the
- 26 Supreme Court of Texas considers appropriate.
- 27 SECTION 11. The changes in law made by this Act apply only

- 1 to a health care or treatment decision made on or after the
- 2 effective date of this Act.
- 3 SECTION 12. This Act takes effect immediately if it
- 4 receives a vote of two-thirds of all the members elected to each
- 5 house, as provided by Section 39, Article III, Texas Constitution.
- 6 If this Act does not receive the vote necessary for immediate
- 7 effect, this Act takes effect September 1, 2015.